

# OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL OF BELIZE



## ***SPECIAL AUDIT - NATIONALITY IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY DEPARTMENT***

**FOR THE PERIOD  
2011 - 2013**



***Office of the Auditor General***

*Second Floor*

*Garden City Building*

*Almond Drive*

*Belmopan City*

*Belize, C.A.*

*P.O. Box 7*

*Tel. No. 822-2850/0208/0214 (General Office)*

*828-4362 (Auditor General)*

*Fax No. 501-822-1041*

Email: [AuditorGeneralBelize@audit.gov.bz](mailto:AuditorGeneralBelize@audit.gov.bz)

May 31, 2016

Honourable Dean O. Barrow  
Prime Minister  
Minister of Finance  
Office of the Prime Minister  
Sir Edney Cain Building  
Belmopan

Dear Prime Minister:

In Accordance with Section 120 (4) of the Belize Constitution 1981, and Section 16(3) of the Finance and Audit (Reform) Act No 12 of 2005, I hereby present a Special Nationality Report on the Immigration and Nationality Department for period January 1, 2012 – September 30, 2013.

I shall be grateful if you would cause the report to be laid before the House of Representatives and the Senate in due course.

Respectfully submitted,

**DOROTHY A. BRADLEY (MRS)**  
Auditor General



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## NATIONALITY

### SECTION II

|                                      |          |
|--------------------------------------|----------|
| Acronyms.....                        | page i   |
| Executive Summary.....               | page iii |
| Audit Mandate .....                  | page 1   |
| Background/Reason for Audit.....     | page 1   |
| Audit Objectives.....                | page 1   |
| The Extent of the Investigation..... | page 2   |
| Findings.....                        | page 2   |
| Recommendations .....                | page 401 |

### Appendices



## Acronyms

PR- Permanent Residence

INS- Immigration and Nationality Service

BECIP – Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program

BNA – Belize Nationality Application

BMPS – Belmopan Station

BWBS – Belize Western Border Station

BNBS – Belize Northern Border Station

PGIA – Phillip Goldson International Airport

OIC – Officer in Charge

BMRPIS – Belize Machine Readable Passport Issuance System

BPIS – Belize Passport Issuance System

BMRPAIP – Belize Machine Readable Passport Application and Issuance Process

MRPS – Machine Readable Passport System

QA – Quality Assurance

FO – Finance Officer

FO Number – Financial Orders Number

USR\_FNAME – User First Name

USR\_LNAME – User Last Name

USR Step – User Step

App Step Date – Application Step Date

TEP – Temporary Employment Permits

DINS – Director of Immigration and Nationality Service

PRF – Permanent Residence File

S.I – Statutory Instrument

VSU – Vital Statistic Unit  
HQ – Headquarters  
CIDAPS – Central Intelligence Data and Analysis Processing System  
CRO – Criminal Records Office  
JICC – Joint Intelligence Coordinating Center  
CIB – Crimes Investigation Branch  
ACP – Assistant Commissioner of Police  
JP – Justice of the Peace  
HIV – Human Immunodeficiency Virus  
VDRL – Venereal Disease Research Laboratory  
DOA – Date of Arrival  
FIU – Financial Intelligence Unit  
W/Sergeant – Woman Sergeant  
ROC – Republic of China  
ID Cards – Identification Cards  
IT – Information Technology  
CITO – Central Information Technology Office  
SSB – Social Security Board  
UK – United Kingdom  
US – United States  
CITO – Central Information Technology Office  
CSME – Caribbean Single Market Economy



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. On September 30, 2013 the Office of the Auditor General received a copy of a memorandum from the Immigration and Nationality Department regarding some missing visas.
2. The Office of the Auditor General initially decided to undertake a Compliance Audit of the Department's Visa Section. However, during the preliminary phase of the Visa Audit the Immigration Department was faced with a passport scandal and on that basis the audit scope was broaden to encompass both the Passport and Nationality Sections.
3. The audit covers the period 2011 to 2013 and starts with the Visa examination progressing into the Nationality and Passport Examinations. The individual reports are lengthy due to the different findings and the manner in which they were executed. The presentation is done in sections: Visa - Section I, Nationality - Section II, Passport Section - III and Other findings – IV. **Appendices presented, for each section, reflect a small percentage of total findings because of the volume of actual findings.**

### Nationality – Section II

4. The objective of this audit was to determine whether procedures were carried out in accordance with the Belize Nationality Act, Chapter 161. Also, to further examine compliance relating to the submission of all required documentation by applicants.
5. We have found instances whereby some individuals were approved visas to visit Belize and were also approved and issued Nationality Certificates and Passports. Such was the case with Wong Hong Kim, Yakup Sut and other names that can be found at Appendix A. Appendix A is only a small sample from some 100 Names found for the audited period. Most applicants who appeared to have acquired Belizean Nationality, cited in this report, files were not presented to Audit by the Department.
6. The Regulations make provision for persons with Canadian and US Passports not requiring visas to enter Belize. However, there were no indications that consistent verifications were done, throughout the various port of entries, to authenticate documents presented. There was no detection machines, tools or methodology employed to counter any counterfeit presentation.
7. The Department has the Nationality Act, Procedures manual and other guidance notes that should be used to facilitate the various processes. However, it was evident that in

most cases examined, the processes and procedures were circumvented, displaying blatant disregard, at every level, for a well established Institutional framework.

8. The System was manipulated to facilitate apparent fraud in so many ways. For example, no space or extra spaces were placed within names, first names and surnames were switched, pictures of pictures were captured instead of live images. These irregularities were apparently not obvious to the Systems Administrator and other officers in charged. Another trend that was observed was the change of names for citizen by registration, at the Vital Statistics Unit, before application was made to the Immigration Department for Belize Passports. There were also persons who did change of surname through marriage after receiving visas and before receiving Belize Passports. While these may seem like relevant and normal procedures, the dates between receiving visas, getting married and receiving Belizean passports are certainly not within the time frame allowed in the Belize Nationality Act.
9. Many sponsors, for visa applicants, used fraudulent business registration certificates that were not detected by the Department. Due to the many irregularities found during our examinations, this report present individual findings, highlighting the different phases of manipulation, in an effort to demonstrate the scope of reform that is required for the Department.

I take this opportunity to acknowledge Officers within the Immigration Department for assistance provided to the Audit Team. To those other agencies that also provided the Team with the necessary assistance it sought. To the Supervisor of Audit, Ms. Carla Faber and Officers assigned to conduct the audit.

It is anticipated that the Report presented will provide the Immigration Department with pertinent information required to effect meaningful reform regarding policy formulation and implementation. It should also lend to the building of necessary controls to better effect policies, changes and procedures.

**AUDIT INVESTIGATION  
NATIONALITY SECTION II  
IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY DEPARTMENT  
APRIL 2011 TO SEPTEMBER 2013**

---

The following comments, suggestions and recommendations arise as a result of an Audit investigation of the application, approval and issuance of Belizean nationality certificates to applicants and those related documents maintained by the Immigration and Nationality Services for the period April 2011 to 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

**Audit Mandate**

2. This audit investigation has been conducted in accordance with *Section 14* of the Finance and Audit Act 2005 which states “ If at any time it appears to the Auditor General that any fraud, or serious loss or serious irregularity has occurred in the receipt, custody or expenditure of public moneys or in the receipt, custody, issue, sale, transfer or delivery of any stamps, securities, stores or other Government property of any kind whatsoever, or in the accounting for the same, he shall immediately bring the matter to the notice of the Minister of Finance”.

**Background/Reason for Audit**

3. The Office of the Auditor General initially decided to conduct an audit investigation after it was publicly announced by the Prime Minister that the Minister of State, Hon Elvin Penner, who had responsibility for Immigration, approved Belizean nationality citizenship to a South Korean National, Wonhong Kim, while he was incarcerated in a Taiwan prison thus allowing a Belizean Passport to be issued to Wonhong Kim.

**4. Audit Objectives**

The objectives of this Audit investigation were:

- 1) To determine whether Belizean Nationality was issued in accordance with the Belize Nationality Act, Chapter 161.
- 2) If there was a violation of the Act, to determine the nature and extent of the violation.
- 3) To determine the extent of compliance with the Act, particularly in relation to the submission of all required documentation by applicants.

The objective and scope of the audit was developed to include a Special Investigation of the Passport, Nationality and Visa sections of the Immigration and Nationality Department.

### **THE EXTENT OF THE INVESTIGATION**

5. In order to reach our objectives we examined the following:

- (i) Nationality Files of applicants including copies of native Passports for visas issued and entry dates into Belize, police records, employer's confirmation letters, bank statements, Referees interview information
- (ii) The Passport application forms and Passport issue list for the period 1st April 2011 to 30th September 2013.
- (iii) Visa application forms and Visa Records
- (iv) Permanent Residency (PR) Permit Registers
- (v) Registers of Nationality by Registration
- (vi) Nationality Certificate Numbers Book
- (vii) Nationality File Diary
- (viii) Other Relevant PR and Nationality Registers including Belize Economic Citizenship Program (BECIP) Register
- (ix) The Machine Readable Passport System
- (x) Payments made by individuals through Smart Stream Reporting System for Nationality fees

We requested the assistance of the relevant authorities for the verification of US visas and Passports of Nationality applicants.

### **FINDINGS**

#### **6. Some individuals were approved visas to visit Belize and were also approved and issued Belizean Nationality Certificates and Passports**

##### *Criteria*

*Part IV Section 10-(1) of the Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize*

*"This section shall apply to any applicant for registration as a citizen of Belize who has the following qualification-*

- (a) that the applicant is of full age and of sound mind;*
- (b) that the applicant is a person who is ordinarily resident in Belize and has been so resident for a period of five years immediately preceding the date of application; and*
- (c) that the applicant is, and intends to continue to be, ordinarily resident in Belize.*

## **The process for the issuance of nationality certificates**

According to the Port Commander, (Officer-in-charge) of the Nationality section, in applying for Belizean nationality through registration, the following are required:

- (a) Applicants must reside in the country of Belize for five years from entry
- (b) Completed application forms are to be brought in personally by the applicant
- (c) Applicants should present their native birth certificates and Passports as well as the photocopied pages
- (d) Police reports
- (e) 2 recent photos
- (f) Medical reports
- (g) Two born Belizean referees
- (h) General declaration by applicants

The above information is then captured in the application register which should record the date and assign file numbers for applications received.

An interview date is set for applicants to return for questioning, and then the file goes to the registry section until the interview date.

Once applicants successfully complete the applications and meet all requirements, the Port Commander minutes the Director to this effect. The Director then minutes the Minister of Immigration that all is in order and applicants are recommended for Belizean nationality. A letter along with the applicants' files is then sent to the Minister of Immigration with all applicants who qualify for the Minister of Immigration to sign their nationality certificates.

The numbers on the nationality certificates are then recorded in the Number Book/register. In addition, the date of the Minister's signature, applicants' names and their file numbers are entered.

Applicants are then notified via a telephone call that they need to visit the nationality section and pay their fee of three hundred dollars for their Belizean nationality. After this is done, a date for their swearing in ceremony is set and they appear at the nationality section on the morning of their swearing in ceremony to sign their oath of allegiance.

After the oath of allegiance is taken and the swearing in ceremony has been completed, the nationality register is then updated with the following information:

- a. Number and date of the certificate
- b. The application number (file number is inserted here) and date



- c. The name of the applicant
- d. Number of children included on the certificate
- e. Section under which certificate is granted
- f. Date of issue
- g. Initials of issuing officer (this column is not being utilized)
- h. Date of oath of affirmation
- i. Remarks (Renunciations, loss, etc.)

6.2 It appeared that an illegitimate Belizean citizenship and Passport scheme was operating in violation of the laws which governs the issuance of nationality and Passport in the country. We found that some individuals were issued with Belizean Nationality and Passports on their first visit to the country of Belize.

6.3 This was evident particularly on visa application forms where applicants admitted to being first time visitors but were issued Belizean Nationality within a day, days, weeks or months of their first entry into Belize.

6.4 Examination was done for 20% percentage of visas issued at the main office in Belmopan and at the Port of Entry Belize Western Border Station (BWBS) while 100% was done at the Belize Northern Border Station (BNBS), and the Phillip Goldson International Airport (PGIA).

6.5 Our preliminary Passport Audit Report AUD/31/01/14 (57) dated March 19, 2014 had revealed the names of five persons who had received Belizean nationality fraudulently.

Two of those persons, Wonhong Kim and Yakup Sut never came to Belize to process those applications while the other three persons, Yiu Pang Chen (Peter Chen), Jack Jie Qin (Marc Ching) and Quoc Vinh Truong (Simon Truong) entered Belize as visitors through the PGIA and soon after fraudulently obtained their Belizean nationality which was issued under Section 10 of the Belize Nationality Act and subsequently were issued their Belizean Passports. This Nationality report will reveal more of such cases. We did not receive the majority of nationality files for most of the fraudulent cases we found.

**Wonhong Kim was fraudulently issued Replacement Permanent Residence (PR) Permit number 44578**

7. We inspected the copy of the Permanent Residence Number Book, (received from the Police on 15<sup>th</sup> May 2014) and observed that Wonhong Kim, received what appeared to be fraudulently nationality and passport (please see Passport Report, Section III).

Wonhong Kim received a fraudulently replacement PR Permit number 44578 dated 18 October 2012. His name was seen recorded at the very end of a page in the PR Number Book as “Kim, Wong Hong”. We verified his date of birth in the PR Numbers Book to that recorded on copies of his Korean and Belizean Passports, as well as that stated on his Passport application and all four matched. His name was fraudulently entered and backdated to the 18<sup>th</sup> October 2012 in the PR number book and he never entered Belize. (Details of the fraudulent Passport obtained by Won Hong Kim are reported in the Passport report). In the column where the receipt number and fees were recorded, the words “replace old PR” were seen. He did not pay the required fee of \$2000.00 that is due for replacement certificate.

7.2 We noted that PR certificate number 44578 was for Josue David Coc Uk, a Guatemalan as was recorded on the first line of the next page of the PR number book. Jose Uk paid \$750.00 vide receipt 44578 dated 19<sup>th</sup> October 2012 as his PR fee.

### **Wonhong Kim was fraudulently issued nationality Certificate 28577/13**

7.3 We examined a photocopy of Wonhong Kim’s (Kin) nationality certificate number 28577/13 dated 22nd April 2013 and signed by Minister Elvin Penner, which was attached to the photocopied Passport application.

7.4 Scrutiny of the Nationality certificate register revealed that the nationality certificate number assigned to Wonhong Kim was blank in the Register. A search of the Numbers Book/Register showed that certificate 28577/13 was issued to Wonhong Kim but was dated 2nd September 2013. We also noted that the series signed and issued in April 2013, begun with 28306 with the serial numbering being consecutive up to September 2013 when it reached 28574 on 2nd September 2013 and continued to 28588.3 for said date. We attempted to get the Nationality acceptance register as well as the Permanent Residence register but, neither was forthcoming. We managed to secure copies of the File Diary and Permanent Residence Permit Number Book which assisted us in finding that he was fraudulently issued Belizean PR and nationality.

### **Verification of nationality fee**

7.5 We carried out a search of the receipts issued for the period January 2013 to September 2013 and found no trace that Wonhong Kim paid nationality fee of Belize three hundred dollars (\$300.00) as required by all citizens by registration.

### **Verification of individual to manifest at Philip Goldson International Airport**

7.6 We visited the Philip Godson International Airport and scrutinized the manifest held by the Immigration and Nationality Department of all individuals who entered and left the country by air for the period 2011 to 2013 and we found no record that Wonhong Kim entered or left the Country of Belize.

7.7 In addition to Minister Penner signing a backdated Nationality certificate for Wonhong Kim, he (Wonhong Kim) in fact, never entered Belize.

**Interview held on 20th February 2014 with Mr. Gordon Wade the OIC Nationality section**

7.8 In an interview held with Mr. Gordon Wade, the OIC, Nationality section, he was questioned about his duties and asked about the application for Wonhong Kim:

He was specifically asked to explain why he allowed Won Hong Kim's application to be processed in the absence of the applicant and why in spite of all the obvious irregularities, a Nationality Certificate was still issued.

**His response was:**

7.9 The Minister, that is Elvin Penner, brought in the application without the original documents and the completed Passport for the individual Wonhong Kim. All pages of the Passport were to be photocopied and brought in along with the original Passport and with the applicant's (Wonhong Kim) native birth paper. He also informed us that the Minister was told to bring in the required documentation and he promised that he would (He indicated that this was a usual practice of various Ministers). Minister Penner never brought in the documents. Instead, he came in a day or two after and requested the file. Mr Wade informed the Minister about the incompleteness of the file, but the Minister informed Mr Wade that he wanted the file as he would take it to the Director, Ms Maria Marin, for her to deal with. He has not seen the file since. He stated that one of his staff members was instructed to type up a letter with Wonhong Kim's name and others on it, which is the norm when files are submitted to the Minister for his approval and signature. Mr Wade believed that the Minister signed for the files; however this file was with the Director along with the register which records acceptance of nationality applications. This register, he said, indicates the applicant's name, date applications are received, the documents presented and the file number assigned to the particular applicant. (We had the opportunity for a short time to view the file, but did not see the minister's signature in the file)

***He was then asked:***

Were permanent residence files (PR) looked at in the process of obtaining nationality?

7.10 His response was "no". According to him they all knew their officers' signatures since they had been working together for so long. It was easy for each of them to recognize another co-worker's signature when it appeared on visas issued therefore, PR files were not used. This has now changed since the incident in September 2013. The PR files are now attached to the Nationality files for onward processing of the applications.

The next question we asked him was:

***What date did Minister Penner bring in the nationality application form for Wonhong Kim?***

7.11 He responded that he did not remember the exact date, but that it was in early September 2013. He indicated that the application register would show such date.

7.12 According to him, he was not paying much attention as to date as it was not out of the norm for any minister to bring in incomplete applications and these would go through on the strength of their promise to bring in the missing documents. This was to the knowledge of the Director, Mrs Maria Marin. He informed us, that Ministers are still bringing in applications for individuals even after what has happened in September 2013.

***Interview held on 20th February 2014 with Ady Pacheco the assistant to OIC Nationality section***

7.13 This officer, Ms Ady Pacheco, was questioned about her specific duties and thereafter she was asked about the acceptance of application forms for nationality by registration

7.14 She indicated that once applications are accepted they are written up in the Acceptance Register, which shows the date of application, the applicant's name, and the documents received and the file number assigned to the individual's application.

**She was asked**

***Were you the person who received Wonhong Kim's application?***

7.15 She answered "yes", she received his application. She said that the application was brought in by Minister Penner.

**She was asked:**

***Should applicants appear personally to make an application for nationality?***

7.16 Ms Pacheco responded that this was usually the case, but this was the practise of Ministers, their secretaries and drivers to bring in application forms for individuals. This was a privilege that they have enjoyed for as long as she could remember. Ms Pacheco continued on Wonhong Kim's application by saying that the application form was incomplete in respect of a police record. She went to her supervisor's room (the OIC nationality section) and brought the matter to his attention in the presence of Minister Penner who had followed her. Her supervisor informed the Minister that he would need to bring in the necessary documents and the Minister agreed that he would. Ms Pacheco accepted the application form and went ahead to enter it into the Acceptance register. She opened a file and carried it to her supervisor as it was incomplete.

The normal procedure would have been for it to go to registry until the interview date given to the applicant. Ms Pacheco did not issue a receipt of acceptance to Minister Penner; he was advised this would be done when he submits (the missing documents. He never got the receipt as he did not submit the documents. She informed us that the application was brought in to the Immigration and Nationality Department September 2013 (date she can't recall).

- 7.17 Ms Pacheco revealed that Minister Penner visited the Department on another day in September 2013 (again she can't recall the date) and requested the file pertaining to Wonhong Kim. The file was given to him via letter dated September 2013 along with other files. Ms Pacheco indicated that the file in question was with the Director, but the Director indicated that the said file was in the possession of Minister Hulse. (We were not provided with any evidence that file was with the Minister) Ms. Pacheco further stated that Minister Penner never returned the file. In addition, to her knowledge payment was never made for Wonhong Kim's nationality.

The usual procedure after files are returned from the Minister is that the individuals are informed by phone to come in and pay the required fee for Belizean nationality. Ms Pacheco stated that as at the date of the interview this procedure was still being employed. Apparently, a standard letter format exists but is never used. A copy of the receipt is made and placed on the individual's file. All persons who show up at the department are made to sign their oath of allegiance in the morning after which they attend the swearing in ceremony in the afternoon.

Ceremonies are held at the George Price Centre. Ms Pacheco stated that there is no record of Wonhong Kim signing the oath of allegiance and him attending the swearing in ceremony. She confirmed that there was no ceremony after June 2013.

- 7.18 Ms Pacheco continued that it was not out of the ordinary that Minister Penner asked for files as Minister Hulse has also done this. Additionally, she stated that other Ministers bring in applications that are incomplete and they promise that they would bring in the documents. They usually do even if after a long time.
- 7.19 We asked why she accepted Wonhong Kim's application from Minister Penner knowing that it was incomplete. Her response was that he was the Minister of Immigration and had promised he would bring in the required documents. Also, her supervisor was aware of the situation since he would always be informed of any situation. In addition, she did not want to be transferred to another station if she did not comply with the request as she also felt intimidated by Minister Penner. We asked why she did not go to the substantive Minister, Minister Hulse. Ms Pacheco responded that she did not know why she never went to Minister Hulse. However, Minister Hulse and the Director were aware that Minister Penner was always in the Office for extended periods of time.

- 7.20 As stated in our Passport report Section III Wonhong Kim was issued Belizean nationality certificate # 28577/13 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2013 (Number Book had 2<sup>nd</sup> September 2013) signed by Minister Elvin Penner. He was subsequently issued Belizean Passport #P0246777 on the 9<sup>th</sup> September 2013 without appearing for his Passport biometrics. We requested his nationality file 31986 in writing on the 21<sup>st</sup> November 2013 and again on 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014 but it was not presented. Notably, his name was not seen on the list of missing files that was presented to the Minister in a report after a nationality file inventory was done by Administrative Officer, Ms. Karen Samuels from the Ministry of Labour.
- 7.21 We received a copy of a letter dated 21<sup>st</sup> January 2015 from National Immigration Agency Ministry of the Interior of Taiwan which informed that Wonhong Kim was detained in Yilan Detention Center from 1<sup>st</sup> August to 26<sup>th</sup> September 2013. That letter verified that he was not in Belize on 2<sup>nd</sup> September when he supposedly applied for his Belizean nationality and when his nationality certificate was backed dated. Also, that he did not take his biometrics on the 9<sup>th</sup> September 2013 when his Passport P0246777 was issued.

***Yakup Sut was fraudulently issued Nationality Certificate 28570/13***

Section 10 (1b) of Belizean Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize revised edition 2000 stipulates:

“This section shall apply to any applicant for registration as a citizen of Belize who has the following qualifications - (b) that the applicant is a person who is ordinarily resident in Belize and has been so resident for a period of five years immediately preceding the date of the application

8. We noted from the photocopy of his Belizean Nationality Certificate number 28570/13 (attached to his Passport application form) that Yakup Sut’s permanent address was stated as San Pedrito Area , San Pedro Town, A.C, Belize C.A. It was signed on 3rd June 2013 by Minister Elvin Penner. The photocopy was certified by Erwin Robinson on 23rd August 2013(his initials was confirmed by the current OIC Passport section) and he certified that he had compared the copy with the original and that it was true and complete copy.
- 8.2 We saw through verification of the Register for Citizen by Registration of said certificate number 28570/13; that the page which had the series 28482 to 28515 was blank which implied that the certificate numbers had not yet been utilized. We examined the Nationality Number Book and it revealed that certificate number 28570/13 was in the name of Yakup Sut however, it was dated 16th August 2013 instead of 3rd June 2013 as stated on his nationality certificate signed by Minister Penner. It appeared that Minister Penner had backdated Yakup Sut’s certificate as those certificates signed by him during the period June 2013 (as seen in the Number Book/Register) started from serial number 28419 and ended with 28455.

8.3 We checked the number book and it revealed that Yakup Sut's nationality file number was 31973. In an attempt to verify that Yakup Sut had met all the requirements in being awarded a Belizean nationality his file number was given to the nationality records section however up to the time of writing this report said file could not be located. We were therefore unable to verify that all the necessary documents were in the file and if he had met all requirements to become a citizen of Belize.

**We found no evidence that Yakup Sut paid the nationality fee of Belize Three Hundred dollars.**

Section 23 of the Belizean Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize revised edition 2000 dictates:

“Every person to whom a certificate under this Act is granted shall, in respect of that certificate, pay, in the prescribed manner, a fee according to the prescribed rates”.

8.4 In an attempt to verify that Yakup Sut had paid Belize three hundred dollars (\$300.00) which is the fee charged for nationality by registration, we examined receipts issued by Immigration and for the period January to September 2013 and we found no receipt which indicated that Yakup Sut had made payment of the required fee associated with the nationality.

- **Interview with Mr. Gordon Wade OIC Nationality section – 20th February 2014**

8.5 In an interview held on 20th February 2014 with Mr. Gordon Wade, OIC Nationality Section, we asked him whether permanent residence files (PR) are looked at in the process of obtaining nationality and his response was that they looked at face value as they know their officers signatures, that is, they have been working together for so long that it is easy for each of them to recognize another co-worker's signature when it appears on visas issued so PR files were not used. This has now changed since the incident in September 2013. The PR files are now attached to the Nationality files for onward processing of the applications.

**Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) was fraudulently issued Nationality certificate 28456/13**

9. We noted from his Passport application form that Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) was born in Taiwan on 6th September 1958. He changed his name on 5th August 2013 to Peter Pang (photocopy of Deed of name change was attached to his application form) in the presence of Notary Public Jose Cardona). Under his previous name Yiu-Pang Chen, on the 18<sup>th</sup> May 2013, he received his Belizean Nationality via certificate 28456/13 which was signed by Minister Elvin Penner. We saw that on the photocopy of the nationality certificate attached to his Passport application form. The photocopies of the Deed of name change and nationality certificate 28456 were signed by Immigration Officer, Miss Ruby Gutierrez, who certified that she had compared the copies with the originals and that they were true and complete copies.

9.2 We noted that the signature on his Deed of name change did not match the signature on his Passport application form.

9.3 We examined the Register of Citizen by Registration and observed that the no entry was made for certificate number 28456. This implied that the certificate number was not issued.

We also examined the Nationality Number Book/Register and it showed that certificate number 28456/13 was in the name of Yiu-Pang Chen however, it was dated 10th July 2013 instead of 18th May 2013 as stated on the photocopy of his nationality certificate. The certificate was apparently backdated *as the series 28306 to 28379 were issued in April 2013 while 28380 to 28418 were issued in May 2013.*

9.4 We saw the handwriting and signature of OIC Nationality section, Mr. Gordon Wade on a note dated 11<sup>th</sup> October 2013, at the bottom of the Numbers book in which he corrected the file numbers for Yiu Pang Chen and of Jack Jie Qin (reported on at paragraph **10** below) in a note stating, "...as per BNA file Register 23.4.12 (signed G Wade)".

9.5 We noted that Yiu-Pang Chen's (Peter Pang) nationality file number was stated as 31922 in the Nationality Number Book, which we requested but it was not presented to us.

#### **Verification of nationality fee**

9.6 We looked at the receipts issued for the period January 2013 to July 2013 and we were unable to find any evidence to substantiate that Yiu-Pang Chen's (Peter Pang) paid the required fee of Belize three hundred dollars (\$300.00) for certificate 28457/13. Please note that he was not qualified for the nationality certificate since he did not have a permanent residence status nor was there any evidence to prove he lived in Belize for the required five years.

- **Verification of individual to manifest at Philip Goldson International Airport**

9.7 We found that Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) did not qualify for Belizean nationality as he entered the country of Belize on *10th April 2013* from Houston USA on United Airline *flight 1407*.

9.8 We noted that Yiu Pang Chen used his ROC Taiwan native Passport #302899786 issued 20<sup>th</sup> April 2011 with expiration date 20<sup>th</sup> April 2021 to apply for his Belizean Passport P0244747. We could not find any record of a visa being issued to him.

9.9 We saw no record that Yiu Pang Chen had been issued Permanent Residence status or that his nationality application was recorded as received in the File Diary.

We did not see his name in the interview register as being interviewed before he received his Belizean nationality.



9.10 In this case there has been a clear violation of section 22 of the Belizean Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize revised edition 2000 which states:

*“Any person who, for the purpose of procuring anything to be done or not to be done under this act, makes any statement which he knows to be false in a material particular commits an offence and shall, on conviction after summary trial before a magistrate, be liable to imprisonment for a term not exceeding twelve months.”*

**Passport application Peter Pang – Belizean Passport P0244747**

9.11 Peter Pang applied for a Belizean Passport on 7<sup>th</sup> August 2013 and paid a fee of \$50.00 vide receipt number 967738, for the regular Passport service. His Passport P0244747 was printed on 13<sup>th</sup> August 2013 and delivered by Omar Phillips and was received by Wen Jing Chen whose photo identification was not attached nor was an authorization letter seen which authorised him to pick up Peter Pang’s Belizean Passport P0244747.

**9.12 Table A** below shows the officers who were involved in the Passport process for Peter Pang. To date Mr. Pang’s Passport P0244747 has not been delivered out of the system. In addition, we noted that Omar Phillips delivered the Passport to Wen Jung Chen while the Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS) have the Passport at QA (Quality Assurance).

**Table A**

The following shows the officers who were involved in the Passport process for Peter Pang

| USR_FNAME | USR_LNAME | USR Step                            | App Step Date       |
|-----------|-----------|-------------------------------------|---------------------|
| Clarette  | Tathum    | Created                             | 07/08/2013<br>12:59 |
| Clarette  | Tathum    | Data entry                          | 07/08/2013<br>12:59 |
| Clarette  | Tathum    | Data Modified                       | 07/08/2013<br>13:00 |
| Sharon    | Flowers   | Approval with no Biometric<br>Check | 13/08/2013<br>09:01 |
| Mark      | Tench     | Print                               | 13/08/2013<br>10:01 |
| Mark      | Tench     | Print Confirm                       | 13/08/2013<br>10:02 |
| Tiffany   | Taylor    | QA Override                         | 13/08/2013<br>10:37 |

9.13 The recommenders for Peter Pang were Martin Cal and Fausto Augustine, who endorsed that they knew Pang for one (1) year and 3 years respectively and both signed and dated the recommenders' forms on the 6<sup>th</sup> August 2013. Those two recommenders along with Peter Pang clearly ignored the warning on Page 1 of Schedule 1 Form 1 Belize Passport application labelled "Warning to the applicant and the recommenders".

**Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) was fraudulently issued Nationality certificate 28457/13**

10. We noted from his Passport application form that Jack Jie Qin (*Marc Chin*) was born in China and his date of birth was 30th November 1960. As with Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) he changed his name on 5th August 2013 to Marc Chin (photocopy of Deed of name change was attached to his application form) in the presence of Notary Public Jose Cardona. His change of name was registered at Vital Statistics Unit in Belize City on the 6th August 2013. He, like Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) received his Belizean nationality via certificate 28457/13 on the 18th May 2013 under his previous name Jack Jie Qin which was signed by Minister Elvin Penner. We noted these observations on the photocopy of the nationality certificate attached to his Passport application form. As with Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) Immigration Officer, Ruby Gutierrez, certified that she had compared the copies of Marc Chin's Deed of change of name and nationality certificate with the originals and that they were true and complete copies. An examination of his Passport application form and his deed of change of name dated 5th August 2013 showed that the signatures did not match.

10.2 We noted that there was also no entry for Jack Jie Qin's (Marc Chin) nationality certificate number 28457/13 which was also on the same page as certificate number 28456 issued to Yiu-Pang Chen's (Peter Pang). We found his name recorded as being issued certificate number 28457/13 in the Nationality number book and it was dated 10th July 2013 not 18th May 2013 as stated on the certified photocopy of his nationality certificate. His nationality certificate was apparently also backdated. We also noticed that the Nationality Numbers Book had Jack Jie Qin's (Marc Chin) nationality file number as 31924, which we requested but it was not presented to us.

10.3 We were able to ascertain that the nationality files of Jack Jie Qin and Quoc Vinh Truong below had been in the possession of Attorney, Arthur Saldivar and later handed over to the Police. We have the copies of the covers of those files which we received from Arthur Saldivar on 13<sup>th</sup> April, 2015. Further investigation is required to ascertain the contents of those two files.

- **Verification of nationality fee**

10.4 We were unable to find any evidence to indicate that Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) paid the fee of Belize three hundred dollars (\$300.00) for his nationality certificate.

We were also unable to find any evidence to substantiate that he was qualified for the nationality certificate. He did not have a permanent residence status and did not provide any proof that he lived in Belize for the required five years.

- **Verification of individual passengers to manifest at Philip Goldson International Airport**

10.5 As with Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang), we verified from the manifest, that Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) entered the country of Belize on *10th April 2013* from Houston USA on United Airline *flight 1407*.

10.6 We noted that Jack Jie Qin had a US Passport number 450562990 issued 27<sup>th</sup> April 2009 with expiry date of 26<sup>th</sup> April 2019 and did not need a visa to enter Belize.

10.7 We found no record that Jack Jie Qin had been issued Permanent Residence status or that his nationality application was recorded as received in the File Diary.

As with Yiu-Pang Chen, we did not see Jack Jie Qin's name in the interview register to indicate that he was interviewed before he received his Belizean nationality.

10.8 Again, there is clear violation here of Section 22 of the Belizean Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize revised edition 2000.

- **Passport Application Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) – Belizean Passport number P0244745**

**Section 3(1) (a) of the Passport Regulations 2013 stipulates:**

An applicant shall submit his application for a Passport to be issued –

(a) In his own name, in the form set out as Form 1 in Schedule 1;

Schedule 1, Form 1, Belize Passport Application Form page 2, under documents to be produced section(c) states:

- If the applicant is: A Belizean by registration (born outside Belize but has become a citizen through naturalization) –
- Native birth certificate or Passport and
- (ii) his/her Belize nationality certificate

10.9 Marc Chin applied for his Belizean Passport on an application form dated 6<sup>th</sup> August 2013 and on 7<sup>th</sup> August 2013 he paid the fee of \$50.00 via receipt number 967734, for the regular Passport service.

10.10 We noted that Marc Chin did NOT provide a copy of his native Birth Certificate or Passport as required by page 2 of Schedule 1, Form 1 of Belize Passport Application Form. Instead he submitted a copy of his United States of America Passport which showed his name as Jack Jie Qin. Therefore the above quoted instruction was contravened by the applicant as well as the Director of Immigration and Nationality who failed to secure the required documents.

10.11 His Passport P0244745 was noted printed on 13th of August 2013, and was delivered by Omar Phillips and received by Wen Jing Chen, (the same person who picked up Yiu-Pang Chen's (Peter Pang) Passport. Again, Wen Jing Chen's photo identification was not attached nor was an authorization letter seen which authorised him to pick up Marc Chin's Passport P0244745.

10.12 **Table B** below shows the officers involved in the Passport process for Marc Chin. As with Yiu-Pang Chen's (Peter Pang) Passport, the BPIS showed that to date, Chin's Passport P0244745 has not been delivered out of the system. We noted, that the BPIS have his Passport like Peter Pang's at QA. It also showed that it was QA override which meant that the QA officer accepted the Passport although something was wrong with it in the system. In discussions with the current and a former Officer In charge, they explained that this acceptance could be because of something minor as a small speck that could not be fixed or the readable part of the Passport could not be read by the BPIS. They also revealed that it often occurs that Passports are not line up properly.

**Table B**

The following table shows officers involved in processing of the Passport for Marc Chin

| USR_FNAME | USR_LNAME | USR Step                         | App Step Date    |
|-----------|-----------|----------------------------------|------------------|
| Clarette  | Tathum    | Created                          | 07/08/2013 12:54 |
| Clarette  | Tathum    | Data entry                       | 07/08/2013 12:54 |
| Clarette  | Tathum    | Data Modified                    | 07/08/2013 13:02 |
| Sharon    | Flowers   | Approval with no Biometric Check | 12/08/2013 16:37 |
| Mark      | Tench     | Print                            | 13/08/2013 09:57 |
| Mark      | Tench     | Print Confirm                    | 13/08/2013 09:58 |
| Tiffany   | Taylor    | QA Override                      | 13/08/2013 10:36 |

10.13 As with Yakup Sut and Peter Pang (Yiu-Pang Chen) Martin Cal and Fausto Augustine both endorsed , signed and dated the recommenders’ forms A and B for Marc Chin that they knew him for one and three years respectively.

Those forms were dated the 6<sup>th</sup> of August 2013. Again there is a clear violation of the warning on Page 1 of Schedule 1 Form 1 Belize Passport Application labelled “WARNING to the applicant and the recommenders”.

**Quoc Vinh Truong (Simon Truong) was fraudulently issued nationality certificate number 28458/13**

11. We noted from his Passport application form that Quoc Vinh Truong (Simon Truong) was born in Vietnam on 11<sup>th</sup> March 1980 and his permanent address in Belize was stated as 21 Vernon Street, Belize City Belize C.A. As with Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) and Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) **Quoc Vinh Truong** changed his name on 5<sup>th</sup> August 2013 to Simon Truong (photocopy of Deed of name change was attached to his application form) in the presence of Notary Public Jose Cardona). His change of name was registered at Vital Statistics Unit in Belize City on the 6th August 2013. On the 18th May 2013, under his previous name Quoc Vinh Truong, he received his Belizean nationality via certificate 28458/13 which was signed by Minister Elvin Penner. We observed these from the photocopy of the nationality certificate attached to his Passport application form.

The photocopies of the Deed of name change and nationality certificate 28458/13 were signed by Immigration Officer, Miss Ruby Gutierrez, (as she did with Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) and Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) who certified that she had compared the copies with the originals and that they were true and complete copies.

11.2 We observed that the signature on his deed of change of name dated 5th August 2013 did not match the signature on page 1 of his Passport application form.

11.3 We noted as with Yiu-Pang Chen (Peter Pang) and Jack Jie Qin (Marc Chin) there was no entry for nationality certificate number 28458 in the Register of Citizens by Registration which was also on the same page as certificates number 28456 and 28457 which had been issued to the aforementioned individuals.

11.4 Our search of the Nationality Number Book indicated that Quoc Vinh Truong was issued certificate number 28458/13 which was dated 10th July 2013 and not 18th May 2013. His certificate was also apparently backdated. His file number was stated as 31923 which was requested but was not presented to us.

- **Verification of nationality fee**

11.5 We verified that Quoc Vinh Truong (Simon Truong) also did not pay the fee of Belize three hundred dollars (\$300.00) for his nationality. He was not qualified since he did not have a permanent residence status and did not meet the five years Belize residency requirement.

- **Verification of individual to manifest at Phillip Goldson International Airport**

11.6 We verified from the manifest, that Quoc Vinh Truong (Simon Truong) entered the country of Belize on **10th April 2013** from Houston USA on United Airline **flight 1407**.

11.7 We noted that Vinh Truong had US Passport number 039060637 issued 25<sup>th</sup> October 2004 with expiry date of 24<sup>th</sup> October 2014 and did not need a visa to enter Belize.

We saw no record that Quoc Vinh Truong had been issued Permanent Residence status or that his nationality application was recorded as received in the File Diary. We did not see Quoc Vinh Truong's name in the interview register as verification of him being interviewed before he received his Belizean nationality.

- **Passport Application Quoc Vinh Truong (Simon Truong) – Belizean Passport number P0244746**

11.8 Simon Truong applied for his Belizean Passport (as did Marc Chin) on an application form dated 6<sup>th</sup> August 2013 and on 7<sup>th</sup> August 2013 he paid the fee of \$50.00 via receipt number 967737, for the regular Passport service. His Passport P0244746 which was printed on 13th of August 2013 was delivered by Omar Phillips and was received (as did Peter Pang and Marc Chin) by Wen Jing Chen without any authorization letter and photo identification attached to the Passport Application Form.

11.9 We noted that The Data Entry Officer and the Print Operator did NOT sign the application form on page 2 under the section titled "FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY".

11.10 We searched the BPIS and it revealed the Passport application went through the following stages and by whom. We noted that the person who delivered the Passport to Wen Jing Chen according to the application form was Omar Phillips. The BPIS showed that said Passport **P0244746** had not yet been delivered out of the system and was still at Quality Assurance Pass (QA) and as such this Passport should still be at the Passport section. **Table C** below shows the steps in the preparation of Simon Truong's Passport number P0244746.

**Table C**

The following table shows officers involved in the processing of the Passport for Simon Truong

| USR_FNAME | USR_LNAME | USR Step                         | App Step Date    |
|-----------|-----------|----------------------------------|------------------|
| Maria     | Puga      | Created                          | 07/08/2013 12:54 |
| Maria     | Puga      | Data entry                       | 07/08/2013 12:54 |
| Sharon    | Flowers   | Approval with no Biometric Check | 13/08/2013 08:08 |
| Mark      | Tench     | Print                            | 13/08/2013 10:00 |
| Mark      | Tench     | Print Confirm                    | 13/08/2013 10:00 |
| Tiffany   | Taylor    | QA Pass                          | 13/08/2013 10:38 |

11.11 We observed that one of the recommenders for Simon Truong was Martin Cal (he also signed Yakup Sut, Peter Pang and Marc Chin's 3A form) of number 3 University Boulevard in Belmopan City who signed as Recommender A. He stated that he knew the applicant for one (1) year. In "the specify relationship" section he inserted the words "know him for 1 year". Another recommender, Fausto Augustine, teacher, with license number 200000#12 of 7 Antelope Street, Belmopan signed as knowing the applicant "for the past 3 years" "through friend". Those two recommenders signed the recommenders' forms on the 6<sup>th</sup> of August 2013.

11.12 Again, there is a clear violation of the warning on page 1, schedule 1, Form 1, Belize Passport Application labelled "WARNING to the applicant and the recommenders".

**11.13** We noted with interest that in an interview held on the 20th February 2014 with Ms Addy Pacheco, it was revealed that there was no swearing in ceremony held after June 2013 and that certificates are not issued to applicants until they have signed their oath of allegiance and had attended swearing in ceremony.

11.14 We noted that the Certificate Numbers Book showed that the certificates for Yiu-Pang Chen, Jack Jie Qin and Quoc Vinh Truong were entered on the 10<sup>th</sup> July 2013 along with other names as listed at **Table D** below in a handwriting that was not similar to the handwriting of the other names listed as having been issued certificate numbers during the period 6<sup>th</sup> June to the 16<sup>th</sup> July 2013. We examined a copy of the nationality certificate for Bo-Jie Shau (Bo-Jie Shan was the name on the certificate) dated the 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2013 and signed by Minister Elvin Penner, indicating that it was also backdated.

**Table D**

The following are the names of the individuals whose names were seen entered in the Nationality Number Book on the 10<sup>th</sup> July 2013

| <b>Name</b>      | <b>BNA File #</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate #</b> | <b>Date recorded in Numbers Book</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|------------------|-------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|
| Yiu-Pang Chen    | 31924             | 28456/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found  |
| Jack Jie Qin     | 31922             | 28457/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found  |
| Quoc Ving Truong | 31923             | 28458/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found  |
| Shing Bo-Lin     | 31925             | 28459/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found (no Nationality fees paid; not interviewed)  |
| Yi-Yun Wang      | 31928             | 28460/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found (no Nationality fees paid; not interviewed)  |
| Bo-Jie Shau      | 31927             | 28461/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found. Copy of Nationality certificate showed it was dated the 22 <sup>nd</sup> May 2013 (no Nationality fees paid; not interviewed) |
| Jia Jing Lai     | 31926             | 28462/13                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | Did not qualify for Nationality; BNA file not found (no Nationality fees paid; not interviewed)  |



11.15 We found out from one of the Registry Clerk, Mr Joshua Martinez, working in the Registry section of the INS (Nationality) that all nationality files with BNA numbers starting in the series “319##” were not located in the filing cabinet. Those may have been removed (no names were mentioned), prior to the audit, along with other nationality files. We were told when we visited the Registry to pick up some files we had requested. The fact that those files in that series ended up with Attorney, Arthur Saldivar, suggest that they were removed. Although those files were not at the INS Registry and were not presented to us, we know that several of them had been in the possession of Arthur Saldivar. As stated at paragraph **10.3** above we have copies of the covers of files which we received from Attorney, Arthur Saldivar. Strangely, the Inventory Report, on missing BNA files prepared by Administrative Officer, Ms. Karen Samuels, did not record them as missing. On the missing files list there were several BNA files starting with the serial numbering “3####” dating back to 2007 although that number series had not started. The missing files list had only one BNA file opened in 2013 recorded as missing, which was # 29741/13 issued to Kun Ying Zhu, but we were aware of many BNA files opened in 2013 that could not be located at the INS and were not presented to us.

11.16 We requested the Nationality files of all persons listed at **Table D** above in February 2014 but since they were not presented we could not verify whether all other requirements had been met.

**Jinchen An (Jin Chen An) was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #28271/12**

12. The irregularities observed on Jinchen An’s visa application and in his nationality file suggest that an illegitimate scheme was organized involving foreign agents, senior Government Ministers, officials and employees of the INS (Visa, Nationality and Passport sections), Justices of the Peace, citizens and residents (visa sponsors) of Belize. Officers of Nationality Section of the INS seem to have been aware of individuals visiting Belize to acquire Belizean Nationality and Passport fraudulently.

12.2 We saw a visa application form in the name Jinchen An who was born in China and date of birth was stated as 15<sup>th</sup> August 1973, submitted to the Belmopan Office. On the top right hand corner of the visa application reserved for the visa issuance or approval date, the application was dated 25<sup>th</sup> October 2012. On Jinchen An visa application it was stated that he planned to travel to Belize on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2012 and planned to leave on 16<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The purpose of his visit was “Business” and planned to stay at the San Ignacio Hotel. The application form was dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 and signed by Roger Tien.

12.3 We also saw attached to the visa application form, a copy of an invitation letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> September 2012 from Minister Erwin Contreras, Minister of Trade, Investment Promotion, Private Sector Development and Consumer Protection.

The letter was addressed to Mr. Roger Tien of Guangdong Province, People's Republic of China and stated:

*"Through this medium, I as Minister of Trade...wish to invite you and your group of Investors to visit our beautiful country of Belize to get a firsthand look at the great opportunities for doing business in our country. As you will soon uncover, the opportunities for investment will range in all sectors of the economy including tourism, oil exploration, financial services to government and the list goes on. It is therefore my distinct pleasure to formally invite you and your group to visit Belize at the earliest convenience. Your presence in Belize would be most welcomed. Sincerely Yours. Hon Erwin Contreras (Minister)"*

12.4 We also saw attached to Jin Chen An's visa application a copy of an undated letter from Roger Tien, c/o San Ignacio Hotel, Room 116 San Ignacio Town, Cayo District addressed to Director, Immigration Department, Belmopan. The subject of the letter was: Application for Visa Mr. Jin Chen An and Mr. Liming Huang, Chinese National and it stated:

*"Dear Madam, I hereby submit two applications for a visa for the above named Chinese nationals whom are consultants to me and my group of Investors. I attached a copy of an invitation letter from Hon Erwin Contreras concerning investments in Belize for my investment group. I intend to bring both of them the first week in November so that they can prepare the Investment proposal before the group proposes visit in December. I anticipate your kind consideration". Sincerely (Signed Roger Tien).*

12.5 We noted that Roger Tien submitted the application for Jinchén An as one of his "Consultants" for his investment group but there was no evidence attached to the visa application form to prove that Roger Tien was an investor.

12.6 We saw that the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, wrote on the copy of the letter from Minister Contreras, "Mr. Guy, please accept applications with respect this request." She affixed her signature with the date 24/10/2012 ... "Let me know how many submitted" Signed 24/10/2012. At the end of the letter was another note by Miss Ruth Meighan, "Note that applicant decided that they do not need visa again". Again she affixed her signature with the date 24/10/2012.

12.7 We observed that Jinchén An was approved a Belize visa on the 24<sup>th</sup> October 2012 by former Director Miss Ruth Meighan, "based on letter from Min. E. Contreras".

Immigration Officer, Beverly Tillett wrote on the visa application form, “Please approval granted for issuing by DINS” (signed B. Tillett) and dated 25<sup>th</sup> October 2012. Visa number V00034694 was issued on the 25<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to Jinchen An.

12.8 The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual (July 1, 2011) Page 5 Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10 states:

*“The entire Passport pages and any other Passport whether expired or valid must be requested in order to verify the domicile period of the applicant. These pages must be examined and certified by the counter clerk; therefore originals must be submitted along with copies.”*

12.9 We could not ascertain whether a bogus Passport was submitted to the Counter Clerk and then copied by staff of the Nationality section, or, whether only the copies that appeared as Passport pages were submitted. We also could not ascertain if the bogus Passport pages were prepared at the Nationality Section or submitted to them by applicants or by other persons.

12.10 We saw a copy of Jinchen An’s Chinese Passport #G50950492 issued 18<sup>th</sup> May 2011 with expiry date of 17<sup>th</sup> May 2021, was also attached to his visa application form. He was in possession of a US Visa #E2243069 with Control #20111534300001 issued 7<sup>th</sup> June 2011 in Hong Kong.

12.11 We requested Jinchen An’s Nationality file 29563/12 and when it was examined we found the following:

- i. His nationality application form was undated and his address was stated as 2 1/2 Miles Northern Highway. The application stated that he entered Belize on the 28<sup>th</sup> August 2007 through the BNBS. On the affidavit section of the nationality application he stated that he was a Cook/ Businessman and on the application he stated that his place of business was National Bar and Restaurant also located at 2 1/2 Miles Northern Highway.
- ii. The Interviewing Officer’s signature appeared as “Jimenez”, whom we later found was, Lourdes Jimenez, who was not an Immigration Officer but a former clerk in the Nationality section. She noted on the General Declaration form, “Int (Interview) Conducted as per Supervisor”. No date and time of the interview with Jinchen An was recorded on his application form.
- iii. His affidavit on the nationality application form to be made by the applicant in support of the application was witnessed by Chiu Hsiang Lo, JP of 2 ½ Miles

Northern Highway (see Passport report Re: Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo) dated the 29<sup>th</sup> August 2012. His nationality referees were Wayne Mario Hulse, Businessman, also of address 2 ½ Miles Northern Highway who stated that he met the applicant at the Market and Steven Young, Businessman of 100 East Canal who stated that he knew the applicant “through Ms. Rina”. Both referees stated that they knew the applicant for 5 years. Their referrals were also dated the 29<sup>th</sup> August 2012, two months before the applicant’s visa was approved by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan on the 24<sup>th</sup> October 2012. The name of the applicant appeared to have been filled in one the application for the referees by what appeared as the handwriting of the OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade.

We noted that Referee, Wayne Mario Hulse of 2 ½ Miles Northern Highway and an individual named Stephanie Hulse of the same address, were the referees for Zhengjun An, as referred to at **paragraph 13** below.

iv. Jinchun An’s Police Department Criminal Record dated the 30<sup>th</sup> August 2012 was “searched checked and certified correct” by an illegible signature of a person who signed on behalf of Eleanor Ramirez, W/Sgt. The document also contained a signature which appeared to be the signature of Keith Lino who signed on behalf of Miguel Segura A.C.P for the Commissioner of Police. That date was almost two (2) months before the applicant’s visa was approved on the 25<sup>th</sup> October, 2012. His Chinese Passport number recorded on the Police Report was G17945143 (the bogus Passport number) with issue date of 18<sup>th</sup> May 2006 and expiry date of 17<sup>th</sup> May 2016 and not G50950492 issued 18<sup>th</sup> May 2011 with expiry date of 17<sup>th</sup> May 2021 (used to apply for his visa). We could not ascertain who gave the police his Chinese Passport # G17945143 since the applicant had not yet arrived in Belize.

v. A faded copy of a bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143 with issue date 18<sup>th</sup> May 2006 and expiry date 17<sup>th</sup> May 2016. That copy of Passport #G17945143 may have been a manipulated copy as it had the same photo as the one seen in his Chinese Passport #G50950492 that had issue date 18<sup>th</sup> May 2011 and expiry date 17<sup>th</sup> May 2021, which he used to apply for his visa.

On page 9 of said Passport was the very faded illegible British Consulate Guangzhou wet visa stamp for visit to Belize. The bogus Belize visa was seen approved on the 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2007 for a single entry between 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2007 and 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007, while yet another bogus entry stamp was seen for the BNBS with the written entry date of 20<sup>th</sup> August 2007 recorded. However, no Mexican issued visa stamp or evidence of travel through Mexico was seen.

We also observed on pages 10 to 13 of his bogus Passport #G17945143, bogus temporary employment stamps for “Cook” at Ah Ruan Restaurant, Ah Wong Restaurant and for “Shop Clerk” at Peng-Fei Ruan for periods 2007-2010. **Table E** list the description, dates and approvers of the bogus stamps that were seen on the copied pages of Jinchen An’s bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143

**Table E**

The following is the description, dates and approvers of the bogus stamps that were seen on the copied pages of Jinchen An’s bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>                                 | <b>Description of/Information on Stamp</b>                         | <b>Date of Stamp/ approval date</b> | <b>Period Approved</b>                                     | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/or Belize Immigration Officer</b>   |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| British Consulate General Guangzhou                  | Good for a single journey to Belize within 3 months<br>G2209628.07 | 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2007          | 28th August to 27 <sup>th</sup> September 2007             | Appeared as J Murray (officer’s post was not stated on the stamp) |
| Belize Northern Border Station Arrival Stamp #79     | Visitor Permit to Belize   | 28th August 2007                    | 28th August to 27 <sup>th</sup> September 2007             | Unknown Signature   |
| Temporary Employment Permit INS Belmopan 775/Bmp/07  | As a cook for Ah Wing Restaurant                                   | 11 <sup>th</sup> October 2007       | Does not remain longer than 10 <sup>th</sup> October 2008  | Liandro Quischan Immigration Officer                              |
| Temporary Employment Permit INS Belmopan 1096/Bmp/08 | Shop Clerk Peng Fei Ruan   | 8 <sup>th</sup> September 2008      | Does not remain longer than 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2009 | Liandro Quischan Immigration Officer                              |

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>   | <b>Description of/Information on Stamp</b>   | <b>Date of Stamp/ approval date</b> | <b>Period Approved</b>                                     | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/or Belize Immigration Officer</b>                    |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|--|
| Temporary Employment Permit<br>Belmopan<br>1419/Bmp/09         | As a cook for Ah Ruan Restaurant   | 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2009      | Does not remain longer than 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 | Giovanni Tzib Immigration Officer  |
| Visa extension (37)<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan    | Does not enter into employment paid or unpaid...does not engage in any business or profession without the consent of the Director... | 6 <sup>th</sup> September 2010      | Does not remain longer than 5 <sup>th</sup> October 2010   | Carlos Amaya Immigration Officer (deceased)  |
| Permanent Residence Stamp, Director, Immigration & Nationality | Permitted to remain in Belize as a Permanent Resident "Cook"   | 5 <sup>th</sup> October 2010        | Permit #42395/10<br><br>Permanent Residence File #24490/10 | Gareth Murillo Former Director, INS (signature dated 7 <sup>th</sup> October 2010) |

12.12 If he came to Belize through the Northern Border, the absence of Mexican stamps suggested that he may have received his bogus Chinese Passport in Belize and he used a genuine Chinese Passport to travel with. This led us to question how he actually got to Belize, and if he did through Mexico, he may have entered Mexico illegally.

12.13 In Jinchun An's nationality file we found a letter Ref: Min/C/3/12 (52) dated 13<sup>th</sup> September 2012 (before the applicant Jinchun An was approved a Belize visa on the 24<sup>th</sup> October 2012). This letter was addressed to the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan and it purportedly came from Hon Santiago Santino Castillo, Area Representative for Caribbean Shores Constituency and Minister of State within the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development. The letter stated:

*“Dear Ms Meighan,*

*This letter serves to introduce Jin Chen, one of my supporters and a constituent. Jin Chen applied for **her** nationality...I support **her** application; therefore, request is being made to have her application be processed, as soon as possible. If you need any further information, please do not hesitate to contact me at 822-2526. Thank you for your favourable consideration. Sincerely (signed) Hon. Santiago Santino Castillo, Area Representative and Minister of State (in the) Ministry of Finance and Economic Development.”*

12.14 It was interesting to note that Jin Chen An was referred to as a female in the letter when in fact Jin Chen An is a male.

12.15 We also found another letter dated November 27, 2012 purportedly from Dr. Arturo Gamero (deceased), Physician/Surgeon of #40 Eve Street, Belize City. It was addressed “To Whom It May Concern” and stated thusin:

*Re: Mr. Jin-chen AN,*

*This certifies that Mr. Jin-chen AN, DOB August 15, 1973, has been seen in office on several occasions in the last few weeks for Acute Gastro-duodenitis. The acute phase of his medical conditions has been stabilized and he is currently on pharmacological treatment.*

*He has been advised to seek definitive treatment abroad and he has expressed the desire to do so in his native country.*

*Mr. AN is in urgent need of his Passport to be able to travel. This urgency is based on the need for immediate management of a potentially life-threatening condition.*

*Any consideration extended to Mr. AN in this regard is deeply appreciated.*

*Belize City, Belize, November 27, 2012*

*(signed)*

*A. Gamero, M.D.*

*(stamped)*

*Dr. Arturo Gamero*

*Physician Surgeon*

*40 Eve Street*

*Belize City, Belize*

12.16 In addition, what appeared as the handwriting of OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade was seen on the letter stating: *BNA#29563/12.*

*Jin Chen An.*

12.17 This letter was signed and dated three (3) days before the nationality certificate number 28271/12 was signed by Minister Godwin Hulse on the 30<sup>th</sup> November 2012. It appeared as if though the doctor's letter may have been used to expedite his nationality as it was recorded on the Minute Sheet of his nationality file 29563/12. However, the Doctor's letter only mentioned "Passport".

12.18 On the 28<sup>th</sup> November 2012, the OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade wrote:

"DINS, applicant qualifies for Nationality through Registration Section (10)...His Passport at enclosure (2) shows...he entered Belize in '07 and also has permanent residence stamp...file is now forwarded for your consideration."

12.19 On the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012, former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan wrote:

"Min, meets legal requirements. Recommended".

Miss Meighan did this although she had recently approved a visa to Jinchen An on the 24<sup>th</sup> October 2012.

12.20 Jinchen An was issued Belizean nationality certificate #28271/12 dated 30<sup>th</sup> November 2012 signed by Minister Godwin Hulse. We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration and found no entry for certificate # 28271/12. His name was seen in the nationality certificate Numbers Book for certificate #28271 recorded on the 30<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The handwriting in the Numbers Book appeared as that of OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade.

12.21 Jinchen An's Passport application form was not presented to us, but a check of the BPIS showed that he used the address of 2 1/2 Mls Northern Highway as his residence in Belize. He was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Chiu Hsiang Lo, JP (Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo/ Re: Passport Report), who also witnessed his nationality application affidavit and who was mentioned by the referee, Steven Young as the person through whom he met Jinchen An. We noted that he was issued his Belizean Passport P0223556 on the 4<sup>th</sup> December 2012, one (1) month and nine (9) days after he was approved a visa to enter Belize on the 24<sup>th</sup> October 2012.



12.22 Further investigation is required to determine on what date he actually entered the country after he was issued visa V00034694 dated 25<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to come to Belize.

**A copy of Chinese Passport #G17945143 was also seen in file number 26412/12 belonging to Zhengjun An**

13. We noted that a copy of Chinese Passport #G17945143 with the identical immigration stamps and signatures as those seen in Jinchen An's nationality file number was also in Zhengjun An's nationality file number 26412/12. However, Zhengjun An's Passport #G17945143 pages had different numbers and the issue and expiration dates were 29<sup>th</sup> May 2007 and 28<sup>th</sup> May 2017 respectively.

Zhengjun An's arrival date was stated as "28.9.07" while Jinchen An's date of arrival was "28.8.07". Jinchen An's arrival date appeared to have been superimposed in ink after the pages had been copied from Zhengjun An's bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143. A copy of a Police report for Zhengjun An dated 10<sup>th</sup> December 2012 was also seen in his nationality file pertaining to the same Passport #G17945143. Zhengjun An's Police Report was signed by Eleanor Ramirez W/Sgt and by an illegible signature for Miguel Segura, ACP, for Commissioner of Police.

- 13.2 We also could not ascertain if Zhengjun An's Passport copies were those of an actual bogus Passport or pages manufactured to appear as copies of a Chinese Passport. The signature of Sheryl Gillett, a Clerk in the Nationality Section, was seen on the copy of the biographic page as the person who certified that she had compared Zhengjun An's copy of bogus Passport #G17945143 with the original on the 28<sup>th</sup> March 2013. We noted that Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco, had certified the arrival date, visa extension, TEPs and PR#42395/10 on the 5<sup>th</sup> April 2013 for Zhengjun An. However, on the 7<sup>th</sup> August 2013, Ms. Sheryl Gillett wrote that his "Permanent Residence needs to be verified". The only differences were that the copies of Zhengjun An's Passport pages had different page numbers on the side and the different arrival dates. Our additional findings on Zhengjun An are outlined at Paragraph 132 of this report.

**Replacement nationality certificates were fraudulently backdated and fraudulent Nationality was given under the guise of registration and the Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Programmes**

14. We saw through examination of Passport applications for the period April 2011 to September 2013, copies of fraudulent replacement nationality certificates that were backdated and certificate numbers written on Passport applications through which persons claimed that they had received Belizean Nationality by Registration (Section 10) of Chapter 161 the Laws of Belize and through the previous Economic Citizenship Investment Programmes (BECIP) (Section 11A).

The BECIP applications and certificates implied that the applicants had received Belize nationality through economic investment from the 1990's and into the year 2000.

14.2 We also received documents from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which suggested that an illegitimate BECIP Program had been operating abroad with links to the Belize INS, Nationality Section and Passport Section. As in the case with Nina and Zhaoyi Sha (see our Passport Report reference Section III, they were told by a person by the name of Tony in Dalian, China that they were applying for Economic Citizenship but they were issued fraudulent replacement nationality certificates with numbers from under the Section 10 (Citizen by Registration). They received Belize Passports without appearing for their Passport biometrics at a Passport Section in Belize or at a Foreign Mission.

14.3 The Register of Citizens by Registration, that was utilized to fraudulently issue certificate numbers to persons mentioned in this report and in our Passport report, showed numerous discrepancies. We also found that certificate numbers were still fraudulently used on Passport applications for 2011, 2012 and 2013 by the issuance of fraudulent replacement nationality certificates and the backdating of those certificates dates. We realized that those certificate numbers were fraudulently issued during the audited period because the persons who used them applied for first-issue Passports in 2011, 2012, 2013 (see Appendices B and C).

14.4 The majority of those fraudulent replacement nationality certificates (as was outlined in our Passport Report) had what appeared to be the signature of former Director, Gareth Murillo. We were not presented with the nationality files for those individuals although said files were requested in writing. The individuals who presented those fraudulent replacement nationality certificates are discussed further in this report and are listed on appendices attached.

14.5 We also noticed that the same agents who had facilitated the application process for some individuals under an Economic Citizenship program had assisted those same persons with applications for Belizean nationality for their spouse (through marriage) and for their children (through descent). We were unable to ascertain if the previous Economic Citizenship program, referred to by Wael Zeeni during an interview with Miss Tanya Hulse, (employee at the Belize High Commission in London, was a genuine program or an illegitimate one. The finding on Wael Zeeni's family is outlined at paragraph 84 in this report.

#### **Passport Copies of bogus Chinese Passports pages were found in some nationality files**

Requirement number 2 Page 5 of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual (July 1, 2011) titled "Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10" states:

*“The entire Passport pages and any other Passport whether expired or valid must be requested in order to verify the domicile period of the applicant. These pages must be examined and certified by the counter clerk; therefore originals must be submitted along with copies.”*

15. We saw the same trend of irregular copies of Chinese Passports, which were presented for Jinchen An, Zhengjun An (above) and Belize Passport applications (see Passport report), for nationality applications. We could not ascertain whether those copies were actual Passport copies made at the Nationality Section or copied elsewhere and compared with actual Passports before they were accepted by the Clerks in the Nationality Section, or whether those copies were brought in to the Nationality Section and used by its employees without comparing them with actual Chinese Passports.

15.2 We also saw the use of a faded Belize Northern Border arrival stamp that was fraudulently used in the Nationality files examined for persons whose dates of entry into Belize was backdated.

This stamp was also used in other nationality files that we suspected the documents were also backdated, but we could not determine those persons’ correct dates of entry into Belize. Further investigation will have to be carried out to verify those persons date of entry into Belize.

15.3 In some instances we found that the issue and expiration dates of what appeared as Chinese Passports were manipulated to make them appear that the applicants had been issued the Passports at an earlier date and they would expire at a later date. Those manipulated copies appeared to have been used to specifically record back-dated entry dates and permit dates on the copied pages in order to make it appear as though those applicants had qualified for the five (5) year domicile period in Belize.

15.4 We found four individuals whose nationality files indicated that their Chinese Passports in said files and those attached to their Passport applications had major discrepancies. Our findings provided evidence that at least two of their Chinese Passports were not genuine and those individuals did not qualify for Belizean nationality issued under Section 10 of Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize. Those four individuals are listed at **Table F**

**Table F**

The following is the four individuals who's Chinese Passports had major discrepancies and who did not qualify for Belizean nationality

| <b>Name</b>                       | <b>Native Chinese Passport #1</b>   | <b>Native Chinese Passport #2</b>   | <b>Date entered the country</b>  | <b>Nationality Certificate issued</b>                      | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-----------------------------------|---|---|--|--|---|
| Dong Tao Jin<br>(Dongtao Jin)     | Copy of genuine Chinese Passport number #G33244420 with issue date 8-Jan- <u>2009</u> was used to get his Belize Visa | Copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G33244420 with issue date 8-Jan- <u>2007</u> which had a faded copy of Dong Tao Jin's picture used in his genuine Chinese PPassport #G33244420 that had been used to obtain his Belize visa   | 2 <sup>nd</sup> June 2013 through Phillip Goldson International Airport (PGIA) | 28382/13 dated 19-May-2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner | Belize visa issued V00037038 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> June 2013.<br><br>Nationality file which was requested was not presented to Audit.   |
| Xi Wang<br>(aka James Louis Wang) | Copy of Chinese Passport G58039971 issue date 7-Feb-2012 and expiry date of 6-Feb-2022 was used for Visa application  | Copy of Chinese Passport G21159033 issued 12-Feb-2007/with expiry date 11-Feb-2017 seen in nationality file and on Passport application. The same Passport picture of him was seen in Passport G58039971 which Miss Ruth Meighan had on 15 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 referred to in her letter certifying the issuance of visa V00036693 as been genuine | Not known  | 28428/13 dated 4-June-2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner | Belize visa V00036693 issued 15 <sup>th</sup> January 2013. Copies of Passport G21159033 page had bogus Guangzhou visa stamp; bogus arrival stamp at the Northern Border Station, bogus extensions and TEP stamps and bogus Permanent Residence (PR) stamps |

| Name                       | Native Chinese Passport #1  | Native Chinese Passport #2   | Date entered the country | Nationality Certificate issued   | Observations   |
|----------------------------|---|--|--------------------------|--|--|
| Jinchen An (Jin Chen An)   | Copy of Chinese Passport G50950492 issued 18th May 2011 with expiry date of 17 <sup>th</sup> May 2021 was seen attached to Visa application   | Copy of Chinese Passport <b>G17945143</b> issued 18th May 2006 with expiry date 17 <sup>th</sup> May 2016 was seen in his Nationality file ( <b>the same Passport picture of him that was seen in Passport G50950492</b> ) | Not known                | 28271/12 dated 30 <sup>th</sup> November 2012 signed by Minister Godwin Hulse  | Belize visa V00034694 approved by Ruth Meighan on the 24 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 and issued on the 25 <sup>th</sup> October 2012<br>Copies of Passport page <b>G17945143</b> had a similar bogus Guangzhou visa stamp; bogus arrival stamp at the Northern Border Station, bogus extensions and TEP stamps and bogus PR stamps with similar dates and signatures as Zhengjun An below |
| Zhengjun An (Zheng Jun An) | We saw only one Passport copy of bogus native Chinese Passport <b>G17945143</b> issued 29th May 2007 with expiry date of 28 <sup>th</sup> May 2017. This Passport number was also used in respect of Jinchen An as stated above | Copy of Chinese Passport <b>G17945143</b> issued 29th May 2007; expired 28 <sup>th</sup> May 2017 seen in his Nationality file   | Not known                | No Nationality certificate was seen in file #26412/12 but he was issued fraudulent PR Permit #42395/10. On the 4 <sup>th</sup> April 2013, Ady Pacheco submitted his nationality file for “consideration, recommendation or otherwise” to DINS and signed the minute sheet she had written | No visa seen<br>Copies of Passport page of <b>G17945143</b> had the similar bogus Guangzhou visa stamp; bogus arrival stamp from the Northern Border Station, bogus extensions and TEP stamps and bogus PR stamps with similar dates and signatures as Jinchen An above.<br>Ady Pacheco wrote on the copy of the Passport <b>G17945143</b> page with                                     |

| Name | Native Chinese Passport #1 | Native Chinese Passport #2 | Date entered the country | Nationality Certificate issued   | Observations   |
|------|----------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------|--|--|
|      |                            |                            |                          | <p>said information on. On the 7<sup>th</sup> August 2013, a S. Gillett wrote on Minute Sheet, “Permanent residence needs to be verified” and she also signed on the minute sheet she had written the information on. The Minister’s list stated that the file had been “vetted and sent to the Director” but we saw no evidence that nationality certificate and Passport had been issued up to October 2013.</p> | <p>bogus stamps that he “arrived 28<sup>th</sup> September 2007...legal with TEP’s and Ext. Then PR...(she then signed and dated it 5.4.2013) legally qualifies”</p> |

15.5 The dates of entry into Belize, and/or visas issued to those individuals above and what we observed from their Nationality files when presented are discussed further this report. The signatures of Immigration Officers and officials seen in the copies of those bogus native Passports and in the bogus stamps as outlined above appeared as those of Immigration Officers: Carlos Amaya (deceased), Liandro Quischan and Giovanni Tzib and previous Directors, Mr. Gareth Murillo and Miss Ruth Meighan. One Immigration Officer's signature could not be identified. Their signatures were also seen in other individuals' files where the Immigration stamps appeared backdated. Those other individuals are also outlined further in this report.

### **Bogus Travel Documents and backdating of Immigration Stamps in Native Passports**

16. We mentioned in our Passport report that the native Passport copies seen of Wonhong Kim and Yakup Sut appeared as bogus. We found no evidence to prove those two individuals ever entered Belize to receive Belize nationality certificates and Passports. We are of the belief that had their nationality files been presented to us by the Registry Section, those files would have shown the same backdating of Immigration stamps to make them appear as if though they had qualified for Belizean Nationality under Section 10 of Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize.

16.2 Since it appeared that Immigration officers and other officials have been backdating the entry dates and imprinting wet Immigration stamps in bogus native Passports of individuals, we could not determine if all individuals who received Belizean nationality during the period April 2011 to September 2013 (and even prior) had genuinely qualified for Belizean nationality under Sections 10 (by registration) and 11 (through Marriage) of Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize.

### **Bogus travel documents and backdating of Immigration stamps in the year 2005**

17. We saw a letter, from former Director Mr. Jose Zetina, addressed to Honourable Ralph Fonseca referenced Gen 13/01/ 05 (7) dated 17<sup>th</sup> November 2005. In his letter he reported that on the 13<sup>th</sup> November 2005, an incident occurred which involved Immigration officers who would have facilitated human smuggling at the PGIA were it not for the intervention of the Police, who were tipped off. There were two (2) Venezuelan nationals and eight (8) Chinese individuals who were on board the private Venezuelan aircraft. "It did not have a flight number because it was an illegal flight it had aircraft registration number YV815CP that was refused leave to land on the 13<sup>th</sup> November 2005". After the travel documents of four (4) of the Chinese were checked they were found to have fraudulent British Passports and it was suspected that the travel documents of the other four (4) Chinese were also fraudulent since information indicated that fraudulent travel documents were being used by Chinese from mainland China to travel abroad.

17.2 We found that the back-dating of entry dates in Belize in individuals' native Passports to have those individuals qualify for the 5-year residency requirement was also a frequent fraudulent practice at the Nationality Section of the Immigration and Nationality Department. We saw such evidence in former Director, Mr. Jose Zetina's memo Gen 13/01/05 (2) dated 12<sup>th</sup> September 2005 to the Minister of Home Affairs and Public Utilities (no name was stated but Hon. Ralph Fonseca was the Minister at the time), in which he reported the following:

*"It is also suspected that in some cases visitor's stamps are backdated for applicants to qualify for the period of residence in Belize. Those who have difficulties with the language, especially Chinese are assisted in answering the Civic Test to enable them to pass. The same method is used for facilitating temporary employment permits (TEP)"*

17.3 It is likely that the copies of native Chinese Passport pages seen in some of the nationality files were just printed paper and not real Passports. We saw the copies of what appeared as genuine Chinese Passport pages in some nationality files; one such Passport #G42535387 issued 1<sup>st</sup> July 2010 for Guocheng Xu. His Passport picture did not appear with the blemish over the face and the biographic page had obvious background features unlike those bogus copies observed in other files that did not have a background and had blemishes over the photos.

17.4 The production of Passport pages or the copying or scanning of genuine Chinese Passports and manipulation of the biographic data and reprinting of the pages as outlined at **Table F** above could be done right here in Belize.

### **Numerous individuals were approved Belizean Citizenship by Registration although they did not live in Belize for the required 5 years**

#### *Criteria*

Part IV Section 10-(1) of the Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize states:

*"This section shall apply to any applicant for registration as a citizen of Belize who has the following qualification-*

- (a) that the applicant is of full age and of sound mind;*
- (b) that the applicant is a person who is ordinarily resident in Belize and has been so resident for a period of five years immediately preceding the date of application; and*
- (c) that the applicant is, and intends to continue to be, ordinarily resident in Belize.*

18. We found that not all individuals, who acquired Belize citizenship under Section 10, were living in Belize for a period of five years immediately preceding the date of application. Such was the case for those individuals listed at **Table G** below and also at **Appendix A**. Those individuals' Belize Port of entry records, Belize Visa issued, or their arrival dates seen



on copies of their native Passports provided evidence that they had not been in Belize for the required 5 year residency period yet they were approved and issued Belizean nationality under Section 10 of the Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize.

**18.2 Appendix A** also includes persons who were not resident in Belize when they applied for first issue Belize Passports, persons who received fraudulent replacement nationality certificates under Section 10 and those persons who received nationality certificates through fraudulent permanent residence permits.

**Table G**

The following is a list of individuals who were not resident in Belize for the required five years yet they were approved and issued Belizean nationality under Section 10 of the Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize.

| <b>Name</b>                        | <b>Date of Entry</b>   | <b>Visa Number and Issue Date</b>                           | <b>Nationality Certificate number or File number and Date</b>   | <b>Minister who signed</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|------------------------------------|--|---|---|----------------------------|---|
| Dong Tao Jin                       | 2-June-2013 through PGIA (United Airlines flight 1410). He used Chinese Passport #G33244420 issued <b>8-Jan-2009</b> that had in it a United States (US) Visa #20131370020004 issued 20-May-2013 | Visa # V00037038 Issued 2-June-2013                         | 28382/13 dated 19-May-2013 and File #29948<br><br>No entry for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. Numbers Book showed certificate was entered on the 17 <sup>th</sup> May 2013, which indicated it was prepared before his arrival | Elvin Penner               | He had 2 Chinese Passports: 1 appeared genuine and the other one bogus. He used Chinese Passport #G33244420 issue date 8-Jan-2007. The Passports had same number but different issued dates) when he applied for his Belize Passport 6-June- 2013. <b>His Nationality file was not presented to Audit.</b> He was issued Belize Passport number P0238518 dated 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2013. |
| Xi Wang (aka James Louis Wang (See | Date entered Belize is unknown but the words “wished to travel   | V00036693 issued 15-January 2013 issued in Chinese Passport | 28428/13 dated 4-June-2013 nationality file number 27791  | Elvin Penner               | His Nationality file showed an entry date of 7-June-2007 through the Northern Border as seen on copy of Chinese   |

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Date of Entry</b>  | <b>Visa Number and Issue Date</b>                               | <b>Nationality Certificate number or File number and Date</b> | <b>Minister who signed</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|---|---|---|---|----------------------------|--|
| Passport report)  | to Belize 20 <sup>th</sup> January 2013” was seen on his visa application. No record seen between January and June 2013 for BNB             | G58039971 with issue date 7-Feb-2012 and expiry date 6-Feb-2022 |   |                            | Passport G21159033 issued 12-Feb-2007 with expiry date 11-Feb-2017. The Passport had bogus Immigration stamps. Belize Passport number P0238890 issued 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013   |
| Tian Zhi Wang (Tianzhi Wang) aka Freakin Yang (See Passport report) | 9 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 was seen on an arrival stamp as his date of entry through Belize Northern Border Chinese Passport #G416024948 | V00025636 issued 7-Nov-2011 in Belmopan signed by Ady Pacheco   | 25698/11 dated 24-Nov-2011.<br>Nationality file #26505/11     | Carlos Perdomo             | Miss Ruth Meighan also recommended Tian Zhi Wang for nationality on 18-Nov-2011. Belize PR stamp with bogus PR Permit #43608 dated 9 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 signed by Miss Ruth Meighan and what appeared as bogus Mexico Immigration stamps seen on copies of native Chinese Passport in his nationality file (Those stamps were faded and illegible; we did |

| Name                     | Date of Entry                             | Visa Number and Issue Date                  | Nationality Certificate number or File number and Date | Minister who signed | Observations  |
|--------------------------|---|---|--|---------------------|---|
|                          |   |   |  |                     | <p>not verify with the Mexican embassy)<br/>Chinese Passport<br/>G416024948 issue date 8<sup>th</sup><br/>April 2010 was used for his nationality and Passport application</p> <p>Belize Passport number<br/>P0185786 issued 25<sup>th</sup><br/>November 2011 to Tianzhi Wang and P0202374 issued 25<sup>th</sup> May 2012 to Freakin Yang</p> |
| Charles Francis Noll Jr. | 17-Sept-2012<br>(further investigation is | Not Applicable (N/A) as he may have used US | 28280/12 dated 12-Dec-2012<br>No entry for certificate | Godwin Hulse        | Fraudulent PR permit #44711 dated 14 <sup>th</sup> November 2012.   |

| Name                | Date of Entry  | Visa Number and Issue Date  | Nationality Certificate number or File number and Date  | Minister who signed | Observations  |
|---------------------|--|---|---|---------------------|---|
|                     | required at the PGIA to ascertain that this is the date he entered the country)  | Passport 215921092 issued 28 <sup>th</sup> December 2005 with expiry date 27 <sup>th</sup> December 2015                      | number in the Register of Citizens by Registration file #29535  |                     | Charles Francis Noll Jr. was issued Belize Passport P0226015 on 8-Jan-2013<br><b>Passport application form and nationality file were not presented to Audit</b>   |
| Randall James Davis | 17-Sept-2012 (further investigation is required at the PGIA to ascertain that this is the date he entered the country) | N/A as he may have used US Passport 213111786 issued 30 <sup>th</sup> March 2005 with expiry date 29 <sup>th</sup> March 2015 | 28282/12 dated 12-Dec-2012 file #29534<br><br>Certificate number had been issued to William Claude Curtis Myles on the 5 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 file #29012) | Godwin Hulse        | Fraudulent PR permit #44710 dated 14 <sup>th</sup> November 2012.<br>Randall James Davis was issued Belize Passport P0226014 on 8-Jan-2013<br><b>Passport application form and nationality file were not presented to Audit</b> |

| Name                 | Date of Entry  | Visa Number and Issue Date   | Nationality Certificate number or File number and Date  | Minister who signed | Observations   |
|----------------------|--|--|---|---------------------|--|
| Jose Wilfredo Molina | 26-June-2012<br>(date of entry needs verification from Ports of entry)                 | (Unknown)<br><br>No visa seen issued   | 27957/12 dated 14-June-2012<br>File #unknown<br>No entry for certificate number seen in Register of Citizens by Registration. | John Saldivar       | Jose Wilfredo Molina was issued Belize Passport P0205968 on 26-June-2012<br><b>Passport application and nationality file were not presented to Audit</b>   |
| Paddy Franks         | 22-Feb-2012<br>(date of entry needs verification from the Belize Northern Border       | N/A as he may have used Canadian Passport BA769742 issued 13 <sup>th</sup> September 2011 with expiry date 13 <sup>th</sup> September 2016 | Fraudulent certificate 22714/12 dated 14-April-2012.<br>File # unknown  | John Saldivar       | In the Register of Citizens by Registration Nationality certificate 22714 issued 1-Aug-2008 (nationality file #31315) was for Narciso Canelo.<br>Paddy Franks was issued Belize Passport P0212850 on 13-Aug-2012<br><b>His Passport application &amp; nationality file were not presented to Audit</b> |
| Zubair Mohamed Kazi  | 26-March-2013, through PGIA on American Airline flight #2189, was seen as the earliest | N/A as he may have used US Passport 488617463 issued 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013  | 28455/13 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> June 2013.<br>File #31769<br><br>Certificate was backdated                                     | Elvin Penner        | Zubair Mohamed Kazi was issued Belize Passport P0241079 on 8 <sup>th</sup> July 2013 and it was picked up by Minister Elvin Penner who   |

| Name  | Date of Entry  | Visa Number and Issue Date   | Nationality Certificate number or File number and Date                             | Minister who signed | Observations  |
|---|--|--|--|---------------------|---|
|   | Belize entry date in 2013 (he also entered in April, May, August, November 2013 and on 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2014   | with expiry date 11 <sup>th</sup> June 2023  | since it was seen as entered in the Numbers Book on the 10 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 |                     | also recommended him for his Belize Passport.<br><b>Nationality file was not presented to Audit</b>   |
| Ammar Harmouch  | 16 <sup>th</sup> March 2007 on Nationality Application and entry stamp through PGIA (if not backdated) Further investigation is required for this individual | No Visa number. Immigration Visa stamp reflected the words “Seen at British Embassy Consular Section Beirut. Good for Single Entry to Belize within 6 months” issued 23-Feb-2007 | 26321/12 dated 11-Jan-2012<br>File #27135/12                                       | Carlos Perdomo      | He was not qualified for nationality. He would have been qualified on 15 <sup>th</sup> March 2012.<br><b>(Passport application was not presented to Audit)</b><br><br>He was issued Belize PassportP0194864 dated 15 <sup>th</sup> March 2012 |
| Ahmad Harmouche<br>Date of Birth 1 <sup>st</sup> February | <b>20<sup>th</sup> September 2007</b> through Belize Northern Border (application stated   | Visa #369/Bmp/07 was issued at Immigration & Nationality Office Belmopan: Good   | 26363/12 dated 11-Jan-2012<br><br>Nationality file #26535/11                       | Carlos Perdomo      | He was not qualified for nationality. He would have been qualified on 19 <sup>th</sup> September 2012.  |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Date of Entry</b>   | <b>Visa Number and Issue Date</b>                            | <b>Nationality      Certificate<br/>number or File number<br/>and Date</b> | <b>Minister<br/>who<br/>signed</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|--|--|--|------------------------------------|---|
| 1992        | that he entered on 20 <sup>th</sup> September 2007; Interview stated that he entered Belize on 30 <sup>th</sup> September 2007) no evidence of travel through Mexico | for single entry to Belize within 6 months issued 1-Aug-2007 |  |                                    | He was issued Belize Passport P0193188 dated 24 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 |



18.3 Persons with US and Canadian Passports do not need visas to enter Belize therefore no visas were issued to those persons but their dates of entry were obtained from Belize Ports of Entry and from persons who requested to remain anonymous. Throughout this report you will see that for most applicants who fraudulently acquired Belizean nationality, their Passport applications and/or nationality files were not presented to Audit. Since most of the nationality files we requested were based on irregularities we had observed on Passport applications in the first phase of our investigation, we are of the considered view that the failure to present numerous Passport applications, may have been in an effort to conceal evidence of fraudulent practices in the Passport and Nationality Sections of the Immigration and Nationality Service (INS). Particularly, perhaps it was in an effort also, to conceal the identities of applicants and other senior officials who had intervened in the Nationality and Passport processes on behalf of persons who did not qualify under Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize. We were, nevertheless able to find evidence of fraud for persons whose Passport applications or nationality files were not presented for examination.

18.4 We were aware that files were removed (nationality files were seen on the media in the possession of Arthur Saldivar) from the registry that falls under the Nationality Section prior to the audit investigation. One of those files was the nationality file of Bo-Jie Shau (Ref Article captioned “Fire!!!” at Immigration Department! of Amandala Newspaper dated 8<sup>th</sup> October 2014 which we saw on the internet). We found that nationality certificate number 28461/13 and Belizean Passport P0245212 issued 19<sup>th</sup> August 2013 without being interviewed by Immigration personnel and may not have qualified for Belizean nationality. This certificate was entered 10<sup>th</sup> July 2013 in the Certificate Numbers Book; however, the News article stated that the certificate was dated 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2013. We also found that the backdating of nationality certificates was also a common fraudulent practice at the INS which will be further discussed in this report. We did not receive his Passport application.

18.5 The names Bo-Jie Shau, Wonhong Kim, Yakup Sut and many others nationality files were not presented to Audit, including nationality files that had allegedly been in the possession of Attorney, Arthur Saldivar. They were then allegedly handed over to the Police but were not seen on the Ministry’s inventory list of one hundred sixty four (164) missing files. We could not ascertain what registers or other documents had been used to perform the inventory, which was submitted by the Administrative Officer.

**No evidence was found that the Investigation Section carried out further vetting of applicants for Belizean Nationality as required by the Referral System of the INS Nationality Section**

19. We observed that specific nationality applicants including Chinese were required to undergo a special vetting as required by the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual.

19.2 The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1, 2011 Procedure for the Referral Systems (page 29) states:

*This system will indicate which application will require further vetting by the Investigation Section as a pre-condition for further processing. All applications falling under the below listed category unless the Director Immigration and Nationality indicates otherwise shall undergo vetting from the Investigation Section.*

*This process is done at the end of the first interview conducted with the applicants for Nationality. The Investigating Officer shall in a timely manner visit the premises of the applicants and conduct covert and overt information gathering to ensure legitimacy of application and prepare and submit report attesting to such to DINS. Files to be referred are:*

- 1. All applications through marriage (Section 11)*
- 2. Applications submitted by nationals of:*
- 3. Russia*
- 4. Bangladesh*
- 5. Somalia*
- 6. Afghanistan*
- 7. Iran*
- 8. Iraq*
- 9. Cuba*
- 10. Pakistan*
- 11. Lebanon*
- 12. Algeria*
- 13. Bolivia*
- 14. Colombia*
- 15. Eritrea*

*16. Libya*

*17. Palestine*

*18. Sudan*

*19. Syria*

*20. Nigeria*

*21. China*

*22. Any other national that the Director may require further vetting*

19.3 We found no evidence that the Investigation Unit of the Department executed further vetting which is the requirement of the Referral System as indicated in the July 1, 2011 Policy and Procedures Manual of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section. The absence of that vital requirement was observed during the examination of nationality files for the period April 2011 to September 2013 of the Chinese, Lebanese, Palestinian and Nigerian applicants, some of whom are listed at **Table G** above and at **Appendix A**.

19.4 There was also no evidence, with the exception of one, that the Referral system had been utilized for the period April 2011 to September 2013 for persons who applied for Belizean nationality under Section 11 (Marriage) as is required.

19.5 We found one instance in which an application for Belizean nationality through marriage (nationality file #24252/08) for Sami Khaled Harmouch (his nationality file stated Harmouche but his native Passport had Harmouch) of Sea Grape Drive, San Pedro married to Veronic Ico of San Marcos, Toledo. This was referred to the Investigation Section for verification to determine whether the marriage was genuine or of convenience. That application was sent for further vetting on the 15<sup>th</sup> December 2008 and again on the 13<sup>th</sup> August 2009. The marriage was declared as genuine by Gilroy Guzman, Immigration Officer in the Investigation Section. The letter was dated the 11<sup>th</sup> March 2010 and was addressed to the Director, INS.

The further vetting of applicants where required may have been selective then or discontinued after that period.

**We did not receive the complete Visa and Entry Records for visitors to Belize for the period April 2011 to September 2013**

20. We were unable to get all records of persons who entered Belize from all Ports of Entry during the period April 2011 to September 2013 in order to do a thorough comparison of visas issued with our Nationality certificate and Passport Issue List. We were told that Visa records were not kept electronically.

Only 20 (%) percent of visas issued by the Belmopan INS were examined but you will note further in this report that most visa applicants who we found had been fraudulently issued Belize nationality had been recently approved their visas at the Belmopan Office. We compiled an electronic list of some visa applications at random or from those that had discrepancies. We used said electronic list to examine if persons who received Belizean nationality had recently entered Belize and did not qualify for Belizean nationality under Section 10 or Section 11 of the Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize. The investigation and compilation of visa applications did not include persons who applied for and were approved visas at the various Embassies and Foreign Missions abroad. This requires further investigation.

- 20.2 The unavailability of all the aforementioned records may have caused many more persons who acquired Belizean nationality fraudulently to go unnoticed. Visa applications may have also been removed from the various Ports of entry to avoid audit examination as we found occurred with Passport applications and nationality files and also had appeared to be the case with Yiu-Pang Chen. His Passport application was submitted on the 7<sup>th</sup> August 2013 at the Passport Office in Belize City and it showed that he was the holder of an ROC Taiwanese Passport #302899786 (issued 20<sup>th</sup> April 2011 with expiration date 20<sup>th</sup> April 2021). Our investigation revealed that he arrived in Belize on board United Airlines flight # 1407 at the PGIA on the 10<sup>th</sup> April 2013 but we were unable to find any record of a visa that had been issued to him at the PGIA.

- 20.3 Our list of missing Passport applications (**Passport report Appendix I**) had numerous names of foreigners who may have recently entered Belize on visas and received Belizean nationality in a couple days, weeks or months. From those cases of suspected fraud we found, we noticed a direct relationship with such persons and with missing Passport applications and unrepresented nationality files.

**Visa List compared to the Passport Issue List for April 2011 to September 2013 was not effective as the Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS) Data Integrity was compromised**

21. We found through an electronic comparison of our Visa and the INS Passport Issue List, that some persons were issued Belizean Passports soon after they were issued Visas.

There may have been more but the data integrity entered in the BPIS was not guaranteed to be accurate because of several inconsistencies. As a result of those inconsistencies our search for matches by names (Visa against Passport) was not completely effective.

#### 21.2 Those inconsistencies were:

- i) **No space or several spaces between First Names-** The data entry using the spacing of Passport holders' first names was not consistent. Varying number of spaces, from no space and up to three spaces, were used to enter first names in the BPIS. This did not support our electronic search by names to identify persons who may have received recent visas and subsequent Belize Passports without meeting the required domicile period.

**Example:** Dong (1space between Dong and Tao) Tao Jin was seen on the Visa application and entered on our Visa List but Dong (2 spaces between Dong and Tao) Tao Jin was entered in the system and consequently transferred to the Passport Issue List. Dongtao (no space between Dong and tao) Jin was seen on his bogus Chinese Passport G33244420 issued 8<sup>th</sup> January 2007 but his names were also separated on the Belize Nationality Certificate # 28382/13 dated 19<sup>th</sup> May 2013 and on his Passport application submitted on the 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013.

- ii) **The first names and surnames were switched-** We noticed that the first names and surnames of persons were used interchangeably on visa applications, nationality files, nationality certificates, Passport applications, and Belize Passports and did not follow the format in their native Passports.

**Example:** The name Chaudhary Geetu was seen on a visa application dated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2012 and entered as such on our visa list. Copy of her Indian native Passport #J2593730 attached to her visa application form showed that it was issued on 4<sup>th</sup> February 2011 in the name Geetu Verma. A Belize dependant permit was seen in the name Geetu Verma Chaudhary dated 14<sup>th</sup> December 2011. Her Belizean Passport P0240077 issued on 20<sup>th</sup> June 2013 had the name Geetu Chaudhary.

#### **We did not receive an electronic Register/ Database from the Ports of Entry to identify all persons who entered Belize during the period April 2011- September 2013**

- 22. As mentioned earlier in this report, the Immigration Department could not provide us with an electronic database of all persons who entered Belize during the period April 2011 to September 2013. Since those entry records from all Belize Ports of entry were not yet maintained electronically, the Visa list used in the electronic data comparison was compiled by the Audit team.

Also persons may have entered Belize in 2010 (or earlier) and would still not have qualified for nationality in 2011, 2012 or 2013 under Section 10 but we did not examine visas for 2010 and earlier. Persons may have also entered Belize illegally and therefore would have no entry record at any Port of Entry.

**We did not receive an electronic Register/ Database from the Nationality Section to identify all persons who were issued Belize Nationality Certificates during the period April 2011-September 2013**

23. We were unable to get a complete electronic record of all persons who were issued Belize Nationality certificates for the period April 2011 to September 2013. When it was requested from the OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade, on April 7, 2014, we were told that such information was not available. He gave us an electronic spreadsheet of nationality certificates that were signed by the Minister prior to the 2012 General and Municipal Elections and said that the list was prepared for the Unions as requested by the Prime Minister and that is the only reason why a list of nationality certificates existed.

**Persons with American and Canadian Passports were not issued visas**

24. Our audit of visas did not extend to the Manifest at the PGIA and records of all persons who entered the various Ports in Belize therefore we were unable to identify the names of more US and Canadian citizens who may have entered Belize to acquire Belize Passports fraudulently. However, we were still able to identify several of them from inconsistencies we observed in the nationality file diary, nationality certificate numbers book, Interview and Oath Registers for which we did specific check using the manifest at the PGIA. Many other persons may have gone unnoticed since we had no INS electronic record of all persons who entered Belize during April 2011 to September 2013 to match with the Passport Issue List.

24.2 The new Visa exemption regulations (S.I #3 of 2015) will make it even more challenging to identify such persons who enter Belize for the purpose of acquiring Belizean nationality fraudulently, as the new law also exempts persons who are holders of valid United States of America multiple entry visas or persons who are holders of valid United States of America Permanent Residency Cards from obtaining a visa to visit Belize. There will be no audit trail of copies of native Passports or US multiple entry visas and residency cards if such persons are not granted Belize visas to enter Belize.

**The facilitation of the change of first names and full names of Citizens by Registration by the Vital Statistics Unit before said citizens applied for Belizean Passports**

25. We encountered another impediment to the electronic comparison of names on the Visa List with names on the Passport Issue List with the deliberate changing of the names of persons, complete names in some cases, facilitated by the Belize Vital Statistics Unit.

Persons, who entered Belize on visas, obtained Belizean nationality and certificates fraudulently through the INS, went to the Belize Vital Statistics Unit to change their names and then returned to the Passport Office INS to obtain Belize Passports in different names. In those instances audit trails were lost and electronic comparison would not produce a match as seen in the cases at **Table H:**

**Table H**

The following is the list of persons who we found had just entered Belize and fraudulently received Belizean nationality but changed their names before they were issued Belizean Passports

| <b>Name on Visa Application form</b> | <b>Visa Number Issue Date or Date of Entry in Belize</b>                     | <b>Name on Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Certificate Number and Date</b>       | <b>Name in Belize Passport</b>  | <b>Passport number and Issue Date in Belize Passport</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|--|---|--|--|
| Jack Jie Qin                         | 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2013; United Airline flight # 1407                    | Jack Jie Qin                           | 28428/13 dated 4 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | Marc Chin (we were able to scan the change of name document and we have it electronically for all individuals in this table labelled H) | P0244745 dated 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2013              | His nationality file was not presented to Audit.   |
| Xi Wang                              | Date of entry is unknown but he was issued visa #36693 on 15th January 2013. | Xi Wang                                | 28428/13 dated 4 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | James Louis Wang  | P0238890<br>12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013                   | Nationality file showed date of entry as 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2007 through the Northern Border with bogus Guangzhou visa and other bogus Belize Immigration stamps |



| <b>Name on Visa Application form</b> | <b>Visa Number Issue Date or Date of Entry in Belize</b>  | <b>Name on Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Certificate Number and Date</b>            | <b>Name in Belize Passport</b> | <b>Passport number and Issue Date in Belize Passport</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------------------------|---|--|---|--------------------------------|--|---|
| Yiu-Pang Chen                        | 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2013; United Airline flight number 1407  | Yiu-Pang Chen                          | 28456/13 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> May 2013      | Peter Pang                     | P0244747 dated 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2013              | His nationality file was not presented to Audit.  |
| Tian Zhi Wang or Tianzhi Wang        | Visa #25636 7 <sup>th</sup> November 2011;<br>9-Nov-2011 was seen as date of entry through Belize Northern Border | Tianzhi Wang                           | 25698/11 dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 | Freakin Yang                   | P0202374 dated 25 <sup>th</sup> May 2012                 | Date of entry 10 <sup>th</sup> June 2005 as seen in nationality file which was backdated. |
| Quoc Vinh Truong                     | 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2013; United Airline flight # 1407   | Quoc Vinh Truong                       | 28458/13                                      | Simon Truong                   | P0244746 dated 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2013              | His nationality file was not presented to Audit.  |

26. We were unable to ascertain the entry dates or visa issue dates for six persons who changed their names and may not have qualified for Belizean nationality under Section 10. One of those persons changed his name eight days before he was issued his nationality certificate, but his certificate was still issued in his previous name. Three of those persons changed their names three weeks after they were issued Belizean nationality, another person changed his name 2 months after receiving nationality and the other changed his name less than a month after receiving nationality. Four of them used different surnames from their original surnames. Out of the four surnames three (3) changed their names to the surname “Parker” on the 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012. We also observed that their native Passports were recently issued therefore; they may not have lived in Belize for the required five (5) years. Those individuals are listed at **Table I**

**Table I**

The following are the list of six persons who changed their names before and between the issuance of their Belizean nationality certificate and Belizean Passport

| <b>Previous Name of Person</b> | <b>Belize Nationality Certificate number, Date Signed and Minister</b>               | <b>New Name in Belizean Passport</b> | <b>Date of Name Change</b>                         | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b>       | <b>Native Passport Number and Issue Date</b>   | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Zhaoqiang Zhu Li               | 27328/12 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> Feb 2012 in the name of Zhaoqiang Zu (Carlos Perdomo) | Forest Li                            | 25 <sup>th</sup> Jan 2012<br>vide deed poll #31/12 | P0191295<br>issued 2 <sup>nd</sup> Feb 2012  | Mexican Passport number G02279520 issued 21 <sup>st</sup> Jan 2009 with expiration date 2019 | Fraudulent PR #43901 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> Jan 2012. No evidence of payment of PR fee. His name was written over correction fluid. He used Belize address #10 Kings Street Belize City. |
| Ioannis Singelidis             | 27342/12 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> Feb 2012 (Carlos Perdomo)                             | John Parker                          | 23 <sup>rd</sup> Feb 2012<br>vide deed poll #82/12 | P0193556<br>issued 29 <sup>th</sup> Feb 2012 | Greek Native Passport AI0271235 issued 19 <sup>th</sup> Sept 2011                            | No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration. No nationality file presented. Belize address: 3 ½ Miles Northern Highway.   |

| <b>Previous Name of Person</b> | <b>Belize Nationality Certificate number, Date Signed and Minister</b>                     | <b>New Name in Belizean Passport</b> | <b>Date of Name Change</b>  | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b>         | <b>Native Passport Number and Issue Date</b>                             | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|
| Natalia Karpouzo glou          | 27346/12 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> Feb 2012 (Carlos Perdomo)                                   | Natalya Parker                       | 23 <sup>rd</sup> Feb 2012 vide deed poll #84/12                       | P0193555 issued 29 <sup>th</sup> Feb 2012.     | Greek Native Passport AI0732152 issued 26 <sup>th</sup> October 2011     | Entry in Register of Citizens by Registration appeared irregular. (Findings in nationality file revealed fraud and is discussed further in this report)<br>Belize address: 3 ½ Miles Northern Highway. |
| Thierry Rene Marie Bercin      | 27347/12 issued 2 <sup>nd</sup> Feb 2012 (Carlos Perdomo)                                  | Terry Parker                         | 23 <sup>rd</sup> Feb 2012 vide deed poll #81/12                       | P0193554 issued 29 <sup>th</sup> Feb 2012      | Switzerland/ Swiss Passport #F3174323 issued 28 <sup>th</sup> March 2007 | No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration; no nationality file presented.<br>Belize Address: Belama Phase 2 Belize City.  |
| Jiachi Jin                     | 25750/11 issued 23 <sup>rd</sup> November 2011<br>We did not see a copy of the Nationality | Jackie Chi Jia Jin                   | Changed his name between 23 <sup>rd</sup> November & 22 <sup>nd</sup> | P0188587 issued 22 <sup>nd</sup> December 2011 | Chinese Passport #G45012517 issued 21 <sup>st</sup> December 2010        | Nationality file was received however it has to be further investigated  |

| <b>Previous Name of Person</b> | <b>Belize Nationality Certificate number, Date Signed and Minister</b>  | <b>New Name in Belizean Passport</b> | <b>Date of Name Change</b>   | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b>  | <b>Native Passport Number and Issue Date</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|--|
|                                | certificate but Carlos Perdomo was the Minister during that time. We saw his signature on Nationality certificates dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 |                                      | December 2011 via deed poll #648/11 (no copy of deed poll was seen)<br>The name in the Register of Citizens by Registration was Jiachi Jin)  |   | at the “Embassy of PRC in Mexico”            | Belize Address: Joseito Layout, Corozal.<br>Partner in ownership of Corozal Free Zone business Mandarin General Merchandise whose other owner was sponsor for Weihang Chen who obtained Belizean Nationality & Passport fraudulently |
| Tyns-Ruenn Su                  | 23460/09 issued 30 <sup>th</sup> May 2009 (Carlos Perdomo);<br>Replacement issued by Maria Marin on the 25 <sup>th</sup> March 2013                     | Henko Ong                            | Changed his name on the 31 <sup>st</sup> July 2009 (242/09) but the change was not found lodged at the Vital Statistics Unit.<br>Replacement | P0111388 issued 30 <sup>th</sup> July 2009 as Tyns-Ruenn Su;<br>P0111755 in the name Henko Ong on the 5 <sup>th</sup> August 2009 | Unknown                                      | There was no copy of a native Passport in his nationality File. No declaration form by Referees. Manuel Heredia Jr. signed as JP on his nationality application.<br>Belize Address: 2 ½ Miles Northern                               |

| <b>Previous Name of Person</b> | <b>Belize Nationality Certificate number, Date Signed and Minister</b> | <b>New Name in Belizean Passport</b> | <b>Date of Name Change</b>   | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b>              | <b>Native Passport Number and Issue Date</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|---|
|                                |  |                                      | certificate had the name of Gareth Murillo who amended certificate through name change on the 4 <sup>th</sup> August 2009. | renewed to P0236231 on the 7 <sup>th</sup> May 2013 |  | <p>Highway seen on renewal of Passport application form.</p> <p>His country of birth was stated as Republic of China, Taiwan on Belize Passport P0111388, while on Belize Passport P0111755 it was stated as Thailand and on Belize Passport P0236231 as Taiwan. He was recommended for his Passport on the 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013 by Rick Shi JP and by Minister of Trade, Hon. Erwin Contreras</p> |

26.2 An Investigation of Deed Polls lodged at the Vital Statistics Unit (VSU) would have enabled us to identify more of such persons but the Audit investigation did not include the VSU.

**There were persons who did change of surnames through Marriage for Citizens by Registration between the time they may have received Visas and the time they received Belize Passports**

27. Examples of such cases are:

- i) Gui Zhen Gan seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration and in her nationality file; Guizhen Chen seen on Belize Passport. No marriage certificate was attached to Passport application and we found no evidence that a marriage was lodged at the Vital Statistics.
- ii) The name Nan Liu was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration; Nan Cheng was seen on Belize Passport. No marriage certificate was attached to Passport application and we found no evidence that a marriage was lodged at the Vital Statistics Unit.

The challenges outlined above interrupted audit trails and subsequently compromised our identification of all persons who visited Belize to acquire Belizean nationality and Belize PPassports without meeting the stipulated requirements. However, through other methods we were still able to find more persons who acquired Belizean nationality soon after they were issued visas to enter Belize.

**Some persons acquired visas and received Belizean Passports through genuine and fraudulent nationality certificates under Section 10 (Registration), Section 11 (Marriage) and Section 11A (Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program) (BECIP)**

28. We found several matches with names when the Passport Issue list for April 2011 to September 2013 was compared to the visa list (we had electronically prepared). We were able to confirm those persons from the two lists by comparing their dates of birth, pictures, native Passports etc. We were unable to receive nationality files for most of those persons whose names generated a match.

28.2 Listed at **Table J** below are those persons whom we found had received Belize visas and subsequently Belizean nationality and Passports:

**Table J**

The following is the list of persons whom we found had received Belize visas and subsequently Belizean nationality and Passports

| <b>Name</b>                 | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b>                                     | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b>   | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b>                  | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-----------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|---|--|---|--|
| Tianzhi Wang (Freakin Yang) | V00025636<br>7 <sup>th</sup> November 2011<br>(signature of Ady Pacheco seen on visa) | P0185786/25 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 in the name Tianzhi Wang & P0202374/25 <sup>th</sup> May 2012 in the name Freakin Yang | China                 | Bella Visa Belize & Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan | 25698/11 dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011  | Belmopan issued Visa                              | Sponsor of visit was Wen Bin Chen of Belmopan. He was recommended on both occasions for a Belizean Passport by Eleodoro Lewis JP |
| Oleg Kalugin                | V00032180<br>16th July 2012   | P0209568 17th July 2012  | Russian Federation    | 2 1/2 Miles Northern Highway Belize                   | Fraudulent certificate BECIP #22/1/98 dated 26th Feb 1998 (Certificate number could not be verified in any Register) | Belize Northern Border                            | No nationality file presented. He was recommender for a Belize Passport by Demecio Cal JP  |



| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b>  | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|---|--|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|
| Alexey Kharitonenko   | V00036275<br>6th January 2013  | P0226251 11th January 2013               | Russian Federation    | 1 1/2 Mile Northern Highway          | Fraudulent certificate #12430/00 dated 8th Feb 2000 under Section 10. In the Register # 12430/00 was seen for Maria Concepcion Milan (File #12430) | Belize Northern Border                            | No Passport application. No nationality file presented   |
| Chang Yang (applied as daughter of Xiaobing Yang as seen below) | Visa approved and the internal control number was 567/BMP/11 dated 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011<br>Visa V00026823 | P0230780 6th March 2013                  | China                 | Vista Del Mar                        | Fraudulent BECIP certificate # 2864.1 dated 19th Dec 2008 (No entry in Register Section 11A) Under Section 10 it was issued to                     | Belmopan issued visa                              | No Passport application. No nationality file presented. BPIS showed she did not appear in person on 6 <sup>th</sup> March 2013 for her Passport biometrics |

| <b>Name</b>                          | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b>       | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--|--|---|--|
|                                      | was issued 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011          |  |                       |  | Maria Estela Santos Recinos on the 21 <sup>st</sup> April 1992 (Natona;ity file #3653) |   |  |
| Ji Wang                              | V00034666 11 <sup>th</sup> October 2012           | P0236503 10 <sup>th</sup> May 2013       | China                 | 7386 Antelope St. Belize City              | Certificate #28349/13 dated 24th April 2013 issued through section 11(Marriage)        | Belmopan issued visa                              | Nationality file was examined and those findings are in the Report at Paragraphs 80 through to 80.4  |
| Geetu Chaudhary<br>(Chaudhary Geetu) | V00031473 11 <sup>th</sup> June 2012              | P0240077 20 <sup>th</sup> June 2013      | India                 | 3 <sup>rd</sup> Street North, Corozal Town | 28338/13 dated 24 <sup>th</sup> April 2013   | Belmopan issued visa                              | Nationality file was examined and those findings are in the Report at Paragraphs 81 through to 81.10 |
| Jimin Guan (Ji Min Guan)             | V00037753 5 <sup>th</sup> March 2013              | P0239029 13th June 2013                  | China                 | Mile 3 Northern Highway                    | Fraudulent BECIP certificate # 2918/94   | Belmopan issued visa                              | No Passport application. No nationality file presented   |

| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>                                    |
|------------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|
|                              |   |  |                       |                                      | dated 13th March 1994 Under Section 10 #2918 had been issued to Ana Diaz Ventura on the 5 <sup>th</sup> May 1992 and her File number was 3590. Under Section 11A (BECIP) certificate #2918/94 had been issued to Fengshen Che |   |  |
| Liming Huang (Li Ming Huang) | V00034693<br>22nd October 2012                    | P0239621 20th June 2013                  | China                 | 2 Miles Northern Highway             | Fraudulent certificate #28424/13 dated 3rd June 2013 under  | Belmopan issued visa                              | No Passport application; No nationality file presented |

| <b>Name</b>                       | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-----------------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|
|                                   |   |  |                       |                                      | Section 10. No entry seen in the Register of citizens by Registration   |   |  |
| Jinchen An<br>(Jin Chen An)       | V00034694<br>22 <sup>nd</sup> October 2012        | P0223556 4th December 2012               | China                 | 2 1/2 Miles Northern Highway         | Certificate #28271/12 dated 30th November 2012 (no entry seen in Register of citizens by Registration under Section 10) | Belmopan issued Visa                              | His Passport application was not presented to Audit. Findings in nationality file included bogus Immigration stamps discussed earlier and further in this report |
| Xiaobing Yang<br>(Xiao Bing Yang) | Visa approved and the internal                    | P0230769 6th March 2013                  | China                 | Vista Del Mar                        | Fraudulent BECIP certificate # 2863/94 dated 23-  | Belmopan issued visa                              | Did not appear in person for Passport biometrics on 6 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. No   |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b>   | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|
|             | control number was 568/BMP/11 dated 6th December 2011.<br><br>Visa V00026824 issued 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 |  |                       |                                      | March-1994 (No entry in Register of citizens by Registration under Section 11A) Under Section 10 certificate # 2863 was issued to Katharina Froese on 24 <sup>th</sup> April 1992 (BNA file #3604) |   | Passport application presented. No nationality file presented  |
| Ruijie Ren  | Visa approved and the internal control number was 569/BMP/11 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011). Visa                 | P0228610 11 <sup>th</sup> February 2013  | China                 |                                      | Fraudulent nationality certificate #2814/94 dated 6 <sup>th</sup> April 1994 (under Section 11A 2814 was issued to Lo  | Belmopan issued visa                              | Did not appear in person for Passport biometrics on 7 <sup>th</sup> Feb 2013. Passport recommender was Emory Young JP. |

| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>                              |
|----------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|
|                            | V00026822 issued on 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 |  |                       |                                      | Shen Shu-Hui dated 27 <sup>th</sup> April 1993) (under Section 10 2814 was issued to Patricia Louise Graham dated 12 <sup>th</sup> March 1992 nationality file #3947) |   |  |
| Dong Tao Jin (Dongtao Jin) | V00037038 2nd June 2013                           | P0238518 7th June 2013                   | China                 | New Area Benque Viejo Town           | Certificate #28382/13 dated 19-May-2013 (Numbers book showed it was entered on the 17 <sup>th</sup> May 2013 prepared before his arrival) No                          | Visa issued at PGIA                               | His nationality file was not presented to Audit. |

| <b>Name</b>              | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b>   | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b>      | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|---|--|---|---|
|                          |   |  |                       |   | entry in Register of citizens by Registration under Section 10   |   |   |
| Weidong Li (Wei Dong Li) | V00037752<br>5 <sup>th</sup> March 2013   | P023902813th<br>June 2013                | China                 | Mile 3<br>Northern Highway<br>Belize City | Fraudulent nationality certificate #2915/94 dated 13th March 1994  | Belmopan issued visa                              | Passport application was not presented to Audit. His nationality file was not received  |
| Ying Zheng               | Visa approved and the internal control number was 566/BMP/11 dated 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011<br>Visa # V00026821 issued 6 <sup>th</sup> | P0230801<br>6th March 2013               | China                 | Vista Del Marr, Belize District           | Fraudulent BECIP certificate # 2864/ dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> March 1994. No entry seen in Register under Section 11A while Under Section 10 | Belmopan issued visa                              | Did not appear in person for Passport biometrics on the 6 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. Passport application and nationality file were not presented to Audit |

| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>                      |
|----------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|
|                            | December 2011                                     |  |                       |                                      | certificate # 2864 was issued to Maria Estela Santos Recinos on the 21 <sup>st</sup> April 1992 (BNA#3653)<br>.   |   |  |
| Muping Chen (Mu Ping Chen) | V00038497<br>25th March 2013                      | P0236265 7th May 2013                    | China                 | Mile 12 Philip Goldson Highway       | Fraudulent certificate # 2584/94 dated 4th April 1994. Under Section 10 this certificate was issued to Wilhelm Peters Redekop on the 21 <sup>st</sup> January 1992 (BNA | Belmopan issued visa                              | We did not receive his nationality file. |



| <b>Name</b>                        | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|------------------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|---|
|                                    |   |  |                       |                                      | file number was 3794). Under Section 11A Registration (BECIP) certificate # 2584 had been issued to Tan Shen Li Rong on the 28 <sup>th</sup> December 1992 (no nationality file#) |   |   |
| Shang Shang Wang (Shangshang Wang) | V00038523 dated 3rd April 2013                    | P0236272 7 <sup>th</sup> May 2013        | China                 | Mile 12 Philip Goldson Highway       | Fraudulent replacement certificate #7586/98 dated 12 <sup>th</sup> August 1998 issued in the name Jianhua Wang with Shangshang  | Belmopan issued visa                              | Passport application was not presented to Audit. We saw a copy of certificate #7586/98 on Jianhua Wang's Passport application who was issued Passport # |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|---|
|             |   |  |                       |                                      | Wang listed as a minor. The name Hon. Jorge Espat was printed on the front of the certificate, and what appeared as the signature of Gareth Murillo as the Director who had replaced the certificate on 9 <sup>th</sup> May, 2009. The certificate number had been issued to Luis Ayala on the 16 <sup>th</sup> April 1998 |   | P0219958 dated 10 <sup>th</sup> Oct 2012. We did not receive her nationality file |

| <b>Name</b>                     | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b>  | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b>    | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|---------------------------------|--|--|-----------------------|---|---|---|--|
|                                 |  |  |                       |   | (nationality File# 9597)  |   |  |
| Jiahao Wu<br>(Jia Hao Wu)       | Visa approved and the internal control number was 431/BMP/11 dated 29 <sup>th</sup> September 2011. Immigration visa stamp was issued. | P0187311/ 8 <sup>th</sup> December 2011  | China                 | #1 Dean and College Boulevard, Belmopan | Fraudulent certificate #18785/05/ 14 <sup>th</sup> November 2011. This certificate had been issued to Ling Hao under Section 10 | Belmopan Issued Visa                              | His nationality file was not received  |
| WeiHang Chen<br>(Wei Hang Chen) | V00031450<br>31 <sup>st</sup> May 2012   | P0207661/6 <sup>th</sup> July 2012       | China                 | #58 Queen Street, Belize City           | Fraudulent certificate #2981/94/ 27 <sup>th</sup> January 1994. Under Section 10 2981/92 was issued to Jose Angel Mercado       | Belmopan issued Visa                              | Passport application was not presented to Audit. His nationality file was not received. He used a fraudulent business certificate number |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>  | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|---|
|             |   |  |                       |                                      | Castro (nationality file #4474); Under Section 11A there was no entry in the Register |   | 14582 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> December 2009 to sponsor visa applicants. We compared his native Chinese Passport (seen on his visa application) to his fraudulently acquired Belize Passport (used on the visa applications as a sponsor) and verified that he was the same person. See this report at paragraphs 39 through to 39.5. We saw another copy of fraudulent undated nationality certificate #2981/94 |

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Visa number Issued and Date of Application</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date of Issue</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Address as in the BPIS</b> | <b>Nationality certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Belize Port of Entry/Place visa was issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|---|---|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|--|
|   |   |  |                       |                                      |  |   | allegedly signed by former Minister Philip Goldson in the name of Zhao Hui Ye Fu plus 1 child (Fu Zunchi). He also used that certificate to apply as a visa sponsor for Yu Zhang on the 30 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 |
| Liudmila Shengeliia (on visa application)<br>Liudmila Valeryevna Shengeliya (In Passport) | V00034608<br>12 <sup>th</sup> November 2012       | P0193776 2 <sup>nd</sup> March 2012      | Leningrad USSR        | 4 ½ Miles Northern Highway           | Fraudulent replacement nationality certificate # 13085/01 dated 11th April 2001 (No entry seen under Section 10) | Belize Northern Border                            | No entry seen for that certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration No nationality file presented.   |

28.3A detailed account on those persons who entered the country on visa and thereafter got Belizean Passports can be found further in this report.

28.4 We observed that a Northern Highway address was frequently used on the Passport applications for persons who obtained Belizean Nationality fraudulently as seen at **Table K** above. Those persons may have used unspecified addresses to make it impossible to verify the address stated. The irregularities observed through the examination of their individual visa applications, nationality files and Passport applications where applicable, in the Register of Citizens by Registration and certificate Numbers Book are further detailed in this report.

28.5 We observed that the following JPs recommended those persons listed at **Table J** above for Belizean Passports although said persons had just entered Belize on visas or were approved recent visas. JP Chiu Hsiang Lo (Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo), who allegedly was involved in the bribing of an Immigration Officer to approve a Belize Passport using a fraudulent birth certificate (see Passport Report Re: Paul Ku), Demecio Cal JP, Jahan Abadi JP, Florentino Baiza JP, Eleodoro Lewis JP and Emory Young JP of Belmopan and Ricardo Diaz JP and Frank Symms JP of Belize City..

**Minister Erwin Contreras requested visas for persons who obtained Belizean nationality and Passports shortly after their arrival into the country**

29. We saw letters from Minister Contreras as the Minister of Trade and Investment attached to visa applications for persons who acquired visas and subsequent Belizean nationality without residing in Belize for the required five years period.

Those visas were approved by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, current Director, Ms. Maria Marin; one had no approval from the Director while another was approved by an unrecognized signature. Those persons are listed in **Table K** below.

**Table K**

The following is the list of persons who were issued visas based on the requests of Minister Contreras and thereafter obtained Belizean nationality and Passports without meeting the required five years period.

| <b>Name of Visa applicant</b> | <b>Date of Visa application</b>     | <b>Sponsor of Visa applicant</b>   | <b>Visa approved by/ Date</b>  | <b>Summary of Minister Erwin Contreras' Letter</b>  | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|---|
| Jinchen An (Jin Chen An)      | <b>22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012</b> | Undated Letter from Roger Tien (Room 116 San Ignacio Hotel) Owner of unnamed Investment Group requesting visa for his Group's "Consultant" | Director Miss Ruth Meighan on 24 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 based on letter from Minister E. Contreras' (Ministry's letterhead) (Miss Ruth Meighan also recommended applicant for Belize Nationality on the 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2012 | Copy of letter seen addressed to Roger Tien (Room 502, Building "C" Yang Guang Ming Garden, Guangdong, PRC) C/Gen/1/01/12 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> September 2012 inviting him and his group of Investors to Belize | Ruth Meighan also wrote on letter, "Note that applicant decided they do not need visa again" signed 24 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 but we found that the visa was not cancelled. Applicant received Belizean Passport <b>P0223556 on 4<sup>th</sup> December 2012.</b> <b>Nationality file showed major discrepancies with bogus Chinese Passport and Immigration stamps</b> |

| <b>Name of Visa applicant</b> | <b>Date of Visa application</b>     | <b>Sponsor of Visa applicant</b>  | <b>Visa approved by/ Date</b>   | <b>Summary of Minister Erwin Contreras' Letter</b>  | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|---|--|
| Liming Huang (Li Ming Huang)  | <b>25<sup>th</sup> October 2012</b> | Undated Letter from Roger Tien (Room 116 San Ignacio Hotel) Owner of unnamed Investment Group requesting visa for his Group's "Consultant " | Director Miss Ruth Meighan on 24 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 based on letter from Minister E. Contreras' (Ministry's letterhead) | Copy of letter seen addressed to Roger Tien (Room 502, Building "C" Yang Guang Ming Garden, Guangdong, PRC) C/Gen/1/01/12 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> September 2012 inviting him and his group of Investors to Belize | Miss Ruth Meighan also wrote on the Minister's letter, "Note that applicant decided they do not need visa again" signed 24 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 but we found that the visa was not cancelled. Applicant received Belizean Passport <b>P0239621</b> on <b>20<sup>th</sup> June 2013</b> . <b>Nationality file was not presented</b> |
| Jimin Guan (Ji Min Guan)      | <b>5<sup>th</sup> March 2013</b>    | No Sponsor  | Approved on 5 <sup>th</sup> March 2013 by current Ag. Director Ms. Maria Marin. Minister Contreras' letter was addressed to     | Minister requested multiple entry visas for "Consultants for Sunny City Development Project" (Ministry's  | Applicant received Belizean PPassport <b>P0239029</b> on <b>13th June 2013</b><br><br><b>His nationality</b>   |



| Name of Visa applicant        | Date of Visa application          | Sponsor of Visa applicant | Visa approved by/ Date   | Summary of Minister Erwin Contreras' Letter  | Observations   |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|--|--|--|
|                               |                                   |                           | Director Miss Ruth Meighan   | letterhead)<br>Ref.<br>C/GEN/1/01/1<br>3 dated 29 <sup>th</sup><br>Jan 2013  | <b>file was not presented</b>  |
| Weidong Li<br>(Wei Dong Li)   | <b>5<sup>th</sup> March 2013</b>  | No Sponsor                | Approved by current Director Maria Marin on 5 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. Minister Contreras' letter was addressed to Director Miss Ruth Meighan | Minister requested multiple entry visas for "Consultants for Sunny City Development Project" (Ministry's letterhead)<br>Ref.<br>C/GEN/1/01/1<br>3 dated 29 <sup>th</sup><br>Jan 2013 | Applicant received Belizean Passport <b>P0239028 on 13th June 2013</b><br><b>His nationality file was not presented</b>          |
| Muping Chen<br>(Mu Ping Chen) | <b>26<sup>th</sup> March 2013</b> | No Sponsor                | Approved by current Director Ms. Maria Marin on 26th March 2013 but not on the designated line. Minister Contreras' letter was                 | (Ministry's letterhead)<br>Reference<br>C/GEN/1/01/1<br>3<br><br>Ref.<br>C/GEN/1/01/1<br>3 dated 29 <sup>th</sup><br>Jan 2013;<br>Minister requested                                 | Applicant received Belizean Passport <b>P0236265 on 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013</b><br><b>His nationality file was not presented</b> |

| Name of Visa applicant             | Date of Visa application   | Sponsor of Visa applicant | Visa approved by/ Date   | Summary of Minister Erwin Contreras' Letter   | Observations   |
|------------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--|---|--|
|                                    |                            |                           | addressed to Director Miss Ruth Meighan  | multiple entry visas for "Consultants for Sunny City Development Project" Letter to Director INS from Kim Chee, Director Sunny City Hotel & Casino  |  |
| Shangshang Wang (Shang Shang Wang) | 3 <sup>rd</sup> April 2013 | No Sponsor                | Director did not approve visa. Visa was approved by an unrecognizable initial dated 3 <sup>rd</sup> April 2013 | Letter from the Ministry of Trade was signed by G. Bradley for Minister Erwin Contreras dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> April 2013. Letter seen from Kim Chee, Director, Sunny City Development Co. to Director, INS dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> April 2013 requesting visa | Applicant received Belizean Passport <b>P0236272</b> on <b>7<sup>th</sup> May 2013</b> |

| <b>Name of Visa applicant</b> | <b>Date of Visa application</b> | <b>Sponsor of Visa applicant</b> | <b>Visa approved by/ Date</b>  | <b>Summary of Minister Erwin Contreras' Letter</b>   | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|--|
| Xi Wang<br>(James Louis Wang) | 15 <sup>th</sup> January 2013   | Christopher Zheng                | Letter from Director Miss Ruth Meighan dated 15 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 certifying her approval of visa | Ruth Meighan wrote on visa application, "Mr. Reynolds, please process for Minister Contreras" signed 15 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 (no copy of letter from Minister was seen attached) | His Nationality file had several bogus immigration stamps. See Table P below Applicant received Belizean Passport <b>P0238890 on 12th June 2013</b> in the name James Louis Wang |

29.2 We also noted that Minister Erwin Contreras requested or recommended visas for other persons as investment opportunities (see Visa report reference Section I). Further investigation is required to ascertain if they were all issued permanent residence, Belize nationality certificates and Passports fraudulently during the period April 2011 to September 2013.

**Yong Xiong Zheng was approved visa in 2012 through Minister Erwin Contreras and Minister Godwin Hulse and thereafter submitted his nationality application (file # 26409/12)**

30. We found that Yong Xiong Zheng, a Chinese national, whose date of birth was stated as 21<sup>st</sup> November 1966 on his visa application, was approved Visa # V00035289 on the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012. A copy of what appeared as a bogus Chinese Passport #G21423581 which had no obvious security features and had an issue date stated as the 7<sup>th</sup> March 2007 and expiry date 6<sup>th</sup> March 2017, was also attached to his visa application. A copy of a letter purportedly from Minister Contreras reference C/Gen/1/01/12 dated 20<sup>th</sup> September 2012 to Roger Tien inviting him and his group of investors to Belize for investment opportunities, was also seen attached to Yong Xiong Zheng's application. This same letter was also attached to Jinchen An and Liming Huang's visa application.

However, the copy submitted by Yong Xiong Zheng did not have the signature and comments of former Director, Ruth Meighan, written on it as seen on the copy for Jinchen An and Liming Huang. We saw instead a note dated 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012 from Minister Godwin Hulse as follows:

*From the Desk of Hon Senator Godwin Hulse, Minister of Labour, Local Government, Rural Development, National Emergency Management and Immigration and Nationality.*

*Nov 29, 2012*

*Ms. Marin,*

*Mr. Roger Tien will be applying for visas for visitors from Mainland, China. Kindly peruse and facilitate if all is in order.*

*Regards,*

*(signed Godwin Hulse)*

*Minister*

30.2 We saw no evidence that Yong Xiong Zheng was issued a Belizean nationality certificate and Passport prior to October 2013 but his name and nationality file # 26409/12 was seen on a spreadsheet labelled “Minister’s list”, which was a list of pending nationality files and their status. His application had no date recorded on it to indicate when the document was received and the comments seen with respect to his nationality file were: “Application incomplete; needs original documents, needs to change application form”. We could not ascertain how Yong Xiong Zheng could have applied for nationality sometime in 2012 when he was approved a visa on the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012.

**Shufeng Chen was approved visa in 2012 through Minister Erwin Contreras and Minister Godwin Hulse and thereafter received Belizean certificate number 28400**

31. We found that Shufeng Chen (Shu Feng Chen), Chinese, whose date of birth was stated as the 30<sup>th</sup> December 1964 on his visa application, was approved Visa # V00035288 on the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012 (the same date as Yong Xiong Zheng). A copy of what appeared as bogus Chinese Passport #G51513269 (it had no obvious security features) with issued date of 13<sup>th</sup> May 2011 and expiry date of 12<sup>th</sup> May 2021 was also attached to his visa application. We also saw a copy of the same invitation letter referenced C/Gen/1/01/12 and dated 20<sup>th</sup> September 2012 from the Minister of Trade, Erwin Contreras to Roger Tien that invited him and his group of Investors to Belize for investment opportunities.

A copy of that same letter was seen attached to Jinchen An, Liming Huang and Yong Xiong Zheng's visa application as outlined above; however, the copy did not have the signature and comments of former Director, Ruth Meighan, written on it as seen on the copy for Jinchen An and Liming Huang's visa applications. Attached was also the note from Minister Godwin Hulse dated 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012.

- 31.2 Shufeng Chen was issued his Belizean nationality certificate #28400 dated 28<sup>th</sup> May 2013 as seen in the Numbers Book. No evidence was found that he was issued a Belizean Passport up to 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013. His name and nationality file # 28869/12 were seen on a spreadsheet labelled "Minister's list", a list of pending BNA files and their status. His nationality application had no date recorded to indicate when it was received and the comments seen with respect to his BNA file was: "vetted and sent to DINS 22/05/13".

We could not ascertain how Shufeng Chen could have applied for Nationality in 2012 when he had been approved a visa on the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012.

- 31.3 We noted that Minister Erwin Contreras also requested nationality files of individuals including Jinchao Wu's (also referred to as Jin Chao Wu). This individual did not qualify for Belizean nationality on the date he was issued said nationality and the immigration stamps in his Passport appeared bogus. Other Ministers of Government, Area Representatives, Mayors and even "Caretakers" requested visas for persons as reported in our Visa report.

We were unable to investigate if they also were invited to Belize with the intention for them to receive Belizean nationality and Passports without meeting the legal residency requirements as was the case with persons who were invited by Minister Erwin Contreras as outlined at **Table K** above.

- 31.4 Wei Hang Chen also obtained Belizean nationality and Passport fraudulently after he was recommended by Minister Elvin Penner for a Belize visa. The findings on Wei Hang Chen and those individuals listed at **Table K** above will be further expounded in this report.

**Copies of irregular original certificates and fraudulent replacement nationality certificates were used by individuals to obtain their first issue Belizean Passports.**

32. We saw many Passport applications for Asians and other foreigners which were incomplete, and had several processing irregularities. (As stated in our Passport report reference Section III).

32.2 We found several more of such cases on the BPIS during our Nationality audit and discovered that their Passport applications were not presented to us. Those Passport applications were among those from 2013 that were removed from the INS prior to the Audit. Those persons listed at **Table L** below received genuine machine readable Passports although they did not appear at a Passport Office for their biometrics and had fraudulent nationality certificates.

**Table L**

The following are the persons that were issued genuine Passports with fraudulent nationality certificates and who did not appear at a Passport office.

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number</b>  | <b>Date of Certificate</b> | <b>Applicant's photo on the BPIS</b>                       | <b>Fingerprint Report</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|---|----------------------------|--|---------------------------|---|
| Minghui Du  | 5016/96<br><br>In the Register of Citizens by Registration it was issued on the 12 <sup>th</sup> July 1994 to Vilma Esperanza Nunez plus 2 children. Nationality file #4241 | 19 <sup>th</sup> June 1996 | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture | Unable to fingerprint     | Passport P0229402 was issued 21 <sup>st</sup> February 2013. Passport application was not presented to Audit. (Ailing Li was the JP who recommended the applicant for his Belizean Passport)          |
| Maria Lui   | 9117/99<br><br>In the Register of Citizens by Registration it was issued Guillermo Leonardo Minksa on 25 <sup>th</sup> August 1998 (BNA file #10792)                        | 13 <sup>th</sup> May 1999  | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture | Unable to fingerprint     | Passport P0246553 was issued on the 5 <sup>th</sup> September 2013. Passport application was not presented to Audit. (Emory Young was the JP who recommended the applicant for her Belizean Passport) |

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number</b>   | <b>Date of Certificate</b>  | <b>Applicant's photo on the BPIS</b>                       | <b>Fingerprint Report</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|---------------|--|-----------------------------|--|---------------------------|---|
| Xiaobing Yang | 2863/94<br>(No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration under Section 11A. Under Section 10 2863/94 was issued to Katharina Froese            | 23 <sup>rd</sup> March 1994 | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture | Unable to fingerprint     | He was approved Belize Visa vide #568/BMP/11 on the 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011. Visa V00026824 was issued<br><br>Passport P0230769 was issued on the 6 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. Passport application and nationality file were not presented to Audit. (Emory Young was the JP who recommended the applicant for his Belizean Passport) |
| Ying Zheng    | 2864/94<br>(No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration under Section 11A. Under Section 10 2864/94 was issued to Maria Estela Santos Recinos | 23 <sup>rd</sup> March 1994 | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture | Unable to fingerprint     | She was approved Belize Visa #566/BMP/11 on the 6 <sup>th</sup> December<br><br>Passport P0230801 was issued on the 6 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. Passport application and Nationality file were  |



| <b>Name</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number</b>  | <b>Date of Certificate</b>  | <b>Applicant's photo on the BPIS</b>                       | <b>Fingerprint Report</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|---|---|--|---------------------------|--|
|             |   |   |  |                           | not presented to Audit.<br>(Emory Young was the JP who recommended the applicant for her Belizean Passport)  |
| Chang Yang  | 2864.1/94<br>(No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration under Section 11A. Under Section 10 2864.1/94 was issued to Maria Estela Santos Recinos (no children included) | 19 <sup>th</sup> December 2008 (recorded as date added to Ying Zheng's nationality certificate) | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture | Unable to fingerprint     | She was approved Belize Visa #567/BMP/11 on the 6 <sup>th</sup> December 2011)<br><br>Passport P0230780 was issued on the 6 <sup>th</sup> March 2013. Passport application and nationality file were not presented to Audit.<br>(Emory Young was the JP who recommended the applicant for her Belizean Passport) |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number</b>  | <b>Date of Certificate</b> | <b>Applicant's photo on the BPIS</b>                       | <b>Fingerprint Report</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|---|----------------------------|--|---------------------------|--|
| Ruijie Ren  | 2814/94 (under Section 11A certificate 2814 was issued to Lo Shen Shu-Hui dated 27 <sup>th</sup> April 1993. Under Section 10 said certificate was issued to Patricia Louise Graham dated 12 <sup>th</sup> March 1992 nationality file 3947 | 6 <sup>th</sup> April 1994 | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture | Unable to fingerprint     | <p>He was approved Belize visa V00026822 on 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011</p> <p>Passport P0228610 was issued on the 11<sup>th</sup> February 2013. JP Emory Young recommended applicant for his Belizean Passport.</p> <p>His nationality file was not received.</p> |

32.3 Furthermore, The Nationality Act Chapter 161 Part V Loss of Citizenship (Section 20) states:

A person who is a citizen by registration shall cease to be a citizen of Belize if that person resides outside Belize for five consecutive years or more, exclusive of any period during which that person- -

(a) is employed abroad as an officer in the services of the Government of Belize; or

(b) is abroad as a representative of the Government of Belize; or

(c) being the spouse or minor child of a citizen of Belize who is abroad in any of the capacities specified in paragraphs

(a) and (b) of this section, resides abroad with that citizen; or

(d) resides abroad on a holiday or for reasons of health; or

(e) is a student at an educational institution abroad; or

(f) resides abroad with a spouse who is a citizen of Belize by descent; or

(g) is abroad for any other purpose which may be prescribed by Order of the Minister.

The Nationality Act Chapter 161 Part V Loss of Citizenship (Section 21.-1e) states

32.4 Where the Minister is satisfied that a person who is a citizen of Belize by registration- (e) has, since the date of his becoming a citizen of Belize by registration, been for a period of not less than two years ordinarily resident in a foreign country of which he was a national or citizen at any time prior to that date, and has not maintained a substantial connection with Belize...the Minister may by Order declare that such person shall cease to be such a citizen and thereupon the person in respect of whom the Order is made shall cease to be a citizen of Belize by registration.

32.5 In accordance with Section 20 and Section 21.-1e of Chapter 161 of the Nationality Act all individuals who did not appear in person for Passport biometrics, may qualify for their Belizean Nationality to be revoked; individual may have been living outside Belize consecutively for 5 years or more or may have been for a period of not less than two years, ordinarily resident in a foreign country of which they were nationals or citizens and may not have maintained a substantial connection with Belize. -This applies even if in some cases their nationality certificates (copies of Replacements or Originals) were issued genuinely under Section 10 of the Nationality Act.

- 32.6 In the initial stage of our audit we were told by the OIC Passport Section, Mrs Sharon Neal Flowers that the Nationality and Passport Sections were not linked to verify the authenticity of nationality certificates before Passports were processed. However, based on our findings we concluded that those fraudulent replacement nationality certificates were not negligently processed. We observed several irregularities in the processing by officers in the Passport Section. Irregularities include missing signatures of applicants and officers who processed the Passport applications, absence of the live photographs of applicants and the absence of recipients' signatures and dates of receipts (see Passport report reference Section III).
- 32.7 We also observed that the relevant Registers of Nationality by Registration were kept in a room next to the Passport Office. Any officer from the Passport section or from the INS had access and could have checked the registers before the Passports were processed. An effortless and quick examination of the Registers of Citizens by Registration would have revealed that many of those replacement nationality certificates presented to the Passport Section were fraudulent as we found.
- 32.8 There could have been many more of those fraudulent Nationality certificates attached to Passport applications for first-issue or renewal of Belize manual or machine-readable Passports; however, only three months of the Passport applications for 2011 and 2012 were examined by the Audit Team.
- 32.9 A list of those persons with fraudulent nationality certificates who did not appear in person for first-issue Passports can be seen at **Appendix B**.
- 32.10 Those may not have appeared in person for biometrics with fraudulent nationality certificates that renewed Passports are listed at **Appendix B1**.

**The INS appeared to have been facilitating an unlawful “Economic Citizenship Program” although the Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program (BECIP) had ended 15<sup>th</sup> January 2002**

33. The Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program (BECIP) officially ended on 15<sup>th</sup> January, 2002 (Ref. [www.belizecompany.com](http://www.belizecompany.com). Regulators and Legislation/Economic Citizenship Programme). However, we saw copies of replacement nationality certificates that were fraudulently backdated, from Passport applications for the period April 2011 to September 2013., Also copies of irregular original certificates and certificate numbers written on Passport applications through which persons claimed that they had received Belizean nationality through the Economic Citizenship Investment Programmes (Section 11A). Those persons claimed they had received Belizean nationality through economic investment from the 1990's and into the year 2000.

In our investigation we uncovered questionable processes that suggested an illegitimate BECIP scheme may have been operating abroad with links to the Belize INS, Nationality and Passport Sections. That was evident from the documents received from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which was obtained through interviews with persons who visited several foreign missions to verify their Passports or to apply for a Passport. See Passport Report and paragraphs 84.2 and 159.2 of this Report. Such was the case with Nina and Zhaoyi Sha (see Passport report), they were told by a person named Tony in Dalian, China that they were applying for Economic Citizenship. However, they were issued fraudulent replacement nationality certificates with numbers from under Section 10. The Register of Citizens by Registration used to fraudulently issue certificate numbers, for those persons showed numerous discrepancies, and was still being fraudulently used for 2011, 2012 and 2013 Passport applications by backdating replacement nationality certificates.

33.2 We also discovered that “agents” abroad who had assisted persons with their previous Economic Citizenship applications were also assisting s with applications for their spouses and children. Belizean nationality was claimed through marriage and descent respectively. We could not ascertain if they were referring to another previous illegal BECIP program or a genuine one. Such examples are discussed further in this Report.

33.3 We were given a copy of the Government of Belize Policy on Economic Citizenship Investment Program of January 1995, amended July 1997. Paragraph 5 of the Investment Program states:

“Belizean laws allow for the operation of Economic Citizenship Investment Programs. This was made possible through an amendment to the Belizean Constitution. The amended Law makes provision for the grant of citizenship to persons who make a substantial contribution to the Economy of Belize. In 1985 the Belizean Nationality Act 1981 was amended by the Belizean Amended Nationality Act 1985 to provide as follows:

“A person who has to the satisfaction of the Minister, made substantial contribution to the economy and or well being of Belize, or who has rendered distinguished service to Belize, and who is not entitled to be registered under any of the other provisions of this Act may be granted citizenship by Registration.”

33.4 We also read in the Government of Belize Policy on Economic Citizenship Investment Program of January 1995 and amended July 1997 (Requirement #18 of page 10) that BECIP approved persons were given their nationalization certificates and Passports at the same

“Applications which are approved by the Scrutinizing Committee shall be sent to the Director of Immigration for the preparation of the Certificate of Nationalization and the Passport.

A notice shall be sent by the BECIP Unit to the successful applicant, advising of the grant of the citizenship and indicating the date and time when the applicant is to be sworn in as a citizen of Belize and to receive his certificate of nationalization and his Belizean Passport.”

- 33.5 Several of those persons who receive their nationality fraudulently did not appear at a Passport Office or Foreign Mission for their biometric capture although it appeared as though they were receiving first-issue Belizean Passports. Those certificate numbers used either were not entered in the Register of Citizens by Registration, belonged to someone else in the Register or we saw no Register with those certificate number series to verify their authenticity. Those persons also did not have nationality files at the INS. The Register (Section 11A) did not have their names and/ or any file numbers recorded. We requested those persons’ files by names, however this proved futile as no files were presented. Since there were no files at the Department for those persons we could not ascertain if they had ever contributed substantially to the economy and or well being of Belize, or had rendered distinguished service to Belize to qualify for Belizean citizenship under Section 11A.
- 33.6 A list of those persons with first-issue Passports allegedly issued under Section 11A who appeared in person for their 1<sup>st</sup> issue Belizean Passports are listed at **Appendix C**.
- 33.7 Those who may have appeared in person, for biometrics with irregular and fraudulent nationality certificates or with genuine nationality certificates, obtained fraudulently and renewed Passports issued under Section 10 & 11A can be seen at **Appendix C1**.
- 33.8 There could have been many more of those fraudulent nationality certificates attached to Passport applications for first-issue or renewal of Belize manual or machine-readable Passports for those who received nationality under Section 10 and Section 11A; however, only three months of the Passport applications for 2011 and 2012 were examined by the Audit Team.
- 33.9 We have outlined below some individuals who were found to have been issued visas to visit Belize and were fraudulently issued Belizean nationality and in some cases also received Passports.

**1) Oleg Kalugin was fraudulently issued a Belize Economic Investment Citizenship Nationality Certificate #22/01/98 and Passport P0209568**

34. We saw that Oleg Kalugin whose place of birth was stated as Russia and date of birth was stated as 18<sup>th</sup> May 1968, was issued a Belize visa #32180 on the 16<sup>th</sup> July 2012. He entered the country through the Port of entry at the Belize Northern Border Station (BNBS).

His visa application had no sponsor and no supporting documents attached except for his Passport size photo. He presented Russian Federation Passport #64No0887452 (issue and expiration date unknown).

The purpose of his visit was “Tourist” as recorded in the Northern Border Station visa returns for July 2012. His visa #V00032180 was approved and issued at Northern Border Station.

34.2 The Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS) showed that Oleg Kalugin presented Belizean nationality certificate #22/01/98 dated 26<sup>th</sup> February 1998 and that he was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Demecio Cal JP. His address in the BPIS was 2 1/2 Miles Northern Highway Belize. We requested his nationality file but it was not presented to Audit. His certificate # 22/01/98 was not seen under Section 11A in the BECIP Register.

34.3 We found through comparison of our manually compiled visa list and the INS Passport Issue list, that Oleg Kalugin received his Belizean Passport P0209568 on 17<sup>th</sup> July 2012 the day after he had entered Belize. This suggested that all documents including his nationality certificate had been prepared for him prior to his visit and that persons at the Immigration Department may have facilitated his arrival to Belize and accepted fraudulent documents at the Passport Section.

34.4 Our findings on the examination of the section of the Register of Citizens by Registration that was labelled “Citizenship by Investment” through which persons received Belizean Citizenship under Section 11A of the Belize Nationality Act will be discussed further in this Report.

**2) Xiaobing Yang, his wife Ying Zheng and daughter Chang Yang were fraudulently issued Belize Economic Investment Citizenship Nationality Certificates # 2863/94, # 2864/94 and 2864.1/94**

35. We found during our Belmopan visa investigation a visa application form dated 29<sup>th</sup> November 2011 in the name of Xiaobing Yang, whose country of birth was stated as China and his date of birth stated as 22<sup>nd</sup> April 1968. The application form had the signature Xiaobing Yang. It appears that he may not have been in Belize to sign the application however, someone signed his name on the line designated for “signature of applicant/guardian”.

35.2 We noted that at the top right hand corner of the visa application form, which was reserved for the date the visa was issued, 10<sup>th</sup> November 2011 was recorded. The date was in the same handwriting as some sections of the application form. In Section 1.16 of the application was the indication that children were travelling with him while in Section 1.17 he listed the names of his “children” who in fact were his wife and daughter. Those names listed were Ying Zheng whose date of birth was 18<sup>th</sup> April 1972; relationship: “wife” and Chang Yang with her date of birth as 4<sup>th</sup> April 1999; relationship: “daughter”.

The visa application form did not indicate the date they intended to visit and leave Belize. It had that they would be staying in Belize at “2462 Tam Road, Belize City David Wang”. The purpose of their visit was indicated as “tourist”.

35.3 Attached to the application was copy of Chinese Passport G36454600 with issue date 31<sup>st</sup> July 2009 and expiry date of 30<sup>th</sup> July 2019. A copy of a Certificate of Incorporation for Pick & Pay (Belize) Co. Ltd. including a document listing the Directors: Chen Hua Liu, David Wang and Delmy Suyapa Cerin were also attached. A copy of David Wang’s voter identification (ID) #498544 with Registration #22 3231 issued 1<sup>st</sup> April 2009 was also seen attached which indicated that he was their sponsor.

35.4 There were no supporting documents attached to prove that the applicants were coming to do business with David Wang. No documents were attached to confirm that any or all of them were related; that Chang Yang was the daughter of Xiaobing Yang and Ying Zheng was his wife. A single entry visa was recommended by an unknown signature (we could not verify whose signature it was) and approved by the former Director, Ruth Meighan on the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011. Visa #568/Bmp/11 was written on his application form.

35.5 We also found a visa application form for Chang Yang, whose application stated that she was born in China on the 4<sup>th</sup> April 1999. The visa application was undated and signed by what appeared to be the signature of David Wang. On the top right corner of the application was the date 10<sup>th</sup> November 2011, but that date was marked out by Immigration Officer, Martin Guy who wrote 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011. The purpose of her travel was indicated as “Tourist” and someone wrote on the form (at the official use section) that “subject is coming to do business with David Wang”.

We could not ascertain how business could have been conducted with a twelve year old (a minor).

35.6 We saw attached to her application form a copy of her Chinese Passport G36454598 issued on 31<sup>st</sup> July 2009 with expiry date of 30<sup>th</sup> July 2014. All documents aforementioned attached to Xiaobing Yang’s application form were also attached to hers indicating that David Wang was her sponsor.

35.7 As with Xiaobing Yang, there were no supporting documents attached to prove that the applicant was coming to do business with David Wang. Neither did the visa application indicate as to when she planned to visit Belize. A single entry visa was recommended by an unknown signature (we could not verify whose signature it was) and approved on the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 by the former Director, Ruth Meighan. Visa #567/Bmp/11 was written on the form.

We saw that Ying Zheng was also approved Visa #566/Bmp/11 by former Director, Ruth Meighan.



35.8 Our search of the BPIS showed that the Belizean nationality certificate numbers used were from Section 11A of the BECIP Register. Xiaobing Yang nationality certificate #2863/94 was dated 23<sup>rd</sup> March 1994; Ying Zheng nationality certificate #2864 dated 23<sup>rd</sup> March 1994 and Chang Yang nationality certificate #2864.1 dated 19<sup>th</sup> December 2008.

35.9 A search of the Register of citizens by Registration showed that there was no entry made under Section 11A for all three certificate numbers used. We found under Section 10 for citizens by Registration that certificate # 2863 was issued to Katharina Froese on the 24<sup>th</sup> April 1992 (nationality file #3604) while certificate # 2864 was issued to Maria Estela Santos Recinos on the 21<sup>st</sup> April 1992 (nationality file #3653).

35.10 Xiaobing Yang, Ying Zheng and Chang Yang received Belizean nationality as Economic Citizens through fraudulent certificates one (1) year and three (3) months after they were approved visas to enter Belize.

We requested their nationality files, however none was presented.

35.11 During our search of the BPIS we found that all three received Belizean Passports on the 6<sup>th</sup> March 2013. However, they did not appear in person to have biometrics captured for Belizean Passports that were issued on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2013. We observed that their photographs appeared as pictures of pictures and no fingerprints were captured on the BPIS.

35.12 The address used on the BPIS for all three was Vista Del Mar, Belize District and they were all recommended by Emory Young JP of Belmopan for their Belizean Passports.

The Passports issued to them were:

Xiaobing Yang Passport P0230769

Chang Yang Passport P0230780

And

Ying Zheng Passport P0230801.

Their Passport application forms were not presented to Audit.

### **3) Ruijie Ren was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 2814/94**

36. We found during our Belmopan visa investigation a visa application form dated 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 in the name of Ruijie Ren. His country of birth was stated as China and date of birth stated as the 26<sup>th</sup> September 1977. The application form had the signature “Ruijie Ren. The signature of Ruijie Ren on his visa application appeared as the same handwriting as the sponsor, David Wang. Both signatures were in print (not cursive) and in bold capital letters.

They were written in similar black ink and the letter “N” in both signatures was very similar. The visa application was not a faxed copy but an original visa application. The copy of Chinese Passport number G42404832 in the name Ruijie Ren had no signature to compare the signature on the visa application to. The signature on Ruijie Ren’s electronic Passport application was also not his since he did not appear in person for his Belize Passport. That signature was also different than the one on the visa application. That application appeared to have been presented at the Belmopan Office at the same time with the visa applications for Xiaobing Yang, Ying Zheng and Chang Yang, who all received Belizean Passports in 2013 without appearing for Passport biometrics and through fraudulent nationality certificates we saw on the BPIS.

- 36.2 We noted the visa application form did not indicate the date Ruijie Ren intended to visit and leave Belize. It stated that he would be staying in Belize at “2462 Tam Road, Belize City David Wang”. The purpose of his visit was indicated as “tourist”.
- 36.3 We saw a copy of Ruijie Ren’s Chinese Passport G42404832 with issue date 12<sup>th</sup> May 2010 and expiry date of 11<sup>th</sup> May 2020 attached to the application. A copy of a Certificate of Incorporation for Pick & Pay (Belize) Co. Ltd. including a document listing the Directors: Chen Hua Liu, David Wang and Delmy Suyapa Cerin were also attached. A copy of David Wang’s voter identification (ID) #498544 with Registration #22 3231 issued 1<sup>st</sup> April 2009 was also seen attached which indicated that he was the sponsor.
- 36.4 A single entry visa was recommended by an unknown signature and approved on 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 by the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. Visa #569/Bmp/11 was written on his application form. We saw that visa V00026822 dated 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 was issued to him.
- 36.5 We saw through a search of the BPIS that he applied for and used Belizean nationality certificate number 2814/94 dated 6<sup>th</sup> April 1994 to apply for his Belizean Passport.
- 36.6 We saw during our search of the BPIS that he did not appear in person to have his biometrics captured for Belizean Passport P0228610. We observed that his photograph appeared as a picture of a picture and no fingerprints were captured on the BPIS. We also observed that the data was created and modified on the 7<sup>th</sup> February 2013 then completed on the 11<sup>th</sup> February 2013 by Erwin Robinson. Passport P0228610 was approved on the 11<sup>th</sup> February 2013 by the OIC Passport Section, Ms Sharon Neal Flowers, printed and print confirmed by Eleud Romero and QA passed by Omar Philips.
- 36.7 We noted that his address on the BPIS was 3 Miles Northern Highway. He was recommended by Emory Young JP of Belmopan for his Belizean Passport. Emory Young JP also recommended Xiaobing Yang, Chang Yang and Ying Zheng who were approved Belize visas and subsequently issued fraudulent Belizean nationality certificates and genuine Passports under similar circumstances.

36.8 We search the Register of citizens by Registration and it showed that certificate # 2814 was issued to Lo Shen Shu-Hui on the 27th April 1993 (No nationality file # recorded) under Section 11A Registration. Under Section 10 Registration certificate #2814 was issued to Patricia Louise Graham on the 12<sup>th</sup> March 1992 (nationality file #3947).

36.9 Ruijie Ren, through fraudulent Belizean nationality certificate number 2814 was issued his genuine Belizean Passport number P0228610 on the 11th February 2013, one (1) year, two (2) months and five (5) days after he was approved a Belize visa on the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011.

36.10 Further investigation is also recommended in a effort to better understand how these illegal activities were facilitated.

**4) Wei Hang Chen (Weihang Chen) was fraudulently issued Belize Economic Investment Citizenship Nationality certificate # 2981/94 dated 27<sup>th</sup> January 1994**

37. We saw a visa application in the name of Wei Hang Chen which stated that he was born in China and date of birth was stated as the 2<sup>nd</sup> September 1990. The visa application was dated the 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2012 and it was signed by what appeared as the signature of Eddie Kwok Chun Chan. The purpose of his visit was indicated as “tourist” on his application. His expected date of travel to Belize was recorded as the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2012 and the date he intended to leave Belize was the 10<sup>th</sup> July 2012. No photo of Wei Hang Chen was provided on the visa application but attached was a copy of Chinese Passport #G49686456 with issue date 11<sup>th</sup> March 2011 and expiry date of 10<sup>th</sup> March 2021 in the name Weihang Chen.

37.2 We noted that the applicant’s intended address in Belize was the “Commercial Free Zone Belize-Mexico Border” and the telephone number 621-2335 was recorded as his contact number. Eddie Kwok Chun Chan indicated by a check of the appropriate box that Wei Hang Chen had never travelled to Belize within the last ten (10) years. Attached to the visa application was a Letter of Financial Support in the name Kwok Chun Chan of the Commercial Free Zone Belize-Mexico Border, Corozal, (He used the address of #58 Queen Street, Belize City on other visa applications) on which he declared that he had known the applicant for eighteen (18) years as his “nephew”. No evidence of their family relationship was presented. The letter was witnessed by Eleodoro Lewis JP on the 29<sup>th</sup> May 2012. A copy of Belizean Passport P0119265 in the name of Eddie Kwok Chun Chan with issue date 18<sup>th</sup> November 2009 was seen attached to the application. We also saw a copy of certificate of Compliance from the Commercial Free Zone for the Mandarin General Merchandise Limited, located in the commercial Free Zone, Belize-Mexico Border, Corozal dated the 19<sup>th</sup> July 2010 and signed by Raul Rosado, CEO, Commercial Free Zone. Our search at the Business & Companies Registry showed that this Business was legally registered and had certificate of Registration #11449. The names and addresses of the Directors are discussed further.

37.3 We saw also attached, a copy of a letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2012 addressed to the Director, Immigration Department, Belmopan from Jian Wu Lui of Corozal Town which stated:

*Dear Madam,*

*I have invited three of my friends to come to visit me and my family from China. The name of the three persons are:*

*Wei Hang Chen*

*Feng Zhang*

*and Xian Jing Ye.*

*They will spend about 15 days in Belize to visit with our family and to do some sight seeing. So I ask that you approve their visas as soon as possible.*

*Yours truly*

*J Wu Lui (signed)*

*Jian Wu Lui*

37.4 We saw no proof of Belizean nationality or permanent residency provided by Jian Wu Lui. We found no evidence of any relation between Jian Wu Lui (who presented the invitation letter) and Eddie Kwok Chun Chan (who appeared as the sponsor).

37.5 We also saw on Jian Wu Lui's letter an undated handwritten note with what appeared to be the handwriting and signature of former Minister of Immigration Elvin Penner. The note read:

*Mrs Meighan*

*Can you please approve the visas for the three persons from China for Mr. Jian Wu Lui.*

*Elvin Penner (signed)*

37.6 We noted that Wei Hang Chen's visa application was accepted on the 28<sup>th</sup> May 2012 by Immigration Officer, Miss Adli Martinez and approved on the 31<sup>st</sup> May 2012 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. Miss Meighan wrote on Wei Hang Chen's application; "Approved on the basis of note from Min Elvin Penner". He was approved a single entry visa #V00031450 dated 31<sup>st</sup> May 2012.

- 37.7 Our investigation revealed that Wei Hang Chen was issued on the 6<sup>th</sup> July 2012, a Belizean Passport #P0207661 in the name Weihang Chen, one month and six days after he was approved a visa to enter Belize. His Passport application was not presented to Audit for examination. However, we saw on the BPIS that he used the address #58 Queen Street, Belize City on his Passport application, which was recommended by Ricardo Diaz JP and he used nationality certificate number 2981/94 dated 27<sup>th</sup> January 1994 with his application. We did not see a copy of the nationality certificate.
- 37.8 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration for Economic Citizenship (Section 11A) and found that there was no entry for certificate #2981. Under Section 10 that number had been issued to Jose Angel Mercado Castro in 1992 vide certificate #2981/92 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 1992 file #4472). We noted that Wei Han Chen date of birth was stated as the 2<sup>nd</sup> September 1990, which would have meant that he was issued Belizean nationality as an Economic Citizen when he was four (4) years old.
- 37.9 Further investigation is required since we did not receive Wei Hang Chen's file. Such investigation would ascertain whether his documents were fraudulently backdated like the others we found. His name also surfaced as a sponsor in our audit of visa applications.
- 37.10 We noted that Eddie Kwok Chun Chan of Mandarin General Merchandise, sponsor of Wei Hang Chen, was a visa sponsor for several other visa applicants who applied through the Belmopan Visa Section of the INS as listed at **Table M**.

**Table M**

**The following is the list of other Chinese persons sponsored by Eddie Kwok Chun Chan of Mandarin General Merchandise Limited**

| <b>Name</b>    | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Belize Visa # Approved</b> | <b>Date Visa Approved</b>      | <b>Relationship to Sponsor</b>  |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|---|
| Lin Dong       | 6-Apr-91             | V00026851                     | 30 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | “brother-in-law” known for 10 years                                   |
| Li Fang Wu     | 7-Nov-91             | V00026860                     | 6 <sup>th</sup> January 2012   | "niece" known for 20 years  |
| Lin Jun Weng   | 18-Dec-93            | V00026861                     | 6 <sup>th</sup> January 2012   | "Brother in law" known for 8 years".                                  |
| Hang Jin Xie   | 25-Sep-82            | V00026862                     | 6 <sup>th</sup> January 2012   | "nephew" known for 17 years   |
| Yan Ting Zhang | 18-May-93            | V00031479                     | 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2012     | Visa Request by Hon Elvin Penner; “ niece” known for 18years          |
| Chao Yang      | 2-Jun-93             | V00031476                     | 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2012     | Visa Request by Hon Elvin Penner; "brother in law" known for 12 years |
| Feng Zhang     | 30-Dec-93            | V00031475                     | 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2012     | Visa Request by Hon Elvin Penner; “nephew” known for 14years          |

37.11 Further investigation is required to ascertain whether those persons listed above received Belizean nationality and Passports during the audited period.

37.12 We also found that a fraudulent nationality certificate #2981/94 (undated) in the name Zhao Hui Ye Fu (including one child, Fu Junchi) was used as a supporting document by Zhao Hui Ye Fu to apply as a sponsor for a Belize visa for Yu Zhang. Zhao Hui Ye Fu also used the business certificate of Mandarin General Merchandise Limited for the visa application of Yu Zhang. The fraudulent certificate had what appeared to be the signature of former Minister Philip Goldson. Yu Zhang was approved visa# V00026850 on the 30<sup>th</sup> December 2011 through that fraudulent certificate.

**Letters of financial support were accepted from individuals other than the sponsors**

38. We saw a copy of the same letter signed by Jian Wu Lui with former Minister Penner's note as outlined above, was attached to the visa applications of Feng Zhang You (the letter stated Feng Zhang and Xian Jing Ye). Although Jian Wu Lui made the request and signed the letter, Feng Zhang You's application had a letter of financial support from Bing Tang Li attached with a copy of his Belizean Passport #P0135349 issued on the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2010. A copy of Corozal Trade License Certificate dated 15<sup>th</sup> January 2011 that was issued for Slot Machines Park St. North Corozal Town was also attached. Slot Machines Park St. North Corozal Town was not a legally registered business as its name was not found at the Business and Companies Registry.

38.2 We noted that Xian Jing Ye's visa was requested by Jian Wu Lui but as with Feng Zhang You the letter of support was not from Jian Wu Lui, but by one Guo Ping Lui. A copy of his Belizean Passport #P0186233 issued 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 was attached to Xian Jing Ye's application. Also attached was a copy of a Nightclub Liquor License certificate for 1756 Club Fusion registered in the name Guoping Lui dated 18<sup>th</sup> January 2012. The business name 1756 Club Fusion was also not a legally registered business as its name was not found at the Business and Companies Registry.

**Wei Hang Chen used fraudulent Business Registration Certificate #14582 to apply as a sponsor for three (3) Chinese Visa applicants**

39. We saw that on the 21<sup>st</sup> August 2012, Wei Hang Chen (Weihang Chen) used a fraudulent Business Registration certificate to apply as a visa sponsor for three (3) native Chinese in Belmopan. The business certificate number was 14582 in the name ABCD Cosmetic Store in Punta Gorda Town. He made his application as a sponsor exactly one (1) month and fifteen (15) days after was issued his Belizean Passport #P0207661 dated 6<sup>th</sup> July 2012 and two (2) months and twenty-one (21) days after he was approved visa #V00031450 to visit Belize.

Those persons he applied for were Yan Zhu Zhao, who he claimed to be his aunt, Peixing Qiu, who he claimed to be his sister-in law and Yan Li who he claimed to be his cousin. No Passport photographs were presented for the visa applicants.

39.2 We noted that the business certificate had no seal but was still accepted on the 20<sup>th</sup> August 2012 by R. Mejia from the Visa Section. The business certificate stated that the owner of the business was Weihang Chen and his address was stated as #28 Jose Maria Nunez Street, Punta Gorda Town. As stated above when the application had been made for his visa, the address of the Commercial Free Zone Belize-Mexico Border Corozal was used while on his Passport application his address was #58 Queen Street, Belize City. The business certificate 14582 showed that it had been issued on the 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2009 by Patricia Rodriguez for the Registrar General and Registrar of Companies.

39.3 We did a search at the Business Registry and it revealed that ABCD Cosmetic Store was not a legally registered business. Certificate #14582 had been issued to Wenjing Chen, owner of Jim's Cosmetic Store located on Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan, on the 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2009. We found that Weihang Chen used a genuine business certificate #14582 to make the fraudulent certificate for ABCD Cosmetic Store. We could not ascertain if Wenjing Chen and Weihang Chen were related since they had the same "Chen" surname. The signature of Patricia Rodriguez and the certificate number and date appeared to have been used from the genuinely issued certificate #14582, which had been issued to Wenjing Chen, owner of Jim's Cosmetic Store.

39.4 We noted that the three individuals he sponsored were approved for visas on the 20<sup>th</sup> August 2012 by former Director, Ruth Meighan. Yan Zhu Zhao, holder of Chinese Passport # 59329918 issued on the 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2012 was issued Belize visa #V00032991, Peixing Qiu, holder of Chinese Passport # 49685515 issued on the 10<sup>th</sup> March 2011 was approved Belize visa #V00032990 and Yan Li, holder of Chinese Passport # G22771647 issued on the 15<sup>th</sup> May 2007 was issued Belize visa #V00032989. Those visas were received through a sponsor Weihang Chen, who had not qualified for Belizean citizenship under Belizean laws and a fraudulent business certificate he presented to the INS.

39.5 Further investigation is required to ascertain if any or the three of those persons had also obtained Belizean nationality and Passports during the period April 2011 to September 2013.



**We found that Mandarin General Merchandise Limited (Company Registration #11449) located at the Commercial Free Zone also had Directors who may not have been qualified for Belizean Nationality during the audited period**

40. We confirmed through our investigation at the Business and Companies Registry that Eddie Kwok Chun Chan, who applied as a visa sponsor for Wei Hang Chen was one of the Directors of Mandarin General Merchandise located at the Commercial Free Zone at Belize-Mexico Border, Corozal. In the Registry's documents lodged his address was stated as Avenida Insurgentes #972, Chetumal, Quintana Roo, Mexico.

40.2 The other Directors listed in the Companies Registry and their addresses lodged on the 27<sup>th</sup> December 2013 were:

- i) Junming Yi of Joseito Layout, Corozal Town
- ii) Jackie Chi Jia Jin of Halls Layout, Corozal Town
- iii) Alex Chen of Avenida Insurgentes #972, Chetumal, Quintana Roo, Mexico
- iv) Miss Venus Maneerod, of Halls Layout, Corozal

40.3 We found out that the company had been in existence prior to that date as we saw a copy of a Commercial Free Zone Certificate of Compliance for Mandarin General Merchandise Limited dated 19<sup>th</sup> July 2010 and a copy of the Certificate of Incorporation for Mandarin General Merchandise Limited given on the 1<sup>st</sup> September 2009.

40.4 We found that three of the Directors of Mandarin General Merchandise Limited listed above was issued Belizean nationality and first-issue Belizean Passports during the audited period. We observed the following irregularities with their Passport and/or nationality applications as listed below at **Table N**.

**Table N**

The following are the three Directors of Mandarin General Merchandise Limited who had irregularities with their Passports and or nationality applications

| <b>Name</b>                                | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Address</b>          | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b> | <b>Minister who signed Nationality certificate</b> | <b>Other Observations</b>  |
|--|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|--|--|
| Junming Yi                                 | Chinese               | Joseito Layout, Corozal | 27892/12 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> June 2012      | John Saldivar                                      | He was issued bogus PR Permit #43894, did not pay any PR fee and had no PR file. There was no entry for certificate #27892 in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We did not receive his nationality file. Social Security card #000504068 as a Chinese national was recently issued on 4 <sup>th</sup> June 2012                |
| Miss Venus Maneerod                        | Chainat, Thailand     | Joseito Layout, Corozal | 25921/11 dated 13 <sup>th</sup> December 2011  | Copy of nationality certificate was not seen       | She was issued bogus PR permit #43843, did not pay any PR fee and had no PR file. Copy of Thailand native Passport #Z804586 was issued on 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2010. Further investigation needed to examine her nationality file.   |
| Jackie Chi Jia Jin (previously Jiachi Jin) | Zhejiang, China       | Joseito Layout, Corozal | 25750/11 dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> November 2011  | Copy of nationality certificate was not seen       | Copy of irregular native Chinese Passport #G45012517 was seen in the name Jiachi Jin with issue date 21 <sup>st</sup> December 2010 issued in Mexico. He changed his name after he was issued his nationality certificate and before he applied for a Belizean Passport. Further investigation needed to examine her nationality file. |

40.5 Further investigation is required for Alex Chen since we were unable to conduct any searches on his name, as his name was a common name and would have appeared numerous times in the Passport list. We would have needed more specific information on him for example, date of birth.

**Zhao Hui Ye Fu used the same Fraudulent Belizean Nationality Certificate #2981/94 as Wei Hang Chen to apply as a Visa sponsor**

41. We found that another Chinese named Zhao Hui Ye Fu used the same fraudulent nationality certificate #2981/94 as Wei Hang Chen. He was associated with Mandarin General Merchandise Limited and claimed to be an employee of said company. He applied as a sponsor on the 29<sup>th</sup> December 2011 for a visa for Yu Zhang at the Visa Section of the INS. His address was stated as #58 Queen Street, Belize City as had Eddie Kwok Chun Chan one of the Directors of Mandarin General Merchandise Limited and sponsor of several other visa applicants as discussed earlier in this report at **paragraph**. He also used the Certificate of Incorporation dated 1<sup>st</sup> September 2009 for Mandarin General Merchandise Limited to apply as the sponsor for Yu Zhang.

41.2 We noted that he presented a letter of support as well as a copy of an undated fraudulent Belizean nationality certificate #2981/94 along with the visa application for Yu Zhang who he claimed was his nephew. The nationality certificate also included the name of a minor child, Fu Junchi, born on the 19<sup>th</sup> February 1984 in Guangdong, China and was allegedly signed by former Minister of Immigration, Philip Goldson. We could not ascertain why he did not use a Belizean Passport, which was the document frequently used to request visas for persons as sponsors. We searched the BPIS and did not find any record of machine-readable Belizean Passports that had been issued to Zhao Hui Ye Fu or to Fu Junchi. We requested Zhao Hui Ye Fu's nationality file but it was not presented.

41.3 We noted that he used the same fraudulent nationality certificate number 2981/94 as Wei Hang Chen which was not recorded under Section 11A of the Register of Citizens by Registration and had been issued to Jose Angel Mercado Castro on the 29<sup>th</sup> May 1992 (nationality file # 4472) under Section 10. We noted that the copy of the certificate had been certified as a "true copy" on the 30<sup>th</sup> December 2011 by Ady Pacheco who had accepted the visa application.

Yu Zhang's (DOB 1<sup>st</sup> June 1987) visa application was approved by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan and he was issued visa #V00026850 on the 30<sup>th</sup> December 2011.

**Wen Sheng Li Visa sponsor from Mandarin General Merchandise Limited had previously been the holder of a Belize stolen manual Passport**

42. We noted another Chinese Wen Sheng Li of Santa Rita Road #11, Corozal, applied as the sponsor of visa applicants and also used the Business Compliance certificate of Mandarin General Merchandise Limited. Attached to those visa applications was a copy of machine readable Belizean Passport #P0053817 issued on 27<sup>th</sup> February 2007. We found that Wen Sheng Li had been the holder of stolen manual Belizean Passport #A003664 issued 8<sup>th</sup> January 2007 that had what appeared to be the signature of former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo. We saw nationality certificate #18591/05 dated 4<sup>th</sup> July 2005 written in the Passport.
- 42.2 We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and it showed that nationality certificate #18591/05 had been issued to Bingtang Li (plus 1 child) on the 4<sup>th</sup> July 2005 (nationality file # 18241). Bingtang Li, mentioned above in this report and also associated with Jian Wu Lui (who requested the visa for Weihang Chen) , was also a frequent visa sponsor for Chinese applicants using a copy of Corozal Trade License Certificate dated 15<sup>th</sup> January 2011 that was issued for Slot Machines Park St. North Corozal Town, a business that was not legally registered. It is to be noted that nationality certificate #18591/05 dated 4<sup>th</sup> July 2005 was also recorded in stolen manual Passport #A003665 with issue date 8<sup>th</sup> January 2007 in the name of Yuzhu Li that had been fraudulently issued to her. The Passport also had what appeared to be the signature of former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo.
- 42.3 We saw on the visa interview questionnaires, Wen Sheng Li stated that he was a business owner and worked at Mandarin General Merchandise Limited. However, he was not listed as one of the Directors at the Registry in 2013.
- 42.4 We have listed below at **Table O** persons who were sponsored by Wen Sheng Li previous holder of stolen manual Passport.

**Table O**

The following is the list of persons who were sponsored by Wen Sheng Li; previous holder of stolen manual Passport

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Visa # Approved</b> | <b>Date Visa Approved</b> | <b>Relationship to Sponsor</b> |
|---------------|----------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Jia Hu Lin    | 10-Apr-90            | 26847                  | 30th December 2011        | "cousin" known for 12 years    |
| Mei Ling Wu   | 25-Nov-85            | 26848                  | 30th December 2011        | "cousin" known for 13 years    |
| Xin You Lin   | 10-Aug-90            | 26865                  | 9th January 2012          | "cousin" known for 16 years    |
| Xiu Qin Zhang | 25-Aug-86            | 26866                  | 9th January 2012          | "cousin" known for 17 years"   |
| Bi Huo Liu    | 30-Nov-83            | 26867                  | 9th January 2012          | "cousin" known for 18 years    |

42.5 Further investigation is required in order to ascertain if those persons he sponsored had received Belizean nationality certificates and Passports.

**Nationality certificate #18840/05 issued to Jian Fu Li (sponsor of many Visa applicants in January and February 2013) was fraudulently issued to and used by John Xu, to apply for a Belizean Passport for which he did not appear in person to capture his biometrics**

43. We have discussed above, that it appeared that Chinese persons were “lending” and “borrowing” the nationality certificates and business registration certificates of other Chinese to make fraudulent ones.

43.2 We noted that this appeared to be the case with Jian Fu Li of Nim Li Punit Street, Belmopan, holder of Belize Passport #P0150115 issued 18<sup>th</sup> November 2010 in the name Jianfu Li. Jian Fu Li applied as the sponsor of twenty (20) Chinese persons. Thirteen (13) of those persons he applied for on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2013 he used an approval letter dated 19<sup>th</sup> February 2011 from the Belmopan City Council. The letter was for a Trade License to operate a business named Happy Internet Cafe, located at #4414 Nim Li Punit Street for the period February to December 2011. That approval letter was accepted by Martin Guy and Adli Martinez from the visa section although the period it covered had expired. Those thirteen (13) visas were recommended by Hon Erwin Contreras.

Jian Fu Li also appeared as a sponsor for seven (7) more Chinese on the 14<sup>th</sup> February 2013. Two (2) of those visas were recommended by Hon John Saldivar and the other five (5) by Hon Erwin Contreras. We noted in this case that a copy of Belmopan Trade licence certificate for Happy Internet Cafe, located at #4 Nim Li Punit was presented, which had been issued for the period 1<sup>st</sup> January to 31<sup>st</sup> December 2011. This expired Trade licence certificate was also accepted by Martin Guy and Adli Martinez, although it was expired. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether those twenty (20) visa applicants had received Belize permanent residence and/or Nationality and Passports during the period reviewed.

- 43.3 We discovered during the Passport audit that a Passport application was submitted in the name of John Xu, Chinese, with the home address of Camalote Village. The Passport application submitted on the 21<sup>st</sup> November 2012, appeared to have been written out by Eleodoro Lewis JP, who also recommended the applicant stating that he knew John Xu for one (1) year.
- 43.4 We saw attached to the Passport application a fraudulent replacement nationality certificate #18840/05 in the name John Xu, which also stated that his name at birth was Mujie Xu. No copy of a deed poll was attached to the Passport application and a search at the Vital Statistics Unit in Belize City revealed that no change of name was legally made for Mujie Xu to John Xu. Printed on the front of the fraudulent Nationality certificate was the name of former Immigration Minister Hon Ralph Fonseca and the date 27<sup>th</sup> June 2005, suggesting that the original certificate had been signed by him on that date. At the back of the certificate was a note certifying that the fraudulent certificate was a true replacement of the original certificate. It was signed by what appeared as the signature of Gareth Murillo and dated the 6<sup>th</sup> January 2009. This certificate was certified as a true copy by Erwin Robinson who also accepted the form as the Counter Clerk on the 21<sup>st</sup> November 2012.
- 43.5 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that certificate number 18840/05 had been issued to Jian Fu Li on the 31<sup>st</sup> October 2005 (BNA File #18178). We received the Nationality file for Jian Fu Li and saw that he had been issued Nationality certificate #18840/05. In the nationality file his address was stated as #85 Neal's Pen Road, Belize City and his occupation was a mechanic and as a businessman. Jian Fu Li may have also not qualified for Belizean Nationality since one of his Referees, Rafael Cho of #10 Mahogany Street, Belize City, stated that he had known him for four (4) years. The required time for Referees to know an applicant for Belizean Nationality was five (5) years.

A copy of an irregular Chinese Passport #145485197 with issue date 20<sup>th</sup> May 1998 in the name Jianfu Li was seen in the Nationality file along with a copy of Belize Permanent Residence card #15043/99 in the name Jian Fu Li, which had the signature of former Director, Paulino Castellanos as issued on the 25<sup>th</sup> February 1999. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether the PR card was genuinely issued.

43.6 We also saw a copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G30386828 with issue date 9<sup>th</sup> July 2008 was also attached to John Xu's Passport application but it was in the name of Mujie Xu. Our investigation revealed that John (Mujie) Xu did not appear in person for his Passport biometrics as the BPIS photo appeared as a picture of a picture and no fingerprints were captured. The signature of Sharon Neal Flowers was seen as the approver of the Passport application. The signature of Immigration Officer, Romi Rosas appeared as the data entry operator, Elick Chan appeared as the Printer and the Quality Assurance was done by Omar Philips.

43.7 Jian Fu Li's Nationality certificate was used by someone to make the fraudulent Nationality certificate for John Xu, through which John Xu received genuine Belize Passport # P0220246 on the 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2012. The Passport was picked up by someone who signed the name "John Xu" on the Passport application form.

**Some individuals fraudulently acquired Belizean nationality under Section 10 when their dates of entry into Belize, temporary employment permit stamp dates and Permanent Residence stamp dates were backdated on bogus copies of their native Passports**

Section 10.-(1) b of The Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161, states that the applicant (for Belize Nationality through Registration) is a person who is ordinarily resident in Belize and has been so resident for a period of five years immediately preceding the date of the application.

Page 6 Section 6 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 titled "Acceptance of nationality Application 161 Nationality Act Section 10)" states:

Proof of (5) five years residence in the country. If applicant has permanent residence in Belize, the date of arrival must be checked to ensure that the five year domicile period is correct. If they have only Passports, the Passport must reflect the five year domicile period through successive temporary status...Applicants may also prove domicile period with copies of their Passports, as the possibility exists that they may have obtained temporary status such as employment permits, student permits etc....

44. We found evidence that several persons who had recently been approved visas to visit Belize, had nationality files with native Passports showing Belize entry dates as though they had been in the country for the 5 years domicile period or more. They also had what appeared as bogus Chinese Passports. Those persons and the findings are outlined below:

**1) Xi Wang aka James Louis Wang was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #28428/13**

45. We saw that Xi Wang whose visa application stated that he was born in Jiang Su (China) and whose date of birth was stated as 6<sup>th</sup> March 1984, was issued Belize visa #V00036693 in Belmopan on the 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013. His visa application was approved by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan on said 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013.

45.2 We noted that the visa application form was signed by “Wang Xi” and dated 7<sup>th</sup> January 2013 although he had not arrived in the country. On the visa application form he indicated that he wished to travel to Belize on the 20<sup>th</sup> January 2013 and that the purpose of his visit was “Tourist”. A copy of Chinese Passport #G58039971 with issue date 7-Feb-2012 and expiration date 6-Feb-2022 was presented with his visa application. We saw also, a copy of a letter reference 1111/1A/13 (2) Vol VIII dated 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013, from former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, which informed “To Whom It May Concern” that Xi Wang was in possession of a genuine visa that was issued by the Director of Nationality Services. She wrote:

“This person is allowed to enter Belize; therefore your assistance in facilitating his travel will be appreciated”.

45.3 On his visa application Miss Ruth Meighan wrote, “Mr. Reynolds, please process for Minister Contreras” she signed and dated the application 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013. There was a copy of letter of financial support dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2013 from Zheng Christopher, stating that “she” is his cousin and that he wished to support “her” application for permanent residence. It appeared that the form for the letter of financial support used was generally used for a male requesting permanent residence for a female but the sponsor used the wrong form. That declaration was witnessed by Demecio Cal JP of Belmopan. Attached was a copy of Trade License issued to New Chon Sing Chinese Restaurant licensed to Christopher Zheng and a copy of his Belizean Passport P0166412 issued 24<sup>th</sup> May 2011.

45.4 We received Xi Wang’s (James Louis Wang) nationality file #27791B/1 for which showed his nationality application was dated 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2013. We also received his Passport application which was dated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2013 and the following were noted:

Two irregular copies of native Chinese Passports with the same photograph but with different issue and expiration dates were seen for Xi Wang (James Louis Wang) as follows:



Chinese Passport #G58039971 issued 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012 with expiry date of 6<sup>th</sup> February 2022 for his 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013 Belmopan Visa application. The second copy was Chinese Passport #G21159033 issued 12<sup>th</sup> February 2007 with expiry date of 11<sup>th</sup> February 2017, which was attached to his Passport application dated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2013 and also in his nationality file #27791B/1.

45.5 We noted that the copy of his Chinese Passport issued in 2007 appeared to have been manipulated to make it seem that he had been in Belize since 2007. We could not ascertain if actual bogus Passports had been presented to employees of the Nationality and Passport Sections of the INS or if they had accepted copies of pages with bogus Passports numbers without requesting the Passports.

45.6 We saw an irregular stamp on the copy of Xi Wang's Chinese Passport #G21159033 issued 12<sup>th</sup> February 2007, which appeared to be a bogus British Consulate General Guangzhou Visa to Belize dated 11<sup>th</sup> April 2007. That stamp appeared to be a fraudulent visa stamp and was seen in other nationality files for persons who did not qualify for Belizean nationality. In addition, was the fact that he had been issued Belize visa #V00036693 on the 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013 and therefore those stamps in his passport could not be genuine. The copy of that Passport page also had a bogus Belize arrival stamp (#57) dated 7<sup>th</sup> June 2007 from the Belize Northern Border Station (BNBS). We could not identify the signature of the Immigration Officer that was within the arrival stamp. His Mexican visa dated 25<sup>th</sup> May 2007 was illegible and appeared bogus while a Quintana Roo arrival stamp also appeared to be bogus. Further investigation is required for us to check with the Mexican authorities to confirm the irregularity of the Mexican stamps.

45.7 We saw Permanent Residence stamp for Xi Wang (James Louis Wang) with Permit #43005/11, PR File #25593/11, signed by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, on 25<sup>th</sup> May, 2011. This was on the copy of page twenty-seven (27) of his Passport #G21159033. The date written within the PR stamp was backdated to make it appear as though Xi Wang (James Louis Wang) had acquired Permanent Residence in 2011. The visa extension stamps and the temporary employment stamps, which reflected that he was a "Cook" for Guang Dong, Sheng Li & Diamond Restaurants dating 2008 through to 2011, were also backdated.

45.8 We are convinced that had he acquired PR in 2011 and left Belize, he would not have needed a visa to visit Belize in January 2013.

The **Table** labelled **P** below shows the description, dates and approvers of the bogus and fraudulent stamps that were seen on the copied pages of Xi Wang's (James Louis Wang) bogus Chinese Passport #G21159033 seen in his nationality file

**Table P**

The following is the description dates and approvers of the bogus and fraudulent stamps seen on Xi Wang's (James Louis Wang) Chinese Passport #G21159033

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>  | <b>Description of Stamp</b>   | <b>Date of Stamp</b>        | <b>Period Approved</b>                                 | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer</b> |
|---|---|-----------------------------|--|--|
| British Consulate General Guangzhou                         | Good for a single journey to Belize within 3 months<br>G7.200519.07 | 11 <sup>th</sup> April 2007 | 11 <sup>th</sup> April-11 <sup>th</sup> July 2007      | Matt----<br>(illegible)                                      |
| Hong Kong arrival stamp                                     | It had Asian writing  | 5 <sup>th</sup> June 2007   | Permitted to remain 7 days from date                   | N/A  |
| Departure Hong Kong Stamp                                   | (appeared as stamp #L3432J)   | 6 <sup>th</sup> June 2007   | N/A  | N/A  |
| Mexico Visa   | Ordinary; other information not legible                             | 25 <sup>th</sup> May 2007   | Not legible  | N/A  |
| Qintana Roo Arrival Stamp                                   | TSL005  | 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2007   | N/A  | N/A  |
| Belize Northern Border Station Arrival Stamp #57            | Visitor Permit to Belize  | 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2007   | 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2007 to 6 <sup>th</sup> July 2007 | Unknown Signature  |
| Visa Extension Stamp (37) Immigration Headquarters Belmopan | Permitted to remain...does not remain in Belize longer than         | 3 <sup>rd</sup> July 2007   | Remain up to 6 <sup>th</sup> September 2007 (2 months) | Jerome Lewis, Immigration Officer                            |

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>  | <b>Description of Stamp</b>  | <b>Date of Stamp</b>            | <b>Period Approved</b>                                      | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer</b> |
|---|--|---------------------------------|---|--|
| Temporary Employment Permit<br>603/BMP/07<br>INS Belmopan   | As a cook for Guang Dong Restaurant  | 16 <sup>th</sup> August 2007    | Does not remain longer than 15 <sup>th</sup> August 2008    | Liandro Quischan, Immigration Officer                        |
| Temporary Employment Permit<br>989/BMP/08<br>INS Belmopan   | As a cook for Diamond Restaurant   | 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2008    | Does not remain longer than 12 <sup>th</sup> August 2009    | Liandro Quischan, Immigration Officer                        |
| Temporary Employment Permit<br>1748/BMP/09<br>INS Belmopan  | As a cook for Sheng Li Restaurant  | 9 <sup>th</sup> November 2009   | Does not remain longer than 12 <sup>th</sup> August 2010    | Liandro Quischan, Immigration Officer                        |
| Visa Extension (37)<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan | Does not enter into employment paid or unpaid...does not engage in any business or profession without the consent of the Director... | 14 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 | Does not remain longer than 12 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 | Carlos Amaya, Immigration Officer (deceased)                 |

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>   | <b>Description of Stamp</b>  | <b>Date of Stamp</b>            | <b>Period Approved</b>                                  | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer</b> |
|--|--|---------------------------------|---|--|
| Visa Extension (37)<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan    | Does not enter into employment paid or unpaid...does not engage in any business or profession without the consent of the Director... | 20 <sup>th</sup> May 2011       | Does not remain longer than 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2011  | Unknown  |
| Temporary Employment Permit<br>801/BMP/10<br>INS Belmopan      | As a cook for Sheng Li Restaurant  | 14 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 | Does not remain longer than 12 <sup>th</sup> March 2011 | Liandro Quischan, Immigration Officer                        |
| Permanent Residence Stamp, Director, Immigration & Nationality | Permitted to remain in Belize as a Permanent Resident "Xi Wang" (no profession recorded)   | 25 <sup>th</sup> May 2011       | Permit #43005/11<br><br>PRF#25593/11                    | Ruth Meighan, Director, INS                                  |

45.9 We examined Xi Wang's (James Louis Wang) nationality file and it showed that his nationality interview was conducted by S. Gillett who signed on the General Declaration form as the Interviewing Officer. We found out that she was not an Immigration Officer but was a Clerk who worked in the Registry. The nationality interview should have been done by the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Supervisor as outlined by Section 4 page 17 of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures handbook which states that "the functions and responsibilities of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Supervisor.

45.10 We noted that Xi Wang (James Louis Wang) did not fill in the Section "contacts in Belize" on his nationality application form and Part III for 'References' was not completed on his application form.

The Part IV section which should have been completed by HQ Vetting officer: CIDAPS Check, CRO Check, JICC Check and signed by the HQ Vetting Officer was also not completed. He stated that his permanent address was Camalote Village and his Referees were from Belmopan. His first Referee, David Barnett of Macaw Street, Belmopan commented on how he became acquaintance with Xi Wang (James Louis Wang) by stating, "I met him through a friend". His second referee, Yacely Thompson, of Guadalupe Street, Belmopan stated "I met **her** through a friend" (although the applicant was a male). Yacely Thompson was also one of the Nationality Referees for Natalia Karpouzoglou who also did not qualify for Belize nationality. Both stated that they had known the applicant for 5 years.

45.11 We did not see an employment letter, Bank statement or letter from FIU verifying that he was capable of maintaining himself or had not been bankrupt in his country. The signature on his nationality application did not match those seen on his interview form and other documents such as native Passport, oath, and Police report. His photo on the Police record appeared as a photocopy of a photo. His oath of allegiance was sworn before Commissioner of the Supreme Court, Mr. Edmund A Zuniga, of Belmopan, on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2013. The signature on his oath of allegiance did not match those on his Passport application dated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2013, or those seen on his nationality application and the copy of his native Passport.

45.12 We saw on the minute sheet of his nationality file, that the OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade, wrote on the 4<sup>th</sup> June 2013 as follows:

“DINS, applicant qualifies for Nationality thru Registration (Section 10) ...he has been living in Belize since 2007 and acquired Permanent Residence in 2011...File is now forwarded for your consideration”. Director, Maria Marin wrote on the 4<sup>th</sup> June 2013, “Min, Recommended, meets legal requirements.”

45.13 Xi Wang was issued Belizean nationality certificate #28428/13 dated 4<sup>th</sup> June 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner (4 months and 20 days after his visa application was approved and issued).

45.14 We search the Register of Citizens by Registration and we saw that the name Xi Wang was recorded for certificate #28428/13.

He changed his name from Xi Wang to James Louis Wang by deed poll #246/13 dated 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013), which was witnessed on the 5<sup>th</sup> June 2013 by D Balderamos Garcia.

- 45.15 We saw that he applied for his Belizean Passport on the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2013 and that his recommenders were Eleodoro Lewis JP from Camalote Village who stated that he knew the applicant for 1 year and Wilburn Augustus Humes, teacher of #13 Pineapple Street, Belmopan, who had a provisional Teacher's licence #CY-2012-00172 and who stated that he had known the applicant for 2 years and shopped at his store. The "occupation" section of his Passport application form was not completed but his nationality application stated that he was a businessman.
- 45.16 We observed that Belizean Passport number P0238890 dated 12<sup>th</sup> June 2013 was issued to Xi Wang in the name James Louis Wang; nearly five (5) months after he was issued a visa on the 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013 to enter Belize. We could not determine the date he actually entered Belize.

**2) Tianzhi Wang (Tian Zhi Wang) aka Freakin Yang was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #25698/11**

46. We found that Tianzhi Wang (Tian Zhi Wang) aka Freakin Yang, whose visa application stated that he was born in Hubei, China and whose date of birth was stated as 15<sup>th</sup> October 1969 was issued Belize Multiple entry "Tourist" visa #V00025636 dated 7<sup>th</sup> November 2011. That visa, which was issued in Belmopan had the signature of Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco and was for the period 7<sup>th</sup> November 2011 to 6<sup>th</sup> May 2012. Ady Pacheco worked in the Nationality Section and not the Visa Section of the INS during the period reviewed. We did not see a copy of his native Passport biographic page attached to his visa application. We saw a copy of page two of his irregular Chinese Passport # G41602494 with the BNBS (Belize Northern Border Station) entry stamp with the date of 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011. His visa sponsor was Wen Bin Chen (Wenbin Chen of #3886 Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan who was a sponsor of many Chinese during the audited period, including persons who were fraudulently issued Permanent Residence as further reported in this report.
- 46.2 We examined Tianzhi Wang's (Tian Zhi Wang) aka Freakin Yang nationality file and his two (2) Passport applications (November 2011 and May 2012) revealed the following:

The name on his nationality application form was stated as Tianzhi Wang Yang, which was not the name seen in the copy of irregular native Passport G41602494. The Nationality file Diary showed that his file was opened on the 18<sup>th</sup> November 2011. The name Wenbin Chen (his visa sponsor) was also recorded on his nationality application as his "contacts in Belize". The date of his entry into Belize was recorded on his nationality application form as 10<sup>th</sup> June 2005 and he stated that he entered through the "Belize Airport" but no evidence of such visit was seen.

We saw imprinted on page 43 of the copy of his irregular Chinese Passport #G4160249, the Belizean PR Stamp (PR Permit #43608/11), which was signed on 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. As with Xi Wang, the date written within the PR stamp was backdated to make it appear as though Tianzhi Wang (Tian Zhi Wang) aka Freakin Yang had acquired Permanent Residence in 2011.

**Table Q** below shows the description, date and approver of the backdated PR stamp that was seen on the copied page of Tianzhi Wang's Chinese Passport #G41602494 seen in his nationality file.

**Table Q** below shows the description, date and approver of the backdated PR stamp that was seen on the copied page of Tianzhi Wang's Chinese Passport #G41602494 seen in his nationality file.

| Type of Stamp   | Description of Stamp   | Date of Approval                          | Period Approved   | Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer |
|---|--|---|---|---|
| Mexico 2010   | Not legible  | ---March 2011<br>(not completely legible) | Not legible   | N/A   |
| Permanent Residence Stamp, Director Immigration and Nationality | Permitted to remain in Belize as a Permanent Resident "Tianzhi Wang" | 9 <sup>th</sup> November 2011             | Fraudulent Permit #43608/11<br><br>No permanent residence file # was recorded under the stamp | Ruth Meighan  |

46.3 We could not ascertain how Tianzhi Wang's aka Freakin Yang arrived all the way from China to Belize on the 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011 (in 2 days) when the records showed that he was issued his visa in Belmopan on 7<sup>th</sup> November 2011. His arrival was through the BNBS Port of Entry.

46.4 We noted that his nationality application had no date. It is a requirement on page 5 of the Policy and Procedures Manual (and Section 10 'Acceptance of Nationality Application' of the Nationality Act- Chapter 161 ) that this is done. It states as follows:

“It is the duty of every Counter Clerk to sign and date the application upon receipt; this should be placed on the upper right side of the front page of the application form”.

46.5 We observed that the PR stamp “Permit to remain in Belize as a Permanent Residence” was signed by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan on 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011, the same date, the referees signed the section of the nationality application form. We noted on page 5 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011, that “the Referee must know the applicant for a minimum of 5 years.” His referees were Carlos Alfredo Portillo of #24 Uruguay Street, San Martin and Transito Joel Rivera of #16 Joseph Street, Belmopan. Both stated that they had known the applicant for 2 years. The interview for nationality for Tianzhi Wang, as recorded on the General Declaration form was done by OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade; however the section of the nationality application for interviewing of referees (Part III References) was not completed.

46.6 We noted that Ernesto Franco signed Tianzhi Wang’s medical laboratory result on the 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011, the same date as Tianzhi Wang’s arrival BNBS stamp, as seen on a copy of his Passport #G41602494 page. The photo used on his Police report was a photocopied photograph of him. On the 10<sup>th</sup> November 2011 Miguel Segura ACP signed the Police Report for Commissioner of Police. .

46.7 We did not see an employment letter, Bank statement or letter from FIU verifying that he was capable of maintaining himself and had not been bankrupt in his country. His signatures did not correspond on his nationality application and Passport applications. His Passport recommender on his 25<sup>th</sup> November 2011 and 25<sup>th</sup> May 2012 applications was Eleodoro Lewis who stated on both applications that he had known the applicant for one year. On his 2012 application he stated that his previous Passport P0185786 was lost on the 24<sup>th</sup> April 2012. His Passport application dated 25<sup>th</sup> November 2011 stated that his address was Bella Vista Belize. His 2012 Passport application and nationality certificate stated that his address was Mountain View Boulevard but the declaration form and Police Report dated 25<sup>th</sup> May 2012 stated that his address was #15 Orange Street, Belize City.

46.8 We observed that OIC Nationality Section, Gordon Wade on the 18<sup>th</sup> November 2011, wrote on the minute sheet of Tianzhi Wang’s (Tian Zhi Wang aka Freakin Yang) file:

“DINS, applicant qualifies for Nationality thru Registration (10). He entered Belize since 2005...File is recommended by Hon. R Witz and forwarded for your consideration”.



On the said 18<sup>th</sup> November 2011, Former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, wrote:

“Min, meets legal requirements. Recommended”.

46.9 We found that Miss Ruth Meighan recommended Tianzhi Wang’s (Tian Zhi Wang aka Freakin Yang) for Belizean nationality even though she had just approved PR to him on the 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011, the same date his entry stamp showed that he entered the country through the BNBS.

46.10 We saw that he was issued nationality certificate number 25698/11 dated 24<sup>th</sup> November 2011 signed by former Minister of Immigration, Minister Carlos Perdomo. A search of the Register of Citizens by Registration revealed that an entry was made in his name, Tianzhi Wang, on 24<sup>th</sup> November 2011, for certificate number 25698/11.

46.11 We noted that on the 25<sup>th</sup> November 2011, he applied for and was issued Belizean Passport P0185786 in the name of Tianzhi Wang, eighteen days after he was issued Belize visa V00025636 on 7<sup>th</sup> November 2011. On the 25<sup>th</sup> May 2012, Tianzhi Wang submitted another Passport application in the name Freakin Yang, without a deed poll. On that application form he claimed that Passport P0185786 was misplaced. Tianzhi Wang was again issued a Belizean Passport P0202374, in the name Freakin Yang on 25<sup>th</sup> May 2012, six (6) months and two (2) weeks after he was issued a visa on the 7<sup>th</sup> November 2011. We could not determine on what date he actually entered Belize or if he had already been in Belize illegally before he was issued a visa at the Belmopan INS.

**Wen Bin Chen was a visa sponsor of persons who were fraudulently issued Permanent Residence status and thereafter sponsored other persons who were also fraudulently issued Permanent Residence status**

47. The fraudulent issuance of Belize Permanent Residency (PR) status is discussed in detail further in this report. During the investigation the name Wen Bin Chen was also associated with persons who received fraudulent PR status.

47.2 We found that Wenbin Chen, in addition to being the sponsor of Tianzhi Wang (Tian Zhi Wang), (who fraudulently received Belizean nationality and Passports), used the business certificate of Chen’s Mall located at #3886 Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan, to sponsor Lin You, holder of Chinese Passport #G36305694 issue date 15<sup>th</sup> July 2009, who he stated was his cousin. Lin You was issued visa #V00026864 on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 approved by Miss Ruth Meighan. Two months later, Lin You was fraudulently issued PR#44044 dated 13<sup>th</sup> March 2012 seen in the Permanent Residence Book as “replace old PR”. We did not see any evidence that Lin You received Belizean nationality and Passport prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name.

47.3 Again, Wenbin Chen, using the business certificate of Chen's Mall was also the visa sponsor of Wen Yuan Chen (Wenyuan Chen), who was approved visa V00029387 by the Director on the 5<sup>th</sup> March 2012 although the application lacked supporting documents. The visa application was accepted by Martin Guy at the Belmopan Office. Eight days later Wen Yuan Chen was issued PR#44045 fraudulently on the 13<sup>th</sup> March 2012 as seen in the Permanent Residence Register as "replace old PR". (We say he was issued PR#44045 fraudulently, as he had applied for a visa to visit Belize on the 5<sup>th</sup> March 2012 and was issued permanent residence on the 13<sup>th</sup> March 2012.) By the 19<sup>th</sup> October 2012, Wenyuan Chen was the co-owner (along with Wenjing Chen) of the business, "101 Wireless" (Registration #18608) with address of #3896 Mountain View Blvd. Belmopan as seen at the Business and Companies Registry.

The genuine business certificate of 101 Wireless was then used by Wenjing Chen, holder of Belize Passport #P0102968; issue date 20th April 2009, to request visas as a sponsor for Chinese supported by Minister Elvin Penner as was recorded by Ag Director Maria Marin on the visa applications.

47.4 The certificate of 101 Wireless was used as proof of sponsorship by Wenjing Chen for the following Chinese persons listed at **Table R** below:

**Table R**

The following are the Chinese persons who were sponsored by Weinjing Chen

| <b>Name</b>     | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Visa Number Approved</b> | <b>Date Visa approved</b> |
|-----------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Ling Lin        | 11/Aug/95            | V00040284                   | 16/Aug/13                 |
| Wei Liu         | 2/Nov/92             | V00040283                   | 16/Aug/13                 |
| Zheng Dong Dong | 5/Mar/92             | V00040286                   | 16/Aug/13                 |
| Miao Li         | 21/Jul/93            | V00040285                   | 16/Aug/13                 |

47.5 Further investigationis required to ascertain if those persons listed at **Table R** above received Belize permanent residence, nationality and/or Passports. We did not see any evidence that Wenyuan Chen received Belizean nationality and Passport prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name. However, Wenyuan Chen used his fraudulently obtained PR status to register the business along with Wenjing Chen, which was then used to sponsor other persons.

47.6 We found that prior to the 19<sup>th</sup> October 2012, Wenjing Chen used the Trade License of the business 101 Wireless, with address of #3 Hummingbird Highway, Belmopan, issued by the Belmopan City Council for the period January 1 to December 31 2012 to request visas as a sponsor for other Chinese citizens.

He used that certificate to request a visa as sponsor for Jin Jie Huang, holder of Chinese Passport #G38267015 with issued date 14<sup>th</sup> October 2009, who was issued Visa #00033814 and approved on the 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 by Director, Ruth Meighan. Jin Jie Huang was also fraudulently issued PR# 44738 on the 23<sup>rd</sup> November 2012. We did not see any evidence that Jin Jie Huang received Belizean nationality and Passport prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name.

47.7 We noted that on the 25<sup>th</sup> November 2011, Wenjing Chen of #17 Sunshine Street, Belmopan, and holder of Belize Passport #P0102968; issued 20th April 2009 was also the sponsor of Chinese visitor Hong Ning Yan. No proof of business ownership was attached to the visa application. We did not see any evidence that Hong Ning Yan received Belizean permanent residence or nationality and Passport prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name.

47.8 We also found that Business Certificate #14582 had also been issued to Wenjing Chen, owner of Jim's Cosmetic Store located on Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan, and registered on the 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2009. He had been issued Belizean Passport #P0102968; issued 20th April 2009. It appeared that Weihang Chen (who was also fraudulently issued a Belizean Passport as discussed above) may have used genuine business Certificate #14582 owned by Wenjing Chen to make a fraudulent certificate for ABCD Cosmetic Store, which did not exist at the Business Registry. The signature of Patricia Rodriguez and the certificate number, date and outline of the fraudulent certificate appeared to have been used from the genuinely issued certificate #14582.

47.9 We saw the name Wen Jing Chen as the recipient of Belizean Passport # P0244746 which had been issued in the name of Simon Truong (previously named Quoc Vinh Truong) on the 13<sup>th</sup> August 2013 who also received Belizean nationality fraudulently as discussed in our Preliminary Passport Report and also discussed in this report. The date of receipt of Truong's Passport was not recorded on the Passport form. The handwriting of the recipients of the other Passports appeared similar to the handwriting of Wen Jing Chen. Those recipients were also issued their passports on the 13<sup>th</sup> August 2013 and obtained their Belize nationality fraudulently. The Passports referred to are; P0244747 received by "Wen Ming Chen" for Peter Pang, previously Yiu Pang Chen and P0244745 received by "Wen Ming Chen" for Marc Chin previously Jac Jie Qin). No date of receipt, identification of the recipient or letter of authorization was seen attached to those Passport applications to identify exactly who the Passport recipients were.

47.10 Our investigation also revealed that Wen Bin Chen was issued Belizean Passport number P0008064 on the 1<sup>st</sup> June 2005. The Passport was issued in the name "Wen-Bin Chen" prior to the date his supposed Belizean citizenship came into effect on 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007.

The BPIS application for P0008064 was created on 17th May 2005 by Zane Ysaguirre, approved without biometric check by former Director, Gareth Murillo and printed, print confirmed and QA passed by Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco, on the 1<sup>st</sup> June 2005. It was delivered out of the BPIS by Tiffany Taylor and revoked by Debra Baptist on the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2008 when he returned for another Passport. All subsequent Passports issued in 2008, 2011 and 2013 were issued in the name “Wenbin Chen”.

- 47.11 We noted that he renewed his Belizean Passport P0155317 issued on 20<sup>th</sup> January 2011 on the 30<sup>th</sup> April 2013 which he claimed his child had wrote in but copies of the damaged pages of his Passport were not seen. He was recommended for his Belizean Passport on the 29<sup>th</sup> April 2013 by Emory Young JP and Patricia Willacey, Teacher. Attached to his Passport application was a copy of Belizean nationality certificate #21396/07 dated 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007 signed by what appeared as the signature of Honourable Ralph Fonseca.

The Officers who processed the application without the required declaration that his Passport had been expired or damaged were Counter Clerk, Erwin Robinson, Data Entry Clerk, Romi Rosas, OIC Passport Section, Sharon Neal Flowers, Print Operator, Eleud Romero and QA, Tiffany Taylor. He was issued Passport P0235904 on the 30<sup>th</sup> April 2013 although his Passport application showed that he only paid a total of \$185.00 (\$150.00 RCR#90707 dated 30<sup>th</sup> April 2013 and \$35.00 RCR #911485 dated 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013) and not \$285.00 for the same day service. The date of receipt of his new Passport received by an unknown person without authority was not legible. His lost stolen or mutilated Passport declaration form was dated the 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013, seven (7) days after his Passport had been issued (printed) at the Passport Office in Belmopan. His declaration form was certified on the 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013 by Emory Young JP of Belmopan. We noted that his declaration form was dated 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013 and therefore he had to have submitted to it to the Passport office on or after that date, while his new Belize Passport P0235904 had been printed from the 30<sup>th</sup> April 2013 but was not issued until the 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013, the same date on the declaration form.

- 47.12 We did not see the name Wen Bin Chen in the Register of Citizens by Registration for certificate #21396/07. A name was previously recorded in the Register for that certificate number but it was wiped out with correction fluid and nothing was written over it.
- 47.13 Further investigation is required into the nationality file of Wen Bin Chen to ascertain how and when he was issued Belizean nationality if any at all.
- 47.14 We saw Wenbin Chen’s name during our verification process at the Registry, as the owner of Chen’s Shopping Mall located at # 3886 Mountain View Blvd Belmopan Belize C.A.

However, the relevant Registration #16215, which was previously owned by Yang Ying Su was transferred to Wenbin Chen on the 5<sup>th</sup> August 2011.

**Jinchao Wu (Jin Chao Wu) of Forest Drive, Belmopan, who did not qualify for Belizean Nationality under Section 10 was issued Nationality Certificate #25920/11**

48. We found that Jinchao Wu, prior to his registration as a citizen of Belize, was associated with a stolen manual Belizean Passport A003519 which had the issue date of 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2001. A false nationality certificate number 10202/01 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> November, 2001 that belonged to Irma I Ramos was written in his stolen Passport. Jinchao Wu's stolen manual Belizean Passport #A003519 had a Mexico Immigration stamp labelled Corozal, Belice, which was dated the 18<sup>th</sup> October 2006. There was a letter dated 15<sup>th</sup> November 2006 from the International Tourist Service Center of Hong Kong addressed to the Director, Belize Immigration and Nationality Services which requested the verification of Belize Passport #A003519.

He was born in China and his date of birth was stated as 12<sup>th</sup> February 1980 on his Passport application but as 12<sup>th</sup> December 1980 in the stolen Passport.

- 48.2 We noted his Passport application form dated the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011 had several processing irregularities including the absence of the Counter Clerk, Data Entry, Supervisor and officer who delivered the Passport signatures, his nationality certificate #25920/11 was not signed by the Minister, there was no date inserted nor did it have the Immigration and Nationality seal. It was therefore a null and void nationality certificate.

His Nationality file #26648/11 was requested and examined and we noted the following:

- 48.3 The copy of his nationality certificate #25920/11 in his nationality file was dated 13<sup>th</sup> December 2011, which suggested that it was backdated, since the certificate attached to his Passport application had not been signed as at the 16<sup>th</sup> of December 2011 (the date he applied for his Passport). There were what appeared to be copies of his irregular native Chinese Passports: #G46036001 (issued 30<sup>th</sup> March 2011) and G14155961 (issued 21<sup>st</sup> March 2005). The copy of Chinese Passport #G46036001 had a note that stated:

"Previously travelled on now expired PP#G14155961 dated 21.3.05. DOA: 4.4.07 EXT's TILL: 4.4.10) Held VP #06/BMP/11 dated 4.3.2011 from 4.4.2010 to 3.10.2011". Below that was an extension stamp dated 3<sup>rd</sup> October 2011 signed by Immigration Officer, Miss Ady Pacheco, on which she extended his visa up to the 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2012 in the same handwriting as the aforementioned note. She worked in the Nationality Section and not the Visa Section.

48.4 We saw imprinted on page 5 of his irregular Chinese Passport #G14155961, Immigration visa stamp #113BMP/07 dated 8<sup>th</sup> March 2007 issued at the INS Belmopan, for him to visit/stay in Belize for three months. It was signed by Jerome Lewis, Immigration Officer. On page 6, we saw faded stamp #57 for the BNBS indicating that he had arrived in Belize on the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2007. No date was written in the stamp indicating the date he should leave Belize. Below the BNBS stamp, was another faded extension stamp, for the Immigration Headquarters. Jerome Lewis extended his stay until the 4<sup>th</sup> July 2007. The date written in that stamp was the 20<sup>th</sup> June 2007. We did not see any arrival and departure stamps indicating his travel from China to Mexico and his arrival in Mexico. We could not ascertain how his native Passport got to the Belmopan less than a month prior to his visit to Belize through the BNBS as the Nationality file reflected.

The **Table** below labelled **S** shows the immigration stamps and the officers' signatures as seen on the copy of Jinchao Wu irregular Chinese Passport G14155961 issued 21<sup>st</sup> March 2005

**Table S**

The following are the Immigration stamps and officers' signatures seen in the nationality file for Jinchao Wu on copy of irregular Chinese Passport G14155961

| Type of Stamp                                    | Description of Stamp                                | Date of Stamp/ approval date | Period Approved  | Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer  |
|--|---|------------------------------|--|--|
| Belmopan Visa Stamp #113/BMP/07                  | Good for a single journey to Belize within 3 months | 8 <sup>th</sup> March 2007   | None stated  | Jerome Lewis, Immigration Officer  |
| Belize Northern Border Station Arrival Stamp #57 | Visitor Permit to Belize                            | 4 <sup>th</sup> April 2007   | 28 <sup>th</sup> August to 27 <sup>th</sup> September 2007 | Signature resembled that of Romi Rosas, Immigration Officer as seen on Passport applications |

| Type of Stamp  | Description of Stamp   | Date of Stamp/ approval date | Period Approved  | Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer |
|--|--|------------------------------|--|---|
| Visa Extension Stamp #37<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan | Permitted to remain on condition that he does not enter into employment paid or unpaid | 20 <sup>th</sup> June 2007   | Does not remain longer than 4 <sup>th</sup> July 2007  | Jerome Lewis, Immigration Officer                     |
| Visa Extension Stamp #37<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan | Permitted to remain on condition that he does not enter into employment paid or unpaid | 4 <sup>th</sup> March 2011   | Does not remain longer than 4 <sup>th</sup> April 2010<br>(wrong date recorded since stamp was dated 4 <sup>th</sup> March 2011) | Carlos Amaya, Immigration Officer (deceased)          |

There were no visa extensions seen between the dates 20<sup>th</sup> June 2007 and 4<sup>th</sup> March 2011 as can be seen at **Table T** below.

**Table T**

The following are the Immigration stamps and the officer's signature seen in the nationality file for Jinchao Wu on copy of Chinese Passport G46036001 issue date 30th March 2011

| Type of Stamp  | Description of Stamp   | Date of Stamp/ approval date  | Period Approved  | Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer |
|--|--|-------------------------------|--|---|
| Visa Extension Stamp #37<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan | Permitted to remain on condition that he does not enter into employment paid or unpaid | 9 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Does not remain longer than 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2012 | Ady Pacheco   |

We did not see any Permanent Residence stamp on the copies of his irregular native Chinese Passports.

48.5 We observed that his undated nationality application form stated at the section for Particulars of Ordinary Residence (addresses in Belize and abroad): “Forest Drive, Belmopan, “2006 – to present”; however, we did not see such evidence in his file. The General Declaration form used for the interview, which was performed by Immigration Officer, Nikolai Zelaya, stated that he left his country of origin (China) on the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2007 and arrived in Belize on the same date. We were unable to verify if he entered the country in 2007. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether he did enter the country of Belize in 2007.

48.6 We saw that he stated that his contact in Belize was Bin Chen (could be Wen Bin Chen), a businessman of Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan. His nationality referees were Mario Orellana of San Martin who stated during the interview that he knew the applicant Jinchao Wu for five years and Iris Williams of Maya Mopan who stated that she knew the applicant for four years. Both signed the application form on the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011, which suggested that his nationality application was submitted sometime after the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 and his file was processed shortly thereafter. Both stated that they knew him as a “friend of a friend”. Part III References of the General Declaration form for the interview of Referees was incomplete. On his nationality application he stated that he was a “Cook” but on his Passport application submitted 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011 within less than a month, he stated that he was a “business person”. He was recommended for his Passport by Justice of the Peace, Eleodoro Lewis who stated that he knew him for one year.

48.7 Even if his Belize entry date (as seen on the arrival stamp) was not backdated, Jinchao Wu would still have not have been qualified for nationality under Section 10 until the 3<sup>rd</sup> of April 2012 but his apparent null ad void nationality certificate #25920/11 was copied and attached to his Passport application on the 13<sup>th</sup> December 2011. It was not signed by the Minister, Carlos Perdomo on the 13<sup>th</sup> of December 2011, as seen on the copy in his nationality file. It had to be signed by the Minister after the 16<sup>th</sup> of December 2011, (the day he presented his Passport application with a copy of an unsigned nationality certificate).

48.8 We observed from the minute sheet in his nationality file that his file was requested by Minister Erwin Contreras for processing. The OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade, wrote on the minute sheet to the Director on the 12<sup>th</sup> December 2011 as follows:

“DINS, Applicant qualifies for Nationality through Registration Sec (10). He has been living in Belize since early 2007. Since then he has maintained himself legal by obtaining visitors extensions, which goes up to Jan ‘12.



Police record, medical (HIV, VDRL), interview completed. File is requested thru' Min. Contreras and is forwarded for your consideration (signed 12.12.11)." Former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan wrote on the minute sheet:

"Minister, Meets legal Requirements. Recommended." Her note was dated 12<sup>th</sup> December 2011.

48.9 It was obvious that the year 2007 that was written by Mr. Wade and from the entry stamp seen in Jinchao Wu's file that he would not have qualified until April 2012 for Belizean nationality. He was issued Belizean nationality certificate number 25920/11 sometime in December 2011.

48.10 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration and found that his name was entered in said register for certificate #25920 dated 13<sup>th</sup> December 2011. Below his name and in the same handwriting and color ink were the names Miss Venus Maneerod (BNA file # 26649; Certificate #25921) and Jinfan Chen (BNA file # 26647; Certificate #25922) who also did not qualify for Belizean nationality and Passport as discussed further in this report. The sequence of their BNA file numbers indicated that their applications were received and nationality files opened on the same day.

Jinchao Wu was also issued Belizean Passport #P0188334 on the 16<sup>th</sup> December, 2011, through the invalid nationality certificate 25920/11, that he had presented to the Passport Section of the INS.

48.11 We found other individuals who were also issued nationality certificates which were in the same series and around the same time as Jinchao Wu. Their nationality certificates were also null and void as they were either not signed by the Minister, not dated or did not have the required Immigration and Nationality seal (see Passport report). They too, applied for and were issued Belizean Passports on the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011. **Table U below** list those individuals along with the inconsistencies found while their files were examined.

**Table U**

The following is the list of other individuals who received null and void nationality certificates and used them to obtain Belizean Passports.

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Date of entry into Belize</b>   | <b>Nationality certificate # and date</b>  | <b>Belize Passport# and issue date</b>  | <b>Nationality application referees &amp; Passport recommender</b>  | <b>Other observations from nationality file (if presented)</b>  |
|-------------|--|--|---|---|---|
| Wensi Wu    | Arrival Stamp in copy of Chinese Passport #G22806964 issued 22nd May 2007 showed entry date of 19th August 2008 at BNBS; Application stated that he left China and entered Belize on the same day - 19 <sup>th</sup> August 2008 (No evidence of travel through Mexico seen on copies of Passport pages) | 25817/11 dated 7th December 2011 (had no seal on the 16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 when he presented his Passport application<br><br>(There was no entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration for this number) | P0188339/16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Dean Michael Cacho and Isaac Johnson both of Belize City stated he was a “friend of a friend” and that they knew him for 1 1/2 years (Part III of General Declaration form used for nationality Referees interview was incomplete. Interview was done by Nikolia Zelaya<br><br>Justice of the Peace Jahan | Visa issued by British Consulate General Guangzhou stamp dated 22 <sup>nd</sup> May 2008. Received Belizean Nationality through Marriage to Guo'ai Su (Nationality Certificate #20406/06 dated 31 <sup>st</sup> May 2007. Copy of marriage certificate (date of marriage 15 <sup>th</sup> February 2008) did not appear to be an official copy (It looked like a document that anyone could have put together nor was it authenticated by the Foreign Service Office of the applicant (page 9 of INS & Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy & Procedures Manual. Dr. Arturo Gamero submitted Medical Report. TEP stamps for Cook and then Cashier issued by Liandro Quischan and Giovanni Tzib on the 14 <sup>th</sup> November 2008 and 8th September 2009 respectively did not appear genuine. Nationality application stated he was a Businessman; Passport application stated he was a cook |

| Name          | Date of entry into Belize  | Nationality certificate # and date                         | Belize Passport# and issue date         | Nationality application referees & Passport recommender                    | Other observations from nationality file (if presented)  |
|---------------|--|--|---|--|--|
|               |  |  |   | Abadi recommended him for his Belizean Passport                            |  |
| Jieliang Peng | Unknown  | 25818/11 dated 7th December 2011 which had no seal         | P0188338/16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Justice of the Peace Jahan Abadi recommended him for his Belizean Passport | His name was seen in the Register of Citizens but was written over correction fluid. Further investigation is required into his nationality file.  |
| Congzhi Wu    | 16 <sup>th</sup> December 2007 through Northern Border as seen on faded stamp.<br><br>No evidence of travel from China to Mexico seen on Passport copies<br><br>Applicant appeared to have entered in 2010 as Social Security card | 25819/11 dated 7th December 2011 (certificate had no seal) | P0188341/16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Justice of the Peace Jahan Abadi recommended him for his Belizean Passport | Visa issued by British Consulate General Guangzhou stamp dated 9 <sup>th</sup> October 2007 may be bogus and needs verification. Copies of Irregular Chinese Passport #G24425203 issued 14 <sup>th</sup> August 2007 and TEP stamps in 2008-2010 signed by Liandro Quischan appeared as copied from another source. Only one 2010 TEP had Ministry of Labour & Local Government Reference Gen WP /1/01/10 (228) dated 18 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2010<br><br>Marriage certificate for marriage at the General Registry on 20 <sup>th</sup> October 2010 to Hong Ping Chen. <b>He indicated on Passport</b> |

| Name             | Date of entry into Belize   | Nationality certificate # and date                         | Belize Passport# and issue date         | Nationality application referees & Passport recommender                    | Other observations from nationality file (if presented)  |
|------------------|---|--|---|--|--|
|                  | #000474439 was issued 18 <sup>th</sup> December 2010  |  |   |  | <b>application that he was single.</b> Nationality application stated “businessman”; Passport application stated “cook”<br><br>Part III References Section of application for interview with Referees was incomplete. Processing was requested by Hon Carlos Perdomo.  |
| Dongshe ng Zheng | Visitor’s Permit to Belize stamp issued at PSW Goldson Airport for entry on the 22 <sup>nd</sup> August 2009 seen on irregular copy of Chinese Passport G22426713<br><br>Applicant may have entered Belize in 2011 as per Social Security card#000471818 issued 13 <sup>th</sup> May 2011 | 25901/11 dated 7th December 2011 (certificate had no seal) | P0188340/16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Justice of the Peace Jahan Abadi recommended him for his Belizean Passport | Irregular copy of Chinese Passport G22426713 issued 30 <sup>th</sup> April 2007 with British Consulate General Guangzhou Visa issued 30 <sup>th</sup> July 2009. Referees knew applicants through "work at shop" but application stated he was a “cook”. Unofficial copy of marriage certificate and translation for Li Liying (Nationality Cert # 19216/06 dated 31 <sup>st</sup> January 2006) & Zheng Dongsheng for marriage on 15 <sup>th</sup> December 2007 (not authenticated by Foreign Service Office). <b>He indicated on Passport application that he was single.</b> Since September 2013 applicant became a sponsor of many visa applicants to Belize |
| Jinyu Huang      | On copy of Chinese Passport #G21167184 issued   | 25918/11 dated 13th December 2011 (certificate             | P0188336/16 <sup>th</sup> December      | Justice of the Peace Eleodoro Lewis  | Part III General Declaration for Referees’ interview was Incomplete. 1st Referee (Noa Sagustume of San Martin,   |

| Name | Date of entry into Belize  | Nationality certificate # and date | Belize Passport# and issue date | Nationality application referees & Passport recommender | Other observations from nationality file (if presented)  |
|------|--|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|
|      | <p>15<sup>th</sup> February 2007 we saw the same bogus visa stamp seen on other Passport copies that have been proven to be fraudulent e.g Xi Wang and Jinchen As discussed earlier in this Report issued on 27<sup>th</sup> June 2007 by British Consulate General Guangzhou.</p> <p>Northern Border arrival stamp 14-Aug-2007 Application indicated that he left China and entered Belize on the same day 14<sup>th</sup> August 2007 (Application stated that he arrived in Belize on <b>12<sup>th</sup> August 2005</b>)</p> | had no seal)                       | 2011                            | recommended him for his Belizean Passport               | <p>Bmp) stated that he knew applicant for 3 years; / 2nd Referee (Jose Orellana of Maya Mopan) stated that he knew applicant for 3 years as “friend of a friend”. Jinyu Huang did not sign affidavit on nationality application. <b>He was issued fraudulent PR#43834 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> November 2011/ no PR fee was paid. TEP stamp for employment as “Shop attendant Bella Visa Store” dated 7<sup>th</sup> September 2007 was signed by Liandro Quischan appeared to have been backdated</b></p> |

| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Date of entry into Belize</b>   | <b>Nationality certificate # and date</b>                     | <b>Belize Passport# and issue date</b>  | <b>Nationality application referees &amp; Passport recommender</b>            | <b>Other observations from nationality file (if presented)</b>  |
|----------------------------|--|---|---|---|---|
|                            | (No evidence of travel from China to Mexico seen on copies of Passport pages; only Quintana Roo stamp)   |   |   |   |   |
| Yihong Luo                 | Unknown  | 25919/11 undated (no seal; no date; no signature of Minister) | P0188335/16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Justice of the Peace Eleodoro Lewis recommended him for his Belizean Passport | His irregular Chinese Passport #G25701619 issued 13 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2007 appeared manipulated. Further investigation is required to be carried out on his nationality file  |
| Jinfan Chen (Jin Fan Chen) | Application stated 9 <sup>th</sup> March 2005 thru' Northern Border but no evidence seen;<br><br>Irregular Chinese Passport # G3254471 issued 9 <sup>th</sup> January 2009 made reference to previous Passport but no copy seen; No copy of Visa | 25922/11 undated (no seal; no date; no signature of Minister) | P0188337/16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Justice of the Peace Eleodoro Lewis recommended him for his Belizean Passport | Visa extension TEP issued 16 <sup>th</sup> April-2009 & PR stamp as "cook" dated 4 <sup>th</sup> Dec '09 Permit # 40761/09; PRF#23544/09 signed by what appeared as Gareth Murillo's signature.<br><br>1 <sup>st</sup> Referee (Severino Paquiul of Camalote stated that he knew the applicant for 2 years. 2 <sup>nd</sup> Referee (Henry Gonzalez of Maya Mopan) stated that he knew the applicant for 3 years. Both stated they knew him as "friend of a friend")<br>Jinfan Chen's affidavit on Nationality application was not signed. Nationality application stated he was a "cooker"; Passport |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Date of entry into Belize</b>                        | <b>Nationality certificate # and date</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and issue date</b> | <b>Nationality application referees &amp; Passport recommender</b> | <b>Other observations from nationality file (if presented)</b>  |
|-------------|---|---|--|--|---|
|             | seen.<br><br>No evidence of travel from China to Mexico |   |  |  | application stated “businessman”<br><br>He was a sponsor for many Visa applicants beginning in April 2013 procured by Minister Edmond Castro & Minister John Saldivar |

48.12 The British Consulate of Guangzhou visa stamps seen in those nationality files needs to be verified as genuine and the Northern Border arrival stamp may not have been genuine. The entry records of the Northern Border Station and the PGIA for 2005-2007 also need to be examined to ascertain when and if those persons actually entered Belize legally through the Northern Border Station and PGIA as they claimed on their nationality applications.

49. We found other persons who did not qualify and illegitimately acquired Belizean nationality under Section 10. They had been recently issued Belize visas and subsequently received Belizean nationality certificates and Passports. However, their nationality files were not presented to Audit to confirm whether their entry dates, TEP's and Permanent Residence stamps were also backdated. Those persons are outlined below:

**Dong Tao Jin (Dongtao Jin) was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #28382/13**

49.2 We saw that Dong Tao Jin who was born in Heilongjiang China and whose date of birth was stated as 1<sup>st</sup> March 1969 arrived in Belize on board United Airline flight #1410 on 2<sup>nd</sup> June, 2013 through the PGIA. He was issued a Belize single entry visa V00037038 dated 2nd June 2013, which was #191 of 2013. Attached to his visa application was what appeared as a genuine Chinese Passport #G33244420 with issue date 8<sup>th</sup> January 2009 and expiration date 7<sup>th</sup> January 2019. He also had a US Visa #H2925082 issued in Guangzhou on 20<sup>th</sup> May 2013 with Control Number 2013137002004. His visa application form, which had no photo, stated that he was staying at the Raddison Hotel and that he was expected to leave on 14<sup>th</sup> June 2013. For the purpose of his visit he indicated "tourist" but the OIC PGIA, Ms. Debra Estrada, who approved his visa wrote that he was a "business visitor".

49.3 We requested his nationality file #29948 but it was not presented. We however noted the following on his Passport application form submitted on 6<sup>th</sup> June, 2013:

His home address was stated as New Area Benque Viejo Town. He was recommended for Passport by JP Albert G. Roches of San Ignacio who stated that he had been acquainted with the applicant for three years as "friends" and by Teacher, Vashti Monique Silva of Belmopan, who stated that she had been acquainted with the applicant for one year as a "friend".

A copy of his faded Chinese Passport #G33244420 was attached to his application form. Said copy of the Passport had the same photo of him as the apparent genuine Chinese Passport he used to get his visa. The only difference between the copy of the Passport attached to his application and the one he used on his entry into Belize was the issue and expiration dates. Those dates on the copy attached to his application form were 8<sup>th</sup> January 2007(issued date) and 7<sup>th</sup> January 2017 (expiration date).



It appeared that his Chinese Passport #G33244420 was copied and altered electronically and the issue date of 2007 was inserted to make it appear that he had been in Belize earlier than he was and qualified for Belizean nationality.

49.4 We could not ascertain if Passport #G33244420 had actually been presented to the Counter Clerk at the Passport Section or just a copy of the bogus native Passport page. The Counter Clerk at the time was Teresita Cooch and she did not record any Chinese Passport number in the For Official Use Section of the Passport application form to indicate that she had seen the actual Passport. The signature on his Passport application form did not match that seen on his visa application

49.5 Dong Tao Jin was not interviewed by Immigration personnel which is a requirement for all nationality applicants. His nationality certificate #28382/13 which was dated 19<sup>th</sup> May 2013 was backdated and was signed by Minister Elvin Penner.–

49.6 We did not see an entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration for nationality certificate #28382/13. The certificate numbers book showed that nationality certificate #28382 was entered on the 17<sup>th</sup> May 2013, which provided evidence that it was prepared for him before he entered Belize through the PGIA on the 2<sup>nd</sup> June 2013. This observation also suggested that there was a program in place through which personnel in the Nationality Section were informed of who would travel to Belize to receive their Belizean nationality certificates and Passports.

49.7 Our check of the Numbers Book revealed that another person by the name of Chen Xiuoyan was also issued Belize nationality at the same time with Dong Tao Jin on certificate #28381/13 and shared the same BNA File #29948. There was also no entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration for certificate number 28381/13. We found no evidence that Chen Xiuoyan had been issued a Belize visa or a Passport during the audited period.

49.8 He was issued Belizean Passport number P0238518 on 7<sup>th</sup> June 2013 in the name Dong Tao Jin, five (5) days after he entered Belize through the PGIA. The entry of his name into the Passport Issuance System may have been with the intention to hide the record since it was entered as Dong (2 spaces) Tao Jin and not Dongtao Jin as was seen on his native Chinese Passport issued 8<sup>th</sup> January 2009.

**Zubair Mohamed Kazi was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 28455/13**

50. We noted that Zubair Mohamed Kazi, who was born in India and whose date of birth was stated as 15<sup>th</sup> October 1945, entered Belize on 26th March 2013 through the PGIA on board an American Airline flight #2189.

Since he used his US Passport he did not need a Belize visa to enter the country. When he applied for his Belizean Passport on 8<sup>th</sup> July 2013, he used US Passport #488617463 issued 12th June 2013. That Passport was issued after his earliest recorded date of entry into Belize through the PGIA. He also entered Belize through the PGIA in April, May, August, November 2013 and on 7<sup>th</sup> February 2014.

50.2 We observed that he was not interviewed by any Immigration personnel as required for nationality applicants. His nationality file (#31769) was opened on the 10<sup>th</sup> June 2013, the same day his nationality certificate was entered in the Numbers Book. He received Belizean nationality certificate # 28455/13 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> June 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner. His certificate was backdated since it was seen in the Numbers Book under the date 10<sup>th</sup> June 2013 along with other certificates signed on said date. There was no entry for this certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration.

50.3 We noted that Zubair Mohamed Kazi's nationality certificate had his Belize address as Mile 30 Coastal Road, Stann Creek District while his Passport application form had Belize address as P.O Box 186, Mile 30 Stann Creek. Minister Elvin Penner recommended him for his Belizean Passport stating that he knew him for the past six years through "business relation". He was also recommended for his Passport by JP Eleodoro Lewis who stated that he knew him for two years as a "friend". We requested his nationality file number 31769 but it was not presented to us. We saw from copies of nationality files covers and some documents emailed to us from Attorney, Arthur Saldivar that he had Kazi's file in his possession and allegedly handed it over along with others to the Police on 15<sup>th</sup> October 2013.

50.4 He was issued his Belizean Passport P0241079 dated 8<sup>th</sup> July 2013 which was picked up by Minister Elvin Penner on that same date he had applied for his Passport. We did not see a written authority for Minister Penner to pick up Zubair Mohamed Kazi's Passport.

#### **Charles Francis Noll Jr was fraudulently issued Belize Nationality certificate # 28280/12**

51. We examined a copy of nationality certificate #28280/12 dated 12<sup>th</sup> December 2012, signed by Minister Godwin Hulse, which had been issued to Charles Francis Noll Jr. It stated that he was born in Florida USA on the 13<sup>th</sup> May 1959. The address stated on the certificate was 3 Miles Northern Highway, Belize City, an address frequently used by persons who acquired Belize nationality fraudulently as discussed in this report. His Passport application was among those that were not presented to us during our Passport investigation of the INS. He may have used USA Passport #215921092 issued 28<sup>th</sup> December 2005 with expiry date 27<sup>th</sup> December 2015 to apply for his Belizean Passport. A search of the BPIS showed that he used the same address of 3 Miles Northern Highway, Belize City, on his Passport application and was recommended by Gertrude Armstrong JP, who was an employee of the INS during that time.

51.2 We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that there was no entry for nationality certificate #28280/12 and the space appeared to have been reserved for the recipient of that number. In the Numbers Book that certificate had been entered on the 30<sup>th</sup> November 2012.

51.3 We examined the Permanent Residence Permit Book and it revealed that Charles Francis Noll Jr. had been fraudulently issued PR Permit# 44711. No PR file number was recorded in the respective column and where the receipt number and PR fees paid should have been recorded, the words, “replace old PR” were written. The date of entry recorded was the 14<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The handwriting resembled that of Permanent Residence Section Clerk, Gertrude Armstrong, who also recommended him for his Belizean Passport since she was also a Justice of the Peace.

51.4 Our investigation revealed that he entered Belize on the 17<sup>th</sup> September 2012 through the Philip Goldson International Airport and was given up to the 16<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to remain in Belize. US citizens do not need a visa to enter Belize therefore he was not issued a visa.

Charles Francis Noll Jr. was issued his Belizean Passport #P0226015 on the 8<sup>th</sup> January 2013, approximately three (3) months and three (3) weeks after he entered Belize as a visitor.

51.5 We requested his nationality file but it was not presented to us. His name and Passport information was included on a list with others pending further verification.

#### **4) Randall James Davis was fraudulently issued Belize Nationality certificate # 28282/12**

52. We saw a copy of nationality certificate #28282/12 dated 12<sup>th</sup> December 2012, signed by Minister Godwin Hulse, which had been issued to Randall James Davis, born in Pennsylvania USA on the 31<sup>st</sup> May 1954. The certificate stated that his Belize address was 1 ½ Miles Western Highway. Such address was frequently used by persons who were fraudulently issued Belizean nationality. His Passport application was not presented but he may have used USA Passport #213111786 issue date 30<sup>th</sup> March 2005; expired date 29<sup>th</sup> March 2015 to apply for his Belizean Passport.

52.2 We searched the BPIS and it showed that he used the same address of 1 ½ Miles Western Highway, on his Passport application and was recommended by Gertrude Armstrong JP, who was also an employee of the INS during that time.

52.3 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that nationality certificate #28282/12 had been issued to William Claude Curtis Myles on the 5<sup>th</sup> August 2013( that is the date in the Register) with his nationality file number being 29012) under Section 10 Registration. In the Numbers Book that certificate had been entered on the 30<sup>th</sup> November 2012 as issued to Randall James Davis.

52.4 We examined the Permanent Residence Permit Numbers Register which revealed that Randall James Davis had been fraudulently issued PR Permit # 44710. No PR file number was recorded in the respective column and in the section where the receipt number and PR fees paid should have been recorded, the words, “replace old PR” were written. The date of entry recorded was the 14<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The handwriting resembled that of former Permanent Residence Section Clerk, Gertrude Armstrong, who also recommended him for his Belize Passport since she was also a Justice of the Peace.

52.5 Our investigation revealed that he entered Belize on the 17<sup>th</sup> September 2012 through the Philip Goldson International Airport and was given up to the 16<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to remain in Belize. As stated before, US citizens do not need a visa to enter Belize therefore he was not issued a visa.

We also found that he was issued his Belizean Passport #P0226014 on the 8<sup>th</sup> January 2013, approximately three (3) months and three (3) weeks after he entered Belize as a visitor.

52.6 We requested his nationality file but it was not presented to us. As with Charles Francis Noll Jr. Randall James Davis’ name and Passport information was included on the list with others sent to the US Embassy for verification for which we have not yet received a response to.

**Jose Wilfredo Molina was fraudulently issued Belize Nationality certificate # 27957/12**

53. We saw a copy of nationality certificate #27957/12 dated 14<sup>th</sup> June 2012, signed by Minister John Saldivar, which had been issued to Jose Wilfredo Molina, born in Venezuela on the 8<sup>th</sup> June 1960. The address stated on the certificate was 3 Miles Northern Highway, Belize City, an address frequently used by persons who fraudulently acquired Belize nationality as discussed in this report. His passport application was not presented to Audit and we did not see a copy of his native Passport to determine which document he may have used to enter Belize.

53.2 We did not see a visa application in his name but we found that he entered Belize on the 26<sup>th</sup> June 2012. The Belize arrival stamp was not legible to determine his Port of Entry. Further investigation is required to ascertain the Port of Entry he used to enter Belize

53.3 Our search of the BPIS showed that he used the same address of 3 Miles Northern Highway, Belize City, on his Passport application and was recommended by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, who was the Director of the INS during that time.

53.4 We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that there was no entry for nationality certificate #27957/12 and the space appeared to have been reserved for the recipient of that number.

53.5 Our investigation revealed that he entered Belize on the 26th June 2012 and was given up to the 25<sup>th</sup> July 2012 to remain in Belize. We found no evidence that a visa was issued in his name. We also found that he was issued his Belizean Passport #P0205968 on the 26<sup>th</sup> June 2012, on the same day he may have entered Belize as a visitor, which suggested that if a nationality file existed for him, it may have been prepared with the required documents, nonetheless bogus documents, prior to his arrival.

We requested his nationality file but it was not presented to us.

**Paddy Franks was fraudulently issued Belize Nationality certificate # 22714/12**

54. We saw a copy of nationality certificate #22714/12 dated 24<sup>th</sup> April 2012, signed by Minister John Saldivar, which had been issued to Paddy Franks, born in Prince George, Canada on the 22<sup>nd</sup> October 1952. The address stated on the certificate was 806 Marin Crescent, Ladyville Village, Belize District. He may have used Canadian Passport #BA769742 issued 13<sup>th</sup> September 2011 with expiry date 13<sup>th</sup> September 2016 to enter Belize and to apply for his Belizean Passport. As a Canadian citizen he did not need a visa to enter Belize, but he had to enter with his native Passport and it was a copy of that native Passport we saw.

54.2 We searched the BPIS and it showed that he used the same address of 806 Marin Crescent, Ladyville on his Passport application and was recommended by Justice of the Peace, Rurico Alvarado.

54.3 We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that nationality certificate #22714 had been issued to Narciso Canales from the 1<sup>st</sup> August 2008 whose nationality file #number was 31315 under Section 10 Registration. In the Numbers Book, certificate number 22714 was not consistent with the certificate numbers issued for the period April 2012 since that series had been issued in June, July and August of 2008.

54.4 Our investigation revealed that he entered Belize on the 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2012 through the Belize Northern Border Station and was given up to the 15<sup>th</sup> March 2012 to remain in Belize. We also found that he was issued his Belizean Passport #P0212808 on the 13<sup>th</sup> August 2012 in the name Frank Paddy but it may have been misprinted as Passport #P0212808 was found among the cancelled Passports. Another Passport, Passport #P0212850 was printed on the same day in the name of Paddy Franks. Paddy Franks was issued his Belizean Passport approximately 5 months and three (3) weeks after he entered Belize through the Northern Border Station.

We requested his nationality file but it was not presented to us.

**Liming Huang was fraudulently issued Belize Nationality Certificate # 28424/13**

55. We saw a visa application form submitted to the Belmopan Office in the name Liming Huang. He was born in China and his date of birth was stated as 30<sup>th</sup> July 1975. His application form was dated 22nd October 2012 and was signed by Roger Tien, as in the case with Jinchen An above. It stated that he planned to travel to Belize on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2012 and leave on 16<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The purpose of his visit was “Business” and he planned to stay at the San Ignacio Hotel.

55.2 We observed that a copy of the aforementioned letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> September 2013 from Minister Erwin Contreras to Mr. Roger Tien ( attached to Jinchen An’s visa application) was attached to his application form. It also had the notation dated 24<sup>th</sup> October, 2013 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan and the copy of Mr. Tien’s undated letter to the Director.

55.3 We saw also a copy of an irregular Chinese Passport #G48016950 issued 21<sup>st</sup> February 2011 with expiry date 20<sup>th</sup> February 2021 attached to Liming Huang’s visa application. On his application form, Former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan wrote as she did on Jinchen An’s visa application at the Recommendation Section:

“Mr. Guy, please process application based on letter from Min E. Contreras. Approved” (signed) 24<sup>th</sup> October 2012. On the application B. Tillet wrote: “Approval granted for issuing of visa by DINS (signed) 25/10/2012. Liming Huang was issued visa # V00034693 dated 25<sup>th</sup> October, 2012.

55.4 We did not receive Liming Huang’s Passport application form, however while we were doing our search of the BPIS we found that he applied for and was issued a Belizean Passport. We also saw on the BPIS that he was recommended for his Belizean Passport by JP Chiu Hsiang Lo (Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo: See Passport report referenced Section III) as was the case with Jinchen An. The BPIS showed that he was issued nationality certificate #28424/13 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> June 2013.

55.5 We noted the entry in the Certificate Numbers Book was made on the 5<sup>th</sup> June 2013, which indicated that the certificate was backdated to read the 3<sup>rd</sup> June 2013. We did not see a copy of said certificate therefore we could not verify the Minister who had signed said certificate. There was no entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration for that certificate number.

We requested his Nationality file but it was not presented to us.

55.6 Liming Huang was issued his Belizean Passport #P0239621 dated 20<sup>th</sup> June 2013, seven (7) months and twenty five (25) days after he was approved visa # V00034693–on the 25<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to enter Belize. Further investigation is required to determine the date that he actually entered Belize.

**Jiahao Wu (Jia Hao Wu) was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #18785/05**

The Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 Section 13.-(1) & (3) state:

*(1) Where an applicant for registration as a citizen of Belize has any minor child, he may in his application or by subsequent letter make a request for the inclusion of the name of that child in the certificate of registration which may be granted under this Part.*

*(3) Where the Minister is satisfied that an applicant to whom a certificate of registration as a citizen of Belize has been issued under this Act was unable due to any fit and proper cause, at the time of making his application for citizenship, to include the names of his minor children in the application, the Minister may allow the certificate of registration as a citizen of Belize to be amended to include the names of the applicant's minor children, on such terms and subject to the payment of such fee as the Minister may prescribe.*

56. We could not ascertain in the case outlined below, if Jiahao Wu was the child of Ling Hao or (and) whether he remained in Belize after he received Belizean nationality and Passport.

56.2 We discovered a visa application for Jiahao Wu (Jia Hao Wu) of China (DOB 26<sup>th</sup> November 1995) dated 29<sup>th</sup> September 2011, which was submitted to the Belmopan Office. A copy of that visa application was not retained but from the information gathered we saw that the application did not have a copy of the applicant's native Passport biographic page attached. His trip was sponsored by Ling Hao who held Belizean Passport # P0139093 issued on the 9<sup>th</sup> July 2010. He was approved Visa # 431/BMP/11 on the 29<sup>th</sup> September 2011 but the signature of approval of the Director was not seen on the visa application.

56.3 Our Audit found that Jia Hao Wu was issued Belizean Passport # P0187311 on the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011. We examined his Passport application and found that he used Belize address of #1 Dean and College Boulevard, Belmopan. We noted that nationality certificate #18785/05 dated 14<sup>th</sup> November 2011 was recorded on his Passport application. The Counter Clerk, Omar Philips, recorded on the official uses section of the Passport application form that the applicant presented nationality certificate #18785/05 issued on the 20<sup>th</sup> September 2005. A copy of his nationality certificate was not seen. JP Florentino Baiza recommended the applicant for his Belizean Passport and stated that he knew him for one (1) year.

Also attached were copies of Social Security Card numbers #000502997 issued 21<sup>st</sup> November 2011 and 000424560 also issued on the 21<sup>st</sup> November 2011. It appeared that Ling Hao who sponsored Jiahao Wu for a Belize visa, had applied for his Belizean Passport as Jiahao Wu did not sign as recipient but the signature “Ling Hao” was seen on the Passport application.

56.4 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) and it showed that nationality certificate 18785/05 had been issued to Ling Hao on the 20<sup>th</sup> September 2005 (nationality file #20585). The Register also showed that in the column for the number of children included on the certificate, someone superimposed the number “1”, over a hyphen that was in the column indicating that no children had been added to her Nationality Certificate. Jiahao Wu was added to the nationality certificate of Ling Hao.

Jiahao Wu received Belizean nationality and Passport #P0187311 on the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011, two (2) months and nine (9) days after he was approved a visa to visit Belize through the Belmopan Office on the 29<sup>th</sup> September 2011.

56.5 Further investigation is required to determine the date he actually entered Belize and to check his nationality file to determine if the required documents for his Belizean nationality were backdated as others were.

56.6 We also saw that Ling Hao applied for visas as a sponsor for the following persons, listed at **Table V** below, who were approved visas on the 14<sup>th</sup> November 2011 through the Belmopan INS.

**Table V**

The following are the persons who received visas through the sponsorship of Ling Hao

| <b>Name</b>    | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Visa Number approved</b> | <b>Relationship to Ling Hao</b> |
|----------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Hui Xing Jiang | 21-Dec-91            | V00025645                   | niece for over 8 years          |
| Ji Zhong Lin   | 2-Mar-75             | V00025646                   | cousin for over 5 years         |
| Lin Lin Ye     | 14-Aug-93            | V00025647                   | friend for over 8 years         |
| Jin Hua Huang  | 23-Dec-74            | V00025648                   | friend for over 4 years         |
| Xia Oyan Wu    | 18-Jun-89            | V00025649                   | friend for over 8 years         |
| Shu Ming Guo   | 13-Nov-79            | V00025650                   | friend for over 5 years         |



Further investigation is required to ascertain whether those persons were approved Belizean nationality and Passports during the period investigated.

**Alexey Kharitonenko was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #12430/00**

57. We noted that Alexey Kharitonenko, who was born in the USSR (Russian Federation) and whose date of birth was stated as 14<sup>th</sup> March 1980, submitted a visa application on 6<sup>th</sup> January 2013 when he entered Belize through the BNBS. Attached was a copy of his native Passport 63NO89890 issued 21<sup>st</sup> October 2008. He was issued Belize visa #V00036275 dated 6<sup>th</sup> January 2013 although his visa application had no supporting documents (such as copy of his Passport) and no sponsor.

57.2 We observed that as with Liming Huang, Alexey Kharitonenko's Passport application form was not presented to us. We found on the BPIS that he submitted his Passport application, using nationality certificate #12430 dated 8<sup>th</sup> February 2000. According to the BPIS his Belize address was mile 1 ½ on the Northern Highway and he was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Jahan Abadi, JP.

57.3 Our search of the Register of Citizens by Registration revealed that certificate # 12430 was issued to Maria Concepcion Milian with 2 children included on the 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2000. Maria Concepcion Milian's nationality file number was 12430. His Nationality file was requested but it was not presented to us.

Alexey Kharitonenko was issued his Belizean Passport # P0226251 on 11th January 2013, five (5) days after he entered Belize through the BNBS.

**Jimin Guan was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 2918/94**

58. We saw a visa application form dated 5<sup>th</sup> March 2013 at the Belmopan Office for Jimin Guan who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 5<sup>th</sup> April 1970. He had requested a multiple entry visa and said application had the signature Guan Jimin. His application form appeared to have been written by the same person who wrote the approved visa number. The purpose of his travel was "business" and he intended to visit Belize 25<sup>th</sup> March 2013 and leave on the 2<sup>nd</sup> April 2013. His address and contact in Belize was Farmer's Market and cell number 501-610-8181. A copy of his Chinese Passport #G57004121, issued 23<sup>rd</sup> November 2011 with expiry date of 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2021, was attached. In his Chinese Passport, was a US visa # H0294116 with Control #20123550280003 issued in Guangzhou on 21<sup>st</sup> December 2012.

58.2 We also saw attached to his visa application form was a letter referenced C/Gen/1/01/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> January 2013 from the Ministry of Trade, Investment Promotion, Private Sector Development and Consumer Protection addressed Ms. Ruth Meighan, Director, Immigration & Nationality, Belmopan. This letter stated the following:

*“I wish to request your assistance in providing multiple entry visas to the below listed people who are consultants for Sunny City Development Project and are in possession of U.S Visas:*

- 1) *Li, WeiDong*
- 2) *Guan, JiMin*
- 3) *Chen, MuPing*

*Any assistance facilitated to them would be greatly appreciated (Signed) Hon Erwin Contreras, Minister”.* (Stamp of the Ministry was also seen beside Minister Contreras’ signature).

His visa #V00037753 was approved on the 5<sup>th</sup> March 2013 by the current Acting Director, Ms. Maria Marin.

58.3 We saw that Jimin Guan also applied for a Belizean Passport, but as with Liming Huang and Alexey Kharitonenko, his Passport application form was not presented. We found on the BPIS that he submitted his Passport application, using nationality certificate #2918/94 dated 13<sup>th</sup> March 1994. According to the BPIS his Belize address was Mile 3 on the Northern Highway and he was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Frank Symms, JP of Belize City.

58.4 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) which showed that nationality certificate #2918 had been issued to Ana Diaz Ventura on the 5<sup>th</sup> May 1992 and her File number was 3590. Under Section 11A (BECIP) certificate #2918/94 had been issued to Fengshen Che from 6<sup>th</sup> September 1993. He used a fraudulent nationality certificate to receive his Belizean Passport. Although requested, Jimin Guan’s nationality file was not presented to us.

58.5 Jimin Guan was issued his Belizean Passport #P0239029 on the 13<sup>th</sup> June 2013. He therefore received Belizean nationality and Passport three (3) months and one (1) week after he was approved a visa to enter Belize by the Belmopan Office.

58.6 Further investigation is required to determine the date he actually entered Belize after receiving visa number #V00037753 on the 5<sup>th</sup> March, 2013.

## **11) Weidong Li was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate 2915/94**

59. We saw a visa application form for Weidong Li which was submitted to the Belmopan Office and dated 5<sup>th</sup> March 2013 as Jimin Guan's application. He was born in Henan, China and his date of birth was stated as 3<sup>rd</sup> December 1967. He also requested a multiple entry visa and, as with Jimin Guan's application, his form appeared to have been written by the same person who wrote the approved visa number. His application was signed by "Li Weidong". His purpose of travel was the same as Jimin Guan ("business") and he intended to visit Belize 25<sup>th</sup> March 2013 and leave on the 2<sup>nd</sup> April 2013. His address and contact in Belize was the same as Jimin Guan., A copy of his Chinese Passport #G54862300 issued 8<sup>th</sup> October 2011 with expiry date of 7<sup>th</sup> October 2021 was attached. This Passport had in it US visa #H0294115 with Control #20123550280002 issued in Guangzhou on 21<sup>st</sup> December 2011.

59.2 We also saw attached to Weidong Li's visa application form, a copy of the aforementioned letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> January 2013 signed by Minister Erwin Contreras requesting multiple entry visas for him, Guan JiMin and Chen MuPing.

His visa #V00037752 was also approved by the current Acting Director, Ms. Maria Marin on the 5<sup>th</sup> March 2013.

59.3 We saw that Weidong Li applied for and was issued a Belizean Passport, but as with Jimin Guan and others aforementioned his application form was not presented to us. Our search of the BPIS revealed that he used nationality certificate #2915/94 dated 13th March 1994 to obtain his Belizean Passport. Like Jimin Guan, his Belize address was stated as Mile 3 Northern Highway. He was also recommended by Frank Symms, JP for his Belizean Passport.

59.4 Our search of the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) revealed that nationality certificate #2915 had been issued to Miguel Angel Betancourt Manzanero on the 5<sup>th</sup> May 1992 with his file number being 4277. Under Section 11A Registration (BECIP) certificate #2915 had been issued to Ben Zhang on the 6<sup>th</sup> September 1993. Weidong Li used a fraudulent nationality certificate to obtain his Belizean Passport.

59.5 Weidong Li was issued his Belizean Passport #P0239028 on the 13<sup>th</sup> June 2013. He therefore received Belizean nationality and Passport three (3) months and one (1) week (like Jimin Guan) after he was approved a visa to enter Belize by the Belmopan Office.

Further investigation is required to determine on what date he actually entered Belize after receiving visa number V00037752 on the 5<sup>th</sup> March, 2013.

### **Muping Chen was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate 2584/94**

60. We noted that Muping Chen who was born in Henan, China and whose date of birth was stated as 30<sup>th</sup> June 1967 was the third individual who Minister Erwin Contreras had requested multiple visas for in his letter dated 29<sup>th</sup> January 2013 to the Director. His visa application form was also dated 25<sup>th</sup> March 2013 and submitted to the Belmopan Office. As with Jimin Guan and Weidong Li his application appeared to have been written by the same person who wrote the approved visa number. His application was signed by “Chen Muping”. On his application it was indicated that the purpose of his travel was “tourist” and that he intended to visit Belize 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2013 and leave on the 8<sup>th</sup> May 2013. His address in Belize was the same as Jimin Guan and Weidong Li while his contact phone number was 223-1219. A copy of his People’s Republic of China Passport #E02352431 issued 16<sup>th</sup> July 2012 with expiry date of 15<sup>th</sup> July 2022 was attached and in which had US visa H05799235 with Control #20130109540003 issued in Beijing on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2013.
- 60.2 As with Jimin Guan and Weidong Li, Muping Chen’s visa #V00038497 was approved by the current Acting Director, Maria Marin. She approved by inserting her initials on the front page of his application instead of on the lines that were reserved for the Director’s approval signature and date. His visa’s date of approval was the 26<sup>th</sup> March 2013.
- 60.3 Muping Chen also applied for and was issued a Belizean Passport. Our search of the BPIS revealed that he used nationality certificate #2584/94 dated 4<sup>th</sup> April 1994 to obtain his Belizean Passport. His Belize address was stated as 12, Philip Goldson Highway. Like Jimin Guan and Weidong Li he was recommended by Frank Symms, JP for his Belizean Passport.
- 60.4 Our search of the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) revealed that nationality certificate #2584 had been issued to Wilhelm Peters Redekop on the 21<sup>st</sup> January 1992 whose file number was 3794. Under Section 11A Registration (BECIP) certificate # 2584 had been issued to Tan Shen Li Rong on the 28<sup>th</sup> December 1992 (no BNA File#). Muping Chen used a fraudulent nationality certificate to obtain his Belizean Passport.
- 60.5 He was issued his Belizean Passport # P0236265 on the 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013. He therefore received his Belizean nationality and Passport one (1) month and one (2) weeks after he was approved a visa to enter Belize by the Belmopan Office.
- 60.6 Further investigation is required to determine what date Muping Chen actually entered Belize after he was approved visa #V00038497 by the Belmopan Office.

## **Shangshang Wang was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #7586/98**

61. We observed that Shangshang Wang who was born in Henan, China and whose date of birth was stated as 8<sup>th</sup> December 1995 submitted a visa application form dated 25<sup>th</sup> March 2013, to the Belmopan Office which requested a multiple entry visa. Her application form was signed by “Wang Shang Shang”. On the right top corner of the application form was the date 3<sup>rd</sup> April 2013, which appeared to be the date the visa was issued. On her application it was indicated that the purpose of her travel was “tourist” and that she intended to visit Belize 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2013 and leave on the 8<sup>th</sup> May 2013. Her address and contact in Belize was Farmer’s Market and phone number 501-223-1219. A copy of her Chinese Passport #G43155007 issued 30<sup>th</sup> June 2010 with expiry date of 29<sup>th</sup> June 2015 was attached and in this Passport was a US visa H0609441 with Control #20130561340004 issued in Beijing on 26<sup>th</sup> February 2013.

61.2 We also saw attached to her visa application a letter, referenced C/Gen/1/01/13 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> April 2013 purportedly from the Ministry of Trade, Investment Promotion, Private Sector Development and Consumer Protection, addressed to Director, Immigration & Nationality, Belmopan. This letter stated:

*“Dear Director, I write to support your assistance in providing entry visa to Miss Shangshang Wang. Miss Wang is an investor who will travel to Belize on a continuous basis to hold discussions with business people regarding the Sunny City Development Project and the Gaming Industry in Belize. Her details are as follows:*

*Name: ShangShang Wang*

*Passport #: G43155007*

*Date of Birth: 8<sup>th</sup> December 1995.*

*She requires a visa to embark from the USA. I am therefore requesting your kind assistance in providing a visa to her in order to facilitate her travel to Belize. Ms. Wang is also on possession of a US Visa. Thank you for your consideration. Sincerely, (Signed G. Bradley for Hon. Erwin Contreras, Minister of Trade, Investment Promotion, Private Sector Development and Consumer Protection.”* The Ministry’s stamp was affixed next to her signature and the designation of the Minister.

We found that “G. Bradley” was the Secretary of Minister Contreras, Ms. Ginolfi Bradley.

61.3 We also saw a letter dated April 2nd 2013 from Kim Chee, Director of Sunny City Development Company, addressed to Director, Immigration Department, Belmopan, was also attached to her visa application form. It stated as follows:

*“Dear Director, I ask you for your kind assistance to aid Ms. Shangshang Wang for a Belize entry visa to visit the country of Belize in the month of April with possible visits in the upcoming months. Miss Wang’s father has visited Belize approximately two months previously and had developed an interest in the nation of Belize. He, Miss Wang’s father has great interest to invest in the Sunny City Hotel Hotel and Casino Resort within the project of Sunny City. Miss Wang’s visit to Belize would be very beneficial to this grand project. Your kind assistance would be greatly appreciated. Yours (signed) Kim Chee, Director of Sunny City Development Co”* (The Sunny City Development Stamp was affixed).

61.4 We also found attached to the visa application form, a Certificate of Incorporation #12344 for Sunny City Development Company issued by the Companies Registry on the 13<sup>th</sup> May 2011 and a Certificate of Compliance also dated 13<sup>th</sup> May 2011 stating that the address of the business was #72 Freetown Road, Belize City.

61.5 We observed Shangshang Wang’s visa #V00038523 was approved by an INS officer, on the 3<sup>rd</sup> April 2013, whose shortened signature was illegible and this same signature was seen in the Recommendations section of the visa application form. No one signed on the lines that were reserved for the Director’s approval signature and date but on the front of the visa application, the words, “Sec, Approved” was seen, which appeared to be the handwriting of Acting Director, Ms. Maria Marin.

61.6 We noted that she applied for and was issued a Belizean Passport; however her Passport application form was not presented to us. We saw on the BPIS that she used nationality certificate **#7586/98 dated 12<sup>th</sup> August 1998** to obtain her Passport. Her Belize address was Mile 12 Philip Goldson Highway and like Jimin Guan, Weidong Li and Muping Chen, she was recommended by Frank Symms JP for her Belizean Passport.

61.7 Our search of the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) revealed that nationality certificate 7586/98 had been issued to Luis Ayala on the 16<sup>th</sup> April 1998 and his nationality file number was 9597. Shangshang Wang had used a fraudulent nationality certificate to obtain her Belizean Passport.

61.8 We found that Shangshang Wang was included as a child on fraudulent Replacement Nationality certificate #7586/98, back-dated to the 12th August 1998 issued in the name Jianhua Wang, which was attached to his 9<sup>th</sup> October 2012 Passport application. Nationality certificate #7586/98 had what appeared as the signature of former Director, Gareth Murillo, at the back of the certificate as having replaced said certificate on the 9<sup>th</sup> May 2009.

Jianhua Wang was recommended for his Belize Passport by Frank A Symns, JP of #445 Lord's Bank Road, the same JP who recommended Shangshang Wang for her Belize Passport when she applied on the 15<sup>th</sup> April 2013. Jianhua Wang used what appeared as an irregular Belize voter's Registration ID#10-3902 dated 9<sup>th</sup> August 2005 (further investigation is required to verify that the voter's registration ID was valid) to apply for his Belizean Passport. He received Belize Passport P0219958 issued on the 10<sup>th</sup> October 2012 with that fraudulent nationality certificate.

- 61.9 The visa requested by Minister Erwin Contreras through letter dated 2<sup>nd</sup> April 2013 (signed by his Secretary Ginolfi Bradley) enabled Shangshang Wang to come to Belize to receive her Belizean Passport using the fraudulent Nationality certificate her father used to get his Belize Passport in October 2012. The fraudulent replacement Nationality certificate made it appear that Shangshang Wang had received Belize Nationality when she was two (2) years and eight (8) months old, as her date of birth was 8<sup>th</sup> December 1995 and the fraudulent certificate was backdated to read 12<sup>th</sup> August 1998. The name Hon. Jorge Espat was printed on the front of the certificate but at the back we saw that it was replaced by what appeared as the signature of Gareth Murillo on the 9<sup>th</sup> May 2009. The dates on the certificate were backdated.
- 61.10 Shangshang Wang was issued her Belizean Passport # P0236272 on the 7<sup>th</sup> May 2013. She received Belizean nationality and Passport one (1) month and four (4) days after she was approved visa V00038523 to enter Belize by the Belmopan Office.
- 61.11 Further investigation is required to determine the date Shangshang Wang actually entered Belize after she was issued visa #V00038523 on 3<sup>rd</sup> April 2013 by the Belmopan office.
- 61.12 We noted that the majority of persons, who received Belize visas and Belize Passports fraudulently as in the cases outlined above, received Belize visas through the Belmopan Office. However, we could not ascertain how those visitors to Belize acquired visas in Belmopan before they travelled to Belize when visas to Belize can be acquired abroad at the nearest Belize Foreign Mission. As in the majority of cases outlined above we were unable to determine their exact dates of entry into Belize after they were issued visas at the Belmopan office.
- 61.13 Since native Passports should be submitted to apply for visas at all Offices in Belize and abroad, we could not ascertain how native Passports got to Belize and were presented to the Belmopan Office without the Passport holders appearing. It appeared that the Chinese applicants' native Passports or pages were fraudulently manufactured and then submitted to the Belmopan office along with visa applications on behalf of persons who had not entered Belize.

Other cases of such irregular visa issuance in what appeared as bogus Chinese Passports are outlined below:

**Chinese individuals with bogus Chinese Passports were issued Belize visas by the Belmopan Office. With the facility of these bogus passports then they entered the country days later through the Belize Northern Border and had their dates of entries backdated**

The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual (July 1, 2011) on Page 5 titled “Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10” states:

*“The entire passport pages and any other passport whether expired or valid must be requested in order to verify the domicile period of the applicant. These pages must be examined and certified by the counter clerk; therefore originals must be submitted along with copies.”*

62. We could not ascertain whether an actual Passport or just copies of Passports were submitted to the Counter Clerk or whether copies of paper that appeared as Passport pages were submitted. We also could not ascertain if the bogus Passport pages were being prepared at the Nationality Section or submitted to them by other persons.

(i) Xiaopeng Zhang and Xiaoyu Zhang

62.2 We noted that a visa application in the name of Xiaopeng Zhang was accepted by Immigration officer, Miss Ady Pacheco on the 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012. His place of birth was Guangdong, China and date of birth was stated as 4<sup>th</sup> October 1992. A single visa was recommended by Mr. Gordon Wade, OIC Nationality Section, on the same date and visa #V00029380 (122/Bmp/12) was approved by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, on the 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012. Miss Ady Pacheco and Mr. Gordon Wade worked (still do) in the Nationality Section and not the Visa Section of the INS during that period. A copy of Xiaopeng Zhang’s Chinese Passport # G21967595 issued 13<sup>th</sup> April 2007 with expiry date of 12<sup>th</sup> April 2012 (almost expired) was attached to his visa application. The purpose of his visit was indicated as “student”. His address and contacts were stated as Mexicali, Mexico and his intended Belize address was stated as #190 Newtown Barracks, Belize City; phone #601-2200 and 223-3188.

62.3 We found attached to his visa application, a copy of page 47 of Chinese Passport # G21967593, which had a multiple Mexican visa, issued in Shanghai, China on the 24<sup>th</sup> July 2007. The name on the Mexican visa was Xiaoyu Zhang, who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 21<sup>st</sup> September 1997.

We found that Xiaoyu Zhang also applied for a Belize visa on the 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012 indicating that the purpose of her travel was “tourist”, which was approved by former



Director, Miss Ruth Meighan and she was issued visa #V00029381 on the same day. A copy of her Chinese Passport # G21967593 issued 13<sup>th</sup> April 2007 with expiry date of 12<sup>th</sup> April 2012 was seen attached to Xiaoyu Zhang's application. Attached to her visa application was the copy of page 47 of Chinese Passport # G21967595 for Xiaopeng Zhang with a multiple entry Mexican visa, also issued in Shanghai, China on the 24<sup>th</sup> July 2007 to Xiaopeng Zhang. Their copies of native Passports apparently got mixed up. We did not see any evidence of stamps in their Passports for their travel from China to Mexico nor for their arrival in Mexico.

62.4 We also found a copy of a letter dated 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012 of Financial Support from Xinye Zhang, attached to their visa applications. Miss Ady Pacheco wrote on the application that Xinye Zhang was the applicants' mother. An unofficial "notarial certificate" (translation) dated 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012 was also attached to both applications, which indicated that the applicants were the children of Xinye Zhang but no copies of birth certificates were attached as proof.

62.5 A copy of Xinye Zhang's Belizean Passport #P0177630 with issue date 24<sup>th</sup> August 2011 was also attached. We could not ascertain whether her Belizean Passport was genuinely issued to her as her Passport application was not presented to us.

62.6 We saw on the BPIS that Xinye Zhang had used nationality certificate #16927 on the 27<sup>th</sup> June 2002. During that time there were allegedly controversial nationality certificate issuances.

62.7 We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that Xinye Zhang was issued certificate #16927. We noted also that Ludong Deng had the same nationality file #17507 as Xinye Zhang and that he was issued certificate #16926 on the same date 27<sup>th</sup> June 2002.

62.8 We observed that Xiaopeng Zhang applied for PR status and File #27227/13 was opened in his name. We requested his PR file and found the following:

- i. On the Minute sheet and copies of Passports we saw the signatures of OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade and Immigration Officer, Miss Ady Pacheco who had accepted his visa application form and recommended that a Belize visa (#V00029380) be approved by former Director, Ruth Meighan. We could not ascertain how the same personnel, who received the visa application and recommended the visa, were now recommending the same applicant for Permanent Residence when the Visa and Nationality Sections in the INS are distinct and separate.

- ii. A copy of Chinese Passport # G59992614 issued 21<sup>st</sup> August 2012 and expired date 20<sup>th</sup> August 2022 issued to Xiaopeng Zhang but we could not verify if the photo in the Passport was the same person in the photo seen in Chinese Passport # G21967595, which was issued five (5) years earlier. A note was written by Immigration Officer, Liandro Quischan on page 5 of the copy of Passport # G59992614 page which stated: “kindly note that bearer previously travelled on # G21967595...DOA (date of arrival) 28<sup>th</sup> February 2012 via BNBS obtained extensions until 25.6.2012” (signed 2.10.2012).
- iii. A stamp of arrival on the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2012 through the BNBS was seen on a copy of page 8 of Passport # G21967595 and the Belize visa sticker issued, which was not V00029380 as recorded on the visa application but V00029381. The visa dated the 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012 had the signature of Miss Ady Pacheco and Mr. Gordon Wade. We could not ascertain how Xiaopeng Zhang arrived at Belize on the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2012 through the Belize Northern Border when his Belmopan issued visa was approved on the 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012. The two copies of Chinese Passport pages for Passport #s G21967595 and G21967593 and for Xiaopeng Zhang and Xiaou Zhang also appeared as bogus.

62.9 We also found that Xiaopeng Zhang’s Permanent Residence File #27227/13 had been issued to Samuel Kim. The PR Permit number 44957 issued to Samuel Kim had also been fraudulently issued to Hailiang Lin as shown at **Table W** below.

**Table W**

The following table shows that Samuel Kim received the same PR file number as Xiaopeng Zhang while said Samuel Kim and Hailiang Lin had the same PR number.

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Permanent Resident Number</b>      | <b>PermanentResident File Number</b> | <b>Nationality</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|
| Samuel Kim   | 44957A/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> December 2013 | 27227                                | American           | Korea                 |
| Hailiang Lin | 44957B/ 2 <sup>nd</sup> December 2013 | -                                    | Chinese            | Guangdong, China      |

62.10 We noted that Hailiang Lin’s visa application was accepted by R. Mejia and visa #V00039581 was approved on the 21st May 2013 by Ms. Maria Marin. He was sponsored by Jie Fu Lin of Lin's Hardware, George Price Highway, Santa Elena (Registration

#20080 dated 7-Aug-2013) as a friend. His visa was requested by Minister Elvin Penner as recorded on the application.

62.11 It appeared that Xiaopeng Zhang was not issued a PR number but his file was returned by Ag Director Maria Marin on the 10<sup>th</sup> May 2013 because of application discrepancies. Ady Pacheco had recommended the applicant for Permanent Residence status.

We did not come across any evidence that Xiaoyu Zhang had also applied for Belize Permanent Residence.

ii) Tian Zhi Wang (Freakin Yang)

63. We observed in the case of Tian Zhi Wang (Tianzhi Wang who changed his name to Freakin Yang) that his date of entry in Belize was 9<sup>th</sup> November 2011 through the Northern Border as seen on the copy of his irregular Chinese Passport # G41602494 issue date 8<sup>th</sup> April 2010 and expiry date 7<sup>th</sup> April 2020. However, his visa was issued in Belmopan on the 7<sup>th</sup> November 2011. It appeared that he may have entered the country only two days later through Mexico but we could not ascertain his date of entry into Belize. We could not determine how his Chinese Passport got to Belize and returned to him for entry to Belize in two days.

iii) Jinchao Wu

64. We found in the case of Jinchao Wu who previously had a stolen Belizean manual Passport (see Passport Report Section III that his nationality file had a copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G46036001 with issue date 30<sup>th</sup> March 2011 and expiry date of 29<sup>th</sup> March 2021 and also a copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G14155961 issued 21<sup>st</sup> March 2005 with expiry date of 20<sup>th</sup> March 2010. His Chinese Passport #G14155961 had a visa stamp, imprinted therein issued at INS Belmopan, which appeared to have been issued on the 8<sup>th</sup> March 2007 by Jerome Lewis. We saw a Belize arrival stamp on the copy of his Passport, which showed that he may have arrived about one month later through the BNBS on the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2007. His nationality file also showed that Miss Ady Pacheco extended his visa on the 3<sup>rd</sup> October 2011, although she had been posted to the Nationality Section. Our findings which show that he did not qualify for Belizean nationality on the date it was issued are outlined earlier in this report at paragraph 48.

64.2 We could not determine how his Chinese Passport got to Belize and returned to him for entry to Belize in one month. We saw no evidence in his Passport pages copied that he had left China and arrived in Mexico. All those immigration stamps on the copies of his Passport seen in his nationality file appeared to have been bogus.

**Liudmila Shengeliya was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality when she received a Replacement Nationality Certificate to replace Nationality certificate # 13085 of 2001**

65. We found that Liudmila Shengeliia (There were two (2) spellings to this surname and both names have the same date of birth indicating that it is the same person )who was born in Russia and her date of birth stated as the 18<sup>th</sup> January 1970 entered Belize on a visa #V00034608 on the 12<sup>th</sup> November 2012 through the BNBS. Her visa application form did not have no picture and no supporting documents nor was a copy of her native Russian Passport biometric page attached to her application form.
- 65.2 We noted that approximately eight months earlier, Liudmila Shengeliya of Leningrad, USSR, with date of birth stated as the 18<sup>th</sup> January 1970, applied for a Belizean Passport, which was issued to her in the name Liudmila Valeryevna Shengeliya on the 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2012 through fraudulent nationality Certificate #13085 dated 11<sup>th</sup> April 2001.
- 65.3 We saw the name of Minister Maxwell Samuels printed on the face of the replacement nationality certificate number 13085 of 2001as the Minister who had signed. At the back of said replacement certificate stated it was replaced on 5<sup>th</sup> November 2009 by what appeared to be the signature of former Director, Gareth Murillo.
- 65.4 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) and found no entry for certificate number 13085 of 2001. In the Numbers book for that period we saw the name Pi-O- Lin as the recipient of nationality certificate # 13085. We requested Liudmila Shengeliya nationality file but it was not presented to us.
- 65.5 We observed that her Passport application form submitted on the 1<sup>st</sup> March 2012 for a first-issue Belizean Passport had the address of 4 ½ Miles Northern Highway. It was also not processed as required. No documents, including nationality certificate and native Passport, were recorded as presented to the Counter Clerk in the For Official Use Only section of the application. The Counter Clerk did not sign and date the application, no one signed as the officer who delivered the Passport to the recipient and the date of receipt was not recorded. The signature of the recipient did not match the applicant's signature on the Passport application. She was recommended for her Belizean Passport by Demecio Cal JP who stated that he knew her for 1 year.
- 65.6 We saw attached to her Passport application a copy of her native Russian Federation Passport #63No 9546636 in the name Liudmila Shengeliya issued 27<sup>th</sup> January, 2009, which appeared irregular and bogus.

65.7 We noted that her Belizean Passport #P0193776 was issued on the 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2012 and it was picked up by an unknown person whose signature was not legible. No authority for Passport pick-up was seen attached to the Passport application.

65.8 We observed that Liudmila Shengeliya was issued her Belizean Passport #P0193776 on the 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2012 in the name Liudmila Valeryevna Shengeliya through fraudulent nationality certificate #13085 dated 11<sup>th</sup> April 2001. It was approximately eight months before she was issued visa V00034608 and entered Belize on the 12<sup>th</sup> November 2012 through the BNBS using the name Liudmila Shengeliia as was recorded on the visa list compiled by the audit staff.

**David Shengeliia was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality when he received a Replacement Nationality Certificate to replace Nationality Certificate # 17692/04**

66. We noted that David Shengeliia who was born in USSR and whose date of birth was stated as 11<sup>th</sup> July 1960 also received a Belizean Passport by using fraudulent replacement nationality certificate 17692/04 dated 5<sup>th</sup> April 2004. His address in Belize was stated as 4634 Seashore Drive. His replacement certificate was allegedly signed by Honourable Ralph Fonseca on 5<sup>th</sup> April 2004 and replaced on the 1<sup>st</sup> October 2009 by what appeared as the very unusual signature of former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo.

There was no entry for certificate number 17692/04 in the Register of citizens by Registration under Section 10.

66.2 We did not see a copy of the Belize visa, which may have been issued to David Shengeliia or to ascertain his date of entry into Belize before he was fraudulently issued replacement certificate 17692/04.

He applied for his Belizean Passport on the 28<sup>th</sup> March 2012 with a copy of his faded Russian Federation Passport # 64No23858354 attached. Said Russian Passport had the issue date of 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2011.

66.3 David Shengeliia received his Belizean Passport P0196182 which was issued on 28<sup>th</sup> March 2012 (in the same month as Liudmila Shengeliya). Former Immigration Clerk, Omar Philips accepted the application form as the Counter Clerk and also did the Data Entry in addition to delivering the Passport to the recipient. Counter Clerk and Data Entry Clerk were separate and distinct functions that should not have been carried out by the same officer.

**Barry Smithson previously known as Badri Shengeliia was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 2368/92**

67. We noted that Barry Smithson, previously known as Badri Shengeliia a native of USSR, Russia, was born on 1<sup>st</sup> March 1965 applied on the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 to renew his Belizean

Passport #P0185686 that had recently been issued to him on the 24<sup>th</sup> November 2011. It was a mere two weeks prior to his 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 application.

67.2 We examined his 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 Passport application and it revealed that Badri Shengeliia lived at 6001 Buttonwood Bay Boulevard, Belize City. On his second visit to the Passport Office he was recommended for his Passport by Miss Juliana Arana JP of Belize City who stated that she knew him for 3 years. The BPIS Report showed that he was recommended for his first Passport (P0185686) by Jahan Abadi JP of Belmopan and his address was stated as Mile 3.5 Northern Highway Belize City.

67.3 We noted that the Counter Clerk Eleud Romero indicated that Barry Smithson (Badri Shengeliia) had presented a copy of his nationality certificate and recorded certificate #2368/92 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> July 1992 but a copy was not attached to his Passport application. He also indicated that he had presented a deed poll that appeared as # 12-00 dated 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 for a change of his name to Barry Smithson but a copy of the deed poll was not attached to his Passport application.

67.4 Our examination of the Register of Citizens by Registration revealed that under Section 10, certificate number 2368 dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 1991 was issued to Yu Huang Yan Fei while there was no entry for that certificate number under Section 11A. We requested Barry Smithson's (Badri Shengeliia) nationality file but it was not presented to us.

He was issued his second Passport P0187354 in the name Barry Smithson on the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011.

67.5 Further investigation is required to ascertain his date of entry into Belize before he got his fraudulent Belizean replacement nationality certificate and Passport.

**Hongwei Chen (Hong Wei Chen) was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 27424/13**

68. We observed that Hongwei Chen who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 11<sup>th</sup> May 1968 submitted his application form dated 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013 for his Belizean Passport. On his Passport application he stated his Belize address as Independence Village, Stann Creek District. His recommender on form 3A was Eleodoro Lewis JP of Belmopan who stated that he had known the applicant, Hong Wei Chen for 2 years as a friend while on form 3B his recommender was Vashti Silva, teacher of Belmopan, who stated that she had known the applicant, "Hong Wei Chin", through a friend for 1 year. A copy of Chinese Passport G25148025 issued 10-Oct-2007 with expiry date of 9-Oct-2017 in the name Hongwei Chen was attached to his application. Also attached was a copy of his Belizean nationality certificate #27424/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner.

68.2 A search of the Register of Citizens by Registration it revealed that certificate number 27424/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 was issued to Hongwei Chen and nationality file #28440 was opened in his name.

The file diary showed that his nationality file #28440 was opened on the 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2012 (same date as Jianguo Chen's discussed further at paragraph 70). In the Numbers Book certificate #27424/13 was entered in his name but on the 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012 as though it had been reserved for him in the Numbers Book prior to his visit to Belize.

68.3 Further investigation is required to ascertain what his nationality file #28440 contains.

68.4 Our investigation revealed that Hongwei Chen entered Belize on the 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2013 on board American Airlines flight #2157. We were unable to find a copy of a visa, or any legitimate Passport which he used to enter Belize.

Hongwei Chen was issued Belizean Passport #P0238494 on the same day he applied for it, 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013, three months after he entered Belize through the PGIA.

**Jinyu Liu (Jin Yu Liu) wife of Hongwei Chen was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 27425/13**

69. We observed that Jinyu Liu, who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 13<sup>th</sup> August 1971 also submitted her Passport application on 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013. On her application she stated that her husband's name was Hongwei Chen and that her Belize address was also Independence Village, Stann Creek District. She was also recommended on form 3A and 3B by Eleodoro Lewis JP and Vashti Silva, teacher, who stated that they had known the applicant, Jin Yu Liu for 2 years as a friend and 1 year through a friend respectively. Attached to her Passport application was a copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G23278559 issued 18<sup>th</sup> June 2007 in the name Jinyu Liu. Also attached was a copy of her Belizean nationality certificate # 27425/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner. The Counter Clerk, Erwin Robinson did not record that a marriage certificate was presented and a copy was not seen attached to the Passport application.

69.2 Our examination of the Register of Citizens by Registration revealed that certificate number 27425/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 was issued to Jinyu Liu and that she shared the same file number 28440 as Hongwei Chen. In the Numbers Book certificate #27425/13 was entered in her name but as with Hongwei Chen it was dated 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012. As with Hongwei Chen, it appeared as though it had been reserved for her in the Numbers Book prior to her visit to Belize.

69.3 Further investigation is required to ascertain her date of entry into Beliz and what her nationality file contains.

69.4 Jinyu Liu received her Belizean Passport P0238498 on the same day she applied for it 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013, but it was not in her husband's surname Chen, but in the name Jinyu Liu.

**Jian Guo Chen (Jianguo Chen) was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 27426/13**

70. We observed that Jian Guo (Jianguo Chen) who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 6<sup>th</sup> October 1966 submitted an application for a Belizean Passport on the 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013; the same day that Hongwei Chen and Jicopynyu Liu aforementioned submitted their applications. We noted that he also listed the same Belize address, Independence Village, Stann Creek as the aforementioned individuals.

70.2 We noted that Jian Guo also had the same recommenders as Hongwei Chen and Junyu Liu, Eleodoro Lewis JP and Vashti Silva, teacher, who both stated that they had known him for 2 years as a friend and 1 year through a friend respectively. Attached to his application was a copy of an irregular Chinese Passport G23641952 issued 6<sup>th</sup> July 2007 with expiry date of 5<sup>th</sup> July 2017 in the name Jianguo Chen. His copy of Belizean nationality certificate #27426/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner was attached to his application.

70.3 Our examination of the Register of Citizens by Registration revealed that certificate number 27426/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 was issued to Jianguo Chen and that nationality file #28441 was opened in his name. In the Numbers Book certificate #27426/13 was entered in his name but as in the cases of Hongwei Chen and Jinyu Liu it was dated 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012. As with Hongwei Chen and Junyu Liu, it appeared as though it had been reserved for him prior to his visit to Belize. The File Diary showed that his BNA File was opened on the 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2012, the same day as Hongwei Chen's.

70.4 We saw on a note dated the 25<sup>th</sup> April 2013 on the file's Minute Sheet where OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade recorded that Minister Elvin Penner requested Jian Guo's file for processing.

70.5 We did not see a visa application form in his name or any legitimate Passport which he used to enter Belize.

Our investigation revealed that Jian Guo Chen entered Belize on the 31<sup>st</sup> March 2013 on board American Airlines flight # 2189.

70.6 We noted that Jian Guo Chen was issued his Belizean Passport #P0238500 on the 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013 (the same date he applied as did Hongwei Chen and Jinyu Liu). He got his Belizean Passport two months and six days after he entered Belize through the PGIA.



70.7 Further investigation is required of his nationality file to determine how he got his nationality.

**Yueping Liu (Yue Ping Liu) wife of Jian Guo Chen was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate # 27427/13**

71. We found that Yueping Liu who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 11<sup>th</sup> April 1973 also submitted her Passport application on the 6<sup>th</sup> June, 2013 (the same date as Hongwei Chen, Jinyu Liu and Jian Guo Chen). She stated on her application that her husband was Jian Guo Chen and her address was Independence Village, Stann Creek (the address used by Jian Guo Chen and Hongwei Chen and Jinyu Liu). She had the same two recommenders, Eleodoro Lewis JP and Vashti Silva, teacher, who stated that they had known Yueping Liu for 2 years as a friend and 1 year through a friend respectively. Attached to her Passport application was a copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G23641591 issued 6<sup>th</sup> July 2007 in the name Yueping Liu. A copy of her Belizean nationality certificate # 27427/13 dated the 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 and signed by Minister Elvin Penner was also attached.

71.2 Our examination of the Register of Citizens by Registration revealed that certificate number 27427/13 dated 29<sup>th</sup> May 2013 was issued to Yue Ping Liu and that she shared the same file number 28441 as Jian Guo Chen. In the Numbers Book it showed that certificate #27426/13 was entered in her name but it was dated 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012, as in the cases of Hongwei Chen and Jinyu Liu and Jian Guo Chen. It appeared as though it had been reserved for her prior to her visit to Belize (as with Hongwei Chen, Jinyu Liu and Jian Guo Chen).

71.3 We saw a note dated the 25<sup>th</sup> April 2013 on her file's Minute Sheet. This note was written by OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade and it reflected that Minister Elvin Penner requested her file for processing.

71.5 We were unable to determine her date of entry into Belize. Further investigation is required to ascertain her entry and the contents of her nationality file.

71.6 We saw that she was issued her Belizean Passport #P0238499 on the 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013 in the name Yue Ping Liu, on the same day as Hongwei Chen, Jinyu Liu and Jian Guo Chen,. Her Passport was not printed in her married name "Chen". The Counter Clerk, Erwin Robinson did not record that a marriage certificate was presented and a copy was not seen attached to the Passport application.

71.7 The **Table** labelled **X** below shows our observations for two additional persons who were issued Belizean nationality certificates around the same time and also Belizean Passports on the same date (6<sup>th</sup> June 2013) as those aforementioned individuals at **paragraphs 68, 69 and 70** above. They were both recommended by Jahan Abadi, Justice of the Peace, for their Belizean Passports.

**Table X**

The following is the other two persons who were issued nationality certificates and Belizean Passports on the same date as those individuals reported on at paragraphs 68, 69 and 70

| <b>Name</b>     | <b>Nationality certificate number and date</b> | <b>Passport number and issue date</b>   | <b>Date of entry into Belize</b> | <b>Observations in nationality file</b>  |
|-----------------|--|---|----------------------------------|--|
| Guoche<br>ng Xu | 28423/13 dated<br>29th May 2013                | P0238496 dated<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013<br>(BPIS showed<br>Jahan Abadi JP<br>was one of his<br>Passport<br>Recommender) | Unknown                          | <p>Belize visa stamp dated 24<sup>th</sup> August 2007 issued in Belmopan signed by Jerome Lewis. Belize entry stamp through <b>BNBS</b> dated as 15<sup>th</sup> November 2007. Nationality application stated he entered Belize through the <b>PGIA</b>. Mexican visa and travel stamps may not be genuine. Nationality file had copies of student permits (for St. Martin De Porres Primary School), extension stamps and employment permits signed by Liandro Quischan, Carlos Amaya and Giovanni Tzib. Work permit photos for 5<sup>th</sup> November and 29<sup>th</sup> May 2009 appeared as years in between or as a different person. Information was blocked out off TEP signed by Giovanni Tzib on the 29<sup>th</sup> May 2009. Referee Sayda Foster referred to applicant as a “she” (“she use to come by food at the restaurant”). Applicant was a male. The other Referee was Robert Mossiah of #3 Gibnut Street, Belmopan although applicant’s address was Punta Gorda.</p> <p>Interview was conducted by INS Clerk, Lourdes Jimenez, who was neither the Supervisor nor an Immigration Officer but she recorded on the General Declaration form, “Interview conducted as per Mr. Wade”.</p> |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Nationality certificate number and date</b> | <b>Passport number and issue date</b>   | <b>Date of entry into Belize</b> | <b>Observations in nationality file</b>   |
|-------------|--|---|----------------------------------|---|
| Caifen He   | 28431/13 dated 4 <sup>th</sup> June 2013       | P0238497 dated 6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 (BPIS showed Jahan Abadi JP was one of her Passport Recommender) | Unknown                          | Mother of Guocheng Xu; Further investigation is required as to the contents of her nationality file |

**Ziad Omais was fraudulently issued Belizean Nationality Certificate number 28151/13**

72. We observed that Ziad Omais a native of Dakar, Senegal, whose date of birth was stated as 26<sup>th</sup> February 1980 presented a Passport application on the 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013, which stated his Belize address, was Santa Rita Road, Corozal Town. He presented a Social Security card receipt dated 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013, which stated it was for a “card replacement”. He did not present any form of photo identification to the Passport Office but still his application was accepted by the Counter Clerk, Teresita Cooch. The data entry was done by Romi Rosas, Immigration Officer, although he was not presented with the required source document to verify the biographic information recorded on the Passport application form before it was entered in the BPIS. The other officers who processed the Passport application also accepted the form without the required identification: Sharon Neal Flowers Flowers approved, Eleud Romero printed, and Tiffany Taylor did the QA. The Counter Supervisor did not sign the Passport application.
- 72.2 We noted that his Passport application recommenders were Jahan Abadi JP of #23/25 Unity Boulevard, Belmopan who stated that he knew the applicant for two (2) year and Agatha Tush, Teacher .of Garden City Primary School with address of #40 St. Matthews St. Belmopan, who also stated that she knew the applicant for two (2) years. Both recommenders stated that Ziad Omais was their friend.
- 72.3 Our examination of the Register of Citizen by Registration revealed his name as the recipient of certificate #28151/13 (BNA File #28989). A search of the Nationality certificate Numbers Book showed that the nationality certificate was entered on the 6<sup>th</sup> August 2012 and not May 23rd 2013, and it appeared that the certificate number was reserved for him nine months before it was signed by Minister Elvin Penner.
- 72.4 We examined his nationality file and it indicated that during his interview, facilitated on the 17<sup>th</sup> July 2012 by OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade, he stated that he had Permanent Residence from 2008 and that he was a businessman in the Commercial Free Zone. Mr. Wade also recorded statements from his Nationality Referees, Alfred Elvis Davis of G Street South, Corozal Town who stated that he knew Ziad Omais for three (3) years as his cab driver and Glen Lincoln Jones of Belmopan who stated on an incomplete referral form that he knew Ziad Omais for two (2) years but did not state how the acquaintance came about. Both signed the required form stating same. The required time was five (5) years for referees to be acquainted with the nationality applicant but still, OIC Mr. Wade recorded that the applicant qualified for Belize nationality under Section 10 Registration.

- 72.5 We noted that his Passport issued and expired date was not visible on the copy of the Republic of Senegal native Passport #10260233 seen in his nationality file. The engraved Passport numbers seen on copies of this native Passport appeared as 02FD22683 and not 10260233. We observed a Belize visa stamp issued from the Northern Border on the 20<sup>th</sup> February 2007, the same date recorded in the Northern Border arrival stamp. There was also another Belize visa stamp issued as the Northern Border on the 24<sup>th</sup> December 2007 (expired on the 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2008) for re-entry as a tourist and a Northern Border arrival stamp dated the 25<sup>th</sup> December 2007. He was given up to the 30<sup>th</sup> May 2008 to remain in Belize although the visa expired date was the 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2008. It appeared that he was also able to get a temporary employment permit stamp, dated 31<sup>st</sup> May 2007 issued in Corozal Town, which stated that he was authorized employment as a Director/ Riachuetto Co. His Nationality application stated that he was a Sales Executive for Rio Moda Co. Located in the Corozal Free Zone. We also saw a single entry Belize Visa issued at the Northern Border Station signed by Immigration Officer, Mark Tench on the 28<sup>th</sup> May 2008 and another Belize visa stamp dated the 6<sup>th</sup> July 2008. Those Belize visa stamps and Northern Border entry stamps indicated that he may not have qualified for Belize Permanent Residence in the first place because he left and entered the country more than once within the first year and his nationality file showed no record of approval to leave the country from the Director, INS.
- 72.6 We also saw copies of another native Republic of Senegal Passport #A00141380, with issue date 27<sup>th</sup> June 2008 and expired date 26<sup>th</sup> June 2013. The Immigration stamps in his previous Passport showed that he was already issued this one but continued to use the previous one up to the 6<sup>th</sup> July 2008 to enter Belize. In the second native Passport we saw numerous Belize departure and arrival stamps entry including a Belize Permanent Residence stamp dated 15<sup>th</sup> July 2008 for PR permit #39678/08 as a Company Director, signed on the 15<sup>th</sup> July 2008 by former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo.
- 72.7 Ziad Omais did not qualify for Belize Permanent Residence status in 2008 or Belize Nationality in 2013. His nationality application was recommended by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan to the Minister on the 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2012. Ziad Omaid was issued Belize Nationality Certificate #28151/13, which was apparently signed on the 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2013 by Elvin Penner.
- 72.8 He was issued his Belizean Passport #P0238485 on the 6<sup>th</sup> June 2013, (without presenting any form of photo identification) the same date of his application on payment of the expedited fee approved by Acting Director, Ms. Maria Marin.

**Ezinne Chinnaya Ngele Udo may not have qualified for Belizean nationality but she was issued nationality certificate #28302/13 (date unknown)**

73. We examined the nationality file (BNA#29551/12) of Ezinne Chinnaya Ngele Udo's who was from Aba, Nigeria, and whose date of birth was stated as 24<sup>th</sup> April 1980. Her nationality application form was not dated to indicate when the Nationality Section received it as required by requirement #1 (page 5) of the INS Nationality and Permanent Residence Policy and Procedures handbook under the section titled "Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10".
- 73.2 We noted that she wrote on her application form that she was employed in customer service at CYZEE Trading Company/ Shop but that she was "not working for pay". We did not see any letter of employment on the file or bank statement to indicate that she was able to sustain herself while in Belize. Nonetheless, her application was accepted by the Nationality Section. We saw copies of two (2) native Nigerian Passports: Passport #A01979517 issued 19<sup>th</sup> October 2011 with expiry date of 18<sup>th</sup> October 2016 and Passport #A4112271 issued 12<sup>th</sup> June 2006 with expiry date of 11<sup>th</sup> June 2011. Those copied pages showed a Belmopan visa stamp issued on the 13<sup>th</sup> February 2007 by Jerome Lewis and an arrival stamp dated 8<sup>th</sup> June 2007 for arrival to Belize through the PGIA. We also saw permanent residence permit stamp #42614/11 signed by Acting Director, Maria Marin. We could not ascertain how her Passport got to Belmopan for the visa stamp before she arrived through the PGIA. She was also issued a "failure to comply" warning in regard to her visa extensions between October and December 2007.
- 73.3 We noted that Ezinne Chinnaya Ngele Udo was recommended for her Belizean nationality by referees, Sandra Gillett of #68 East Collet Canal and by Kimberly Pollard of #63 Bella Vista, Belize City, where on the Reference form it was recorded that they knew her for five (5) years. However, on the General Declaration Form compiled during the interview of Referees conducted by Allan Vargas, a new Referee, Valerie Richardson of Orange Walk Town stated that she knew the applicant for two (2) years only. The form was also incomplete as the Referees did not comment on the character of the applicant.
- 73.4 She was issued her Belizean nationality certificate #28302/13 (date unknown), which was signed by Minister Elvin Penner. We saw the information in the Numbers Book for the 26<sup>th</sup> March 2013. Another nationality certificate #28304, seen in the Numbers Book as recorded on the same date (26<sup>th</sup> March 2013) and issued to Mary Margaret Robinson, was dated 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2013. Ezinne Chinnaya Ngele Udo's oath of allegiance was witnessed on the 26<sup>th</sup> April 2013 by Edmund Zuniga, Commissioner of Supreme Court, of Belmopan. She applied for her Belizean Passport on the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2013 and received Passport #P0239378 issued 18<sup>th</sup> June 2013.

**Ezinne Chinnaya Ngele Udo was a sponsor for Stephen Ogochukwu Obijuru in June 2012**

74. We found (during our Visa investigation) an original visa application form on which Ezinne Udo applied on the 26<sup>th</sup> June 2012 as a visa sponsor for Stephen Ogochukwu Obijuru of Nigeria, whose date of birth was stated as 1<sup>st</sup> September 1984. She used her Belizean permanent residence status (Permit #42614/11) signed on the 10<sup>th</sup> February 2011 by Acting Director, Ms. Maria Marin. The visa application was signed by “Stephen” and dated the 26<sup>th</sup> June 2012. We also saw a copy of Stephen Ogochukwu Obijuru’s native Nigerian Passport #A03604348 issued 17<sup>th</sup> February 2012 with expiration date 16<sup>th</sup> February 2017. The signature on his native Passport appeared similar to that on the visa application although he was just applying for a visa and should not have been in Belize as yet. His visa was approved on the 28<sup>th</sup> June 2012 by Miss Ruth Meighan.

74.2 We also found attached to Ezinne Udo’s visa application a letter of financial support signed and dated 26<sup>th</sup> June 2012 which stated that Stephen Ogochukwu Obijuru was her brother and that she earned \$3,000.00 to \$3,500.00 monthly. That declaration was signed by Carlos G. Walker, Justice of the Peace. Also attached was an undated letter signed by Peter K. Morgan, of Morgan Imports, who stated that she was employed as a Sales Agent at the business since January 2011. We saw a copy of the business certificate for Morgan’s imports also attached to her visa application.

74.3 We did a search at the Business and Companies Registry and saw that Morgan’s Imports had been issued business certificate #14991 dated 15<sup>th</sup> March 2010 and it was owned by Peter Kenneth Morgan and Carlos Gerald Walker, the same JP who witnessed her financial support declaration as an employee of Morgan’s Imports.

**Carlos Walker Justice of the Peace was involved with several other persons whose nationality or Passport process revealed irregularities or fraud during the period reviewed**

75. Carlos Gerald Walker (JP), recommended another Nigerian Ugochukwu Chidozie Nwaeme for Permanent Residence. Ugochukwu Chidozie Nwaeme was issued the same file Number (29032/12) as one Lesly Madrid Pineda. Carlos Gerald Walker also recommended Enis Anibal Ozkan, of Antakya Turkey, for a Belizean Passport on the 13<sup>th</sup> May 2013 and picked up Passport P0236901 issued in the name Anibal Enis Ozkan on the 15<sup>th</sup> May 2013 without a written authority. The applicant had presented irregular manual Passport #A007744 for renewal with issue date 19<sup>th</sup> May 2000 in the name Ans Osscan. He did not present a deed poll to show that his name had been changed and Carlos Walker JP did not write the name of the Ans Osscan on the form 3A although he stated that he knew him for one (1) year.

75.2 Carlos Walker JP also picked up Belizean Passport # P0237926 issued on the 30<sup>th</sup> May 2013 to Baha Ozgur of Istanbul, Turkey, without any written authority. Baha Ozgur had renewed his Belizean Passport #P0078165 issued on the 31<sup>st</sup> January 2008 and stated on his Passport application that he was in possession of Belizean nationality certificate #21638/07 dated 13<sup>th</sup> November 2007.

75.3 Our examination of the Register of Citizens by Registration showed the name of the genuine owner and details for nationality certificate #21638/07 had been covered by correction fluid and the name Baha Ozgur (BNA File # 31699) was recorded. Further investigation is required as to the contents of Baha Ozgur's file.

**Natalia Karpouzoglou who changed her name to Natalya Parker did not qualify for Belizean Nationality but was fraudulently issued Nationality Certificate #27346/12 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012**

76. We saw a Passport application, which was presented to the Passport Office on the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2012 for one Natalya Parker of Athens, Greece, whose date of birth was stated as 12<sup>th</sup> July 1968. The Passport application was not accepted by the Counter Clerk as the signature was missing from the allotted line. The form stated that the applicant's address was 3 ½ Miles Northern Highway (the Northern Highway address was used frequently by persons who fraudulently acquired Belizean nationality) and that her previous name was Natalia Karpouzoglou.

76.2 Attached to the Passport application was a copy of her native Greek Passport #A10732152 issued 26<sup>th</sup> October 2011 with expiry date of 25<sup>th</sup> October 2016, issued in the name Natalia Karpouzoglou. The applicant did not present a Belizean identification such as, a Social Security card to show that she had been living in Belize for over five (5) years and may have been employed. Attached also was a deed poll, which showed that her name was legally changed to Natalya Parker on the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2012. It was witnessed on the 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2012 by Demecio Cal, JP of #19 Suriname Street, Belmopan, who also recommended her for her Belizean Passport on the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2012, stating that he knew her for one year. Attached also was a copy of nationality certificate #27346/12, dated 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012, which was signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo.

76.3 We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and saw that her name was entered after other applicants that received certificates in that series on the 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012. Her name and information was recorded in a different handwriting and in a different colour ink. It appeared as if the space had been reserved in the Register for her and the information was written later after the Nationality file was created. There was no date recorded in the respective column in the Register indicating that she had taken an oath of affirmation as a citizen of Belize.



- 76.4 We noted that the Supervisor of the Passport Section did not sign on the Passport application form to approve its processing and the form also showed that no one issued the Passport or picked it up. However, we saw that she was issued Passport P0193555 on the 29<sup>th</sup> February 2012.
- 76.5 We noted that Natalia Karpouzoglou along with two other persons all changed their surnames to Parker on the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2012 at the Vital Statistics Unit in Belize City. The other two persons were Thierry Rene Marie Bercin, a native of Switzerland who changed her name to Terry Parker and Ioannis Singelidis a native of Greece, who changed his name to John Parker.
- 76.6 We examined Natalia Karpouzoglou's (Natalya Parker) file number 28242/12 and noted the following:
- i. Her nationality file was requested for processing by the then Minister of Immigration, Carlos Perdomo. It was recommended for approval on the 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012 to the Director, Miss Ruth Meighan by Immigration Officer, Nikolai Zelaya. and to Minister Carlos Perdomo by the DINS, Ruth Meighan on the same date. Her nationality application form had the date 1<sup>st</sup> February 2012 written on it, which indicated the date it was received in the Nationality Section and it was signed by what appeared as the handwriting and initial of Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco.
  - ii. The General Declaration section of her application indicated that Natalia Karpouzoglou (Natalya Parker) interview was done by Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco. She was recommended for her Belizean nationality by Yaceli Thompson of Hummingbird Avenue, Belmopan and Yesenia Castillo of Maya Mopan, Belmopan who both stated that they knew her for five (5) years (although her address was 3 ½ Miles Northern Highway). Yaceli Thompson had also referred Xi Wang (James Louis Wang), a Chinese, male on the 29<sup>th</sup> April 2013 for his Belizean nationality. She stated that she knew "her" (Xi Wang) for five (5) years, when he had been approved a single entry visa on the 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013 by Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. That visa was for him to visit Belize as a "tourist". He therefore was not qualified for Belizean nationality issued to him on the 4<sup>th</sup> June 2013. Yaceli Thompson had stated that her address was Guadalupe Street when she fraudulently referred Xi Wang for his Belizean nationality.
  - iii. Her nationality application affidavit was witnessed by Demecio Cal JP of Belmopan. We also saw an irregular copy of her native Greek Passport #A10732152 without the security features seen on the one she presented for her Passport application. We noted that her signature on the copy of her Passport found in her file appeared different from the signature she had presented/inserted/written on her Passport application form.

- iv. The copied pages of Natalia Karpouzoglou's Greek Passport in her nationality file did not have a Belize visa and the dates written in the two Belize arrival stamps for entry through the PGIA appeared illegible. According to her nationality application she had entered Belize in 2001 (no specific date) through the PGIA and that she was living in Belize City from 2001 to the present. There was no evidence of such date on the copies of her native Greek Passport.
- v. A copy of a PR permit stamp (PR# 37096/05) dated 21<sup>st</sup> October 2005 as an "Investor", was stamped on one of the pages of her copied Greek Passport which appears to have the signature of former Director, Mr. Jose Carmen Zetina. That PR stamp appeared to have been fraudulently copied from another Passport.

We could not ascertain how (PR# 37096/05) could have been stamped and issued in Natalia Karpouzoglou's Greek Passport #A10732152, which had an issued date of 26<sup>th</sup> October 2011. The PR permit number was dated six (6) years before the Greek Passport was even printed and issued to her.

- vi. On the General Declaration form where the question asked: "Is applicant legally or illegally in Belize? If legal show proof of status", Miss Ady Pacheco, Immigration officer wrote, "Legal- PR Holder", although it was obvious that that PR stamp on the irregular copy of her native Passport was fraudulently placed there.

The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011, page 11 & 12 (Acceptance of Nationality through Descent) Titled "Application Procedures" requires:

Procedure 2.

"All documents submitted by applicant must be original. A certified copy by the Counter Clerk must be retained and the original copy returned after completion of process."

Procedure 3.

"Documents in any other language must be translated to English. The name, address, and occupation of the translator must be placed on the translated document."

Procedure 4.

"If any doubt arises as to the authenticity of the document, the relevant Foreign Service Office shall authenticate the document prior to acceptance."

Procedure 5.

“The birth certificate of applicants must carry the names of both the applicant and the Belizean national through whom the descent is being sought.....”

76.7 We observed a copy of a native Greek Passport #AI0362792 issued 28<sup>th</sup> September 2011 and with expiry date of 27<sup>th</sup> September 2016 in the name Theodora Syngelidi (DOB 25.11.96). Declaration form was witnessed on the 25<sup>th</sup> April 2012 by Demecio Cal JP of Belmopan, on which Natalya Parker declared that Theodora Syngelidi was her daughter and that she was requesting her addition to her nationality certificate #27346/12. We did not see a copy of the birth certificate for Theodora Syngelidi to prove that she was not the daughter of Natalia Karpouzoglou's (Natalya Parker) nor did we see an application for child addition to Natalia Karpouzoglou's nationality certificate.

76.8 We noted again, the role of Ady Pacheco in the fraudulent granting of nationality where she wrote a note on the 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2012 via the Minute Sheet of Natalia Karpouzoglou's nationality file to the Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. The note certified that Natalia Karpouzoglou had acquired Belizean nationality and requested the addition of her daughter. The request was approved on the 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2012 by Miss Ruth Meighan although it was obvious that Natalia Karpouzoglou had fraudulently acquired Belizean nationality; hence, her daughter Theodora Syngelidi did not qualify for Belizean nationality. Director, Miss Ruth Meighan recommended the application to the Minister, Carlos Perdomo, for addition of the child Theodora Syngelidi to her mother's nationality certificate, one (1) week after the request was made via declaration form by Natalya Parker.

76.9 We did not see a copy of the nationality certificate with the addition of Theodora Syngelidi's name nor any evidence that she had been issued a Belizean Passport before September 2013. Theodora Syngelidi name may have also been changed before she had applied for a Belizean Passport.

76.10 Natalia Karpouzoglou did not qualify for Belize Nationality and was fraudulently issued nationality certificate #27346/12 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012. In addition, her alleged daughter was fraudulently added to the said certificate.

76.11 We noted that the same appeared to have been the case with Thierry Rene Marie Bercin who changed her name to Terry Parker and Ioannis Singelidis who changed his name to John Parker. But their Nationality files, if they existed at the time we requested them, were not be presented to Audit.

76.12 We observed that Thierry Rene Marie Bercin, a native of Switzerland who changed her name to Terry Parker was issued her Belizean Passport #P0193554 in her new name and Ioannis Singelidis, a native of Greece, who changed his name to John Parker, was issued his Belizean Passport #P0193556 in his new name. All three persons, Natalia Parker, Terry

Parker and John Parker Passport applications indicated processing irregularities and were not signed by the OIC, Passport Section, Mrs. Sharon Neal Flowers. The forms did not have the signatures of the officer/s who issued the Passports or the signatures of the recipients.

76.13 We noted that Thierry Rene Marie Bercin was issued her Belize nationality certificate #27347/12 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012 and Ioannis Singelidis was issued his Belize nationality certificate #27342/12 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> February 2012. Minister Carlos Perdomo signed both nationality certificate but s no entry was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration.

76.14 The Certificate Numbers Book showed that certificate number 27342 was issued to Ioannis Singelidis and his nationality file number was 2836 while Thierry Rene Marie Bercin was issued certificate number 27347/12 and her nationality file number was 28241. We requested their nationality files but we did not receive said files.

76.15 We found other persons who were approved visas and were issued nationality certificates or had nationality applications pending as shown at **Table Y**.

**Table Y**

The following is the list of more persons who were approved visas and who we found had been issued nationality certificates or had pending nationality applications

| <b>Name of Visa &amp; Nationality Applicant</b>                                      | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Date of Visa Application &amp; Visa Number Approved</b> | <b>Visa Application Accepted by/ Approved By</b> | <b>BNA File #</b>     | <b>Date of Application for Nationality</b> | <b>BNA File Status Comments</b>  |
|--|-------------------------|--|--|-----------------------|--|--|
| Denzel Lerone Hernandez Brooks<br><br>(Visa Sponsor was Reverend Charles David Goff) | Honduras                | V0006839/ 14 <sup>th</sup> December 2011                   | Ady Pacheco/ No approval of DINS signature       | 29156/12 (Section 10) | 28th June 2012                             | "vetted and sent to DINS 24th May 2013"<br><br>The Numbers Book showed that he was assigned Nationality certificate #28438/13 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> June 2013. |
| Ki Jun Jeun<br><br>(Visa Sponsor was Chulsoo Park)                                   | Korea                   | 26832/12 <sup>th</sup> December 2011                       | Martin Guy/ Ruth Meighan                         | 29788/13 (Section 10) | 19th June 2013                             | "General declaration completed"  |
| Jia Li Ruan  | China                   | 26882/ 27 <sup>th</sup>                                    | Ady  | 27792/13              | 16th January                               | "Interview needed"   |

| <b>Name of Visa &amp; Nationality Applicant</b>   | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Date of Visa Application &amp; Visa Number Approved</b> | <b>Visa Application Accepted by/ Approved By</b>                 | <b>BNA File #</b> | <b>Date of Application for Nationality</b>     | <b>BNA File Status Comments</b>  |
|---|-------------------------|--|--|-------------------|--|--|
| (Visa sponsor was Wei Chi Yan)  |                         | January 2012   | Pacheco accepted; Gordon Wade recommended; Ruth Meighan approved | (Section 10)      | 2013   |  |
| Shu Feng Chen (Shufeng Chen) (Letters recommending Visa were signed by Minister Erwin Contreras and Godwin Hulse) | China                   | 35288/ 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2012                      | Not seen   | 28869/12          | No date recorded when application was received | “Vetted and sent to DINS 22 <sup>nd</sup> May 2013”<br><br>The Numbers Book showed that he was assigned Nationality certificate #28400 dated 28 <sup>th</sup> May 2013 |
| Yong Xiong Zheng (Letters recommending Visa were signed by  | China                   | 35289/ 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2012                      | Not seen   | 26409/12          | No date recorded when application was received | “Application incomplete; needs to change application form”   |

| <b>Name of Visa<br/>&amp; Nationality<br/>Applicant</b> | <b>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Date of Visa<br/>Application &amp;<br/>Visa Number<br/>Approved</b> | <b>Visa<br/>Application<br/>Accepted<br/>by/<br/>Approved<br/>By</b> | <b>BNA File #</b> | <b>Date of<br/>Application for<br/>Nationality</b> | <b>BNA File<br/>Comments</b> | <b>Status</b> |
|---|-----------------------------|--|--|-------------------|--|------------------------------|---------------|
| Minister Erwin<br>Contreras and<br>Godwin Hulse)        |                             |  |  |                   |  |                              |               |

## **Individuals who did not qualify for Belizean Nationality through Marriage were issued Belizean Citizenship**

Section 11. (1-3a-c) of the Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 states:

*“Subject to the other provisions of this Part, no person who is the spouse, or the widow or widower, of a citizen of Belize by descent or registration shall be registered as a citizen of Belize under this Act, except in accordance with the succeeding provisions of this section.*

*(2) A person who desires to be registered as a citizen of Belize under this section shall send an application in the prescribed form and manner to the prescribed officer.*

*(3) After the receipt of the application under subsection (2), the prescribed officer shall send the application to the Minister, if he is satisfied that the applicant has the following qualifications-*

*(a) That the applicant has the qualifications specified in paragraph (a) and (c) of subsection (1) of section 10;*

*Section 10 subsection (1a) reads: that the applicant is of full age and of sound mind; & (c) that the applicant is, and intends to continue to be, ordinarily resident in Belize*

*(b) That the applicant has been resident in Belize throughout a period of one year immediately preceding the date of the application of such applicant; and*

*(c) That the applicant is the spouse, or the widow or widower, of a citizen of Belize by descent or registration.*

Also subsection (4) states,

*“For the purpose of the residency requirement specified in subsection (3) (b) above, if any applicant marries a Belizean citizen, such applicant shall be deemed to have been legally resident in Belize from the date of such marriage, **notwithstanding that he might have entered Belize illegally.**”*

77. The requirement for applicants through marriage to have one year residence in Belize was also seen in the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011, titled Acceptance of Nationality Application Section 11 (Form G) page 9 which states at requirement #6:



“Proof of one year domicile period in Belize: The applicant must be residing in Belize one year preceding the date of application. Belizean nationality document of spouse must be submitted example: Belize birth certificate, Belize passport or Belize Nationality Certificate. Only marriage certificates issued by the Vital Statistics Office in Belize City will be accepted. Foreign marriage certificates must be authenticated by the Foreign Service office of the applicant.”

77.2 In addition, page 29 of the Policy and Procedures Manual July 2011 titled “Referral System” quoted at paragraph 45 above is also relevant.

77.3 This process is done at the end of the first interview conducted with the applicants for Nationality. The Investigating Officer shall in a timely manner visit the premises of the applicants and conduct covert and overt information gathering to ensure legitimacy of application and prepare and submit report attesting to such to DINS. Files to be referred are:

1. All applications through marriage (Section 11)
2. Applications submitted by nationals of: 1. Russia....
3. Any other national that the Director may require further vetting.”

**Peter William Dahlstrom a native of Sweden did not qualify for Belizean nationality and was issued nationality certificate number 28265/12**

78. In our Passport report referenced Section III we outlined at the processing irregularities observed for Peter William Dahlstrom’s Passport applications, one dated 5<sup>th</sup> April 2012 and the other dated 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2012 through which he was issued Passport number P0220900 on the 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2012. His nationality certificate #28265 attached to his 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2012 Passport application was dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 and was signed by Minister Godwin Hulse.

As a result, we requested his file and we found that Mr. Dahlstrom, was a consultant and he submitted his application for Belizean nationality on 5<sup>th</sup> April 2012 (the same day he had submitted his previous Passport application form) stating that his Belize address was #61 Southern Foreshore, Belize City. He was born in Tranas, Sweden on the 12<sup>th</sup> January 1967 and had applied for Belizean nationality through marriage (Section 11). The copy of a marriage certificate showed that he was married on 8<sup>th</sup> October 1994 to Sherrette Normandeen Simplis at Sacred Heart Church, Cayo, Belize. His Nationality Referees were Dean Barrow, Attorney at Law, and Kim Simplis Barrow, First Lady of #6038 Seashore Drive, Belize City who stated that they had known the applicant for 20 years. The date of their Declaration by persons supporting the application was the 5<sup>th</sup> April 2012.

78.2 We observed some irregularities in Mr. Dahlstrom's nationality file which indicated that he did not qualify for Belizean nationality through Section 11 (Marriage) as follows:

- 1) On his application he wrote, "Eventually want to reside in Belize". (The regulations state that the applicant has to be resident and intends to continue to be, ordinarily resident in Belize).
- 2) On his application and in the interview of the applicant, he "have (sic) been spending 4-6 weeks in Belize every year for the last 20 years". (The regulations state that the applicant qualifies if he has been resident in Belize throughout a period of one year immediately preceding the date of the application of such applicant).

On the Nationality Application form, question 8 requests the periods of applicant's residence in Belize. His visits were noted on the form as follows:

- a) April 2<sup>nd</sup> 2012 to now (April 5<sup>th</sup> 2012 was the date of his application)
  - b) 23<sup>rd</sup> December 2012 to 16<sup>th</sup> January 2012 (**should have been 23<sup>rd</sup> December 2011**)
  - c) 1<sup>st</sup> July 2011 to 3<sup>rd</sup> October 2011
  - d) 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 to 30<sup>th</sup> April 2011
  - e) 20<sup>th</sup> December 2011 to 4<sup>th</sup> February 2011 (**should have been 20<sup>th</sup> December 2010**)
- 3) His Swedish Passport #53494662 issued 8<sup>th</sup> May 2007 and his European Union Passport #84199017 issued 19<sup>th</sup> February 2012 did not show that he had been resident in Belize throughout a period of one year immediately preceding the date of his application.
  - 4) Miss Ady Pacheco, Immigration Officer, who interviewed the applicant, wrote on the minute sheet to the Director that he "qualifies for Citizenship under Section 11 of the Nationality Act, when he did not.
  - 5) The Section of Part IV of his application form which should have been completed by HQ Vetting officer: CIDAPS Check, CRO Check, JICC Check and signed by the HQ Vetting Officer was not completed.
  - 6) He was recommended for nationality on 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, who wrote to the Minister on the Minute Sheet of his file that the applicant "meets legal requirements" when he did not.
  - 7) Minister Godwin Hulse who signed his nationality certificate number 29575/12 may have read the note on the first page of his application, which stated, "have (has) been spending 4-6 weeks in Belize every year for the last 20 years".

It was obvious to anyone who handled the file after the note was written that Peter William Dahlstrom did not meet the one year residency requirement for nationality through marriage since it was specifically stated on the application.

- 8) His Nationality application did not have the date and signature of the Counter Clerk who accepted the application. That was in violation of Requirement 1 (Page 9) of the Policy and Procedures Manual July 1, 2011 titled "Acceptance of Nationality Application Section 11 Form G)" which requires: ".....Please write on the front of the application form the file number, date it was received and name and signature of the accepting officer."
- 9) No evidence found in his nationality file that the Referral System was utilized in regard to applicants through Marriage. That is a requirement of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011, on page 13 titled "Interview conducted for Nationality through Registration" and which was to be executed by the Investigation Unit of the Department.
- 10) The General Declaration (Interview) was dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012, the same date the nationality certificate number 28265 was signed by Minister Godwin Hulse.
- 11) The date of departure from his country of origin and the date of entry into Belize was not recorded on the form.
- 12) Part III of the application for References was incomplete.
- 13) A copy of an expired manual Belize Passport number A007610 with issue date 1<sup>st</sup> March 2000 and expiry date 29<sup>th</sup> February 2010 as issued to Sherret Normandeen Dahlstrom in Belize City, which did not have an INS stamp over the photo. An expired form of identification should not have been accepted by the Nationality Section.

78.3 Through Section 11 of the Nationality Act, Peter William Dahlstrom received his Belizean nationality (certificate number 28265/12 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012). His name was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration and the Numbers Book for certificate number 28265 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012.

78.4 We saw the BPIS Passport application for the 5<sup>th</sup> April 2012 and it showed that his data capture was performed by Petula Peyrefitte, Clerk. The record showed a fraudulent nationality certificate #1111111111 dated the 5<sup>th</sup> April 2012. (It was a bogus certificate number used on the system. The BPIS accepts any certificate number and does not verify the validity of the number entered).

This was the same day the Declaration by persons supporting his Nationality Application (Referees) was signed by Dean Barrow, Attorney at Law and by Kim Simplis Barrow, First Lady. It was also the same date he had written on his Nationality application. We could not determine if a Passport had been issued to him for that Passport application but we saw that two Passports had been issued in his wife's name: P0194116 in the name Sherrett Normandeen Dahlstrom and P0194117 in the name Sherrett Normandeen Dahlstrom on the same day. P0194116 was seen among the cancelled Passports. Her Passport application form was not presented to Audit along with other Passport applications for Passports issued in the entire series P0193985 to P0194447.

78.5 Peter William Dahlstrom received Belizean Passport #P0220900 issued on the 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2012 through his second Passport application.

**Olena Moskalyk (Curly) did not qualify for Belize Nationality and was issued Belize Nationality Certificate number 27467/12 while Mykola Moskalyk did not qualify for Belize Nationality and was added to Belize Nationality Certificate number 27467/12**

79. We found two visa applications dated the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012 for single entry Belize visas for Olena Moskalyk, born in Ukraine, date of birth 16<sup>th</sup> August 1986 and for her child Mykola Moskalyk, born in Ukraine, date of birth 5<sup>th</sup> May 2008. Coco Beach was recorded as her residential address. She indicated that the purpose of her visit to Belize was "business". Sections 1.15 ('Contact Details'), 2.1, 2.2 ("On which date will you leave Belize") 2.5, 3.1 & 3.2 of the visa application were incomplete. She also indicated on her visa application at Section 4.1 that she had not travelled to Belize in the last 10 years. She did not indicate on the child's application if he had travelled to Belize in the last 10 years. Both visa applications appeared to have been signed by Olena Moskalyk. No photo was provided for both visa applications. The visa applications were approved by Immigration Officer, Ruby Gutierrez; no date of approval was recorded on the visa application for Olena Moskalyk but the date on Mykola's application by the approver, Immigration Officer, Ruby Gutierrez, was 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012. They were issued visa numbers V00029131 and V00029132 (control numbers 109 and 110/12 respectively) at the Belize Northern Border Station.

79.2 We examined her nationality file and it showed inconsistencies including two (2) different dates of entry into Belize. Her application was not signed and dated by the Accepting Officer at the Nationality Section in accordance with Requirement 1 (Page 9) of the Policy and Procedures Manual July 1, 2011 titled "Acceptance of Nationality Application Section 11 Form G)" which requires: ".....Please write on the front of the application form the file number, date it was received and name and signature of the accepting officer."

79.3 We noted that she applied for Belizean nationality through Marriage (Section 11 of Chapter 161 of the Immigration and Nationality Act). The name on the file was Olena Mockajtwik (corrected after her first name was recorded as Oteha).

Her name inside the file under her photograph was recorded as Oneha Moskalyk and her child's name was recorded as Makogin Mockajak. Her nationality application was written in the name Oteha Olena Mockajtwik. On the General Declaration dated 25<sup>th</sup> January 2012, her name was written as Oteha Olena Mockaj. Those errors in her name suggested that the application and file may have been prepared before by someone else or Olena Moskalyk came into the Immigration office and that she could not have submitted her nationality application since she would have known how to spell her name.

79.4 We observed that the file had a copy of an undated letter with letterhead and a request that read as follows:

*“Hon Edmond Castro “Clear the Land” Castro  
Minister of State in the Ministry of Works*

*I hereby recommend for the file of **Oteha Mocajtwik** (BNA#28077/12) to be send (sic) to the Director of Immigration desk to be expedited. Thank you for your assistants (sic).*

*(Signed)  
Hon Edmond Castro  
Minister of State in the Ministry of Works  
210-2393”*

79.5 We saw that the section on her nationality application for spouse information was not completed. The form stated that her husband's name was John Curly, a native of Slovakia who was a “business owner”. Her address was recorded as 2 miles Northern Highway, Belize City. A copy of Belizean Passport #P0123596 with issue date 19<sup>th</sup> January 2010 was seen in the name John Paul Curly. The BPIS showed that John Paul Curly used nationality certificate #13523 issued on the 26<sup>th</sup> October 2000 to apply for his Belizean Passport.

However, a search of the Register of Citizens by Registration showed that certificate # 13523 had been issued to Royse Hosman Compos (BNA File #14254) and had been destroyed on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2009 and could not have been reissued. Nationality certificates in that series had been issued in February and March of 2001. It appeared that her husband did not genuinely receive Belizean Nationality and Passport; therefore, her application for nationality through marriage should not have been honoured by the INS.

- 79.6 We saw what appeared as an unofficial English translation on the 24<sup>th</sup> January 2012 of a birth certificate certified by Belizean Manuel Soler (JP) for Mykola Moskalyk in Olena Moskalyk's nationality file, which stated that she was his mother and his father was Volodimirovich Moskalyk. There was neither a copy of a divorce certificate nor a copy of the original native birth certificate of Mykola Moskalyk seen in her nationality file.
- 79.7 We also saw a copy of a marriage certificate from the Belize Vital Statistics Unit in the names Olena Moskalyk (Spinster) and John Paul Curly (Bachelor) both of 2 Miles Northern Road, Belize City, for a marriage that took place in Ladyville on the 14<sup>th</sup> February 2011 and was performed by Pastor Maurice Westby. Her Nationality application stated that she was married at "Court". The visa application, on which she did not use her married name "Curly", stated that she entered Belize on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012 and indicated (by a check of the relevant box) that she had not travelled to Belize in the last ten years. The marriage was seen recorded at the Vital Statistics Unit (VSU) in Belize City. The date of issue recorded on the copy of the marriage certificate by the VSU was 19<sup>th</sup> January 2012 fifteen (15) days before she arrived in Belize).
- 79.8 We noted that the application stated that she had been residing in Belize since the 15<sup>th</sup> August 2006. Immigration Officer, Liandro Quischan noted on a page of her native Ukraine Passport EH550432 issued 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2010; expired 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2020: "transferred from Ukraine P/P# EC687266 issued 15.8.2006" and also on another Passport page copy "kindly note that bearer previously travelled on Ukraine Passport EC687266 issued 15.8.2006. DOA (date of arrival in Belize) **2.6.2010** via San Pedro, obtained ext. until 11.01.2012 also obtained TEP#554/Bze/11 issued 15.12.11 exp. 14.12.12, now being transferred to this Passport (signed) 3.1.12". This note was stamped with a Belize City Immigration stamp. No copy of her previous Ukraine Passport # EC687266 issued 15<sup>th</sup> August 2006 was seen in her nationality file to confirm the date of entry recorded on her application. However, we know that she arrived in Belize on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012 through the Belize Northern Border. The Immigration stamp seen on her native Ukraine Passport EH550432 issued 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2010 with expiry date 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2020 is outlined at **Table Z** below.

**Table Z**

The following is the Immigration stamp seen on the copy of Olena Moskalyk's native Ukraine Passport EH550432

| Type of Stamp                               | Date of Stamp                | Period Approved  | Description of Stamp          | Signature of Permit Approver/Belize Immigration Officer |
|---|------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|---|
| Temporary Employment Permit INS Belize City | 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2012 | Does not remain longer than 14 <sup>th</sup> December 2012 | Self Employed/ Business Owner | Liandro Quischan  |

79.9 We also saw Immigration stamps on the copies of Ukraine native Passport #A0721928 issued 28<sup>th</sup> November 2011 with expiry date 28<sup>th</sup> November 2014 for Mykola Moskalyk. Copy of the biographic page of Passport #A0721928 was seen and what appeared as copies of Passport pages only for Passport #A0289353 (issue and expiration date unknown). A note was seen written by Immigration Officer, Liandro Quischan, on a page of Passport #A0721928 stating, "Bearer previously travelled on Ukraine P/P A0289353 dated 4.6.09. D.O.A (date of arrival in Belize) **9.2.11** via San Pedro. Obtained extensions until 27.11.11 (signed) and dated 15.12.11 and stamped with a Belize City Immigration stamp. There were also other Immigration stamps seen on the copied pages (numbered and unnumbered) of his native Passports as outlined at **Table ZA** below.

**Table ZA**

The following are the Immigration stamps seen on the copies of Mykola Moskaluk's native Ukraine Passport #A0721928 and copied pages of #A0289353

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>  | <b>Date of Stamp</b>          | <b>Period Approved</b>          | <b>Description of Stamp</b>                          | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer</b> |
|---|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|--|
| Visa # PL6800813 for an unidentified Foreign Country (on Passport page #A0289353) | 3 <sup>rd</sup> August 2009   | Unknown                         | Unknown  | Unknown  |
| Mexico Arrival Stamp (no Passport # on page)                                      | Date not legible              | Unknown                         | Unknown  | Unknown  |
| Unknown Arrival Stamp (no Passport # on page)                                     | 31 <sup>st</sup> August 20--  | 30 <sup>th</sup> September 20-- | Visitor Permit to Belize                             | Unknown Signature  |
| Mexico Sticker Visa #C524291 (on Passport page #A0289353)                         | 31 <sup>st</sup> January 2011 | 31 <sup>st</sup> January 2016   | Issued in KIEV                                       | N/A  |
| Departure Stamp San Pedro (on Passport page #A0289353)                            | 30 <sup>th</sup> February---  | N/A                             | Not legible  | N/A  |
| Wet Belize Visa Stamp #115 (issued in Mexico) (on Passport page #A0289353)        | 8 <sup>th</sup> February 2011 | Up to May 7 <sup>th</sup> 2011  | Visa for Belize Honorary Consul for Belize in Mexico | Lic. Jorge L.---- Gomez                                      |



| <b>Type of Stamp</b>   | <b>Date of Stamp</b>          | <b>Period Approved</b>                      | <b>Description of Stamp</b>                                 | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer</b> |
|--|-------------------------------|---|---|--|
| Belize arrival stamp (on Passport page #A0289353)                                | 9 <sup>th</sup> February 2011 | Up to 8 <sup>th</sup> March 2011            | (Stamp not legible to identify border)                      | Unknown  |
| Visa Extension Stamp<br>Belize City<br>(no Passport # on page)                   | Date not legible              | Remain up to 27 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 | Permitted to remain...does not remain in Belize longer than | Not legible  |
| Visa Extension Stamp<br>#37, Belmopan<br>(on Passport page #A0289353)            | 27 <sup>th</sup> April 2011   | Remain up to 8 <sup>th</sup> May 2011       | Permitted to remain...does not remain in Belize longer than | Unknown  |
| Visa Extension Stamp<br>(appeared as --- Town)<br>(on Passport page #A0289353)   | 6 <sup>th</sup> May 2011      | Remain up to 6 <sup>th</sup> June 2011      | Permitted to remain...does not remain in Belize longer than | Unknown  |
| Visa Extension Stamp<br>#37, Belmopan<br>(on Passport page #A0289353)            | 4 <sup>th</sup> June 2011     | Remain up to 6 <sup>th</sup> September 2011 | Permitted to remain...does not remain in Belize longer than | Unknown  |
| Wet Belize Visa Stamp<br>#300 (issued in Mexico)<br>(on Passport page #A0289353) | 20 <sup>th</sup> July 2011    | Up to 29 <sup>th</sup> October 2011         | Visa for Belize<br>Honorary Consul for Belize in Mexico     | Lic. Jorge L.---- Gomez                                      |
| Belize Departure Stamp<br>(on Passport page                                      | 29 <sup>th</sup> July 2011    | N/A   | Not legible   | N/A  |

| Type of Stamp   | Date of Stamp               | Period Approved                         | Description of Stamp  | Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer |
|---|-----------------------------|---|---|---|
| #A0289353)  |                             |   |   |   |
| Belize Arrival Stamp<br>(on Passport page<br>#A0289353)                           | 5 <sup>th</sup> August 2011 | Up to 4 <sup>th</sup> September<br>2011 | Not legible   | N/A   |
| Dependant Permit<br>(Belize City<br>Immigration) on<br>Passport page<br>#A0721928 | 15th December 2011          | Up to 26th November<br>2012             | Dependant of Olena<br>Moskalyk residing at<br>#24 Coconut Dr. San---<br>- | Liandro Quischan                                      |

- 79.10 We saw no evidence on the copies of Olena Moskalyk and Mykola Moskalyk's Passports pages of their arrival at the Northern Border Station on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012. Also the date of submission of their nationality application was unknown. A copy of Police Report dated 24<sup>th</sup> January 2012 for Olena Moskalyk was seen in her file. It was searched, checked and certified correct by an unknown Police Officer for Eleanor Ramirez W/Sgt. and signed by J. Sabal for Miguel Segura, ACP for Commissioner of Police.
- 79.11 We noted that Olena Moskalyk's nationality referees were Melissa Rosado of #10 Arizona Road, who stated that she knew her for one year and that "she does babysitting". The other Referee, Rosita Soler of #12 Arizona Road, Ladyville, stated that she knew the applicant for one year and "she does babysitting job for him". The applicant had stated on both her nationality application and Passport application that she was a "web designer". Both referees signed the declaration section of the application on the 24<sup>th</sup> January 2012.
- 79.12 We saw no evidence in her nationality file that the Referral System was utilized in regard to applicants through Marriage as is required by the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011, which was to be executed by the Investigation Unit of the Department.
- 79.13 We noted that Olena Moskalyk Curly presented a Passport application on the 24<sup>th</sup> February 2012 which stated her address as 2 Miles Northern Highway. Her Passport recommender on the 20<sup>th</sup> February 2012 was private contractor and JP, Manuel Soler of #374 Los Lagos, Ladyville who stated that he knew the applicant for one year.
- 79.14 We also saw attached to her Passport application was nationality Certificate # 27467/12 dated 9<sup>th</sup> February 2012, dated three days after she entered Belize through the Northern Border. It was signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. At the back of her Nationality certificate was a child addition for Mykola Moskalyk dated 10<sup>th</sup> February 2012 and signed by what appeared as the signature of Minister Carlos Perdomo.
- 79.15 We did not see an entry for certificate #27467/12 in the Register of Citizens by Registration. Her name was seen in the Numbers Book for certificate #27467 along with those certificates signed on the 9<sup>th</sup> February 2012. The name of Mykola Moskalyk was not seen entered in the Numbers Book.
- 79.16 We observed that Olena Moskalyk Curly was issued her Belizean Passport P0193300 with issue date as 24<sup>th</sup> February 2012. It appeared that Manuel Soler (her Passport recommender) also picked up her Belizean Passport but no written authority or identification of Manuel Soler was seen attached to her Passport application.

Mykola Moskalyk was issued his Belizean Passport P0193301 on the 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012.

**Ji Wang a Public Officer and native of Shandong China who did not qualify for Belizean Nationality was issued Nationality Certificate #28349/13**

80. We observed that Ji Wang who was born in Shandong China and whose date of birth was stated as 5<sup>th</sup> June 1963 submitted his visa application on the 11<sup>th</sup> October 2012 for a re-entry visa since the applicant claimed that he had to have travelled to China for “personal reasons”. His application was approved by the former Director, Ruth Meighan and he was issued visa # 34666 dated 11<sup>th</sup> October 2012 through the Belmopan Office. His date of re-entry was expected to be the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2013.

80.2 We saw attached to his visa application a copy of nationality application receipt #6134 dated the 21<sup>st</sup> February 2012 for Ji Wang, signed by Sheila Samuels. The form stated “Immigration Officer for Belize acknowledge receipt of Nationality application plus: (documents submitted were listed)”. The receipt stated that his BNA File # was 26841/12. We examined the nationality file diary and did not see his name or the file #26841 recorded. We noted that the file numbering for that series which was issued on the 29<sup>th</sup> December 2011 was not sequential and it jumped from BNA file #26838 to BNA file #26849. BNA Files #s 26839 to 26848 were missing from the File Diary. We also noted that no BNA file numbers were issued on the 21<sup>st</sup> February 2012 as the File Diary recorded that BNA File #27739 had been issued on the 15<sup>th</sup> February 2012 and then BNA File #27740 had been issued on the 24<sup>th</sup> February 2012. The next date more BNA file numbers were issued was the 13<sup>th</sup> March 2012. We also observed that the officer who signed the nationality application receipt #6134 (dated the 21<sup>st</sup> February 2012) for Ji Wang was Sheila Samuels who was a former Clerk in the Registry Section of the INS and not an Immigration Officer. It appeared that BNA File #26841/12 was reserved in December 2011 and may have been later dated as though it was opened on the 21<sup>st</sup> February 2012. However, the entries in the File Diary did not reflect what was on BNA Receipt #6134 for Ji Wang.

80.3 We observed that **Ji Wang** was issued Nationality certificate #28349/ 13 on the 24<sup>th</sup> April 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner. BNA File number 26841/12 was requested and we noted several irregularities during the examination of his Visa, Nationality and Passport application and documents as outlined below:

- 1) His “re-entry” visa application was incomplete as Part 3: Present Occupation and Part 4: Travel History was not filled in.
- 2) On Form 8 of the Immigration Act, Chapter 156 is an outline of the legal document authorized under Section 18 for Re-entry Permits. Ji Wang was not issued a re-entry permit to re-enter Belize as is required by the Nationality Act for persons who had already been domiciled in Belize if such was the case. The visa application showed that he applied for a visa on 11<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to re-enter Belize on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2013.

Although the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan approved the visa on 11<sup>th</sup> October 2012, there was no request for “travel to China for personal reasons” attached and approved by the Director. It was only stated on the visa.

- 3) A copy of his native Passport was not seen in his nationality file to verify that he had entered Belize prior to January 2013 (the date he stated he would have re-entered Belize). There was also no evidence that he had acquired Permanent Residence status and had been in Belize prior to May 2013 when he applied for his Belizean Passport.
- 4) The signature seen on the Visa application dated 11<sup>th</sup> October 2012 and those seen as applicant and as recipient of Ji Wang’s Belizean Passport P0236503 dated 10<sup>th</sup> May 2013 did not match. That evidence suggested that he may not have been in Belize to apply for the visa issued as a “re-entry visa which stated that he was scheduled to return to Belize on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2013.
- 5) Attached to the visa application was also a copy of a marriage certificate, which showed that he was married to a naturalized Belizean, Jiabi Nunez, previously Jiabia Yao (holder of P0238448 issued 5<sup>th</sup> June 2013) whose children were listed as Yue Du and Yicheng Du. The certified copy of duplicate original marriage certificate reflected that the marriage allegedly took place at the General Registry on the 7<sup>th</sup> January 2011. The marriage officer’s name stated was E. O. Pennil.
- 6) The copy of Ji Wang’s Belizean Social Security card # 000512545 which he used to apply for his Belizean Passport was issued on the 29<sup>th</sup> April 2013, five days after his nationality Certificate was signed by Minister Elvin Penner on the 24<sup>th</sup> April 2013. The copy of the marriage register for marriage stated that he was a Public Officer when he got married on the 7<sup>th</sup> January 2011. We could not ascertain why he was not in possession of a social security card prior to 2013 if he had been employed from 2011 as a Public Officer.

We searched Government Smart stream and saw no evidence of Ji Wang having been a Public Officer. We saw a Wang/Shu Tsai who had been employed by the Ministry of Natural Resources as a System Technician during the period 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2001 to 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2004. His date of Birth was stated as 6<sup>th</sup> June, 1978 and his address was 6 Belize Street, Belmopan, Cayo.

- 7) A copy of Belizean nationality certificate #19371/06 dated 28<sup>th</sup> May 2007 signed by former Minister of Immigration, Ralph Fonseca, in the name of Jiabi Nunez. A check of the Register of Citizens by Registration under Section 11 (Marriage) showed that the previous entry for #19371/06 was wiped out with liquid paper and the name Jiabi Yao was written in the Register (BNA File #20582).

She renewed her Belizean Passport in 2011 and was issued Passport# P0182032 dated 20th October 2011, in the name Jiabi Wang. Her Passport application was not presented to us.

Further investigation is required to ascertain the contents of her file in order to know if she had acquired Belizean nationality genuinely.

- 8) No evidence that the Referral system for applications under Section 11 was seen. This special investigation would have been needed to authenticate the marriage of Ji Wang to Jiabi Nunez since she had previously gotten Belizean nationality through marriage and was again marrying in order for Ji Wang to receive Belizean nationality through marriage.
- 9) He listed no contact phone number on his Passport application dated 10<sup>th</sup> May 2013 to suggest/indicate that he had been living in Belize prior to the date of his application.
- 10) Ji Wang's Passport recommenders were Denese M. Petzold, Teacher, and Emory Young JP, both of Belmopan, who stated that they had known the applicant for 1 year. Ji Wang's address was stated as #7386 Antelope Street Extension, Belize City. Those two persons were also the Passport recommenders for Osama Khaled Harmouch, native of El Sfireh, Lebanon who also may not have been in the country for the required time to qualify for Belizean nationality as outlined further in this report.

He applied for and was issued his Belizean Passport #P0236503 dated 10<sup>th</sup> May 2013.

80.4 Further investigation is required to ascertain why Sheila Samuels, Immigration Registry Clerk would have issued a file number that was not recorded in the file diary and wrote a date on it that was not seen in the Diary. The BNA receipt book would also have to be examined to verify that receipt #6134 was for the Feb 2012 period as it appeared that it may have been issued later in 2013 when Ji Wang came to Belize.

**Geetu Chaudhary (Chaudhary Geetu) a native of India did not qualify for Belizean Nationality through marriage but was issued Nationality Certificate #28338 /13**

81. We saw that Chaudhary Geetu who was born in India and whose date of birth was stated as the 15<sup>th</sup> April 1982 submitted a visa application form dated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2012 to the Belmopan Office. The purpose of her visit was "Tourist" but she did not indicate the expected date of her travel to and from Belize. She was approved Multiple Visa entry # 31473 on the same day by the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan.

81.2 We also saw attached to her visa application was a copy of native Indian Passport #J2593730 issued on 4<sup>th</sup> February 2011 in the name Geetu Verma. There was no evidence to show that she was married to her sponsor Avnesh Chaudhary who claimed to be her husband and Managing Director of Ganesh Company Ltd formerly Vicar Company Ltd located at the Commercial Free Zone. We saw a copy of Belizean Passport #P0087742 issued 18<sup>th</sup> June 2008 in the name Avnesh Chaudhary attached to her visa application. Also attached was a dependant permit dated 14<sup>th</sup> December 2011 in the name Geetu Verma Chaudhary on which it was stated that she was given up to the 13<sup>th</sup> December 2012 to enter Belize.

81.3 We noted that she was issued Belizean nationality on the 24<sup>th</sup> April, 2013 although she had not entered Belize up to the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2012, (the date of her visa application). She could not have resided in Belize for the one year consecutively as a person who was married to a Belizean citizen by Registration up to the time she received her Belizean nationality on the 24<sup>th</sup> April 2013. She received nationality certificate 28338/13 dated 24<sup>th</sup> April 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner.

81.4 We also saw a copy of Belize Social Security card #000294007 issued 7<sup>th</sup> June 2013, after she received her Belizean nationality. Her Belizean Passport recommenders were Yareni Smith, Teacher of Santa Rita Layout who stated that she knew her for one (1) year as: “guardian of a school child at the school I teach” and David Rejon JP of Corozal Town who first wrote that he had known her for two years and then wrote one year as: “friend’s wife”.

81.5 We examined her nationality file and found out that she first entered Belize on the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 through the Belize Northern Border. That arrival date was before Avnesh Chaudhary had applied on the 14<sup>th</sup> December 2011 for a Dependant Permit #065/Czl/11 which gave her until the 13<sup>th</sup> December 2012 to enter Belize. The permit implied that she had not come to Belize as yet. The copied pages of her native Indian Passport #J2593730 issued 4<sup>th</sup> February 2011 with expiry date 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2021 seen in the file had no page numbers. We saw a stamp with the words “Visa for Belize” issued by U.K Modi, Honorary Consul but the place it was issued was not legible. The visa was for single entry as a “Tourist” and dated 30<sup>th</sup> November 2011 for entry before e 29<sup>th</sup> February 2012 (an entire year). The arrival stamp for Belize was not legible but the highlighted date of arrival on the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 was seen. The other Immigration and Belize stamps were not legible.

The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011 (Acceptance of Nationality Application Section 11 (Form G) page 9, Requirement #6 states:

“...Only marriage certificates issued by the Vital Statistics Office in Belize City will be accepted.

**Foreign marriage certificates must be authenticated by the Foreign Service office of the applicant”.**

- 81.6 We saw a copy of a marriage certificate which was not authenticated by the Foreign Service office of the applicant. That native Indian marriage certificate was seen in Geetu Chaudhary's nationality file for marriage between Avnesh Chaudhary and said Geetu Chaudhary which had occurred on the 11<sup>th</sup> October 2011 at the Community Center in Salub, Punjab, India. The name Geetu Chaudhary was seen under "Particulars of Bride" although she had not yet been married. We noted that her name before marriage was Geetu Verma.
- 81.7 We saw on her nationality application, her 1<sup>st</sup> referee Teodora Senida Toledano of #31 Honeycamp Street, Orange Walk, stated that she knew her for "8 months"; not one year as required by law for applications through Marriage. Her second referee, Adonai Elias Blanco from Douglas Village Orange Walk, stated that he knew her for one year. Geetu Chaudhary's address was stated as 3<sup>rd</sup> Street North, Corozal Town.
- 81.8 We saw no evidence of additional vetting in Geetu Chaudhary's nationality file as been executed by the Investigation Section, which was required by the Referral System for applicants through Marriage (Section 11).
- 81.9 We noted that she was recommended for nationality by Miss Ady Pacheco (signed as seen by Gordon Wade on the 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2013) to the DINS on the 20<sup>th</sup> April 2013. She was recommended on the 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2013 for nationality to the Minister by acting Director Ms. Maria Marin.
- 81.10 Geetu Chaudhary applied for her Belizean Passport on the 20<sup>th</sup> June 2013 and was issued Passport # P0240077 on the 26<sup>th</sup> June 2013 in the name Geetu Chaudhary. Her Passport was picked up by an employee of the Nationality Section of the INS, Ms. Gertrude Armstrong on the same day (26<sup>th</sup> June 2013) without any record that a written authority was presented.

**Zhenyu Chen (Zhen Yu Chen) did not qualify for Belizean Nationality through Marriage but was issued Nationality Certificate #26219/12**

82. We noted that prior to her registration as a citizen of Belize, Zhenyu Chen, who was born in China on 8<sup>th</sup> October 1970, was associated with a stolen Belizean manual jumbo Passport A003514; issued 17<sup>th</sup> July 2002 and expiry date of 16<sup>th</sup> July, 2012.
- 82.2 We conducted an investigation on 16<sup>th</sup> October 2014, at the Belmopan Branch of the Belize Social Security Board on Social Security Card number 000487623 which was in the name of Zhenyu Chen. The records revealed that she first applied for a Social Security Number on 29<sup>th</sup> October 2008. At the time of her first registration she submitted her Chinese Passport G11324361 issued 11<sup>th</sup> August 2004 with expired date of 10<sup>th</sup> August, 2009. Her Dependant permit D50/BMP/08 issued on 11<sup>th</sup> February 2008 stated that she was a dependant of Quo Quing Chen who resided at Pomona Village. On 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2010, Zhenyu Chen applied for a replacement of her Social Security card and submitted her Belizean Manual jumbo Passport A003514.



That evidence suggested that her Passport A003514 was issued to her sometime after October 2008 but it was backdated to appear as if though it was issued on 17<sup>th</sup> July, 2002. It is our belief that had the applicant had her Belizean Passport A003514 from July 2002, she would have used it to apply for her Social Security Registration on 29<sup>th</sup> October 2008 instead of her Dependant Permit.

82.3 Our examination of Zhenyu Chen nationality file and Passport application revealed the following:

- i. Zhenyu Chen used her stolen Belizean manual Passport #A003514 issued 17<sup>th</sup> July 2002 to apply for her Police Report dated 14<sup>th</sup> February 2011, which was signed by ACP Miguel Segura.
- ii. On the 11<sup>th</sup> April 2011, she applied for Belizean nationality through marriage to Guoqing Chen, holder of Belizean nationality certificate #20689/07 dated 20<sup>th</sup> February 2007 (signed by Minister Ralph Fonseca) and Belizean Passport P0053746 issued 26<sup>th</sup> February 2007. She also requested on her application that her child Xiaona Chen, born in China on the 9<sup>th</sup> June 2000 be added to her certificate. We saw no copy of a birth certificate to show that Xiaona Chen was the daughter of Zhenyu Chen in her file. A Declaration form dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 was seen in her nationality file on which she requested the addition of her child, Xiaona Chen, but she did not declare that the child was her daughter in the absence of an official birth certificate. We also saw a copy of irregular Chinese Passport #G33963417, issued 13<sup>th</sup> February 2009 in the name of Xiaonan Chen, which appeared as if though it had been manipulated.
- iii. On Zhenyu Chen's Belizean nationality and Passport applications she indicated that she lived in Pomona, Stann Creek but we observed that she had Belmopan referees for her nationality application. She was recommended for her Belizean nationality by Police Officer, Ricardo Chi of #3744 North Piccini, Belmopan and Dalila Donis of the same address who both stated that they had known her for three years. We observed Dalili Donis was not a legal referee since she was not born in Belize but in Guatemala. By her signing as a referee she contravened requirement #1 on page 5 (which makes reference to page 4 of the nationality application form) of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011 titled "Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10". Requirement # 1 states in part:  
  
"On page four (4) the Referees who should be Belizean nationals by birth, must write in their names, complete address and number of years they know the applicant".
- iv. The section of the application for information on spouse was not completed by the applicant. There were two separate unofficial marriage certificates and certificate of translations in the file: one for Chen Zhenyu born 8<sup>th</sup> October 1970 & Chen Guoqing

born 6<sup>th</sup> September 1973 for marriage in Taishan City on the 3<sup>rd</sup> April 1997 (no pictures) and one for Chen Guoqing born 6<sup>th</sup> September 1973 and Chen Jade Jade born 8<sup>th</sup> June 1970 registered for marriage in Taishan City on 3<sup>rd</sup> April 1997. The translation copy that did not have Zhenyu Chen's name had her photo and Chen Guoqing's photo together as though photo shopped. We noted that neither copies were officially stamped nor were they authenticated by the Foreign Service Office of the applicant (requirement 6 on page 9 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Handbook). It appeared that the surname "Chen" was also Zhenyu Chen's maiden and married name. Her Christian names were Jade Jade and not Zhenyu and her date of birth was not the 8<sup>th</sup> June 1970, but 8<sup>th</sup> October 1970. Our finding proved that many of those Chinese marriage certificates similar to Zhenyu Chen's were bogus. There was also a copy of a Belize marriage Register page for marriage between Guoqing Chen and Zhen Yu Chen on the 17<sup>th</sup> June 2010 and performed by Senior Justice of the Peace, Hon Robert Mossiah.

- v. We saw a copy of Chinese Passport #G11324361 issued 11<sup>th</sup> August 2004 with expiry date of 10<sup>th</sup> August, 2009 with a Belmopan wet issued visa stamp, dated 6<sup>th</sup> September 2007 for single entry to Belize within 6 months, which was signed by an a signature appearing as "JL" (Jerome Lewis). We could not ascertain how her Chinese Passport got to Belmopan for a visa stamp six days before she arrived in Belize. The copies of G11324361 also had a Northern Border arrival stamp (#60) with an arrival date of 12<sup>th</sup> September 2007 signed by what appeared as the signature of Mr. Giovanni Tzib. There were also visa extension stamps seen dated 14<sup>th</sup> October 2007 and 11<sup>th</sup> February 2009 signed by Miss Ady Pacheco. What appeared as a faded Dependant Permit stamp dated 11<sup>th</sup> February 2008 for Zhenyu Chen as the dependant of Quo Quing Chen of Pomona was seen signed by Mr. Giovanni Tzib.
- vi. No evidence of additional vetting of her application was seen as required for Chinese applicants and for applicants requesting nationality through marriage. Although her file had those discrepancies, she was recommended for her Belizean nationality to the DINS by Mr. Gordon Wade, OIC Nationality Section and then recommended to the Minister on the 4<sup>th</sup> January by Director Miss Ruth Meighan.

82.4 We saw that Zhenyu Chen was issued her nationality certificate number 26219/12 dated 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. The child, Xiaona Chen, was added to her certificate on the 9<sup>th</sup> February 2012 by the same Minister, Carlos Perdomo. We found no entry for certificate number 26219/12 in the Register of Citizens by Registration.

82.5 We noted that when Zhenyu Chen, a "domestic" applied for her Belizean Passport on the 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2012 she did not use her 2010 issued Social Security card. She used the expired Social Security card (stated her nationality as Chinese) which had expired 11<sup>th</sup> February 2009. Her expired card was accepted by the Counter Clerk, Mr. Romi Rosas.

She was issued her Belizean Passport # P0194897 on the 16<sup>th</sup> March 2012. The child (Xiaona Chen) was added by Hon Carlos Perdomo on the 9<sup>th</sup> February 2012 and she was issued Belize Passport # P0194909 on the 16<sup>th</sup> March 2012.

**Individuals who did not qualify for Belizean Nationality through Marriage under the Economic Citizenship Program Section 11A of the Nationality Act were issued Belizean Citizenship**

Paragraph 5 of the Government of Belize Policy on Economic Citizenship Investment Program of January 1995 which was amended July 1997 states:

*“Belizean laws allow for the operation of Economic Citizenship Investment Programs. This was made possible through an amendment to the Belizean Constitution. The amended Law makes provision for the grant of citizenship to persons who make a substantial contribution to the Economy of Belize.*

*In 1985 the Belizean Nationality Act of 1981 was amended by the Belizean Amended Nationality Act 1985 to provide as follows: “A person who has to the satisfaction of the Minister, made substantial contribution to the economy and or well being of Belize, or who has rendered distinguished service to Belize, and who is not entitled to be registered under any of the other provisions of this Act may be granted citizenship by Registration.”*

*“Any applicant who is granted citizenship by Registration shall be entitled to have -*

- a) The applicant’s spouse, if any, resident with the applicant in Belize and*
  - b) The applicant’s children, if any, below the age of eighteen years and resident with the applicant in Belize*
- registered as citizens of Belize at the same time.”*

Requirement #6 on page 9 of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011, titled “Acceptance of Nationality Application Section 11 (Form G) also dictates:

*“Proof of one year domicile period in Belize: The applicant must be residing in Belize one year preceding the date of application. Belizean nationality document of spouse must be submitted example: Belize birth certificate, Belize Passport or Belize Nationality Certificate. Only marriage certificates issued by the Vital Statistics Office in Belize City will be accepted. Foreign marriage certificates must be authenticated by the Foreign Service office of the applicant.”*

83. We observed the following cases with persons that did not reside continuously in Belize for a period of one year but were issued Belize Nationality certificates as having qualified through Marriage (Section 11) thus violating the Nationality Act.

**Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour resident of the United Arab Emirates who did not qualify for Belizean Nationality was issued Nationality certificate #25805/11**

84. We saw the copy of an email dated 5<sup>th</sup> August 2013 addressed to Director of INS, Maria Marin from Ms. Tanya Hulse of the Belize High Commission in London, wherein she gave the details of an earlier appointment with a family and requested feedback in terms of the Department's position on the matter.

84.2 We noted that Ms. Tanya Hulse wrote that Mrs. Nagham Dahbour, wife of Wael Zeeni (Zeenni seen on the Passport issue list) and their family visited the Mission to apply for Belize Passports. Mrs Dahbour had in her possession a nationality certificate dated 24<sup>th</sup> November 2011. Upon inquiry she was told that Mrs. Dahbour had acquired Belizean citizenship through marriage and the children had acquired their nationality through descent. When questioned if they (husband or wife) had ever lived in Belize at any point in time before or during their marriage, they both said "no". Mr. Zeenni asked if the BECIP was still in effect to which she responded that it had closed over 10 years ago. Mr. Zeenni told her that it was the same agent who had assisted their family with their initial application under the BECIP program was assisting them with applications for his wife and family through marriage and descent.

84.3 We observed that a copy of Belizean nationality certificate #25805/11 dated 24<sup>th</sup> November 2011 in the name of Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour and signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo was seen attached to the copy of the email. The certificate stated that she was born in Amman, Jordan and that her permanent address was Mile 2 Northern Highway.

84.4 Further investigation is required into the case in respect of the Director's response and the outcome.

84.5 We observed the following from the documents examined:

- 1) The electronic Passport application for Ms. Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour was not processed but seen on pending status at the Passport Office.
- 2) There was no entry seen for this certificate number (25805/11) in the Register of Citizens by Registration under Sections 10 and 11.
- 3) The Nationality file for Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour was requested on June 19<sup>th</sup> 2014 but it was not presented.
- 4) On a spreadsheet issued to us by OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade, the individuals listed at **Table ZB** below had been issued replacement nationality certificates.

5) Passports had been issued to the Zeenni family in 2011 and 2013 as shown at **Table ZC** below.

6) In the section of the Register of Citizens by Registration labelled “Citizens by Investment” (Section 11A) the names of Najjad Ahmad Zeeni and Wafa Najjad Ahmad Zeeni (not Zeenni) were recorded for nationality certificate numbers 1724 and 1725 issued on 11<sup>th</sup> May 1990. The entry for Wafa Najjad Ahmad Zeeni also indicated that three children were included.

84.6 On top of the name Wafa Najjad Ahmad Zeeni the name of Elena Revolorio (nationality file #12933 dated 27<sup>th</sup> December 2000) was squeezed in and the words Section 10 were also recorded in the Register. The initials/ signatures of the officers, who issued those certificate numbers on that specific page and had been signing all along, were not seen in the Register for those entries and no file numbers were recorded in the respective column for those names. The absence of file numbers was a common finding in this specific register. Beginning with certificate #1724 recorded in the Register as dated the 11<sup>th</sup> May 1990 through to the last recorded certificate #3063 which was undated, there were no initials of the officer who issued those certificate numbers as the Register required.

84.7 We could not confirm that Wael Zeenni (the alleged husband of Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour) was one of the children of Wafa Najjad Ahmad Zeeni or whether Wafa Najjad Ahmad Zeeni and Najjad Ahmad Zeeni had genuinely acquired Belizean nationality through Economic Citizenship. We also could not confirm whether the three children indicated by a number in the Register had acquired economic citizenship genuinely or whether Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour had acquired nationality genuinely through Marriage.

84.8 We did not receive her file nor did we see any evidence that she had applied for a Passport up to September 2013.

84.9 We saw no evidence that the Referral System was utilized in regard to applicants through Marriage as is required by the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 (page 29). This requirement should have been investigated by the Investigation Unit of the Department.

Page 29 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 titled Referral System” is relevant.

**Table ZB**

The following is the list of individuals from the Zeenni family who were issued replacement nationality certificates.

| <b>NAME AS SEEN ON THE ELECTRONIC LIST</b> | <b>NATIONALITY</b> | <b>DATE CERTIFICATE WAS SIGNED</b>  | <b>Remarks</b>   |
|--|--------------------|---|--|
| WAEEL NAJJEND<br>ZEINNE (ZEENNI)           | KUWAIT             | 17/05/1990 (The name of the minister who signed certificate was not indicated) The other certificates listed prior to this one and after on the list were dated 20 <sup>th</sup> , 23 <sup>rd</sup> and 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2011. Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour certificate was dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 and signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo  | The list did not indicate the date the replacement cerifcate was signed. |
| AIMEN NAJJAD<br>ZEINNE (ZEENNI)            | AMERICAN           | 17/05/1990 (The name of the minister who signed certificate was not indicated) (The other certificates listed prior to this one and after on the list were dated 20 <sup>th</sup> , 23 <sup>rd</sup> and 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2011. Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour certificate was dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 and signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo | The list did not indicate the date the replacement cerifcate was signed. |
| MAHA NAJJAD<br>ZEENNI                      | AMERICAN           | 17/05/1990 (The name of the minister who signed   | There was no certificate   |

| NAME AS SEEN ON THE ELECTRONIC LIST | NATIONALITY | DATE CERTIFICATE WAS SIGNED  | Remarks  |
|-------------------------------------|-------------|--|--|
|                                     |             | certificate was not indicated) The other certificates listed prior to this one and after on the list were dated 20 <sup>th</sup> , 23 <sup>rd</sup> and 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2011. Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour certificate was dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 and signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo   | replacement date on the list but it may have been replaced sometime between the 20 <sup>th</sup> and 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2011                          |
| WAFANAJJAD<br>AHMED ZEENNI          | SYRIA       | 17/05/1990 (The name of the minister who signed certificate was not indicated) The other certificates listed prior to this one and after on the list were dated 20 <sup>th</sup> , 23 <sup>rd</sup> and 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2011. Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour certificate was dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 and signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo | There was no certificate replacement date on the list but it may have been replaced sometime between the 20 <sup>th</sup> and 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 |

84.10 We could not verify if their original nationality certificates were ever received, if they had been lost or if they wanted authentic Belizean nationality certificates to “replace” the ones they purportedly received in 1990.

**Table ZC**

The following are the Passports that were issued to the Zeenni's family

| <b>FIRST NAMES</b> | <b>SURNAME</b> | <b>PASSPORT NUMBER</b> | <b>PASSPORT ISSUE DATE</b> |
|--------------------|----------------|------------------------|----------------------------|
| NAJJAD AHMAD       | ZEENNI         | P0170999               | 05/07/2011                 |
| WAFI NAJJAD        | ZEENNI         | P0241123               | 08/07/2013                 |
| AIMEN NAJJAD       | ZEENNI         | P0241124               | 08/07/2013                 |
| MAHA NAJJAD        | ZEENNI         | P0241125               | 08/07/2013                 |
| NAJJAD             | ZEENNI         | P0241126               | 09/07/2013                 |
| NOAH WAEI          | ZEENNI         | P0241127               | 09/07/2013                 |
| WAEI NAJJAD        | ZEENNI         | P0241128               | 09/07/2013                 |

84.11 We noted two different spelling of the name of those persons in the electronic list of certificates given to us but the Passport issue list had the surname Zeenni for those same names listed as Zeinne on the electronic list.

84.12 We were not presented with the Passports applications for those individuals listed above at **Table ZC** as can be seen at **Appendix I** of our Passport report referenced Section III.

**Areej Khalil Daghistani resident of the United Arab Emirates did not qualify for Belizean Citizenship through Section 11 (Marriage) but was issued Belize Nationality certificate #2005/91**

85. We observed that the copy of Ms. Hulse's aforementioned email also indicated that a Belize Passport was not issued for one Areej Khalil Daghistani who had received a Belize nationality certificate under similar circumstances as Nagham Sudqi Amin Dahbour, and whose case had also been reported to the "DINS" indicating that it may have been through marriage (Section 11A).

85.2 Further investigation is required into the case in respect of the Director's response and the outcome.

85.3 We observed the following from the documents examined:

- 1) The electronic Passport application for Areej Khalil Daghistani was not processed but seen on pending status at the Passport Office.
- 2) The pending BPIS application had nationality certificate #2005/91 dated 5<sup>th</sup> November 1991 recorded as been presented by her.



- 3) In the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 11A) the name Yahya Aldine Jaffar plus two children were recorded for certificate number 2005/91. No Nationality file number was recorded for them.

85.4 We did not see a copy of Areej Khalil Daghistani's nationality or replacement certificates that was apparently issued to her, therefore we could not confirm if she had genuinely received Belizean nationality through marriage. As stated before at paragraph 84.9 there was no evidence that the Referral System was utilized in regard to applicants through Marriage.

85.5 Further in investigation is required as to the contents of the nationality files for Yahya Aldine Jaffar and Areej Khalil Daghistani.

**Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer a native of Saudi Arabia and a national of Palestine did not qualify for Belizean Nationality through Marriage under section 11A but was issued Nationality Certificate 25221/11**

86. We noted that Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer, a native of Saudi Arabia and a national of Palestine was issued Nationality Certificate 25221/11 dated 21<sup>st</sup> June 2011 signed by Carlos Perdomo. His nationality file number was requested and the following inconsistencies were noted:

- i) Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer's nationality application was neither dated nor initialled by the Counter Clerk who accepted the form however; Page 1 of said application was dated 14<sup>th</sup> June 2011. We noted that on the right top corner of the application form there was what appeared to be the handwriting of OIC Nationality Section, Gordon Wade who appeared to be the person who recorded his nationality file #26018/11 on the nationality form.
- ii) He did not fill in the period of his residence in Belize on his application form.
- iii) On his nationality application form Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer stated that his mother's name was Fatiya El Bashatli. He recorded on his application, the name of his wife, Faten Omar El Bashatli, through whom he claimed Belizean nationality and as did their children through descent. A copy of nationality certificate #2128 had the name of Faten Omar Abdel Quader Khalil El Bashatli. That certificate did not have the date it was issued and it had an irregular signature of former Minister, Said Musa.
- iv) He had two Belizean referees Daniel Austin Itza and Mara Andrea Scott both of Belize City who stated on the 13<sup>th</sup> June 2011 that they had known the applicant for 2 years.

We could not ascertain how they could have known him for the 2 years stated since his date of entry in his native Passport was recorded as 11<sup>th</sup> June 2011.

- v) His native Passport had a visa stamp, issued on 15<sup>th</sup> March 2011 by Tanya Hulse from the Belize High Commission in London. Said visa was to have expired on the 15<sup>th</sup> June 2011. His date of entry into the country as recorded in the illegible Belize entry stamp was 11<sup>th</sup> June 2011, four days before his visa had expired. He was given until the 10<sup>th</sup> July 2011 to remain in Belize.
- vi) OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Wade made a notation on the Minute sheet of Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer's file which stated that applicant "should be residing in Belize for one year."
- vii) His application was recommended to the Minister on 17<sup>th</sup> June 2011 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. She also wrote a note to the Minister which stated: "Min, Special request also, applicant travels next Friday to Lebanon. Grateful for your approval". (signed by Ruth Meighan on 17<sup>th</sup> June 2011)

In the Register of Citizens by Registration under Section 11A, the name Faten Khalil El Bashatli was recorded as having been issued Belize Nationality through Economic Investment (BECIP). The certificate number issued to her was 2128 dated 27<sup>th</sup> February 1992, but no file number was recorded for her. Her file was requested but it was not presented to us.

Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer got his Belizean nationality certificate 25221/11 dated 21<sup>st</sup> June 2011 and Passport # P0170346 issued on the 24<sup>th</sup> June, ten and thirteen days respectively after he entered Belize.

86.2 We did not see any evidence in his nationality file that the Referral System was utilized in regard to applicants through Marriage and in regard to his identity as a Palestinian national.

**Interview held on April 7, 2014 with OIC, Nationality Section Mr Gordon Wade Re: Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer**

86.3 We conducted an interview on April 7, 2014 with the OIC Nationality Section, Mr Gordon Wade, in which he was asked about the Owemer family, that is, husband and children concerning their claim to nationality through marriage and by descent. Mr. Wade said that he knew for a fact that the husband was not eligible for nationality but it was decided on by the then Director Miss Ruth Meighan and the Minister at the time, Mr. Carlos Perdomo. He indicated that the two met in her office and decided to give him Belizean nationality. He told us that Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer never came to Belize before. He just came one day and got his Belizean nationality.

Mr. Wade told us that Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer did not deserve Belizean nationality because he never set foot in Belize before but that there is a clause in Section 11 of the Nationality Act that refers to the date of marriage to a Belizean as the date the applicant qualified for Belizean nationality through Marriage.

86.4 We reviewed Section 11 of Chapter 161 of the Nationality Act that he referred to and we noted that subsection (4) states: “For the purpose of the residency requirement specified in subsection (3) (b) above, if any applicant marries a Belizean citizen, such applicant shall be deemed to have been legally resident in Belize from the date of such marriage, **notwithstanding that he might have entered Belize illegally**

86.5 We also saw in an email from Ministry of Foreign Affairs, to Khodr Harmouche, the Honorary Consul of Belize in Lebanon dated 20<sup>th</sup> August 2013, confirming that **“the spouse of a Belizean National can only obtain citizenship after legally residing continuously in Belize for a period of one year”**.

**Interview held on 30<sup>th</sup> June 2014 with OIC Nationality Section Mr Gordon Wade Re: Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer**

86.6 We observed after examination of Mohamed Owemer’s nationality file that his visa entry stamp was dated the same month his nationality certificate was signed, we had another interview with Mr. Gordon Wade and the following questions and his responses are below:

Audit: Since you were aware that this was the first time Mr. Owemer visited Belize in 2011, why did the Nationality Section accept the two referees who stated that they had known him for two years?

Mr. Wade: It is the same situation as with Minister Penner and Wonhong Kim. I cannot tell the two referees that they did not know this man. It would not hold up in a court of law.

We noted that Mr Wade had made a notation on the Minute sheet of Owemer’s file which stated that applicant “should be residing in Belize for one year.”

Audit: So you are saying that it’s the same as the “legal vs. factual guilt” situation?

Mr. Wade: Yes

Audit: We were unable to find a file number for his wife, Faten El Bashatli, in the Register but we requested her Nationality file using her name and so far it has not been presented to us.

Mr. Wade: Faten El Bashatli got nationality through Investment along with her father and family. The wife's father had also come in with him (Mohamed Owemer) in 2011 and his father-in-law's file was found so there must be a file for her too.

86.7 It is to be noted that Faten El Bashatli's nationality file was not presented to us.

86.8 We observed that the interview for Mohamed Mohamed Owemer was done by Mr. Gordon Wade on 15<sup>th</sup> June 2011 where he noted on the application, "applicant has married to Belizean since 1995 and his three children are all Belizeans. I think that he should be considered."

86.9 There may have been other occurrences of this nature for persons who lived abroad and received nationality through marriage to persons who had allegedly received Belize nationality under the BECIP program (Section 11A) but our Audit did not include visas issued by Embassies and Foreign Missions abroad.

**The Register of Citizens by Registration had several pages which showed persons who had received nationality through marriage under Section 11A (BECIP)**

87. We saw in the only Nationality Register identified to us as the BECIP Register (Section 11A) that Nationality Certificate # 2945 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> December 1993 to Nationality Certificate #3063 issued sometime in November 1994 (119 certificate numbers including numerous missing entries), that persons consecutively received Belizean Nationality under Section 11 (Marriage) as recorded in the Section 11A Register. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether those persons had indeed qualified for Registration through marriage under Section 11A.

**Many copies of native Passports showed discrepancies with the dates of entry into Belize for the 5 years (Section 10 of the Nationality Act) and 1 year (Section 11 of the Nationality Act) domicile period of continuous residency in Belize**

88. We found many copies of native Passports during our examination of nationality files that showed discrepancies with the dates of entry into Belize for the 5 years and 1 year domicile period of continuous residency in Belize which is a requirement of Sections 10 and 11 of the Nationality Act. Those Passport holders' names are listed at **Appendix D**.

### **All Nationality files examined did not have copies of the native Passports**

Requirement 6 (Page 6) of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 titled “Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10” states:

“Proof of (5) five year residence in the country. If applicant has permanent residence in Belize, the date of arrival must be checked to ensure that the five year domicile period is correct. If they have only passports, the passport must reflect the five year domicile period through successive temporary status. Applicants may also proof (prove) domicile period with copies of their passports, as the possibility exists that they may have obtained temporary status such as employment permits, student permits etc. Please note that based on the checklist provided by the Solicitor General’s Office, a person who has permanent residence but does not have a passport must still showproof that they have been residing in Belize. Having a permanent residence card is not enough proof; therefore they must signa declaration stating the reason why they are not in possession of a passport. They are required also to show additional proof in the form of letter of employment, social security statements, school records, if they have Belizean children their birth certificates, along with the permanent residence cards.”

89.2 We did not see such requirements in the Nationality Act. We could not ascertain why a checklist would be submitted to the INS by the Solicitor General’s Office as requirements for Belizean Nationality.

89.3 Many Nationality files we examined neither had copies of the applicants’ native Passports to prove their domicile period (Appendix E), nor were there employment letters, letters from the FIU stating their Financial Status and that they have not been declared bankrupt in their country (Appendix E.1) nor Bank Statements to show that those persons had met the requirements for citizenship (Appendix E.2).

### **Interview held on March 13, 2014 with OIC Nationality Section Mr. Gordon Wade**

89.4 In our March 13<sup>th</sup> 2014 interview with Mr. Gordon Wade, he was questioned in regard to the activities of the Nationality Section. He was asked how long an applicant had to wait before he/she could acquire a Belizean nationality certificate. Although we were asking about the process from application to nationality certificate stage, Mr. Wade gave us the following response:

“A Minister can approve Belizean nationality with one letter and all other requirements are waived, including fees, security clearance, civic test; everything can be waived. The law has the requirements but that does not matter because the law also states that a Minister has the final say. Applicants do not even have to be in the country for the five (5) years. As long as a Justice of the Peace or Minster writes a letter stating that they knew the applicant for over 5 years, and that they are of good behaviour, they are approved.

That process takes the place of all requirements. This happens especially around election time when ministers and area representatives submit lists of applicants who should get nationality. Those persons do not even have to show their Passports to prove that they came into the country with visas.”

89.5 We were given two spreadsheets of persons who received Belizean nationality during the period investigated (April 2011 to September 2013) and many persons were approved and issued nationality certificates just before the 2012 Municipal and General Elections. We have reported on seven of those persons in this nationality report. They are Yongbo Ye (paragraph 122.8) Denzel Lerone Hernandez Brooks, Ki Jun Jeun, Yong Xiong Zheng, Zheng Jun An and Jia Li Ruan (**Table Y**). Further investigation is required to ascertain whether those other applicants had met the five year or one year domicile requirement.

### **Several copies of native Passports showed some applicants had illegal status in Belize between visa extensions**

Paragraph 3 on Page 4 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 states:

“The applicant must also be informed that it is incumbent on them to remain legal in Belize in conformity with their temporary status (i.e. student, dependant, employment permits).....”

90. Our examination of the copies of individuals’ native Passports revealed that several of those applicants may not have been legally resident in Belize for the one year or five years domicile period. We observed that they did not successively extend their visas as they expired. Those persons were still awarded Belizean nationality. One of those applicants (and her son) whose native Passport copies revealed several occasions of illegal status in Belize is discussed below:

### **Fengwan Wu - issued Belizean Nationality Certificate #25697/11 in the name Fengwan Lu**

91. Our examination of Fengwan Wu’s nationality file number 26419/11 revealed copies of two Chinese Passports. One Passport G22415147 issued 26-April-2007 was in the name Fengwan Wu and the other one G54816970 was issued 30Aug 2011 in the name of Honghui Lu (purportedly her son). As a result of our examination we noted:

- i. A single entry wet stamp visa was issued at British Consulate General, Guangzhou to Fengwan Wu to enter Belize 4-Dec-2007 to 4-March-2008. She apparently entered Belize on 17<sup>th</sup> January 2008 through the BNBS as indicated on her visitor's permit stamp. She was permitted to remain in Belize until 16<sup>th</sup> February 2008. **Table ZD** below shows the dates she made late applications for extension of her visa as well as the dates her visa was extended.

**Table ZD**

The following are the dates that Fengwan Wu made her late applications for extension of her visa and the dates her visa were extended

| <b>Date visa was extended</b>   | <b>Date should have extended on</b> | <b>Date visa was extended to</b> |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| 19 <sup>th</sup> August 2008    | 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2008        | 12 <sup>th</sup> September 2008  |
| 16 <sup>th</sup> September 2008 | 12 <sup>th</sup> September 2008     | 11 <sup>th</sup> October 2008    |
| *8 <sup>th</sup> October 2009   | 5 <sup>th</sup> October 2009        | 4 <sup>th</sup> November 2009    |
| *20 <sup>th</sup> November 2009 | 4 <sup>th</sup> November 2009       | 4 <sup>th</sup> December 2009    |
| 3 <sup>rd</sup> December 2010   | 4 <sup>th</sup> December 2009       | 26 <sup>th</sup> December 2010   |
| 30 <sup>th</sup> December 2010  | 26 <sup>th</sup> December 2010      | 26 <sup>th</sup> January 2011    |
| 1 <sup>st</sup> February 2011   | 26 <sup>th</sup> January 2011       | 26 <sup>th</sup> February 2011   |
| 26 <sup>th</sup> April-2011     | 24 <sup>th</sup> April-2011         | 23 <sup>rd</sup> May 2011        |

91.2 We saw that Fengwan Wu had acquired a temporary employment permit on the 6<sup>th</sup> October 2008, which was stamped:

“Does not remain in Belize longer than 5-Oct-2009”.

That permit was renewed on the 27-November 2009 and she was allowed to remain up to 26<sup>th</sup> November 2010.

91.3 We noted that although she was granted employment permit, she should have been extending her visa. She did extend her visa (on dates after the visa dates had expired) but after 24<sup>th</sup> May 2011 when she got permission to remain in Belize until the 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2011, no other stamps for extensions were seen. We saw only an undated dependant permit stamp, which stated: "valid up to 13-Jan-2012".

**Several copies of native Passports did not have the Passport numbers on the pages where the Belize entry stamp was imprinted**

92. We observed copies of native Passports on which the Passport serial numbers were not seen. There was no way of verifying if those persons were in fact the ones who entered Belize on the dates stamped on those Passports pages. Some examples are listed below at **Table ZD1**.

**Table ZD1**

| <b>Name</b>         | <b>Name</b>              |
|---------------------|--------------------------|
| Shu Tang Chan       | Zufa Huang               |
| Chang Chung Pao Chu | Ching Dong Wang aka Alex |
| Wen Cheng Chang     | Wen lin Le               |
| Kang Chih Chang     | Wang Li Yan              |
| Wenying Huang       | Wing Chih Yan            |
| Feng Jiao Guan      | Hsin Chi Wang            |
| Xiaogin Huang       | xxxxxxxxxxxx             |

**There were frequent interventions by Ministers/ Area Representatives and other individuals in the Belize Nationality procedure, which are not provided for by the Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 Citizenship by Registration**

The Belizean Nationality Act Section 10.-(1) (b) states that persons are entitled to registration as citizens who have the following qualifications- that the applicant is a person who is ordinarily resident in Belize and has been so resident for a period of five years immediately preceding the date of the application.

Procedures 7 and 9 (page 12) of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 titled “Application Procedures” states:

7. “Payments shall be made and receipts issued only after proper vetting has been done by the supervisor and approval to process has been given.”

9. “Completed application forms will be processed and certificates available for delivery upon payment of a processing fee of forty dollars within six weeks.”

93. We observed several letters from Ministers in individuals’ nationality files requesting that their “Nationality documents be processed a bit faster”. The OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Wade also made notations on the minute sheets of those files that Ministers of Government, Area Representatives and other individuals (we could not identify) had requested or recommended the applicants for nationality. Those Ministers and or Area Representatives are listed at **Table ZE** below. We could not ascertain whether those Ministers, Area Representatives and other persons who requested nationality files were compensated by applicants to request their files for selective or rushed processing by the Nationality Section.



**Table ZE**

The following is the Ministers, Area Representatives and other individuals who intervened in the Nationality process without any provision to do so by the Nationality Act

| <b>Name of Minister/<br/>Area Representative/<br/>Or other Individuals</b> | <b>Name of Applicant<br/>for Nationality</b>   | <b>Date of<br/>Minister's/Area<br/>Representative or<br/>other individuals'<br/>Letter or date of<br/>notation on<br/>Minute Sheet</b> | <b>Where evidence<br/>was seen</b>     |
|--|--|--|--|
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo  | Shu-Ming Chiang<br><br>Belize Passport<br>#P0179613 issued<br>20 <sup>th</sup> September 2011  | May-10-2011  | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon. Ramon Witz  | Tian Zhi Wang aka<br>Freakin Yang<br><br>Chinese Passport<br>#G41602494 issue<br>date 8 <sup>th</sup> April 2010<br><br>Belize Passports<br>P0185786 issued<br>25 <sup>th</sup> November 2011<br>as Tianzhi Wang<br>and P0202374<br>issued 25 <sup>th</sup> May<br>2012 as Freakin<br>Yang | Nov-18-2011  | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon. Eden Martinez   | Jinyu Huang<br>Chinese Passport<br>#G21167184 issue<br>date 15 <sup>th</sup> February<br>2007<br>Belize Passport<br>P0188336 issued<br>16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011  | December-12-2011   | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |

| <b>Name of Minister/<br/>Area Representative/<br/>Or other Individuals</b> | <b>Name of Applicant<br/>for Nationality</b>   | <b>Date of<br/>Minister's/Area<br/>Representative or<br/>other individuals'<br/>Letter or date of<br/>notation on<br/>Minute Sheet</b> | <b>Where evidence<br/>was seen</b>  |
|--|--|--|---|
| Hon Erwin Contreras  | Jinchao Wu (Had stolen manual Passport #A003519 with fraudulent nationality certificate number 10202/01). He did not qualify for Belizean nationality in December 2011 when his file was requested by Minister Erwin Contreras G46036001 issue date 30 <sup>th</sup> March 2011 Belize Passport P0188334 issued 16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | December-12-2011   | On Minute Sheet of Nationality File   |
| Mr. R. Rosado  | Juana Edy Miranda Belize Passport P0242132 issued 18 <sup>th</sup> July 2013   | December- 29-2011  | On Minute Sheet in Nationality File   |
| Hon Manuel Heredia   | Ammar Harmouch Republic of Lebanon Passport #0971975 Issue date 22 <sup>nd</sup> February 2007 Belize Passport P0194864 issued 15 <sup>th</sup> March 2012   | January-9-2012   | Minister Manuel Heredia was written and highlighted on nationality application form and on Minute Sheet |

| <b>Name of Minister/<br/>Area Representative/<br/>Or other Individuals</b> | <b>Name of Applicant<br/>for Nationality</b>  | <b>Date of<br/>Minister's/Area<br/>Representative or<br/>other individuals'<br/>Letter or date of<br/>notation on<br/>Minute Sheet</b> | <b>Where evidence<br/>was seen</b>   |
|--|---|--|--|
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr.  | Hani Harmouch<br><br>Republic of<br>Lebanon Passport<br>#1024240 Issue date<br>11 <sup>th</sup> May 2007<br><br>Belize Passport<br>P0242139 issued<br>18 <sup>th</sup> July 2013          | January -11-2012   | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon. Rene Montero  | Saad Mohamad<br>Harmouch<br><br>Republic of<br>Lebanon Passport #<br>29 <sup>th</sup> May 2006<br><br>Belize Passport<br>P0197605 issued<br>13 <sup>th</sup> April 2012                   | January-9-2012   | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon Rene Montero   | Wael Harmouche<br><br>Republic of<br>Lebanon Passport #<br>0015639 issue date<br>29 <sup>th</sup> January 2003<br><br>Belize Passport<br>P0191420 issued 7 <sup>th</sup><br>February 2012 | January-9-2012   | On Minute Sheet<br>and on a letter to<br>Ms. Meighan<br>requesting her to<br>facilitate with the<br>following<br>Nationality for<br>ceremonies to be<br>held on 13 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012 |
| Hon Gabriel Martinez   | Jesus Angel   | January-17-2012  | On Minute Sheet in   |

| <b>Name of Minister/<br/>Area Representative/<br/>Or other Individuals</b>   | <b>Name of Applicant<br/>for Nationality</b>  | <b>Date of<br/>Minister's/Area<br/>Representative or<br/>other individuals'<br/>Letter or date of<br/>notation on<br/>Minute Sheet</b> | <b>Where evidence<br/>was seen</b>     |
|--|---|--|--|
|  | Rafailan Machuca<br>Republic of<br>Salvador Passport<br>#A04296607 issue<br>date 4 <sup>th</sup> February<br>2011<br>Belize Passport<br>P0226057 issued 9 <sup>th</sup><br>January 2013           |  | Nationality File                       |
| Mr. D. Gonzalez<br>Documents from file<br>copied suggested Iris<br>Behatriz Linarez Gomez<br>was from Orange Walk. | Iris Behatriz Linarez<br>Gomez<br>Republic of<br>Salvador Passport<br>#004655659 issue<br>date 29 <sup>th</sup> July 2010<br>Belize Passport<br>P0228595 issued 11 <sup>th</sup><br>February 2013 | January-17-2012  | On Minute Sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon John Saldivar  | Lidia Azucena Diaz<br>Najera<br>Belize Passport<br>P0236864 issued<br>15 <sup>th</sup> May 2013   | April- 27-2012   | On Minute Sheet in<br>Nationality File |

| <b>Name of Minister/<br/>Area Representative/<br/>Or other Individuals</b> | <b>Name of Applicant<br/>for Nationality</b>   | <b>Date of<br/>Minister's/Area<br/>Representative or<br/>other individuals'<br/>Letter or date of<br/>notation on<br/>Minute Sheet</b> | <b>Where evidence<br/>was seen</b>   |
|--|--|--|--|
| Hon Gaspar Vega  | Richard Adu<br>Yeboah<br><br>Belize Passport<br>P0226197 issued<br>10 <sup>th</sup> January 2013   | June-25-2012   | On Minute Sheet in<br>Nationality File<br><br>(File also had a<br>copy of the Letter<br>from Hon Gaspar<br>Vega) |
| Hon Pablo Marin  | Gabriela Barrera<br><br>No evidence seen of<br>Belize Passport<br>issued   | July- 5-2012   | On Minute Sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon. Elvin Penner  | Kudzai<br>Pahwaringira<br><br>Belize Passport<br>P0227192 issued<br>24 <sup>th</sup> January 2013  | September-17-2012  | Letter in Nationality<br>File to "Person in<br>Charge<br>Immigration"  |
| Hon Santiago Castillo  | Shu Bin Yu<br><br>Chinese Passport<br>G22410719 issue<br>date 24 <sup>th</sup> April 2007<br><br>Belize Passport<br>P0238156 issued 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>June 2013 | October - 4 -2012  | Letter in Nationality<br>File to Ruth<br>Meighan   |

We have listed at **Appendix F** a complete list of those individuals who had intervened in the nationality process.

93.2 As can be seen from **Table ZE** above and **Appendix F**, Ministers Carlos Perdomo and Elvin Penner were among those Ministers who had requested that nationality files be processed while they were the Ministers of Immigration and this fact alone is capable of causing intimidation and pressure on the staff of the Nationality Section to process files for person who did not qualify for Belizean nationality as we found in several cases.

**Ministers of Government may not have known the persons they were recommending for Belizean Nationality**

94. We found an undated letter with the letterhead stating “Hon Edmond Castro “Clear the Land” Castro” from Minister Edmond Castro, Minister of State in the Ministry of Works, in the nationality file for Olena Moskalyk Curly and Mykola Moskalyk, which stated:

*“I hereby recommend for the file of **Oteha Mockajtwik** (BNA 28077/12) to be send to the Director of immigration desk to be expedited. Thank you for your assistants”.*

The letter was signed by Hon Edmond Castro, Minister of State in the Ministry of Works.

94.2 We saw the phone number 210-2393 was written in pen under the type-written designation of the Minister. The wrong spelling of her name suggested that he did not know the applicant Olena Moskalyk Curly. Her nationality file was opened in the name Oteha Mockajtwik and later the first name was corrected to Olena. Her nationality application was also made out in the name Oteha Olena Mockaj, which suggested that no official document from the applicant was submitted before the processing of her file began in the Nationality Section of the INS. She received a Belizean nationality certificate dated 9<sup>th</sup> February 2012 in the name Olena Moskalyk Curly, three days after entering Belize on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012 and a Belizean Passport P0193300 issued 24<sup>th</sup> February 2012, eighteen days after entering Belize on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012.

94.3 We also found three letters from Minister Santiago Santino Castillo Jr. in three persons’ nationality files, where he requested the processing of Chinese applicants’ nationality applications. Those three letters were written to the former Director INS, Miss Ruth Meighan, in which he referred to the nationality applicants as supporters and constituents, even before they were given Belizean nationality. In two of those letters he used his Area Representative, Caribbean Shores, letterhead with the Ministry of Economic Development’s address and in the other one he used the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development letterhead. In two of the three letters he referred to the applicants as “she” and “her” when they were two male applicants. Those letters from Hon Santiago Santino Castillo are outlined at **Table ZF** below:

**Table ZF**

The following are the request letters from Minister Santiago Santino Castillo Jr wherein he had requested the processing of Chinese applicants

| <b>Name of Nationality Applicant</b> | <b>Address in Belize</b>                 | <b>Origin of Letter from Hon Santiago Santino Castillo</b>                                 | <b>Date of letter and Recipient</b>   | <b>Purpose of Letter</b>   | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|---|--|---|
| Jinchen An                           | 2 ½ Miles, Northern Highway, Belize City | Area Representative, Caribbean Shores Constituency (address Economic Development, Belmopan | Letter dated 13 <sup>th</sup> September 2012 to Director of Immigration and Nationality Miss Ruth Meighan | “I support her application...r equest is hereby being made to have her application be processed as soon as possible”. (Please note that Jinchen An is a male.) | Applicant’s Visa was approved 24 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 by Ruth Meighan ( <b>Re: Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo (JP witnessed the affidavit and Steven Young and Wayne Mario Hulse signed as Referees)</b> )   |
| Zhengjun An                          | 2 ½ Miles, Northern Highway, Belize City | Government of Belize, Ministry of Finance and Economic Development                         | Letter dated 23rd January 2012 to Director of Immigration and Nationality Miss Ruth Meighan               | “I support her application and would like to know when it will be processed”. Please note that Zhengjun An is a male.  | BNA File was recommended to DINS for consideration by Ady Pacheco on the 4 <sup>th</sup> April 2013. File had copies of bogus Chinese Passport and other bogus Immigration stamps ( <b>Re: Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo JP) signed the affidavit Wayne Hulse and Stephanie Hulse signed as referees)</b> ) |

| <b>Name of Nationality Applicant</b> | <b>Address in Belize</b>                  | <b>Origin of Letter from Hon Santiago Santino Castillo</b>                                    | <b>Date of letter and Recipient</b>   | <b>Purpose of Letter</b>   | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------------------------|---|---|---|--|---|
| Shu Bin Yu                           | 6196<br>Buttonwood<br>Bay, Belize<br>City | Hon Santiago<br>Santino Castillo,<br>Area Representative,<br>Caribbean Shores<br>Constituency | Letter dated 4 <sup>th</sup><br>October 2012 to<br>Director of<br>Immigration and<br>Nationality Miss<br>Ruth Meighan | “I support his<br>application<br>and I would<br>be grateful for<br>the processing<br>of same”. | Visa stamp from La Habana, Cuba<br>on 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2007; visa valid until<br>12 <sup>th</sup> February 2008. Stamp needs to<br>be verified as genuine. BNA file was<br>forwarded to Director by Ady<br>Pacheco on the 18 <sup>th</sup> April 2013<br>although his application was<br>incomplete and had<br>inconsistencies <b>Re: Jahan Abadi<br/>(JP) signed the Affidavit, Steven<br/>Young and Stephanie Hulse signed<br/>as referees</b> |



94.4 We also saw a letter, dated 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 from the Desk of Hon Rene J. Montero in the Nationality file of Wael Harmouch addressed to Miss Ruth Meighan, which stated:

“Ms. Meighan, please facilitate me with the following nationality for the ceremonies to be held on the 13<sup>th</sup> January 2012: 26536, 26537, 26543, 27020, 23414, 22999 and 30743 (signed).

94.5 We could also not ascertain whether he was referring to a general swearing in ceremony or he was alluding to a private swearing in ceremony for persons approved Belizean nationality, which we were told was a common irregular practice carried out at the Department. We were told that in confidence in order for us to investigate. Further investigation is required to ascertain that there was/were private swearing in ceremony/ies.

#### **Interview on 8<sup>th</sup> December 2014 with former Minister of Immigration Mr. Carlos Perdomo**

95. In an interview with former Minister of Immigration, Mr. Carlos Perdomo on December 8, 2014 he confirmed his intervention into the processing of nationality. When we asked him if he recalled giving instructions regarding the processing of the Passport for Paul Ku, his response was,

“... I do not think I directed anything in regard to Passports. I would send a note to Ruth Meighan asking for her to kindly assist in regard to people who came to the Ministry for help with their BNA (Belize Nationality Application) file numbers because their applications had been unapproved for a long time.”

#### **Corruption in the speeding up or delay of the nationality process for individuals**

96. We found a memo Gen 13/01/05 (2) sent to the Minister of Home Affairs and Public Utilities by former Director, Jose Zetina dated 12<sup>th</sup> September 2005, in the Department’s Confidential File, Mr. Zetina reported the following:

“In the Nationality and Residence Section corruption stems from facilitating and speeding up the process of applications once payment is made to certain individual civilians who run this section. These applications are then given priority by ensuring that they meet all the requirements with documentations in order and submitted for vetting ahead of others. In some cases delay tactics are used to pressure individual applicants to pay for the services.....On selected applicants, approvals are intentionally delayed or applicants are told further checks or documentations are needed in order to influence payment for the services.”

**Many irregularities were found with native Lebanese with the surname Harmouche or Harmouch**

97. We found many irregularities with native Lebanese with the surname Harmouche or Harmouch with several of them who did not qualify for but were issued Belizean Nationality as discussed below.

**No further vetting, as required by the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual, appeared to have been carried out on Lebanese persons with the surname Harmouche/ Harmouch**

Page 29, of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 titled “Referral System”

This requirement has been quoted at paragraphs 19.2 and 77.2 above.

98. We saw no evidence in the nationality files examined for the period under review that the Referral System was utilized in respect to Lebanese applicants named Harmouche or Harmouch. The use of the Referral System for such applicants is a requirement of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011. As mentioned above the Investigation Unit of the Department should have carried out further vetting of those applicants.

**Eleven (11) persons with the surname Harmouche/ Harmouch received Belizean Nationality prior to the Belize General and Municipal Elections in March 2012**

99. We saw eleven (11) native Lebanese with the surname Harmouch or Harmouche were issued their Belizean nationality in January 2012, prior to the General and Municipal Elections in 2012. Ten of their names were found on the aforementioned spreadsheet (paragraph 89.5 of this report) that was given to us by the OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. Those persons are listed at **Table ZG**.

**Table ZG**

The following is the ten Lebanese nationals who were issued Belizean Nationality prior to General and Municipal Elections in March 2012 as seen on the INS Spreadsheet

| <b>Name</b>                          | <b>Date Nationality Certificate Was Signed</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Samir Mouhamed Harmouch              | 12/01/2012                                     | He was issued certificate #26406/12 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2012. His name was seen in the Register (File #26670); Numbers Book had certificate date as 10 <sup>th</sup> January 2012. Passport application was not presented to Audit. He received his Belizean Passport #P0194874 issued on 15 <sup>th</sup> March 2012. Nationality File showed discrepancies. (See paragraph 102.3 of this report |
| Mustapha Mahmoud Chihab D.T Harmouch | 05/01/2012                                     | (Certificate number unknown)<br>His Passport application was not presented to Audit but he received his Belizean Passport #P0190096 issued on 18 <sup>th</sup> January 2012  |
| Wissam Hussein Harmouch              | 11/01/2012                                     | (Certificate number unknown)<br>His Passport application was not presented to Audit. He received Belizean Passport #P0194869 issued on 15 <sup>th</sup> March 2012   |
| Oussama Harmouch                     | 11/01/2012                                     | He was issued certificate #26426/12 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 which was also seen issued to Mona Irma Meza in the Register of Citizens by Registration (nationality file #30406) See paragraph 116 of this report. His Passport application was not presented to Audit. He received Belizean Passport# P0198894 issued on 30 <sup>th</sup> April 2012,   |
| Saad Mohamad Harmouch                | 11/01/2012                                     | He was issued nationality certificate #26328/12 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 and Belizean Passport # P0197605 on 13 <sup>th</sup> April 2012 (See paragraph 120 of this report.   |

|   |            |  |
|---|------------|--|
| Ammar Harmouch                                | 11/01/2012 | <p>He was issued certificate #26321/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. His name was seen in the Register for BNA File #27135; Numbers Book entry was 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012.</p> <p>His Passport application was not presented to Audit. He received Belizean Passport# P0194864 issued on 15<sup>th</sup> March 2012</p>  |
| Wajih Harmouch                                | 11/01/2012 | <p>He was issued certificate #26412/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 which was also seen issued to Francisco Antonio Aparicio in the Register of Citizens by Registration (nationality file #26332). The Numbers book had certificate #26412 as issued to Wajih Harmouch on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. He received Belizean Passport #P0191370 issued on 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012.</p> |
| Wael Harmouche                                | 11/01/2012 | <p>He was issued certificate # 26324/12 dated 11-Jan-2012. His name was seen in the Numbers Book (nationality file #26537). He received his Belizean Passport P0191420 issued on 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012.</p>   |
| Abdul Rahman Harmouch                         | 11/01/2012 | <p>He was issued certificate #26364/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. His name was seen in the Numbers Book (file #27241) dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012. One of his Nationality referee, Everette Anderson, stated that he knew him for four (4) years only. Interview was done by Ady Pacheco. He received his Belizean Passport #P0194503 issued on 9<sup>th</sup> March 2012.</p>     |
| Ahmad Harmouche<br>(Date of Birth 1-Feb-1992) | 11/01/2012 | <p>He was issued certificate #26363/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. His name was seen in the Numbers Book for file #26535 dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012. He received his Belizean Passport #P0193188 issued on 24<sup>th</sup> February 2012. (See paragraph 103 of this report.</p>   |

99.2 We found that another Lebanese, Ahmad Harmouche whose date of birth was 10<sup>th</sup> November 1970 with nationality file #26535/11, had the same file number as another Ahmad Harmouche whose date of birth was 1<sup>st</sup> February 1992. Ahmad Harmouche (born 10<sup>th</sup> November, 1970) name was not on the spreadsheet given to us by Mr. Gordon Wade, but his nationality file showed that he had received Belizean nationality certificate # 26239/12 dated 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. We could not ascertain why his name was not included on the spreadsheet of persons who had received Belizean nationality certificates signed prior to the elections but we found that Ahmad Harmouche may not have qualified for Belizean Nationality on 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012. We noted that his Nationality file also had his name as Ahmed Said Harmouche. We have outlined our findings of him further in this report.

99.3 We also observed that thirty-eight (38) persons with the surname Harmouche/Harmouch received their first-issue Belizean Passports or renewed their Belizean Passports during the April 2011 to September 2013 period. Several of them had similar first names.

**Four Nationality files for members of the Harmouch family were among those that could not be found**

**100.** We noted that the Ministry of Labour and Local Government, during the period 9<sup>th</sup> to 18<sup>th</sup> October 2013, conducted an inventory of Belize nationality files at the Immigration and Nationality Department. According to the Ministry's undated report, one hundred and sixty four (164) nationality files could not be found at the Department. Four of those files were for four (4) persons with the surname Harmouch (listed at **Table ZH** below) who may have also received Belize Nationality in 2012. Two other Harmouch BNA files: Osama Harmouch- BNA #27365/12 and Hani Harmouch- BNA#27378/12 listed on the missing inventory list were at the INS and had been examined by Audit but the Ministry had them as missing.

100.2 We noted the Ministry's report also stated that the Registry Clerks, Ms. Sheila Samuels and Ms. Cheryl Gillett gave (We noted from files examined that her christain name was spelt with an S for Sheryl) no explanation as to where those (164) files could be. The missing nationality files for persons with the surname Harmouch as reported in the Ministry's inventory report are listed at **Table ZH** below. **Appendix G** is a copy of the inventory report carried out by the Ministry and the irregularities found by the Ministry.

**Table ZH**

The following is the list of four members of the Harmouch family whose files could not be found at the Immigration and Nationality Department

| <b>Name</b>       | <b>Nationality File Number</b> |
|-------------------|--------------------------------|
| Mohammad Harmouch | 26641/12                       |
| Mohammad Harmouch | 27369/12                       |
| Issam Harmouch    | 27370/12                       |
| Oyman Harmouch    | 27375/12                       |

**26 Passport Application forms were not presented for persons with the surname Harmouch or Harmouche for the period April 2011 to September 2013**

101. Out of the thirty-eight (38) applications submitted for first-issue Belizean Passports by individuals whose surnames are Harmouche/Harmouch, , we did not receive twenty six (26) Passport application forms. Those applications also included the individuals who renewed their Belizean Passports during April 2011 to September 2013. The names of those individuals are listed at **Appendix H**.

101.2 We could not ascertain if all of them were new recipients of Belizean nationality for the period April 2011 to September 2013. However, we observed that four (4) of them had the same first name and surname (Ahmad Harmouch or Ahmad Harmouche). No Passport applications were presented to us for three of those four applicants. We were able to examine two of those four nationality files. Those two files had the same file number but separate nationality certificates as can be seen at **Table ZI**.

**Table ZI**

The following is the persons named Ahmad Harmouch who shared the same names and in two instances had the same file numbers

| <b>Name</b>     | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b>                                  | <b>Passport Number and Issue Date</b>    | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-----------------|----------------------|---|--|--------------------------------|--|
| AHMAD HARMOUCH  | 1st Oct 1991         | 25308/11 dated 28 <sup>th</sup> July 2011(copy of certificate not seen)         | P0178729/6 <sup>th</sup> September /2011 | 25754                          | His Passport application was not presented to Audit  |
| AHMAD HARMOUCHE | 1st Feb 1992         | 26363/12 dated 11th January 2012 (signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo             | P0193188/24 <sup>th</sup> February 2012  | 26535/11                       | May not have qualified for Belizean nationality (see paragraph 103 of this report.   |
| AHMAD HARMOUCHE | 10th Nov 1970        | 26239/12 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 (signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo) | P0199989/ 14 <sup>th</sup> May 2012      | 26535/11 A                     | Passport application was not presented to Audit May not have qualified for Belizean nationality (See paragraph 114 of this Report.               |
| AHMAD HARMOUCH  | 27th Nov 1995        | 16328.1/02 dated 25 <sup>th</sup> April 2002 (BPIS)                             | P0210172/ 24 <sup>th</sup> July 2012     | 17071                          | Passport application was not presented to Audit. Certificate #16328 was issued to Hussein Harmouch. Nationality file was not presented to Audit. |

| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b>                                 | <b>Passport Number and Issue Date</b> | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|----------------------------|----------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|
| AHMAD HUSSEIN<br>HARMOUCHE | Unknown              | 7153/97 dated 24 <sup>th</sup><br>April 1997 (copy of<br>certificate not seen) | Unknown                               | File # 8308                    | He applied for a<br>Passport 28 <sup>th</sup><br>February 2011 as<br>seen on BPIS;<br>Passport # unknown.<br>His nationality file<br>was not presented to<br>us when requested |



**Khodr Harmouch, the Honorary Consul of Belize in Tripoli Lebanon wrote letters to Minister Manuel Heredia to intervene in the nationality process of persons with the same Harmouch/ Harmouche surname**

102. We observed that there appeared to be a special connection between the Honorary Consul of Belize in Lebanon Khodr H. Harmouch and Hon. Manuel Heredia in order to have the following three members of the Harmouch/ Harmouche family acquire Belizean nationality.

**i. Samir Harmouch**

102.2 We saw a letter dated 9<sup>th</sup> December 2011 from Khodr Harmouch, Belize Consul in Lebanon, to Minister Manuel Heredia in which he requested assistance with regards to a citizenship application for Samir Harmouch. Samir Harmouch was born on the 1<sup>st</sup> October 1989 in El Sfire, Lebanon. Minister Heredia requested Samir Harmouch's nationality file sometime after 9<sup>th</sup> December 2011 (as seen recorded by Gertude Armstrong, Immigration Clerk, in a note dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 in his BNA file's minute sheet) and by the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 nationality certificate # 26406/12 was entered in the Numbers Book. The nationality certificate spreadsheet indicated that it was signed by the Minister Carlos Perdomo on the 12<sup>th</sup> January 2012 but the copy of the certificate and the BPIS Report showed that certificate #26406/12 was dated the 17<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and signed by what appeared as the signature of Minister Carlos Perdomo. The receipt for nationality fee (number not legible) was dated the 12<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

102.3 We found in his Nationality file copies of two different sets of native Passport pages. One was the Republic of Lebanon RL0589513 issued 28<sup>th</sup> November 2005, which had a visa stamp of British Embassy Beirut for visit to Belize for 6 months on the 1<sup>st</sup> (month not legible) 2006 and a wet visitor's permit stamp dated 22-Sept-2006 for the BNBS. The other native Passport copy was Republic of Lebanon RL1848871 issued 27<sup>th</sup> July 2010 with expiry date of 27<sup>th</sup> July 2015. That Passport copy contained an unclear wet stamp by Belize Immigration, San Pedro Office dated 4<sup>th</sup> October 2010 and a Belize Immigration wet entry stamp with the date 4<sup>th</sup> October 2010. The other copies of Passport pages had his first Passport number RL 0589513, and a faded wet visa stamp with the words, "Seen at the British Embassy (Consular Section) Beirut, Good (illegible word) journey to Belize (written in pen) more illegible words dated -1 (illegible word) 2006. The Belize wet entry stamp was also not clear compared to the entry date (22<sup>nd</sup> September 2006) and signature written in it. The Beirut visa stamps need to be verified as genuine.

102.4 We could not ascertain if he had indeed qualified for Belizean nationality on 17<sup>th</sup> January 2012. We were unable to confirm that his visitor's permit stamp dated 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2006 which he obtained, was backdated. He may have entered Belize on the 4<sup>th</sup> October 2010 as his native Lebanese Passport showed.

The Interview was done by Gertrude Armstrong, a clerk in the Nationality Section. We did not see a copy of his oath of allegiance yet he was issued Belizean nationality and a Belizean Passport.

102.5 We noted that Ruben Gonzalez, of Escalante Subdivision, San Pedro witnessed his affidavit, which was to be made by the applicant in support of the nationality application. Mr. Gonzalez was also one of his nationality referees and he stated that he knew the applicant for five (5) years. His other referee Marta Carla Tamai of San Juan Area, San Pedro, stated that she knew the applicant for two (2) years only. Based on her referral, he would not have qualified for Belizean nationality even if everything else was in order since the policy states that the Referee must know the applicant for five years. He did not take his oath of allegiance.

102.6 We observed that he was recommended to the Director on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 by a Clerk, Gertrude Armstrong, and not the OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. . Her recommendation was accepted on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 by the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan who wrote:

“Min, meets legal requirements. Recommended”.

She did so even though he did not meet the legal requirements.

He was issued Belize Nationality Certificate # 26406/12 dated 17<sup>th</sup> January 2012, signed by what appeared as the signature of Carlos Perdomo. He was issued Belize Passport P0194874 on the 15<sup>th</sup> March 2012.

## **ii. Ahmad Harmouche**

103. We also found a letter, dated 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 from Khodr H. Harmouch to Minister Heredia, which requested the assistance with regards to the citizenship application for Ahmad Harmouche. We saw that he was born on the 1<sup>st</sup> February 1992 in El Sfireh, Lebanon as stated on a copy of his native Lebanese Passport #1057849 issued 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2007. Sometime between 8<sup>th</sup> December 2011 and 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012, Minister Heredia requested the nationality file of Ahmad Harmouche as seen recorded by Mr. Gordon Wade, OIC Nationality Section, in a note on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 on the file's minute sheet. By 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 nationality certificate #26363/12 was signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. The visa stamp dated the 9<sup>th</sup> August 2007 seen on a copy of his native Passport page was issued in Belmopan. It was signed by Jerome Lewis, Immigration Officer. The irregularities in his nationality file and his non-qualification for Belizean nationality will be discussed further in this report.

**iii. Ali Harmouch**

104. We noted that a Belize visa was issued on the 18<sup>th</sup> October 2012 to Ali Harmouch born on the 18<sup>th</sup> May 2011 in Lebanon by the Honorary Consul of Belize, Lebanon, by Khodr Harmouch. Ali Harmouch was later added to his father's Abdul Rahman Harmouch, Belizean nationality certificate #26364/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. The translation of Ali Harmouch birth record was not certified by the Foreign Service Office of applicant as the policy stipulates but by a private "Sworn Translator". Abdul Rahman Harmouch's nationality application was dated the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and his certificate was signed by the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. Miss Ady Pacheco was the Immigration officer who conducted the interview. One of his Nationality referees, Everette Anderson, stated that she knew the applicant for four years only. If the father, Abdul Rahman Harmouch, did not qualify for Belize nationality then the son, Ali Harmouch, who was added to his nationality certificate, also did not qualify. We noted that Abdul Rahman Harmouch's nationality file was requested for processing by Minister, Manuel Herdia, as seen noted on his nationality file's minute sheet.

**Conflict of interest and irregularities noted with the Office of Khodr H. Harmouch, Honorary Consul of Belize in Tripoli Lebanon**

105. We found in the Visa files for Lebanon that Khoder Harmouch's Office issued visas to many other persons with the name Harmouch. That situation appeared to be conflict of interest for the Honorary Consul of Belize in Tripoli, to ask a minister of government to intervene in the nationality process for persons who were apparently his family members, whether they had qualified for Belizean nationality or not. The Office of Khodr H. Harmouch, Honorary Consul of Belize in Tripoli Lebanon had also been the subject of irregularities in regard to one hundred and seven (107) unaccounted for Belize visas and other irregularities with the issuances of visas as seen from the Immigration Department Lebanon visa files (see Visa Audit Report referenced Section I)

105.2 We saw a Mohamed R Harmouch's name on a visa stamp for the issue of a visa to Talal Harmouch on 24<sup>th</sup> April 2002. Talal Harmouch was issued his Belizean nationality in August of 2007.

105.3 We also found that Khodr H. Harmouch was the Director of Harmouch's Center Ltd, formerly located on Seagull Street in San Pedro Town in August 2010, with address as Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town in September 2013. It appeared that several members of the Harmouch/Harmouche family, who came to Belize as visitors, may have received temporary employment permits, as seen stamped in their native Passports, for working as "Store Clerks" and "Cashiers" at this Business.

We also found at the Registry that the Harmouch Business was requesting a reduction of penalty fees due for the years 2001-2009 to the Registry. The Director, Khodr H. Harmouch claimed that their “business has not been prosperous over the years due to a lot of competition”.

**Harmouche/Harmouch appeared to have been escaping mandatory military service in Lebanon**

106. We were alarmed by the number of persons with the surname Harmouch or Harmouche who received Belizean nationality and Passports during the period investigated. In previous years, it appeared that members of the Harmouch/Harmouche family were escaping military service in their country by obtaining a second nationality as seen in Belal Hussein Harmouche’s nationality file #15822/01. 106.2 Our examination of Belal Hussein Harmouche’s nationality file also revealed that he arrived in Belize on the 15<sup>th</sup> December 1998 on visa #399/98 and was granted stay until the 14<sup>th</sup> January 1999. He thereafter received further extensions to his visitor’s permit until 4<sup>th</sup> December 1999. He applied for his Belizean nationality in May 2001 and was granted nationality through certificate #14509/01 dated 19<sup>th</sup> August 2001. His name was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration for certificate #14509 dated 17<sup>th</sup> August 2001 (nationality file #15822). He received his Belizean nationality after only 2 years and 8 months in Belize. His nationality application was also supported by bogus referees that will be outlined further in this report. He departed from Belize on the 26<sup>th</sup> August 2003. Information on his departure from Belize was provided/ in a letter dated 19<sup>th</sup> May 2004 from his lawyer.

**Several of the Harmouch/ Harmouche Lebanese Passports were valid for one year**

107. We observed that several of the Harmouch/Harmouche’s Lebanese Passports were valid for one year only. It appeared that those individuals’ entry dates and extensions were backdated or those extensions were issued in their expired Lebanese Passports before their Passports were extended by Sarkis Abu-Nehra, Consul Honoraire du Liban Belize. Those individuals are listed at **Table ZJ** below

**Table ZJ**

The following is the list of Harmouche/Harmouch whose entry dates and extensions appeared to have been backdated or their extensions were issued in their expired Lebanese Passports before their Passports were extended

| <b>Name</b>                                    | <b>Lebanese<br/>Passport<br/>Number</b> | <b>Issue Date</b>              | <b>Expiration Date</b>         | <b>Belize<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Number and<br/>Date</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--|---|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|---|--|
| Ahmad Harmouche (date of birth 1-Feb-1992)     | RL1057849                               | 22 <sup>nd</sup> June 2007     | 21 <sup>st</sup> June 2008     | 26363/12 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2012                          | Extended in Belize by Sarkis Abu-Nehra on 23 <sup>rd</sup> February 2010 and 16 <sup>th</sup> May 2011   |
| Ammar Harmouche (date of birth 1-January-1980) | RL 0971975                              | 22 <sup>nd</sup> February 2007 | 22 <sup>nd</sup> February 2008 | 26321/12 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2012                          | Extended by Sarkis Abu-Nehra in Belize on 25 <sup>th</sup> March 2008 to 24 <sup>th</sup> March 2009 and then until 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2009 to the 6 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 at the Consul Honoraire du Liban Belize |

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Lebanese<br/>Passport<br/>Number</b> | <b>Issue Date</b>              | <b>Expiration Date</b>        | <b>Belize<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Number and<br/>Date</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--|---|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|--|
| Mahmoud Hussein Harmouche<br><br>(date of birth 20 <sup>th</sup> September 1980) | 1617572                                 | 14 <sup>th</sup> October 2001  | 13 <sup>th</sup> October 2002 | 18357/05 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> July 2005                             | Extended by Sarkis Abu-Nehra in Belize on 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2002 to 30 <sup>th</sup> October 2003 from the Consul Honoraire du Liban Belize |
| Ahmad Harmouche<br><br>(date of birth 10 <sup>th</sup> November 1970)            | RL0021233                               | 8 <sup>th</sup> February 2003  | 8 <sup>th</sup> February 2004 | 26239/12 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> January 2012                           | Extended by Sarkis Abu-Nehra in Belize on 15 <sup>th</sup> April 2010 to 15 <sup>th</sup> April 2011 from the Consul Honoraire du Liban Belize     |
| Iman Legha Ep Ali Harmouch<br><br>(date of birth 10 <sup>th</sup> February 1982) | RL1193646                               | 10 <sup>th</sup> December 2007 | 9 <sup>th</sup> December 2008 | 24907/11 dated 1 <sup>st</sup> April 2011                             | Copies of Passport extensions were not seen  |

| Name   | Lebanese<br>Passport<br>Number | Issue Date                   | Expiration Date           | Belize<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Number and<br>Date | Observations   |
|--|--------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|--|--|
| Saad Mohamad Harmouch<br><br>(date of birth 14 <sup>th</sup><br>November 1990) | RL076910                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May<br>2006 | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2007 | 2638/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012          | Extended by Sarkis<br>Abu-Nehra in Belize on<br>14 <sup>th</sup> May 2009 to 13 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2010 and on 9 <sup>th</sup><br>May 2010 to 18 <sup>th</sup> May<br>2011 from the Consul<br>Honoraire du Liban<br>Belize |

**The same bogus Referees were used for those Harmouch/ Harmouche who received Nationality in 2001 and 2002**

108. We found many nationality files that had the same bogus nationality referees. Prominent among those files were Harmouch/ Harmouche who may not have qualified for Belizean nationality in 2001 and 2002 but sill received such nationality. **Table ZK** below lists some of the Harmouch/Harmouche who may not have qualified for Belizean nationality when they received those nationality certificates.

**Table ZK**

The following is the list of Harmouch/Harmouche who may not have qualified for Belizean nationality

| <b>Name of Nationality Applicant</b> | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Certificate</b> | <b>Observations in Nationality File</b>  |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|--|
| Belal Hussein Harmouche              | 15822/01                       | 14509/01                              | 17-Aug-2001                | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse. They were the alleged referees for many individuals who applied for Belizean nationality We did not get to interview those two individuals.d over again. The copies in the files were not from a card but from faded old copies of the the two individuals voters' ID cards |
| Nasr Hussein Harmouch                | 17071                          | 16327/02                              | 25-April-2002              | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse  |
| Layla Mohamad Chebab Harmouch        | 17071                          | 16328/02                              | 25-April-2002              | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral and Robert   |



| <b>Name of Nationality Applicant</b> | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Certificate</b> | <b>Observations in Nationality File</b>   |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|---|
|                                      |                                |                                       |                            | Theodore Hulse  |
| Ahmad Harmouch                       | 17071                          | 16328.1/02                            | 25-April-2002              | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Hussein Harmouch                     | 17071                          | 16328.2/02                            | 25-April-2002              | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse |

**Several Harmouch/ Harmouche may not have qualified for Belizean nationality on the dates their certificates were signed**

- i) Ammar Harmouch native of Lebanon did not meet the five years requirement to receive his Belizean Nationality Certificate Number 26321/12**

109. We noted that Ammar Harmouch, who was born in El Sfireh Lebanon and whose date of birth was stated as 1<sup>st</sup> January 1980, applied for Belizean nationality on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and was issued his Belizean nationality on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012, for which he had not met the required five years domicile in Belize.

109.2 Our examination of his nationality file number 27135/12 revealed the following:

- i) Ammar Harmouch entered Belize on the 16<sup>th</sup> March 2007 through PGIA as seen on his Passport application. Copies of his native Lebanese Passport showed a British Embassy Consular Section Beirut visa stamp dated 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2007 and a PGIA arrival stamp dated 16<sup>th</sup> March 2007. Both stamps need to be verified as genuinely issued.
- ii) The copy of his Lebanese Passport number RL0971975 issued 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2007 with expiry date of 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2008 was not valid from 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2008 to 6<sup>th</sup> September 2009. It was extended by the Honorary Consul of Lebanon in Belize from 7<sup>th</sup> September 2009 to 6<sup>th</sup> September 2010. Although his Passport was expired for more than a year the INS issued him a Belize Temporary Employment Permit and visa extension during the time his Passport was not valid,.
- iii) His Belize address was listed as Sea Grape Drive San Pedro
- iv) His nationality application form was incomplete. (The applicant's parents' information, listing of documents submitted and Part III references sections were not completed).
- v) He did not submit an employment letter, bank statement or letter from FIU
- vi) There was no evidence that Ammar Harmouch submitted his native Passport to the Police when he applied for a Police report, which was necessary for applications for Belizean nationality, yet he was given said Police report. The Police report did not record his Passport number. It was signed by W/ Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and ACP Miguel Segura for the Commissioner of Police.

- vii) His signature on the nationality application, native Passport, police report and interview form did not match the signature on his oath of allegiance form.
- viii) His referees were Maria Lizet Alejos and Irma Grisel Corear both of San Pablo Area, San Pedro who signed his nationality application on the 3<sup>rd</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> of January 2012 respectively. The handwriting pertaining to the referees' information was the same. That same person who filled in the information for said referees wrote 4 years of knowing the applicant and then marked out the number 4 and wrote 5 for both referees. JP Ruben Gonzalez witnessed the affidavit to be done by the applicant in support of the application on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012. Page 5 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011, requires that:

“The Referee must know the applicant for a minimum of 5 years.”

We noted that this requirement was contravened as it was clear that the two referees did not know Ammar Harmouch for the five years period, if at all.

- ix) Miss Gertrude Armstrong did the interview and she was not the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Supervisor who was the person responsible to conduct interviews for Nationality (page 17 of Manual).
- x) Miss Armstrong, on 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012, wrote on the Minute Sheet that the applicant came to Belize in 2006 when nothing in the file indicated that date.

Please note that Miss Armstrong allegedly committed an offense when she wrote that the applicant came to Belize in 2006 when nothing in the file indicated that he entered the country in 2006.

- xi) No evidence of referral to the Investigation Section was seen in his file. Since he was a Lebanese national referral of his case to the Investigation Section is a requirement prior to approval of nationality, as stated before in this report.
- xii) Former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan, recommended the applicant for nationality to the Minister stating that he met legal requirements when the file clearly showed he did not.
- xiii) His Nationality Certificate #26321/12 was signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo and dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012, two (2) days after he submitted his application for Belizean nationality.

109.3 According to the visa stamp in Ammar Harmouch's Lebanese Passport number 0971975, and as stated on his nationality application, his date of entry into Belize was 16<sup>th</sup> March 2007. He therefore would not have qualified for Belizean nationality until the 16<sup>th</sup> March 2012, yet he received his nationality on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

109.4 We saw that his nationality file was requested on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 for processing by Minister Manuel Heredia as noted on the Minute Sheet of his file by Gertrude Armstrong.

109.5 We noted that his nationality certificate #26321/12 was entered in the Numbers Book on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012. His name was also seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration for certificate dated the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. He was issued his Belizean Passport # P0194864 on the 15<sup>th</sup> March 2012. His Passport application was not presented to Audit but the BPIS report showed that he was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Ruben Gonzales, JP, who had also witnessed his affidavit on his nationality application.

**ii) Abdul Rahman Harmouch and Ali Harmouch natives of Lebanon did not meet the five years requirement to receive their Belizean Nationality Certificate Numbers 26364/12 and 26364.1/12**

110. We noted that Abdul Rahman Harmouch who was born in El Sfireh Lebanon and whose date of birth was 1<sup>st</sup> January 1978 applied for Nationality on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and was issued Belizean nationality on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012, for which he had not met the required five years domicile in Belize. The child, Ali Harmouch who was born in Lebanon date of birth was stated as 18<sup>th</sup> May 2011.

110.2 Our examination of Abdul Rahman Harmouch's nationality file number 27241 revealed the following:

- 1) On the copies of his Republic of Lebanon Passport #0933038 which was issued 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2006 and Passport RL1387209 issued 29<sup>th</sup> August 2008, we saw a Belize visa stamp issued at the British Embassy Beirut for travel to Belize on the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2007. Another similar visa was issued on the 10<sup>th</sup> November 2008. Other departure and entry permit stamps to Belize were seen for 10-Nov-2011; 9-April-2011, 26-Jan-2011 and Mexican visas dated 26-May-2010 & 17-Jan-2011. If he entered Belize after the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2007 as the first visa stamp indicated, then he would not have qualified for Belizean nationality until after February 2012 and not on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012.
- 2) His nationality application form was not completed as it did not have his signature.
- 3) His Belize address was listed as Coconut Drive San Pedro

- 4) His child Ali Harmouch was added his nationality certificate # 26364/12 however the translation of the child's birth record was not certified by the required Foreign Service Office of the applicant but by a private "Sworn Translator".
- 5) The child Ali Harmouch was issued Belize visa on the 18<sup>th</sup> October 2012 by Khodr Harmouch, the Honorary Consul of Belize in Lebanon. It was valid up to the 18<sup>th</sup> January 2013.
- 6) Immigration Officer, Miss Ady Pacheco recorded that, Miss Everette Anderson, a referee, stated that she knew the applicant for four years. The requirement on page 5 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual was contravened since it required that the referee must know the applicant for a minimum of five years.

We could not ascertain whether Miss Anderson knew Abdul Rahman Harmouch for the 4 years or if at all.

- 7) He did not submit an employment letter, bank statement or letter from FIU.
- 8) As with Ammar Harmouch and Osama Khaled Harmouch there was no evidence seen in his file of any referral to the Investigation Section for further vetting although he was a Lebanese national.
- 9) He was issued Belizean Nationality certificate #26364/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. His name was seen in the Numbers Book for said certificate on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012.
- 10) He was issued his Belizean Passport # P0194503 on the 9<sup>th</sup> March 2012.

**iii) Hani Harmouch native of Lebanon - irregularities with the issuance of Belizean nationality certificate 28411/13**

111. We noted irregularities with the issuance of Belizean nationality certificate number 28411/13 to Hani Harmouch who was born in El Sfireh Lebanon and whose date of birth was stated as 28<sup>th</sup> September 1988. He applied on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 for his Belizean nationality and was issued such nationality on the 30<sup>th</sup> May 2013. We observed that the Counter Clerk who accepted the nationality application recorded the name "Hon. Manuel Heredia" at the top-right area of the form where the date and the nationality file number were recorded.

111.2 Our examination of Abdul Hani Harmouch's nationality file number 27378 revealed the following:

- 1) His application was incomplete. The Submission of application Section which required the applicant to list documents submitted with application was incomplete.
- 2) His Belize address was listed as Escalante Subdivision, San Pedro Town.
- 3) The copy of his native Republic of Lebanon Passport RL1024240, which was issued 11-May-2007, showed a Belize visa issued 13-Aug-07 at INS Belmopan and a permit stamp from 30-Nov-07 to 29-Dec-07. The visa was issued by Giovanni Tzib, Immigration Officer. We could not ascertain how his native Lebanese Passport got to Belize for a visa stamp in Belmopan, prior to his arrival.
- 4) The PR stamp (PRF#23343/09) dated 26<sup>th</sup> May 2010 seen on page 5 of a copy of his native Passport RL1024240 appeared irregular. We saw on the PR stamp the signature of Mr. Gareth Murillo.
- 5) As with Ammar Harmouch and Abdul Rahman Harmouch there was no evidence of referral to the Investigation Section although he was a Lebanese national.
- 6) He did not submit an employment letter, bank statement or letter from FIU.
- 7) Minister Heredia requested Hani Harmouch's nationality file and also assisted the applicant with his application as we saw recorded on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 by Miss Ady Pacheco in the interview for the question:

"Who is assisting the applicant in his application?" Ms. Ady Pacheco wrote as the response "Ref: Min. Hon. Manuel Heredia".

- 8) On the Minute sheet of Hani Harmouch's file was a notation dated the 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013 by S. Gillett that the applicant's signature did not correspond with the signature in his native Passport. We also noted that the signatures on his application, interview and police report did not match.
- 9) The OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade did not recommend the applicant for nationality but a note dated the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 was made by Ms. Gertrude Armstrong, who was a clerk in the Nationality Section, who recommended the applicant for nationality to the Director.
- 10) He was issued his Belizean nationality certificate number 28411/13 dated 30<sup>th</sup> May 2013 signed by Minister Elvin Penner. His name was seen in the Numbers Book and in the Register for certificate number 28411.
- 11) He was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Martin Cal JP and he was issued Passport number P0242139 on the 18<sup>th</sup> June 2013.

**iv) Wael Harmouch native of Lebanon – irregularities with the issuance of Belizean nationality certificate number 26324/12**

112. We noted\ irregularities with the issuance of Belizean nationality certificate number 26324/12 issued to Wael Harmouch who was born in El Sfireh Lebanon and whose date of birth was stated as 5<sup>th</sup> February 1983. He applied on the 5<sup>th</sup> December 2011 for his Belizean nationality and was issued such nationality on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012. Those irregularities noted in his file number 26537 were as follows:

- 1) The copies of Wael Harmouch's native Republic of Lebanon Passport # RL0015639 did not show that he was resident in Belize for the required five years as there were several visa stamps and arrival dates, especially in the first year. His Passport was issued 29-Jan-2003 with expiry date of 29th January 2008. In it was a Belize visa stamp which was apparently issued on 4-July-06 by the INS at PGIA, the same date written in his entry stamp. Also stamped in his Passport was another Belize wet visa stamp issued on 2-July-2007 with the notation: "Seen at the British Embassy, Beirut for a single journey to Belize." There was also another Belize entry stamp on 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2007. Other stamps showed that he also exited Belize on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2009 and returned on 30<sup>th</sup> April 2009. Belize visa extension stamps, arrival, departure and work permit stamps were issued after 29<sup>th</sup> January 2008 in his expired Lebanese Passport # RL0015639.
- 2) On 13<sup>th</sup> August 2008, he received a temporary employment permit to work as cashier at Mahmoud Harmouch. No business name was stated by the Immigration officer and no evidence of a business certificate was seen in the file. However, on his application for nationality he wrote that he wanted to register as a Belizean because he had business here (in Belize).
- 3) His Belize address was listed as Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town.
- 4) Part III of his application for referees was incomplete (that is, character of applicant and general comment of referees).
- 5) The picture in his Lebanese Passport was photocopied and used for his Police report (suggesting that he may not have been in Belize when someone applied for his Police report). His police report was signed by W/Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and ACP Miguel Segura for Commissioner of Police.
- 6) As with Ammar Harmouch, Wael Harmouch's Passport number was not recorded in his Police report which means it may not have been presented to the Police as an identification of the applicant. His Police Report was signed by W/ Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and ACP Miguel Segura for Commissioner of Police.

- 7) The signature on the copy of Wael Harmouch's Lebanese Passport did not match the one on his Police record, oath of allegiance, nationality application and Interview forms.
  - 8) His interview like Ammar Harmouch was conducted by Gertrude Armstrong although she was not the section's supervisor. He stated that he had spent "6 months in Lebanon army- compulsory" his application was undated but his Interview was done on the 5<sup>th</sup> December 2011.
  - 9) Wael Harmouch's referees for his nationality were: Gilberto James Young, Construction worker of Belmopan and Minor Sagatume, Taximan of #3 K Mart Street, Belmopan although the applicant lived in San Pedro at Pescador Drive. Both referees stated that they knew him for five years.
  - 10) He recorded his total assets as Belize \$250,000.00 but no Bank Statement was seen in his file.
  - 11) No FIU letter or employment letter was presented.
  - 12) As with Ammar Harmouch, Osama Khaled Harmouch, Abdul Rahman Harmouch and Hani Harmouch, his file had no evidence that it was referred to the Investigation Section as required for all Lebanese applicants.
  - 13) On the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 Minister (Rene) Montero requested the processing of Wael Harmouch nationality file. That request was made to former director Miss Ruth Meighan. His request was to also facilitate several other persons with nationality for ceremonies to be held on 13<sup>th</sup> January 2012.
- 112.2 Wael Harmouch received his Belizean nationality certificate #26324/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. His name was seen in the Numbers Book for the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

He was recommended for his Belizean Passport by Florentino Baiza, JP of Belmopan and was issued Passport # P0191420 on the 7<sup>th</sup> February 2012.

**v) Wajih Harmouch was issued Belizean Nationality Certificate Number 26412/12 that belonged to another individual**

113. We discovered a Passport application dated 23<sup>rd</sup> January 2012 for Wajih Harmouch who was born in Lebanon on the 1<sup>st</sup> February 1985. According to the information on his application, he was issued certificate number 26412/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012.
- 113.2 Our search of the Register of Citizens by Registration (Section 10) showed that certificate #26412 was issued to Francisco Antonio Aparicio on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012, whose nationality file number was 26332. When the certificate Numbers book was examined it showed the name Wajih Harmouch as the recipient of certificate #26412.



113.3 We checked the BPIS and it revealed that he used certificate #26412 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 to apply for his Belizean Passport on the 23<sup>rd</sup> January 2012 and that he was recommended by Florentino Baiza, JP, of Cotton Tree Village, Cayo District. We requested his nationality file on the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2014 and were told that it was missing from the cabinet and from the Department.

Wajih Harmouch was issued his Belizean Passport # P0191370 on the 6<sup>th</sup> February 2012.

- vi) Ahmad Harmouche /Ahmed Said Harmouche a native of Lebanon did not meet the five years requirement to receive his Belizean Nationality Certificate Number 26239/12**

114 We noted that Ahmad Harmouche who was born in El Sifre Lebanon and whose date of birth was stated as 10<sup>th</sup> November 1970 applied for and was issued Belizean nationality on the 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012. Although he received his nationality certificate his name was not included on the list of certificates signed before the 2012 General and Municipal Elections.

114.2 Our examination of Ahmad Harmouche's nationality file 26535 revealed the following:

- 1) His name was recorded on his nationality file as Ahmad Harmouch and also on his oath of allegiance signed by P.A. Bernard, J.P and as Ahmed Said Harmouche on his nationality affidavit.
- 2) The copy of his Lebanese Passport #RL0021233 in the name Ahmad Harmouche had issued date of 8<sup>th</sup> February 2003 and expiration date of 8<sup>th</sup> February 2004 but was extended on April 15<sup>th</sup> 2010 to 14<sup>th</sup> April 2011. A wet faded visa stamp was seen on the copy of his expired Lebanese Passport with the notation: "Seen at British Embassy (Consular Section) Beirut good for single entry to Belize within 6 months." It was dated 6<sup>th</sup> September 2006. It is to be noted that while the visa stamp was faded, the pen writing was bright. There were several foreign and local immigration stamps apparently issued in the expired Passport. We saw Belize visa extensions in 2007 and 2008, Belize work permit stamp for 2009, Belize departure and arrival stamps for 2008 and 2009 and a PR stamp dated 17<sup>th</sup> July 2008.

If Ahmad Harmouche arrived in Belize in 2006 then he was issued visa and accepted into Belize on an expired Lebanese Passport.

- 3) His Nationality application stated that he had been in the country from 16<sup>th</sup> December 2006. His entry stamp also showed that he arrived in Belize on 16<sup>th</sup> December 2006 through the PSW Goldson Airport. There was another Visa #639/2010 issued in Libya by Honorary Consul of Belize in Libya which was for 1 year from 23-Feb-2010 to 22-Feb-2011. The BNBS stamp showed his arrival date as 31<sup>st</sup> December 2010.

We could not ascertain why he was issued Belize Visa #639/2010 on 23-Feb-2010 in Libya when the copies of his Passport showed that he may have acquired PR status from 17<sup>th</sup> July 2008. That implied that the PR stamp could not have been in his Passport on the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2010. The PR stamp, signed by what appeared as the signature of Gareth Murillo, appeared irregular as the date was bright, as though it was written after the other information in the stamp. The Passport number was not legible on the page where the PR stamp was seen. Further investigation is required to determine that PR permit number 39681/08 was genuinely issued to him.

- 4) Part III of his application labelled References were incomplete (Character of applicant and General Comments)
- 5) His application did not have the date and signature of counter clerk and it stated that he had a business here although he was just allowed to work as a cashier on 17<sup>th</sup> July 2008 as seen on the PR stamp on a copied page of a Passport with numbers that were not visible.
- 6) His interview like Ammar Harmouch and Wael Harmouch was done by Miss Gertrude Armstrong although she was not the supervisor of the section.
- 7) In the interview he stated that his financial assets were Belize \$100,000 but no proof such as a bank statement was not seen in his file. We saw no letter from the FIU or an employment letter.
- 8) Belize departure and arrival stamps in 2008, 2009 and 2010, 2011 were seen on copied pages of his expired Passport.
- 9) His PR stamp was signed by Gareth Murillo on 17<sup>th</sup> July 2008 stating that he was permitted to work as a “Cashier”. (Cashier for Malak’s Hardware was seen on TEP stamp dated 17<sup>th</sup> July 2008.
- 10) His application was not referred for further vetting as required for Lebanese applicants.
- 11) The Police Report dated 5<sup>th</sup> December 2011 recorded his expired Lebanese Passport number RL 0021233. It was signed by W/Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and by A.C.P Miguel Segura for Commissioner of Police.
- 12) Signatures on oath of allegiance, police report and nationality application did not match his Passport signature.
- 13) His nationality file was requested for processing by Minister Manuel Heredia as seen on the file’s minute sheet.

114.3 We noted that Ahmad Harmouche received his Belizean nationality certificate # 26239/12 dated 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. That certificate was in the name Ahmad Harmouche not Ahmed Harmouche. His name was seen in the numbers book for certificate #26239 for the 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

114.4 We observed that he was issued his Belizean Passport # P0199989 in the name Ahmad Harmouche on the 14<sup>th</sup> May 2012 but his Passport application was not presented to Audit. The BPIS revealed that he was recommended for his Passport by Juliana Arana JP of Belize City.

**vii) Ahmad Harmouche a native of Lebanon did not meet the five years requirement to receive his Belizean Nationality #26363/12**

115. We noted that another Ahmad Harmouche who was born in El Sifre Lebanon and whose date of birth was stated as 1<sup>st</sup> February 1992 applied for nationality on the 5<sup>th</sup> December 2011 and was issued Belizean nationality on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

115.2 Our examination of Ahmad Harmouche's nationality file number 26535/11 revealed the following:

- 1) His nationality application was not completed in that he did not sign said application. It was not dated by the Counter Clerk as was required. The submission of application section was incomplete.
- 2) Part III References Section of the nationality application reflected that Referee #1 Ruben Gonzalez of Escalente Subdivision stated that he had known the applicant for four (4) years. Another referee Abelardo Jesus Guerra of San Juan Area San Pedro stated that he had known the applicant for four to five (4-5) years.

As stated before, page 5 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual of July 1, 2011 requires that the referee must know the applicant for a minimum of 5 years.

- 3) His Belize address was stated as Hurricane Street San Pedro
- 4) His application stated that he wanted Belizean nationality because his "business was here".
- 5) His business address was stated as Best Buy Hardware, Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town. However, he had received a work permit for working as cashier for Khoder Harmouch (the same person who was the Honorary Consul of Lebanon) on 5<sup>th</sup> May 2011.

- 6) The copy of his Lebanese Passport # RL1057849, with issue date of 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2007 and expiry date of 21<sup>st</sup> June 2008, had in it a Belize visa #369/ Bmp/07 which was issued on 1<sup>st</sup> August 2007 in Belmopan at INS and signed by Jerome Lewis. We could not ascertain how his native Passport got to Belize for a visa stamp before his arrival. The entry stamp for the Belize Northern Border stated that he entered on 30<sup>th</sup> September 2007 and it also indicated that he was allowed to remain in Belize until the 29<sup>th</sup> October 2007; however, his nationality application stated that he entered the country of Belize on 20<sup>th</sup> September 2007.
- 7) His Lebanese Passport was extended on 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2010 to 16<sup>th</sup> May 2011 by Sarkis Abu-Nehra, Consul Honoraire du Liban Belize.

His Passport, which expired on the 21<sup>st</sup> June 2008 was not valid during the period 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2008 to 22<sup>nd</sup> February, 2010 but yet he received Belize Immigration stamps. We saw that his first extension was dated 10<sup>th</sup> December 2008. We also saw a dependant permit stamp dated 28<sup>th</sup> October 2008 signed by Giovanni Tzib, another dependant permit signed by another Immigration officer (could not verify signature) on the 10<sup>th</sup> December 2008, visa extensions in 2010, 2011 and 2012 and a temporary employment permit for “Cashier” dated 6<sup>th</sup> May 2011.

- 8) His Interview which was done on 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 (one day before his nationality certificate was signed) by Immigration Officer, Miss Ady Pacheco, stated that he entered Belize on 30<sup>th</sup> September 2007. She signed and stated that he should be granted nationality because he has been residing in Belize since September 2007. If his entry stamp was not backdated, he would have qualified for Belizean nationality on 29<sup>th</sup> September 2012, eight (8) months later.
- 9) His picture on his Police report appeared as a photocopied photo of the one in his Passport. He did not submit his Lebanese Passport when he applied for his Police report as no Passport number was printed on said report. The photos he used were not recent photos as we could not identify him as the person whose photo was seen on the BPIS for a Belizean Passport. His Police Report was signed by W/Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and by someone who signed with the surname “Sabal” for Miguel Segura, ACP for Commissioner of Police.
- 10) His application was not referred for further vetting to the Investigation Unit as should have been the case for all Lebanese nationals.
- 11) Mr Gordon Wade, OIC Nationality Section, on 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 submitted Ahmad Harmouche’s nationality file to the DINS (Director) stating that he qualified for Nationality as he has been living in Belize since 2007. On the same date, the former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan wrote to the minister stating that he met legal requirements when he did not.

12) His oath of allegiance had his name as Ahmad Harmouch not Ahmad Harmouche and it was witnessed on 13<sup>th</sup> January 2012 by Sandra Ireland, Commissioner of the Supreme Court.

13) His nationality file was requested for processing by Minister Manuel Heredia as noted on the minute sheet on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 by the OIC Nationality Section, Gordon Wade. The date the file was requested by the Minister was not stated.

115.3 We noted that Ahmad Harmouche received his Belizean nationality certificate #26363/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. His name was seen in the Numbers book for certificate #26363 dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

115.4 He applied for and was issued his Belizean Passport P0193188 dated 24<sup>th</sup> February 2012. The BPIS showed that he was recommended for his Passport by Florentino Baiza, JP, of Cotton Tree Village, Cayo District.

**viii) Oussama Harmouch a native of Lebanon did not meet the five years requirement to receive his Belizean Nationality #26426/12**

116. We noted that Oussama Harmouch who was born in El Sifre Lebanon and whose date of birth was stated as 27<sup>th</sup> March, 1985 applied for Belizean nationality on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and was issued Belizean nationality on 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

116.2 Our examination of Oussama Harmouch's nationality file number 27216/12 revealed the following:

- 1) Part III of his application labelled References were incomplete (Character of applicant and General Comments). His Belize address was listed as Hurricane Street, San Pedro
- 2) The copy of his Republic of Lebanon Passport #0879878 issued on 30<sup>th</sup> August 2006 with expiry date of 30<sup>th</sup> August 2011 had a Belize visa issued at the INS Bmp on 22-Jan-2007 but his first visit to Belize was on the 16-March-2007 through the PGIA. We could not ascertain how his native Passport got to Belmopan for a visa stamp before he arrived in Belize three (3) months later.
- 3) His Lebanese Passport was not presented to the Police for a criminal record as there was no native Passport number recorded.
- 4) His Interview was done by Miss Gertrude Armstrong who was not authorized by the INS Policy to do so.
- 5) His file had no evidence of referral to the Investigation Section for further vetting as was required for Lebanese applicants.

6) The picture used on his Police report and accepted by the Nationality Section was a very young depiction of him. His Police Report was signed by W/Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and by a person with the surname “Sabal” who signed for Miguel Segura ACP for the Commissioner of Police.

7) There was no evidence of an FIU Report, Employment letter or Bank Statement.

8) The signature on his oath, Police report and nationality application did not match.

(It is to be noted that his signature on his BPIS application was also different than the aforementioned ones at 8 above).

9) His nationality file was requested by Minister Heredia (date not stated) as noted on the minute sheet of the nationality file.

116.3 We searched the Register of Citizens by Registration and it revealed that nationality certificate #26426/12 had been issued on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 to Mona Irma Meza whose nationality file number was 30406. His name and BNA file number 27216 was squeezed in between the line and the information that was recorded for Mona Irma Meza in the Register of citizens by Registration. The Numbers book listed his name as the recipient of certificate # 26426 while Mona Irma Mesa’s name was not recorded therein.

116.4 Oussama Harmouch received certificate #26426/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. He along with nine other persons with the surname Harmouche received Belizean nationality on the 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

116.5 He applied for and was issued his Belizean Passport# P0198894 dated 30<sup>th</sup> April 2012. His Passport application was one of the many that was not presented to us. The BPIS showed that he was recommended for his Belize Passport by Ruben Gonzalez, JP.

**There were other Harmouch/ Harmouche family members whose nationality files showed irregularities**

**A) Mahmoud Hussein Harmouche – Nationality Certificate # 18357/05**

117. We observed that Mahmoud Hussein Harmouche, who was born in Lebanon on the 20<sup>th</sup> September 1980, applied for Belize Nationality on the 25<sup>th</sup> June 2004 and received Belizean nationality on the 11<sup>th</sup> July 2005. His address was stated as Coconut Drive, San Pedro.

117.2 We examined his nationality file number 20018/04 and the following were noted:

- 1) His application for nationality in 2005 was first denied since he had been convicted on 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2002 in the Belize City Magistrate Court for operating a Casa de Cambio without a license. This information was obtained from the relevant Belize Security Clearance; the Head Special Branch dated 22<sup>nd</sup> July 2004.
- 2) On the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2005, Mr. Gian C Ghandi (Legal Counsel) in the Ministry of Finance and Home Affairs, Legal Department wrote on the minute sheet to the former Director: “In view of adverse reports from the Special Branch and the Attorney General’s Ministry, the application for Nationality is refused”.
- 3) He was also not recommended by the Cabinet Secretary on 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2005 and his file was requested to be sent to the Minister by former Director, Jose Zetina on 24<sup>th</sup> June 2005 stating that the Committee (Nationality Advisory Committee) was not recommending because of grievous conviction. Ms. Ady Pacheco wrote the Minister on the Minute Sheet stating the reasons for the denial of his application on the 29<sup>th</sup> June 2005. On 30<sup>th</sup> June 2005, Hon Ralph Fonseca wrote the Director on the Minute Sheet stating, “Recommendation of the Committee has been carried”. However, on 11<sup>th</sup> July 2005, former Minister Ralph Fonseca again wrote the director stating, “DINS after meeting today and pledge to follow the (illegible word) law as we mutually agreed- approved (signed by Hon Ralph Fonseca and dated 11<sup>th</sup> July 2005).
- 4) Mahmoud Hussein Harmouche may not have qualified for Belizean nationality as his nationality file also showed that he did not have a copy of the native Passport with which he first entered Belize. It had a copy of Permanent Residence (PR) Card, File #15986/2000 (Permit # 31081/2000 with Belize entry date stated as 6<sup>th</sup> January 1999. The card was issued on 28<sup>th</sup> March 2000 and was signed by former Director, Paulino Castellanos.
- 5) A copy of his Lebanese Passport #1617572; issued 14<sup>th</sup> October 2001 to the 13<sup>th</sup> October 2002, which did not have his signature, was extended to 31<sup>st</sup> October 2002 by Sarkis Abu-Nehra of the Consul Honarario de Liban a Belice. The 2001 issued Lebanese Passport showed an arrival stamp with date 17<sup>th</sup> January 2003 from the PSW Goldson International Airport.
- 6) Part III of Mahmoud Hussein Harmouche’s nationality application for referees was incomplete and his lab report and PR Card were in the name Mahmoud Harmouch and not the Harmouche (with the “e”)

117.3 He was approved Belizean nationality via certificate # 18357/05 dated 11<sup>th</sup> July 2005 and signed by Minister Ralph Fonseca in the name of Mahmoud Harmouche.

**B) Iman Harmouch (Iman legha EP Ali Harmouch was her name on her Nationality File) – nationality certificate #24907/11**

118. Iman Harmouch, born in El Sfire Lebanon on the 10<sup>th</sup> February 1982, applied for Belizean nationality through marriage to Ali Harmouch (2<sup>nd</sup> June 2010) and received nationality certificate number 24907/11 dated 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo.

118.2 We examined her nationality file number 25557/10 and the following were noted:

- 1) Her address was stated as Sea Grape Drive, San Pedro Town
- 2) Gertrude Armstrong did the interview for Iman Harmouch aka Iman Legha Harmouch although she was not the section supervisor.
- 3) Ruben Gonzalez was the JP who witnessed the affidavit and was a referee for the applicant. He also recommended her for her Belize Passport.
- 4) The signature in her native Passport number RL 1193646 (issued 10<sup>th</sup> December 2007 and expiry date 9<sup>th</sup> December 2008) and oath of allegiance & Civic Test did not match.
- 5) The Belmopan wet visa stamp issued on the 4<sup>th</sup> January 2008 was signed by Immigration officer, Giovanni Tzib, and the Northern Border arrival stamp was dated 14<sup>th</sup> April 2008. We could not ascertain how her native Lebanese Passport got to Belmopan for a visa stamp before she came to Belize three (3) months later through the Belize Northern Border as her file indicated.
- 6) She received her Belizean nationality through marriage but there was no evidence seen of further vetting by the Investigation Section as required for applicants through marriage and Lebanese nationals.
- 7) A nationality certificate number 21321/07 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2007, signed by Minister Ralph Fonseca, which was issued to Ali Harmouch, Lebanese native with date of birth stated as 15<sup>th</sup> May 1983. We saw the name Ali Harmouch in the Register of citizens by Registration for certificate number 21321/07 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2007 (nationality file #22730). Ali Harmouch was issued Belize Passport number P0223123 on the 28<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The BPIS recorded certificate number 21321/07 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2011 for his Passport application and he was recommended for his Passport by Charles Abou-Nehra, JP. His Passport application was not presented to Audit.

118.3 We saw that Iman Harmouch was issued her Belizean nationality certificate #24907/11 dated 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. Her name was seen as Iman Legha Harmouch in the Numbers Book for certificate 24907 recorded on the 28<sup>th</sup> March 2011.



118.4 She applied for and was issued her Belizean Passport #P0169443 dated 20th June 2011. The BPIS showed that she was recommended for her Belize Passport by Ruben Gonzales, JP.

**C) Nouredine Mohamad Harmouch – Nationality Certificate # 21361/07**

119. We observed that Nouredine Mohamad Harmouch who was born in Lebanon on the 1<sup>st</sup> August 1982 applied for Belizean nationality on the 15<sup>th</sup> May 2007 and was issued nationality certificate number 21361/07 on the 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007.

119.2 We examined Nouredine Mohamad Harmouch's nationality file number 30651/07 and the following were noted:

- 1) His references were given by Yecenia Abuguel Ardon De Paz and Elga Ciomara De Paz who were both of Mountain View Area, Belmopan while the applicant claimed to live in San Pedro. In the section that requested how the acquaintance came about, both referees referred to the applicant as a "she" although he is a male. Yecenia Abuguel Ardon De Paz stated, "I met her through her sister" while Elga Ciomara De Paz commented, "I met her at her work. I use to go and buy and we became friends". The form for both referees was incomplete and they did not answer the questions: "What does the referee know about the character of applicant" and "General Comment of Referee. If he thinks applicant is genuine and should be granted Nationality".
- 2) The PR stamp, seen on a copy of his native Lebanese Passport number 2044315 (issued and expiration date unknown) with an illegible permit number, stated that he was permitted to remain in Belize as a permanent resident "store clerk". The Passport page (#43) appeared as though it was copied from another Passport as the Passport numbers were also not visible on the page as seen on previous copies of the same Passport (2044315). The PR stamp had what appeared as the signature of former INS Director, Peter Parchue at the bottom. The PR file number was also not legible.
- 3) His Nationality file #30651 was returned on 27<sup>th</sup> September 2007 for pictures by someone who signed with the surname "Pacheco" because the photo presented was a picture of another picture but yet his application was approved by the Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo and by the Cabinet Secretary, Mr. Robert. Leslie on the 20<sup>th</sup> September 2007.
- 4) His interview was done by Kathy Linares who was not the Supervisor of the Section. She was a Clerk in the Nationality Section at the time.

119.3 Nouredine Mohamad Harmouch received Belizean nationality certificate # 21361/07 dated 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007 signed by Minister Ralph Fonseca.

119.4 Nouredine Mohamad Harmouch was issued his Belizean Passport number P0075903 on the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2007; however, we saw no record that he renewed his Belizean Passport during the period reviewed.

**D) Saad Mohamad Harmouch – Nationality certificate #26328/12**

120. We saw a Passport application for Saad Mohamad Harmouch born in El Sfireh, Lebanon on the 4<sup>th</sup> November 1990. It was dated the 19<sup>th</sup> March 2012 and his address was stated as Pescador Drive, San Pedro. He was recommended for his Passport by Florentino Baiza, JP, of Cotton Tree Village, Cayo District.

120.2 We saw attached to his Passport application was a copy of Republic of Lebanon Passport number 0710469 with issue date 29<sup>th</sup> May 2006 and expiry date of 29<sup>th</sup> May 2007 and a letter from the Belize Social Security Board dated 19<sup>th</sup> March 2012 (the same date of his Passport application) stating that he had applied for his social security card and that it will not be ready until the 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2012.

120.3 We observed that Belizean nationality certificate number 26328/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 was recorded on his Passport application but a copy of it was not attached. A search of the Register of Citizens by Registration showed that he was issued certificate number 26328 and that his nationality file was number 26543. The certificate numbers book showed that he was assigned certificate number 26328 on the 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

120.4 We examined his nationality file number 26543 and the following were noted:

- 1) His Belize address was stated as Pescador Drive, San Pedro on his nationality application.
- 2) Part III of his nationality application for referees was incomplete
- 3) A copy of his native Lebanese Passport #RL0710469 was seen in his file.
- 4) His date of entry into Belize was recorded as the 16<sup>th</sup> November 2006 on his nationality application. A copied page of his Passport RL0710469 showed a stamp that indicated that he entered the country on the 16<sup>th</sup> November 2006 through the BNBS. Two visa stamps were seen on copies of his Passport. The first was issued on the 21<sup>st</sup> June 2006 by the British Embassy Consular Section, Beirut. A line was marked through the stamp as though it was cancelled but the words cancelled were not seen.
- 5) Another Belize visa stamp issued on the 14<sup>th</sup> April 2010 at the BNBS showed that his date of entry into Belize was the 14<sup>th</sup> April 2010. An undated dependant permit stamp signed by Immigration Officer, Jerome Lewis, for being the dependant of Abdallah Saad Harmouch up to the 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2008.

We noted that the dependant permit and visa which had been issued in his Passport that had expired since 29<sup>th</sup> May 2007.

- 6) An employment permit stamp dated the 20<sup>th</sup> May 2009 signed by Immigration Officer, Giovanni Tzib, for employment as a “shop clerk” for Abdullah Harmouch.
  - 7) His native Passport was extended twice, that is, the 14<sup>th</sup> May 2009 and on the 19<sup>th</sup> May 2010 by Sarkis Abu-Nehra, Honorary Consul of Lebanon in Belize. The second extension was up to the 18<sup>th</sup> May 2011. No visa extensions were seen on the copies of his native Passport, which indicated he may have been in the country illegally.
  - 8) His interview was done by Miss Gertrude Armstrong who was not the duly appointed officer to conduct the interview.
  - 9) There was no evidence of further vetting as was required through the Referral System for all Lebanese applicants.
  - 10) He was recommended for nationality on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 by a Clerk, Miss Gertrude Armstrong to the Director when it should have been the OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade, as we observed was the standard procedure.
  - 11) The Police record had a photocopied picture of his Passport picture. He may not have presented his native Passport to the police as no Passport number was recorded on the report, which was signed by W/ Sergeant Eleanor Ramirez and by Miguel Segura, ACP for Commissioner of Police
  - 12) Hon. Rene Montero requested Saad Mohamad Harmouch’s nationality file via a letter dated 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012 to former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. This same letter was seen in the nationality file for Wael Harmouche as outlined earlier in this Report at paragraph **112**.
  - 13) Saad Mohamad Harmouch was issued his Belizean nationality certificate #26328/12 dated 11<sup>th</sup> January 2012 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo. Said certificate was signed by the Minister exactly two days after it had been requested by Hon. Rene Montero.
- 120.5 We noted that he applied on the 19<sup>th</sup> March 2012, for his Belizean Passport but did not present a copy of a Belize identification card. He instead presented a letter dated 19<sup>th</sup> March 2012 from the Social Security Board, which stated that his social security card #000503588 would not have been ready until the 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2012. Since he had been issued employment permits in 2009 he should have been registered at the Social Security Board prior to March 2012
- 120.6 We saw that his Passport application signature did not match his Lebanese Passport signature. He was issued his Belizean Passport P0197605 on the 13<sup>th</sup> April 2012.

**More Nationality Files for persons with the surname Harmouch were on pending status at the Department**

121. We have attached as **Appendix H.1** the nationality files that were on pending status as seen on the spreadsheet labelled “Minister’s list” for more persons with the surname Harmouch or Harmouche.

**56 persons who were not qualified were fraudulently issued Permanent Residence (PR) status**

The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual (July 1, 2011) states:

*“When examining the passport Counter Clerk must check one year backwards from the date of application. Passport must be examined to ensure that the applicant has satisfied the one year domicile period in Belize.”*

122. We were not presented with the Permanent Residence Permit Number Book for the period April 1, 2011 to the 26<sup>th</sup> September 2011 but were able to receive copies of the Number Book from the Commissioner of Police for the period 27<sup>th</sup> September 2011 to the 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

122.2 We found that fifty-six (56) persons were fraudulently issued permanent residence status for the period 27<sup>th</sup> September 2011 to the 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013. Our findings were revealed through examination of the copies of PR Permit Number book (received from the Police) along with PR files. Those persons were fraudulently issued PR numbers that in some cases belonged to other persons. Such fraud was done to make it appear as though those persons had been resident in Belize for the one year domicile period and had qualified for permanent residence and subsequently Belizean nationality and Passports.

122.3 We saw at the very end of the pages of the PR Permit Number Book, which was allocated for spacing and not to record information, the names and other information of several persons with fraudulent PR numbers. Those persons were issued the PR number of the person listed on the first line of the next page. Other persons who had also received PR numbers fraudulently were recorded on the regular lines in the PR Register and some were squeezed in between the names of those that had been previously recorded.

- 122.4 We have listed at **Appendix I** all persons who were issued PR Permit numbers fraudulently as “replace old PR” and the names that those PR permit numbers had been previously issued to. The names may have been misspelt in some cases as the writing in the PR Permit Register was not always legible, hence we could not find any more information on several of them to ascertain whether they had been approved visas prior to the fraudulent issuance of PR Permit numbers, or whether they had already received Belize Nationality and Passports.
- 122.5 We also found that persons who were approved visas were fraudulently issued PR numbers in less than one (1) year. Those PR numbers also included numbers that had previously been issued to other persons and in some cases the PR dates were backdated and stated as issued even before the date their visas were approved. Some of them also received Belizean nationality and Passports through their fraudulent PR status as outlined further in this report at **Table ZN**.
- 122.6 We also found that many of those persons were issued Belize nationality certificates and Passports, while the others were issued Belizean nationality certificates only or their nationality applications were at pending status. We may not have found evidence of Belizean Passports issued for many of them prior to October 2013 because they could have changed their names at the VSU before they applied for their Belizean Passport. Also, we did not get a list of all nationality certificates issued for the period investigated.
- 122.7 We found in addition to Tianzhi Wang, a fraudulent PR holder who was issued visa and subsequently received Belize nationality and Passport. That individual is Yong Bo Ye (Yongbo Ye), who was born in China and his date of birth was stated as 12<sup>th</sup> September 1968, also received his Belizean Passport under similar circumstances.
- 122.8 We saw that Yongbo Ye submitted a visa application on the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2011 signed by Wen Bin Chen. His application was accepted by Miss Ady Pacheco and he was approved visa #26842 on the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2011 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan. He was sponsored by Wen Bin Chen of Chen's Mall of 3886 Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan) who stated that he was his friend. The letter of financial support used was not the form for Visa sponsors but for Permanent Residency sponsors. Yongbo Ye was issued his Belizean nationality certificate #26175 on the 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012. It is likely that his certificate was signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo since he was the Minister at that time. We did not see a copy of the certificate but we saw this information in the Nationality Certificate Numbers Book and on the electronic spreadsheet of certificates we received from OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Wade, which was signed by the Minister prior to the 2012 General Elections.

- 122.9 We saw his name in the Register of Citizens by Registration for certificate number 26175 (BNA file #26876). His BPIS application Report showed that he applied for a Belize Passport on the 6<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and paid the regular Passport fee of \$50.00 vide receipt #638492. He presented nationality certificate #26175 dated 5<sup>th</sup> January 2012. His home address was stated as Punta Gorda Town, Toledo District and he was recommended for his Passport by Eleodoro Lewis, JP.
- 122.10 We noted that he was subsequently issued Belizean Passport # P0189513 on the 6<sup>th</sup> January 2012 through expedite service for which he should have paid \$100.00 and not \$50.00. He received a Belize Passport eighteen (18) days after he was approved a visa by former Director, Ruth Meighan to enter Belize. Further investigation is required to ascertain his date of entry into Belize and the contents of his nationality file #26876.
- 122.11 We saw many other persons with fraudulent PR Permit numbers who received Belizean nationality and Passports but there were no evidence they had been issued their visas just before getting those Belizean documents. Those persons are listed at **Table ZN** further in this report.
- 122.12 We could not ascertain the dates the recipients of fraudulent PR numbers actually entered Belize (except for Tianzhi Wang). Further investigation is required to ascertain their dates of entry into Belize. Additionally, we found no record of the payment of PR Permit fees for those persons with fraudulently issued PR permit numbers.
- 122.13 At **Table ZL** below are the individuals who were fraudulently issued PR status after they had received visas from the Director INS through the Belmopan office. In some cases the PR Permit numbers issued to them had already been issued to other persons.

**Table ZL**

The following is the list of individuals who had been fraudulently issued PR status right after they had received visas from the Director INS

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>PR Permit Number</b> | <b>Date of issue</b>           | <b>Visa Application Accepted by and Approved by</b> | <b>Visa Number and Date Approved</b> | <b>Visa Sponsor</b>                       | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------|-------------------------|--------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| Tianzhi Wang | 43608                   | 9 <sup>th</sup> November 2011  | Miss Ady Pacheco<br>Miss Ruth Meighan               | V00025636<br>7th November 2011       | Wen Bin Chen of Chen's Shopping Mall, Bmp | He received nationality certificate #25698 dated 24th November 2011 and two Passports; one in the name Freakin Yang and the other in Tianzhi Wang (see paragraph 46 of this report) |
| Yongbo Ye    | 43895                   | 28 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | Miss Ady Pacheco<br>Miss Ruth Meighan               | V00026842<br>19th December 2011      | Wen Bin Chen of Chen's Shopping Mall, Bmp | He received nationality certificate #26175 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> January 2012. He was issued Belizean Passport # P0189513 on the 6 <sup>th</sup> January 2012                       |
| Lin You      | 44044                   | 13 <sup>th</sup> March 2012    | Miss Ady Pacheco<br>Miss Ruth Meighan               | V00026864<br>9th January 2012        | Wen Bin Chen of Chen's Shopping Mall, Bmp | He also had a PR card #190868 for Mexico issued 20th September 2011, which further confirmed that he had not been living in Belize for a year to have acquired Permanent Residence. |

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>PR Permit Number</b> | <b>Date of issue</b>  | <b>Visa Application Accepted by and Approved by</b> | <b>Visa Number and Date Approved</b>                           | <b>Visa Sponsor</b>   | <b>Observations</b>   |
|---------------|-------------------------|---|---|--|---|---|
| Wen Yuan Chen | 44045                   | 13 <sup>th</sup> March 2012   | Martin Guy/<br>Director                             | V00029387<br>5th March 2012                                    | Wen Bin Chen of<br>Chen's Shopping<br>Mall, Bmp   | By the 19 <sup>th</sup> October 2012 he registered as owner of 101 Wireless along with Wenjing Chen of 3896 Mountain View Blvd. Belmopan, and became sponsor of other visa applicants |
| Jin Jie Huang | 44738                   | 23 <sup>rd</sup> November 2012  | Miss Adli Martinez<br><br>Miss Ruth Meighan         | V00033814<br>2nd October 2012                                  | Wenjing Chen of<br>#3 Hummingbird<br>Highway<br>Belmopan  | PR Permit# 44738 had been genuinely issued to Elbetah Chiroma Danladi of Gwagwalada, Nigeria.   |
| Xiaoting Su   | 44770                   | No date recorded in PR Permit Number Book but the previous date was 3 <sup>rd</sup> December 2012 | Mr. Martin Guy<br><br>Miss Ruth Meighan             | V00037533<br>5th February 2013                                 | Weitao Liu of<br>Kangle Foam<br>Factory at<br>Henderson Ave. 2<br>1/2 Miles<br>Northern<br>Highway<br>(deceased on 16th May-2013) | PR Permit # 44770 had been issued to Ifeanyi Henry Akuruka of Owerw, Nigeria.   |
| Muhua Li      | 44865                   | 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2013<br>(Backdated.<br>See column 5)                                     | Copy of visa<br>application not seen                | V00039580<br>12th June 2013 as<br>per Belmopan<br>Visa Returns | Copy of visa<br>application not<br>seen   | PR Permit# 44865 had been issued to Tammy Lier Gibson of California, USA  |



| <b>Name</b> | <b>PR Permit Number</b> | <b>Date of issue</b>          | <b>Visa Application Accepted by and Approved by</b> | <b>Visa Number and Date Approved</b>      | <b>Visa Sponsor</b>                                  | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|---|---|--|---|
| Lang Yan Su | 44928                   | 30 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 | Mr. Martin Guy<br>Miss Ruth Meighan                 | V00032313<br>23rd July 2012               | Yu Cheng Xiao<br>owner of New China Town Supermarket | PR Permit# 44928 had been issued to Davis Garland Turner of Louisiana, USA  |
| Rujian Jian | 44942B                  | 5 <sup>th</sup> February 2013 | Miss Adli Martinez<br>Miss Ruth Meighan             | V00033810<br>2nd October 2012.            | Xuefei Cao owner of Hattieville Store                | Xuefei Cao was also issued a bogus PR# 43819 on the 12th February 2011 and was issued Belizean Passport #P0165331 on the 6th May 2011.<br><br>PR Permit # 44942 had been issued to Angela McKie of Byena, St. Vincent |
| Jia Yong Ma | 44944B                  | 5 <sup>th</sup> February 2013 | Miss Adli Martinez<br>Miss Ruth Meighan             | V00033811<br>2 <sup>nd</sup> October 2012 | Xuefei Cao owner of Hattieville Store                | See above for Sponsor Xuefei Cao.<br><br>PR Permit #44944 had been issued to Mary Collen Steege of Maryland, USA  |

| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>PR Permit Number</b> | <b>Date of issue</b>   | <b>Visa Application Accepted by and Approved by</b> | <b>Visa Number and Date Approved</b> | <b>Visa Sponsor</b>  | <b>Observations</b>  |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Zi Jian Chen                 | 44956B                  | 11 <sup>th</sup> February 2013 (was backdated. See column 5) | Mr. Martin Guy<br>Ms. Maria Marin                   | V00039578<br>8th May 2013            | Daxi Huang of OK Restaurant (was not registered at Companies Registry), Caribena Street, San Pedro Town. Belize PR permit #40668/09 was stamped in his native Chinese Passport signed by Mr. Gareth Murillo. | PR Permit # 44956 had been issued to Juan Jose Leiva of Honduras   |
| Hailiang Lin (Hai Liang Lin) | 44957B                  | 12 <sup>th</sup> February 2013 (backdated. See column 5)     | R. Mejia<br>Ms. Maria Marin                         | V00039581<br>21st May 2013           | Jie Fu Lin of Lin's Hardware, George Price Highway, Santa Elena  | Visa was recommended by Minister Elvin Penner.<br><br>PR Permit # 44957 had been issued to Samuel Kim of Korea who was also an American National |
| Bi Qi Su (Biqi Su)           | 44960                   | 13 <sup>th</sup> February 2013                               | Mr. Martin Guy<br>Miss Ruth Meighan                 | V00032314<br>23rd July 2012          | Yu Cheng Xiao of New China Town Supermarket  | PR Permit # 44960 Biqi Su had been to Zakir Ahmed of Sylhet,   |

| <b>Name</b>    | <b>PR Permit Number</b> | <b>Date of issue</b>  | <b>Visa Application Accepted by and Approved by</b> | <b>Visa Number and Date Approved</b>                   | <b>Visa Sponsor</b>  | <b>Observations</b>  |
|----------------|-------------------------|---|---|--|--|--|
|                |                         |   |   |  |  | Bangladesh   |
| Jian Zhong Cao | 44961                   | 14 <sup>th</sup> February 2013  | Miss Adli Martinez<br>Miss Ruth Meighan             | V00033812<br>2nd October 2012                          | Xuefei Cao owner of Hattieville Store on the 20th June 2012 (This is when the store was registered?)   | See above for Sponsor Xuefei Cao.<br><br>PR Permit # 44961 had been issued to John Gordon Stapler of Peterborough, Canada  |
| Xiaoxia Zhen   | 45015                   | 27 <sup>th</sup> July 2012 (backdated. Permit series 45001 were those that were being used in 2013) | Miss Ady Pacheco<br>Miss Ruth Meighan               | 26888 (Ref #064 Bmp12<br>2 <sup>nd</sup> February 2012 | Jian Xing Chen of #1453 George Price Drive, Dangriga (owner of F & A Game Shop located at #750 St. Vincent Street a business that was not registered at the Companies Registry). | Jian Xing Chen was also mentioned in our Passport report for irregular frequent renewals of his Belizean Passports.<br><br>To replace old PR Permit #3297/86 was recorded in the Permit Number Book but on her visa application it was indicated that she had never been to Belize within the last 10 years. |

122.14 We observed that the person who entered the names of those persons in the PR Register wrote the words, “replace old PR” in the column where the receipt number and PR fees should have been recorded. Additionally, no PR file numbers were issued to those persons and just a hyphen was recorded in the “File Number” Column of the Register. The person who entered those PR numbers as “replace old PR” may have committed a prosecutable offense by falsifying important records in an effort to deceive persons to believe that those persons had qualified for Belizean permanent residence when they did not.

122.15 We noted that the handwritings in the PR Permit Number Book that recorded those fraudulent PR permit numbers resembled those of the Nationality and Permanent Residence section Clerk, Gertrude Armstrong and that of the Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco. In some cases Miss Pacheco also accepted the visa applications of those persons as shown at **Table ZL** above. We observed that section 22 of the Nationality Law may have been violated, which states:

*“Any person who, for the purpose of procuring anything to be done or not to be done under this Act, makes any statement which he knows to be false in a material particular commits an offence and shall, on conviction after summary trial before a magistrate, be liable to imprisonment for a term not exceeding twelve months.”*

122.16 We learned that Miss Pacheco worked in the Nationality Section during the period investigated. As a result, we could not ascertain why Miss Ady Pacheco accepted visa applications and signed on visas for persons who were subsequently issued fraudulent PR numbers, nationality and Passports. Those fraudulent insertions in the PR Permit Number Book also appeared to be done in her handwriting when compared to a note she had written at the back of the Number Book which stated:

*“Note: Book closed. New permit Book opened. (Signed) Ady Pacheco 6.1.14.”*

122.17 As can be seen from **Table ZL** above, Wen Bin Chen of Chen’s Shopping Mall, of #3886 Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan and Wenjing Chen of #3896 Mountain View Boulevard appeared to be involved in more than just sponsoring visa applicants due to the frequency of persons they sponsored who had received fraudulent Belizean permanent residence, nationality and Passports. Their roles in relation to those findings and others are discussed further in this report: Wen Bin Chen at paragraphs 46, 47, 47.2, 47.3, 47.10, 47.12 and 48.6, and Wen Jing Chen at paragraphs 9.11, 10.11, 11.8, 11.10, 47.4 and 47.9. Xuefei Cao, previous owner of Hattievill Store also seemed to have been involved in sponsoring persons for visas who would thereafter receive fraudulent permanent residence status as outlined below.

## **Xuefei Cao – Fraudulent PR Permit Number 43819**

123. We found that Xuefei Cao, who was born in Guangdong China, with her date of birth stated as 8<sup>th</sup> August 1982, was fraudulently issued PR Permit #43819. The entry in the PR Permit Number Book was dated 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2011. However, we noted that she had submitted her Passport application in May 2011 almost seven months before and stated that her address was #26 Sibun, Hattievillage Village.
- 123.2 We noted that she applied for her first issue Belizean Passport with nationality certificate #24895/11 dated 29<sup>th</sup> March 2011 (eight months plus before receiving her PR Permit on 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2011). Her Passport application did not have a copy of her birth certificate or a copy of her Belizean identification card to show that she was living in Belize for at least a year. That was the case with many 1<sup>st</sup> issue Passport applicants who did not present copies of their birth certificates. Their native Passports reflected that they had recently received those Passports which did not indicate that they had been living in Belize for a year or more (see Passport report referenced Section III).
- 123.3 We observed that Xuefei Cao was fraudulently issued her Belizean Passport #P0165331, on the 6<sup>th</sup> May 2011, which confirmed that her PR Permit number 43819 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2011 was fraudulent and was issued almost seven months before her name and fraudulent PR were recorded in the PR Permit number Book.
- 123.4 We saw that on the 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 she applied at the Belmopan office as a visa sponsor for five Chinese persons who were approved visas on the said date. She used the Change of Name of Business Registration certificate #7062 (from Ah Wing Shop to Hattievillage Store), which was transferred on the 20<sup>th</sup> June 2012 to her as seen at the Business and Companies Registry. The business was formerly owned by Jin Rong Ke as Ah Wing Shop then it was transferred to Juzhong Cao on 21<sup>st</sup> May 2008, then to Shaomei Zhu on 1<sup>st</sup> June 2011. The name Ah Wing Shop was changed to Hattievillage Store on the 20<sup>th</sup> June 2012 and ownership was transferred on said date to Xuefei Cao. By the 5<sup>th</sup> April 2013, less than a year, after Xuefei Cao had been approved visas for the persons listed below **at Table ZM**, Hattievillage Store was transferred back to Juzhong Cao who had previously owned it from 2008 to May 2011. It appeared as though the business was transferred to Xuefei Cao in order for her to use the business certificate to sponsor visas for other persons.
- 123.5 We found that three (3) of the five (5) persons Xuefei Cao had sponsored and who had on the 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 been issued visas, fraudulently received PR Permits as she had. We did not see evidence that they had been issued Belizean Passports but they could have changed their names. The names of the five persons she sponsored can be seen at **Table ZM** below.

**Table ZM**

The following table shows the five persons who were issued visas and thereafter fraudulently received PR status

| <b>Visa applicant</b> | <b>Visa Number approved</b> | <b>Relationship to Xue Fei Cao</b>                          | <b>Fraudulent PR#/ date recorded</b>                      |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------|---|---|
| Ru Jian Jian          | 33810                       | Cousin (as declared on Letter of Financial Support)         | Fraud PR44942B dated 5 <sup>th</sup> February 2013        |
| Jia Yong Ma           | 33811                       | Cousin (as declared on Letter of Financial Support)         | Fraudulent PR #44944B dated 5 <sup>th</sup> February 2013 |
| Jian Zhong Cao        | 33812                       | Brother (as declared on Letter of Financial Support)        | Fraudulent PR44961 dated 14 <sup>th</sup> February 2013   |
| Fang Xian Lin         | 33813                       | Sister- in-law (as declared on Letter of Financial Support) | None seen issued up to September 2013                     |
| Xue Wen Lin           | 33815                       | Sister-in-law (as declared on Letter of Financial Support)  | None seen issued up to September 2013                     |

**Jian Xing Chen aka Jianxing Chen did not qualify for Belizean Nationality Certificate number 8652/98**

Section 10 (1) (a) of the Nationality Act states:

*“An applicant for registration as a citizen of Belize should be of “full age”...*

*And*

*Section 13 (4) states:*

*“Where a minor child...has attained the age of eighteen years, and cannot for that reason be included in the parent’s certificate of registration, he shall be entitled to apply for Belizean citizenship...”*

124. In our Passport Audit Report referenced Section III, we outlined our findings on Jian Xing Chen, born in China, with date of birth stated as the 26<sup>th</sup> November 1980, who renewed several of his Belizean Passports irregularly and frequently before they had expired. A search of the BPIS showed that he used Belizean nationality certificate #8652/98 dated 7<sup>th</sup>

July, 1998, which was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration as issued to Jianxing Chen under Section 10 Registration. However, according to the BPIS report, his date of birth was indeed 26<sup>th</sup> November 1980, which meant that he was still 17 years when he apparently got a certificate in his own name, when he should have been included on one of his parent's nationality certificate.

124.2 Our investigation revealed that Jianxing Chen aforementioned at **paragraph 124** above, of #1453 George Price Drive, Dangriga, presented a Dangriga Trade License Certificate (no number) dated 1<sup>st</sup> January 2012, which indicated that he was the owner of F & A Game Shop located at #750 St. Vincent Street Dangriga. We found that F & A Game Shop was not a registered business at the Business and Companies Registry.

124.3 We requested Jian Xing Chen's nationality file on the 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us, therefore we could not confirm if the nationality certificate number 8652/98 was indeed issued to him.

124.4 We noted that Jian Xing Chen submitted a visa application as the sponsor for Xiaoxia Zhen of China stating that she was his Cousin-in-law. Her details are below

#### **Xiaoxia Zhen – Fraudulent PR Permit Number 45015**

125. We noted that Xiaoxia Zhen was born in China on the 22<sup>nd</sup> September 1986, (as seen on the copy of her Chinese Passport #G55225559 issued 6<sup>th</sup> September 2011 attached to her visa application). Her visa application was submitted on and was accepted by Miss Ady Pacheco from the Nationality Section. One single entry tourist visa #V0026888 (064 Bmp/12 was approved on 2nd February 2012 by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan.

125.2 We found her name while scrutinizing the PR Permit Number Book as having been issued PR 3297 in 1986. We saw under the column for file numbers the notation "old PR 3297/86" and under the column reserved for receipt number and amount paid the words "replace old PR". She was issued with replacement PR Permit number 45015 dated 27<sup>th</sup> July 2012.

125.3 We could not ascertain how Xiaoxia Zhen could have been previously issued PR#3297/86, as was recorded in the PR Permit Number Book, when she was born (may not have yet been born) that same year and in no way could have been in Belize for one year and qualified for PR status. We did not find any evidence that she received Belizean nationality and Passport up to September 2013 or she may have changed her name by deed poll or marriage prior to her been issued a Passport.

**No evidence that Belize Visas were issued to persons who fraudulently received Belizean PR Permits Nationality certificates and Passports**

126. We found no evidence that persons who were fraudulently issued Belizean PR permits, nationality certificates and Passports had been the recipients of visas. Their names may have been incorrectly spelt in the PR Permit Number Book, as we found was the case with several of them, as their names appeared hurriedly written and were not clearly legible. Others may have entered Belize illegally, however further investigation is required to confirm when or whether they had entered Belize legally through one of the Ports of Entry. The names of such persons who had fraudulent PR numbers and were issued Belize nationality certificates and/or Passports are listed below at **Table ZN**.



**Table ZN**

The following is the list of persons for whom no evidence was found that they were issued visas yet they received Belizean PR permits, nationality certificates and or Passports

| <b>Name</b>          | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b> | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|----------------------|---|-----------------------|---|--|--|--|
| Xue Fei Cao (Xuefei) | 43819<br>2 <sup>nd</sup> December 2011                                | China                 | 24895/11<br>29th March 2011                               | not seen   | P0165331<br>issued 6th May 2011        | Her Passport application showed that no copy of birth certificate, no copy of nationality certificate no Belize ID was presented. She sponsored other visa applicants who also received fraudulent PR Permits. |
| Jinyu Huang          | 43834<br>8 <sup>th</sup> December 2011                                | China                 | 25918/11 13th December 2011                               | Carlos Perdomo   | P0188336<br>issued 16th December 2011  | Copy of his nationality certificate had no seal; nationality file showed bogus Guangzhou visa and Northern border arrival stamps in native Passports (See this report at Table U & Table ZE                    |

| <b>Name</b>         | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b> | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|---------------------|---|-----------------------|---|--|--|---|
| Miss Venus Maneerod | 43843<br>9 <sup>th</sup> December 2011                                | Thailand              | 25921/11 13th December 2011                               | Copy was not seen  | P0188381<br>issued 19th December 2011  | She was a Director of Mandarin General Enterprise (see this report paragraph 40.2, Table N, paragraph 48.10) Thai Passport issued date was 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2010              |
| Junming Yi          | 43894/28 <sup>th</sup> December 2011                                  | China                 | 27892/12 dated 18th June 2012                             | John Saldivar  | P0219466<br>issued 2nd October 2012    | He was a Director of Mandarin General Enterprise Certificate number had no entry in the Register-Section 10   |
| Andreas Young       | 44021<br>28 <sup>th</sup> February 2012                               | Malaysia              | 27652/12 29th February 2012                               | Carlos Perdomo   | P0193691<br>issued 1st March 2012      | For Passport application submitted 1 <sup>st</sup> March 2012 he presented Malaysian Passport #A20773766 issued date 20 <sup>th</sup> October 2009<br><br>JP was Florentino Baiza |
| Jianpo Xu           | 44482<br>6 <sup>th</sup> September 2012                               | China                 | Fraudulent replacement nationality certificate #17330/03  | Ralph Fonseca's name was printed on front but it had         | P0200072<br>issued 10th May 2012       | PR # 44482 had been issued to Ailha Mohamad Hijazi of Brazil. Nationality certificate had no entry in the Register of Citizens by   |

| <b>Name</b>                   | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b> | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b>        | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b>            | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------------------------|---|-----------------------|---|---|---|--|
|                               |   |                       | backdated 6th February 2003                               | no replacement signature at the back of the certificate and no date |   | Registration. Used copy of Irregular Chinese Passport G56466407 issue dated 3rd November 2011 to apply for Belizean Passport. (See paragraphs 126.2, 127 through to 127.5 of this Report and paragraph of Passport Report referenced.....dated.....) |
| Won Hong Kim<br>(Wonhong Kim) | 44578<br>18 <sup>th</sup> October 2012                                | Korea                 | 28577/13 dated 22nd April 2013                            | Elvin Penner  | P0246777<br>issued 9 <sup>th</sup> September 2013 | PR # 44578 had been issued to Josue David Coc Uck of Guatemala. (See Passport report Ref.....dated..... and paragraph 7.2 of this report). We requested but did not receive his nationality file # 31986   |
| Randall James Davis           | 44710<br>14 <sup>th</sup> November 2012                               | USA                   | 28282/12 dated 12 <sup>th</sup> December 2012             | Godwin Hulse  | P0226014<br>issued 8 <sup>th</sup> January 2013   | Entered Belize on the 17 <sup>th</sup> September 2012 through the PGIA (see Table G and paragraphs 52 through to 52.6 of this report)  |

| <b>Name</b>              | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b>   | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b>   | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b>          | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------------|---|-----------------------|---|--|---|---|
| Charles Francis Noll Jr. | 44711<br>14 <sup>th</sup> November 2012                               | USA                   | 28280/12 dated 12 <sup>th</sup> December 2012. As can be seen at column two he got his PR nearly 1 month before his nationality | Godwin Hulse   | P0226015<br>issued 8 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 | Entered Belize on the 17 <sup>th</sup> September 2012 through the PGIA (see Table G and paragraphs 51 through to 51.5 of this report)   |
| Fenglan Wu (Feng Lan Wu) | 44834A<br>19 <sup>th</sup> December 2012                              | Henan, China          | Fraudulent replacement certificate #19747/06 dated 10th June 2006; Replacement date was 8th Sept 2009                           | Ralph Fonseca printed on the front of replacement certificate. The signature on the replacement certificate appeared as Gareth Murillo | P0200173<br>issued 11th May 2012                | PR # 44834 had been issued to Lidia Isabel Deras Lopez of Honduras. Issued fraudulent replacement certificate #19747/06 signed by what appeared as the signature of Gareth Murillo. (No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration Section 10) JP was Cleopas Lord on Passport application |

| <b>Name</b>                 | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b>                                   | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b>  | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-----------------------------|---|-----------------------|---|---|--|---|
| Ying Zhe Xu<br>(Yingzhe Xu) | 44833<br>19 <sup>th</sup> December 2012                               | Henan, China          | Fraudulent replacement #19747.1/06 dated 10th June 2006. Replacement date was 8th Sept 2009 | Ralph Fonseca's name was printed on the front of replacement certificate. The signature on the replacement certificate appeared as that of Gareth Murillo | None seen or name was changed          | Added as a child to fraudulent Replacement certificate #19747/06 which had been issued to Fenglan Wu. (No entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration Section 10). Yingzhe Xu was issued PR# 44833 that had been issued to Prosper Omeaku Fijoh of ABA, Nigeria |
| Xiaodi Wu<br>(Xiaodi Xu)    | 44835B/19 <sup>th</sup> December 2012                                 | Henan, China          | Fraudulent replacement #19747.2/06 dated 10th June 2006; Replacement date was 8th Sept 2009 | Ralph Fonseca printed on front of replacement certificate. The signature on the replacement certificate appeared as that of Gareth                        | none seen or name was changed          | Xiaodi Wu was added as a child to fraudulent replacement certificate #19747/06 issued to Fenglan Wu. (No entry in the Register of Citizens Section 10). Xiaodi Wu was issued PR# 44835 that had been issued to Omar Antonio Redondo Ponce of Honduras.                |

| <b>Name</b>     | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b> | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b>   | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-----------------|---|-----------------------|---|--|--|--|
|                 |   |                       |   | Murillo  |  |  |
| Shuzi Hu        | 44904<br>23 <sup>rd</sup> January 2013                                | Zhejiang, China       | 28305/13<br>5 <sup>th</sup> April 2013                    | Ralph Fonseca printed on front of replacement certificate. The signature on the replacement certificate appeared as that of Gareth Murillo | None seen or name was changed          | The name on the application receipt was Zhongxiong Yang 7329 dated 18.3.13 for nationality file 29917 and nationality certificate #28297. Shuzi Hu was seen in the nationality numbers book entry made on the 26 <sup>th</sup> March 2013 for file #29917 and nationality certificate #28305. Nationality file 29917 was removed from the INS. |
| Zhongxiong Yang | 44905<br>23 <sup>rd</sup> January 2013                                | Zhejiang, China       | 28297 /13/ 5th April 2013                                 | not seen   | None seen or name was changed          | No other information seen. Nationality file 29917 was removed from the INS.  |
| Yue Yang        | 44906<br>23rd January   | Zhejiang, China       | 28296/13 (22nd March 2013 in                              | not seen   | None seen or name was                  | BNA File #29914/13; Minister's list stated vetting   |

| <b>Name</b>        | <b>Fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit Number and date recorded</b> | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b>    | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Passport Number and Date Issued</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------|---|-----------------------|--|--|--|--|
|                    | 2013  |                       | Numbers Book)  |  | changed                                | was complete; no date application submitted  |
| Jianming Yu        | 44907<br>23 <sup>rd</sup> January<br>2013                             | Zhejiang,<br>China    | 28300/13 (22 <sup>nd</sup><br>March 2013 in<br>Numbers Book) | not seen   | None seen or<br>name was<br>changed    | Nationality file<br>29915/13 Minister's list<br>stated vetting was<br>complete. No date<br>application submitted |
| Shuangshuang<br>Yu | 44909<br>23rd January<br>2013   | China                 | 28299/13 (22 <sup>nd</sup><br>March 2013 in<br>Numbers Book) | not seen   | None seen or<br>name was<br>changed    | Nationality files 29916/13.<br>Minister's list stated vetting<br>was complete; no date<br>application submitted  |

126.2 We found that four (4) persons from those issued fraudulent PR permits were also issued fraudulent replacement nationality certificates and they were able to receive genuine Belizean Passports. We were able to find those four persons through comparison of the PR Permit Number Book with Passport applications. Those persons appeared to be from the same family but recorded separate addresses in Belize on their Passport applications and were issued different fraudulent nationality certificate numbers from the years 2003 and 2006. Those persons were Jianpo Xu, Fenglan Wu, Ying Zhe Xu and Xiaodi Wu as listed at **Table ZN** above.

126.3 This finding led us to believe that someone from the Permanent Residence and Nationality section of the INS who had access to and was knowledgeable about the fraudulent PR Permit Numbers in the Book, was also linked to the production of those fraudulent replacement nationality certificates. This was discussed in our Passport report referenced Section III and also mentioned in this report at paragraph 32 and throughout this report. Many persons received Belizean Passports through fraudulent replacement nationality certificates that had what appeared to be the signature of Gareth Murillo as the Director who replaced them and backdated those certificates. The officers who processed those fraudulent replacement nationality certificates from the Passport section may have known that they were fraudulent as we observed several processing irregularities on many of those Passport applications, including the absence of live data capture photos and fingerprints and the missing signatures of Immigration officers' for many of them.

126.4 We interviewed former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo on the 27<sup>th</sup> August 2014 as mentioned in our Passport Audit report, concerning what appeared as his signature/initials on fraudulent replacement nationality certificates and he denied signing.

#### **Jianpo Xu was fraudulently issued PR# 44482 and nationality certificate #17330/03**

127. We observed that Jianpo Xu, born in China, whose date of birth was stated as the 5th October 1980, was issued fraudulent PR #44482 on the 6<sup>th</sup> September 2012 as a replacement to "old PR". This entry was seen recorded in the PR Permit Number Book, which also showed that PR #44482 had been issued to Ailah Mohamad Hijazi of Brazil on the 7<sup>th</sup> September 2012.

127.2 We noted that he was also issued a fraudulent replacement nationality certificate #17330/03 with the name of Minister Ralph Fonseca printed on the front as the Minister who had signed the original certificate on the date 6<sup>th</sup> February 2003. There was however, no replacement signature or replacement date at the back of said certificate.

A search of the register of Citizens by Registration revealed that there was no entry for certificate #17330.



127.3 We saw that Jianpo Xu submitted a Passport application on the 10<sup>th</sup> May 2012, which stated that his address was #2 San Francisco Street, Orange Walk. Attached to his application was a copy of his fraudulent nationality certificate #17330/03 along with what appeared as bogus Chinese Passport # G56466407 issued 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2011. He did not present any form of Belizean ID. Cleopas Lord JP of Belize recommended him for his Belizean Passport and stated that he knew him for 2 years. He received his expedited Belizean Passport # P0200072 on the same date, 10<sup>th</sup> May 2012. That incomplete and fraudulent certificate (no signature of the Director) was accepted by Omar Philips who signed as the Counter Clerk and Data Entry Clerk who captured Jianpo Xu personal data and biometric. His Passport was approved by Sharon Neal Flowers while it was printed by Elick Chan and Quality Assured QA passed by Dionae Jones. No one signed as having issued the Passport to a recipient, no one signed as having received the Passport and the date of receipt of Passport was not inserted.

127.4 We could not ascertain how those officers did not detect that Jianpo Xu nationality certificate was fraudulent or whether they may have seen that his nationality certificate was not in order.

127.5 Further investigation is required to ascertain through which Port of Entry he entered Belize as we saw no record that he had been approved a visa during the period investigated. His Nationality file was requested on the 10<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

**Fenglan Wu, Yingzhe Xu and Xiaodi Wu were fraudulently issued PR Permit numbers #44834A 44833 and 44835B and fraudulent replacement nationality certificate number 19747/06**

128. We observed that Fenglan Wu, who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 15<sup>th</sup> November 1977, was fraudulently issued PR permit #44834A dated 19<sup>th</sup> December 2012. This certificate number had been issued to Lidia Isabel Deras Lopez of Honduras. She was also issued fraudulent nationality certificate number 19747/06. We saw a copy of replacement certificate issued to her on 8<sup>th</sup> September 2008 with the name of Minister Ralph Fonseca printed at the front as having been the minister who had signed the original on the 10<sup>th</sup> June 2006. At the back of said certificate was what appeared to be the signature of former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo, as the one who had certified that it was a true replacement copy of the original certificate. We examined the Register for Citizens by Registration and found that no name was recorded for entry 19747/06.

128.2 We also noted that Yingzhe Xu who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 2<sup>nd</sup> July 1999 was issued fraudulent PR permit #44833 that had been issued to Prosper Omeaku Fijoh of ABA, Nigeria. His name was listed as Yingzhe Xu a child of Fenglan Wu on the fraudulent replacement certificate number 19747/06 with his number recorded as 19747.1/06.

Xiaodi Wu who was born in China and whose date of birth was stated as 17<sup>th</sup> April 2001 was issued fraudulent PR permit #44835B that had been issued to Omar Antonio Redondo Ponce of Honduras. Her name was listed as Xiaodi Xu a child of Fenglan Wu on the fraudulent replacement certificate number 19747/06 with his number recorded as 19747.2/06

128.3 We noted that their names indicated that they may have been the wife and children of Jianpo Xu who was also issued fraudulent PR #44482 on the 6<sup>th</sup> September 2012 and fraudulent nationality certificate #17330/03 as outlined earlier at paragraph 127 of this report.

128.4 We noted that Fenglan Wu submitted a Passport application on the 11<sup>th</sup> May 2013 without presenting any form of Belize ID but used what appeared as a copy of bogus Chinese Passport # G45410271 with issue date 30<sup>th</sup> August 2010 along with her fraudulent nationality certificate. Her address was stated as #5867 Manatee Drive, Belize City and JP Cleopas Lord (the same JP who recommended Jianpo Xu for his Belizean Passport) recommended her stating that he knew her for two years.

128.5 We saw her Passport application and fraudulent nationality certificate were accepted by Omar Philips who signed as the Counter Clerk while her data entry and biometric capture were done by Romi Rosas. Her Passport was approved by Sharon Neal Flowers while the Passport was printed by Elick Chan and QA passed by Dionae Jones. No one signed as having issued the Passport to a recipient, no one signed as having received her Passport and the date of receipt was not inserted.

128.6 We noted that Fenglan Wu paid for an expedited Passport and was issued her Belizean Passport # P0200173 on the 11<sup>th</sup> May 2012 (one day after Jianpo Xu).

128.7 We could not ascertain how Fenglan Wu received her Belizean Passport P0200173 dated 11<sup>th</sup> May 2012 and her PR permit had the date 19<sup>th</sup> December 2012.

128.8 We saw no record that they had been approved visas during the period investigated. As we did with Jianpo Xu, we requested on the 10<sup>th</sup> June 2014 the nationality file for Fenglan Wu, which should have also contained the particulars for Yingzhe Xu and Xiaodi Xu, but it was not presented.

Further investigation is required to ascertain when they entered Belize or through which Port of Entry.

**Two (2) other persons who had received fraudulent PR Permits submitted Belizean nationality applications but one was rejected and the other was on pending status**

129. We found that two (2) other persons who had received fraudulent PR Permits had applied for nationality but one application was rejected and the other was placed on pending status. We examined the Register of Citizens by Registration and the Numbers Books and did not find any evidence that they had been issued Belizean nationality certificates or Passports prior to September 2013 or they may have already changed their names prior to the issuance of their Belizean Passports. The two persons are listed at **Table ZO** below.

**Table ZO**

The following is the two persons who received fraudulent PR Permits and had submitted nationality applications

| <b>Name</b>        | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Fraudulent PR Permit #</b> | <b>Date Recorded in PR Permit Number Book</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|---|---|
| Bertha Barkman     | Canada                  | 44481                         | 6th September 2012                            | Her nationality application was returned since her Police record was not signed as per Minister's list                                |
| Rosa Maura Wenzryn | El Salvador             | 44927                         | 23 <sup>rd</sup> January 2013                 | Nationality file #28422/12-Minister's list stated that applicant did not qualify for nationality as she had not been living in Belize |

129.2 Further investigation is required to conduct verification of the native Passports of those persons to ascertain whether those fraudulent PR numbers were recorded therein and to confirm the Director's signature in the PR stamps.

**Former Director Ruth Meighan had signed the PR stamps on the copies of three native Passports for persons who were issued fraudulent PR Permits**

130. We noted that former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan's signature was seen on the PR permit stamps for three (3) persons who did not qualify for and were fraudulently issued those PR permits. We saw her signature on the PR stamps in the copies of the native Passports of Tianzhi Wang (Freakin Yang), Ivan David Zhou Zhu (he became a sponsor of other visa applicants using his fraudulently obtained Belizean permanent residence status and a fraudulent business registration certificate) and Zhaoquiang Zhu Li (his name was changed to Forest Li on 25<sup>th</sup> January 2012). The three persons are listed at **Table ZP** below:

**Table ZP**

The following table list the three individuals whose PR permits were signed by the former Director although they were not qualified for such permits

| <b>Name</b>                 | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Native Passport Number Issue and Expiry Date</b>   | <b>Fraudulent PR Permit Number</b>    | <b>Date in PR Stamp</b>       | <b>Director of Immigration and Nationality Service Signature in PR Stamp</b> |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------|---|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--|
| Tianzhi Wang (Freakin Yang) | China                 | Copy of Irregular Passport #G41602494/ 8 <sup>th</sup> April 2010 to 7 <sup>th</sup> April 2020 | 43608/11 (no PR file number recorded) | 9 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 | Ruth Meighan   |

| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>Place of Birth</b>                       | <b>Native Passport Number Issue and Expiry Date</b>  | <b>Fraudulent PR Permit Number</b>   | <b>Date in PR Stamp</b>       | <b>Director of Immigration and Nationality Service Signature in PR Stamp</b> |
|------------------------------|---|--|--|-------------------------------|--|
| Ivan David Zhou Zhu          | Mexicali, BC                                | Copy of Mexico Passport G06664838/3 <sup>rd</sup> May 2011 to 3 <sup>rd</sup> May 2017                                   | 44863/13 (“Replace old PR” recorded in Passport) PR# had been issued to Kishor Kumar Khemani of Jai Pur Key, India (no PR file # recorded) | 9 <sup>th</sup> January 2013  | Ruth Meighan   |
| Zhaoqiang Zhu Li (Forest Li) | China<br><br>He also had a Mexican Passport | Copy of Mexican Passport number G02279520 issued 21 <sup>st</sup> Jan 2009 with expiry date of 21 <sup>st</sup> Jan 2019 | 43901/12 (No PR file number recorded in Passport)  | 20 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 | Ruth Meighan   |

**Ivan David Zhou Zu who was issued fraudulent PR Permit #44863/13 on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2013 used a fraudulent business registration certificate to sponsor visa applicants**

131. It appeared that the purpose of creating fraudulent Business certificates and transferring the ownership of genuinely obtained Business certificates among Chinese was for the submission of visa applications as sponsors who owned Belizean businesses. Those “business owners” then applied as sponsors on behalf of other Chinese visitors who would eventually be approved visas and then approved PR and Nationality fraudulently. This was seen in the case of Xuefei Cao, Wei Hang Chen, Wenyuan Chen, Wenjing Chen and said Ivan David Zhou Zhu also discussed in the Visa Audit report referenced Section I.

131.2 We found that then nineteen year old Ivan David Zhou Zu, whose native Mexican Passport stated that he was born in Mexicali, BC on the 16th May 1994, used what appeared as a native Mexican issued Passport # G06664838; (issue date 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2011 and expiry date 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2017, which had in his Belizean PR stamp and fraudulent PR permit number signed by Miss Ruth Meighan) to apply as a sponsor for visa applicants in 2013.

131.3 We observed that the PR#44863 that he received had been issued to Kishor Kumar Khemani of Jai Pur Key, India. We noted that his name and other information (gender, BNA File #, Nationality, Place of birth, date of birth, date of arrival, receipt number) were written between the names of Kishor Kumar Khemani and Windsor Savannah Pritchard (PR#44862) in the Permit Numbers Register.

131.4 We noted that David Ivan Zhou Zhu used business certificate #19823 dated 5th August 2011 in the name of Zhou’s Super Store to apply as a sponsor for Chinese visa applicants, Chuande Tang and Zhong Li on the 3<sup>rd</sup> September 2013 and for Xiaoping Sun on the 4<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

131.5 We saw that the business certificate had no seal and showed his address as #18 King Street, Belize City. The copy of the business certificate #19823 was certified as a true copy of the original by Immigration officer, Elden August. We did verification of said certificate at the Business and Companies Registry and found that Business Registration certificate #19823 was dated the 21<sup>st</sup> June 2013 and was registered as "Kellyiahz" and owned by Erolyn Estella Frazer whose address was 1 Nargusta Street, Belmopan, Cayo District, Belize C.A.

131.6 We also saw that Ivan David Zhou Zhu presented a letter dated 19<sup>th</sup> August 2013 from the Atlantic Bank Belmopan signed by Ms. Jennylee Banner, Operations Supervisor, stating that his account balance for account number 211444980 was \$10,253.25. The letter also stated that his bank account was opened on the same date, the 19<sup>th</sup> August 2013.

131.7 We did not see evidence that Immigration Officer Elden August of the Investigation Section and an officer from the Visa Section did verification at the bank and or questioned Ivan David Zhou Zhu as to why he deposited the sum of \$10,253.25 just two weeks before he sponsored the first two visa applicants. We could not ascertain why the two sections accepted the letter without first interviewing the sponsor about the apparent haste in the deposit and the resulting suspicion which it created.

131.8 We saw that Minister Elvin Penner's Aide, Alfonso Cruz Jr (JP) of 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, San Ignacio signed on the letter of financial support for all three visa applicants, although the sponsor's address was stated as #18 King Street, Belize City.

131.9 The persons sponsored by Ivan David Zhou Zhu were approved visas and are listed at **Table ZQ** below. We could not ascertain if they had received PR status, Belizean nationality and Passports prior to September 2013. Further investigation is required to ascertain if they had received PR status, Belizean nationality and Passports.

#### **Table ZQ**

The following are the three persons who approved visas and were sponsored by Ivan David Zhou Zhu who used his fraudulently issued PR permit and his fraudulent business registration certificate

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Visa number approved</b> | <b>Date approved</b>           | <b>Approved by</b> |
|---------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------|
| Chuande Tang  | 40852                       | 3 <sup>rd</sup> September 2013 | Maria Marin        |
| Zhong Li      | 40851                       | 3 <sup>rd</sup> September 2013 | Maria Marin        |
| Xiao Ping Sun | 40857                       | 4 <sup>th</sup> September 2013 | Maria Marin        |

131.10 We had a telephone conversation on the 24<sup>th</sup> April 2015 with the Registrar of Business and Companies, Ms. Patricia Rodriguez, and she was asked:

Whether the Registry did checks at the addresses of persons who applied to register their businesses. Her response was that no physical searches were done at the addresses of the businesses and companies registered to ascertain if they actually existed. She said that she was not aware if checks were conducted in the past before she became the Registrar.

131.11 We did not see any evidence that the Visa Section of the INS did physical searches at the business addresses that visa sponsors claimed they owned. We noted however, that the Referral System of the Nationality Section which should have included physical searches at the addresses of Chinese persons was not utilized.

**Zhengjun An was fraudulently issued PR Permit #42395/10 dated 5<sup>th</sup> October 2010, which was also fraudulently issued to Jinchen An**

132. We saw nationality file number 26412/12 for Zhengjun An, a Chinese, whose date of birth was stated as the 5<sup>th</sup> September 1973. His nationality application did not record the date of the receipt of his application. His Belize address was listed as 2 ½ Miles Northern Highway with his phone number 223-3313. That number was the same phone number recorded on the Passport application form for Rina Chiu Hsiang Lo, JP (See Passport report referenced Section III)
- 132.2 We saw in his nationality file a copy of what appeared to be bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143 with issue date 29<sup>th</sup> May 2007 and expiry date of 28<sup>th</sup> May 2017. The copy of the Passport had no security features and it was stamped and signed on the 28<sup>th</sup> March 2013 by Sheryl Gillett of the Nationality Section, who certified that she had compared the copy with the original (Passport) and that it was a “true and complete copy”. We could not ascertain if she saw copies of or the actual Passport. Copies of the same bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143 but with issue date 18<sup>th</sup> May 2006; expiry date 17<sup>th</sup> May 2016 were seen for Jinchen An in said nationality file 26412/12 (addressed at paragraph **12** of this report).
- 132.3 We saw on another page with the numbers #G17945143 imprinted, what appeared as a bogus British Consulate Guangzhou Visa stamp dated 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2007 signed by “J. Murray”, for a single journey to Belize during the 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2007 to the 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2007. We also saw what appeared as a bogus Northern Border arrival stamp dated the 28<sup>th</sup> September 2007, recorded as “28.9.07”. The signature on the stamp was illegible. These stamps and dates were the similar ones seen for Jinchen An in the same nationality file; however, Jinchen An’s month was superimposed to read “28.8.07” as his arrival date.
- 132.4 We did not see any Mexico issued visa stamp or evidence of travel through Mexico. His date of entry into Belize was recorded on the Nationality application as the 28<sup>th</sup> September 2007 through the Belize Northern Border Station. We also saw a note recorded on one of the bogus Passport pages by Ady Pacheco on which she stated, *“Arrived 28.9.07 legal up to 5.10.10 with TEP’s & Ext. then PR on 5.10.10. PR#42395/10 (signed Ady Pacheco 5/4/2013 legally qualifies”*.
- 132.5 We saw the same bogus extension and temporary employment stamps with dates and signatures seen on Jinchen An’s bogus Passport pages on copies of Zhengjun An’s bogus Passport as can be seen at **Table ZR** below.



**Table ZR**

The following Table shows the description, dates and approvers of the bogus stamps that were seen in the copies of pages of Zhengjun An's bogus Chinese Passport #G17945143 that were similar to those seen in Jinchen An's BNA File #29563/12

| <b>Type of Stamp</b>                                 | <b>Date of Stamp</b>           | <b>Period Approved</b>                                     | <b>Description of Stamp</b>  | <b>Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer</b> |
|--|--------------------------------|--|--|--|
| British Consulate General Guangzhou                  | 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2007     | 28th August to 27 <sup>th</sup> September 2007             | Good for a single journey to Belize within 3 months<br>G2209628.07 | Appeared as J Murray   |
| Belize Northern Border Station Arrival Stamp #79     | 28th September 2007            | 28th September to 27 <sup>th</sup> October 2007            | Visitor Permit to Belize   | Signature could not be verified                              |
| Temporary Employment Permit INS Belmopan 775/Bmp/07  | 11 <sup>th</sup> October 2007  | Does not remain longer than 10 <sup>th</sup> October 2008  | As a cook for Ah Wing Restaurant                                   | Liandro Quischan, Immigration Officer                        |
| Temporary Employment Permit INS Belmopan 1096/Bmp/08 | 8 <sup>th</sup> September 2008 | Does not remain longer than 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2009 | Shop Clerk Peng Fei Ruan   | Liandro Quischan, Immigration Officer                        |
| Temporary Employment Permit Belmopan 1419/Bmp/09     | 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2009 | Does not remain longer than 7 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 | As a cook for Ah Ruan Restaurant                                   | Giovanni Tzib, Immigration Officer                           |

| Type of Stamp  | Date of Stamp                  | Period Approved  | Description of Stamp   | Signature of Visa Approver/Belize Immigration Officer         |
|--|--------------------------------|--|--|---|
| Visa Extension (37)<br>Immigration Headquarters<br>Belmopan    | 6 <sup>th</sup> September 2010 | Does not remain longer than 5 <sup>th</sup> October 2010 | Does not enter into employment paid or unpaid...does not engage in any business or profession without the consent of the Director... | Carlos Amaya, Immigration Officer                             |
| Permanent Residence Stamp, Director, Immigration & Nationality | 5 <sup>th</sup> October 2010   | Permit #42395/10<br><br>PRF#24490/10                     | Permitted to remain in Belize as a Permanent Resident "Cook"   | Gareth Murillo (signature dated 7 <sup>th</sup> October 2010) |

132.6 We saw on his nationality application he stated that he was a Businessman but in the section where it is asked to state the business or employer's address the words "not applicable" were written. Under the section for particulars of parent the name An Yi Sheng was recorded as his father and Wong Chang Gut was recorded as his mother (Those were the same names of parents recorded on Jinchen An's nationality application form). The General Declaration form stated that he was interviewed on the 12<sup>th</sup> December 2012 by "Jimenez". We later found that Lourdez Jimenez, was a staff member at the INS, who was neither the Supervisor nor an Immigration Officer. She commented on the form "*subject has PR should be given Nationality*". She did not record a time for his interview on the form.

132.7 We observed that his affidavit was witnessed by Isaac Johnson, JP of Belize City and dated 10<sup>th</sup> December 2012. His Nationality Referees were Wayne Mario Hulse and Stephanie Hulse, both of 2 ½ Miles Northern Highway (Wayne Mario Hulse along with Steven Young of 100 East Canal were the Referees of Jinchen An) who both stated that they knew the applicant for 5 years. On the General Declaration form used for the interview it was recorded that Stephanie Hulse stated at the question, "how did the acquaintance come about? "She is my friend a long time ago" (the applicant was a male).

For the same question, Wayne Mario Hulse's statement was recorded as "through another friend".

132.8 We saw the Police Report was signed by an illegible signature for Miguel Segura, ACP, for the Commissioner of Police and it was dated the 10<sup>th</sup> December 2012. The Chinese Passport number recorded on the Police Report was bogus Passport #G17945143 with issue date 29<sup>th</sup> May 2007. We could not ascertain whether an actual bogus Passport was presented to the Police or whether only the numbers were given to the Police. The photo on the Police Report also appeared as a copy of a photo and not an original photo.

132.9 We also saw in Zhengjun An's Nationality file a copy of a letter addressed to Ms. Ruth Meighan dated 23rd January 2013 from Hon Santiago Santino Castillo, Area Representative for Caribbean Shores Constituency, Minister of State in the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development. The letterhead was that of the Government of Belize, Ministry of Finance and Economic Development but it had no file reference. The initials signature of Ruth Meighan was recorded on the letter with a note stating, "Mr. Wade f.n.a (for necessary action) 29.1.13. The letter stated:

*Dear Ms Meighan, An Zheng Jun, a resident of Caribbean Shores (2 ½ Mls Northern Hwy) applied for his nationality on December 12<sup>th</sup> 2012. **Her** application is BNA# 26412/12, and a receipt of same is attached for easy reference. I support **her** application, and would like to know when it will be processed. If you need any further information, please do not hesitate to call me at 610-2444. Many thanks. Sincerely (signed) Hon. Santiago Santino Castillo, Area Representative Caribbean Shores, Minister of Sate (in the) Ministry of Finance and Economic Development."*

132.10 We noted that the file was not referred to the Director by the OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. On the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2013, a note was written on the Minute Sheet by Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco, who wrote:

*"Chinese National, Zhengjun An, qualifies for citizenship under Section 10, Chapter 161 Laws of Belize RE 2000-2003. Applicant came to Belize on the 28.9.2007 and remained legal with work permits and extensions up until 5.10.2010 and on same date (5.10.2010) he obtained his PR status for Belize (PR#42395/10). Enclosure 2. Applicant meets medical qualifications enc (4). Nothing adverse on police record recorded against the applicant. File now submitted for your consideration, recommendation or otherwise." (Signed Ady Pacheco on the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2013).*

132.11 We also saw on the minute sheet a note written by C. Gillett (Registry Clerk) “*Permanent Residence needs to be verify (sic) (signed) 7.8.2013*”. C. Gillet had also recorded previous notes on the Minute Sheet on the 11<sup>th</sup> of February 2013 and on the 26<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup> of March 2013, before the file was referred to the Director by Ady Pacheco.

132.12 We saw no evidence that Zhengjun An was issued a Belize nationality certificate or Belize Passport before October 2013. However, we saw his name on a spreadsheet labelled Minister’s List 2013, which showed the status of nationality files. His name was included on the list along with three (3) other Chinese persons who were issued nationality file numbers in the same sequence for which no date was recorded as to when their nationality applications were received at the Nationality Section of the INS. We also found that one of those persons had just been issued a visa to Belize. Zhengjun An and the other three Chinese are listed at **Table ZS** below.

**Table ZS**

The following table list Zhengjun An and the three Chinese who were issued nationality file numbers in the same sequence and for whom no dates were recorded indicating when their nationality applications were received

| <b>Applicant’s Name</b> | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Remarks (as seen on Minister’s list)</b>   | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------|---|--|
| Yong Xiong Zheng        | 26409/12                       | Application incomplete, needs original documents, needs to change application form. | <p>He was approved visa #V00035289 on the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012</p> <p>His visa application had an invitation letter attached referenced C/Gen/1/01/12 dated 20<sup>th</sup> September 2012 from Minister of Trade, Erwin Contreras to Roger Tien. The same letter was seen attached to Jinchen An and Liming Huang’s visa application (See paragraphs 12 and 55 of this report). It did not have the signature and comments of former Director, Ruth Meighan,</p> |

| <b>Applicant's Name</b> | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Remarks (as seen on Minister's list)</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------|---|--|
|                         |                                |   | written on it as seen on the other copy for Jinchun An and Liming Huang<br><br>Also attached was a note dated 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2012 from Minister Godwin Hulse asking Acting Director, "Ms Marin" to "kindly peruse and facilitate if all is in order" the visa applications from Roger Tien. |
| Ling Wang               | 26410/12                       | Vetted and sent to the Director             | No record of visa seen. No evidence of Passport issued up to September 2013  |
| An Hong Hui             | 26411/12                       | Applicant needs to change application       | No record of visa seen. No evidence of Passport issued up to September 2013  |
| Zheng Jun An            | 26412/12                       | Vetted and sent to the Director             | See paragraph <b>132</b> of this Report; no evidence of Passport issued up to September 2013   |

132.13 We could not determine whether Zhengjun An was living in Belize and if so when and through which Port of entry he entered Belize before he was issued a fraudulent PR #42395/10 and was recommended for Belizean nationality by Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco. In addition, we did not examine the nationality files for Yong Xiong Zheng, Ling Wang and An Hong Hui to see the dates they arrived and documents they may have used for their nationality applications.

#### **A number of Belize Nationality Application File Numbers were duplicated and given to different persons**

133. We noted that a number of BNA file numbers were duplicated and issued to different persons. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether all those who were issued duplicated file numbers had been approved recent visas or had entered the country in less than the time required as domicile period to qualify for Belizean nationality under Section 10 or Section 11 of the Nationality Act.

Such was the case of Xi Wang /James Louis Wang as reported on above at **paragraph 45** who is listed at **Table ZT** below along with others who had the same file number as other persons. **Appendix J** list other cases found.

**Table ZT**

The following is the list of persons who had the same file numbers issued to them by the INS.

| <b>File number</b>                            | <b>Date opened</b>                            | <b>Name of Individual</b>        | <b>Date of Birth/ Age</b> | <b>Nationality</b>                             |
|---|---|----------------------------------|---------------------------|--|
| 27991A  | 19.1.12                                       | Celeni Mineth Sanchez            | 5.8.84                    | Guatemalan                                     |
| 27791B. this is the information in the column | 3.5.9 (this is the information in the column) | Xi Wang same name as 27791 below | 6.3.84                    | Chinese  |
| 27791   | 3.5.13  | Xi Wang                          | Not stated                | Chinese  |
| 27791   | 15.1.13                                       | Juana Bermudez Martinez          | 19.1.87                   | Honduran                                       |
| 27530   | 17.1.13                                       | Milton Orlando Lainez Alfaro     | 10.11.60                  | Salvadoran                                     |
| 27530B  | 17.1.13                                       | Brad Stewart Moore               | 13.10.52                  | US Citizen                                     |
| 27529   | 17.1.13                                       | Romelio Interiano                | 21.9.80                   | Guatemalan                                     |
| 27529B  | 17.1.13                                       | Douglas Ernest Podzun            | 19.11.62                  | Canadian                                       |
| 27439A  | 11.4.12                                       | Mohamad Rachid El Haj            | 25.1.63                   | Lebanese. Not in BNA file Diary.               |
| 27439B  | 23.4.12                                       | Neville Campton Mcandrew         | 13.11.46                  | Guyanese. This was seen in the BNA File Diary. |
| 27385A  | Not stated                                    | Dameh M Harmouch                 | 1.9.88                    | Lebanese                                       |
| 27385B  | 11.1.12                                       | Maria Ofshia Moh                 | 5.12.81                   | Salvador                                       |
| 25704   | Not stated                                    | Valencio Giron                   | 30                        | Salvadoran                                     |
| 25704   | 15.11.10                                      | David Roy Camp                   | Not stated                | US Citizen                                     |
| 25698   | 9.11.10                                       | Antonio Rana Jimenez             | Not stated                | Mexican  |

| File number | Date opened | Name of Individual                | Date of Birth/ Age | Nationality |
|-------------|-------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------|-------------|
| 25698B      | Not stated  | Guo Mao Su                        | Not stated         | Chinese     |
| 25697       | 29.11.10    | Gricel Aurora Gonzalez Lopez      | Not stated         | Not stated  |
| 25697B      | Not stated  | Xiao Zhi Li                       | Not stated         | Chinese     |
| 25667       | 20.10.10    | Mickey George Thorton             | 70                 | US Citizen  |
| 25667B      | Not stated  | Edin Alfredo Pop Santistevan      | Not stated         | Guatemalan  |
| 25207       | 6.7.09      | Misael de Jesus Salazar Alvarenga | 23                 | Salvador    |
| 25207       | 30.8.11     | Denice Lee Ryan                   | 4.5.52             | US Citizen  |
| 25202A      | 1.7.09      | John Charles Puesder              | 60                 | American    |
| 25202B      | Not stated  | Wen Ling Chen                     | 9.7.83             | Chinese     |

133.2 We noted this same irregularity of opening a duplicate nationality file for previous years with nationality file #16781/01A in the name of Yao Ming Liang (plus two children) and nationality file # 16781/02 in the name of Jung Chin Lin (plus three children). Further investigation is required to determine whether the two families had been genuinely issued those file numbers.

133.3 We noted that both families consisting of nine (9) persons received Belize nationality fraudulently. They had the same bogus Nationality referees' namely (Therese Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse) and copies of their illegible Belize voter's identification as was seen in many other nationality files for that period as discussed further at paragraph 140 of this report.

#### **File Numbers issued in the 2013 File Diary were found inserted in the 2011 and 2012 nationality file Register**

134. We saw some nationality file numbers that were opened in 2013 in the File Diary inserted in the nationality file register for 2011 and 2012. Those names and file numbers are listed at **Appendix K**. It include the names of Xi Wang aka James Louis Wang and Zhaoqiang Zhu Li aka Forest Li who were fraudulently issued nationality certificates 28428/13 dated 04.06.13 (signed by Minister Elvin Penner) and 27328/12 dated 02.01.12 (signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo).

**Nationality file numbers recorded as issued to three individuals in the File Diary differed from the names seen in the BNA application register or no entry was recorded in register**

135. We saw that some nationality file numbers had different names (or no entry in the BNA application register) from those names seen in the File Diary. Those file numbers with the individuals listed in the Application register and File Diary is listed at **Table ZU** below:

**TableZU**

The following is the file numbers that had different names or no entry seen in the BNA application register

| <b>Name of Individual</b>     | <b>File number</b>   | <b>Date opened</b> | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Nationality</b> |
|-------------------------------|--|--------------------|----------------------|--------------------|
| Dammar Lamond Grant           | 27565 was his file number entered in the File Diary  | 19.8.12            | Not stated           | American           |
| Ahmad Yaser Taabab            | 27565 was his file number in the Belize Nationality Application (BNA) Register   | 9.5.13             | 1.11.87              | Damascus           |
| Juan Pablo Hernandez          | 27157B was his file number in the File Diary. That file number in the BNA Register was for Elisia Elvira Tiul De Gregoro | 9.1.12             | Not stated           | Not stated         |
| Elisia Elvira Tiul De Gregoro | 27157A his her file number in the File Diary. In the BNA register her file number was quoted as 27157B                   | 9.1.12             | Not stated           | Not stated.        |
| Jose Rafael Lara Soliz        | 26305 is his file number in the File Diary. That file number was file in the BNA Register                                | 20.10.11           | 16.4.66              | Salvadoran.        |



**Some individuals were issued nationality certificates in the Numbers book/Register on dates that were earlier than when their BNA files were opened in the File Diary**

136. We found in the Numbers book that persons were issued nationality certificates on dates that were earlier, on the same day or very close to the dates when their nationality files were opened in the File Diary. In some cases their names and dates they submitted their nationality applications were not recorded in the BNA File Diary. Those inconsistencies made it appear as if a fraudulent citizenship program was operating and in most cases the nationality files for such persons were not found when requested for examination by Audit. **Table ZV** lists some examples while **Appendix L** lists other examples.

**Table ZV**

The following is the list of persons who were issued nationality certificates in the numbers book on dates that were earlier, on the same day or very close to the date when their BNA files were opened in the file Diary

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Country of Birth or Nationality</b> | <b>BNA File # &amp; Date File was opened</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate number</b> | <b>Certificate Date in Certificate Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Date seen on certificate</b>                               | <b>Belize Passport #/Issue Date</b>  |
|--|--|--|---------------------------------------|--|---|--|
| Wonhong Kim  | Korean                                 | 31986<br>2.9.13                              | 28577                                 | 2.9.13   | Nationality File not found                                    | P0246777/ 9 <sup>th</sup> September 2013   |
| Yakup Sut  | Turkey                                 | 31973<br>20.8.13                             | 28570                                 | 16.8.13  | 3.6.13  | P0245775/ 26 <sup>th</sup> August 2013   |
| Obel Corcho Melgarejo                                    | Cuban                                  | 31937<br>18.7.13                             | 28491                                 | 19.7.13  | File not found; BPIS showed certificate date of 18th May 2013 | P0246905/ 11 <sup>th</sup> September 2013  |
| Jalal Ebrahimi   | United Arab Emirates                   | 31936<br>18.7.13                             | 28492                                 | 19.7.13  | Nationality File not found                                    | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name                               |
| Jamal Ebrahimi   | United Arab Emirates                   | 31935<br>18.7.13                             | 28493                                 | 19.7.13  | Nationality File not found                                    | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name                               |
| Bo Jie Shau (Bo-Jie Shan on the Nationality certificate) | Chinese                                | 31927<br>10.7.13                             | 28461                                 | 10.7.13  | Nationality File not found                                    | P0245212 issued 19 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 (Passport application was not presented to Audit) |

| <b>Name</b>          | <b>Country of Birth or Nationality</b> | <b>BNA File # &amp; Date File was opened</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate number</b> | <b>Certificate Date in Certificate Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Date seen on certificate</b>                                     | <b>Belize Passport #/Issue Date</b>                              |
|----------------------|--|--|---------------------------------------|--|---|--|
| Yui Pang Chen        | Chinese                                | 31924<br>10.7.13                             | 28456                                 | 10.7.13  | Nationality File not found; copy of certificate was dated 18.5.13   | P0244747/ 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2-13<br>(Peter Pang)           |
| Quoc Vinh Truong     | American                               | 31923<br>10.7.13                             | 28458                                 | 10.7.13  | Nationality File not found; copy of certificate was dated 18.5.13   | P0244746/ 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2-13<br>(Simon Truong)         |
| Jack Jie Qin         | American                               | 31922<br>10.7.13                             | 28457                                 | 10.7.13  | Nationality File not found; copy of certificate was dated 18.5.13   | P0244745/ 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2-13<br>(Marc Chin)            |
| Philip Thomas Kueber | Canadian                               | 31790<br>24.6.13                             | 28453                                 | 10.6.13  | Nationality File not found; Copy of certificate was dated 16.5.2013 | P0242031/ 17 <sup>th</sup> July 2013                             |
| Mojgan Jahanian      | Iran                                   | 31784<br>20.6.13                             | 28452                                 | 10.6.13  | Nationality File not found  | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |

| <b>Name</b>                 | <b>Country of Birth or Nationality</b> | <b>BNA File # &amp; Date File was opened</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate number</b> | <b>Certificate Date in Certificate Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Date seen on certificate</b> | <b>Belize Passport #/Issue Date</b>                              |
|-----------------------------|--|--|---------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|--|
| Mohammad Kazem Meshkaty     | Iran                                   | 31783<br>20.6.13                             | 28451                                 | 10.6.13  | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |
| Ahmad Ansari Poor           | Iran                                   | 31782<br>20.6.13                             | 28450                                 | 10.6.13  | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |
| Jahanian Hamidreza          | Iran                                   | 31781<br>20.6.13                             | 28449                                 | 10.6.13  | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |
| Zubair Mohamed Kazi         | American                               | 31769<br>10.6.13                             | 28455                                 | 10.6.13  | Nationality File not found      | P0241079/ 8 <sup>th</sup> July 2013                              |
| John Joseph Hurry           | USA                                    | 32200<br>6.9.13                              | 28586                                 | 2.9.13   | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |
| Mahtab Damda                | USA                                    | 32000<br>6.9.13                              | 28583                                 | 2.9.13   | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |
| Levon Termendhyan           | American                               | 31998<br>6.9.13                              | 28585                                 | 2.9.13   | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |
| Kourosh Esfandiar Akhitiari | Canadian                               | 31999<br>6.9.13                              | 28584                                 | 2.9.13   | Nationality File not found      | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant changed name |

**Several persons were not interviewed before their nationality applications were approved and Belizean nationality certificates issued**

Page 13 of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual, July 1, 2011, under “Interview conducted for Nationality through Registration” informs that

*“The General Declaration form is used to record the interview conducted between the applicant and the interviewer. This form must be completed and signed by the Interviewer, in the event there is a language barrier, an interpreter should be used and the interpreter signs as a witness”.*

Page 17 of the Manual delegates the responsibility of conducting interviews for nationality applicants to the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Supervisor as follows:

*“Title of Post: Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Supervisor” then “Summary of Essential Functions and Responsibilities”:*

Responsibility number 4. *“Conduct interviews with applicants of CSME and Nationality.”*

137. We found no evidence that several persons who were granted and issued Belizean nationality certificates were interviewed as required. Further checks would have to be made at the Ports of entry. Those persons also included applicants whose nationality certificate dates in the Numbers Book showed that their certificates were signed even before their nationality applications were accepted by the Nationality Section as seen in the INS’s File Diary. Several of them had no record in the File Diary that their nationality applications were received by the Nationality Section. They received nationality certificates without being interviewed, which is a critical component of the nationality application procedure. We could not ascertain whether the other criteria under Section 10 of Nationality Act were met for qualification as Belizean citizens since their nationality files were not presented to us. Those individuals are listed at **Table ZW**.

**Table ZW**

The following is the list of individuals we found who were not interviewed by the INS

| <b>Name</b>                         | <b>Nationality</b>       | <b>File Number</b>       | <b>Certificate number</b> | <b>Date certificate signed (Certificate Numbers Book/register)</b> | <b>Remarks</b>             |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|--|----------------------------|
| Dong Tao Jin                        | Chinese                  | 29948                    | 28382                     | 17.5.13  | Nationality file not found |
| Wonhong Kim                         | Korean                   | 31986                    | 28577                     | 2.9.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Li –Cheng Yeh                       | Chinese                  | 31983                    | 28587                     | 2.9.13   | Nationality file not found |
| June Wu (name not in file diary)    | Not in file diary        | 31983 (in numbers book)  | 28588                     | 2.9.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Yu-Ming Yeh                         | Not in file diary        | 31983 (in numbers book)  | 28588.1                   | 2.9.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Yu-Jia Yeh                          | Not in file diary        | 31983 (in numbers book)  | 28588.2                   | 2.9.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Yu-Wei Yeh                          | Not in file diary        | 31983 (in numbers book)  | 28588.3                   | 2.9.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Wenge Mao                           | Chinese                  | 31981                    | 28572                     | 16.8.13  | Nationality file not found |
| Peiping Wu (name not in file diary) | Not stated in file diary | 31981 ( in numbers book) | 28573                     | 16.8.13  | Nationality file not found |
| Yakup Sut                           | Turkey                   | 31973                    | 28570                     | 16.8.13  | Nationality File not found |
| Steven Andrew Marrs                 | Australian               | 31763B                   | 28440                     | 6.6.13   | Nationality file not found |

| Name                         | Nationality | File Number | Certificate number | Date certificate signed (Certificate Numbers Book/register) | Remarks                    |
|------------------------------|-------------|-------------|--------------------|---|----------------------------|
| Maxim Poon Wong              | Canadian    | 31759       | 28417              | 31.5.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Shida Zhu                    | Chinese     | 31763A      | 28441              | 6.6.13  | Nationality file not found |
| Alfred Ibrahim Hanna Hanania | Jordanian   | 29939       | 28439              | 6.6.13  | Nationality file not found |
| Leslie George Carr           | Jamaican    | 29953       | 28418              | 31.5.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Maria Fernanda Mejia         | Honduran    | 29959       | 28403              | 29.5.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Yiu-Pang Chen                | Taiwanese   | 31924       | 28456              | 10.7.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Jack Jie Qin                 | Chinese     | 31922       | 28457              | 10.7.13   | Nationality file not found |
| Quoc Ving Truong             | Vietnamese  | 31923       | 28458              | 10.7.13   | Nationality file not found |

**Appendix M** lists other persons who were not interviewed as was required to have received their Belizean nationality

137.2 We found that the persons listed at **Table ZX** did not pay their nationality fees as required by the Nationality Act.

**Table ZX**

The following is the list of persons who we found did not pay their nationality fees as required by the Nationality Act

| <b>Name</b>                         | <b>Nationality</b>       | <b>Certificate Number</b> | <b>Certificate Date in Numbers Book</b> | <b>Date on certificate</b>                                 |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|---|--|
| Wonhong Kim                         | Korean                   | 28577                     | 2.9.13                                  | 22.4.13. His file was not found                            |
| Li –Cheng Yeh                       | Chinese                  | 28587                     | 2.9.13                                  | File not found   |
| June Wu (name not in file diary)    | Not in file diary        | 28588                     | 2.9.13                                  | File not found   |
| Yu-Ming Yeh                         | Not in file diary        | 28588.1                   | 2.9.13                                  | File not found   |
| Yu-Jia Yeh                          | Not in file diary        | 28588.2                   | 2.9.13                                  | File not found   |
| Yu-Wei Yeh                          | Not in file diary        | 28588.3                   | 2.9.13                                  | File not found   |
| Wenge Mao                           | Chinese                  | 28572                     | 16.8.13                                 | File not found   |
| Peiping Wu (name not in file diary) | Not stated in file diary | 28573                     | 16.8.13                                 | File not found   |
| Yakup Sut                           | Turkey                   | 28570                     | 16.8.13                                 | File not found. Certificate was dated 3.6.13               |
| Yiu-Pang Chen                       | File diary has Chinese   | 28456                     | 10.7.13                                 | 18.5.13. His file was not found                            |
| Jack Jie Qin                        | American                 | 28457                     | 10.7.13                                 | 18.5.13. His file was not found                            |
| Quoc Ving Truong                    | American                 | 28458                     | 10.7.13                                 | 18.5.13. His file was not found                            |
| Obel Corcho Melgarejo               | Cuban                    | 28491                     | 19.7.13                                 | File not found. BPIS 18.5. 13                              |
| Jalal Ebrahimi                      | United Arab Emirates     | 28492                     | 19.7.13                                 | File not found. No Passport issued before 31 <sup>st</sup> |



| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>Nationality</b>   | <b>Certificate Number</b> | <b>Certificate Date in Numbers Book</b> | <b>Date on certificate</b>   |
|------------------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---|--|
|                              |                      |                           |   | October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name  |
| Jamal Ebrahimi               | United Arab Emirates | 28493                     | 19.7.13                                 | File not found. No Passport issued before 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Steven Andrew Marrs          | Australian           | 28440                     | 6.6.13                                  | File not found. No Passport issued before 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Shida Zhu                    | Chinese              | 28441                     | 6.6.13                                  | File not found. No Passport issued before 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2013 or applicant may have changed her name |
| Zheng Jiang Zhu              | Chinese              | 28443                     | 6.6.13                                  | File not found. No Passport issued before 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Alfred Ibrahim Hanna Hanania | Jordan               | 28439                     | 6.6.13                                  | File not found. No Passport issued before 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Maxim Poon Wong              | Canadian             | 28417                     | 31.5.13                                 | File not found. BPIS certificate date was 30.5.2013  |

137.3 **Appendix N** also lists other applicants who did not pay the required nationality fee.

**No evidence that some nationality applicants took and signed their oath of allegiance prior to receiving their Belizean nationality certificates**

The Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161, Section 17.-(1) states:

*“A person to whom a certificate of Registration as a citizen of Belize is granted shall, on subscribing the prescribed oath of affirmation of allegiance, have the status of a citizen of Belize by registration as from the date of that certificate.”*

138. We found that several persons did not take and sign their required oath of allegiance. We noted this infraction through examination of the Swearing in Register, which records persons who attended a swearing-in ceremony where they took and signed their oath of allegiance. Those individuals included Wonhong Kim and Yakup Sut aforementioned in this report. **Table ZY** lists those other individuals. It is to be noted that we did not see any individuals whose BNA file numbers which started with the serial numbering of “319” in the Swearing-In Register.

**Table ZY**

The following is the list of persons whose files were not presented and who were issued nationality certificates although there was no evidence that they took and signed their oath of allegiance

| <b>Name</b>      | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number Issued and date</b> | <b>File number</b> | <b>Date File was opened</b> |
|------------------|----------------------|---|--------------------|-----------------------------|
| Yakup Sut        | 15-Jun-68            | 28570 dated 16 <sup>th</sup> Aug 13       | 31973              | 20-Aug-13                   |
| Wenge Mao        | 26-Nov-67            | 28572 dated 16 <sup>th</sup> Aug13        | 31981              | 26-Aug-13                   |
| Yeh Li Cheng     | 15-Feb-70            | 28587 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> Sept 13       | 31983              | 28-Aug-13                   |
| Guo Theng Dang   | 10-Jan-63            |   | 31984              | 02-Sep-13                   |
| Wonhong Kim      | 10-Feb-61            | 28577 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> Sept 13       | 31986              | 02-Sep-13                   |
| Yui Pang Chen    | 6-Sept-58            | 28456 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> May 13       | 31924              | 10-Jul-13                   |
| Quoc Vinh Truong | 30-Nov-60            | 28457 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> May 13       | 31922              | 10- Jul-13                  |
| Jack Jie Qin     | 11-Mar-80            | 28458 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> May 13       | 31923              | 10-Jul-13                   |

139. We found through our examination of nationality files, which also included those nationality files for persons who renewed Passports during the period investigated. Several nationality files did not have a copy of the oath of allegiance, signed by the new citizens of Belize before they were issued their nationality certificates. In some cases, the signature on the oath of allegiance did not match the signature on other documents or the document was seen in the file but the person did not sign the oath. **Table ZZ** lists those persons who were issued nationality certificates and no copies of their signed oath of allegiance were seen or their signatures on their oaths did not match their signatures seen on other documents.

**Table ZZ**

The following is the list of persons who were issued nationality certificates but no copies of their signed oaths of allegiance were seen in their nationality file or their signatures on the oaths did not match with their signatures seen on other documents

| <b>Name</b>                     | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Oath of Allegiance</b>  |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|
| Denzel Lerone Hernandez Brooks  | 29156/12                       | 28438/13                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Yong Zhi Huang                  | 29284/12                       | 28298/13                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Samir Mouhamed Harmouch         | 26670/11                       | 26406/12                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Ammar Harmouch                  | 27135/12                       | 26321/12                              | The signature was not the applicant's signature as seen several places on Nationality application and on police record |
| Fang Ling Wu                    | 25665/10                       | 27793/12                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Sindy Corina Chohuoj Chan       | 28005/12                       | 27153/12                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Hui Juan Liu                    | 25664/11                       | 27686/12                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Ting Yu Chao A.K.A Taffany Chao | 25673/10                       | 27795/12                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Lee Yi Lung                     | 26123/11                       | 25423/11                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Shuming Chen aka Sumi Chen      | 26123/11                       | 25424/11                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Ali Mohamed Akil Rada           | 26218/11                       | 25789/11                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Yue Hao Yan                     | 26005/11                       | 25218/11                              | No copy seen in file   |
| Talal Ahmad Harmouch            | 30755/07                       | 21216/07                              | signature on oath does not match   |

| Name           | Nationality<br>File Number | Nationality<br>Certificate Number | Oath of Allegiance  |
|----------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|
|                |                            |                                   | application nor<br>Passport signature   |
| Hong Yuan She  | 13736/99                   | 11879/00                          | Oath not signed by<br>applicant; only<br>signed as witnessed<br>by Eleodoro Lewis<br>JP |
| Fatme Harmouch | 12094/99                   | 9932/99                           | No copy seen in file  |

139.2 Additional persons whose nationality files did not have a signed copy of their oaths of allegiance or the signatures on the oaths did not match the signatures seen on other documents are listed at **Appendix O**.

**Many Nationality Files for persons who renewed Passports during the period April 2011 to September 2013 had the same bogus referees**

140. We requested the files for several persons who we saw renewed their Passports that had irregularities with their previous Passports or nationality certificates and or entries in the Register of Citizens by Registration (reported in the Passport report referenced Section III) In those nationality files we observed that many of them had bogus referees and may not have acquired their Belizean nationality genuinely. Those files had the faded and unidentifiable copies of voter's registration identification card for two Belizeans, namely Therese Estelle Cabral of Dangriga and Robert Theodore Hulse of Orange Walk. Those copies were seen in several nationality files for that period and appeared as though they were copied from copies and not from the original identification cards. The referees section of the nationality application also had the names and alleged signatures of those referees, which appeared to have been written and forged by the same individual. The signatures on those persons' identification cards did not match the ones on the Referees' form. We noted that those persons received Belizean nationality during the period 2001-2002. **Table ZZA** below lists some of those persons while others are at **Appendix P**.

**Table ZZA**

**The following is the list of persons whose nationality files had bogus referees**

| <b>Name of Person</b>   | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and Date</b> | <b>Signature of Minister</b>  | <b>Observation in File</b>  |
|---|--------------------------------|--|---|---|
| Thomas Edward Rubin   | 17272/02                       | 16607/02 dated May 2002                        | Maxwell Samuels   | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Song Xiao Li aka George Lee aka David Lee   | 15686                          | 14382/01 dated 23-July-2001                    | Maxwell Samuels   | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Yicai Zhu aka Frank Zhu (no deed poll)  | 16391                          | 15305/01dated 18-Dec-2001                      | Maxwell Samuels (Replaced by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan on 9 <sup>th</sup> March 2012 although applicant may not have appeared in person to apply for and capture Passport biometrics | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Li Hua Wu aka Richard Wu  | 17289                          | 16602/02 dated 31-May-2002                     | Maxwell Samuels   | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Qiau Chao Chen plus 4 adults and children (name was changed to <b>Jie Lun Chen on 13<sup>th</sup> May) 2011</b> | 16984                          | 16178/02 dated 12-April-2002                   | Maxwell Samuels   | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |

## **Qiau Chao Chen (Jie Lun Chen) Nationality File #16984**

141. We make special mention of Jie Lun Chen for whom someone else may have presented a Passport application on the 27<sup>th</sup> May 2011 renewing machine Readable Passport P0097778 issued 17<sup>th</sup> November 2008. His BPIS photo showed that he may not have appeared in person to renew his Passport. Passport P0097778 was in the name Qiau Chao Chen but the Passport application was in the name Jie Lun Chen. No deed poll was attached to the application or presented to the Counter Clerk yet P0166912 was issued on 30<sup>th</sup> May 2011 & P0167857 was issued on 2<sup>nd</sup> June 2011 in the name Jie Lun Chen. P0166912 was later spoilt and was seen among the cancelled Passports. A search at the Vital Statistics Unit in Belize City indicated that a deed poll for change of name to Jie Lun Chen was lodged on the 13<sup>th</sup> May 2011. Director Maria Marin amended his nationality certificate on the 10<sup>th</sup> June 2011 although he may not have appeared in person at the Nationality Section of the INS. He may have also not appeared in person at the VSU to change his name since he may not have been in the country but a deed poll was lodged at the VSU for change of name to Jie Lun Chen on the 13<sup>th</sup> May 2011.

141.2 We requested his nationality file and in addition to the bogus referees (Therese Cabral and Theodore Hulse seen in the file. We saw that nationality certificates for several other adults and children were also included in the same BNA file #16984 but there was no proof that they were related. Although all persons listed at **Table ZZB** below were included in the file 16984 with the bogus Referees, we noted that only Qiau Chao Chen renewed his Passport in 2008 and 2011.

141.3 We observed that another person Huiyu Tan was, on the 17<sup>th</sup> May 2010, added to Jianhua Tan's nationality certificate by former Minister, Carlos Perdomo. Jianhua Tan's nationality certificate #16177/02 was, on the 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2010, replaced by former Director, Gareth Murillo. Our findings showed that after he and the below persons at **Table ZZB** were issued nationality on 12<sup>th</sup> April 2002 his file became active in November 2008 and then again in April and May of 2010.

### **Table ZZB**

The following table list the persons who were included in file 16984

| <b>Name on Nationality Certificate</b>            | <b>Nationality File Number</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Certificate</b> |
|---|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Guifang Chen<br>(name on file) DOB<br>13-Jan-1957 | 16984                          | 16175/02                              | 12-April-2002              |
| Yintao Xie (DOB                                   | 16984                          | 16175.1/02                            | 12-April-2002              |

|   |       |            |               |
|---|-------|------------|---------------|
| 14-July-1984)   |       |            |               |
| Jian Guo Xie DOB<br>6-Oct-1957<br>(husband of Guifang<br>Chen)  | 16984 | 16176/02   | 12-April-2002 |
| Jianhua Tan DOB<br>22-July-1970   | 16984 | 16177/02   | 12-April-2002 |
| Qiau Chao Chen<br>(changed name to<br>Jie Lun Chen 13-<br>May-2011 Ref Deed<br>Poll #136/2011)<br>DOB 9-Sept-1971 | 16984 | 16178/02   | 12-April-2002 |
| Huiyu Tan (DOB<br>21-Dec-1997) added<br>to Jianhua Tan<br>certificate   | 16984 | 16177.1/02 | 17-May-2010   |

141.

4 We also observed that the Special Branch of the Police Department did the Security Clearance on the applicants and on the bogus referees Therese Cabral and Theodore Hulse. We saw two wet stamps from Special Branch on the bottom of the INS request form that was for the official use of Special Branch only. One stated “nothing adverse recorded” and signed by an illegible signature as Head Special Branch. The other wet stamp stated “CIDAPS” (Central Intelligence Data and Analysis Processing System) get from Passport report) checked and the dates were recorded in ink.

**Abbas Ahmed Khan – alleged Human Trafficker was issued Belizean nationality certificate #16894/02**

142. We requested the nationality file of Abbas Ahmed Khan who was born in Pakistan and whose date of birth was stated as 16<sup>th</sup> June 1974. His nationality file did not have a copy of his native Passport to show the date he entered Belize and through which Port of Entry. We saw a copy of a PR Permit #31334/2000 card (PR File #16078/2000) in his nationality file, which was issued on the 9<sup>th</sup> May 2000 and which stated that his Belize arrival date was the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2000. That suggested he was fraudulently issued a PR card since he had not acquired one year residence in Belize at the time the PR card was issued to him. The card appeared to have been signed by former Director, INS, Paulino Castellanos. We found that the individual Abbas Ahmed Khan did not qualify for Belizean nationality as his file also had the same bogus referees Therese Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse. He was issued his Belizean nationality certificate #17894/02 dated 27<sup>th</sup> June 2002 signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels.

142.2 We found that he was in the social media in March of 2014 for alleged human trafficking charges. The facebook post of what was posted on *QuepasaCorozal.com* read as follows:

***Subject: Arrested man walks out of free man and cops testimonies free Abbas Khan of escape charges***

*“Abbas Khan, a Pakistani national with Belizean citizenship, who at one point was wanted for Unlawful Possession of Passports and for Escaping from Police Custody after being caught, holding the Passports of workers of his, appeared in the Belmopan Magistrate Court this past Wednesday. Six witnesses, all police officers, were called to the stand. They testified on (February 2014) of having seeing Khan at the station, but the defence pointed out that while Khan was at the precinct, he was kept in the lobby area. He had been taken in by an off duty police officer but was not in the lockup so could not escape lawful custody. Magistrate Merlene Moody found that the prosecution could not establish that Khan was in lawful custody so the charge of escape was dismissed.”*

We noted that the news transcript for Channel 7 News Belize for November 7<sup>th</sup> 2013 stated:

*“39 year old Abbas Khan, he's a Corozal resident who vanished from Orange Walk Police in early March of this year. He had been detained for having five Indian passports which he could not account for. Reports said that he had skipped across to Mexico. Police issued a warrant for his arrest and eight months later, he's back. Police report that yesterday, Mexican authorities handed over Abbas Ahmed Khan to Corozal Police. He is wanted for unlawful possession of passports and Escape from Lawful Custody. He has other pending court matters in other local jurisdictions. He vanished from the Orange Walk Police station on March 11th while he was outside of the holding cell because he said he had breathing problems.”*

142.3 Passports were renewed for persons during the period of the Audit (April 2011-September 2013). Several certificate holders did not appear in person to capture their passport biometric and Audit found several irregularities with the related number entries in the Nationality Register. Some also renewed stolen or unaccounted manual Passports or had discrepancies in their Nationality files.

A list of those nationality certificates issued in 2001-2003 that had certificate, register or BNA file discrepancies are listed at **Appendix Q**.

142.4 We also saw several nationality files that did not have the required Police Report for applicants who were issued nationality certificates in 2002 as can be seen at **Table ZZC** below.

#### **Table ZZC**

The following is the list of nationality files that did not have the required Police report of the applicants who had been issued nationality certificates in 2002



| Name of Applicant   | Nationality Certificate # | Address                        | Country of Origin     |
|---------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------|
| Thomas Edward Rubin | 16607/02                  | #97 Vista Del Mar, Belize City | San Diego, California |
| WenYing Huang       | 15903/02                  | 4th Ave, Czl Town              | China                 |
| Feng Jiao Huang     | 15904/02                  | 4th Ave, Czl Town              | China                 |
| Jung-Chin Lin       | 15848/02                  | #49 Vista Del Mar              | China                 |
| Sheng-Yi Lin        | 15851/02                  | #49 Vista Del Mar              | China                 |
| Yi-Fu Lin           | 15850/02                  | #49 Vista Del Mar              | China                 |
| Hsiu-Chin           | 15849/02                  | #49 Vista Del Mar              | China                 |
| Meng Cheng Li       | 16768/02                  | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City      | China                 |
| Caiqiong Li         | 16767/02                  | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City      | China                 |
| Mengtang Li         | 16766/02                  | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City      | China                 |

142.5 We also saw, in the INS Confidential File a memo Ref GEN 13/01/05 (2) dated September 12, 2005 from former Director Jose Zetina to the Minister of Home Affairs. The title/subject matter of this memo was “*Overview of the Immigration Department*” and Mr Zetina stated, “*...the corruption is entrenched within the Department. It is estimated that over 80% to 90% of the staff, both civilian and Immigration officers are involved in some form of corruption at different levels.*”

142.6 We noted that he further stated “*passports, visas, visitor’s permit, visa extensions, temporary employment permits, permanent residence and nationality are in a very high demand and some nationals particularly the Chinese criminals and those involved in human smuggling are willing to pay very high prices for the facilitation of these services. It is also suspected that Chinese nationals may be obtaining Passports without meeting the necessary requirement and that some of them who acquired their nationality in 2002 are paying for either obtaining a Passport or for its renewal.*”

142.7 This led us to conclude that some persons who had fraudulently received nationality during that year (2002) should not have had passports issued to them or their Passports renewed but they were still renewed during the April 2011 to September 2013 period.

#### **Interview on 18<sup>th</sup> February 2015 with former Director INS, Mr. Gareth Murillo**

142.8 We asked Mr. Murillo if he knew about irregularities that were taking place at the Nationality Section sometime during the period 2001/2002 that later caused the Passport Office to dishonour Passports and nationality certificates issued during that period.

Mr. Murillo's response: *"Sometime in 2002 the Government decided to end the BECIP program. I do not remember in what month. At the time I was a Senior Immigration Officer and I heard that BECIP applications were still being accepted and processed. Apparently the former Minister, Mr. Maxwell Samuels and the former Director, Mr. Paulino Castellanos decided to do their own thing. We were told that the ones being processed were applications that had already been received and accepted before the program had ended but then it continued for while until what was really taking place erupted and caused a big scandal. Both of them were removed from their positions. The Director, who took over, Mr. Parchue, later circulated a notice, even internationally, about Passports that were issued around that time, which caused unnecessary setbacks for persons who had received genuine Passports. He was removed and then I was given the post of Acting Director."*

### **No register was presented for those individuals that received nationality under the Economic Citizenship by Investment**

The Belizean Nationality Act 1981 was amended by the Belizean Amended Nationality Act 1985 to provide as follows:

*"A person who has to the satisfaction of the Minister, made substantial contribution to the economy and or well being of Belize, or who has rendered distinguished service to Belize, and who is not entitled to be registered under any of the other provisions of this Act may be granted citizenship by Registration."*

The Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 Section 15 states that,

*"there shall be kept and maintained in the prescribed form a register of persons who are granted citizenship by registration".*

In the Government of Belize Policy on Economic Citizenship Investment Program of January 1995 and amended July 1997, we read that BECIP had its own Register.

Point # 18 under the Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Fund states:

*"All applications for Economic Citizenship shall be submitted by a Licensed Immigration Consultant to the Director of the BECIP Unit on forms printed by the BECIP Unit. Each application must be accompanied by proof of payment of the appropriate registration fee into the special fund at the Central Bank of Belize and necessary supporting documentations. **All applications shall be entered into a Register of applicants to be kept by the BECIP Unit** in the order in which the applications are received and each application shall be given a **distinctive reference number**. The applications shall first be processed by the BECIP Unit and those which are found to be in order shall be submitted to the Scrutinizing Committee with recommendation for the granting or refusal, or otherwise, of the Economic Citizenship.*

*All applicants whose applications are sent to the Scrutinizing Committee shall be notified of the outcome of their applications within seven days of the decisions of the Scrutinizing Committee.”*

***“Applications which are approved by the Scrutinizing Committee shall be sent to the Director of Immigration for the preparation of the Certificate of Nationalization and the passport. A notice shall be sent by the BECIP Unit to the successful applicant, advising of the grant of the citizenship and indicating the date and time when the applicant is to be sworn in as a citizen of Belize and to receive his certificate of nationalization and his Belizean passport.”***

143. We did not receive a register for those persons who had received Belizean nationality through Economic Citizenship by Investment. We were told that the section labelled as such, as seen in the Register for Citizens by Registration for Sections 10 and 11 applicants, was all the department had for the recipients of BECIP.

The Register which was maintained by the BECIP Unit for persons who acquired Economic citizenship was not presented to Audit and another Register was identified to us as the only BECIP Register at the INS.

143.2 We were given three (3) Registers on 22<sup>nd</sup> November, 2013 for Citizens by Registration by the Head Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. Those three (3) registers were as follows:

- i) For the period February 1982 to 31 January 2000 (**this Register also included two different certificate series for citizenship by Investment; one set appeared incomplete, which was labelled “1998 BECIP Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program”**)
- ii) For the period 1-February 2000 to 4-June 2012
- iii) For the period 4-June-2012 to current

143.3 We noted the following irregularities in those registers, specifically the first one:

- a) The majority of certificate references with 2 forward slash for example ###/year, for citizens who claimed citizenship through Investment (BECIP) could not be verified. In the earliest Citizenship by Registration Register for period --February 1982 to 31 January 2000, one page was labelled “1998 BECIP- Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program” which listed the information for 11 persons for the period 24-April-1998 to 11-May 1998. Those entries had certificate series 27/1/98 to 37/1/98 only. We were unable to verify whether persons who presented Passport application for renewal during April 2011 to September 2013, who used certificate numbers with similar reference format, were indeed citizens through Investment.

- b) In the same Citizenship by Registration Register for period --February 1982 to 31 January 2000, the front section recorded citizens who got nationality under Section 10 and Section 11 (through marriage). However, this Register had a section in the middle labelled Citizenship through Investment that had certificate series ranging from #1 (-- June -1986) to #3063 (8-November-1994). In this section were recorded citizens who we were told got nationality under Section 11A and Section 11 (through marriage to persons who claimed Belizean citizenship through Section 11A. Only certificate # 1 through to #134, #862, #1725, #1860 and #1987 had file numbers recorded. When nationality files were requested for persons for whom no file numbers were recorded in the Register, none were presented to us.
- c) In both sections of that Register for period --February 1982 to 31 January 2000, citizens recorded as receiving nationality under Section 10 & 11 and citizens who received under Section 11A (Citizens through Investment), had similar certificate numbers up to # 3063. The only difference observed was the certificate dates.

**Interview held on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2014 with Director International Affairs Ministry of Foreign Affairs**

143.4 We were asked by the Director in our June 5, 2014 interview regarding Passport bulk issuances to Geneva in 2002, if we had seen instances during the Audit where Nationality numbers overlapped. The interview was as follows:

The question was: *“Are you seeing instances where nationality certificate numbers overlap? Immigration is having a problem with the processing of a Passport application that I am assisting with and I was told that was the problem.”*

Our response was yes, we were a bit confused ourselves and that we noticed one of the Registers for Citizens by Registration had two sections, one for citizens under Section 10 and 11 and the other for citizens under Section 11A. Also that in both of those registers the numbers was similar.

The Director stated that: *“A situation like that should not be. These numbers should have never overlapped”.*

143.5 We also interviewed former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo in regard to the confusion with nationality by investment registers.

**Interview held on 27<sup>th</sup> August 2014 with former Director Gareth Murillo**

143.6 We asked the former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo, how many registers there were for Belizean nationality and he responded *“There were one for Economic Citizenship, one for Descent and one for Citizenship by Registration.”*

We informed him that during our investigation we saw two different series numbering used for Nationality through Economic Investment and one of those number series were the same numbers used for the regular Citizenship by Registration. We also informed him that we did not find a complete Register for Economic Citizenship for the series that was different from the regular nationality series. We asked him to explain how those number series could be similar and what would be the difference, if any.

Mr. Murillo responded by saying *“the confusion arose because the BECIP Unit was offering their own numbers while the Immigration Department was using their own numbers for BECIP. It should not have happened but it caused some confusion.”*

We asked him if BECIP Unit and Immigration Department were processing Economic Citizenship and his response was “yes.”

We questioned Mr. Murillo’s response, as we read in the Government of Belize Policy on Economic Citizenship Investment Program of January 1995 amended July 1997, that the Immigration Department did not process BECIP applications and there was a specific register kept by the BECIP Unit and that the Immigration Department only prepared the certificates and Passports. We also learned that BECIP applications also had a *“distinctive reference number”*.

- 143.7 We discovered a copy of an undated letter, referenced 075/96, to Mr. Joseph Fuller, BECIP Unit Belmopan from a person who signed as “NG”. This letter confirmed that BECIP had its unique certificate references. It stated:

*“Enclosed please find the following for the under-mentioned person:*

*Certificate of Registration No. 075/1/96 for Ashoke Nair*

*1 Oath of Allegiance....*

*Grateful if you acknowledge receipt of same by signing and returning a copy of this letter”.*

*(Signed NG)*

- 143.8 The OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade’s statement also contradicted what was said by the former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo in relation to the approval of BECIP applications.

**Interviews held on 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2014 and 25<sup>th</sup> June 2014 with OIC Nationality Section Mr. Gordon Wade**

**22<sup>nd</sup> January 2014 interview**

143.9 When asked about a specific nationality file for Zhou Sileung Sun formerly, Sun Xiling (aka Davis Sun) in which we observed irregular family additions. He gave us a response and some additional information about the BECIP program. He said that in the BECIP program the **Immigration Department did not approve the nationality of the individuals**. Mr Wade stated that in some files for Nationality by Investment we will only see a letter from Robert Leslie asking the Department to issue Passports. He said that many of the cases they are seeing for Passports or renewal do not have the supporting documents in the file. Furthermore, that the information in the BECIP manual does not address the situation in the files. He said that there were many BECIP agents involved and that the files are incomplete and do not have the necessary documents.

**25<sup>th</sup> June 2014 interview**

143.10 We asked Mr. Wade about the entries in the Register that were labelled “citizenship by Investment” and the certificate numbers we were seeing with two slashes that we did not get the Register. He said there was no other Nationality Register at the Department. He said that there were a lot of nationality files missing and in some cases no nationality files existed in the first place. He added that INS only got the letters from the BECIP Unit to make Passports for persons who were approved citizenship by investment. He went on to state that he was not familiar with the series that we saw with slashes and that there is no Register for them. He also said that he was told that the nationality certificate series in 1985 to 1989 were genuine but the ones issued in 1999, 2000, 2001 and 2002 were not.

**A file with certificates of citizens who allegedly received citizenship through Economic Investment was placed on hold because of missing files at the INS**

144. We received a file from the OIC Nationality Section; Mr. Gordon Wade It included several lists of persons, copies of nationality certificates, copies of manual Passports and pending Passport applications. This was for persons who wanted a first-issue or renewal of their Passports but their Belizean nationality certificates could not be verified since the INS Registry had no nationality file for those persons. Those persons are listed at the below **Table** labelled **ZZD**. Some of those persons’ nationality certificates were clearly fraudulent since their certificate numbers were linked to different names in the Registers of Citizens by Registration. Other certificate numbers had no information in the spaces where the names and other information of persons, who received nationality certificates, were recorded. The majority of persons whose names were entered in the alleged BECIP Register (Section 11A) had no file numbers recorded.

Also missing were other information such as: date BNA file was opened, name of certificate holder, number of children included on certificate, section under which certificate was granted, date of issue of certificate, initials of issuing officer and date of oath of affirmation. The information would have helped to verify those persons as genuinely receiving Belizean nationality.

One of them at **Table ZZZ** below had a nationality certificate with the number typed at the wrong place. Another was linked to a jumbo manual Passport with the series unaccounted for in the Jumbo Passport Issue Register at the Department.

**Table ZZD**

The following is the list of BECIP persons for whom no files existed at the INS and whose nationality certificate numbers were blank in the irregular BECIP Register (Section 11A) their

| <b>Name of Nationality Certificate/Passport Holder</b> | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number and Date on certificate</b> | <b>Signature of Minister appeared to be</b> | <b>Section of Law/ Register</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--|-------------------------|---|---|---------------------------------|---|
| Ola Ali Youssef<br>Youssef El Alamy                    | Kuwait                  | 049/95 dated 15-Dec-1995                          | Dean Barrow                                 | Unknown                         | Name did not exist in the three registers presented. Certificate 049 was for Lee Yung Chu-Lin dated 8-Jan-1989 under Section 11A & for Expectacion de Jesus Mendoza dated 20-Aug-1982 under Section 10                  |
| Marcelle Joseph El Hage                                | Beirut, Lebanon         | 1906/91 dated 20-Aug-1991                         | Said Musa                                   | 11A                             | No entry seen in the three registers presented. No file number  |
| Najwa Dhia Al-Deen Al-Nawab (2 children included)      | Baghdad, Iraq           | 2403/91 dated 12-Nov-1991                         | Said Musa                                   | unknown                         | No entry was seen under Section 10 no file number recorded in Register. Under Section 11A Citizens the name recorded for 2403 dated 24-July-1992 was Wang Yang plus 2 children  |
| Raja Najib Ezzeddine                                   | Deirkoubel, Lebanon     | 1429/89 dated 12-Oct-1989                         | Said Musa                                   | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register. He was issued unaccounted Passport #A003890 issued 14-May-2007 in London from unaccounted/stolen series A003501-A004000. Those series were from 1999 |
| Anaan Souheil El Musleh                                | Beirut, Lebanon         | 1811/91 dated 18-March-1991                       | Said Musa                                   | 11A                             | Certificate number was in the top-middle of certificate; Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register  |



| <b>Name of Nationality Certificate/Passport Holder</b> | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number and Date on certificate</b>                                     | <b>Signature of Minister appeared to be</b>                       | <b>Section of Law/ Register</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--|-------------------------|---|---|---------------------------------|---|
| Gabriel Adel Dreik                                     | Anfeh, Lebanon          | 997/89 dated 1-June-1989  | Manuel Esquivel   | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register   |
| Muna Munaf A. Hussain (4 children included)            | Basra, Iraq             | 2785/93 dated 25-March-1993(Replacement by Miss Ruth Meighan on the 11- October-2012) | Said Musa's name was printed as being the Minister who had signed | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register. It was replaced by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan on 11-October 2012 |
| Nada Taha Nikati (3 children included)                 | Tripoli, Lebanon        | 313/88 dated 14-March-1988  | Dean Barrow   | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register   |
| Taha Azmi Nikati                                       | Tripoli, Lebanon        | 312/88 dated 14-March-1988  | Dean Barrow   | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register   |
| Natalia Goukassian (2 children included)               | Gorlovka Donetsk, USSR  | 2845/93 dated 17-May-1993   | Said Musa   | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register   |
| Oubaida Alijaresh Nizameddin (4 children included)     | unknown                 | 574/88 dated 23-Nov-1988  | unknown   | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in register. Copy of Nationality Certificate was not seen                             |
| Pentti Sakari Ronka                                    | Pielavesi, Finland      | 1318/89 dated 29-Aug-1989   | Samuel Rhaburn  | 11A                             | Name seen in the Register but no file number recorded in Register   |

- 144.2 The complete list of original certificates and Passport applications seen in the file for persons with missing nationality files can be seen at **Appendix R** along with certificate numbers, date and the Minister's signature which appeared on those certificates.
- 144.3 We were able to receive one (1) Nationality file for a person recorded in that controversial Register and it was for an individual, Zhou Sileung Sun aka Davix X Sun aka Sun Xiling for whom file number 1682/7 was recorded in the Register.
- 144.4 The relevant register and nationality files were required in order for us to have verified the nationality certificates for those claiming citizenship through BECIP. The Register for BECIP citizens through Investment in the section of the Register of Citizens by Registration, for period --February 1982 to 31 January 2000 may not be entirely genuine. The lack of information in that register such as names, certificate dates, nationality file numbers, number of children included on certificate, date of oath/affirmation and the absence of the nationality files need to be investigated. It is also important to note that the children and wives of those persons listed in that register were also acquiring Belizean citizenship through descent and marriage, even when no names were seen in the Register and no files appeared to have existed at the Department.

#### **Other Irregularities seen in Register of Citizens by Registration**

Form D of the Belize Nationality Act (Chapter 161) requires the following information in the Register of Citizens by Registration:

- 1) *Certificate No. and date*
- 2) *Application No. and date*
- 3) *Name*
- 4) *No. of children included in the certificate*
- 5) *Section under which certificate is granted*
- 6) *Date of Issue*
- 7) *Initials of Issuing Officer*
- 8) *Date of oath or affirmation*
- 9) *Remarks (Renunciation, loss etc.)*

145. We noted the following in the three Citizens by Registration registers examined:

- a) Numerous missing entries in all three registers examined, especially in the Register that shared similar numbers for citizens under Section 11A (Citizenship by Investment). As mentioned in our Passport report, it appeared as though numbers were reserved for fraud. Many applicants presented nationality certificates or nationality certificate numbers when their names, date of certificate, date of oath of affirmation, number of children included on certificate, file number, section (under Law) which the certificates were granted etc. were not seen in the Registers.

145.2 We are of the opinion that had nationality certificate numbers been issued sequentially, there should not have been missing entries. This was confirmed that in a 13<sup>th</sup> March, 2014 interview with the OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. We asked him how the date and number on a nationality certificate was determined, his response was that the numbers had to be issued sequentially and the Minister puts in the date the certificate was signed.

145.3 In our 27<sup>th</sup> August 2014 interview with former Director, Mr. Gareth Murillo, we also asked him if he was aware of missing certificate numbers entries in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His response was:

*“No, I was not aware of any missing entries. There should be none”.*

He was also asked if during his time as the Acting Director and Director, he inspected the Register of Citizens by Registration from time to time to which he responded:

*“As Director I would see the register when it was time to replace certificates but at no time did I see missing entries”.*

We informed him that those missing entries in the register were seen from as early as 1983 and onward. We saw numerous missing entries in all the Registers presented to us, for both citizens under Section 10 and Section 11A.

145.4 We have listed at **Appendix S** a list of nationality certificate numbers that we saw during the audit examination. They were either on Passport applications or nationality certificates that had no corresponding entries in the Register of Citizens by Registration. Those certificate numbers used had dates as if though they were issued from the 80's, 90's and up to 2013, and strangely, it appeared that those Passport applications were first issue Passports.

- b) Two to three names squeezed in on the lines in the Registers for one nationality certificate number indicating that one certificate number was issued to several persons. We found evidence that one nationality certificate number was issued to two or more persons fraudulently. This was seen in the Sections 10, 11 and 11A Register, especially in 1991 (for 11A).

#### **Interview held on 7<sup>th</sup> April 2014 with OIC Nationality Section Mr. Gordon Wade**

145.5 In our 7<sup>th</sup> April, 2014 interview held with OIC Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. We asked him about the discrepancy seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration and the Nationality certificates with similar numbers being issued to different persons. His response was that a nationality certificate number belongs to one individual only, except in the case where children are included on the same certificate and are given the same number followed by “.1” for the 1<sup>st</sup> child, “.2” for the 2<sup>nd</sup> child etcetera. He added that this situation suggested fraud and should never happen.

- c) The blatant use of white out (correction fluid) in the Registers of Citizens by Registration and in some cases made, it was obvious that it was done to cover up the names of the original recipients of the certificate numbers as was the case with Nina Sha and Zhaoyi Sha reported in detail at paragraph 8.6 in the Passport Report referenced Section III) **Table ZZE** below lists some instances of the use of correction fluid that covered up the names of the original holders of nationality certificates.

Further investigation is required to ascertain the original holders of the certificate numbers that were covered by correction fluid in the Register of Citizens by Registration.

#### **Table ZZE**

The following is the list of instances where correction fluid was used in the Register of Citizens by Registration to cover the original holders of nationality certificates

| <b>Previous Name in Register of Citizens by Registration</b> | <b>New Name in Register of Citizens by Registration</b> | <b>Certificate Number and Date</b>         | <b>Section of Law/Register</b> |
|--|---|--|--------------------------------|
| Jamil Chinapen   | Nina Sha  | 16677 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> June 2002     | Section 10                     |
| Jamil Chinapen   | Zhaoyi Sha  | 16677.1 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> June 2002   | Section 10                     |
| Unknown  | -----Del Carmen Leonov                                  | 18909 dated 10 <sup>th</sup> November 2005 | Section 10                     |
| Unknown  | Jiabi Yao   | 19371/06                                   | Section 10                     |
| Unknown  | Ming Zhuo Wu  | 20233 dated 6 <sup>th</sup>                | Section 10                     |

| <b>Previous Name in Register of Citizens by Registration</b> | <b>New Name in Register of Citizens by Registration</b> | <b>Certificate Number and Date</b>         | <b>Section of Law/Register</b> |
|--|---|--|--------------------------------|
|  |   | November 2006                              |                                |
| Unknown  | Lacy Jim Faftik   | 21222 dated 7 <sup>th</sup> August 2007    | Section 10                     |
| Unknown  | Baha Ozgur  | 21638 dated 14 <sup>th</sup> November 2007 | Section 10                     |
| Unknown  | Jose Edgardo Alas                                       | 25861 dated 11 <sup>th</sup> December 2012 | Section 10                     |
| Unknown  | Bryan Michael Paul Boguert                              | 27333 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> February 2012  | Section 10                     |

- d) Some entries were made in temporary ink (felt pen) which is not allowed for Government documents and ledgers.
- e) Two instances of Asian style writing in one of the register. It suggested that persons other than Immigration Officers or employees had access to the Nationality register at some point. Those two instances can be seen at **Table ZZF** below:

**Table ZZF**

The following is the two instances that the Asian style writing was found in one of the Register for Citizens by Registration

| <b>Name</b>          | <b>File Number</b> | <b>Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date of Certificate</b> | <b>Other Observations</b>  |
|----------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--|
| Teng . Tsai<br>.Wang | 21557              | 20851                     | 8 <sup>th</sup> May 2007   | Section 10 of the register   |
| Mei . Hsueh<br>Chang | 21557              | 20852                     | 8 <sup>th</sup> May 2007   | 2 children were included on certificate as seen under Section 10 in the Register |

**One thousand (1000) Nationality Certificate Numbers were not recorded in one of the Register of Citizens by Registration**

146. We observed that one thousand nationality certificate numbers with the series 2670 to 2769 (100) and 6100 to 6999 (900) were unaccounted for in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We noted that between the period March and May of 1993, the last certificate number used was 2669 then the series jumped to 2770. Between January and October 1996 the certificate number 6099 was the last number recorded in the Registration of Citizens by Registration.

146.2 We noted that another case of unrecorded numbers was later discovered by Immigration personnel and rewritten when the numbering had jumped from 6099-7000 between January and October of 1996. All the recipients of those certificate numbers from 6100 to 6999 for 900 certificate numbers were still not written in the Register. This evidently fraudulent practice of reserving nationality numbers continued throughout the Register and even into 2013.

146.3 We were unable to identify the recipients of all those certificate numbers on the BPIS since we needed the expertise of the CITO Technician and he had abandoned the Audit at a critical time (the last date we heard from him was 21<sup>st</sup> May, 2014, via a text in which he stated that he would be working late and that he would be in the next day). He was in the process of creating a formula to search for all similar nationality certificate numbers on the BPIS when he left.

**Many Individuals' Nationality files did not have the required documents yet those individuals received Belizean Nationality certificates**

Section 10 (3) of The Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161 states:

*“Without prejudice to the generality of subsection (2) of this section, the Minister may refuse to register as a citizen of Belize any person referred to in that subsection if he is satisfied that the applicant-*

*(a) Is not of good character; or*

*(b) Has been convicted by a competent court in any country of a criminal offence for which he was sentenced to death or has been detained under a sentence of imprisonment of twelve months or more imposed on him on his conviction of a criminal offence by such a court, and in either case, has not received a free pardon in respect of the offence; or*

*(c) Has engaged in activities, whether within or outside of Belize, which, in the opinion of the Minister, are prejudicial to the safety of Belize or to the maintenance of law and public order in Belize; or*

*(d) Has been adjudged or otherwise declared bankrupt under any law in force in any country and has not been discharged; or*

*(e) Not being the dependant of a citizen of Belize has not sufficient means to maintain himself and is likely to become a public charge.”*

147. We noted that the above quoted requirements were contravened by some individuals and the INS as outline below:

- i) Documents to prove that they were of good character were not provided from their native country or country of residence prior to Belize.
- ii) Documents to prove that they had not been convicted by a competent court. Convicted in any country of a criminal offence for which they were sentenced to death. Detained under a sentence of imprisonment of twelve months or more. Imposed conviction of a criminal offence by such a court, and in either case, had not received a free pardon in respect of the offence from their native country or country of residence prior to Belize.
- iii) Not all applicants provided documents from their native country or country of residence prior to Belize to prove that they had not engaged in activities ... outside of Belize, which are prejudicial to the safety of Belize or to the maintenance of law and public order in Belize.

147.2 We saw from the nationality files examined that almost all nationality applicants provided a Belize Criminal Record from the Belize Crimes Investigation Branch. However, none was provided from their native country or the country they had been resident prior to Belize.

147.3 We viewed with grave concern the practice of the Department to accept only the applicant's Belize criminal record. Those persons may have had a criminal record in their native country, which would not be in Belize's Criminal Registry.

We were also concerned that, the opinion of two (2) Belizean (by birth) Referees could not suffice in determining whether a nationality applicant was of “good character.” The applicant's criminal record from his native country is important.

**The Recommended procedure to request a criminal record from the native country of applicants for Belizean nationality was not adhered to**

148. We noted that prior to 27<sup>th</sup> September 2005; the Head Special Branch requested through Joint Intelligence Agencies, status verification on nationality applicants. However, after September 2005 they recommended that applicants request their own criminal records from their native country before applying for Belizean residency or nationality.

148.2 We saw a letter dated 27<sup>th</sup> September 2005 Ref. PSF 2/14/2005 from the Head Belize Special Branch Headquarters, Paul Wade, to the Director (name was not stated) of Immigration and Nationality. In this letter with subject matter: *‘JICC Checks on Belize Nationality Applicants’*, the Director INS was informed that Interpol Stations in London and Beijing can no longer provide assistance to the Head Special Branch in carrying out checks in relation to non-criminal matters.

148.3 He also informed the Director that Interpol China was requesting that Chinese applicants apply for criminal records through the local Chinese Embassy or Consulate to obtain a certificate of police record from the applicant’s local police authority. In the case of the United Kingdom the applicant should apply to the Data Protection Officer at the Headquarters of the local Police Force in whose area they last resided.

148.4 Additionally, his letter went on to say:

*“in view of the above, it is considered that all residency or nationality applicants should be advised that it is their responsibility to obtain a certificate of this nature prior to submitting the relevant application, in order to avoid any long delays in obtaining police records from the local police authorities in their countries of origin.”*

148.5 Mr. Wade concluded his letter by stating:

*“JICC will continue to carry out checks on the Interpol and EPIC data bases, but that production of the relevant document, by the applicant, suitably endorsed by an authority from their country of origin, would allow for expeditious processing of their applications”.*

148.6 We also observed that prior to 2011 and specifically up to 19<sup>th</sup> January 2010, requests were made by INS to Head Special Branch for information (security clearance) for applicants for Belizean nationality and for their Referees. Those requests were submitted on a designated form with the INS letter head and labelled “Security Clearance”.

The name of the persons who required vetting were recorded on the form including their dates of birth, place of birth, native Passport number or Belize ID number, nationality, occupation and their permanent address and it would be signed by an INS officer for the Director. That request was also recorded on the nationality file’s Minute Sheet. The Head Special Branch would submit such clearance on a separate form to the Director, INS. This was done in addition to the submission of Police Reports from the Criminal Records Office in Belmopan. **Table ZZG** below lists four individuals in whose files those requests were observed.



**Table ZZG**

The following is the list of applicants whose nationality files showed that the INS requested security clearance from Head Special Branch

| <b>Name of Applicant</b>  | <b>Date of Request</b>         | <b>Observations on request for Security Clearance from Special Branch</b>   |
|---|--------------------------------|---|
| Mahmoud Hussein Harmouch  | 11 <sup>th</sup> April 2005    | Requested by Ady Pacheco for the applicant and for referees Hugo Lizama and Eduvijes Ancona   |
| Talal Harmouch  | July 2007                      | Requested for applicant and Ruben and Maria Gonzalez before file was sent to the Solicitor General for vetting  |
| Blanca Haydee Perez   | 18 <sup>th</sup> January 2010  | Security Clearance was requested for Abram Tzib as referee for applicant  |
| Muhammad Zaghlool<br>(Applicant applied for nationality through Marriage (Section 11). He entered Belize on 19 <sup>th</sup> June 2008 and got married as per Marriage Certificate on 30 <sup>th</sup> September 2008 to Belizean, Claudia Jimenez of Belize City | 19 <sup>th</sup> January 2010. | Muhammad Zaghlool was identified as a major smuggler of Pakistani, Indian and Nepalese nationals from Belize to Mexico for onward movement to the USA |

148.7 We did not see in any of the applicants' nationality files we examined for 2011, 2012 and 2013 where the INS requested security clearance by the Head Special Branch. In our exit interview with the Acting Director, INS, Maria Marin on July 30<sup>th</sup>, July 31<sup>st</sup> and August 3<sup>rd</sup> 2015, she revealed to us that the directive to eliminate the security clearance came from Cabinet.

148.8 We noted that the violation of the Belize Nationality Act may have allowed persons to receive Belizean nationality who were convicted criminals or persons whose activities could be prejudicial to the safety of Belize or to the maintenance of law and public order in Belize. A few of those individuals are Li Hua Wu aka Richard Wu, Wonhong Kim, Muhammad Zaghlool and Hongyuan She.

148.9 We examined the nationality files for certificates issued in 2011 -2013 and had the Police Reports from the Crimes Investigation Branch alone. No evidence was seen that Security Clearance was requested from the Special Branch for applicants or for their Belizean Referees.

**Attorney General's Ministry used to vett Nationality Files subsequent to 16<sup>th</sup> April 2010**

149. We noted that the Attorney General's Ministry through the Solicitor General had been vetting nationality files submitted by the INS. We saw such vetting in the file dated 10<sup>th</sup> July 2007 and 16<sup>th</sup> April 2010. The vetting by the Solicitor General was apparently discontinued by the INS, since we did not see such procedure in the files presented for 2011, 2012 and 2013. A critical aspect of the nationality process was discontinued.

**No evidence seen that a Committee reviewed nationality applications subsequent to 2005**

150. We saw evidence in some nationality files that there had been a committee set up to review nationality applications. The Nationality Advisory Committee as it was called included the Ministry of Finance and Home Affairs Legal Department, Mr. Robert Leslie (the Cabinet Secretary) and Mr. Gian C Ghandi (Legal Counsel). We observed that the committee had the authority to deny applicants.

150.2 We saw an example of the committee's review process in the nationality file of Mahmoud Hussein Harmouche where Mr. Gian C Ghandi, Legal Counsel wrote to the Director on the 4<sup>th</sup> April 2005 and stated:

*"In view of adverse reports from the Special Branch and the Attorney General's Ministry, the application for nationality is refused".*

Mr. Robert Leslie, the Cabinet Secretary, also wrote on 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2005:

*"Not recommended".*

150.3 However, as stated before at **paragraph 117.2 (3) (titled Mahmoud Harmouch)** their decision was overruled by Hon. Ralph Fonseca who approved the application for Belizean Nationality on 11<sup>th</sup> July 2005.

**All applicants for Belizean nationality did not comply with the requirements for a Police Record**

Requirement #4 on page 6 of the Policy and Procedures Manual July 1, 2011 (Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10) requires:

*"A valid Police Record, signed by the applicant."*

Requirement #4 on page 9 (Acceptance of Nationality Application Section 11 Form G) also requires:

*Recent Police Record signed by the applicant. “Please note that the Police Records have only (6) months validity.”*

We saw that the Police Record itself also states “*valid for 6 months only*”

151. We observed from the nationality files examined that a number of people applied for their Belizean nationality without their Belize Police records, did not sign their Police Records or applied with expired Police Record. In some cases we noted that the applicants did not appear in person to have their photos taken for the Police Record as the photos appeared as copies of their native Passport photos or a photocopy of a photograph. **Table ZZH** below list some of those individuals who did not comply with the police record requirements while **Appendix T** list other such individuals that violated the requirements.

**Table ZZH**

The following is a list of individuals who violated the requirements for a police record for their Belizean nationality

| <b>Name of Applicant</b> | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Police Record Presented</b>   | <b>Nationality Certificate Received</b> | <b>Address as per Certificate</b> |
|--------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|-----------------------------------|
| Ziad Omais               | Dakar, Senegal          | No   | 28151/13 dated 23-May-2013              | Santa Rita Road, Corozal          |
| Yih Wei Ku               | ROC/Taiwan              | No   | 25202/11                                | Succotz Village                   |
| Ali Zaouali              | France                  | No   | 25506/11                                | #9 Barrack Rd, Bze City           |
| Sidia Elizabeth Cabrera  | Honduras                | No   | 27254/12                                | Spanish Lookout                   |
| Thomas Edward Rubin      | San Diego California    | No   | 16607/02                                | #97 Vista Del Mar, Bze City       |
| Mengtang Li              | China                   | No   | 16766/02                                | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City         |
| Wael Harmouche           | El Sfireh, Lebanon      | Picture in applicant's Lebanese Passport was copied and printed and copied on to photo paper for Criminal Record | 26324/12 dated 11-Jan-2012              | Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town    |

| <b>Name of Applicant</b>         | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Police Record Presented</b>   | <b>Nationality Certificate Received</b>   | <b>Address as per Certificate</b>            |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|--|
| Tian Zhi Wang                    | Hubei, China            | Photo used for Police Report was picture of a picture  | 25698/11 dated 24-Nov-2011  | Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan            |
| Saad Mohamad Harmouch            | El Sfireh, Lebanon      | Picture of a picture used on Police Report   | 26328/12 dated 11-Jan-2012  | Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town               |
| Ahmad Harmouche                  | El Sfireh, Lebanon      | Photo used for Police Report was picture of a picture taken from his Passport picture (not a valid photo) 2007 | 26363/12 dated 11-Jan-2012 (applicant did not qualify until 30-Sept- 2012 or 1-October-2013 | Hurricane Street, San Pedro Town             |
| Hui Juan Liu                     | China                   | Police Record was not signed by applicant  | 27686/12  | 40 Mahogany St, Bze City                     |
| Wen-Cheng Chang (aka Eric Chang) | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/ application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired)   | 12505/00 dated 4-July-2000  | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City |
| Kang-Chih Chang (aka Andy Chang) | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/ application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired)   | 12506/00 dated 4-July-2000  | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City |
| Shu-Tang Chang                   | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/ application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired)   | 12504/00 dated 4-July-2000  | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City |
| Chung Pao-Chu Chang              | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/ application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired)   | 12503/00 dated 4-July-2000  | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City |

**Applicants did not provide documents to prove that they had not been declared bankrupt under any law in force in any country**

Sec 10 (3 d) of Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize states:

*(3) “Without prejudice to the generality of subsection (2) of this section, the Minister may refuse to register as a citizen of Belize any person referred to in that subsection if he is satisfied that the applicant-*

*(d) has been adjudged or otherwise declared bankrupt under any law in force in any country and has not been discharged;”*

152. We saw no evidence from the files examined that the Financial Intelligence Unit (FIU) was utilized to investigate the applicants of Belizean nationality for bankruptcy. Neither did we see any document from the applicant’s native country confirming that they had not been declared bankrupt in their country or another country of residence.

**Applicants did not provide documents to prove that they were not dependants of a citizen of Belize and that they had sufficient means to maintain themselves and were not likely to become a public charge or liability. Chapter 161 Sec 10 (3 e)**

#### **Section 10 (3)**

*“Without prejudice to the generality of subsection (2) of this section, the Minister may refuse to register as a citizen of Belize any person referred to in that subsection if he is satisfied that the applicant-*

*(e) not being the dependant of a citizen of Belize, has not sufficient means to maintain himself and is likely to become a public charge.*

153. We saw no evidence from the files examined that applicants were not dependants of a citizens of Belize; that they had sufficient means to maintain themselves and were not likely to become a public charge or liability. Such evidence needed would have been in the form of Bank Statements or employment letters. We did not see letters verifying the bank balances of all applicants from commercial Banks in Belize or from their native country or elsewhere; although several applicants wrote the value of their total assets or stated on their nationality application forms that they owned businesses in Belize. Likewise, we saw no employment letters to show that persons had sufficient means to maintain themselves.

**Nationality Application form was inconsistent with the Department’s Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011**

Requirement #1 on Page (5) of the Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011 (Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10) makes a reference to page 4 of the application form:

*“On page (4) for the Referees: **who should be Belizean nationals by birth**, must write in their names, complete address and number of years they know the applicant.”*

Requirement #10 on page seven (7) (Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10) requires:

*“Identification of both referees is needed for each application. The signature on application form and signature on Belize passport or Belize Voter’s identification card must be checked to ensure consistency. Referees must be Belizeans by birth.”*

154. We saw a nationality application form dated 28<sup>th</sup> July 2011 for Yi Lung Lee which was inconsistent with the above quoted requirements. On page four (4) for his nationality application had the question, “Are the referees born Belizeans or naturalized, if not, what is their original nationality?”

154.2 We could not ascertain why Yi Lung Lee’s nationality application form would ask the question about the nationality of the referees when requirements # 1 and 10 of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011 indicates that all referees should be born Belizeans.

**No authority for the production or issue of Passport-Type Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits in the Belize Immigration Act**

155. We saw no authority in the Belize Immigration Act that allowed for the INS to produce and issue Passport type permanent residency re-entry permits. What we found was the outline of a legal document the Re-entry permit (form 8), that the INS was authorized to use under Section 18 of the Immigration Act, Chapter 156 of the Laws of Belize. This form can be seen at Table ZZI below.

## Table ZZI

The following is the outline of form 8 which is the legal document that Section 18 of the Immigration Act authorizes the INS to use as the re-entry permit

Form 8

Permit No. RE/ /

(Section 18)

### IMMIGRATION ACT

#### Re-entry Permit

This permit entitles \_\_\_\_\_ holder of Passport No. \_\_\_\_\_ issued at \_\_\_\_\_ on \_\_\_\_\_ and who is an alien domiciled in Belize, to re-enter Belize after a temporary absence outside Belize.

2. This permit is valid up to and including \_\_\_\_\_

Director of Immigration,

Belize.

Belize City, dated \_\_\_\_\_

### **Two hundred and ten (210) Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits for Belize (Passport-Type Documents) found at the Taiwan Embassy**

156. We saw the copy of an email dated 19<sup>th</sup> October, 2011 with the subject: “*Permanent Resident Re-entry Permit (Passport-Type)*”. The email was forwarded from the Belize Ambassador to ROC- Taiwan, to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs along with pictures of Belize Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits. Those were found in the Office of the Ambassador/Charge d’ Affaires at the Embassy of Belize, ROC- Taiwan upon the assumption of her duty to that post. The information was emailed to the former CEO of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, on 7<sup>th</sup> September 2011. The serial numbers of those documents are listed below at **Table ZZJ**.

### **Table ZZJ**

The following is the list of Belize Permanent Residency Re-entry permits that were found in the Office of the Ambassador/Charge d' Affaires, ROC- Taiwan

| <b>Serial number of Belize Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits</b> | <b>Amount</b> |
|---|---------------|
| 000601-000660   | 60            |
| 000801-000850   | 50            |
| No serial numbers   | 100           |
| <b>TOTAL</b>  | <b>210</b>    |

### **Interview held on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2015 with the Director International Affairs from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs**

157. We asked the Director International Affairs about the two hundred and ten (210) Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits referred to in the Belize Ambassador to ROC- Taiwan email found in Taiwan. The Director International Affairs was asked if it was the first time that she was aware of the existence of those Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits to which she responded:

*“Prior to 2009, over one thousand (1,000) of the same Permanent Residency Re-entry Permits were found in Taiwan and sent to Belize on Cabinet’s directive. These permits were received and destroyed by the Ministry of National Security. The second incident with Ms. Cherie Nisbet proves that not all were sent and destroyed prior to 2009.”*

### **Some original nationality certificates issued to some individuals did not have certificate numbers and dates**

158. We saw copies of some original certificates that were issued to individuals which did not have the certificate numbers and/ or dates. Those individuals are listed at **Table ZZK**.



**Table ZZK**

The following is the list of individuals who were issued original certificates that did not have certificate numbers and or dates on them

| <b>Name</b>                                | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Minister's signature on Nationality Certificate</b>        | <b>Date</b>                    | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------|--|
| Faten Omar Abdel Quader Khalil El Bashatli | 2128/92                               | Irregular signature of Minister Said Musa                     | No date printed on certificate | Applicant's name was seen in Section 11A Register but no file number was recorded in the Register. Nationality file was requested on 11 <sup>th</sup> June 2014 but not presented.   |
| Maroun El-Badaoui Maroun                   | None                                  | Signature on certificate was that of Minister Maxwell Samuels | 24-Jan-2002                    | Certificate had no number; Renewed Passport 22-April-2013  |
| Mercedes Maroun                            | None                                  | Signature on certificate was that of Minister Maxwell Samuels | 24-Jan-2002                    | Certificate had no number; Renewed Passport 22-April-2013  |
| Su Hong                                    | 2203/92                               | Irregular signature of Minister Said Musa                     | No date printed on certificate | Applicant's name was seen in Section 11A Register but no file number was recorded in the Register. Nationality file was requested but not presented. She applied for a Replacement with a Police Report stating that her original nationality certificate was lost but then later submitted a copy she had found. Replacement Certificate seen |

| Name                             | Nationality Certificate Number  | Minister's signature on Nationality Certificate | Date   | Observations   |
|----------------------------------|---|---|--|--|
| Xiao Tuo Zhang                   | None printed on copy of Original Certificate seen                     | Irregular signature of Minister Said Musa       | 4-Jan-1990                                       | Name was not clear on certificate; Certificate # 1676/90 was written on Passport application. Under Section 10, 1676/90 dated 2-March-1990 was for Mirta Boteo Morales. Under Section 11A Register white-out was used to cover the original name in the Register and the name Zhang Xiaotuo was seen but no file number was recorded in the Register.  |
| Kent Bruce Crane                 | None printed on copy of Original Certificate seen                     | Irregular signature of Minister Dean Barrow     | 23-Oct-1987                                      | Applicant wrote 243/87 on application and it was found in the Register/Previous manual Passports were linked to unaccounted & compromised batch of Passports. He stated in a report that his nationality certificate was "missing" and that he was applying for a Replacement certificate; however, a copy of the original was seen attached. His nationality file was requested on 19-June-2014 but it was not presented to Audit |
| Bruce Liu formerly Ching-Hua Liu | None printed on copy of Original Certificate seen                     | Irregular signature of Minister Dean Barrow     | No date on copy of Original certificate attached | Certificate #761 dated 6-March-1989 replaced by Jose Zetina on 1-August-2005/ Name seen in the Register but no file number was recorded. His nationality file was requested twice on Feb-25-2014 & 10-June-2014 but it was not presented to Audit.<br><br><b>(Replacement certificate was seen)</b>  |
| Jia Hui Huang                    | None printed on copy of Original Certificate seen which was illegible | Irregular signature of Minister Said Musa       | 29-Dec-1992                                      | Certificate 2607/92 dated 29-Dec-1992 was written on application; applicant had stolen Passport A006750 with issue date of 12-Aug-2003 issued at Trade Office Hong Kong but Register stated batch was issued to Belize City. The name Huang Zhang Jing plus 1 was seen in the Register for that number. File was requested on 19-June-2014 but it was not presented  |

| <b>Name</b>        | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b>                           | <b>Minister's signature on Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Date</b>                    | <b>Observations</b>  |
|--------------------|---|--|--------------------------------|--|
| Shih Tsai Huang    | None printed on copy of Original Certificate seen               | Irregular signature of Minister Said Musa              | No date printed on certificate | Huang Shi Tsai on certificate and seen in Register 11A; no file number was recorded in the Register; no file presented although requested on 19-June-2014  |
| Wen Hua Xiao Huang | No seal on copy of Original Certificate /Number was not visible | Irregular signature of Minister Said Musa              | No date printed on certificate | 2669/93 dated /93 was recorded on Passport application) There was no entry for 2669 in Section 11A of Register; 2669 was for Santiago Putol Tox dated 12-Jan-1993 under Section 10. Three children were listed on certificate as receiving nationality along with applicant. no file number was recorded in the Register; no file presented although requested on 19-June-2014 |
| Jianbin Liu        | None printed on copy of Original Certificate attached           | Irregular signature of Minister Dean Barrow            | No date printed on certificate | Certificate # 060/1/96 dated 18-Jan-1996 written on Passport application but series not seen in the Register.  |

158.2 Those certificates listed above may have been issued fraudulently hence the reason why they would have needed to be replaced and a number assigned and recorded on the subsequent replacement nationality certificate.

158.3 It appeared that replacement nationality certificates, and not the copies of original nationality certificates, were introduced at the INS. Those certificates did not have the certificate numbers and or dates that said certificates were purportedly signed by the Minister/s. We did not meet with the former Ministers of Immigration to confirm if the signatures on those certificates.

**The issuance of Replacement Nationality Certificate by the INS created opportunity for Fraud involving corrupt Immigration Personnel and International “Agents”**

159. We reported our findings on many fraudulent replacement nationality certificates in our Passport report. One such finding was the case of Nina Sha and Zhaoyi Sha (mother and son) allegedly from China. They were able to receive fraudulent replacement nationality certificates and consequently genuine Belizean Passports without having set foot in Belize. We also found that those persons with fraudulent nationality replacement certificates had international middlemen/agents with links to the Belize Passport Office assisting them, one of which is in Dalian, China and has “*a well established organization*”. (This was established based on confidential correspondence between Consulates.

159.2 We noted that Ms. Sha was told by their “agent” in China that there were Passports left over from the previous Economic Investment Citizenship Program. However, the fraudulent nationality certificates issued to Ms Sha and her son Zhaoyi Sha was the certificate which had been issued to one Jamil Chinapen as seen under Section 10 of the Citizens by Registration Register.

159.3 We showed former Director of Immigration and Nationality, Mr. Gareth Murillo, during our 27th August, 2014 interview with him, copies of several fraudulent replacement nationality certificates and asked if the signatures were his. He denied signing those certificates and said:

*“I still have some friends over at the Immigration Department who may be doing this”.*

**Interview held on 8th December, 2014 with former Director Ruth Meighan on the issuance of Replacement Nationality Certificates**

160. We asked Ms. Meighan during our 8th December 2014 interview with her, why replacement nationality certificates were issued and not the copies of the original certificates. Her response is below:

*“I met the process there and I had questioned it. At first it was just a letter but people needed a number of the certificate. But I met that process there when I became the Director”.*

160.2 We did a subsequent interview on 16<sup>th</sup> January 2015 with Miss Meighan and informed her that we observed that certificates, not letters, were replaced by the INS. We told her that this was noted from nationality files and Passport applications we had examined. We went on to ask her why those people weren’t just given a copy of the original certificate from the file and she expounded on her response with:

*“In some cases the owners lost their certificate or damaged it. Some had laminated the certificate and that should not have been done so they requested a replacement. As I said, the process of issuing replacement certificates was already there when I became Director.”*

160.3 We asked her what the procedure was for the signing of a replacement certificate and she responded as follows:

*“The file only would come to me and I would just sign the replacement based on the file. Anyone would bring the file from the Nationality Section.”*

160.4 We noted that copies of the nationality certificates issued to each individual whose files were presented were found on their file. In addition, all most all of the replacement certificates issued were for the files that were not presented to us.

**INS Directors replaced individuals nationality certificates for persons although nationality files may not have existed for those individuals**

**(i) Former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan replaced Nationality Certificate 2785/93 for Missing Nationality File**

161. We observed that Miss Ruth Meighan replaced nationality certificate for Muna Munaf A. Hussain who was born in Basra Iraq on the 1<sup>st</sup> July 1949. The Nationality certificate had been replaced by former Director, Ruth Meighan on 11<sup>th</sup> October 2012. The replacement certificate indicated that it was signed by Minister Said Musa as his name was printed on the front of the certificate.

161.2 We saw her name in the Register of Citizens by Registration under Section 11A Citizens but no file number was recorded for the entry. Her file was not at the department as we saw from a folder presented to us by the OIC Nationality Section, for nationality files that could not be found.

161.3 It was interesting to note that Ms. Meighan had told us that she had to have the nationality file in her possession to replace a nationality certificate.

**(ii) Acting Director, Ms. Maria Marin replaced Nationality Certificate 2203/92 for Missing Nationality File**

162. We observed that Ms. Maria Marin replaced nationality certificate #2203/92 on the 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2013 for Su Hong whose correct name was Hong Su born in Beijing China on the 12<sup>th</sup> October 1963. The Replacement indicated that the original was signed by Minister Said Musa on 13<sup>th</sup> April 1992.

162.2 We saw that Hong Su applied for a renewal of her Belizean manual Passport 0248647 issued 15<sup>th</sup> March 2002 at the Consulate of Belize in Los Angeles in the name Hong Su. That manual Passport indicated that she had been previously issued Passport number 098953 on the 14<sup>th</sup> April 1992.

162.3 We saw the name Su Hong in the Register under Section 11A for Citizens through Economic Investment. No file number was recorded for that entry in the Register. When her nationality file was requested on the 25<sup>th</sup> February 2014, it was her husband; Zhou Sileung Sun's (Davis X Sun) nationality file number 1682/7 that was presented. His file contained a copy of her original undated nationality certificate in the name Su Hong and signed by what appeared as the signature of Minister Said Musa and a letter (Ref (13) 1064/13 dated 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013, from Barrow and Williams Law Firm signed by Tania M Moody. It was addressed to the Immigration Department and stated they were the Solicitors for the family (Davis Sun, Hong Su, and Joseph Yang Sun) and were submitting documents and payment on their behalf for their replacement nationality certificates.

The Nationality file for Zhou Sileung Sun's (Davis X Sun) also revealed that his previous wife's name was Shalan J Sun, born in China on the 1<sup>st</sup> August 1945.

162.4 We noted that Hong Su's nationality certificate was replaced without her nationality file by Ms. Maria Marin and the replacement certificate was typed in the name "Su Hong" with a note at the back stating that her name had been changed to Diana Su Sun on the 29<sup>th</sup> March 2006. Her Passport application presented on the 20<sup>th</sup> May 2013 (without a copy of a deed poll) had the name Hong Su and she was issued her Belizean Passport P0237126 in the name Hong Su on the 20<sup>th</sup> May 2013 although Ms. Marin had certified that her new name was Diana Su Sun.

**(iii) Former Director, Gareth Murillo replaced Nationality Certificate numbers 762/89 and 1684/1/96 Vol. V (18)**

163. We observed that Gareth Murillo replaced nationality certificates for the following persons for whom we were unable to get their nationality files or their parents' for examination:

- i) Shu- Jung Chiu Liu who was born in Taiwan on the 21<sup>st</sup> January 1955. Her nationality certificate #762/89 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> March 1989 was replaced by Mr. Murillo on the 24<sup>th</sup> June 2008 and indicated that the original was signed by Minister Dean O. Barrow.
- ii) I-Wei Liu who was born in Taiwan on the 15<sup>th</sup> December 1985. His nationality certificate #762/89 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> March 1989 was replaced by Mr. Murillo on the 24<sup>th</sup> June 2008 and indicated that the original was signed by Minister Dean O. Barrow.
- iii) I-Hsuan Liu who was born in Taiwan on the 20<sup>th</sup> April 1980. Her nationality certificate #762/89 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> March 1989 was replaced by Mr. Murillo on the 24<sup>th</sup> June 2008 and indicated that the original was signed by Minister Dean O. Barrow.
- iv) I -Ting Liu who was born in Taiwan on the 9<sup>th</sup> September 1993. His descent certificate #1684/1/96 Vol.V (18) dated 8-July-1996 was replaced by Mr. Murillo on the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2008 and indicated that the original was signed by Miss V. E Samuels, former Director, INS.

163.2 We were also unable to receive the nationality file for Bruce Liu, previously Ching-Hua Liu, and holder of nationality certificate number 761/89 dated 6<sup>th</sup> March 1989, which indicated that the original was signed by Minister Dean O. Barrow. His certificate was replaced by former Director, Mr. Jose Carmen Zetina in August 2005 (date not clear). The names Ching-Hua Liu and Shu-Jung Chiu Liu (2 children included), were seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration as having received Belizean nationality under Section 11A (Economic Investment). However no file numbers were recorded for those entries in the register and when we requested their nationality files; none were presented as was the case with many others whose names or certificate numbers were listed in that specific Register of Citizens who claimed Belizean nationality through economic investment.

163.3 We also saw a copy of nationality certificate number 1393/89 signed by former Minister of Immigration, Samuel Rhaburn dated the 7<sup>th</sup> March 1989. That certificate was issued to Kishinchand-Sadarangani Vishnu of Nadras, India, whose name was seen in the register of Citizens by Registration Section 10. We could not ascertain whether the INS had two Ministers who signed nationality certificates in March of 1989 as we saw that Minister Dean O. Barrow signed for Bruce Liu's family on 6<sup>th</sup> March 1989.

163.4 We mentioned in our Passport Audit Report Section III), that in view of all the irregularities and fraudulent activities, Cabinet's decision on missing files made January 14, 2014, sent to the Director, Miss Maria Marin by Minister Godwin Hulse vide unreferenced letter dated January 14, 2014 should be reviewed taking into consideration our findings.

Minister Godwin Hulse's unreferenced letter was as follows:

January 14, 2014

To: Immigration Director

Ms. Maria Marin

*Re: cabinet discussion today January 14, 2014 on issuance of Passports to persons for whom immigration department does not have a file.*

*Cabinet has decided that persons who hold original nationality certificates and previous Passports should be issued with a new Passport.*

*A file should be created for such persons showing copies of previous passports, certified copy of the original nationality certificate authenticated by the director and a copy of a photograph should be attached to the copy of the certificate also authenticated by the director.*

*The state must honor the documentation issued by previous ministers and recognize previous passports issued by the department however obtained.*

*In the case of persons who only have copies of their nationality certificate but not the original and no previous passports, then further investigation is required. Cabinet has not yet decided how these are to be handled.*

*The ministry is asked to present its recommendation to Cabinet for consideration and approval on these.*

*Regards*

*Godwin Hulse*

*Minister*



**The Nationality Section had a fraudulent practice of issuing “Borrowed Nationality” numbers**

164. In our Passport Rreport we mentioned other persons who had nationality certificate numbers that did not belong to them. Those certificate numbers were recorded in stolen manual Passports that were renewed during the period investigated. Those individuals who had nationality certificates that were not for them are listed at **Table ZF** and Appendices D and D.4 in the Passport report referenced Section III).

164.2 Our examination of a Passport application for Shiou-Ling Jan on which the words, “applicant borrowed Nationality Certificate” were written. The nationality certificate numbered 27988/13 was dated 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2013 but the actual entry in the Number Book was July 9, 2012. In the Register of Citizens by Registration her name and certificate number were inserted between lines since the number was left out and it appeared that the number had been reserved for her.

164.3 We noted in addition to the discrepancy in the Numbers Book with the date on her nationality certificate and the note on her Passport application, a search of her nationality file number 26058/11 also showed irregularities as follows:

- 1) There were two distinct handwritings on her Civic Test
- 2) Her occupation was “Doctor” on her nationality Application; it was “Domestic” on her Passport application.
- 3) On Part III Referees Form that recorded the interview with Referees we observed that the Referees may not have known her. We noted the following:
  - a) Nelson Jiovani Vasquez of #19 St. John Street, San Martin Belmopan stated that he had known the applicant for 3 years and that “I met him while he worked at my friend’s store”.
  - b) Clifford Candido Perez of #15 Mahogany Street stated in his interview that he knew the applicant for 4 1/2 years and that “I met him when I moved to Belmopan.”

The applicant was female; not male but still the interviewing Officer stated that the Referees were genuine.

- 4) Shiou Ling Jan’s date of entry in her ROC Taiwanese Passport could not be verified as the date that she entered the country. Whether she had qualified for Belizean nationality through 5-year residency in Belize.

Her Passport application had already indicated that she had “borrowed” the Nationality certificate number. Her name and certificate number were inserted between two lines that had already had certificate numbers in the Register (Section 10), as the number assigned from the 9<sup>th</sup> July 2012 in the certificate Numbers Book that had been previously omitted in the Register.

- 164.4 We had requested, received and returned her nationality file 26058 for perusal in December 2013 during the Passport investigation. However, when we requested the file on 25<sup>th</sup> February, 2014 for the Nationality investigation it was not presented to us.

**Not all Nationality and Permanent Residence Files requested were presented to us**

165. We had requested the Nationality files for our examination for many persons who we observed with Nationality Certificate and Certificate number irregularities; however, the Department was unable to present them to us for examination. Those persons included those who had not appeared at a Passport office in person to capture their biometrics, those with frequent Passport renewals. Those with copies of nationality certificates that appeared fraudulent and persons who claimed they received Belize nationality by Registration through Economic Investment.

- 165.2 We had to request many files by names or by certificate numbers. No BNA file numbers were recorded in the designated column of the Register of Citizens by Registration and in some cases the certificate numbers that were requested had already been issued to other persons in the register.

- 165.3 We noted, the Ministry’s missing nationality files inventory list of one hundred and sixty four (164) did not include the name, Wonhong Kim, Yakup Sut, Bo-Jie Shau, Maxim Poon Wong and many others whose nationality files were not presented to Audit when requested. Those nationality files that had been in the possession of Arthur Saldivar and allegedly turned over to the Police were also not included on the Ministry’s missing nationality files inventory list. The Ministry’s missing files inventory list is labelled as **Appendix G**.

- 165.4 We could not ascertain the registers, ledgers and/or other documents used by the Ministry to perform the inventory.  
We have listed at **Table ZZL** those files that were requested and were not presented to us for examination.

**Table ZZL**

The following is a list of nationality files that were requested and not presented to us for examination

| <b>Name</b>          | <b>File Number</b>                                | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b>   | <b>Date on Certificate or Date seen in Certificate Numbers Book</b> | <b>Date File Requested</b>                                   |
|----------------------|---|---|---|--|
| Wonhong Kim          | 31986   | 28577/13 (No entry seen in the Register)  | 22-Apr-13 Numbers Book date was 2- Sept-2013                        | 21-November 2013 and again on 25 <sup>th</sup> February 2014 |
| Yakup Sut            | 31973   | 28570/13 (No entry seen in the Register)  | 3-June-2013/ Numbers Book date was 16- Aug-2013                     | February 2014  |
| Maxim Poon Wong      | No entry in Register of Citizens by Registration. | 28417/13 (No entry seen in the Register)  | 30-May-13   | 14-July-2014   |
| Bo-Jie Shau          | 31927/13  | 28461/13 in the name Bo-Jie Shan seen on certificate. (No entry seen in the Register) | 22-May-2013 Numbers Book date was 10-July-2013                      | February 2014  |
| Philip Thomas Kueber | 31790 seen in numbers book                        | 28453/13 (No entry seen in the Register)  | 16-May-13 Numbers Book date was 10-June-2013                        | 19-Jun-14  |
| Charles Francis Noll | 29535 as seen in Numbers Book                     | 28280/12  | 12-Dec-12/30-November- 2012 in Numbers Book                         | 13-Mar-15  |
| Paddy Franks         | Unknown<br>Certificate number was not his         | 22714/12 (was issued to Narciso Canelo as seen in Register)                           | 14-Apr-12/  | 13-Mar-15  |

| <b>Name</b>                                     | <b>File Number</b>   | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b>   | <b>Date on Certificate or Date seen in Certificate Numbers Book</b> | <b>Date File Requested</b> |
|---|--|---|---|----------------------------|
|   |  |   |   |                            |
| Liming Huang                                    | Unknown  | 28424/13 (no entry seen in Register)  | 03-Jun-13   | 13-Mar-15                  |
| John Xu (did not receive John Xu's file #18178) | Certificate number was not his                                   | 18840/05 (File # #18178 and certificate number was for Jian Fu Li in Register)                    | 27-Jun-05   | 03-Apr-14                  |
| Kent Bruce Crane                                | No file #; no date of application seen in Register just his name | 243/87  | 23-Oct-87   | 19-Jun-14                  |
| Bond Kung                                       | No file existed<br>Name not seen in Register                     | 2131/92<br>2131 was for Liao Huang Su E (Section 11A) and for Gumerinda Sandoval (Section 10)     | 10-March-1992<br>(Replacement date 12-January-2009)                 | 19-Jun-14                  |
| Kevin Chu                                       | No file existed<br>Name not seen in Register                     | 2216/94<br>2216 was for Feng-Tien I (Section 11A) and for Hantley Chrisoqanis Pieros (Section 10) | 13/09/1994<br>(Replacement date 17-June-2009)                       | 19-Jun-14                  |
| Steven Andrew Marrs                             | 31763B   | 28440   | 6.6.13  | February 2014              |
| Shida Zhu                                       | 31763A   | 28441   | 6.6.13  | February 2014              |

165.5 Since we did not receive nationality files for those persons listed above and for those listed at **Appendix U** (Nationality and permanent residence files were not presented to Audit), we could not ascertain whether those persons acquired Belizean nationality genuinely, through Section 10 or Section 11 Registration or through Registration by Economic Investment. Those files were requested by names, certificate numbers and nationality file numbers. The files listed at **Appendix U** also include permanent residence files.

**Copies of Birth and Marriage certificates and certificates of translation especially for Chinese nationals were not the required official documents**

Requirement #12 of Section 10, on page 7 of The Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011 titled “Acceptance of Nationality Application Chapter 161 Nationality Act Section 10” requires:

*“Married Certificates issued by the General Registry must be submitted by all married women. For applicants married outside Belize, their marriage certificates must be authenticated by their respective Foreign Service offices”.*

Requirement #6 under Section 11 (Form G) on page 9 of the Manual (Acceptance of Nationality Application requires:

*“.....Only marriage certificates issued by the Vital Statistics Office in Belize City will be accepted. Foreign marriage certificates must be authenticated by the Foreign Service office of the applicant”.*

Procedures 2, 3, 4 and 5 on page 12 of the Manual (Acceptance of Nationality through Descent) titled “Application Procedures” requires:

2. *“All documents submitted by applicant must be original. A certified copy by the Counter Clerk must be retained and the original copy returned after completion of process.*
3. *Documents in any other language must be translated to English. The name, address, and occupation of the translator must be placed on the translated document.*
4. *If any doubt arises as to the authenticity of the document, the relevant Foreign Service Office shall authenticate the document prior to acceptance.*
5. *The birth certificate of applicants must carry the names of both the applicant and the Belizean national through whom the descent is being sought.”*

166. We saw inconsistencies on several foreign birth and marriage certificates in some nationality files that should have warranted further verification by the INS. The Investigation Section, through the prescribed Referral System as it relates to nationality applications for all Chinese nationals and for applications through marriage, should have done further vetting as required. The **Tables** labelled **ZZM and ZZN** respectively below list the marriage and birth certificates that were not authenticated by the Foreign Service Office of those nationality applicants' country.

**Table ZZM**

The following is the list of marriage certificates and the notarial certificates of marriage (translations) that did not appear as official documents and were not authenticated by the Foreign Service office applicants' country

| <b>Applicant</b>  | <b>Spouse as per Marriage Certificate</b> | <b>Date Place of Marriage</b>                                  | <b>Nationality Certificate Number, Date and Minister</b>      | <b>Chinese Certificate Inconsistencies</b>   | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|---|---|--|---|--|---|
| Fengwan Yu<br>Date of birth: 25 <sup>th</sup> August 1979 | Jianrui Lu                                | April 7 <sup>th</sup> 2003 in Taishan City, Guangdong Province | 25697/11 dated 24 <sup>th</sup> November 2011/ Carlos Perdomo | Marriage certificate and translation certificate dated 13 <sup>th</sup> May 2008 did not appear to be official documents as they were not authenticated as required<br>Also seen on file was a copy of Belize original marriage register page for marriage by Hon Israel Alpuche, Senior JP for marriage on 21 <sup>st</sup> October 2011 (1 month before certificate issued). It was not the certificate from the VSU as required | She received P0185789 issued 25 <sup>th</sup> November 2011. Passport application was not presented; In Nationality file British Consulate General Guangzhou Visa stamp, Northern Border stamp, extensions etc appeared bogus on irregular copies of Chinese Passport #G22415147 issued 26 <sup>th</sup> April 2007 |
| Wensi Wu<br>Date of                                       | Guo'ai Su                                 | 15 <sup>th</sup> February                                      | 25817/11 date unknown/  | Marriage certificate and translation certificate dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> April 2008 did not  | Received P0188339 issued 16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011. He   |

| <b>Applicant</b>   | <b>Spouse as per Marriage Certificate</b> | <b>Date Place of Marriage</b>            | <b>Nationality Certificate Number, Date and Minister</b>                                      | <b>Chinese Certificate Inconsistencies</b>   | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|--|---|--|---|--|---|
| birth:16 <sup>th</sup><br>June 1968  |   | 2008 in<br>Taishan<br>City,<br>Guangdong | Carlos<br>Perdomo<br>(Name seen in<br>the Numbers<br>Book but not<br>seen in the<br>Register) | appear to be official documents as<br>they were not authenticated as<br>required   | stated that he was single on<br>Passport application. In<br>Nationality file British<br>Consulate General<br>Guangzhou Visa stamp,<br>Nothern Border stamp,<br>extensions etc appeared<br>bogus on irregular copies of<br>Chinese Passport<br>#G22806964 issued 22 <sup>nd</sup><br>May 2007  |
| Dongsheng<br>Zheng<br>Date of<br>Birth was<br>30 <sup>th</sup><br>December<br>1977 | Li Liying                                 | 15 <sup>th</sup><br>December<br>2007     | 25901/11<br>dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>December<br>2011/ Carlos<br>Perdomo                     | Marriage certificate and translation<br>certificate dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> April 2008 did not<br>appear to be official documents as<br>they were not authenticated as<br>required | Received P0188340 issued<br>16 <sup>th</sup> December 2011. He<br>stated that he was single on<br>Passport application. In<br>Nationality file British<br>Consulate General<br>Guangzhou Visa stamp,<br>Nothern Border stamp etc<br>appeared bogus on irregular<br>copies of Chinese Passport<br>#G22426713 issued 30 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2007 |
| Jade Jade  | Guoqing                                   | 3 <sup>rd</sup> April                    | No evidence   | Marriage certificate and translation   | No evidence of Passport seen  |

| <b>Applicant</b>   | <b>Spouse as per Marriage Certificate</b> | <b>Date Place of Marriage</b>                         | <b>Nationality Certificate Number, Date and Minister</b> | <b>Chinese Certificate Inconsistencies</b>   | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|--|---|---|--|--|---|
| Chen<br><br>Date of birth: 8 <sup>th</sup> June 1970)  | Chen                                      | 1997 in Taishan City, Guangdong                       | of Nationality certificate issued                        | certificate dated 29 <sup>th</sup> August 1999 did not appear to be official documents as they were not authenticated as required  | issued. -Birth certificate was also seen in the Nationality file for Zhenyu Chen and may have been filed in error   |
| Zhenyu Chen<br>(D.O.B 8 <sup>th</sup> October 1970)<br><br>Was the holder of stolen manual Passport #A003514 issued 17 <sup>th</sup> July 2002 | Guoqing Chen                              | 3 <sup>rd</sup> April 1997 in Taishan City, Guangdong | 26219/12 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> January 2012              | Marriage certificate and translation certificate dated 27th April 2004 did not appear as official documents<br><br>(Copy of Belize Original Marriage Register for marriage by Hon Robert Mossiah, Senior JP for marriage on 17 <sup>th</sup> June 2010 at the Belmopan Magistrate Court also seen on file). No certificate seen from VSU as required | Received P0194897 issued 16 <sup>th</sup> March 2012. Extension and temporary employment stamps seen in irregular copies of Chinese Passport #G11324361 issued 11 <sup>th</sup> August 2004 |
| Geetu Chaudhary  | Avnesh Chaudhary                          | 11 <sup>th</sup> October 2011 in Salub,               | 28338/13 dated 24 <sup>th</sup>                          | Marriage certificate (date not clear) did not appear as official document as it was not authenticated as required.   | See Report(paragraph <b>81</b> ) above for further findings; P0240077 issued 26 <sup>th</sup> June  |



| <b>Applicant</b>                          | <b>Spouse as per Marriage Certificate</b> | <b>Date Place of Marriage</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number, Date and Minister</b> | <b>Chinese Certificate Inconsistencies</b>  | <b>Other Observations</b> |
|---|---|-------------------------------|--|---|---------------------------|
| Date of birth:15 <sup>th</sup> April 1982 |   | Punjab India                  | April 2013   | (Name of bride on certificate was also Geetu Chaudhary; not her maiden name Verma | 2013                      |

- 166.2 We saw recorded on the Minute Sheet of Congzhi Wu's nationality file #26463/11 that he had presented a native marriage certificate to the Nationality Section. However, it was not accepted and was advised to "bring marriage certificate from the Registry in Belize City". We saw on his file a copy of the original marriage Register of his marriage to Hong Ping Chen. The marriage occurred on the 20<sup>th</sup> October 2010 and was performed by the Deputy Registrar General at the General Registry. That copy was not from the VSU as required by the Policy.
- 166.3 We saw that Congzhi Wu was given nationality through Marriage (Section 11), via nationality certificate number 25819/11 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2011. The minister had also requested his nationality file for processing as seen recorded on the 29<sup>th</sup> November 2011 on his Minute Sheet by OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. Copies of his irregular Chinese Passport #G24425203 issued 14<sup>th</sup> August 2007 also had what appeared as a bogus British Consulate General Guangzhou Visa stamp, Belize Northern Border stamp for entry date on 10<sup>th</sup> December 2007, visa extension and temporary employment permit stamps that appeared as copied from another Passport as the stamps were very faded. His Passport application was presented on the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011 on which he indicated that he was single. He received his Belizean Passport # P0188341 on the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011.
- 166.4 Further investigation is required to verify his stated date of entry of 10<sup>th</sup> December 2007 into Belize.

**Table ZZN**

The following is a list of birth certificates and the notarial certificates of birth (translations) that appeared bogus

| <b>Applicant</b> | <b>Mother/Father as per Birth Certificate</b> | <b>Place and Date of Birth</b>                          | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and date Minister or Director who signed</b>        | <b>Birth Certificate Inconsistencies</b>  | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|------------------|---|---|---|---|---|
| Caylah Yang      | Ming-Lun Hsieh & Li Ui Yang                   | Phuket, Bangkok on 13 <sup>th</sup> November 2007,      | #1684/1/12 Vol IV (53) dated 24 <sup>th</sup> April 2012. Signed by Miss Ruth Meighan | Father's name was recorded as Li Wei Yang on descent application  | P0204202 issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2012<br>(Circumstances may have been the same with sister Chloe Yang as seen on letter from Cherie Nisbet, Charge' d' Affaires, Embassy of Belize in Taiwan to Gordon Wade, OIC, Nationality Section Ref: EBRC/M/08/E/03-12 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> March 2012 |
| Honghui Lu       | Fengwan Yu & Jianrui Lu                       | Taishan City, Guangdong on 17 <sup>th</sup> August 2004 | 25697.1/11 added on the 5 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 by Minister Carlos Perdomo       | Native Birth certificate & Notarial Birth certificate translation dated 17 <sup>th</sup> February 2011 did not appeared | He was issued a temporary Passport #T0000387 on the 6 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 & Belize expedited Passport  |

| <b>Applicant</b>  | <b>Mother/Father as per Birth Certificate</b>   | <b>Place and Date of Birth</b>   | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and date Minister or Director who signed</b>      | <b>Birth Certificate Inconsistencies</b>  | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|---|---|--|---|---|---|
|   |   |  |   | to be official documents  | #P0193942 on the 9 <sup>th</sup> March 2012 authorized by former Director Ruth Meighan but the expedited fee was not paid   |
| Ali Harmouch  | Father: Abdul Rahman Harmouch   | Lebanon on 18 <sup>th</sup> May 2011   | 26364.1/12 date of child addition was not copied. Signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo | Translation of child's birth record did not appear to be an official document   | No evidence of Passport issued to Ali Harmouch (DOB 18.5.11) prior to October 2013. Visa was issued to child by Honorary Consul of Belize in Lebanon (Khodrr Harmouch) on <b>18<sup>th</sup> October 2012</b> |
| Mengzhe Li (name was changed to Andu Li' on the 27 <sup>th</sup> August 2001) Re: Nationality certificate | Song Xiao Li (name changed to George Li on the 27 <sup>th</sup> August 2001) Re: Nationality certificate #14382/01 which was dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2001 and signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels but name | Beijing City, Beijing Province on June 13 <sup>th</sup> 1995 & on August 19 <sup>th</sup> 1995 (Both dates were on birth | 14383.1/01 dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2001. Signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels     | Translation of child's birth record was not certified by Foreign Service Office of applicant's country and had conflicting dates of birth | Nationality file for family had bogus referees, Therese Cabral and Robert Hulse as outlined earlier and father Song Xiao Li was issued unaccounted for manual Passport (See Passport                          |

| <b>Applicant</b>   | <b>Mother/Father as per Birth Certificate</b>   | <b>Place and Date of Birth</b>       | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and date Minister or Director who signed</b> | <b>Birth Certificate Inconsistencies</b>   | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|--|---|--------------------------------------|--|--|---|
| #14383.1/01 which was dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2001 and signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels but name amended on the 27 <sup>th</sup> August 2001 by Immigration Officer, Horace Guzman | amended on the 27 <sup>th</sup> August 2001 by Immigration Officer, Horace Guzman & Hui Li (name changed to Regina Liu on the 27 <sup>th</sup> August 2001) (Re: Nationality certificate #14383/01 which was dated 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2001 and signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels but name amended on the 27 <sup>th</sup> August 2001 by Immigration Officer, Horace Guzman | certificate)                         |  |  | Report at paragraph)  |
| Cuiyue Wu  | Li Hua Wu & Huazhen Xiao  | China on 19 <sup>th</sup> April 1985 | 16603.1/02 dated 31 <sup>st</sup> May 2002 signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels  | Translation of child's birth record was not certified by Foreign Service Office of applicant | Nationality file for family had bogus referees Therese Cabral and Robert Hulse as outlined earlier and parent Li Hua Wu was identified as a Human |

| <b>Applicant</b> | <b>Mother/Father as per Birth Certificate</b> | <b>Place and Date of Birth</b>          | <b>Nationality Certificate Number and date Minister or Director who signed</b> | <b>Birth Certificate Inconsistencies</b>   | <b>Other Observations</b>   |
|------------------|---|---|--|--|---|
|                  |   |   |  |  | Trafficker (See Passport Report at paragraph)   |
| Chen Lan         | Li Hua Wu & Huazhen Xiao                      | China on 14 <sup>th</sup> February 1986 | 16603.2/02 dated 31 <sup>st</sup> May 2002 signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels  | Translation of child's birth record was not certified by Foreign Service Office of applicant | Nationality file for family had bogus Referees Therese Cabral and Robert Hulse as outlined earlier and parent Li Hua Wu was identified as a Human Trafficker (See Passport Report at paragraph) |

Requirement # 5 on pages 12 of the Policy and Procedures Manual July 1 2011 for Acceptance of Nationality application through descent titled Application Procedures requires:

*“The Birth certificate of applicants must carry the names of both the applicant and the Belizean national through whom the descent is being sought.....”*

166.5 We saw that the copy of Caylah Yang’s native Thailand birth certificate stated that her father’s name was Li Ui Yang while her nationality by Descent application and the copy of her father’s previous manual Passport #0229917; issued 6<sup>th</sup> August 2001 stated that his name was Li Wei Yang. We did not see any authentication to verify that he was the same person.

Requirement # 4 of the Policy and Procedures Manual for nationality by descent states

*“if any doubt arises as to the authenticity of the document, the relevant Foreign Service Office shall authenticate the document prior to acceptance”.*

166.6 We noted that Caylah Yang’s Belizean Passport #P0204202 issued on the 7<sup>th</sup> June 2012 and sister Chloe Yang (#P0204203 issued on the 7<sup>th</sup> June 2012) both received nationality by descent was picked up by Eric Chang but a copy of a written authority was not seen. Both applied together for their Passports as seen on a letter from Cherie Nisbet, Charge’ d’ Affaires, Embassy of Belize in Taiwan to Gordon Wade, OIC, Nationality Section Ref: EBRC/M/08/E/03-12 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2012.

**No copies of their children’s birth certificate were seen in the Nationality file of Lee Yi Lung and Shuming Chen aka Sumi Chen**

167. We examined nationality file #26123/11 for a Taiwanese family, Lee Yi Lung date of birth 5<sup>th</sup> January 1956 (Businessman of Belize Agriculture Company Ltd) and Shuming Chen aka Sumi Chen date of birth 5<sup>th</sup> February 1961. We saw that there were no copies of the birth certificates for their children Ting Chun Lee and Ni-Yen Lee who had received Belizean nationality with their parents. Shuming Chen and Lee Yi Lung received Belizean nationality vide certificate #25424/11 signed by Minister Carlos Perdomo dated 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2011. The children received their Belizean nationality numbers 25424.1 (Ni-Yen Lee aka Annie Lee) and 25424.2 (Ting-Chun Lee aka Kevin Lee) through their mother, Shu-Ming Chen aka Sumi Chen.

167.2 We noted that in addition to the absence of the copies of birth certificates, there were no copies of deed polls to ascertain what their original names were. The names changed were seen on their nationality certificates. Additionally, there was no entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration for the certificate numbers issued to the family.

The copies of the adults' Civic Tests showed that they may have not been completed by the applicants as both forms appeared with the same handwriting in different colour ink (blue and black). The family's Belize address was stated as 3 Miles Northern Highway on their nationality certificates while their Passport applications dated 8<sup>th</sup> November 2011 stated their address as 2 ½ Miles Northern Highway. We noted that their nationality applications were received on the 28<sup>th</sup> July 2011, the same day the interviews were done by OIC, Nationality Section, Mr. Gordon Wade. Both of referees Teodulo Ho of Roaring Creek and Simon Garcia of Santa Elena Town, stated that they knew the applicants for five (5) years "through a friend". We noted that the family's nationality file was requested for processing by Minister Carlos Perdomo, who signed their nationality certificates.

167.3 We noted that copies of Lee Yi Lung and Shuming Chen's Belize visa and the PGIA entry stamps on the copies of their native Passports appeared faded and as though copied from another document. Those visas and stamps indicated their entry dates into Belize as the 10<sup>th</sup> May 2006. No copy of oath of allegiance was seen in their nationality file.

167.4 Further investigation is required to verify their dates of entry into Belize to ascertain whether they were qualified for Belizean nationality.

167.5 We observed that both parents did not present copies of their native birth certificates or a copy of any form of Belize or Taiwanese identification when they applied for their Passports. Shu Ming Chen was issued Belizean Passport #P0184232 and Yi-Lung Lee received Passport #P0184233 on the 8<sup>th</sup> November 2011. Ni-Yen Lee and Ting Chun Lee received their Belizean Passports #P0241057 and #P0241058 on the 8<sup>th</sup> July 2013.

#### **Files were needed for verification due to discrepancies noted while conducting the Passport Investigation**

**i) Concepcion Vidal – File number 11385 – nationality certificate number 10154/99**

168. We reported in our Passport report referenced Section III) at paragraph 73, that we had noted a very irregular Passport application and processing that showed a total disregard for the Passport regulations. This Passport application was submitted on 15<sup>th</sup> December 2011 by an applicant Concepcion Vidal, a Guatemalan, with date of birth 6<sup>th</sup> October 1979. There was no nationality certificate number and date of issue recorded at Section 3 of her application form. When the BPIS was checked we found that nationality certificate number 10154/99 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 1995 was used for the electronic application. We did verification of said certificate number to the Nationality Register and found that certificate 10154/99 was dated 3<sup>rd</sup> September, 1999 and was issued to Concepcion Gregorio with no children included and her file number was 11385.



168.2 We saw a copy of US Permanent Residence card # C1USA058393014 in the name Vidal Concepcion was attached to her Passport application. The US Permanent Residence card was not completely legible and appeared bogus.

We requested her file but it was not presented to us.

ii) **Lihua Wu (Li Hua Wu) – Internationally identified Human Smuggler – nationality certificate number 16602/02**

169. We reported in our Passport report at paragraph 52 that Li Hua Wu, born in China on the 4<sup>th</sup> August 1953, had been identified internationally as a human smuggler. That finding was expounded on in our Passport Report) and was linked to several stolen Belize manual Passports in 2005. We requested his nationality file 17289/02 and saw that he and his alleged family members (there were unofficial copies of marriage certificates and birth certificates not certified by the Foreign Service Office of their native country) received Belizean nationality via certificates signed by former Minister of Immigration Maxwell Samuels as follows:

Li Hua Wu: Nationality certificate # 16602/02 dated 31<sup>st</sup> May 2002

Huazhen Xiao (wife): Nationality certificate # 16603/02 dated 31<sup>st</sup> May 2002

Cuiyue Wu (daughter): Nationality certificate # 16603/.1/02 dated 31<sup>st</sup> May 2002

Lan Chen (son): Nationality certificate # 16603/.2/02 dated 31<sup>st</sup> May 2002

169.2 We also saw that their nationality files had bogus referees, Therese Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse, whose voter's identification cards were copied and their signatures appeared forged on the Nationality referee form and (on several Referral forms seen in nationality files for that period.

169.3 We found a copy of a Permanent Residence Permit Card #22194/97 issued on the 2<sup>nd</sup> May 1997 in the name of Lihua Wu. On the permit card had his arrival date in Belize as 3<sup>rd</sup> April 1997, which was not the required time of one year for him to have qualified for Belize permanent residency status. The copy of that permit card #22194/97 had what appeared to be the signature of a former Director, Merlene Bailey Martinez.

iii) **Muhammad Zaghlool – Alleged Major Human Smuggler of Pakistani Indian and Nepalese nationals – Nationality certificate number 23919/10**

| 170. We had reported in our Passport report that Muhammad Zaghlool, born in Pakistan on the 12<sup>th</sup> October 1980 was allegedly identified as a human smuggler of Indian and Pakistani nationals and was refused leave to land in Mexico on the 1<sup>st</sup> April 2014.

He received Belize Nationality through marriage to Claudia Jimenez on the 30<sup>th</sup> September 2008 at the Islamic Mission in the Belize District.

170.2 We found two Pakistan Passports in the name Muhammad Zaghlool in his nationality file number 25404, that is, Passport # AB5946431 issued 8-April-2006 which expired 7-April-2011 and #A095886 issued 16-June-2009.

170.3 We noted that Pakistan Passport number AB5946431, which had the Passport number A2059254 printed on its pages, had the following visas:

Consulate of Belize in Singapore issued visa: 2-April-2008 to 1-July-2008

He entered Belize on 19-June-2008 and got until 15-July-2008 to leave. The stamp was not clear to identify the Port of entry.

Belize issued Visas: 11-July-2008 to 11-Aug-2008, 11-Aug-2008 to 11-Sept-2008; Belize Visitor's Permit stamp: 19-June-2009 to 3-Sept-2009,

He got a temporary employment (the 1<sup>st</sup> was a visitor's permit) permit # 386/ Bze/08 on 3-Sept-2009 to work with Khasaj International Ltd as an Administrative Manager

He departed Belize through the BNBS on 17<sup>th</sup> April, 2009. There was also another stamp from the BNBS dated 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2009 but it was not clear. Another BNBS visa stamp which had the date 4-April-2009 to 3-Sept-2009 was also seen.

170.4 He had visas from other countries as follows:

Republic of Singapore Visa (with his picture): 24-April-2008 to 29-May-2008

Kingdom of Thailand: Visa Stamp dated 19-Feb-2008 giving permission to enter before 18-May-2008

Bahamas: 16-June-2008 to 16-Sept-2008

Singapore: 27-Feb-2008 to 2-April-2008

170.5 We observed that those visas indicated that he may not have been resident in Belize for one year after he first entered Belize. The Recommendation on the 22<sup>nd</sup> July 2010 to the Director by an officer whose signature could not be determined stated that Muhammad Zaghlool had permanent residence in the country but no evidence was seen from copies of his native Passport examined.

170.6 We noted that his BNA file indicated that he entered Belize on 19<sup>th</sup> June 2008 and by the 30<sup>th</sup> September 2008 he was married to Belizean, Claudia Jimenez. His file should have been further vetted through the Referral System by the Investigation Section to authenticate the marriage but no such evidence was seen.

170.7 We saw that Referee, Marcelino Cano of 1743 Coney Drive, Belize City stated in the interview that he knew the applicant for nine (9) years as his neighbour and Referee, Oswaldo Acosta of #31 Bella Visa, Belize City stated that he knew the applicant for eight (8) years through his wife. The Referee form was incomplete as they did not state what they knew about the character of the applicant and did not make General Comments on whether they thought that the applicant should have been granted Belize nationality. If the applicant first arrived in Belize on the 19<sup>th</sup> June 2008, the Referees could not have known the applicant for more than one (1) year and seven (7) months on the 20<sup>th</sup> January 2010, the date when the interview was done by Nationality Clerk, Gertrude Armstrong. Ms. Armstrong was not the Supervisor of the Nationality Section who should have done the interview.

170.8 We noted that security clearance was requested on the 19<sup>th</sup> January 2010 on the applicant and referees from the Special Branch by Nationality Clerk, C. Gillett and security clearance was given by the Head, Special Branch through letter dated the 29<sup>th</sup> March 2010. The Security Clearance letter was signed by an illegible signature for Noel M. Leal (Sr. Superintendent) Head Special Branch. Security clearance was done on the Referees although it was obvious that they did not know the applicant for eight and nine years respectively as was stated.

170.9 The handwriting and signature seen on his nationality application, Police Report and native Passports in his nationality file did not match the handwriting and signature seen on the Civic Test in his file.

Muhammad Zaghlool was issued his Belizean nationality certificate number 23919/10 on the 10<sup>th</sup> August 2010, which was signed by Minister, Carlos Perdomo.

iv) **Yicai Zhu (aka Frank Zhu) nationality certificate number 15305/01 dated 18<sup>th</sup> December 2001**

171. We noted during our Passport investigation (see our Passport report paragraph **41**), that a Passport application dated 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2012 was presented for one Yicai Zhu for renewal of Passport A009197 issued 19<sup>th</sup> December 2001. Also attached to the application was a copy of the bio data page of another Passport A005707 in the name Frank Zhu with date of birth **26<sup>th</sup> January 1968** and expiration dates 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2004 and 22<sup>nd</sup> July 2014 respectively. Although the Passport was in the name Frank Zhu the photograph resembled Yicai Zhu's BPIS photograph of his new Passport P0194654 issued 14<sup>th</sup> March 2012. The BPIS picture of Yicai Zhu appeared to be a picture of a picture. Passport A005707 was from the series that was recorded in the Jumbo Passport Issue Register as issued by Miss Laura Munoz with no signature of the recipient. The series A005701 to A005725 was issued to Geneva, a Mission that never issued Passports (Re interview Audit Officers/Ministry of Foreign Affairs on 5<sup>th</sup> June, 2014).

Passport P009197 was from series A009126 to A009200 which was unaccounted for in the Jumbo Issue Register. (See our Passport report paragraphs **41** for more details of this case)

- 171.2 We examined nationality file number 16394 which had a BNA application for Yicai Zhu, born in China on the **27<sup>th</sup> March 1964** on which he listed his wife's name as Xueqin Wu, born in China on the 16<sup>th</sup> September 1965 and two children, Jun Zhu and Yuan Zhu.
- 171.3 We saw that the family's nationality referees were bogus as an unclear copy of the Voter's identification cards for Therese Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse was seen in the file. The signatures of those referees on the form did not match their signatures on the ID. Those copies of identification were used in many other nationality files we saw for the period 2001 and 2002.
- 171.4 We saw a Belize visa stamp dated 17<sup>th</sup> February 1995 issued at the PGIA on a copy of Yicai Zhu's native Chinese Passport number 148373903; issued 3<sup>rd</sup> December 1994. A Belize arrival stamp for the PGIA dated the 6<sup>th</sup> March 1995 was also seen on the copy of his Passport. We could not ascertain how his native Chinese Passport got to Belize for a stamp before he arrived three (3) weeks later as his native Passport indicated.
- 171.5 We also saw a copy of Permanent Residence card number 19405 dated 4<sup>th</sup> April 1995 issued to Yicai Zhu. His date of entry into Belize as recorded on the card was the 6<sup>th</sup> March 1995. The card had what appeared as the signature of former INS Director, Mrs. Merlene Bailey Martinez. We observed that Yicai Zhu was not resident in Belize for one year to have qualified for Permanent Residence.
- 171.6 We noted that Yicai Zhu was issued nationality certificate number 15305/01 dated 18<sup>th</sup> December 2001 signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels. This certificate was replaced by former Director, Ruth Meighan, on the 9<sup>th</sup> March 2012 although Yicai Zhu BPIS photo on his new Belizean Passport number P0194645 issued 14<sup>th</sup> March 2012, appeared as a photo of a photo. This indicated that he may not have been in Belize in March 2012 to have applied for a replacement nationality certificate.
- 171.7 We saw that certificate number 15305/01 dated 18<sup>th</sup> December 2001 was in the Register as issued to Yicai Zhu but his nationality file number recorded in the Register was 16391 and not 16394.
- 171.8 We noted that his wife, Xueqin Zhu was issued Belizean nationality certificate number 15306/01 dated 18<sup>th</sup> December 2001. On that certificate her children Yuan Zhu and Jun Zhu were also listed for certificate number 15306.1/01 and 15306.2/01 respectively. Her certificate was signed by Minister Maxwell Samuels. However, a Passport application was submitted in the name Xueqin Xu on the 1<sup>st</sup> December 2011 for the renewal of manual Passport number A009196 issued on the 19<sup>th</sup> December 2001 to Xueqin Wu (She had 3 different surnames: Zhu, Xu and Wu).

The Passport series A009126-A009200 was unaccounted for in the Jumbo Passport Issue Register. The BPIS showed that a picture of a picture was in the system and not a live photograph for Xueqin Zhu.

171.9 We saw the name Xueqin Zhu in the Register for certificate number 15306/01 dated 18<sup>th</sup> December 2001. Passport P0187139 was issued 6<sup>th</sup> December 2011 in the name Xueqin Wu but no one signed as having received said Passport.

v) **Xiaoli Tang Xiaoli Ke Nationality certificate numbers 17019/02 dated 11<sup>th</sup> July 2002 and 18712/05 dated 9<sup>th</sup> September 2005**

172. We saw that Xiao Li Tang was the holder of a manual Passport number A006285 issued on 22<sup>nd</sup> July 2002 in the name Xiaoli-Tang Ke in Belize City, which had the signature of former Director, Paulino Castellanos. That was before she applied for her Belizean nationality in 2005. She was also the holder of Belizean manual Passport number 0257999 issued 16<sup>th</sup> July 2002 in the name Xiaoli Tang, which was cancelled on the 22<sup>nd</sup> July 2002. Both manual Passports had the certificate number 17019/02 dated 11<sup>th</sup> July 2002 recorded in them.

172.2 We examined the Register of citizens by Registration and it showed that certificate number 17019/02 was issued to Lia Oli Tang whose file number was 17597.

172.3 We also saw that Belizean machine readable Passports were issued to Xiaoli Tang Ke, who used certificate number 18712/05 dated 9<sup>th</sup> September 2005. A search of the Register of Citizens by Registration showed that certificate number 18712/05 was issued to Xiaoli Ke, and her file number was 19769.

172.4 We reviewed her nationality file number 19769 and saw that Xiaoli Tang Ke, born in China on the 8<sup>th</sup> August 1980, applied for Belizean nationality through marriage on the 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2004. We saw in her nationality file a copy of Chinese pp#G00597046 issued 28<sup>th</sup> December 2000, which had a Belmopan issued visa dated 31<sup>st</sup> Jan 2001 and a Re-entry Visa dated 22<sup>nd</sup> Sept 2003, both for entry through the PGIA. Her date of entry into Belize was stated on her nationality application as March 12<sup>th</sup> 2001. She could not have been a genuine holder of Belizean Passport numbers A006285 and 0257999 since those were issued in 2002 and she applied for Belizean nationality in 2004. Her affidavit in support of her nationality application was sworn before Lee Mark Chang, JP. The Referees section of application was incomplete.

vi) **Samia and Imad Khaled – Nationality certificate numbers 2867/93 and 2868/93**

173. We reported in our Passport report paragraph **28.6** nationality certificate numbers 2867/93 and 2868/93 dated 20<sup>th</sup> May 1993 in the names of Samia and Imad Khaled 2868/93 were issued to Maria Candelaria Miranda and Beatriz Edisa Cima respectively on 21<sup>st</sup> April 1992.

We requested on the 11<sup>th</sup> June 2014, the file for Samia and Imad Khaled but their was not presented to us.

vii) **Nina Sha and Zhaoyi Sha nationality certificate 16677/02 & 16677.1/02**

174. No Nationality file was presented for Nina and Zhaoyi Sha. Their files were requested on the 8-May-2014 (No file exists for them as File # 16869 in the Register was for Jamil Chinapen)

viii) **Lai Kai Wen nationality certificate number 5595/95 dated 7<sup>th</sup> August 1985**

175. BNA file numbers 7878 for Fan Yu Cheng and 7434 for Liang Li Ji, which both had certificate number **5595/95**, were requested on the 19-June-2014. None of those nationality files were presented to us.

ix) **Jianke Tan nationality certificate 16805/02 dated 28<sup>th</sup> June 2002**

176. Neither name nor file number for Jianke Tan was recorded in the Register (Section 10). Jianke Tan's nationality file was requested on the 19-June-2014. His nationality file was not presented to us.

x) **Huyuan Dai nationality certificate number 13751/01 dated 6th April 2001**

177. His name and file number was not recorded in the Register (Section 10). Huyuan Dai's nationality file was requested on the 19-June-2014. His nationality file was not presented to us.

xi) **Shih Tsai Huang (Huang Shih Tsai) nationality certificate number 2493/92 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> March 1992**

178. No file number was recorded in the Register. Shih Tsai Huang (Huang Shih Tsai) nationality file was requested on the 19-June-2014. His nationality file was not presented to us.

xii) **Yang Lin Mei plus 4 children (Chuang Hui Yang applied for renewal of his Passport) nationality certificate number 2028/91 dated 28<sup>th</sup> November 1991**

179. No Nationality file for Yang Lin Mei was presented to us however, we saw the name Yang Lin Mei recorded in the Register of Citizens by Registration but no nationality file number was seen. Yang Lin Mei's nationality file was requested on the 19-June-2014.

xiii) **Antonio Oburu Ondo nationality certificate number 18989/05 dated 12<sup>th</sup> December 2005**

180. We did not see Antonio Oburu Ondo's name or a nationality file number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His file using his name was requested on the 19-June-2014. His nationality file was not presented to us.

xiv) **Li Li Zhang Wang nationality certificate number 2640/93 dated 5<sup>th</sup> February 1993**

181. Li Li Zhang Wang's name was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration but no file number was recorded. We requested her file on the 20-March-2014, but it was not presented to us.

xv) **Yuan Hui Hung Cheng nationality certificate number 2470/92 dated 28<sup>th</sup> September 1992**

182. The name Cheng Yuan Hui was seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration but no file number was recorded. His file was requested on the 19-June-2014, but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xvi) **Jianjun Chen nationality certificate number 115/2/01 dated 29<sup>th</sup> November 2001**

183. No entry was seen in the Register for the series 115/2/01. His nationality file was requested on the 11-June-2014 but it was not presented to us.

xvii) **Anwar Rabie nationality certificate number 78/01/01 dated 6<sup>th</sup> September 2001**

184. We did not see certificate number 78/01/01 recorded in any register. We requested Anwar Rabie's nationality file on the 19-June-2014, but it was not presented to us.

xviii) **James Wang nationality certificate number 2022/94 dated 13<sup>th</sup> May 1994**

185. We saw in the Register of Citizens by Registration that certificate #2022 was for Jose Osmin Peres under Section 10 and for Elena Mentov under section 11 A. We requested James Wang's nationality file on the 10-June-2014 using his name, but it was not presented to us.

xix) **Bond Kung nationality certificate number 2131/92 dated 10<sup>th</sup> March 1992**

186. We saw in the Register of Citizens by Registration that certificate number 2131 had been issued to Gumeriendo Sandoval under section 10 and Luo Zhong Gu under section 11A. We requested Bond Kung's nationality file on the 19-June-2014 but it was not presented to us.

xx) **Steven Cheng nationality certificate number 3012/95 dated 4<sup>th</sup> July 1995**

187. We saw in the Register of Citizens by Registration that certificate #3012 had been issued to Yeh, Hui-Yen (James Yeh) under Section 10 on 5-June-1992 (BNA file # 4301). We did not see any entry under Section 11A for certificate number 3012. Steven Cheng's nationality file was requested in June-2014 but his file was not presented to us.

xxi) **Kevin Chu nationality certificate number 2216/94 dated 13<sup>th</sup> September 1994**

188. We saw in the Register for Citizens by Registration that certificate #2216 was for Hantley Chrisoqanis Pieros under Section 10 and was dated 10-June-1991 and for Feng Tien-I under Section 11A dated 27-April-1992. We requested Kevin Chu's nationality file in June-2014 but his file was not presented to us..

xxii) **Demi Ho nationality certificate number 2362/92 dated 16<sup>th</sup> June 1992**

189. We saw in the Register of Citizens by Registration that certificate 2362/92 was for Eddna Iliana Aldana Guerra under Section 10 and was dated 7-Oct-1991 while under Section 11A it was for Lina Abdalla Al Atrash and was dated 26-June-1992. We requested Demi Ho's nationality file in February 2014 but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxiii) **Bingquan Huang nationality certificate number 21/02/2000 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2000**

190. We did not see certificate number 21/02/2000 in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We requested Bingquan Huang's nationality file on the 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014, but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxiv) **Canying He nationality certificate number 18272/04 dated 16<sup>th</sup> July 2011**

191. We saw in the Register of Citizens by Registration that certificate number 18272 was for Zhong Ghu He (file 19593). We requested Canying He's nationality file on 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxv) **Nader Ibrahim Mohamed Hassan Awwad nationality certificate number 2485/92 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> October 1992**

192. We did not see certificate number 2485/92 in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We requested **Nader Ibrahim Mohamed Hassan Awwad's** nationality file on the 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 using his name) but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxvi) **Yong Guang Lin nationality certificate number 15656.2/02 dated 7<sup>th</sup> February 2002 file #16656 issued in the name Jing Yun Lin plus 3 children including the name Yong Guang Lin**

193. We saw Jing Yun Lin's name (with no children) in the Register of Citizens by Registration although certificate 15656/02 had three (3) children included thereon. Her file was requested on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 but her nationality file was not presented to us.



xxvii) **Roberto Wiyi Yang nationality certificate number 5170/94 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> November 1994**

194. We did not see Roberto Wiyi Yang's name in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We requested his file on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 using his name but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxviii) **Jianmin Xu nationality certificate number 17596/04 dated 27<sup>th</sup> July 2004**

195. Jianmin Xu's name was not seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We requested his file on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxix) **Bruce Liu (formerly Ching-Hua Liu) nationality certificate number 761/89 dated 6<sup>th</sup> March 1989**

196. We saw the name Liu Ching-Hua in the Register of Citizens by Registration; however no file number was recorded. We requested his file on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 and certificate number but his nationality file was not presented to us.

xxx) **Shu Jung Chiu Liu nationality certificate number 762/89 dated 6<sup>th</sup> March 1989**

197. We saw the name Liu Chiu Shu Jung in the Register of Citizens by Registration but no file number was recorded. We requested her file on February 25, 2014 and on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 and certificate number but her nationality file was not presented to us.

xxxi) **I Wei Liu nationality certificate number 762/89 dated 6<sup>th</sup> March 1989**

198. We saw the name of **I Wei Liu's** mothers name Liu Chiu Shu Jung (and two children included) in the Register of Citizens of Registration but no file number was recorded. **I Wei Liu's** file was requested on February 25, 2014 and on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 and certificate number but her nationality file was not presented to us.

xxxii) **I Hsuan Liu nationality certificate number 762/89 dated 6<sup>th</sup> March 1989**

xxxii) **I Ting Liu nationality by Descent certificate number 1684/1/96 Vol V (18) dated 8<sup>th</sup> July 1996**

199. We requested I Ting Liu's nationality file on 25<sup>th</sup> February, 2014 and on 19<sup>th</sup> June, 2014 but it was not presented to us.

xxxiii) **Jian Xing Chen nationality certificate number 8652/98 dated 7<sup>th</sup> July 1998**

200. We requested Jian Xing Chen's nationality file number 9354 on 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

xxxiv) **Yongge Dai nationality certificate number 99/3/99 dated 12<sup>th</sup> January 1999**

201. We did not see certificate number 99/3/99 in any of the Registers for Citizens by Registration. Yongge Dai's file was requested on 11<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

xxxv) **Xiaobo Ji nationality certificate number 041/3/00 dated 24<sup>th</sup> August 2000**

202. We did not see certificate number 041/3/00 in any of Registers for Citizens by Registration. Xiaobo Ji's file was requested 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

xxxvi) **Chuang Sheng Rong nationality certificate number 20477/07 dated 16<sup>th</sup> January 2007**

203. We requested Chuang Sheng Rong's file number 21139 on the 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

xxxvii) **Liang Zhang nationality certificate number 17450/03 dated 8<sup>th</sup> February 2003**

204. We did not see Liang Zhang's name in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His file was requested on the 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

xxxviii) **Jing Zhang Huang nationality certificate number 2607/92 dated 29<sup>th</sup> December 1992**

205. We saw the name Huang Zhang Jing (one child included) under Section 11A in the Register of Citizens by Registration however no file number was recorded. Her file was requested on 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 using her name but it was not presented to us.

xxxix) **Zizhen Niu nationality certificate number 15762/02 dated 26<sup>th</sup> February 2002**

206. We did not see Zizhen Niu's name in the Register of Citizens by registration. Her file was requested 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014 me but it was not presented to us.

xl) **David So nationality certificate numbers 20185/01 dated 25<sup>th</sup> July, 2001 and 17688/05 dated 14<sup>th</sup> February 2005**

207. David So was the holder of stolen and fraudulently issued Belize Passports (see Passport report at paragraph 24).

Certificate 20185/01 dated 25<sup>th</sup> July, 2001 was for Romulo Angel Aleman while Certificate 17688/05 was for Augusto Godoy (nationality file #16287) as seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration. We requested David So's nationality file on 19-June-2014 but it was not presented to us.

xli) **Yanzhu Zhao nationality certificate numbers 11301/02 dated 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2002 and 21657/07 dated 30<sup>th</sup> November 2007**

208. Yanzhu Zhao was the holder of stolen Belizean manual Passport number A003942 issued 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2002, which showed certificate number 11301/02 recorded in it. The Register of Citizens by Registration showed that certificate number 11301/02 had been issued to Jorge Alberto Aguilar (File number 12546).

We noted that she was also issued nationality certificate 21657/07 on 30<sup>th</sup> November 2007 for which there was no entry in the Register of Citizens by Registration.

We requested Yanzhu Zhao nationality file on 11<sup>th</sup> June 2014 but it was not presented to us.

209. There were other persons, outlined or listed in our Passport Report and its Appendices, whose nationality files were requested for examination but they were not presented to us. Details of those persons can be seen at **Appendix U**.

#### **Many Belizeans got their Nationality certificates signed prior to the 2012 General Elections**

210. We were provided a spreadsheet by the OIC Nationality Section of persons who received Belizean nationality prior to the 2012 Municipal and General Elections. The list had two thousand one hundred and ten (2,110) names. However, we were unable to request and examine all of those Nationality files to confirm whether those persons met all the requirements for Belizean Nationality under the Nationality Act Chapter 161. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether those persons met all the requirements for Belizean nationality.

#### **Nationality certificates were prepared and given a number before they were signed and in some cases before the persons came to Belize**

211. We observed instances where Minister Elvin Penner inserted dates on nationality certificates that did not match those dates that were entered in the INS Numbers book and in some cases it was before the individuals had entered the country if they had entered any at all. We requested the the Nationality files for those individuals; however the Immigration personnel did not locate most of the files.

211.2 Nationality certificate numbers should be issued sequentially. No numbers should be reserved for persons for future issuance or no certificates should be back-dated to make them appear as though they had been issued in the past, as we saw was the case with Wonhong Kim. Certificate numbers may have been reserved for persons who would later come to Belize for the first time.

211.3 As stated before in this report, it appeared that there was a program ongoing through which the personnel from the Nationality Section were made aware of the names of persons who would travel to Belize to fraudulently receive their nationality certificates and Passports.

211.4 We saw some cases as can be seen at **Table ZZO** below that nationality certificates had already been prepared but the persons may not have received their Belize Passports, or may have changed their names before their Passports were issued in order to remove the audit trail.

Further investigation is required to ascertain the dates of their entry into Belize.

**Table ZZO**

The following is the list of nationality certificates that were signed by Minister Elvin Penner and the dates differed from those recorded in the Nationality Numbers Book

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>  | <b>Observations/Findings</b>   |
|-------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|
| Wonhong Kim | Republic of Korea                           | 28577/13                              | 22nd April 2013   | 2nd September 2013                   | P0246777 9 <sup>th</sup> September 2013 | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. <b>Passport recommenders were Elvin Penner and Alfonso Cruz JP.</b> (BPIS biometric photo was <b>a picture of a picture; no fingerprints captured</b> ) His nationality file 31986 was not presented. <b>He was in a Taiwanese jail at the time his nationality and Passport was processed and issued.</b> (Ref. unreferenced letter dated 21 <sup>st</sup> January 2015 from Jacklyne Chen, the Director of International Affairs Division, National Immigration Agency (Ministry of the Interior, Taiwan) directed to H.E. Ambassador Nisbet |

| Name                              | Country of Birth/<br>Native Country | Nationality Certificate Number | Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS | Date in Numbers Book/Register | Belize Passport# and Issue Date           | Observations/Findings  |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|---|--|
| Yakup Sut                         | Turkey                              | 28570/13                       | 3rd June 2013                                      | 16th August 2013              | P0245775/<br>26 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. <b>Passport recommenders were Elvin Penner and Martin Cal JP.</b> (BPIS biometric picture was a picture of a picture; no fingerprints captured). His nationality file 31973 was not presented. He did not appear in person for his Passport photo. All the ports of entry were not audited to confirm that he never entered Belize |
| Zubair Mohamed Kazi               | India/ US Citizen                   | 28455/13                       | 2 <sup>nd</sup> June 2013                          | 10 <sup>th</sup> June 2013    | P0241079/<br>8 <sup>th</sup> July 2013    | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file #31769 was not presented. His earliest date of arrival at PGIA was 26 <sup>th</sup> March 2013 as seen in the PGIA manifest.  |
| Yiu Pang Chen<br>(changed name to | Taiwan, ROC                         | 28456/13                       | 18th May 2013                                      | 10th July 2013                | P0244747/<br>13 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file #31924 was not presented.   |

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b> | <b>Observations/Findings</b>   |
|---|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Peter Pang on the 5 <sup>th</sup> of August 2013) Ref. Deed poll #383 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 seen lodged at the Belize Vital Statistics Unit |   |                                       |   |                                      |  | Date of arrival at PGIA was 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2013 on United Airlines #1407   |
| Jack Jie Qin (changed name to Marc Chin on the 5 <sup>th</sup> of August 2013 Ref. Deed poll #382 dated 5 <sup>th</sup>                                 | China/ US Citizen                           | 28457/13                              | 18th May 2013   | 10th July 2013                       | P0244745/ 13 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file #31922 was not presented.<br><br>Date of arrival at PGIA was 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2013 on United Airlines #1407 |

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>    | <b>Observations/Findings</b>   |
|---|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|
| August 2013 seen lodged at the Belize Vital Statistics Unit   |   |                                       |   |                                      |   |  |
| Quoc Vinh Truong (changed name to Simon Truong on 5th of August 2013) Ref. Deed poll #384 dated 5 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 seen lodged at the Belize Vital | Vietnam/<br>US Citizen                      | 28458/13                              | 18th May 2013   | 10th July 2013                       | P0244746/<br>13 <sup>th</sup> August 2013 | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file #31923 was not presented.<br><br>Date of arrival at PGIA was 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2013 on United Airlines #1407 |



| <b>Name</b>                                | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b>   | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>  | <b>Observations/Findings</b>  |
|--|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| Statistics Unit                            |   |                                       |   |                                      |   |   |
| Maxim Poon Wong                            | Vietnam                                     | 28417/13                              | 30 <sup>th</sup> May 2013<br>seen as certificate date on the BPIS as his Passport application was not presented | 6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013            | P0239999/<br>25 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file # 31759 was not presented. (BPIS biometric photo did not appear as a live photo; no fingerprints captured). Passport Recommender was Gertrude Armstrong who worked in the Nationality Section of INS He did not appear in person for his Passport photo. All the ports of entry were not audited to confirm that he never entered Belize |
| Catharina Geertruida Petra Hendrika Guizar | Roermond, Netherlands                       | 25108/13                              | 25 <sup>th</sup> April 2013   | 25 <sup>th</sup> May 2011            | P0236798/<br>14 <sup>th</sup> May 2013  | Applicant presented Netherland Passport NVBD72HD7 issued 7 <sup>th</sup> November 2011; Nationality File requested March 13, 2014 but not presented. Date of entry into Belize unknown  |
| Qinxing Ye                                 | China                                       | 27422/13                              | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013   | 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2012        | None seen up to November                | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration.  |

| Name          | Country of Birth/<br>Native Country | Nationality Certificate Number | Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS | Date in Numbers Book/Register | Belize Passport# and Issue Date                                  | Observations/Findings   |
|---------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|--|---|
|               |                                     |                                |  |                               | 2013 or applicant changed name                                   | Date of entry into Belize unknown   |
| Youzhu Huang  | China                               | 27423/13                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                          | 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 | None seen up to November 2013 or applicant may have changed name | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration as dated 30 <sup>th</sup> May 2013.<br><br>Date of entry into Belize unknown  |
| Hong Wei Chen | China                               | 27424/13                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                          | 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 | P0238494/<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013                           | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration as dated 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013.<br><br>Entered Belize on <b>3rd March 2013 on American Airlines flight #2157</b> . “husband” of Jinyu Liu (See this Report at paragraph 68) |
| Jinyu Liu     | China                               | 27425/13                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                          | 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 | P0238498/<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013                           | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration. “Wife” of Hongwei Chen as dated 29 <sup>th</sup>   |

| Name          | Country of Birth/<br>Native Country | Nationality Certificate Number | Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS | Date in Numbers Book/Register | Belize Passport# and Issue Date        | Observations/Findings  |
|---------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|--|--|
|               |                                     |                                |  |                               |  | May 2013<br>Date of entry into Belize unknown (See this Report at paragraph 69)  |
| Jian Guo Chen | China                               | 27426/13                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                          | 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 | P0238500/<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration. <b>Date of entry was 31st March 2013 at PGIA on AA flight # 2189</b><br><br>“husband” of Yueping Liu<br><br>(See this Report at paragraph 71) |
| Yueping Lui   | China                               | 27427/13                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                          | 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 | P0238499/<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration. “Wife of Jianguo Chen”<br>Date of entry into Belize unknown (See this report at paragraph 71)   |

| Name             | Country of Birth/<br>Native Country | Nationality Certificate Number | Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS | Date in Numbers Book/Register | Belize Passport# and Issue Date         | Observations/Findings  |
|------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|---|--|
|                  |                                     |                                |  |                               |   |  |
| Yunior Dominguez | Holgiue, Cuba                       | 28108/13                       | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                          | 2 <sup>nd</sup> August 2012   | P0239566/<br>20 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration (Yunior Dominguez Alavarez recorded in Register) His Passport application form stated that he was a merchant. On 3B he was recommended by Gwendolyn Jones, teacher, who stated that she knew the applicant for 2 years as one of her doctors.<br><br>Date of first entry into Belize unknown |
| Ziad Omais       | Dakar, Senegal                      | 28151/13                       | 23 <sup>rd</sup> May 2013                          | 6 <sup>th</sup> August 2012   | P0238485/<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013  | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration. <b>Dongtao Jin's certificate #28382/13 was dated 19<sup>th</sup> May 2013, and was 231 certificates after Ziad Omais' certificate (#28151).</b> Nationality Referees Alfred Davis knew him for three years; Glen  |

| <b>Name</b>                       | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>                | <b>Observations/Findings</b>   |
|-----------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|
|                                   |   |                                       |   |                                      |   | Linclon Jones knew him for 2 years. Visa stamps for Belize issued at the Northern Border need to be verified as genuine  |
| Dongtao Jin                       | China                                       | 28382/13                              | 19 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                                 | 17 <sup>th</sup> May 2013            | P0238518/<br>7 <sup>th</sup> June 2013                | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration.<br>Arrived in Belize on 2 <sup>nd</sup> June 2013 thru' PGIA. Visa #191/13 approved by Debra Estrada, OIC, PGIA Senior Immigration Officer. Passport recommenders were Albert Roches JP & Vashti Monique Silva |
| Hsiao Shu –Hui<br>(Shu-Hui Hsiao) | China                                       | 28210/13                              | 29 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                                 | 6 <sup>th</sup> September 2012       | P0238460/<br>6 <sup>th</sup> June 2013                | Name was seen recorded in the Register of Citizens by Registration.<br>Date of entry into Belize unknown   |
| Zhongxiong Yang                   | China                                       | 28297 /13                             | 5 <sup>th</sup> April, 2013                               | 22 <sup>nd</sup> March 2013          | He may not have arrived in Belize as yet for Passport | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration.<br><br>Date of entry into Belize   |

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>  | <b>Observations/Findings</b>   |
|--------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|--|
|              |   |                                       |   |                                      | prior to October 2013 or may have changed his name  | unknown  |
| Shuzi Hu     | China                                       | 28305/13                              | 5 <sup>th</sup> April, 2013                               | 26 <sup>th</sup> March 2013          | She may not have arrived in Belize as yet for Passport prior to October 2013 or may have changed her name | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration.<br>Date of entry into Belize unknown     |
| Shing Bo Lin | China                                       | 28459/13                              | 18 <sup>th</sup> May 2013                                 | 10 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | He may not have arrived in Belize as yet for Passport prior to October 2013 or may have changed his name  | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration.<br><br>Date of entry into Belize unknown |

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>              | <b>Observations/Findings</b>  |
|--------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| Bo-Jie Shau  | China                                       | 28461/13                              | 22nd May 2013   | 10th July 2013                       | P0245212 issued 19 <sup>th</sup> August 2013        | His Passport application was not presented to Audit<br><br>Nationality File was removed from INS Ref Belize Amandala newspaper online dated 8 <sup>th</sup> October 2013)<br><br>Date of entry into Belize unknown                          |
| Jia-Jing Lai | China                                       | 28462/13                              | 22nd May 2013   | 10th July 2013                       | P0245213/ 19 <sup>th</sup> August 2013              | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. Passport Recommenders were Elvin Penner and Edmund Kwan JP. Passport was picked up by Eric Chang w/o authority.<br>Date of entry into Belize unknown. |
| Yi-Yun Wang  | China                                       | 28460/13                              | 22nd May 2013   | 10th July 2013                       | None seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. No interview was done with applicant.<br>Date of entry into Belize  |

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b>  | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>                         | <b>Observations/Findings</b>   |
|-----------------------|---|---------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|--|
|                       |   |                                       |  |                                      | changed his/her name   | unknown.   |
| Obel Corcho Melgarejo | Cuba  | 28491/13                              | 18 <sup>th</sup> May 2013 was seen as the date of certificate on the BPIS<br>Copy of his certificate was not seen. | 19 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | P0246905/11 <sup>th</sup> September 2013                       | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. Recommended for Belize Passport by Alfonso Cruz JP. His nationality file 31937 was removed from INS. His nationality file was in Arthur Saldivar's possession. Those files were given to the Police on the 16 <sup>th</sup> October 2013 (Ref news archives for CTV3 Belize website) .Date of entry into Belize unknown. |
| Ebrahimi Jalal Naser  | United Arab Emirates                        | 28492/13                              | 23 <sup>rd</sup> August 2013 was the date on 28493/13<br>Copy of his certificate was not seen. We                  | 19 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | He may not have arrived in Belize as yet for Passport prior to | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file # 31936 was removed from INS. His file was one of those that were in the possession of Arthur   |



| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Country of Birth/<br/>Native Country</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date on Nationality Certificate or as seen on BPIS</b> | <b>Date in Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Belize Passport# and Issue Date</b>   | <b>Observations/Findings</b>  |
|----------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|--|---|
|                            |   |                                       | can't prove that the dates were different                 |                                      | October 2013 or may have changed his name  | Saldivar. Those files were handed over to the Police on the 16 <sup>th</sup> October 2013 (Ref. CTV3 Belize website)<br><br>Date of entry into Belize unknown.  |
| Ebrahimi<br>Jamal<br>Naser | United Arab Emirates                        | 28493/13                              | 23 <sup>rd</sup> August 2013                              | 19 <sup>th</sup> July 2013           | He may not have arrived in Belize as yet for Passport prior to October 2013 or may have changed his name | No entry was made for certificate number in the Register of Citizens by Registration. His nationality file # 31935 was removed from INS. His file was one of those that were in the possession of Arthur Saldivar. Those files were handed over to the Police on the 16 <sup>th</sup> October 2013 (Ref. CTV3 Belize website)<br>Date of entry into Belize unknown. |

## **Adults were added to a nationality application which violated the Belize nationality law**

Page 3 of the Nationality Application states:

*“This portion should be filled if applicable. Request by applicant for Registration of minor child/ children below the age of eighteen years”*

212. We observed that the following file showed major inconsistencies with this policy including the observation that the applicant (s) had the same 2 referees, (Therese Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse) as in other files, whose signatures appeared to be forged on the application. This finding was discussed in detail at paragraph **140** of this report.

212.2 We saw that file number 16984 showed Guifang Chen who was born in China on the 13<sup>th</sup> January 1957, had included several adults as children on her undated application.

212.3 We noted that along with Jian Guo Xie (DOB 6-Oct-1957) who it was stated was her husband, the other persons included were: Xie Yintao (child) (DOB 14-July-1984) who would have been 18 years in 3 months before the date of the certificate, Jianhua Tan (child) (DOB 22-July-1970 who was 32 years, and Qiao Chao Chen (child) (DOB 9-Sept-1971) who was 31 years at the time of application.

212.4 We observed that Jian Guo Xie was issued certificate number 16176/02 dated 12<sup>th</sup> April 2002, Xie Yintao was added to Guifang Chen’s certificate number 16175/02 as 16175.1/02 dated 12<sup>th</sup> April 2002. Jianhua Tan was issued certificate number 16177/02 dated 12<sup>th</sup> April 2002 and Qiao Chao Chen was issued certificate number 16178/02 dated 12<sup>th</sup> April 2002. All certificates were signed by former Minister, Maxwell Samuels.

212.5 We noted that Qiao Chao Chen (DOB 9-Sept-1971) who was issued certificate # 16178/02 dated 12-April-2002 changed his name to Jie Lun Chen ref deed poll # 136/2011 dated 13-May-2011.

212.6 We also noted that Jian Hua Tan DOB 22-July-1970, certificate # 16177/02 dated 12-April-2002 who added child Huiyu Tan to the certificate on 17-May-2010 used the same suspicious Chinese Passports (G04616982 issued 28-May-2002). The birth certificate of the child was not official and had no signature and stamp of the alleged Notary Public Chen Yan from Guangdong Province, the People’s Republic of China.

212.7 We saw that there were medical certificates for Guifang Chen, Yintao Xie, Qiao Chao Chen, Jianhua Tan and Jianguo Xie. The Police criminal report was for Guifang Chen only although there were 4 more adults on the application. The copy of the Permanent Residence Card in the file was for Guifang Chen (Permit #22206/96) PRF (Permanent Residence File) #13410/97 issued 30-March-1997.

The Security Clearance dated 11-April-2002 from Special Branch was for Guifang Chen and was signed by an M. Baiza who should have noted the same bogus Belizean referees as other files had. We noted that \$1,300.00 was paid vide receipt number 856476 dated 12-April-2002 and was made out in the name Jian Guo Xie. That was done although he was not the applicant nor was it his name written on file number 16984 as been assigned said file number. There was no bank statement for anyone in the file.

**The Children of persons whose claim to Belizean citizenship could not be verified as genuine, were approved nationality by descent**

Section 2 (2) of Part II of The Belize Nationality Act Chapter 161, states two definitions of a “citizen of Belize” as follows:

*“A person shall be or become entitled to the status of a citizen of Belize in one of the following ways only-*

*(a) By right of descent as provided by the Act;*

*And*

*(b) By virtue of registration as provided by the Act”.*

Section 5.-(1) of Part III “Citizenship by Descent” defines that:

*“Subject to the other provisions of this Part, a person born in Belize on or after the appointed date shall have the status of a citizen of Belize.”*

Section 5.-(2) states:

*“Subject to the other provisions of this Part, a person born outside Belize on or after the appointed date shall have the status of a citizen of Belize by **descent if at the time of his birth his father or mother is a citizen of Belize.**”*

213. We found children were issued Belize nationality through descent by people who claimed Belizean citizenship through Economic Citizenship (that could not be verified).

**Interview held on 24<sup>th</sup> March 2014 with OIC Nationality Section Mr. Gordon Wade**

213.3 Mr Wade was asked why the children of Citizens by Registration were receiving nationality by descent. Mr. Wade responded saying that the children who were born after the date their parents were given nationality by registration should receive it by descent according to the Belize Nationality Act. He said that the law approves of it even for children of citizens who had received nationality through the Economic Citizenship program. He went for a copy of the Nationality Act and read the law for us.

He said that a citizen of Belize includes those by Registration and therefore their children are eligible for citizenship by descent.

**The application form for Nationality through Descent did not take into consideration the children of persons who received Nationality by Registration**

214. The application for persons applying for nationality by descent pertained to persons whose parents or grandparents were born in Belize. The relevant application form was not adjusted to reflect the amendment to the law relating to the offer of Nationality by descent to the children of Belizeans by Registration.

214.2 The application form for nationality through descent reflected two main requirements:

- 1) The application form requested the Town/District of the person (mother, father, and grandparent) by virtue of whom the Nationality by descent was being sought, implying that they had to be born in Belize (4.-(1). It did not request the country of birth of the mother, father or grandparent.
- 2) The form also requested the Birth Certificate of the parent or grandparent in order to ascertain whether they qualified under Section 4.-(1) or (2) (a) (b)

**No verification could be done on a claim to citizenship by descent as the supporting documents were not to prove that the parents claim to Citizenship by Registration through Economic Investment was genuine**

215. We were not presented with the relevant BECIP Register to verify that individuals who claimed to have Belizean nationality through Economic Investment had indeed received citizenship. **Table ZZP** below shows a person with Belizean nationality by decent. The parents claimed that they had received citizenship by registration through Economic Investment.

Medisa Fathali, born in Iran on the 26<sup>th</sup> August 2004 used her nationality certificate 1684/1/08 Vol III (41) dated 28<sup>th</sup> March 2008 to apply for her first-issue Belizean Passport on the 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 through the Belize High Commission in London. We were not aware that two BECIP programs were going on simultaneously in 1998 as our findings suggested at Table ZZP below. Other such unverified cases can be seen at **Appendix V**.

**Table ZZP**

The following table shows the name of the person who received Belizean nationality by decent through parents who claimed to have received citizenship by registration through Economic Investment

| <b>Name</b>    | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number</b>                                | <b>Parents</b>   | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Parents Nationality Certificate</b>   | <b>Observations</b>   |
|----------------|-----------------------|--|--|-----------------------|--|---|
| Medisa Fathali | Esfahan, Iran         | 1684/1/08 Vol III (41) dated 28 <sup>th</sup> March 2008 | Mother: Sedigheh Kazerouni Javid Fathali<br><br>And<br><br>Father: Abbas Fathali | Isfahan, Iran         | Nationality Certificate # 06/2/98 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> January, 1998 was stated on Passport application for Sedigheh Kazerouni Javid Fathali.<br>And<br><br>Nationality Certificate # 06/1/98 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> January, 1998 was stated on Passport application for Abbas Fathali<br><br><br>The BECIP Register with such series was not presented to us | Certificate number 006/98 dated 24 <sup>th</sup> April 1998 seen in Register of Citizens by Registration was for Juraj Horec (no children added)<br><br>Nationality certificate copies of parents were not seen as just the certificate number was recorded on their Passport applications<br><br>Sedigheh Kazerouni Javid Fathali was issued P0221558 on the 2 <sup>nd</sup> November 2012; Abbas Fathali was issued P0221557 on the 2 <sup>nd</sup> November 2012 |

215.2 We also could not verify two more nationality certificates for persons who had the surname Fathali and appeared to be the children of Sedigheh Kazerouni Javid Fathali and Abbas Fathali. Their claim for citizenship by registration was through Economic Investment. **Table ZZQ** lists the two persons who had the name Fathali whose nationality certificates we could not verify.

**Table ZZQ**

The following table list the two persons who had the surname Fathali and whose nationality certificates could not be verified by Audit

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Nationality Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date</b>  | <b>Observations</b>   |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|---|
| Mohammad Fathali<br>Date of birth 13 <sup>th</sup><br>August 1973 | 06/2.2/98                             | 20 <sup>th</sup> June 1990 seen<br>recorded on the<br>application form | Copy of Nationality<br>certificate was not<br>seen. Applicant<br>renewed Passport<br>#P0078583 issued 20 <sup>th</sup><br>February 2008<br>through Los Angeles<br>Consulate on 23 <sup>rd</sup><br>October 2012 but<br>authorized Robert<br>Leslie in Belize to<br>pick up P0221347<br>issued on the 31 <sup>st</sup><br>October 2012                       |
| Fazel Fathali<br>Date of Birth 23 <sup>rd</sup><br>August 1972    | 06/2.1/98                             | 20 <sup>th</sup> January 1998  | Copy of Nationality<br>certificate was not<br>seen. Applicant was<br>renewing Passport<br>#P0080416 issued on<br>12 <sup>th</sup> March 2008<br>through the Belize<br>High Commission in<br>London on 2 <sup>nd</sup><br>October 2012 but<br>authorized Robert<br>Leslie in Belize to<br>pick up P0221556<br>issued on the 2 <sup>nd</sup><br>November 2012 |

**Two formats for Certificates of Nationality through Descent were issued to the children of Citizens by Registration including Citizens by Economic Investment**

216. We saw several nationality certificates issued to persons whom one (1) parent was claiming nationality by registration, including through Economic Investment. The reference number used on those certificates, which started with the numbers 1684, identified them as certificates for citizens through descent and the observation that both parents were not born in Belize and at least one claimed he/she was a citizen of Belize by Registration and through Economic Investment. Those certificates that were issued as descent certificates that were not the regular descent certificates along with the inconsistencies found during verification can be viewed at **Table ZZR** below.

**Table ZZR**

The following is the list of Belizean Nationality Certificates. The certificates did not have the words “Nationality by Descent”. They were issued through descent of parents who were Citizens by Registration

| <b>Name</b>    | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b>            | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>  | <b>Parents’<br/>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b>          | <b>Certificate number<br/>and Register<br/>Information</b>  | <b>Other Observations</b>  |
|----------------|---|---|--|--|---|--|
| Lamar<br>Awwad | Ras Al-<br>Khaimah,<br>United<br>Arab<br>Emirates | 1684/1/12<br>Vol. VIII<br>(40) dated<br>25 <sup>th</sup><br>September<br>2012; signed<br>by what<br>appeared as<br>the signature<br>of Ms. Maria<br>Marin but it<br>was not clear<br>since<br>department’s<br>stamp was<br>placed over<br>the signature | Father:<br>Nader<br>Ibrahim<br>Mohamed<br>Hassan<br>Awwad<br><br>Mother:<br>Rasha<br>Ahmed El<br>Hourani | Kuwait<br>City,<br>Kuwait<br><br><br><br><br><br><br>Unknown | Father Nader Ibrahim<br>Mohamed Hassan<br>Awwad had Belizean<br>nationality by<br>registration with<br>certificate #2485/92<br>dated 22-October-1992.<br>(copy was not seen<br><br><b>There was no entry<br/>for this certificate<br/>2485/92 under section<br/>11A; No file #; no file<br/>presented when<br/>requested.</b> | Father had received Passport<br>#P0156077 issued 27 January,<br>2011 and renewed it on 5 <sup>th</sup><br>December 2012 and received<br>P0223751 issued on the same<br>date.<br><br>Temporary Passport #T0000523<br>for Lamar Awwad was signed by<br>Miss Ruth Meighan on 26-<br>September- 2012 |



| Name                       | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent   | Parents'<br>Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Certificate number<br>and Register<br>Information  | Other Observations  |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------|--|---|---|--|---|
| Alexia<br>Jade D'<br>Monte | Squamish,<br>Canada           | 1684/1/12<br>Vol.1V (50)<br>dated 19 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2012<br>issued in<br>Belmopan<br>and signed<br>by Director<br>Miss Ruth<br>Meighan | Father:<br>Conor<br>Vincent<br>D'Monte<br><br>Mother:<br>Jennifer Lee<br>Ann Kong | Burnary,<br>Canada                        | Michael Thomas Kong<br>7754/98 dated 22-May-<br>1998 signed by<br>Minister Dean Barrow<br><br>Jennifer Lee Ann Kong<br>7754.2/98 dated 22-<br>May-1998 signed by<br>Minister Dean Barrow | Michael Thomas Kong plus 3<br>children added to certificate was<br>seen in the register under <b>Section<br/>10</b> . Their address was #8<br>Lamanai Street Belmopan<br>although our investigation and<br>letter of authority attached to<br>Passport application proved that<br>they did not live at that address |
| Dominic<br>Lee D'<br>Monte | Vancouver,<br>Canada          | 1684/1/12Vo<br>1.IV(49)<br>dated 19 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2012<br>issued in<br>Belmopan<br>signed by<br>Director<br>Miss Ruth<br>Meighan      | Father:<br>Conor<br>Vincent<br>D'Monte<br><br>Mother:<br>Jennifer Lee<br>Ann Kong | Burnary,<br>Canada<br><br><br>Unknown     | Michael Thomas Kong<br>7754/98 dated 22-May-<br>1998 signed by<br>Minister Dean Barrow<br><br>Jennifer Lee Ann Kong<br>7754.2/98 signed by<br>Minister Dean Barrow<br>dated 22-May-1998  | Michael Thomas Kong seen in<br>the register under <b>Section 10</b> . #8<br>Lamanai Street Belmopan was<br>used as address although letter of<br>authority for Michael Thomas<br>Kong attached to Passport<br>application proved that they did<br>not live at that address  |

| Name                                   | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details  | Name of<br>Parent  | Parents'<br>Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth          | Certificate number<br>and Register<br>Information  | Other Observations  |
|--|-------------------------------|---|--|--|--|---|
| Caylah<br>Yang                         | Phuket,<br>Thailand           | 1684/1/12<br>Vol. IV(53)<br>dated 24 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2012<br>signed by<br>Miss Ruth<br>Meighan | Father: Li-<br>Ui Yang ( <i>on<br/>Caylah Yang<br/>Chinese<br/>Birth<br/>certificate</i> )<br><br>Li-Wei Yang<br>( <i>on<br/>Nationality<br/>application</i> )<br><br>Mother:<br>Ming-Lun<br>Hsieh | China<br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br>China | Father claimed<br>nationality certificate<br>was lost but copy of<br>Passport # 0229917<br>dated 6-Aug-2001 had<br>Certificate # 592/88<br>recorded. In register<br>(Section 11A)<br>certificate # 592 dated<br>23 <sup>rd</sup> November 1988<br>was seen for Yang<br>Chien-I (plus 2<br>children); Section 10<br>had the name Gladys<br>Louise Gabourel dated<br>29 <sup>th</sup> November 1983. | Father's name differed on<br>Thailand birth certificate and on<br>"father's" Passport. Passport<br>application for Caylah Yang<br>dated 17 <sup>th</sup> May, 2012 indicated<br>applicant's 1 <sup>st</sup> application for<br>Passport but receipt for Embassy<br>of Belize, Republic of China<br>dated 17-May-2012 stated<br>"Passport renewal". Belizean<br>Passport P0204202 for Caylah<br>Yang was issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2012<br>and was picked up by Eric Chang<br>without authority. |
| Chloe<br>Yang<br>(sister of<br>Caylah) | Shanghai,<br>China            | 1684/1/12<br>Vol IV(25)<br>dated 24 <sup>th</sup>   | Father: Li-<br>Ui Yang (on<br>Chinese<br>Birth<br>certificate for  | China  | Information the same<br>as that of Caylah Yang<br>above  | Chloe Yang also applied through<br>descent as seen on letter from<br>Cherie Nisbet, Charge' d'<br>Affaires, Embassy of Belize in<br>Taiwan to Gordon Wade, OIC,   |

| Name             | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent  | Parents'<br>Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Certificate number<br>and Register<br>Information   | Other Observations  |
|------------------|-------------------------------|--|--|---|---|---|
|                  |                               | April 2012   | Caylah<br>Yang) We<br>did not see a<br>copy of<br>Chloe<br>Yang's birth<br>certificate<br><br>(Li-Wei<br>Yang (on<br>Nationality<br>application)<br><br>Mother:<br>Ming-Lun<br>Hsieh | China                                     |   | Nationality Section Ref:<br>EBRC/M/08/E/03-12 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup><br>March 2012 Belize Passport<br>P0204203 issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2012. |
| Chen-<br>Han Lin | Chetumal,<br>Mexico           | 1684/1/08Vo<br>1 VIII(13)<br>dated 3-Sept-<br>2008 signed<br>by Mr.<br>Gareth<br>Murillo | Mother: Yi-<br>Hsing Hsu<br><br>Father: Yi-<br>Lin Lin   | Taiwan<br><br>Unknown                     | Nationality details of<br>mother were not seen<br>on descent form nor<br>Passport application | Yi-Hsing Hsu had Belizean<br>Passport #P0122766 issued 12 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2010  |

| Name                       | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details  | Name of<br>Parent   | Parents'<br>Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Certificate number<br>and Register<br>Information   | Other Observations   |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------|---|---|---|---|--|
| Dongrui<br>Wu              | Guangdong<br>, China          | 1684/1/13<br>Vol III(30)<br>dated 15 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2013  | Father: Guoli<br>Wu<br><br>Mother:<br>Kunying Zhu                                   | Unknown<br><br>Unknown                    | Nationality details of<br>father were were not<br>seen on descent form<br>nor Passport<br>application   | Guoli Wu produced Social<br>Security card #000232844 stating<br>his nationality as a Belizean.<br>Passport P0172852 issued 19-<br>July-2011 was seen for Guoli Wu<br>but Passport application was not<br>presented for us to verify father's<br>Belizean nationality |
| Eylul<br>Catrize<br>Aykurt | Arnavutko<br>y, Turkey        | 1684/1/13<br>Vol IV (36)<br>dated 3-May-<br>2013 signed<br>by Maria<br>Marin  | Father:<br>Guven<br>Aykurt<br><br>Mother:<br>Catherine<br>Joan Aykurt               | Unknown<br><br>Unknown                    | Parent's nationality<br>details were not seen   | We were unable to verify parent's<br>claim to Belizean nationality   |
| I-Ting<br>Liu              | Taoyuan<br>County,<br>Taiwan  | 1684/1/96<br>Vol V (18)<br>dated 8-July-<br>1996.<br>Replacement<br>certificate<br>dated 16 <sup>th</sup><br>December | Father:<br>Ching-Hua<br>Liu aka<br>Bruce Liu<br><br>Mother: Shu<br>Jung Chiu<br>Liu | Hsinchu<br>Hsien,<br>Taiwan<br><br>Taiwan | Replacement<br>nationality certificate<br>#761/89 dated 1 <sup>st</sup><br>August 2005 signed by<br>Mr. Jose Carmen<br>Zetina. Copy of<br>original undated<br>certificate (number not | In Register under Section 11A<br>certificate number 761/89<br>belonged Ching- Hua Liu but no<br>file number recorded; no file<br>presented to Audit.   |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b> | <b>Parents'<br/>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Certificate number<br/>and Register<br/>Information</b>   | <b>Other Observations</b>  |
|-------------|--|---|---------------------------|---|--|--|
|             |  | 2008 signed by what appeared as the signature of Mr. Gareth Murillo (alleging that original was signed by Valerie E. Samuels) |                           |   | <p>clear) signed by what appeared to be the signature of Minister Dean O. Barrow</p> <p>Replacement nationality certificate number 762/89 dated 24<sup>th</sup> June 2008 for Shu Jung Chiu Liu signed by what appeared as the signature of Mr. Gareth Murillo (alleging that original certificate was signed by Minister Dean O. Barrow</p> | In register under Section 11A certificate number 762/89 belonged to Liu, Chiu Shu- Jung (2 children added) but no file number recorded; no file presented to Audit. Nationality files for both parents were requested. |

| Name            | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent  | Parents'<br>Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Certificate number<br>and Register<br>Information   | Other Observations   |
|-----------------|-------------------------------|--|--|---|---|--|
| Kelvin<br>Zhang | Portland<br>Oregon,<br>USA    | 1684/1/10<br>Vol VIII (7)<br>dated 7 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2010<br>signed by<br>Gareth<br>Murillo | Mother:<br>Yingchun<br>Zhang<br><br>Father:<br>Jianyang<br>Zhang | China<br><br>China                        | 15433/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on copy of<br>ordinary Passport<br>#0281577 issued 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>March 2003<br><br>15432/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on copy of<br>ordinary Passport<br>#0281469 issued 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>March 2003<br><br>We were unable to<br>verify nationality<br>details for both parents | Previous manual Passport<br>#0281577 issued 3 <sup>rd</sup> March 2003<br>was not issued genuinely (see<br>Passport report appendix D.3)<br><br>Yingchun Zhang received<br>Passport P0229398 issued 21-<br>Feb-2013<br><br>Previous manual Passport<br>#0281469 issued 3 <sup>rd</sup> March 2003<br>was not issued genuinely (see<br>Passport report appendix D.3)<br><br>Jianyang Zhang received Passport<br>P0229401 issued 21 <sup>st</sup> Feb-2013 |

| Name            | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent  | Parents'<br>Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Certificate number<br>and Register<br>Information   | Other Observations  |
|-----------------|-------------------------------|--|--|---|---|---|
| Terren<br>Zhang | Portland<br>Oregon,<br>USA    | 1684/1/10<br>Vol VIII (8)<br>dated 7 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2010<br>signed by<br>Gareth<br>Murillo | Mother:<br>Yingchun<br>Zhang<br><br>Father:<br>Jianyang<br>Zhang | China<br><br>China                        | 15433/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on ordinary<br>Passport copy.<br><br>15432/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on ordinary<br>Passport copy.<br><br>We were unable to<br>verify Nationality<br>details for both parents<br>and as a result further<br>investigation is<br>required. | Previous manual Passport<br>#0281577 issued 3 <sup>rd</sup> March 2003<br>was not issued genuinely (see<br>Passport report appendix D.4)<br><br>Previous manual Passport<br>#0281469; issued 3 <sup>rd</sup> March 2003<br>was not issued genuinely (see<br>Passport report appendix D.4)<br><br>Both parents may not have been<br>issued Belizean nationality<br>genuinely under Section 10 in<br>January 2002 since their manual<br>Passports were not genuinely<br>issued. |

| <b>Name</b>    | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b>    | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>  | <b>Parents'<br/>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Certificate number<br/>and Register<br/>Information</b>  | <b>Other Observations</b>  |
|----------------|---|---|--|---|---|--|
| Merry<br>Zhang | Jardinez de<br>Santa<br>Monica,<br>Mexico | 1684/1/12<br>Vol XII (36)<br>dated 5 <sup>th</sup><br>October 2012<br>signed by<br>Miss Ruth<br>Meighan | Father:<br>Lihuan<br>Zhang<br>Mother:<br>Xumei<br>Zhang                        | Unknown   | Parents nationality<br>details unknown<br>(nationality certificate<br>was not attached with<br>parents information)   | Unable to verify parents'<br>Belizean nationality  |
| Pinxuan<br>Zhu | China                                     | 1684/1/11<br>Vol IX (37)<br>dated 17 <sup>th</sup><br>October 2011                                      | Mother:<br>Yuyang Pang<br><br>Father:<br>Unknown<br>We did not<br>receive file | China   | Nationality certificate<br>number 18157/04<br>(Section 11) dated 16 <sup>th</sup><br>November 2004 was<br>recorded on Passport<br>application form; In the<br>register under Section<br>10 certificate number<br>18157 dated 16 <sup>th</sup><br>November 2004<br>belonged to Lynda<br>Ramirez (no children<br>added) | Copy of descent certificate was<br>not attached to Passport<br>application although it was the 1 <sup>st</sup><br>issue of Passport for Pinxuan<br>Zhu.<br><br>Mother Yuyang Pang was<br>fraudulently issued certificate<br>18157/04 dated 16 <sup>th</sup> November<br>2004 and had Belizean Passport<br>#P0145823 issued 22 <sup>nd</sup><br>September 2010 for which she<br>did not appear in person to<br>capture her biometrics |



**Children were approved Nationality by descent although the parents Registration as a citizen of Belize was irregular or fraudulent or the children's descent certificate reference was not verified as genuine**

217. We found instances where the children of citizens by registration, including those by economic investment, were issued Belizean citizenship by descent but their parents' citizenship or the children's descent status may not have been received genuinely as **Table ZZS** below shows.

**Table ZZS**

The following is the list of children who were issued Belizean citizenship although their parents' citizenship and/or those children descent status may not have been genuine

| <b>Name</b>  | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>   | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>  | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Nationality by<br/>Registration<br/>Certificate<br/>Number &amp;<br/>Verification of<br/>Register of<br/>Citizens by<br/>Registration</b>   | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|
| Danny Williams<br>(previously<br>Danil<br>Bessmertnyy) | St.<br>Petersburg,<br>Russia           | 1684/1/11Vo<br>I.II(54) dated<br>15 <sup>th</sup> March<br>2011<br><br>(Copy of<br>certificate<br>was not seen)<br>Child's<br>descent<br>certificate | Father: Boris<br>Sokholov<br>who changed<br>his name to<br>Boris<br>Bessmertnyy<br>on the 25 <sup>th</sup><br>January 2008<br>then changed<br>his name to<br>Barry | Angarsk,<br>Russia                     | 10/1/98 dated 20 <sup>th</sup><br>January 1998<br><br>(P0078107 issued<br>30 <sup>th</sup> January 2008<br>& P0156575 issued<br>7 <sup>th</sup> February 2011<br>in the name Boris<br>Bessmertny). | P0181927 issued 7 <sup>th</sup> October<br>2011 in the name Danil<br>Bessmertny and<br><br>P0196239 issued 28 <sup>th</sup> March<br>2012 in the name Danny<br>Williams (name changed on<br>the 22 <sup>nd</sup> February 2012) |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>   | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Nationality by<br/>Registration<br/>Certificate<br/>Number &amp;<br/>Verification of<br/>Register of<br/>Citizens by<br/>Registration</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|--|---|---|--|--|---|
|             |  | and authority could not be found when requested on the 18 <sup>th</sup> March 2015; instead Descent Certificate #1684/1/11 Vol XI (54) dated 28 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 was seen as issued to Rei-Ya Gilharry | Williams on the 16 <sup>th</sup> February 2012<br><br>Mother: Unknown<br>Child's descent application documents were not seen in nationality file number 083/97/98 for Boris Sokholov (father) | Unknown                                |  |   |
| Lamar Awwad | Ras Al-Khaimah, United                 | 1684/1/12 Vol. VIII (40) dated  | Father: Nader Ibrahim   | Kuwait City, Kuwait                    | Father Nader Ibrahim Mohamed Hassan Awwad  | Father had already received Passport #P0156077 issued 27-January-2011 and was |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>   | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Nationality by<br/>Registration<br/>Certificate<br/>Number &amp;<br/>Verification of<br/>Register of<br/>Citizens by<br/>Registration</b>  | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|--|---|---|--|---|--|
|             | Arab<br>Emirates                       | 25 <sup>th</sup><br>September<br>2012; signed<br>by what<br>appeared as<br>the signature<br>of Maria<br>Mendez<br>(Marin) but it<br>was not clear<br>since<br>department's<br>stamp was<br>placed over<br>the signature | Mohamed<br>Hassan<br>Awwad<br><br>Mother:<br>Rasha<br>Ahmed El<br>Hourani | Unknown                                | claimed he had<br>Belizean<br>Nationality by<br>Registration<br>Certificate<br>#2485/92 dated 22-<br>October-1992.<br>There was no entry<br>for this certificate<br>2485/92 under<br>Section 11A; Under<br>Section 10,<br>certificate number<br>was for Julio Cesar<br>Martinez No file<br>number; no file<br>presented when<br>requested on 19 <sup>th</sup><br>June 2014. | already renewing it on 5 <sup>th</sup><br>December 2012 and received<br>P0223751 issued 5 <sup>th</sup><br>December 2012.<br>Temporary Passport<br>#T0000523 for Lamar<br>Awwad was signed by Ruth<br>Meighan on 26-September-<br>2012 |
| Caylah Yang | Phuket,<br>Thailand                    | 1684/1/12<br>Vol. IV(53)<br>dated 24 <sup>th</sup>  | Father: Li-<br>Ui Yang on<br>Chinese                                      | China                                  | Father claimed<br>Nationality<br>certificate was lost   | Father's name differed on<br>Thailand birth certificate and<br>on Belize manual Passport.  |

| Name                                     | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details                | Name of<br>Parent   | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth                      | Nationality by<br>Registration<br>Certificate<br>Number &<br>Verification of<br>Register of<br>Citizens by<br>Registration   | Observations   |
|--|-------------------------------|---|---|--|--|--|
|  |                               | April 2012<br>signed by<br>Ruth<br>Meighan                      | Birth<br>certificate<br>(Li-Wei<br>Yang on<br>Nationality<br>application)<br>Mother:<br>Ming-Lun<br>Hsieh | China<br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br><br>China | but copy of<br>Passport #<br>0229917 dated 6-<br>Aug-2001 seen had<br>Certificate # 592/88<br>recorded. <b>In<br/>Register (Section<br/>11A) certificate #<br/>592 dated 23<sup>rd</sup><br/>November 1988<br/>belongs to Yang<br/>Chien-I (plus 2<br/>children)</b> | Passport application dated<br>17 <sup>th</sup> May, 2012 indicated<br>applicant's 1 <sup>st</sup> application for<br>Passport but receipt for<br>Embassy of Belize, Republic<br>of China dated 17-May-2012<br>stated "Passport renewal".<br>Passport P0204202 for Caylah<br>Yang was issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June<br>2012 and was picked up by<br>Eric Chang without authority. |
| Chloe Yang<br>(sister of<br>Caylah Yang) | Shanghai,<br>China            | 1684/1/12<br>Vol IV(25)<br>dated 24 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2012 | Father: Li-<br>Ui Yang on<br>Chinese<br>Birth<br>certificate for<br>Caylah Yang<br>(Li-Wei<br>Yang on     | China  | Father claimed<br>Nationality<br>certificate was lost<br>but copy of<br>Passport #0229917<br>dated 6-Aug-2001<br>seen had Certificate<br>number 592/88   | Belize Passport P0204203<br>issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2012   |

| Name       | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details                      | Name of<br>Parent  | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Nationality by<br>Registration<br>Certificate<br>Number &<br>Verification of<br>Register of<br>Citizens by<br>Registration  | Observations   |
|------------|-------------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------|---|--|
|            |                               |   | Nationality<br>application)<br><br>Mother:<br>Ming-Lun<br>Hsieh  | China                         | recorded. In<br>Register (Section<br>11A) certificate #<br>592 dated 23 <sup>rd</sup><br>November 1988<br>belongs to Yang<br>Chien-I (plus 2<br>children)                   |  |
| Emily Mark | Chetumal,<br>Mexico           | 1684/1/11<br>Vol X (31)<br>dated 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>November,<br>2011 | Father: Wai<br>Lee Mark<br><br>(Mother<br>unknown we<br>did not see a<br>copy of<br>descent<br>certificate<br>with parents<br>information<br>as it was not | China                         | In register (Section<br>10) certificate<br>number1751/90<br>dated 15 <sup>th</sup> June<br>1990 seen for Johan<br>Wall & Ma Jin Ke<br>(Kum Fo Mark) and<br>2 children added | Passport application seen for<br>father, Wai Lee Mark;<br>Passport P0188204 issued 14-<br>Dec-2011.<br><br>Copy of descent certificate<br>was not seen |

| Name         | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent  | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth          | Nationality by<br>Registration<br>Certificate<br>Number &<br>Verification of<br>Register of<br>Citizens by<br>Registration  | Observations   |
|--------------|-------------------------------|--|--|--|---|--|
|              |                               |  | attached to<br>Passport<br>application                           |  |   |  |
| Kelvin Zhang | Portland<br>Oregon,<br>USA    | 1684/1/10<br>Vol VIII (7)<br>dated 7 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2010<br>signed by<br>Gareth<br>Murillo | Mother:<br>Yingchun<br>Zhang<br><br>Father:<br>Jianyang<br>Zhang | China<br><br><br><br><br><br><br>China | 15433/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on<br>ordinary Passport<br>copy.<br><br><br><br><br><br>15432/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on<br>ordinary Passport<br>copy.<br><br>We were unable to<br>verify Nationality<br>details for both | Previous manual Passport<br>#0281577; issue date 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>March 2003 was not issued<br>genuinely ( <b>see Passport<br/>Report Appendix D.3</b> )<br><br>Yingchun Zhang renewed to<br>P0229398 issued 21-Feb-2013<br><br><br><br><br><br>Previous manual Passport<br>#0281469; issue date 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>March 2003 was not issued<br>genuinely (see Passport report<br>appendix D.3)<br><br>Jianyang Zhang renewed to<br>P0229401 issued 21 <sup>st</sup> Feb- |

| Name         | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent  | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth          | Nationality by<br>Registration<br>Certificate<br>Number &<br>Verification of<br>Register of<br>Citizens by<br>Registration  | Observations   |
|--------------|-------------------------------|--|--|--|---|--|
|              |                               |  |  |  | parents   | 2013   |
| Terren Zhang | Portland<br>Oregon,<br>USA    | 1684/1/10<br>Vol VIII (8)<br>dated 7 <sup>th</sup><br>April 2010<br>signed by<br>Gareth<br>Murillo | Mother:<br>Yingchun<br>Zhang<br><br>Father:<br>Jianyang<br>Zhang | China<br><br><br><br><br><br><br>China | 15433/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on<br>ordinary Passport<br>copy.<br><br><br><br><br><br>15432/02 dated 14 <sup>th</sup><br>January, 2002 seen<br>stamped on<br>ordinary Passport | Previous manual Passport<br>#0281577; issue date 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>March 2003 was not issued<br>genuinely ( <b>see Passport<br/>Report Appendix D.4</b> )<br><br>Yingchun Zhang renewed to<br>P0229398 issued 21-Feb-2013<br><br><br>Previous manual Passport<br>#0281469; issue date 3 <sup>rd</sup><br>March 2003 was not issued<br>genuinely (See Passport<br>Report <b>appendix D.4</b> ) |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>   | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Nationality by<br/>Registration<br/>Certificate<br/>Number &amp;<br/>Verification of<br/>Register of<br/>Citizens by<br/>Registration</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|-------------|--|---|---|--|--|---|
|             |  |   |   |  | copy.<br><br>We were unable to<br>verify Nationality<br>details for both<br>parents  | Jianyang Zhang renewed to<br>P0229401 issued 21 <sup>st</sup> Feb-<br>2013<br><br>Both parents may not have<br>been issued Belize Nationality<br>genuinely under Section 10 in<br>January 2002 since their<br>manual Passports were not<br>genuinely issued |
| Meier Wen   | China                                  | 1684/1/97<br>Vol IV dated<br>18 <sup>th</sup> April<br>1997 | Parents' details were<br>not provided<br>since<br>Passport<br>applicant was<br>16 years. No | Parents place<br>of birth<br>unknown   | Parents nationality<br>details unknown   | Meier Wen renewed Passport<br>P0041459 issued 25 <sup>th</sup> August<br>2008 in 2012 so did not<br>provide copy of descent<br>certificate. Meier Wen did not<br>present herself for biometrics<br>for Passport renewal on 27 <sup>th</sup>                 |



| <b>Name</b> | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b>  | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>   | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Nationality by<br/>Registration<br/>Certificate<br/>Number &amp;<br/>Verification of<br/>Register of<br/>Citizens by<br/>Registration</b> | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|--|---|---|--|--|--|
|             |  |   | signature on<br>Passport<br>application   |  |  | December 2012. Her Passport<br>photo was a picture of a<br>picture and no fingerprints<br>were captured on the BPIS  |
| Yupeng Wen  | China                                  | <b>1689</b> /1/99<br>Vol IX (24)<br>dated 11 <sup>th</sup><br>August 1999<br>(not a<br>genuine<br>reference for<br>descent<br>certificates) | Parents'<br>details were<br>not provided<br>although<br>applicant was<br>14years. No<br>signature on<br>Passport<br>application | Parents place<br>of birth<br>unknown   | Parents nationality<br>details unknown   | Yupeng Wen renewed<br>P0668899 issued 27 <sup>th</sup><br>September 2007 in 2012 so<br>did not provide a copy of<br>descent certificate. Yupeng<br>Wen did not present herself<br>for biometrics for Passport<br>renewal on 27 <sup>th</sup> December<br>2012. Her Passport photo was<br>a picture of a picture and no<br>fingerprints were captured on<br>the BPIS Her previous<br>Passport # 0201047 dated 13 <sup>th</sup><br>August 1999 could not be<br>verified as genuine |
| Pinxuan Zhu | China                                  | 1684/1/11   | Mother:   | China                                  | Nationality  | Copy of descent certificate  |

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Descent<br/>Nationality<br/>Certificate<br/>Details</b> | <b>Name of<br/>Parent</b>   | <b>Place/<br/>Country of<br/>Birth</b> | <b>Nationality by<br/>Registration<br/>Certificate<br/>Number &amp;<br/>Verification of<br/>Register of<br/>Citizens by<br/>Registration</b>   | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|--|--|---|--|--|--|
|             |  | Vol IX (37)<br>dated 17 <sup>th</sup><br>October 2011      | Yuyang Pang<br><br>Father:<br>Unknown<br>Descent<br>certificate<br>was not seen |  | certificate #<br>18157/04 (section<br>10) (dated 16 <sup>th</sup><br>November 2004<br>was recorded on<br>Passport application<br>form. In the<br>Register under<br>section 10<br>certificate # 18157<br>dated 16 <sup>th</sup><br>November 2004<br>belonged to Lynda<br>Ramirez (no<br>children added) | was not attached to Passport<br>application although it was<br>the 1 <sup>st</sup> issue of Passport for<br>Pinxuan Zhu.<br><br>Mother Yuyang Pang was<br>fraudulently issued certificate<br>18157/04 and had Belize<br>Passport #P0145823 issued<br>22 <sup>nd</sup> September 2010 for<br>which she did not appear in<br>person to capture her<br>biometrics |

217.2 All nationality by descent certificates for which we were unable to verify the parent (s) claim as genuine to Belizean Nationality by Registration, including economic investment can be seen at **Appendix V**.

**An individual from the Belize High Commission in London signed nationality by descent certificates which was the duty of the Director of Immigration**

Requirement #6 on page 14 of The Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1, 2011 titled “Nationality Certificates via Descent” states:

*“Prepared Certificate is taken for Director’s signature, a copy is saved electronically and file is returned to Registry Clerk for filing.”*

218. We saw that the nationality by descent certificates issued to the individuals listed at **Table ZZS** below were signed by an individual from the Belize High Commission in London and not the Director as was seen in other cases. We could not identify the person’s signature who had signed said certificates. The father of the children listed below, Mohamed Khalil Owemer’s citizenship through marriage was not issued according to the law as outlined earlier at paragraph **86** in this report.

**Table ZZS**

The following are the three children of Mohamed Khalil Owemer whose descent certificates were signed by an individual in London

| <b>Name</b>                 | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number</b> | <b>Date</b>                 | <b>Person who signed certificate</b> | <b>Place Issued</b> |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------|
| Rawan Mohamed Khalil Owemer | Riyadh, Saudi Arabia    | BHC-LON 178/10/08 (6)     | 6 <sup>th</sup> August 2010 | Unknown                              | London              |
| Noor Mohamed Khalil Owemer  | Riyadh, Saudi Arabia    | BHC-LON 179/10/08 (6)     | 6 <sup>th</sup> August 2010 | Unknown                              | London              |
| Malak Mohamed Khalil Owemer | Riyadh, Saudi Arabia    | BHC-LON 180/10/08 (6)     | 6 <sup>th</sup> August 2010 | Unknown                              | London              |

**No evidence seen that Belizean Nationality was revoked for citizens who got Belize nationality under Section 10 (citizens by registration) who did not reside in Belize for 5 consecutive years or more.**

Section 20 of Part V “Loss of Citizenship” of the Nationality Act Chapter 161 of the Laws of Belize states:

*“ A person who is a citizen by registration shall cease to be a citizen of Belize if that person resides outside Belize for five consecutive years or more, exclusive of any period during which that person- -*

*(a) is employed abroad as an officer in the services of the Government of Belize; or*

*(b) is abroad as a representative of the Government of Belize; or*

*(c) being the spouse or minor child of a citizen of Belize who is abroad in any of the capacities specified in paragraphs (a) and (b) of this section, resides abroad with that citizen;*

*or*

*(d) resides abroad on a holiday or for reasons of health; or*

*(e) is a student at an educational institution abroad; or*

*(f) resides abroad with a spouse who is a citizen of Belize by descent; or*

*(g) is abroad for any other purpose which may be prescribed by Order by the Minister.”*

And

Section 21.-1e states:

*“Where the Minister is satisfied that a person who is a citizen of Belize by registration-*

*(4) has, since the date of his becoming a citizen of Belize by registration, been for a period of not less than two years ordinarily resident in a foreign country of which he was a national or citizen at any time prior to that date, and has not maintained a substantial connection with Belize...the Minister may by Order declare that such person shall cease to be such a citizen and thereupon the person in respect of whom the Order is made shall cease to be a citizen of Belize by registration.”*

We noted during our investigation a number of persons did not appear in person for their Passports biometrics. All those persons who did not appear in person for their Passports biometrics, even if their nationality certificates (copies of replacements or originals) were issued genuinely under Section 10 of the Nationality Act, may have qualified for their Belizean nationality to be revoked in accordance with section 20 Part V of the Nationality Act Chapter 161. A list of those persons with fraudulent nationality certificates who did not appear in person for first-issue Passports are listed at **Appendix B**. While those who did not appear in person for renewals of their Passports are listed at **Appendix B1**.

We noted that the Loss of Citizenship would also relate to persons who wrote the addresses of Belize hotels as their address on their Passport applications.

**Many persons who claimed to have Belizean nationality under Section 10 Registration wrote the names and addresses of Belize hotels as their addresses**

219. We found during our Passport investigation at the INS, that many persons who applied to renew their Passports and claimed to have Belizean nationality wrote the name and address of Belize hotels.

219.2 We noted that those who had fraudulent nationality certificates did not appear in person for Passport biometrics. As mentioned earlier, those who had received Belizean nationality fraudulently used the Northern Highway as their address, which was not a specific address.

Persons who stayed at Belize hotels, and did not reside in Belize can be seen at **Appendix W**.

219.3 We noted that many citizens by registration, in possession of fraudulently obtained nationality certificates and Belizean Passports, paid the expedited Passport fee of \$100.00 in April 2011 to February 2013 and \$250.00 in March to September 2013 (see Passport Report).

**British Embassies in Beirut and Guangzhou and Belmopan visa stamp need to be verified as genuine**

220. We saw a British Embassy Beirut and Belmopan Immigration Office visa stamp in the native Passports of persons with the surname Harmouch or Harmouche. During a telephone call in March 2015 to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, we questioned the possibility of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs verifying the authenticity of a British Embassy in Guangzhou Visa stamp. We were told that the Ministry did not supervise the issuance of visas to Belize at those British Embassies. It was further stated that an agreement signed between all British Embassies and Belize from the 1980's gave them the authority to issue visas to Belize. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether the British Embassy Beirut and Belmopan visa stamps were genuine and if so whether the visas were genuinely issued.

## **An Internet Website offered Belizean Citizenship and Passport for sale at a cost of \$9,900 USD**

221. We found a website on the Internet named IPC Belize © 2012 offering Belize Passports for sale. The website claimed to have "... direct local contacts".

The website proposed the following:

***Second Passport, Citizenship & Residency in Belize!***

***You can have a Belize passport in as little as 6 months***

***How much does a Belize passport cost?The price is incredibly low at only \$9,900 USD***

*If you're looking for a good dual passport that offers excellent Visa-free travel to Europe and several places in Asia, but you don't want to wait many years or pay tens of thousands of dollars to acquire one, Belize is an excellent option. You can have a **Belize passport** in as little as 6 months, contact us for further details at: [ipcbelize@imap.cc](mailto:ipcbelize@imap.cc)*

221.2 Up to the time of writing this report in 2015 the website was still up on the Internet. We tested the email address on the website requesting information on its services and received a response which we have labelled **Appendix X**.

## **Recommendations**

The Director, Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

- 1) That Belizean Nationality is revoked, pending investigations, for all persons cited in this Report and the Passport Report in accordance with the Nationality Act Chapter 161 Part V Loss of Citizenship Section 21.-(1) c as follows:

*Where the Minister is satisfied that a person who is a citizen of Belize by registration-*

*Has been convicted of an offence under this Act; ...(c) was registered as a citizen of Belize by means of fraud, false representation, or the concealment of material; circumstances or by mistake.... the Minister may by Order declare that such person shall cease to be such a citizen and thereupon the person in respect of whom the Order is made shall cease to be a citizen of Belize by registration...*

- 2) All Belizean passports obtained fraudulently are recalled in accordance with Section 10 of the 2013 amended Passport Regulations "recall and cancellation of Belize passport".

The Belize Passport Regulations 2013 Section 10 states:

*A Belize Passport issued under these Regulations or any preceding legislation may be recalled by the Director of Immigration and Nationality Services and cancelled at any time.*

- 3) The Commissioner of Police is informed about these findings so that a criminal investigation is launched. The Commissioner of Police should request the assistance of Interpol in order to identify all non-resident Belizeans and foreigners involved as well.
- 4) The Financial Intelligence Unit is informed of all persons involved in those fraudulent activities relating to the issuance of Belizean nationality and Passports. It is important that FIU launch an investigation into the assets of those persons to determine if any bribery was involved.
- 5) The intervention of Ministers into the nationality process is investigated to ascertain whether bribery was involved in the issuance of Belize nationality to those whose nationality was expedited, whether they qualified or not under the Nationality Act.
- 6) The intervention of Ministers into the nationality process is immediately ceased since the Nationality Act does not provide for the intervention in the nationality process by a Minister.
- 7) Persons who received Belizean nationality under Section 10 and have qualified according to the law to lose such status since they have been living outside Belize should be revisited.

If they are living abroad and their circumstances are not provided for by the Act that their Belizean Nationality should also be revoked in accordance with Section 20, which states:

*A person who is a citizen by registration shall cease to be a citizen of Belize if that person resides outside Belize for five consecutive years or more, exclusive of any period during which that person –*

*(a) is employed abroad as an officer in the services of the Government of Belize; or*

*(b) is abroad as a representative of the Government of Belize; or*

*(c) being the spouse or minor child of a citizen of Belize who is abroad in any of the capacities specified in paragraphs*

*(a) and (b) of this section, resides abroad with that citizen;*

*or*

*(d) resides abroad on a holiday or for reasons of health; or*

*(e) is a student at an educational institution abroad; or*

*(f) resides abroad with a spouse who is a citizen of Belize by descent; or*

*(g) is abroad for any other purpose which may be prescribed by Order by the Minister:*

*Provided that the provisions of this section shall not apply to an economic citizen as defined in section 12 of this Act.”*

- 8) The Commissioner of Police conducts an investigation into the disappearance of Nationality files and missing Passport applications to find out who was/were responsible for their removal from the INS and have them charged. In the event that those documents are located that said documents are presented to the Auditor General for auditing.
- 9) An investigation is launched at the various Embassies and Foreign Missions abroad, specifically in the United Kingdom, Singapore, China and Taiwan in order to identify persons who are “agents” in facilitating the fraudulent issuance of Belizean citizenship to persons who do not qualify under the Nationality Act.

Persons who may be innocently facilitating the fraudulent issuance of Belizean Passports at the various Embassies and Foreign Missions are warned and trained to provide the relevant assistance or query relating to the authenticity of Passports as was done in the case of Nina and Zhaoyi Sha (See Passport report).

Officers assisting with Passport applications may not be aware that Belizean nationality certificates were obtained through fraudulent activities. Therefore, training must encompass foreign agents who are deceiving persons abroad into believing that the Belize BECIP program is still ongoing.

- 10) A system of vetting or verification of nationality certificate numbers and certificates with nationality files is done. This should be done by a separate Unit, prior to all first issues and renewal of Belizean Passports, for all persons claiming Belizean citizenship by Registration including economic investment.
- 11) All blank entries in the Nationality Registers should be reviewed and updated accordingly.



- 12) A comprehensive review of The Department's operation and processes is conducted in an effort to streamline its operations.
- 13) Copies of all Chinese Passports showing the biographic data are forwarded to the Embassy of the Republic of China for verification.
- 14) The Commissioner of Police should be called in to investigate the source of those bogus Chinese Passports or pages that were made to appear as Chinese Passport pages, which were used for fraudulent purposes by Officers in the Visa and Nationality sections of the INS.
- 15) A new unit of the INS, separate from all other sections of the Department, should be created and given the responsibility to verify and authenticate foreign travel documents. All Immigration personnel should be trained to identify bogus travel documents from foreign countries
- 16) The Commissioner of Police creates a Policy for the Crimes Investigation Branch issuance of Police Reports.
- 17) The Commissioner of Police investigates those involved in the issuance of Police Report (e.g. Jinchun An) who may not have been in Belize on the date he was issued a Police Report.
- 18) An inventory of all stamps used by the Department is carried out and all obsolete visa, arrival, visa extension, temporary employment permit and permanent residence stamps are destroyed.
- 19) The use of all bogus Immigration stamps, foreign and local, are investigated by the Commissioner of Police to determine whether those stamps were fraudulently used in Belize or abroad.
- 20) The unauthorized use of Belize visa, arrival, extension, employment permit and PR stamps discontinued.
- 21) Reinstates the requirement for a notarized criminal record from the native country and prior country of residence of the Permanent Residence and Nationality applicant.
- 22) Where it is impossible for applicants to get such records from their native country or prior country of residence that the Head, Special Branch is asked to do a Joint Intelligence Coordinating Check (JICC) on such applicants. This is especially for those who are required by the Referral System (Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 1, 2011 (page 29)).

- 23) A revision is made regarding the decision to accept an applicant's criminal record only from the Belize Criminal Investigation Branch for nationality applicants. This decision violates the Nationality Act.
- 24) Audit is informed as to when and why the Nationality Advisory Committee was removed and who gave the authority for its dismissal from reviewing nationality applications
- 25) Audit is informed as to when and why the vetting of Nationality applications by the Attorney General was discontinued and who gave the authority for that to happen
- 26) Based on adverse findings in relation to an applicant, the vetting Committee's decision (when the vetting Committee is reinstituted) should not be overruled by any Minister of Government.
- 27) All Nationality applications and documents are brought into agreement with the Law. The wording used on these forms and policies should not be ambiguous as to create confusion and doubt of the legal requirements.
- 28) The issuance of Replacement Nationality certificates should be reconsidered. Copies of the Original certificates should be issued and a certification note made on the copy of the original certificate. The issuance of Replacement Nationality certificates provides an opportunity for fraud.
- 29) The person who applies for a first issue Passport or to renew a Passport, whose Nationality file cannot be located, should be the one to provide sufficient proof of acquiring Belize nationality genuinely, including the proof of payment of the relevant fees to the government. A previous Passport and/or original Nationality certificate is not enough proof. Such proof should be presented to a vetting committee and not just to officers in the INS or to the Director.
- 30) A proper and impartial interpretation of the law is done to determine whether the children of persons who acquired Belizean nationality through registration should receive Belizean citizenship by descent, which was originally reserved for the children and grandchildren of born Belizeans.
- 31) The decision to grant nationality by descent to the children of persons who received nationality by registration including Economic Investment is reviewed as it opens the door to fraud. (Most of the cases we saw did not appear to be genuine as those "parents" may not have qualified for Belizean citizenship in the first place.

- 32) A new system is designed, instituted and executed in the Nationality Section to limit nationality fraud and the issuance of duplicate nationality certificate numbers and nationality files.
- 33) Conduct a review of the expedited Passport processing fee for Citizens by Registration under Section 10 as the policy allowed many persons to receive expedited new and renewed Passports and return to their residences abroad, proving that they did not reside in Belize. The expedited Passport fee mechanism also allowed persons who came to Belize to acquire Belize nationality and Passports fraudulently, to leave the country as soon as possible; hence, the current policy facilitates nationality and Passport fraud.
- 34) The period for knowing a Passport applicant is revised since a Recommender for Nationality under Section 10 Registration must be Belizean born and should know the applicant for 5 years, but the recommender for a Belize Passport does not have to be a born Belizean and does not have to know the applicant for 5 years.
- 35) The Referral System is immediately re-instituted and utilized for applicants to whom the policy applies.
- 36) A complete and thorough audit of all visa applications is executed at the Belmopan Visa Section since that was the main office approving visas for persons who subsequently received Belize PR and Nationality fraudulently.
- 37) A thorough Audit is executed countrywide at all Ports of Entry to identify persons who entered Belize with and without visas issued, who were subsequently issued Belize nationality fraudulently from the year 2000.
- 38) A standard system of Data Entry for manual and electronic records is implemented in all sections of the INS including Visa, Nationality and Passport Sections.
- 39) The Commissioner of Police is informed about those circumstances of the fraudulent granting of Belize Permanent Residency status and nationality that appeared to have been facilitated by Ministers of Government. Immigration Officers, employees, JPs, residents, citizens and Directors so that a criminal investigation is launched.
- 40) The Commissioner of Police is informed about those circumstances of the fraudulent entries in the Belizean Permanent Residency Permit Number Book. That Immigration Officer, Ady Pacheco, and other who are found to have assisted, are investigated for their role in those fraudulent activities.

- 41) The Commissioner of Police is informed about those circumstances of fraudulent Permanent Residency Permit stamps seen in native Passports signed by former Director, Miss Ruth Meighan.
- 42) The Belize Permanent Residency of each person who was fraudulently issued PR Permit numbers is revoked and that the Commissioner of Police investigates each recipient and visa sponsor for their role in Immigration fraud.



# Appendices

## NATIONALITY

### Section II



## **Appendix A**

The following is the list of persons who received Belize nationality under Section 10 Registration and also received their first issue Belize passports who did not meet the requirements for Belizean nationality

This list does not include all those who did not qualify through other violations under Section 10 Registration such as: persons who were not interviewed, persons with Nationality Referees who did not meet the 5-year period of acquaintance with the applicant, or persons who did not take their oath of Allegiance etc. Those persons are listed at other Tables and Appendices as mentioned in the Nationality Report.

(We could not ascertain if all those who received Belize Nationality certificates received Belize passports due to time constraints but some may have changed their names before they were issued Belize passports.)



| Name  | Country of Birth  | Date of Entry  | Visa Number & Issue Date | Nationality Certificate # & Date   | Minister who signed Nationality Certificate / Minister's name seen printed on Replacement Certificate and INS Director who replaced certificate | Belize Passport Number Issued & Date | Additional Observations  |
|---|-------------------|--|--------------------------|--|---|--------------------------------------|--|
| Won Hong Kim<br>(Wonhong Kim or Kim Won Hong) | Republic of Korea | He did not Enter Belize. BPIS Report appeared as a picture of a picture and no fingerprints were captured.<br><br>(See Passport Audit Report & Nationality Audit Report) | No Visa found issued     | 28577/13 dated 22nd April 2013.<br><br>No entry was made in the Register of Citizens by Registration.<br><br>In the Certificate Numbers Book certificate number 28577 was entered on the 2 <sup>nd</sup> September 2013 so Wonhong Kim's nationality certificate number 28577 was fraudulently backdated | Elvin Penner  | P0246777 issued 9th September 2013   | He was issued Fraudulent PR# 44578 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> October 2012, which had been issued to Josue David Coc Uck of Guatemala.<br><br>Copy of what appeared as a fraudulently manufactured Republic of Korea passport was used for his passport application.<br><br>No PR file #; no evidence of payment of PR fee.<br><br>See Passport Report |

| Name  | Country of Birth | Date of Entry  | Visa Number & Issue Date   | Nationality Certificate # & Date                    | Minister who signed Nationality Certificate / Minister's name seen printed on Replacement Certificate and INS Director who replaced certificate | Belize Passport Number Issued & Date          | Additional Observations   |
|---|------------------|--|--|---|---|---|---|
| Dong Tao Jin<br>(Dongtao Jin)                                     | China            | 2-June-2013 through PGIA (United Airlines flight 1410). He used Chinese passport #G33244420 issue date 8-Jan-2009. Also US Visa #20131370020004 issued 20-May-2013 | Visa# 191/13 V00037038<br>Issued 2-June-2013   | 28382/13 dated 19-May-2013 (back-dated certificate) | Elvin Penner  | P0238518<br>issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2013  | He had 2 Chinese passports: For Belize passport application on 6-June-2013 he used irregular Chinese passport #G33244420 issue date 8-Jan-2007 (see Report). His Nationality file was missing from the Department |
| Xi Wang<br>(aka James Louis Wang<br>Ref. Belize Vital Statistics) | China            | Date entered Belize is unknown but "wished to travel to Belize 20 <sup>th</sup> January 2013" was seen on his visa application                                     | V00036693<br>issued 15-January 2013<br>issued on Chinese Passport G58039971 issue date 7-Feb-2012/expired 6-Feb-2022 | 28428/13 dated 4-June-2013<br>File #27791           | Elvin Penner  | P0238890<br>issued 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 | His Nationality file showed a bogus entry date of 7-June-2007 through the Northern Border as seen in Chinese Passport G21159033 issued 12-Feb-07/expired 11-Feb-2017.   |

## Appendix B

The following is the list of persons who received fraudulent Belizean nationality certificates under Section 10 & 11A Registration and first issue Belizean passports and did not appear in person to capture their biometrics

**i) Persons who received Belize nationality certificates under Section 10 Registration and First Issue Belize passports but did not appear in person to capture their biometrics**

| Name                        | Country of Birth  | Date of Entry   | Visa Number & Issue Date | Nationality Certificate # & Date/ or File # | Minister who signed Nationality Certificate / Minister's name seen printed on Replacement Certificate and INS Director who replaced certificate | Belize Passport Number Issued & Date | Officers who processed Passport Application & Belize Passport  | Additional Observations   |
|-----------------------------|-------------------|---|--------------------------|---|---|--------------------------------------|--|---|
| Won Hong Kim (Kim Won Hong) | Republic of Korea | Did not Enter Belize. BPIS Report appeared as a picture of a picture and no fingerprints were captured. | No Visa Issued           | 28577/13 dated 22nd April 2013              | Elvin Penner  | P0246777 issued 9th September 2013   | Counter Clerk & Counter Supervisor: Omar Philips, Data Entry & QA: Erwin Robinson, Approved: Sharon Flowers, Print & Delivered | Fraudulent PR# 44578 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> October 2012.<br><br>Copy of what appeared as a fraudulently manufactured |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |                                   |   |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|-----------------------------------|---|
|  |  | (See Passport Audit Report & Nationality Audit Report) |  |  |  |  | Passport to recipient: Mark Tench | <p>Republic of Korea passport was used for his passport application.</p> <p>No PR file #; no evidence of payment of PR fee. PR # had been issued to Josue David Coc Uck of Guatemala; Passport Recommenders were Minister Elvin Penner and Alfonso Cruz Jr. JP (Minister Penner's Aide) See Passport Report.</p> <p>Belize address used was Piccini Area, Belmopan, Cayo District</p> |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|-----------------------------------|---|

## Appendix B.1

The following is the list of persons who received nationality certificates under Section 10, Section 11A and certificates through Descent who did not present themselves to a Passport Office or Foreign Mission for “live” photographs and fingerprints to be captured when their Belize passports were renewed

### i) Section 10

| Name of Applicant | Country of Birth | Nationality Certificate & Date  | Minister who signed Certificate/ Director who Replaced | Previous Passport Renewed & Issue Date/ Comments | New Passport Number/ Date Issued               | Observations on BPIS Passport Report   | Observations   |
|-------------------|------------------|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| Jerry Kwan        | China            | 18473/01 dated 22 <sup>nd</sup> January 2002<br><br>Certificate #18473 had been issued to Arlen Lang on 26 <sup>th</sup> May 2005. BNA File #20071 under Section 10 | Copy was not seen                                      | P0104249 issued 7-May-2009                       | P0220244 issued 16 <sup>th</sup> November 2012 | BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture and no fingerprints were captured.<br><br>Applicant appeared much younger in this BPIS photo than in the photo seen in a copy of his passport | No Nationality File presented.<br><br>Passport recommender was Ailing Li, JP<br><br>Counter Clerk: Omar Philips, Data Entry: Romi Rosas, Approved: |

|   |       |   |                 |   |   |   |  |
|---|-------|---|-----------------|---|---|---|--|
|   |       |   |                 |   |   | <p>P0104249 issued 7-May-2009 as seen attached to his 2012 <b>application</b>)</p>                  | <p>Sharon Flowers, Print: Eleud Romero, QA: Omar Philips. No one signed as officer who issued to recipient.</p> <p>Belize address used was 9 Miles Northern Highway</p>                            |
| Jie Lun Chen (formerly Qiau Chao Chen ) | China | 16178/02 dated 12 <sup>th</sup> April 2002. Name Qiau Chao Chen seen in Register Section 10 but nationality file had bogus Referees | Maxwell Samuels | P0097778 issued 17 <sup>th</sup> November 2008 in the name Qiau Chao Chen | <p>P0166912 was printed on 30-May-2011 and spoiled on 2-June-2011</p> <p>&amp;</p> <p>P0167857 issue date 2-June-2011</p> | <p>BPIS photo of applicant appeared as a picture of a picture and no fingerprints were captured</p> | <p>His Nationality file was examined and it had bogus referees (Therese Cabral and Theodore Hulse) 4 adults who may have been unrelated were also seen in Nationality file #16984. Nationality</p> |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |   |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | <p>certificate was amended by Maria Marin for Director on 10<sup>th</sup> June 2011.</p> <p>Passport Recommender was Ailing Li. Counter Clerk &amp; Print: Elick Chan, Data Entry: Erwin Robinson, Approved without biometric check and QA Pass: Sharon Flowers. No one signed as issued to recipient. Belize address used was #80 Freetown Road, Belize City</p> |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|

## Appendix C1

The following is the list of persons with irregular and or fraudulent nationality certificates and certificate numbers under Section 10 & Section 11A for who one or more persons on the nationality certificates appeared in person to renew previously issued Belize passports.

*Also listed below are the names of persons listed as children on some of those certificates even though those persons may not have renewed their passports during the period investigated*

| <b>Name</b> | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate &amp; Date</b>  | <b>Minister/ Director who signed Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Previous Passport Number/ Date Issued</b> | <b>New Passport Number/ Date Issued</b>        | <b>Observations</b>  |
|-------------|-------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Jianbin Liu | China                   | No certificate number seen on certificate/no date<br><br>Certificate #060/1/96 recorded on passport application/ 18-Jan-1996 recorded on | Signature appeared as an irregular signature of Dean Barrow  | P0135521 issued 7 <sup>th</sup> June 2010    | P0222531 issued 20 <sup>th</sup> November 2012 | Passport Recommender was Dexter E. Belisle, JP of Belmopan<br><br>Belize address was #1048 Bachelor, Belize City |



|                          |  |  |                                   |  |   |   |
|--------------------------|--|--|-----------------------------------|--|---|---|
|                          |  | <p>application as certificate date.</p> <p>Certificate series was not seen in any Register</p>   |                                   |  |   |   |
| David Christopher Schart | <p>London Canada stated on Nationality Certificate.</p> <p>Canada was stated on previous Belize passport</p> | <p>7127/97/undated.</p> <p>In the Register of Citizens by Registration certificate #7127/97 had been first issued to Maria Martha Quintanilla (BNA File #7127) dated 25<sup>th</sup> August 1997. The name David Christopher Schart (BNA File #8510) and certificate dated 25<sup>th</sup> August 1997 was entered</p> | Signature appeared as Dean Barrow | P0073164 issued 13 <sup>th</sup> November 2007 | P0237511 issued 24 <sup>th</sup> May 2013 | The address on his Nationality Certificate was 3 ½ Miles Northern Highway and on passport application it was #177 Beltex Crescent |

|                  |               |  |   |  |   |  |
|------------------|---------------|--|---|--|---|--|
|                  |               | above the name<br>Maria Martha<br>Quintanilla in<br>the Register.  |   |  |   |  |
| Wen-Shin<br>Chou | Taiwan, China | Replacement<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>#20958/07<br>dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> June<br>2007.<br>Section 10<br>Register had<br>the name<br>Ching-Mei<br>Chung at first<br>with no<br>children added<br>then white-out<br>used to cover<br>hyphen and 1<br>child added on<br>the right;<br>Replacement<br>Certificate had<br>the name<br>Ching-Mei<br>Chou-Chung. | Name printed<br>on<br>Replacement<br>Certificate<br>was Ralph<br>Fonseca but it<br>was replaced<br>on 8 <sup>th</sup> May<br>2013 by<br>Maria Marin | P0124933<br>issued 2 <sup>nd</sup><br>October 2010<br>which she<br>claimed was<br>lost | P0239705 issued 21 <sup>st</sup><br>June 2013 | Passport<br>Recommenders were<br>Sydney Codd, JP of<br>San Ignacio and<br>Patricia Willacey,<br>teacher of<br>Belmopan.<br>Applicant stated she<br>lived on San Andres<br>Road, Corozal.<br><br>Social Security Card<br>was issued 23 <sup>rd</sup> July<br>2010<br><br>Nationality File<br>#20879 requested on<br>19-June-2014 but<br>was not presented.<br>Applicant renewed<br>passports frequently<br>(See Passport<br>Report) |

## Appendix C

The following is the list of persons who received Belize nationality certificates under Section 11A (BECIP) Registration and received first issue Belize passports for which they appeared in person for biometrics

| Name                                | Country of Birth | Date of Entry | Visa Number & Issue Date | Nationality Certificate # & Date   | Minister who signed Nationality Certificate / Minister's name seen printed on Replacement Certificate and INS Director who replaced certificate | Belize Passport Number Issued & Date                                   | Additional Observations   |
|-------------------------------------|------------------|---------------|--------------------------|--|---|--|---|
| Wei Wei Zheng<br><br>(Weiwei Zheng) | China            | Not known     | None seen issued         | Fraudulent Replacement Certificate #069/1/97 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> October 1997.<br><br>Certificate number series was not seen in any Register | Name on Certificate was Hon. Eduardo Juan but replaced by what appeared to be the signature of Gareth Murillo on 11-Feb-2008                    | P0221593 issued 2 <sup>nd</sup> November 2012 in the name Weiwei Zheng | Passport Recommender was Eleodoro Lewis who also filled in the passport application form for the applicant. Her Belize address was stated as Camalote Village. Fraudulent Nationality certificate and deed poll had address as 2 ½ Miles Northern Highway.<br><br>BECIP Registration program issued passports at the same time of approval so a |

|                                |       |         |                  |  |   |   |  |
|--------------------------------|-------|---------|------------------|--|---|---|--|
|                                |       |         |                  |  |   |   | <p>1<sup>st</sup> issue passport for the BECIP program was irregular.</p> <p>Her Belize Social Security Card #000504687 was issued 29<sup>th</sup> October 2012. Copy of Chinese passport #G52828133 had an issue date of 24<sup>th</sup> June 2011</p>  |
| Ben Wang<br>(Ching Hsuan Wang) | China | Unknown | None seen issued | <p>Fraudulent Replacement Nationality certificate #2182/92 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> April 1992 in the name Zhicai Wang and two children added: Wang, Shou and Wang, Ching-Hsuan. In the Register Section 11A, certificate #2182 was seen as issued to Wang Zhi Cai and one (1) child included not 2 as</p> | Hon Said Musa printed on certificate but replaced by what appeared as the signature of Gareth Murillo on 1 <sup>st</sup> March 2009 | P0163772 on the 26 <sup>th</sup> April 2011 | <p>Address on passport application was Camalote Village</p> <p>No identification was presented by applicant. Counter Clerk's signature could not be verified but it appeared similar to Immigration Officer, Teresita Cooch's signature</p> <p>BECIP Registration program issued passports at the same</p> |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
|  |  |  |  | seen on fraudulent Replacement Nationality certificate |  |  | <p>time of approval so a 1<sup>st</sup> issue passport for the BECIP program was irregular.</p> <p>The deed poll #63/ 2011 dated 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2011 had that name was being changed from Zhicai Wang to Ben Wang then it was marked out and the name Ching Hsuan Wang was recorded instead as though the applicant did not know what was his original name.</p> <p>No Nationality file presented</p> <p>Passport Recommender was JP, Hsia, Chien Hung of 49 Miles Western Highway, Camalote</p> |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|

## Appendix D

The following is the list of copies of native passports that showed inconsistencies with Belize entry dates and period of residency (Section 10 & 11) as seen during the examination of nationality files

| <b>Name of Applicant for Nationality</b> | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate#</b> | <b>Current Address as per Certificate</b> | <b>Copies of Applicant's Passport with Record of Visas Issued (Ensure that applicant had been in the country for 5 consecutive years) 1 year for by Marriage</b>   |
|--|-------------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|
| Mohamed Owemer                           | Dammam, Saudi Arabia    | 25221/11                        | Mile 2 Northern Highway                   | Passport #0001437 issued 28-April-2008 had visa for Belize issued 15-March-2011 and expired 15-June-2011 for "single" entry issued at Belize High Commission, London by Tanya Hulse. Applicant entered Belize 11-June-2011 and was issued up to 10-July-2011/. His visa received at London had already expired when he was in Belize. Nat Cert dated 21/6/2011 and oath taken 24/6/11. Applicant had no proof of 1 year domicile period in Belize. |

|                            |                      |   |   |   |
|----------------------------|----------------------|---|---|---|
| Muhammad Zaghlool          | Sialkot,<br>Pakistan | 23919/10 dated 20-Aug-2010 signed by Carlos Perdomo | #6111 Dolphin Drive,<br>Belize City             | Visa issued at Consulate of Belize Singapore for Tourism dated 2-April-2008 to 1-July-2008; Earliest Belize permit stamp dated 19-June-2008/ by 30-Sept-2008 applicant was already married to a Belizean at the Islamic Mission in Belize; no Referral for vetting was done by Investigation Section  |
| Shu-Tang Chang (applicant) | Taiwan<br>ROC        | 12504/00 dated 4-July-2000                          | 29 Albert Street,<br>Apartment #10, Belize City | Page with Visa stamp dated 18-Aug-1995 was attached to passport biometric page but page did not have the passport #M10947680 that was on applicant's biometric passport page copy   |
| Chung Pao-Chu Chang (wife) | Taiwan<br>ROC        | 12503/00 dated 4-July-2000                          | 29 Albert Street,<br>Apartment #10, Belize City | Page with Visa stamp dated 26-Jan-1998 was attached to passport biometric page but page did not have the passport #M10947678 that was on applicant's biometric passport page copy. There was also a stamp that stated "Paroled Until: Indefinite; Purpose:Public Interest (other Taiwan document was attached with a Belize Immigration stamp; the date stamped was not clear but someone wrote in pen 14.08.93 as arrival date and wrote PR 17692/93 dd 28.04.1993 |

## Appendix E

The following is the list of nationality files which were examined that did not have the relevant native passports of the applicants to indicate their dates of entry into Belize

| <b>File #</b> | <b>Name of Applicant for Nationality</b>           | <b>Nationality Certificate #</b> | <b>Copies of Applicant's Passport with Record of Visas Issued</b>                  |
|---------------|--|----------------------------------|--|
| 14310/00      | Wen-Cheng Chang<br>(aka Eric Chang)                | 12505/00 dated 4-July-2000       | No passport copy in file   |
| 26174         | Youna Fei<br>Children: Zenan Fei and Hao Zhang Fei | 25369/11                         | Only the Recent Passport was Presented issued in 2009, no copy of the previous one |
| 25930/11      | Dayana Abigail De Paz                              | 25206/11                         | Only the Recent Passport was Presented issued in 2007                              |
| 26178/11      | BinYue Xiao  | 25370/11                         | Only the Recent Passport was Presented issued in 2010; no copy of the previous one |
| 26637/11      | Clara Luz Marquez Leonardo                         | 27114/12                         | Only the Recent Passport was Presented issued in 2010; no copy of the previous one |
| 28700/12      | Ezekwere Gerald Umenwa                             | 28292/12                         | NO. Passport got Lost but a Police Report was provided.                            |
| 26466/11      | Geisy Saucedo Molina                               | 27135/12                         | NO   |



## Appendix E.1

The following is the list of nationality files that did not have letters from the Financial Intelligence Unit or applicants' native countries verifying that applicants had not been declared bankrupt under any law in force in any country and had not been discharged

| <b>File #</b> | <b>Name of Applicant for Nationality</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate#</b> | <b>Current Address as per Certificate</b>              | <b>Country of Birth</b> |
|---------------|--|---------------------------------|--|-------------------------|
| 30755/07      | Talal Ahmad Harmouch                     | 21216/07                        | Pescador Drive, San Pedro (Harmouch's Center Ltd.)     | El Noury, Lebanon       |
| 26442/11      | Siya Li                                  | No Certificate in file          | #14 Second Street/ Corozal Town on General Declaration | Guangdong, China        |
| 14310/00      | Shu-Tang Chang (applicant)               | 12504/00 dated 4-July-2000      | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City           | Taiwan ROC              |
| 14310/00      | Chung Pao-Chu Chang (wife)               | 12503/00 dated 4-July-2000      | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City           | Taiwan ROC              |
| 14310/00      | Wen-Cheng Chang (aka Eric Chang)         | 12505/00 dated 4-July-2000      | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City           | Taiwan ROC              |
| 14310/00      | Kang-Chih Chang (aka Andy Chang)         | 12506/00 dated 4-July-2000      | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City           | Taiwan ROC              |

## Appendix E.2

The following is the list of nationality applicants who did not present proof that they were not dependants of a citizen of Belize and proof that they had sufficient means to maintain themselves and were not likely to become a public charge

| <b>BNA File #</b>            | <b>Name of Applicant</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate#</b>                   | <b>Current Address</b>                             | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Employment letter</b> | <b>Bank Statement</b> |
|------------------------------|--------------------------|---|--|-------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| 30755/07                     | Talal Ahmad Harmouch     | 21216/07  | Pescador Drive, San Pedro (Harmouch's Center Ltd.) | El Noury, Lebanon       | No                       | No                    |
| 26081/11                     | Mohamed Owemer           | 25221/11  | Mile 2 Northern Highway                            | Dammam, Saudi Arabia    | No                       | No                    |
| 26419/11                     | Fengwan Yu               | 25697/11 dated 24-Nov-2011 in the name Fengwan Lu | #48 5th Avenue, Corozal Town                       | Guangdong, China        | No                       | No                    |
| 26463/11 applied 9-Nov-2011  | Congzhi Wu               | 25819/11 signed 7-Dec-2011                        | #15 Freetown Road, Belize City                     | Guangdong China         | No                       | No                    |
| 27051/12 applied 4-Jan-2012  | Shu Bin Yu               | 28374/13 dated 25-April-2013                      | 6196 Buttonwood Bay, Belize City                   | Guangdong China         | No                       | No                    |
| 28989/12 applied 15-May-2012 | Ziad Omais               | 28151/13 dated 23-May-2013                        | Santa Rita Road, Corozal                           | Dakar, Senegal          | No                       | No                    |
| 26564/11 applied 7-Dec-2011  | Jin Yu Huang             | 25918/11 dated 13-Dec-2011                        | Punta Gorda Town                                   | Guangdong China         | No                       | No                    |

|  |                       |                               |                                       |                    |    |    |
|--|-----------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------|----|----|
| 26537/11<br>applied 5-Dec-2011             | Wael Harmouch e       | 26324/12<br>dated 11-Jan-2012 | Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town        | El Sfireh, Lebanon | No | No |
| 29584/12<br>applied 12-Sept-2012           | Guo Cheng Xu          | 28423/13<br>dated 3-June-2013 | #59 Main Street, Punta Gorda Town     | Guangdong China    | No | No |
| 26268/12<br>applied 17-Oct-2011            | Wensi Wu              | 25817/11<br>dated 7-Dec-2011  | #15 Freetown Road, Belize City        | Guangdong China    | No | No |
| 27378<br>applicatio n dated 11-Jan-2012    | Hani Harmouch         | 28411/13<br>dated 30-May-2013 | Escalante Subdivision, San Pedro Town | Sfire, Lebanon     | No | No |
| 27241<br>applicatio n dated 10-Jan-2012    | Abdul Rahman Harmouch | 26364/12<br>dated 11-Jan-2012 | Coconut Drive, san Pedro              | El Sfireh, Lebanon | No | No |
| 26505/11<br>applicatio n dated 9-Nov-2011  | Tian Zhi Wang         | 25698/11<br>dated 24-Nov-2011 | Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan     | Hubei, China       | No | No |
| 27216/12<br>applicatio n dated 10-Jan-2012 | Oussama Harmouch      | 26426/12<br>dated 11-Jan-2012 | Hurricane Street                      | El Sfireh, Lebanon | No | No |
| 26543/11<br>applicatio n dated 5-Dec-2011  | Saad Mohamad Harmouch | 26328/12<br>dated 11-Jan-2012 | Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town        | El Sfireh, Lebanon | No | No |

|   |   |   |   |                       |    |    |
|---|---|---|---|-----------------------|----|----|
| 26123/11<br>applicatio<br>n dated<br>28-July-<br>2011 | Lee Yi<br>Lung/<br>Shuming<br>Chen aka<br>Sumi<br>Chen/ Ting<br>Chun Lee<br>& Ni-Yen<br>Lee | 25423/11 &<br>25424/11<br>dated 22-<br>Sept-2011  | 3 Mile<br>Northern<br>Highway                             | Taiwan<br>ROC         | No | No |
| 26647/11<br>applicatio<br>n dated 7-<br>Dec-2011      | Jinfan<br>Chen  | 25922/11<br>dated 13-<br>Dec-2011   | 34<br>Hummingbir<br>d Highway,<br>Stann Creek<br>District | Guangdong<br>China    | No | No |
| 26670/11<br>applicatio<br>n dated 9-<br>Dec-2011      | Samir<br>Mouhamed<br>Harmouch   | 26406/12<br>dated 17-<br>Jan-2012   | Pescador<br>Drive, San<br>Pedro Town                      | El Sfireh,<br>Lebanon | No | No |
| 26208/11<br>applicatio<br>n dated 7-<br>Sept-2011     | Dong<br>Sheng<br>Zheng  | 25901/11<br>dated 14-<br>Dec-2011   | Main Street,<br>Caye<br>Caulker                           | Guangdong<br>China    | No | No |
| 26535/11<br>applicatio<br>n dated 7-<br>Dec-2011      | Ahmad<br>Harmouch<br>e  | 26363/12<br>dated 11-<br>Jan-2012<br>(applicant<br>did not<br>qualify until<br>30-Sept-<br>2012 or 1-<br>October-<br>2013 | Hurricane<br>Street, San<br>Pedro Town                    | El Sfireh,<br>Lebanon | No | No |
| 26535/11<br>Applicati<br>on dated<br>5-Dec-<br>2011   | Ahmad<br>Harmouch<br>e  | 26239/12<br>dated 5-Jan-<br>2012  | San Pedro<br>Ambergris<br>Caye                            | El Sfire,<br>Lebanon  | No | No |

|  |   |  |   |                       |    |    |
|--|---|--|---|-----------------------|----|----|
| 29551/12<br>application dated<br>23-Jan-2013       | Ezzine<br>Chinnaya<br>Ngele Udo   | 28302/13<br>dated 22-<br>April-2013<br>signed by<br>Minister<br>Penner | 24 Central<br>American<br>Boulevard,<br>Belize City | Aba,<br>Nigeria       | No | No |
| 27135/12<br>application dated 9-<br>Jan-2012       | Ammar<br>Harmouch   | 26321/12<br>dated 11-<br>Jan-2012                                      | Sea Grape<br>Drive, San<br>Pedro                    | El Sfireh,<br>Lebanon | No | No |
| 15686/01<br>applied<br>17-July-<br>2001            | David Lee<br>(George Li<br>or Song<br>Xiao Li)<br>app also<br>Liu Hui<br>(wife) &<br>Li<br>Mengzhe<br>(child) | 14382/01 &<br>14383/01<br>dated 23-<br>July-2001                       | #56<br>Freetown<br>Road, Belize<br>City             | Zhejiang,<br>China    | No | No |
| 27791/13<br>application dated 3-<br>May-<br>2013   | Xi Wang<br>(James<br>Louis<br>Wang)   | 28428/13<br>dated 4-<br>June-2013<br>signed by<br>Elvin Penner         | Camalote<br>Village,<br>Cayo<br>District            | Jiangsu,<br>China     | No | No |
| 17289/02<br>application dated<br>10-April-<br>2002 | Lihua Wu<br>(also for<br>wife<br>Huazhen<br>Xiao and<br>children<br>Cuiyue Wu<br>& Lan<br>Chen                | 16602/02 &<br>16603/02<br>dated 31-<br>May-2002                        | #71 North<br>Front Street,<br>Belize City           | Fujian,<br>China      | No | No |
| 13736/99<br>application dated<br>16-Dec-<br>1999   | Hong<br>Yuan She  | 11879/00<br>dated 4-<br>March-2000<br>signed by<br>Jorge Espat         | #5455<br>Hummingbird<br>Highway,<br>Belmopan        | Liaoning,<br>China    | No | No |

|          |  |          |                                      |  |    |    |
|----------|--|----------|--------------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 26174    | Youna Fei & Children:<br>Zenan Fei and Hao Zhang Fei | 25369/11 | 7th Ave,<br>CZL Town                 |  | No | No |
| 25930/11 | Dayana Abigail De Paz                                | 25206/11 | 5 Gristock St, OWT                   |  | No | No |
| 25353    | Mauricio Evora Melgar                                | 24784/11 | Valley of Peace                      |  | No | No |
| 26168/11 | Yagen Miao & Child: Jing Chi Miao                    | 25368/11 | 7 Ave, CZL Town                      |  | No | No |
| 26178/11 | BinYue Xiao  | 25370/11 | 43 Kings St, Belize City             |  | No | No |
| 25958/11 | Dongsoo Kim  | 25225/11 | 5 Sibun St, BMP                      |  | No | No |
| 25017/09 | Sara Ajcac   | 27338/12 | Camalote Village                     |  | No | No |
| 25944/11 | Cristobal De Jesus Leonardo Morales                  | 26447/12 | 24 Landivar St, Kings Park, Bze City |  | No | No |
| 26332/11 | Arnulfo Escobar Regalado                             | 27915/12 | San Pedro Town                       |  | No | No |
| 26637/11 | Clara Luz Marquez Leonardo                           | 27114/12 | St. Peters Rd, BMP                   |  | No | No |
| 27258    | Wajih Harmouch                                       | 26412/12 | Pescador Drive                       |  | No | No |
| 27403    | Husband:<br>Alvaro Jiron                             | 26804/12 | Duck Run II                          |  | No | No |
| 27403    | Wife:<br>Katherine Roxana Jiron                      | 26804/12 | Duck Run II                          |  | No | No |
| 25862/11 | Husband:<br>Dennis Leroy Feucht                      | 27375/12 | San Ignacio Town                     |  | No | No |

|          |   |                             |   |        |    |    |
|----------|---|-----------------------------|---|--------|----|----|
| 25862/11 | Wife:<br>Dorothy<br>Ann<br>Feucht                           | 27376/12                    | San Ignacio<br>Town                       |        | No | No |
| 27464    | Roberto<br>Igarza   | 26795/12                    | #33 Calle<br>America,<br>Salvapan<br>Area |        | No | No |
| 25292/09 | Husband:<br>Yih Wei<br>Ku                                   | 25202/11                    | Succotz<br>Village                        |        | No | No |
| 25292/09 | Wife: Yun-<br>Ying Chen                                     | 25203/11                    | Succotz<br>Village                        |        | No | No |
| 26244/11 | Ali Zaouali   | 25506/11                    | #9 Barrack<br>Rd, Bze City                | France | No | No |
| 25894/11 | Jun Zhang   | 25384/11                    | #16 6th St,<br>North CZL<br>Town          |        | No | No |
| 26147/11 | Lisset<br>Penalver<br>Betancourt                            | 25483/11                    | 23A Julias<br>Villas, San<br>Pedro Town   |        | No | No |
| 26214/11 | Cui Xiang<br>Ma   | 25508/11                    | 4417 Nim Li<br>Punit St,<br>BMP           |        | No | No |
| 30738/07 | Parent:<br>Chun Mei<br>Tan &<br>Child: Hui<br>Yu Tan        | 25058/11 &<br>25058.1/11    | Barrier Reef<br>Dr. San<br>Pedro          |        | No | No |
| 26/30/11 | Ying Ji   | 25493/11                    | Constitution<br>Dr, BMP                   |        | No | No |
| 25744/11 | Zhuo Chao<br>He   | 25057/11                    | Bella Vista<br>Village                    |        | No | No |
| 25539/10 | Parent:<br>Efrain<br>Lopez &<br>Child:<br>Salvador<br>Lopez | 24771/11<br>&24771.1/1<br>1 | Cow Pen<br>Village                        |        | No | No |
| 25309/09 | Husband:<br>Chong<br>Yang Zhao                              | 24898/11                    | 7069 George<br>Price Blvd,<br>BMP         |        | No | No |
| 25309/09 | Wife: Hui<br>Xia Ou   | 24899/11                    | 7069 George<br>Price Blvd,<br>BMP         |        | No | No |

|          |  |                             |  |  |            |    |
|----------|--|-----------------------------|--|--|------------|----|
| 25166/09 | Nidian<br>Concepcion Moralez<br>Gonzalez                                   | 25626/11                    | Cotton Tree<br>Village                     |  | No         | No |
| 25665/10 | Fang Ling<br>Wu  | 27793/12                    | #10-12<br>Halfmoon<br>Ave, BMP             |  | No         | No |
| 25319/09 | Michael<br>Jadher<br>Medina  | 24779/11                    | #2B<br>Curasow St,<br>BZE City             |  | <b>Yes</b> | No |
| 25418/10 | Dhaliwal<br>Gurpreet<br>Singh  | 24799/11                    | #6 Nargusta<br>St, BMP                     |  | No         | No |
| 25112/09 | Tzu Ling<br>Lin  | 25052/11                    | #38 Santa<br>Familia St,<br>OWT            |  | No         | No |
| 25057/09 | Victor<br>Enrique<br>Acevedo   | 24797/11                    | 18.5 Miles<br>S/C Valley<br>Rd             |  | No         | No |
| 26125/11 | Nan Liu  | 25490/11                    | Constitution<br>Dr, BMP                    |  | No         | No |
| 26027    | Husband:D<br>anilo<br>Leonicio<br>Verganza<br>Herrarte                     | 25676/11                    | Calla Creek<br>Village                     |  | No         | No |
| 26027    | Wife: Luz<br>Maria<br>Verganza<br>& Child:<br>Robin<br>Abraham<br>Verganza | 25677/11<br>&25677.1/1<br>1 | Calla Creek<br>Village                     |  | No         | No |
| 24189/07 | Barbara<br>Deed<br>Bediko  | 24912/11                    | Seine Bight<br>Village                     |  | No         | No |
| 26152/11 | Jason Ray<br>Kropf   | 28114/13                    | Mile 28<br>Hummingbir<br>d Highway,<br>S/C |  | No         | No |
| 26466/11 | Geisy<br>Sauceda<br>Molina   | 27135/12                    | 1631 Spain<br>Ave, Bze<br>City             |  | No         | No |
| 26800/11 | Belisario<br>Francisco<br>Najera   | 26211/12                    | Santa Barbara<br>St, Santa Cruz<br>Area    |  | No         | No |



|          |  |          |                              |  |            |    |
|----------|--|----------|------------------------------|--|------------|----|
| 25244/09 | Lizanka Isabel Herrera                   | 27935/12 | #5 Dunn St, Kings Park Area  |  | <b>Yes</b> | No |
| 28005/12 | Sindy Corina Chohuoj Chan                | 27153/12 | 3rd St, San Ignacio          |  | No         | No |
| 28931/12 | Jose Carbajal Mena                       | 28107/12 | Santa Rosa St, OWT           |  | No         | No |
| 26157/11 | Yahaira Gonzalez                         | 27767/12 | Monument Site, Dangriga Town |  | No         | No |
| 28580/12 | Jeffrey David Pfaender                   | 28275/12 | Esperanza Village, Cayo      |  | <b>Yes</b> | No |
| 25911/11 | Parent: Zhenyu Chen & Child: Xiaona Chen | 26219/12 | Pomona Village               |  | No         | No |
| 25825/11 | Gregoria Barreto De Campos               | 26476/12 | Camalote Village             |  | No         | No |
| 29235/12 | Yong Xing Zhu                            | 28387/13 | Bullet Tree Rd               |  | No         | No |
| 29284/12 | Yong Zhi Huang                           | 28298/13 | Freetown Rd, Bze City        |  | No         | No |
| 25664/11 | Hui Juan Liu                             | 27686/12 | 40 Mahogany St, Bze City     |  | No         | No |
| 25673/10 | Ting Yu Chao A.K.A Taffany Chao          | 27795/12 | #10-12 Halfmoon Ave, BMP     |  | No         | No |
| 28093    | Richard Adu Yeboah                       | 28046/12 | South St, CZL Town           |  | <b>Yes</b> | No |
|          |  |          |                              |  |            |    |

|          |  |          |                                |  |            |    |
|----------|--|----------|--------------------------------|--|------------|----|
| 26234/11 | Lidia Azucena Diaz Najera                                    | 27812/12 | #28 Maravillas Ave, BMP        |  | No         | No |
| 27790/12 | Clayton Thomas Greenidge                                     | 28295/13 | #5963 B Campus Ave, Bze City   |  | <b>Yes</b> | No |
| 25622/10 | Julian I. Escobar  | 25081/11 | Armenia Village                |  | No         | No |
| 27414/12 | Azeez Wale Ogunmoye  | 28272/12 | #7 Santa Rita Height, CZL Town |  | No         | No |
| 27595    | Jesus Angel Rafailan Machuca                                 | 26967/12 | Lousville Village              |  | No         | No |
| 29281/12 | Kudzai Pahwaringira  | 28274/12 | 106 Scholar Ave, BMP           |  | No         | No |
| 29131    | Dina Jesus Salazar Perez                                     | 28249/13 | Duck Run III                   |  | No         | No |
| 28738/12 | Husband: Robin James   | 28216/12 | Bullet Tree Rd                 |  | No         | No |
| 28738/12 | Wife: Betty James  | 28217/12 | Bullet Tree Rd                 |  | No         | No |
| 27951    | Parent: Coralia Flores & Child: Harold Rafael Flores Estrada | 28336/13 | Tulip St, San Ignacio          |  | No         | No |
| 29157/12 | Jose Raul Guerra Cartagena                                   | 28327/13 | #10 Flor De Mayo St, BMP       |  | No         | No |
| 28538/12 | Gabriela Barrera   | 28035/12 | Kontiki Area, San Ignacio      |  | No         | No |
| 31538/07 | Juana Edy Miranda  | 26058/11 | Carmelita Village, OWT         |  | No         | No |

|          |   |          |                                 |  |    |    |
|----------|---|----------|---------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 26110/11 | Iris<br>Behatriz<br>Linarez<br>Gomez        | 26895/12 | 14 Bliss<br>Drive, OWT          |  | No | No |
| 26673/11 | Nathan<br>Glenn<br>Hessler                  | 28142/12 | Duck Run II                     |  | No | No |
| 26605/11 | Felipa<br>Tzunux<br>Tzunun                  | 26095/11 | #60 4th Ave,<br>CZL Town        |  | No | No |
| 28504/12 | Edgar<br>Anzuelo<br>Diaz                    | 27390/12 | 2604 Mercy<br>Lane, Bze<br>City |  | No | No |
| 26710/11 | Aidee<br>Isabel<br>Orellano<br>Hernandez    | 26491/12 | San Pedro<br>Village            |  | No | No |
| 28252/12 | Beatriz De<br>Jesus<br>Rodriguez            | 27561/12 | Trial Farm<br>Village,<br>OWT   |  | No | No |
| 26045/11 | Baudillo<br>Maximino<br>Lopez<br>Hernandez  | 27391/12 | Franks Eddy<br>Village          |  | No | No |
| 19151/08 | Vidal<br>Castillo<br>Bodden                 | 25869/11 | Escalante<br>Sub, San<br>Pedro  |  | No | No |
| 22323/06 | Felicita<br>Caballero<br>Aguilar De<br>Ruiz | 24622/11 | San Juan<br>Village             |  | No | No |
| 22588/06 | Isis Barina<br>Ramos                        | 25293/11 | Cristo Rey                      |  | No | No |
| 28042/12 | Dania<br>Marleny<br>Ramirez                 | 27193/12 | Burrel Boom<br>Village          |  | No | No |
| 25793/11 | Andrew<br>Hunt                              | 28022/13 | Belize<br>Jungle<br>Home        |  | No | No |
| 29252/12 | Wei Yue<br>Chen                             | 28094/12 | #29 7th Ave,<br>CZL Town        |  | No | No |
| 31121    | Eline<br>Carolina<br>Rodriguez              | 24624/11 | 11.5 Miles,<br>Pomona<br>Valley |  | No | No |

|          |   |            |                                 |  |    |    |
|----------|---|------------|---------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 28592/12 | Valvin Seymour Duff   | 27546/12   | #134 Mitchell Estate, Ladyville |  | No | No |
| 26218/11 | Ali Mohamed Akil Rada   | 25789/11   | #58 Santa Rita Rd               |  | No | No |
| 23548/07 | Parent: Irma Reyes Guzman & Child: Karen Julissa Reyes Guzman | 24811/11   | Otro Benque Rd                  |  | No | No |
| 29574/12 | Rosa Molina Gough   | 28267/12   | #54 Daly St, BZE City           |  | No | No |
| 27019/12 | Jaziba Nasser   | 27219/12   | Escalante Sub, San Pedro        |  | No | No |
| 26590/11 | Parent: Elena Bachan Canahui & Child Ever Alexander Bachan    | 27140/12   | Maravillas St, BMP              |  | No | No |
| 26005/11 | Yue Hao Yan   | 25218/11   | #6898 Mahogany St, Bze City     |  | No | No |
| 29962/13 | Husband: Ming Feng Chen                                       | 28403/13   | #4424 Nimli Punit St.           |  | No | No |
| 29962/13 | Wife: Shu Lian Deng   | 28404/13   | #4424 Nimli Punit St.           |  | No | No |
| 22806/07 | Parent: Blanca Haydee Perez & Child: Cesat Geovanny Perez     | 27715.1/12 | Benque Viejo Town               |  | No | No |

|          |  |          |  |  |    |    |
|----------|--|----------|--|--|----|----|
| 28411/12 | Perla Maythe Maza  | 27364/12 | High St, Santa Elena                   |  | No | No |
| 26023    | Zoila Nohemy Portillo  | 27395/12 | Valley of Peace                        |  | No | No |
| 27249/12 | Dilma Haydee Calderon  | 26544/12 | San Estevan Village                    |  | No | No |
| 28540/12 | Miriam Batres  | 28038/12 | Kontiki Area, San Ignacio              |  | No | No |
| 25424/10 | Xi Lian Ruan   | 24602/11 | #33 George Price Ave, Santa Elena Cayo |  | No | No |
| 25907/11 | Erick Ernesto Villalta Gomez   | 26532/12 | Cristo Rey, Cayo                       |  | No | No |
| 25678/10 | Parent: Olasunmb o Olawunmi Ogungobi & Child: Olabanji Samuel Ogunjobi | 25083/11 | #4 Flowers St, BMP                     |  | No | No |
| 27560/12 | Beatriz Esmeralda Guerra   | 27417/12 | #51 George St, BVC                     |  | No | No |
| 28079/12 | Narry Nadith Euceda Artica   | 27889/12 | 3 Hummingbird Ave, BMP                 |  | No | No |
| 27437/11 | Guojie Zhen  | 28152/12 | Bishop Martin St, Santa Elena          |  | No | No |
| 29705/12 | Samuel Evan Ewing  | 28328/13 | #67 Magoon St, Dangriga Town           |  | No | No |
| 29614/12 | Ana Luisa Garcia   | 28330/13 | San Mateo Subdivision, San Pedro Town  |  | No | No |

|          |                                    |          |                                    |  |    |    |
|----------|------------------------------------|----------|------------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 26708/11 | Jorge Josue Argueta Campos         | 26470/12 | Chulavista, CZL Town               |  | No | No |
| 29953/13 | George Carr Leslie                 | 28418/13 | #16 Albert St west, Bze City       |  | No | No |
| 25919/11 | Lin Chun Hung                      | 28093/13 | #1 Forest Drive, BMP               |  | No | No |
| 27441/12 | Berta Veronica Sam Ramirez         | 28133/13 | Central Farm, Cayo                 |  | No | No |
| 26191/11 | Peggy Louise Rasp                  | 28102/13 | YoungGal Rd, Teakettle             |  | No | No |
| 27228/12 | Gurucharan Singh Amar Singh Badwal | 28414/13 | #3 West St, San Ignacio            |  | No | No |
| 28620/12 | Yu Yi Lee                          | 28401/13 | 6070 University Dr, BMP            |  | No | No |
| 18772/12 | Manuel Geovanni Panigua            | 28222/13 | Independence Village               |  | No | No |
| 18980/11 | Sunita Tekchandan                  | 28377/13 | #50 Main St, Punta Gorda Town      |  | No | No |
| 27796/13 | Julie-Ann Keneisha Ellis Bradley   | 28447/13 | #210 Juliet Soberanis St, Bze City |  | No | No |
| 28487/12 | Gurminder Kaur Mangat              | 28422/13 | #41 Benque Rd, San Ignacio         |  | No | No |
| 27509/12 | Yunior Dominguez Alvarez           | 28108/13 | Belama Phase 2, Bze City           |  | No | No |
| 26801/12 | Yan Ping Zhu                       | 28430/13 | Bella Vista Village                |  | No | No |
| 29156/12 | Denzel Lerone Hernandez Brooks     | 28438/13 | 34 Yarborough Rd, Bze City         |  | No | No |

|          |  |          |   |  |    |    |
|----------|--|----------|---|--|----|----|
| 23344/07 | Parent:<br>Olva<br>Castillo<br>Ramos &<br>Children:<br>Wilmer<br>and<br>Roxana<br>Guitierrez | 25245/11 | #5 Otoxha<br>St, BMP                        |  | No | No |
| 23320/07 | Marvin<br>Leonel<br>Barrientos   | 25249/11 | Cotton Tree<br>Village                      |  | No | No |
| 25983    | Thomas<br>Dukes  | 27107/12 | G-38 Marina<br>Drive, San<br>Pedro Town     |  | No | No |
| 24146/07 | Marta Julia<br>Hernandez<br>Lopez  | 25873/11 | Savana St,<br>OWT                           |  | No | No |
| 29600/12 | Chinelo<br>Monica<br>Nwalie  | 28416/13 | #11 Simon<br>amb St, Bze<br>City            |  | No | No |
| 27365/12 | Osama<br>Khaled<br>Harmouch  | 28363/13 | Sea Grape<br>Dr, San<br>Pedro Town          |  | No | No |
| 29265/12 | De Qiang<br>Zhang  | 28137/13 | #350 St.<br>Vincent st,<br>Dangriga<br>Town |  | No | No |
| 29749/13 | Geetu<br>Chaudhary   | 28338/13 | 3rd North,<br>CZL Town                      |  | No | No |
| 29677/12 | Janet G.<br>Wicinski   | 28367/13 | #50 Cristo<br>Rey Rd, San<br>Ignacio        |  | No | No |
| 29585/12 | Cai Fen He   | 28431/13 | #59 Main St,<br>Punta Gorda<br>Town         |  | No | No |
| 29215/12 | Hua Wen<br>Chen  | 28391/13 | Cotton Tree<br>Village                      |  | No | No |
| 29588/12 | Sanu Miah  | 28371/13 | #1<br>Guadalupe<br>St, OWT                  |  | No | No |
| 28440/12 | Husband:<br>Hong Wei<br>Cha  | 27424/13 | Independenc<br>e Village                    |  | No | No |

|          |  |                        |                                     |  |    |    |
|----------|--|------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 28440/12 | Wife:<br>JinYu Liu   | 27425/13               | Independenc<br>e Village            |  | No | No |
| 29550/12 | Husband:<br>Richard<br>Deeds   | Husband:<br>28392/13   | Center Rd,<br>Spanish<br>Lookout    |  | No | No |
| 29550/12 | Wife:<br>Rachel<br>Deeds &<br>Children:<br>Kelcy and<br>Alexander<br>Deeds   | Wife/Kids:<br>28393/13 | Center Rd,<br>Spanish<br>Lookout    |  | No | No |
| 29584/12 | Guo Cheng<br>Xu  | 28423/13               | #59 Main St,<br>Punta Gorda<br>Town |  | No | No |
| 24606/10 | Shu Hui<br>Hsiao   | 28210/13               | #25 Belize-<br>Corozal Rd,<br>OWT   |  | No | No |
| 29292/12 | Bing Hui<br>Zhu  | 28383/13               | #555 6th<br>Ave, CZL<br>Town        |  | No | No |
| 29234/12 | Jian Chao<br>Su  | 28388/13               | Bullet Tree<br>Rd                   |  | No | No |
| 28075/12 | Lilian<br>Perez  | 28314/13               | #41 Church<br>Hill St, BVC          |  | No | No |
| 26220/11 | Yoshiki<br>Kai<br>Velasquez  | 27772/12               | #82 Burns<br>Ave, San<br>Ignacio    |  | No | No |
| 27952/12 | Francisco<br>Armando<br>Lopez  | 27123/12               | Esperanza<br>Village,<br>Cayo       |  | No | No |
| 27959/12 | Jaime<br>Augusto<br>Escobar  | 27125/12               | Billy White<br>Village              |  | No | No |
| 25861/11 | Parent:<br>Patricia E.<br>Martinez<br>Children:<br>Nathaly<br>and Karina<br>Monge and<br>Kevin<br>Alberto<br>Jovel | 27649/12               | Branch<br>Mouth Rd,<br>San Ignacio  |  | No | No |



|               |  |          |                                      |  |    |    |
|---------------|--|----------|--------------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 25521/10      | Wen Ying<br>Chen   | 24965/11 | #34 East<br>Canal                    |  | No | No |
| 28622/12      | Chia Wei<br>Chang  | 28410/13 | #6070<br>University<br>Dr, BMP       |  | No | No |
| 28624/12      | Chia Yu<br>Chang   | 28402/13 | #6070<br>University<br>Dr, BMP       |  | No | No |
| 26120/11      | Parent:<br>Shu-Min<br>Chiang<br>Children:<br>Hsieh Yi<br>Lun | 25358/11 | 58 Baymen<br>Ave, Bze<br>City        |  | No | No |
| 28441/12      | Husband:<br>Jian Quo<br>Chen                                 | 27426/13 | Independenc<br>e Village             |  | No | No |
|               | Wife:<br>YuePing<br>Liu                                      | 27427/13 | Independenc<br>e Village             |  | No | No |
| 26259/11      | Rodolfo<br>Rolando<br>Bran                                   | 27708/12 | Zericote St,<br>San Ignacio          |  | No | No |
| 26205/11      | Evelia<br>Aguilar<br>Morales                                 | 26731/12 | Avella St,<br>Santa Elena,<br>Cayo   |  | No | No |
| 28068/12      | Maria<br>Onida<br>Montecino<br>s                             | 27929/12 | Las Flores<br>Area, BMP              |  | No | No |
| 27932/12      | Marta Julia<br>Diaz Cruz                                     | 27131/12 | Los Tambos,<br>Cayo                  |  | No | No |
| 27649/12      | Mirta<br>Marta<br>Calderon<br>Perez                          | 27086/12 | 8th St, San<br>Ignacio               |  | No | No |
| 28158/12      | Brian<br>Arther<br>Cook                                      | 27454/12 | San Pedro<br>Town,Ambe<br>rgris Caye |  | No | No |
| 25891/11      | Estela<br>Anaya<br>Lopez                                     | 26359/12 | #16 Jalacte<br>St, Salvapan,<br>BMP  |  | No | No |
| 27527/11<br>B | Maria<br>Podzum  | 26920/12 | Almond Dr,<br>CZL Town               |  | No | No |

|          |  |          |                                    |  |    |    |
|----------|--|----------|------------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 26158/11 | Martha Gladis Siu Manzanare s                                    | 27765/12 | Monument Site, Dangriga Town       |  | No | No |
| 28348/12 | Jose Benedicto Ramos   | 28278/12 | Succotz Village                    |  | No | No |
| 27634    | Elicia De Dolores Berganza                                       | 27018/12 | Duck Run I, Cayo                   |  | No | No |
| 25749/11 | Paulina J. De Tzalam   | 26264/12 | #56 Lamux St, Maya Mopan area, BMP |  | No | No |
| 27003/12 | Mirna Yanneth Hegar  | 27359/12 | St. Joseph St, BVC                 |  | No | No |
| 25968/11 | Nelson Godoy   | 27805/12 | Los Tambos, Cayo                   |  | No | No |
| 29752/13 | Can Jian Chen  | 28415/13 | Park St, South, CZL Town           |  | No | No |
| 26082    | Ronald Deaton  | 27717/12 | 20 Cahal Pech St, San Ignacio Town |  | No | No |
| 26099/11 | Byron Rocael Barrera Cortez                                      | 27496/12 | Cotton Tree Village                |  | No | No |
| 27926    | Parent: Sidia Elizabeth Cabrera<br>Child: Keylin Larissa Cabrera | 27254/12 | Spanish Lookout                    |  | No | No |
| 28370/12 | Olusesan Martins Oluwadare                                       | 27350/12 | West Landivar, Bze City            |  | No | No |
| 27634    | Edelisia Matus De Marroquin                                      | 27016/12 | 6th St, San Ignacio Town           |  | No | No |

|          |  |          |  |  |    |    |
|----------|--|----------|--|--|----|----|
| 24966/08 | Wen-Ting Chang   | 27860/12 | 6070 University Dr, BMP                        |  | No | No |
| 27381/12 | Roxana Isabel Mejia Cruz   | 27469/12 | Armenia Village                                |  | No | No |
| 28550/12 | Cindy Dalila Marquez   | 27541/12 | Bishop Desmond Smith St, Cahal Pech area, Cayo |  | No | No |
| 25664    | Yang Te Chao   | 27792/12 | #10-12 Halfmoon Ave, BMP                       |  | No | No |
| 26875/11 | Yan Ying Su  | 26203/12 | 3886 Mountain View Blvd, BMP                   |  | No | No |
| 25666/10 | Chien Di Michael Chao  | 27797/12 | #10-12 Halfmoon Ave, BMP                       |  | No | No |
| 26205/11 | Parent: Consuelo Herrarte Ramos<br>Children: Luis, Maybellene and Jailene Herrarte | 25668/11 | 2nd St, San Ignacio                            |  | No | No |
| 29541/12 | Geeta B. Preetwani   | 28320/13 | 30th Burns Ave, San Ignacio Town               |  | No | No |
| 25667/10 | Mickey George Thorton  | 25044/11 | Young Bank Rd, Camalote RD                     |  | No | No |
| 29650/12 | Yi Hong Wu   | 28313/13 | George Price Blvd, BVC                         |  | No | No |
| 25667/11 | Edin Alfredo Pop Santisteban   | 26632/12 | Guinea Grass Village, OWT                      |  | No | No |

|                                    |  |                                   |  |  |    |    |
|------------------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|--|--|----|----|
| 26648/11<br>applied 7-<br>Dec-2011 | Jin Chao<br>Wu   | 25920/11<br>dated 23-<br>Dec-2011 | Forest Drive,<br>BMP                           |  | No | No |
| 25797/11                           | Xiao Ling<br>Zhou  | 25078/11                          | 9 Mls<br>Northern<br>Highway,<br>Bze District. |  | No | No |
| 26100/11                           | Parent:<br>Maria Pilar<br>Divas<br>Lemus<br>Children:<br>Evelyn and<br>Yunior<br>Ramirez | 25813/11                          | Chulavista,<br>CZL Town                        |  | No | No |
| 26240/11                           | Feng Li<br>Chun  | 25473/11                          | Mussle<br>Creek St,<br>BMP                     |  | No | No |
| 25572/10                           | Parent:<br>Inocente<br>Lopez<br>Henriquez<br>Child:<br>Hugo<br>Ernesto                   | 25278/11                          | Panama St,<br>BMP                              |  | No | No |
| 25955                              | Jia Hui Lu   | 25495/11                          | Ediver De<br>La O St,<br>BVC                   |  | No | No |
| 26841/12                           | Ji Wang  | 28349/13                          | #7386<br>Antelope St,<br>Ext., Bze<br>City     |  | No | No |
| 26166/11                           | Parent:<br>Jianrui Lu<br>Child:<br>Hong Hui<br>Lu  | 25496/11                          | #48 5th Ave,<br>CZL Town                       |  | No | No |
| 25865/11                           | Gui Zhen<br>Gan  | 25510/11                          | 17 Fonseca<br>St, OWT                          |  | No | No |
| 26091                              | ZhongPin<br>Liao   | 25273/11                          | Placencia<br>Village                           |  | No | No |
| 27766/12                           | Maria Julia<br>Bradley   | 28335/13                          | Caye Caulker,<br>Belize<br>District            |  | No | No |

|          |   |                      |   |  |    |    |
|----------|---|----------------------|---|--|----|----|
| 29510/12 | Mary Margaret Robinson  | 28304/13             | San Jose Succotz                              |  | No | No |
| 26539/11 | Husband:<br>Ever Valle Mendoza  | Husband:<br>28256/13 | #10 Montalvo St,<br>Las Flores Area, Bze City |  | No | No |
| 26539/11 | Wife:<br>Yanira Valle   | Wife:<br>28268/13    | #10 Montalvo St,<br>Las Flores Area, Bze City |  | No | No |
| 17806/02 | Parent:<br>Carlos Alirio Rivera<br>Children:<br>Marjorie and Gerardo Rivera | 24823/11             | #631 Providence St. BVC                       |  | No | No |
| 28539/12 | Beatriz Larin   | 28036/12             | La Loma Luz Blvd,<br>Santa Elena Town         |  | No | No |
| 27490/12 | Parent:<br>Idalmis Cabrera Abalo<br>Child:<br>Dulce Maria Del Arco Cabrera  | 27899/12             | Belama Phase 4, Bze City                      |  | No | No |
| 20576    | Eleazar Gonzalez Donis  | 24630/11             | Cow Pen Village                               |  | No | No |
| 30743/07 | Parent:<br>Emilia Arriola<br>Child:<br>Karen and Damaris Arriola            | 26732/12             | Santa Elena Town, Cayo                        |  | No | No |

|          |  |                                 |  |  |    |    |
|----------|--|---------------------------------|--|--|----|----|
| 20469/05 | Juana Sub  | 19910/06                        | Red Bank,<br>S/C                         |  | No | No |
| 12768/99 | Parent:<br>Felipe<br>Yucute<br>Bucu<br>Children:<br>Luis and<br>Victor<br>Yucute | 10991/99                        | #60 Benque<br>Viejo Rd,<br>San Ignacio   |  | No | No |
| 22979/07 | Lidia Ester<br>Lopez   | 21488/07                        | Cotton Tree<br>Village                   |  | No | No |
| 19642/03 | Robert<br>Danilen<br>Tatum   | 18062/04                        | #3 Lamanai<br>St, BMP                    |  | No | No |
| 19630/03 | Chaos<br>Huang Wu  | 17794/04                        | #38 George<br>Price Blvd,<br>BCV         |  | No | No |
| 15489/01 | Adolfo<br>Stoesz<br>Thiessen   | 14799/01                        | Blue Creek<br>Village                    |  | No | No |
| 17104/02 | Atanacia<br>Eustaquia<br>Oliva   | 16680/02                        | 8 Mls<br>Western<br>Highway,<br>Bze City |  | No | No |
| 31660/07 | Ivan Jose<br>Lopez   | 24510/11                        | Duck Run I                               |  | No | No |
| 23064/07 | Andrea<br>Griselda<br>Henriquez  | 25772/11                        | August Pine<br>Ridge                     |  | No | No |
| 23362/07 | Oscar<br>Ruben<br>Lima   | 27861/12                        | Santa<br>Martha<br>Village               |  | No | No |
| 17272/02 | Thomas<br>Edward<br>Rubin  | 16607/02                        | #97 Vista<br>Del Mar,<br>Bze City        |  | No | No |
| 16805/02 | husband:<br>WenYing<br>Huang   | 15903/02                        | 4th Ave, Czl<br>Town                     |  | No | No |
| 16805/02 | Wife: Feng<br>Jiao Huang<br>& Children:<br>Zufa and<br>Xiaoqin<br>Huang          | Wife &<br>Children:<br>15904/02 | 4th Ave, Czl<br>Town                     |  | No | No |

|          |  |          |   |  |    |    |
|----------|--|----------|---|--|----|----|
| 20585    | Parent:<br>Hao Ling<br>Child:<br>JiaHao Wu   | 18785/05 | Camalote<br>Village                       |  | No | No |
| 18941/07 | Oscar<br>Odilio Lira   | 24826/11 | Indian Ville<br>Area, Punta<br>Gorda      |  | No | No |
| 15068/01 | Pedro<br>Espinoza  | 25422/11 | Ladyville,<br>Belize<br>District          |  | No | No |
| 18688/05 | Victor<br>Rodriguez  | 20293/06 | Sarawee<br>Village, S/C                   |  | No | No |
| 15541/01 | Linda<br>Ramirez   | 18157/04 | #13 Santa<br>Rita Layout,<br>Czl Town     |  | No | No |
| 18062/03 | Xuman He   | 18645/05 | #5 Douglas<br>Jones St,<br>Bze City       |  | No | No |
| 17485/02 | Abbas<br>Ahmed<br>Khan   | 16894/02 | #72 Vista<br>Del Mar,<br>Bze City         |  | No | No |
| 14058/00 | Parent:<br>Paulino<br>Mo' Rax<br>Child:<br>Victor<br>Alexander<br>Caal Mo                | 12541/00 | Jalacte<br>Village,<br>Toledo<br>District |  | No | No |
| 19225/02 | Raul<br>Zuleta   | 17420/03 | St. Matthews<br>Village,<br>Cayo          |  | No | No |
| 19036/05 | Wilson<br>Antonio<br>Castillo  | 24255/10 | Boca Del<br>Rio                           |  | No | No |
| 30472    | Parent:<br>Mayra<br>Melendez<br>Gonzalez<br>Children:<br>Bayron<br>and Maria<br>Gonzalez | 22861/08 | Franks Eddy<br>Village                    |  | No | No |
| 18400/02 | Maria Julia<br>Vides<br>Agilar   | 17551/03 | #61 Gristock<br>St, OWT                   |  | No | No |

|          |   |                   |                                |  |    |    |
|----------|---|-------------------|--------------------------------|--|----|----|
| 26003/11 | Luigi Lungarini   | 27943/12          | Unitedville, Cayo              |  | No | No |
| 27476/12 | Zoila Aquino  | 26775/12          | San Mateo Area, San Pedro Town |  | No | No |
| 25843/11 | Candido Argueta Reyes   | 27657/12          | St. Matthews Village, Cayo     |  | No | No |
| 26002/11 | Parent: Marie Alexia Malo<br>Children: Alessandro and Amalita Lungarini   | 27944/12          | Unitedville, Cayo              |  | No | No |
| 31699/07 | Baha Ozgur  | 21638/07          | San Antonio Village, CZL       |  | No | No |
| 30479/07 | Yi Chien Ho   | 23069/08          | #3 Jamaica, BMP                |  | No | No |
| 24160/07 | Husband: Tyns Ruenn Su  | 23460/09          | 2.5 Mls Northern Highway       |  | No | No |
| 24160/07 | Wife: Hsui-Mei Su Chang   | 23461/09          | 2.5 Mls Northern Highway       |  | No | No |
| 15794/01 | Husband: Hsieh Kung Chih  | Husband: 16965/02 | #1 Forest Drive, BMP           |  | No | No |
| 15794/01 | Wife: Hsieh Chen Chen & Child: Hsieh I Hsun                               | Wife: 16966/02    | #1 Forest Drive, BMP           |  | No | No |
| 27966 B  | Parent: Sonia N. Menjivar & Children: Angel G. Lovo and Maiba Y. Menjivar | 27160/12          | Las Flores Area, BMP           |  | No | No |



|               |  |  |   |  |    |    |
|---------------|--|--|---|--|----|----|
| 26448/11      | Jing Biao<br>Tan   | 25801/11                                     | 6129 Brown<br>St, BMP                       |  | No | No |
| 14145/00      | Parent:<br>Vilnor<br>Charleron<br>& Child:<br>Tales<br>Charleron                           | 13073/00                                     | #21 Kraal<br>Rd, Bze City                   |  | No | No |
| 25298/09      | Husband:<br>Ching<br>Dong<br>Wang  | Husband:<br>25204/11                         | Succotz<br>Village                          |  | No | No |
| 25298/09      | Wife:<br>Wen-Ling<br>Lo and<br>Children(3<br>)   | Wife:<br>25205/11                            | Succotz<br>Village                          |  | No | No |
| 16781/02      | Jung-Chin<br>Lin<br>Sheng-Yi<br>Lin<br>Yi-Fu Lin<br>Hsiu-Chin<br>& Cheng<br>Cheng<br>Tseng | 15848/02<br>15851/02<br>15850/02<br>15849/02 | #49 Vista<br>Del Mar                        |  | No | No |
| 16781/01<br>A | Yao Ming<br>Liang<br>Jui-Lan<br>Liang<br>Yu-Ting<br>Liang<br>Yu-Wei<br>Liang               | 15204/01<br>15205/01<br>15206/01<br>15203/01 | 3.5 Mls<br>Northern<br>Highway,<br>Bze City |  | No | No |
| 17391         | MengChen<br>g Li<br>Caiqiong<br>and<br>Mengtang<br>Li<br>Renhai Li                         | 16768/02<br>16767/02<br>16766/02             | #42<br>Freetown<br>Rd, Bze City             |  | No | No |
| 25800/11      | Hsu, Chin<br>Chan  | 28129/12                                     | #668 Guinea<br>Grass Rd,<br>OWT             |  | No | No |

|          |   |          |   |  |    |    |
|----------|---|----------|---|--|----|----|
| 18284    | Manoj<br>Harishandas<br>Nandwani  | 20230/06 | #36 5th St,<br>CZL Town                     |  | No | No |
| 24459/08 | Parent: Xin<br>Hao Zhou<br>&Child:<br>JinXi Tan                         | 22761/08 | 375 Belama<br>Phase II,<br>Bze City         |  | No | No |
| 22837/07 | Cesar<br>Humberto<br>Bautista   | 22104/08 | Buena Vista<br>Village,<br>Cayo<br>District |  | No | No |
| 20018/04 | Mahoud<br>Hussein<br>Harmouch<br>e                                      | 18357/05 | Coconut Dr.<br>San Pedro                    |  | No | No |
| 21545/06 | Chun Ping<br>Ma   | 19962/06 | 6922<br>Mahogany<br>St, Bze City            |  | No | No |
| 21172/06 | Vinoda<br>Kannan<br>Sigamani  | 20973/07 | 23 St.<br>Vincent St,<br>Dangriga<br>Town   |  | No | No |
| 21241/06 | Zi Qiang<br>Yan   | 20698/07 | #34<br>Hummingbir<br>d Highway,<br>BMP      |  | No | No |
| 20944/06 | Norma<br>Yadira<br>Hernandez  | 20035/06 | Bella Vista<br>Village, S/C                 |  | No | No |
| 21549/06 | RongBan<br>Luo  | 20435/06 | #9 Blue<br>Creek St,<br>BMP                 |  | No | No |
| 16394/01 | Father:<br>Yicai Zhu  | 15305/01 | #71 New<br>Rd, Bze City                     |  | No | No |
| 16394/01 | Mother &<br>Children:<br>Xueqin<br>Wu and<br>Yuan Zhu<br>and Jun<br>Zhu | 15306/01 | #71 New<br>Rd, Bze City                     |  | No | No |
| 21139/06 | Husband:<br>Jin Shao<br>Huang   | 20476/07 | 34 King St,<br>Bze City                     |  | No | No |

|          |                                  |                            |  |            |    |    |
|----------|----------------------------------|----------------------------|--|------------|----|----|
| 21139/06 | Wife: Jing Shao Huang            | 20477/07                   | 34 King St, Bze City                         |            | No | No |
| 12094/99 | Fatme Harmouch                   | 9932/99                    | San Pedro Town, Ambergris Caye               |            | No | No |
| 14310/00 | Shu-Tang Chang                   | 12504/00 dated 4-July-2000 | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC | No | No |
| 14310/00 | Chung Pao-Chu Chang (wife)       | 12503/00 dated 4-July-2000 | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC | No | No |
| 14310/00 | Wen-Cheng Chang (aka Eric Chang) | 12505/00 dated 4-July-2000 | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC | No | No |
| 14310/00 | Kang-Chih Chang (aka Andy Chang) | 12506/00 dated 4-July-2000 | 29 Albert Street, Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC | No | No |

## Appendix F

### Reference paragraph

The following is the Ministers of Government, Area Representatives and other persons who intervened in the Belize nationality process when there is no such provision for them to intervene in the Belize Nationality Act

| <b>Name of Minister or Area Representative who intervened in the process</b> | <b>Name of Applicant for Nationality</b> | <b>Date of Letter with Minister Intervention or Minute Sheet entry date</b> | <b>Where evidence was seen</b>   |
|--|--|---|--|
| Hon Edmond Castro  | Olena Moskalyk                           | February 8, 2012  | On Minute Sheet of Nationality File  |
| Hon Edmond Castro  | Mykola Moskalyk                          | February 8, 2012  | On Minute Sheet of Nationality File  |
| Hon Erwin Contreras  | Jinchao Wu                               | December-12-2011  | On Minute Sheet of Nationality File  |
| Hon Erwin Contreras  | Ali Mohamed Akil Rada                    | November-22-2011  | On Minute Sheet of Nationality File  |
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr.  | Osama Khaled Harmouch                    | January-6-2012  | On Minute sheet in Nationality File<br><b>(Minister Heredia requested File for processing a year before applicant had qualified for Nationality based on his file)</b> |
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr.  | Hani Harmouch                            | January -11-2012  | On Minute sheet in Nationality File<br><b>(Minister Heredia requested File for processing but application had no signature and other</b>                               |

|                         |   |                             |  |
|-------------------------|---|-----------------------------|--|
|                         |   |                             | <b>signatures did not match passport signature)</b>  |
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr. | Abdul Rahman Harmouch   | January-10-2012             | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr. | Samir Mouhamed Harmouch   | January-10-2012             | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon. Rene Montero       | Saad Mohamad Harmouch   | January-9-2012              | On Minute Sheet and on a letter to Ms. Meigan requesting her to facilitate with the following Nationality for ceremonies to be held on 13 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 (same letter seen in Wael Harmouche Nationality file) |
| Hon. Rene Montero       | Berta Veronica Sam Ramirez  | 18 <sup>th</sup> June -2012 | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr. | Ahmad Harmouche<br>(DOB 10-Nov-1970)  | January -5-2012             | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon. Manuel Heredia Jr. | Ahmad Harmouche<br>(DOB 1-Feb-1992)   | January -10-2012            | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
|                         |   |                             |  |
| Hon Manuel Heredia      | Ammar Harmouch<br><br>D.O.B 1-Jan-1980 (did not qualify for Belizean Nationality). He submitted application on 9 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 and | January-9-2012              | Hon Manuel Heredia was written and highlighted on application form and on Minute Sheet (Ruth Meighan wrote to Minister, "Meets legal   |

|   |  |                   |  |
|---|--|-------------------|--|
|   | certificate was dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 |                   | requirement” when<br>applicant did not)  |
| Hon Manuel Heredia  | Ammar Harmouch   | January-9-2012    | On Minute Sheet  |
| Hon Rene Montero  | Wael Harmouch  | January-9-2012    | On Minute Sheet and on<br>a letter to Ms. Meigan<br>requesting her to<br>facilitate with the<br>following Nationality for<br>ceremonies to be held on<br>13 <sup>th</sup> January 2012. Same<br>letter seen in Saad<br>Mohamad Harmouch<br>Nationality file. |
| Hon Manuel Heredia  | Oussama Harmouch                                       | 10-January-2012   | On Minute Sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon Manuel Heredia  | Zoila Aquino   | 16th-January-2012 | On Minute Sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon. Elvin Penner to<br>“Person in Charge<br>Immigration” | Amanda Magana  | October- 23- 2012 | Letter in Nationality File   |
| Hon. Elvin Penner to<br>“Person in Charge<br>Immigration” | Kudzai Pahwaringira                                    | September-17-2012 | Letter in Nationality File   |
| Hon Elvin Penner  | Jian Guo Chen<br>(Jianguo Chen)                        | April 25, 2013    | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon Elvin Penner  | Yueping Liu<br>(Yue Ping Liu)                          | April 25, 2013    | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File   |
| Hon Santiago Castillo to<br>Ruth Meighan                  | Shu Bin Yu   | October-4-2012    | Letter in Nationality File   |

|                       |                                       |                    |  |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------|--|
| Hon Santiago Castillo | Junzheng An                           | January 23, 2013   | Letter in Nationality File to Ruth Meighan     |
| Hon Santiago Castillo | Jinchen An                            | September 13, 2012 | Letter in Nationality File to Ruth Meighan     |
| Hon. Ramon Witz       | Tian Zhi Wang aka Freakin Yang        | 18-Nov-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Ramon Witz       | Jinfan Chen (Jin Fan Chen)            | 12-Dec-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Shu-Ming Chiang                       | 10-May-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Lee Yi Lung                           | 7-Sept-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Shuming Chen aka Sumi Chen/           | 7-Sept-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Ni-Yen Lee                            | 7-Sept-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Ting Chun Lee                         | 7-Sept-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Wensi Wu                              | 29-Nov-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Congzhi Wu                            | 29-Nov-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Carlos Perdomo   | Natalia Karpouzoglou (Natalya Parker) | 2-Feb-2012         | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon. Eden Martinez    | Jinyu Huang                           | 12-Dec-2011        | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon Carlos Perdomo    | Dongsheng Zheng (Dong Sheng Zheng)    | December 2011      | On Minute sheet in Nationality File            |
| Hon Carlos Perdomo    | Dayana Abigail De Paz                 | June 2011          | Recommendation letter seen in Nationality File |

|                     |   |                                 |  |
|---------------------|---|---------------------------------|--|
| Hon Manuel Heredia  | Lisset Penalver<br>Betancourt   | 2011                            | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Carlos Perdomo  | Cui Xiang Ma  | 2011                            | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Manuel Heredia  | Nidian Concepcion<br>Moralez Gonzalez   | 16 <sup>th</sup> November 2011  | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Erwin Contreras | Fang Ling Wu  | 30 <sup>th</sup> April 2012     | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Erwin Contreras | Danilo Leonicio<br>Verganza Herrarte;<br>Luz Maria Catalan<br>Reyes & Robin<br>Abraham Verganza | 15 <sup>th</sup> November 2011  | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Erwin Contreras | Beatriz Esmeralda<br>Guerra   | 7th February 2012               | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Rene Montero    | Belisario Francisco<br>Najera   | 4 <sup>th</sup> January 2012    | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Elvin Penner    | Sindy Corina Chohuoj<br>Chan  | 19 <sup>th</sup> January 2012   | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Elvin Penner    | Jeffrey David Pfaender  | 28 <sup>th</sup> September 2012 | On letter in Nationality<br>File       |
| Hon Carlos Perdomo  | Hui Juan Liu  | 29 <sup>th</sup> February 2012  | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |
| Hon Erwin Contreras | Ting Yu Chao A.K.A<br>Tiffany Chao  | 2 <sup>nd</sup> May 2012        | On Minute sheet in<br>Nationality File |



|                      |   |                               |  |
|----------------------|---|-------------------------------|--|
| Hon Gaspar Vega      | Richard Adu Yeboah  | 25 <sup>th</sup> June 2012    | Letter submitted by Vega and also recorded on Minute Sheet in Nationality File                                     |
| Hon John Saldivar    | Lidia Azucena Diaz Najera                                 | 27 <sup>th</sup> April 2012   | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon John Saldivar    | Parent: Elena Bachan Canahui & Son: Ever Alexander Bachan | 9 <sup>th</sup> January 2012  | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon John Saldivar    | Perla Maythe Maza   | 3 <sup>rd</sup> February 2012 | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon John Saldivar    | Yoshiki Kai Velasquez                                     | 10 <sup>th</sup> April 2012   | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon Pablo Marin      | Fengwan Wu/ Fengwan Lu                                    | 4 <sup>th</sup> November 2011 | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon Gabriel Martinez | Jesus Angel Rafailan Machuca                              | 17 <sup>th</sup> January 2012 | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon Elvin Penner     | Dina Jesus Salazar Perez                                  | 6 <sup>th</sup> August 2012   | Letter from Minister Elvin Penner asking that her file be processed a bit faster                                   |
| Hon Pablo Marin      | Gabriela Barrera  | 5 <sup>th</sup> July 2012     | On Minute sheet in Nationality File<br><br>Also copy of letter seen from Minister dated 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 |
| Hon Pablo Marin      | Fidelia Fuentes   | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012    | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera                                 |

|                 |                         |                            |  |
|-----------------|-------------------------|----------------------------|--|
| Hon Pablo Marin | Karla Cartagena         | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Beatrice Salguero Larin | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Danilo Barrera Guzman   | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Amarilis Vasquez        | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Miriam Batres           | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Jose Morales Cac        | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Jacinto Tzunux Tzunun   | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Felipa Yup Nij          | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin | Humei Liu               | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012 | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for                  |

|                         |  |                                |  |
|-------------------------|--|--------------------------------|--|
|                         |  |                                | Gabriela Barrera   |
| Hon Pablo Marin         | Fernando Ramirez                                   | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012     | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Hon Pablo Marin         | Francisco Barrera                                  | 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2012     | Letter from Minister Pablo Marin seen in the Nationality File for Gabriela Barrera |
| Mr. R. Rosado           | Juana Edy Miranda                                  | 29 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Mr. D. Gonzalez.        | Iris Behatriz Linarez Gomez                        | 17 <sup>th</sup> January 2012  | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon Pablo Marin         | Felipa Tzunux Tzunun                               | 3 <sup>rd</sup> January 2012   | On Minute sheet in Nationality File  |
| Hon Elvin Penner        | Sidia Elizabeth Cabrera                            | 26 <sup>th</sup> January 2012  | On Minute Sheet in File  |
| Hon Elvin Penner        | Richard Deeds                                      | 30 <sup>th</sup> August 2012   | Letter seen in Nationality File  |
| Hon Elvin Penner        | Rachel Deeds & Children: Kelcy and Alexander Deeds | 30 <sup>th</sup> August 2012   | Letter seen in Nationality File  |
| Hon Elvin Penner        | Jaime Escobar                                      | 19 <sup>th</sup> January 2012  | On Minute Sheet in File  |
| Hon Elvin Penner        | Lilian Inez Perez                                  | 20 <sup>th</sup> July 2012     | Letter seen in Nationality File  |
| Hon. Michael Hutchinson | Valvin Seymour Duff                                | 20 <sup>th</sup> February 2012 | On Minute Sheet in File  |

1. INTERNAL REPORT ON FILE IVENTORY  
FOR BELIZE NATIONALITY ACT,  
IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY  
SERVICES
2. LIST OF NAMES WHOSE FILES THAT  
COULD NOT BE FOUND.

During the dates of 9 - 18 October, 2013, a file inventory of Belize Nationality Act files (BNA) was done by Ms. Myra Samos, Mr. Manuel Lopez and, myself, Ms. Karen Samuels. The BNA Registry is located on the ground floor of the Immigration and Nationality Services Department on Dry Creek Street, Belmopan City.

Distinction has to be made as to where the BNA Registry is located due to another registry being available on the second floor for the department's administrative purposes.

#### Findings:

In the BNA Registry, there are 42 filing cabinets and 29 of the 42 filing cabinets are used for BNA files. The other 13 filing cabinets are used for the Permanent Resident persons.

Totally, there are 3,682 files that were verified. A list of those files is in an attached folder that is labelled "Belize Nationality Act - Master File." In the BNA files, the minute sheets were poorly written up where the entries were not dated. Also, only the last two entries, that were made earlier in the year of 2013, had dates. The entries that were written on the sheet correspond with the actual documents that are located in the BNA files.

Also, there were files that had the same BNA numbers with different names, but were given "A" or "B" for distinction. These are files that have a husband and wife applying for nationality and so these files were given the same number with the "A" or "B." They were verified as well. There was not much occurrence of this practice.

Attached to this report, there is a list of 164 names whose files could not be found and no explanation was given by the two Clerks, Ms. Sheila Samuels and Ms. Cheryl Gillett, as to where the files would be. They were listed, also, as part of the master list and they could not be verified.

the master list, these older BNA files are referred to files being "set for destroy," "destroyed" "to be destroyed." They amount to a sum of 1,520 files and they ranged from BNA file # 20 to BNA 31231/07 with their respective names.

They are some older BNA files that are dated as far back as 1998 to 2008. Those files were verified and are listed, separately, in an attached folder that is labelled "Files for Archiving". Please note that they are not actually destroyed, but they are still located at the Immigration and Nationality Service Office. They are filed in cartoon boxes at the same BNA Registry.

These older files should actually be sent to the Belize Archives and Records Service and not physically destroyed by employees of the Department of Immigration and Nationality Service.

Stored in other cabinets are files that have "certificates" that already signed and waiting to be issued. They are other certificates that were, waiting to be signed and to be issued, as well. There were others that were put "on hold" which were based on the instruction given by Minister Godwin Hulse. A folder is also annexed with a list of these files that totalled to 15 files. They were verified and are located in separate filing cabinets that are in the BNA Registry.

While verifying the files, a written request came from Mr. Gian Ghandi, Legal Advisor, Ministry of Finance, to borrow the files, BNA # 23929/10 – Edwin Oscar Stephen – and BNA # 23942 – Jocelle Campbell-Stephen. These two files were on the list and I took note of them and they were returned to the BNA Registry two days later.

#### Conclusion:

When entries were made on the minute-sheet, they were not dated and were written poorly. There was a practice to classify files as being "to be destroyed" or "destroyed" after a five year span of inactivity. I am recommending that these files are sent to Department of Belize Archives and Records Systems and not destroyed.

It seems that a proper filing system needs to be set in place for the BNA Registry. In other words, an improved Records Management System needs to be introduced, practice maintained. More filing cabinets are also needed for the growing number of applications received by the department.

The listed names below are the 164 BNA files that could not be located nor viewed.

| No. | Name                            | BNA #        | Date Applied | Nationality |
|-----|---------------------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|
| 1.  | Mario Oswaldo Equivel Espino    | 30793/07     | 13/09/2007   | Guatemalan  |
| 2.  | Nancy Marilu Chaj Ramirez       | 24541/08     | 15/10/2008   | Guatemalan  |
| 3.  | Ibis Maldonado                  | 21770/06     | -            | Honduran    |
| 4.  | Guillermo Lopez                 | 217968/06    | -            | Honduran    |
| 5.  | Jose Rafael Ramirez             | 31335/07     | -            | Salvadoran  |
| 6.  | Sandra Josefa Ponce             | 28330/12     | -            | Salvadoran  |
| 7.  | Katharina Klassen Bergen        | 28845/12     | 14/05/2012   | Mexican     |
| 8.  | Gladiz Amanda Vasquez           | 23764/07     | 23/11/2007   | Guatemalan  |
| 9.  | Willian Eduardo Garcia ✓        | 29556/12     | 30/08/2012   | Guatemalan  |
| 10. | Manuel Geovanni Paniagua        | 18772/12     | 24/02/2012   | Guatemalan  |
| 11. | Ercilia Yanett Aquino           | 19179/11     | 18/04/2011   | Guatemalan  |
| 12. | Blanca Isabel Morales Fernandez | 19384/03     | 6/2/2003     | Guatemalan  |
| 13. | Adelaida Zacarias               | 19384/03     | 6/2/2003     | Guatemalan  |
| 14. | Alfredo Roman Corona            | 23065/07     | 28/08/2007   | Mexican     |
| 15. | Jose Oswaldo Barillas           | 23067/07     | 28/08/2007   | Mexican     |
| 16. | Manuel De Jesus Reina Cardosa   | 23246/07     | -            | Salvadoran  |
| 17. | Raul Ernesto Zeledon Ordonez    | 23916/10     | 30/0/2010    | Nicaraguan  |
| 18. | Isai Aguirre Hernandez          | 25139/09     | 5/20/2009    | Mexican     |
| 19. | Hong Jing Huang                 | 25238/09     | -            | Chinese     |
| 20. | Abigail De Jesus Cruz Herrarte  | 25324/09     | -            | Guatemalan  |
| 21. | Veronica Maria Grant            | 25913/13     | -            | American    |
| 22. | Gregorio Fabian                 | 27274/12     | -            | Guatemalan  |
| 23. | Alaa Hassoun                    | 27368/12     | -            | Labanese    |
| 24. | Miriam Pineda Vasquez           | 28185/12     | -            | Guatemalan  |
| 25. | Helen Morales                   | 28296/12     | -            | Mexican     |
| 26. | Karla Yasmilla Bueso            | 28422/12     | -            | Honduran    |
| 27. | Hong Wei Chen ✗ & Jinghui       | 28440/12 ✓   | Audit Reid   | Chinese     |
| 28. | Jian Quo Chen Jian Guo          | 28441/12 ✓   | Audit Reid   | Chinese     |
| 29. | Hilda Clemencia Ramirez         | 28453/12     | 1/2/2012     | Guatemalan  |
| 30. | Francisco Madrid Pineda         | 29034/12 (A) | -            | Guatemalan  |
| 31. | Abigail Liwat                   | 29552/12     | -            | PHILIPPINES |
| 32. | ROSE BRUCE BLUMENTRITT          | 29553/12     | -            | PHILIPPINES |



|     |                           |           |            |            |
|-----|---------------------------|-----------|------------|------------|
| 33. | Juan José Cortez          | 28209     | 18/10/2012 | Guatemalan |
| 34. | Tereson Miguel de Lorenzo | 28314/12  | -          | Guatemalan |
| 35. | Imelda Madali Zepeda      | 28432/12  | -          | Guatemalan |
| 36. | Marghie Guevara           | 28666/12  | -          | Honduran   |
| 37. | Jerry Nicholas            | 29046/12  | 29/05/2012 | American   |
| 38. | Gina Yesenia Velasquez    | 29077/12  | -          | Guatemalan |
| 39. | Ukpabi Cristiana Ijeoma   | 29101/12  | 13/06/2012 | Nigerian   |
| 40. | Shaohua Zhu               | 29103/12  | 14/06/2012 | Chinese    |
| 41. | Can Shao Wu               | 29136/12  | -          | Chinese    |
| 42. | Yuan Huan Liang           | 29137/12  | -          | Chinese    |
| 43. | Farzad Michael Modiri     | 29238/12  | -          | Iran       |
| 44. | Carlos Enrique Cabreraz   | 29248/12  | 23/07/2012 | Guatemalan |
| 45. | Eduardo García            | 29302/12  | 17/09/2012 | Honduran   |
| 46. | Narudeen O. Awalaja       | 29533/12  | -          | Nigerian   |
| 47. | Roxana Vanessa Esquivel   | 29604/12  | 19/04/2012 | Salvadoran |
| 48. | Santos Ramirez            | 29663/12  | -          | Guatemalan |
| 49. | Jin Jin Wu                | 29691/12  | -          | Chinese    |
| 50. | Ivana Francisca Aguilar   | 29724/12  | -          | Honduran   |
| 51. | Jing Ju Liu               | 29734/12  | 19/12/12   | Chinese    |
| 52. | Kun Ying Zhu              | 29741/13  | -          | Chinese    |
| 53. | Xi Meng Zhen              | 29772     | -          | Chinese    |
| 54. | Rudy de Jesus Alvarado    | 30227     | 20/03/2007 | Guatemalan |
| 55. | Cesar Rolden Mejia Coy    | 30254     | 26/03/2007 | Guatemalan |
| 56. | Yusimy Vasquez            | 29711     |            | Cuban      |
| 57. | Sonia Montes              | No number |            |            |
| 58. | Zulma Lissetter Reyes     | 24106/07  |            | Salvadoran |
| 59. | Jose M. Quinilla          | 26400/12  |            | Guatemalan |
| 60. | Catarina Quinilla         | 26401/12  |            | Guatemalan |
| 61. | Leslie George Byrce       | No number |            |            |
| 62. | Encarnacion Martinez      | 11530/99  |            | Guatemalan |
| 63. | Sunita Tekchandani        | 18980/11  |            | Indian     |
| 64. | Wan Chi Lu                | 20954/05  |            | Taiwanese  |
| 65. | Irina Yaneth Alvarado     | 23870/09  |            | Honduran   |
| 66. | Jorge Genesis Lopez       | 23986/12  |            | Nicaraguan |
| 67. | Blanca Lopez Vasquez      | 23980/11  |            | Salvadoran |
| 68. | Manuel Aguirre            | 24069/07  |            | Guatemalan |
| 69. | Vicenta Ba Sub            | 24091/07  |            | Guatemalan |
| 70. | Teresa M. Morales         | 24094/07  |            | Guatemalan |
| 71. | Ridella Urutia            | 24097/07  |            | Guatemalan |



|      |                        |          |                        |             |
|------|------------------------|----------|------------------------|-------------|
| 72.  | Manuel Ba Xol          | 24123/07 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 73.  | Juan Barrillas         | 24129/07 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 74.  | Mirta Ramirez          | 24131/07 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 75.  | Brenda Moran           | 24132/07 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 76.  | Jose Ruiz Pat          | 24134/07 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 77.  | Susana Singh           | 24151/07 |                        | Guyanese    |
| 78.  | Doris Guevara          | 24176/07 |                        | Honduran    |
| 79.  | Erla Aguilar           | 24184/07 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 80.  | Maria Martinez         | 24186/07 |                        | Honduran    |
| 81.  | Kuo Chan Huang         | 24203/07 |                        | Taiwanese   |
| 82.  | Pablo Ramirez          | 24386/08 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 83.  | Anacely Montejo        | 24414/08 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 84.  | Jesus Bu               | 24445/08 |                        | Honduran    |
| 85.  | Lei Ancu               | 24452/08 |                        | Taiwanese   |
| 86.  | Ming Rong Wu           | 24453/08 |                        | Taiwanese   |
| 87.  | Elder Xol              | 24456/08 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 88.  | Jose Logan             | 24474/08 |                        | Costa Rican |
| 89.  | Levia Dominguez        | 24477/08 |                        | Honduran    |
| 90.  | Dongyi Zhen            | 24630/12 |                        | Chinese     |
| 91.  | Rosalia Sanchez        | 24854/09 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 92.  | Natalia Beer           | 24877/08 |                        | Nicaraguan  |
| 93.  | Maria Orellano         | 24939/11 |                        | Salvadoran  |
| 94.  | Pablo Palma            | 25080/09 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 95.  | Miriam Paz             | 25626/09 |                        |             |
| 96.  | Samuel Mathias         | 25410/10 |                        | British     |
| 97.  | Helen Martinez         | 25509/10 |                        | Honduran    |
| 98.  | Iris Aguirre           | 25520/10 |                        | Honduran    |
| 99.  | Agatha Petkau          | 25536/10 |                        | Mexican     |
| 100. | Petrona Panteleon      | 25692/10 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 101. | Adonias Abzun          | 25813/11 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 102. | Zolla Ramos            | 25815/11 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 103. | Raquel Diaz            | 25841/11 |                        | Guatemalan  |
| 104. | Karthikeyan Ulaganthan | 25871/11 | Audit rec'd<br>12/3/14 | Indian      |
| 105. | Hermes Anaya           | 25892/11 |                        | Salvadoran  |
| 106. | Rutt Mejia             | 25948/11 |                        | Salvadoran  |
| 107. | Anyellina Rodriguez    | 25910/11 |                        |             |

|      |                    |              |                |               |
|------|--------------------|--------------|----------------|---------------|
| 108. | Rosa Pavon Fiallos | 25988/11     |                | Honduran      |
| 109. | Richard Heinrich   | 26053/11     |                | American      |
| 110. | Yu Chi Wei         | 26081/11     |                | Chinese       |
| 111. | Aizar Segura       | 26084/11     |                | Panamanian    |
| 112. | Harold Diaz        | 26137/11     |                | Venezuelan    |
| 113. | Carmen Castillo    | 26329/11     |                | Honduran      |
| 114. | Kathia Ortiz       | 26330/11     |                | -             |
| 115. | Darling Guevara    | 26334/11     |                | Honduran      |
| 116. | Michael Odennell   | 26373/12     |                | American      |
| 117. | Joan Johnson       | 26375/12     |                | American      |
| 118. | Olga Rodriguez     | 26377/12     |                | Honduran      |
| 119. | Walter Tobar       | 26397/12(A)  |                | Guatemalan    |
| 120. | Ana Mendoza        | 26397/12 (B) |                | Salvadoran    |
| 121. | Amy Knox           | 26403/12     |                | American      |
| 122. | Hua Wu Zhang       | 26416/12     |                | Chinese       |
| 123. | Dania Nunez        | 26508/11     |                | Dom. Republic |
| 124. | Yanira Valle       | 26539 (B)    |                | -             |
| 125. | Ever Mendoza       | 26539/11     |                | Honduran      |
| 126. | Roger Cuellar      | 26584/11     |                | Honduran      |
| 127. | Reginalda Enríguez | 26585/11     |                | Guatemalan    |
| 128. | Claudia Sanchez    | 26586/11     |                | Honduran      |
| 129. | Genaro Pineda      | 26610/11     |                | Salvadoran    |
| 130. | Mohammad Harmouch  | 26641/11     |                | Lebanese      |
| 131. | Elbia Jordon       | 26660/06     |                | Guatemalan    |
| 132. | Gonzalo Morales    | 26746/11     |                | Guatemalan    |
| 133. | Yan Ping Zhu       | 26801/12     |                | Chinese       |
| 134. | Marla Nativi       | 26839/12     |                | -             |
| 135. | Olawale Kolapo     | 26849/12     |                | Nigerian      |
| 136. | Shu Bin Yu         | 27051/12     |                | Chinese       |
| 137. | Can Jun Di         | 27178/12     |                | -             |
| 138. | Guosheng Deng      | 27928/12     |                | -             |
| 139. | Osama Harmouch *   | 27365/12     | Rec'd by Audit | Lebanese      |
| 140. | Mohammad Harmouch  | 27369/12     |                | Lebanese      |
| 141. | Issam Harmouch     | 27370/12     |                | Lebanese      |
| 142. | Oyman Harmouch     | 27375/12     |                | Lebanese      |
| 143. | Hani Harmouch *    | 27378/12     | Rec'd by Audit | Lebanese      |

|      |                   |          |   |                              |
|------|-------------------|----------|---|------------------------------|
| 144. | Janet Brown       | 27384/12 |   | Lebanese                     |
| 145. | Esther Ajaero     | 27395/12 |   | Nigerian                     |
| 146. | Mohamed El Haj    | 27439/12 |   | Lebanese                     |
| 147. | Angelica Escobar  | 27444/12 |   | Guatemalan                   |
| 148. | Jing Mei Wu       | 27448/12 |   | Chinese                      |
| 149. | Elisa Valdez      | 27453/12 |   | Mexican                      |
| 150. | Milton Alfaro     | 27530/12 |   | Salvadoran                   |
| 151. | Mario Rey         | 27533/12 |   | Guatemalan                   |
| 152. | Amadeo Cortez     | 27568/12 |   | Salvadoran                   |
| 153. | Adina Requena     | 27596/12 |   | Guatemalan                   |
| 154. | Bimala Kandel     | 27608/12 |   | Nepalese                     |
| 155. | Jimmy Mairena     | 27719/12 |   | Nicaraguan                   |
| 156. | Sinthya Alvarez   | 27729/12 |   | Honduran                     |
| 157. | Herbert Martells  | 27734/12 |   | Jamaican                     |
| 158. | Xin Yu Huang      | 27750/12 |   | Chinese                      |
| 159. | Constanza Giraldo | 27757/12 |   | Colombian                    |
| 160. | Jeniffer Avila    | 27759/12 |   | Honduran                     |
| 161. | Md. Abul Kalam    | 27763/12 |   | Bangladesh                   |
| 162. | Maria Bradley     | 27766/12 | <i>Audit Rec'd<br/>Maria Julia<br/>Ballester<br/>2/5/14</i> | Salvadoran ✓ <i>Conf 283</i> |
| 163. | Pauline King      | 27771/12 |   | Jamaican                     |
| 164. | Cruz Chapas       | 27772/12 |   | Honduran                     |

## Appendix H

The following is the list of persons with the surname Harmouch or Harmouche who have Belizean Nationality and were issued first time passports or renewed passports during the April 2011-September 2013 period

**\*\*\* (Twenty-six (26) of their Passport Applications were not presented to Audit for us to have been able to note and examine their Nationality certificate and Nationality files)**

| <b>PASSPORT #</b> | <b>FIRST NAME</b> | <b>SURNAME</b> | <b>ISSUE DATE OF PASSPORT</b> | <b>NATIONALITY CERTIFICATE #/ DATE ON CERTIFICATE</b> | <b>SIGNATURE OF MINISTER ON NATIONALITY CERTIFICATE APPEARED AS</b> | <b>OBSERVATIONS</b>                             |
|-------------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------------------|---|---|---|
| P0169443          | IMAN              | HARMOUCH       | 20/06/2011                    | 24907/11 dated 1 <sup>st</sup> April 2011             | Carlos Perdomo  |   |
| P0170663          | SARA ALI          | HARMOUCH       | 29/06/2011                    | Not seen  | Not seen  | Passport application was not presented to Audit |
| P0170708          | MOHAMED           | HARMOUCH       | 30/06/2011                    | Not seen  | Not seen  | Passport application was not presented to Audit |
| P0171666          | TALAL BELAL       | HARMOUCH       | 07/07/2011                    | Not seen  | Not seen  | Passport application was not presented to Audit |
| P0171667          | MUHAMMED YEHYA    | HARMOUCH       | 07/07/2011                    | Not seen  | Not seen  | Passport application was not presented to Audit |

|          |   |                        |            |   |                    |  |
|----------|---|------------------------|------------|---|--------------------|--|
| P0171668 | IRMA<br>GRISEL                                    | HARMOUCH               | 07/07/2011 | Not seen  | Not seen           | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0171669 | ALI<br>AHMAD                                      | HARMOUCH               | 07/07/2011 | Not seen  | Not seen           | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0177068 | MARK<br>ABDALLA<br>H                              | HARMOUCH               | 18/08/2011 | Not seen  | Not seen           | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0177069 | DANIEL  | HARMOUCH               | 18/08/2011 | Not seen  | Not seen           | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0178729 | AHMAD<br>(DOB 1 <sup>st</sup><br>October<br>1991) | HARMOUCH               | 06/09/2011 | 25308/11 dated<br>28 <sup>th</sup> July 2011                | Did not see a copy | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0180617 | KHODR<br>HUSSEIN                                  | HARMOUCH               | 29/09/2011 | 6068/96 dated<br>27 <sup>th</sup> September<br>1996         | Did not see a copy | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0189327 | IBRAHIM<br>MOHAME<br>D                            | HARMOUCH<br>E          | 11/01/2012 | Not seen  | Not seen           | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0190096 | MUSTAPH<br>A<br>MAHMOU<br>D                       | CHIHAB DIT<br>HARMOUCH | 18/01/2012 | Not seen  | Did not see a copy | Passport application was not presented to Audit                      |
| P0191370 | WAJIH   | HARMOUCH               | 06/02/2012 | 26412/12<br>belonged to<br>Francisco<br>Antonio<br>Aparicio | Did not see a copy | His certificate number was also issued to Francisco Antonio Aparicio |

|          |                             |               |            |   |                    |   |
|----------|-----------------------------|---------------|------------|---|--------------------|---|
| P0191420 | Wael                        | HARMOUCH<br>E | 07/02/2012 | 26324/12 dated<br>11-Jan-2012   | Carlos Perdomo     |   |
| P0193188 | AHMAD<br>DOB 1-Feb-<br>1992 | HARMOUCH<br>E | 24/02/2012 | 26363/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012  | Carlos Perdomo     |   |
| P0194503 | ABDUL<br>RAHMAN             | HARMOUCH      | 09/03/2012 | 26364/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012  | Carlos Perdomo     |   |
| P0194864 | AMMAR                       | HARMOUCH      | 15/03/2012 | 26321/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012  | Carlos Perdomo     | Passport application was not<br>presented to Audit  |
| P0194869 | WISSAM<br>HUSSEIN           | HARMOUCH      | 15/03/2012 | Not seen  | Not seen           | Passport application was not<br>presented to Audit  |
| P0194874 | SAMIR<br>MOUHAM<br>ED       | HARMOUCH      | 15/03/2012 | 26406/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012  | Hon Carlos Perdomo | Passport application was not<br>presented to Audit. He did not<br>do an oath of allegiance                    |
| P0197605 | SAAD<br>MOHAMA<br>D         | HARMOUCH      | 13/04/2012 | 26328/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012  | Hon Carlos Perdomo |   |
| P0198894 | OUSSAMA                     | HARMOUCH      | 30/04/2012 | 26426/12 dated<br>11 <sup>th</sup> January<br>2012  | Hon Carlos Perdomo | Passport application was not<br>presented to Audit; His<br>certificate # was also issued to<br>Mona Irma Meza |
| P0199989 | AHMAD                       | HARMOUCH<br>E | 14/05/2012 | DOB 10-Nov-1970<br>Also Ahmed Said<br>Harmouche<br>26239/12 dated 5 <sup>th</sup><br>January 2012 | Hon Carlos Perdomo | Passport application was not<br>presented to Audit  |

|          |                     |            |            |   |               |   |
|----------|---------------------|------------|------------|---|---------------|---|
| P0210167 | HUSSEIN             | HARMOUCH   | 24/07/2012 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0210172 | AHMAD               | HARMOUCH   | 24/07/2012 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0210198 | KHODER KHALED       | HARMOUCH   | 24/07/2012 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0212277 | TALAL AHMAD         | HARMOUCH   | 06/08/2012 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport was cancelled and seen on destruction list |
| P0212279 | TALAL AHMAD         | HARMOUCH   | 06/08/2012 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0223123 | ALI                 | HARMOUCH   | 28/11/2012 | 21321/07 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> October 2007 | Ralph Fonseca | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0228728 | FATEMA SOPHIA       | HARMOUCH E | 12/02/2013 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0229820 | HUSSEIN CHRISTOPHER | HARMOUCH E | 25/02/2013 |   | Not seen      |   |
| P0229821 | JAMIL MAHMOUD       | HARMOUCH E | 25/02/2013 |   | Not seen      |   |
| P0235730 | ALI MUSTAFA KHODER  | HARMOUCH   | 29/04/2013 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |
| P0235731 | LAYAN SAMI          | HARMOUCH E | 29/04/2013 | Not seen                                    | Not seen      | Passport application was not presented to Audit     |

|          |                           |          |            |   |                |  |
|----------|---------------------------|----------|------------|---|----------------|--|
| P0236203 | AYMAN                     | HARMOUCH | 06/05/2013 | 28321/13 dated<br>22 <sup>nd</sup> April 2013 | Elvin Penner   |  |
| P0236534 | OSAMA                     | HARMOUCH | 10/05/2013 | 28363/13 dated<br>25-April-2013               | Elvin Penner   |  |
| P0239289 | MAHMOU<br>D               | HARMOUCH | 17/06/2013 |   | Not seen       |  |
| P0242139 | HANI                      | HARMOUCH | 18/07/2013 | 28411/13 dated<br>30-May-2013                 | Elvin Penner   | Passport application was not<br>presented to Audit |
| P0246678 | AHMAD<br>ABDELRA<br>TTMAN | HARMOUCH | 06/09/2013 | N/A   | Born in Belize |  |



## Appendix H.1

The following is the list of nationality files that were seen on pending status at the INS for persons with the surname Harmouch/ Harmouche

| NAME                                       | FILE #   | DATE APPLIED   | APPLICATI<br>ON FORM | ADDRESS                                 | REMARKS BY<br>OFFICER FROM<br>NATIONALITY<br>SECTION   |
|--|----------|----------------|----------------------|---|--|
| MUSTAPHA<br>AMAD<br>CHEHAB DIT<br>HARMOUCH | 23374/12 | None<br>stated | SECTION<br>10        | PESCADOR<br>DRIVE, SAN<br>PEDRO<br>TOWN | “UPDATE OF<br>PASSPORT ,<br>ORIGINAL OF<br>REFEREE<br>RUBEN<br>GONZALEZ,<br>ALSO REFEREE<br>MUST KNOW<br>APPLICANT<br>FOR 5 YRS.”                              |
| MAHA<br>HARMOUCHE                          | 29965/13 | 05/01/2013     | SECTION<br>10        | SAN PEDRO<br>ISLAND,<br>BELIZE          | “SECTION 13<br>ON<br>APPLICATION<br>IS FILLED OUT<br>BY BORN<br>BELIZEAN”  |
| MOHAMAD<br>HARMOUCH                        | 27382/12 | 01/11/2012     | SECTION<br>10        | PESCADOR<br>DRIVE, SAN<br>PEDRO<br>TOWN | “APPLICANT<br>SIGNATURE<br>DOES NOT<br>CORRESPOND<br>WITH<br>SIGNATURE<br>ON PASSPORT,<br>BLOOD TEST IS<br>NEEDED, HE<br>WILL QUALIFY<br>UNTIL<br>08/03/2013.” |

## Appendix I

The following is the list of persons who were issued permanent residence status fraudulently as seen in the Permanent Residence Permit Register

(In some cases the names may have been misspelt as the writing in the PR Permit Register was not always legible)

| Name         | Permanent Residency Number | Place of Birth | Date of Birth (as recorded in the Register) | Receipt number | Date of issue     | Nationality Certificate & Date       | Minister who signed | Passport # & Issue Date   | Observations   |
|--------------|----------------------------|----------------|---|----------------|-------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------|---|--|
| Tianzhi Wang | 43608                      | China          | 15/10/1969                                  | replace old PR | 9th November 2011 | 25698/2011 dated 24 th November 2011 | Carlos Perdomo      | in Tianzhi Wang P0185786 issued 25th November 2011/ In Frealin Yang P0202374 issued 25th May 2012 | No file #; no evidence of payment of PR fee. Visa #43608 approved 9th November 2011; Visa copy had the signature of Ady Pacheco; PR stamp was signed by Ruth Meighan dated 9th November 2011; See Nationality Report |

## Appendix J

The following is a list of Nationality files (BNA) that were fraudulently duplicated and issued to different individuals

**Further investigation is required to determine whether all of those individuals were issued Belize nationality. Several of them were fraudulently issued Belize nationality and passports and are mentioned in our Nationality report**

| File number  | Date opened                                   | Name of Individual               | Date of Birth | Nationality     |
|--|---|----------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|
| 28067  | 24.1.12                                       | Emerson Mungua Pineda            | 22.8.68       | Nicaraguan      |
| 28067  | 24.1.12                                       | Angelia Toluo Hernandez          | 1.11.73       | Guatemalan      |
| 28018A   | 19.1.12                                       | Jose Vasquez Barrera             | 13.2.76       | Salvadoran      |
| 28018B   | 12.2.13                                       | Zhaoqiang Zhu Li                 | 26.10.73      | Chinese/Mexican |
| 27991A   | 19.1.12                                       | Celeni Mineth Sanchez            | 5.8.84        | Guatemalan      |
| 27791B. this is the information in the column  | 3.5.9 (this is the information in the column) | Xi Wang same name as 27791 below | 6.3.84        | Chinese         |
| 28003A   | 19.1.12                                       | Diego Maurrero N                 | 7.8.74        | Colombian       |
| 28003B this was written as 28008B, however an arrow was pointed to connect it with 28003 A | 19.1.12                                       | Cecilia Orellana                 | 3.3.70        | Honduran        |
| 27966A   | 18.1.12                                       | Gicela Arlette Moza              | 10.3.82       | Guatemalan      |
| 27966B   | 18.1.12                                       | Sonia Noemy Menjivar             | 10.8.84       | Salvadoran      |
| 27807A   | 16.9.13                                       | Xionara Janeth Reyes Lopez       | 26.3.87       | Honduran        |
| 27807B   | 27.9.73                                       | Ana Sofia Guenora De Lopez       | 6.5.72        | Salvadoran      |
| 27791  | 3.5.13  | Xi Wang                          | Not stated    | Chinese         |
| 27791  | 15.1.13                                       | Juana Bermudez Martinez          | 19.1.87       | Honduran        |

## Appendix K

The following is the list of BNA files that were opened in 2013 in the File Diary and were found inserted in the BNA Register under 2011 and 2012

**i) The names of these persons who applied in 2013 were found inserted in the 2012 BNA Register**

| <b>File number</b>   | <b>Date of application</b> | <b>Name</b>                      | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Nationality</b> |
|--|----------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|
| 27779  | 8.1.13                     | Henry Alberto Escobar Guzman     | 2.1.88               | Guatemalan         |
| 27789  | 7.1.13                     | Christopher Fortune              | 10.4.74              | Guyanese           |
| 27790  | 7.1.13                     | Clayton Greenidge                | 10.5.70              | Grenadian          |
| No file number stated but his name was squeezed in above Juana Bermudez Martinez | 3.5.13                     | Xi Wang                          | Not stated           | Chinese            |
| 27791  | 15.1.13                    | Juana Bermudez Martinez          | 19.1.87              | Honduran           |
| 27793  | 15.2.13                    | Mukresh Gidwani                  | 13.10.82             | Indian             |
| 27794  | 27.2.13                    | Eduardo Luciano Santiago         | 16.12.68             | American           |
| 27795  | 7.3.13                     | Jaimie Lynn Popper               | 21.8.87              | American           |
| 27796  | 11.4.13                    | Julie-Ann Keneisha Ellis Bradley | 22.8.82              | Jamaican           |
| 27797  | 11.4.13                    | Yu Qiong Chen                    | 19.9.84              | Chinese            |
| 27798  | 22.4.13                    | Sillua Del Carmen Penati         | 27.4.75              | Salvadoran         |
| 27799  | 22.4.13                    | Margaret Sanchez                 | 25.10.67             | Honduran           |
| 27800  | 23.5.13                    | Henry Alberto Urbina Ocampo      | 17.11.85             | Honduran           |
| 27801  | 7.6.13                     | Lisa Marie Aviles                | 13.1.77              | American           |
| 27803  | 21.6.13                    | Abilio Elias Dominguez Vaca      | 21.11.71             | Pananina           |

|        |         |                              |          |            |
|--------|---------|------------------------------|----------|------------|
| 27804  | 12.8.13 | Chun Yan Zhu                 | 5.3.79   | Chinese    |
| 27805  | 12.8.13 | Edgarlina Reyes Avila        | 6.2.76   | American   |
| 27806  | 20.8.13 | Shae-Ann Nadia Tashavn Keddo | 18.11.79 | Jamaican   |
| 27807B | 27.9.13 | Ana Sofia Guenora De Lopez   | 6.5.72   | Salvadoran |
| 27807A | 16.9.13 | Xionara Janeth Reyes Lopez   | 26.3.87  | Honduran   |
| 27808  | 19.9.13 | Olga Argentina Ocampo Ortez  | 19.8.60  | Honduran   |
| 27809  | 26.9.13 | Silvia Elena Parrales Ocon   | 24.8.72  | Nicaraguan |
| 27810  | 16.9.13 | Ana Naclery Perez            | 2.8.82   | Guatemalan |

## Appendix L

The following is the list of individuals who were issued nationality certificates according to the Numbers book/register on dates that were earlier, on the same day or very close to the date when their nationality files were opened according to the File Diary. In some cases the dates they submitted their nationality applications were not recorded in the BNA File Diary

| <b>Nationality</b>          | <b>Country of Birth/Nationality</b> | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>BNA File Number</b> | <b>Date opened</b> | <b>Certificate number</b> | <b>Certificate Date in Certificate Numbers Book/Register</b> | <b>Date on certificate as seen in BNA File or on passport application/Passport issued</b>            |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|--|--|
| John Joseph Hurry           | American                            | 17.11.66             | 32200                  | 6.9.13             | 28586                     | 2.9.13   | File not found. No passport seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Mahtab Damda                | USA                                 | 13.10.76             | 32000                  | 6.9.13             | 28583                     | 2.9.13   | File not found. No passport seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Levon Termendhyan           | American                            | 15.11.88             | 31998                  | 6.9.13             | 28585                     | 2.9.13   | File not found. No passport seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |
| Kourosh Esfandiar Akhitiari | Canadian                            | 25.12.61             | 31999                  | 6.9.13             | 28584                     | 2.9.13   | File not found. No passport seen issued prior to October 2013 or applicant may have changed his name |

## Appendix M

The following is the list of persons who received nationality but were not interviewed as required

| <b>Name</b>                 | <b>Country of Birth or Nationality</b> | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>File Number</b> | <b>Date opened</b> | <b>Certificate number</b> | <b>Date certificate was signed as seen in Nationality Numbers Book/register</b> | <b>Date on certificate</b>  | <b>Remarks</b>  |
|-----------------------------|--|----------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|---|---|-----------------|
| John Joseph Hurry           | American                               | 17.11.66             | 32200              | 6.9.13             | 28586                     | 2.9.13  | File not found  | Not interviewed |
| Mahtab Damda                | American                               | 13.10.76             | 32000              | 6.9.13             | 28583                     | 2.9.13  | File not found  | Not interviewed |
| Levon Termendhyan           | American                               | 15.11.88             | 31998              | 6.9.13             | 28585                     | 2.9.13  | File not found  | Not interviewed |
| Kourosh Esfandiar Akhitiari | Canadian                               | 25.12.61             | 31999              | 6.9.13             | 28584                     | 2.9.13  | File not found  | Not interviewed |
| Wonhong Kim                 | Korean                                 | 10.2.61              | 31986              | 2.9.13             | 28577                     | 2.9.13  | File not found but he applied for passport and photocopied certificate had date 22.4.13 | Not interviewed |

## Appendix N

The following is the list of persons who received nationality and did not pay the required nationality fee

| <b>Name</b>                      | <b>Nationality</b> | <b>Date of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate number</b> | <b>Date in numbers book/register</b> | <b>Date on certificate</b>  | <b>Receipt number for nationality &amp; Date of Receipt</b> |
|----------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| John Joseph Hurrey               | American           | 17.11.66             | 28586                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Mahtab Damda                     | USA                | 13.10.76             | 28583                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Levon Termendhyan                | American           | 15.11.88             | 28585                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Kourosh Esfandiar Akhitiari      | Canadian           | 25.12.61             | 28584                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Wonhong Kim                      | Korean             | 10.2.61              | 28577                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found but he applied for passport and photocopied certificate had date 22.4.13 | None  |
| Li –Cheng Yeh                    | Chinese            | 15.2.70              | 28587                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| June Wu (name not in file diary) | Not in file diary  | Not in file diary    | 28588                     | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Yu-Ming Yeh                      | Not in file diary  | Not in file diary    | 28588.1                   | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Yu-Jia Yeh                       | Not in file diary  | Not in file diary    | 28588.2                   | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Yu-Wei Yeh                       | Not in file diary  | Not in file diary    | 28588.3                   | 2.9.13                               | File not found  | None  |
| Wenge Mao                        | Chinese            | 26.11.67             | 28572                     | 16.8.13                              | File not found  | None  |



## Appendix O

The following is the list of recipients of nationality certificates and/or passports whose names and/or signatures were not seen in the Swearing-In Register for the period 10<sup>th</sup> February 2012 to 6<sup>th</sup> September 2013, signed copies of their oath of Allegiance were not seen in their nationality files, the oath document was not signed by the applicant, or the signature on their oath document did not match with the signature seen on other documents

**A) The following persons' names and signatures were not seen in the Swearing-in Register as having taken the oath of allegiance but they were issued Belize Nationality and/or passports**

| <b>Name</b>                   | <b>Nationality/Place of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number Issued and date</b> | <b>BNA File number</b>   | <b>Passport Number/ Date issued</b>   |
|-------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|--------------------------|---|
| Yakup Sut                     | Turkey                            | 28570 dated 16 <sup>th</sup> Aug 13       | 31973 opened 20-Aug-2013 | P0245775 issued 26-Aug-13   |
| Wenge Mao                     | China                             | 28572 dated 16 <sup>th</sup> Aug13        | 31981 opened 26-Aug-2013 | No evidence of passport issued prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name (See Nationality Report) |
| Yeh Li Cheng (Li – Cheng Yeh) | China                             | 28587 dated 2 <sup>nd</sup> Sept 13       | 31983 opened 28-Aug-2013 | No evidence of passport issued prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name (See Nationality Report) |
| Guo Theng Dang                | China                             |   | 31984 opened 2-Sept-2013 | No evidence of passport issued prior to October 2013 or he may have changed his name (See Nationality Report) |

**C) Persons whose Nationality files did not have a signed copy of the oath of allegiance document or there were discrepancies observed when the signature on the document was compared to other documents**

| <b>Name (includes all names seen in the Nationality File)</b> | <b>Nationality/<br/>Place of Birth</b> | <b>File #</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate#</b> | <b>Oath of allegiance</b>  |
|---|--|---------------|---------------------------------|--|
| Denzel Lerone Hernandez Brooks                                | Honduras                               | 29156/12      | 28438/13                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Yong Zhi Huang  | China                                  | 29284/12      | 28298/13                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Samir Mouhamed Harmouch                                       | Lebanon                                | 26670/11      | 26406/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Ammar Harmouch  | Lebanon                                | 27135/12      | 26321/12                        | The signature was not the applicant's signature as seen several places on Nationality application and on police record |
| Arnulfo Escobar Regalado                                      | -                                      | 26332/11      | 27915/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Fang Ling Wu  | China                                  | 25665/10      | 27793/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Sindy Corina Chohuoj Chan                                     | Guatemala                              | 28005/12      | 27153/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Hui Juan Liu  | China                                  | 25664/11      | 27686/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Ting Yu Chao A.K.A Taffany Chao                               | China                                  | 25673/10      | 27795/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Jesus Angel Rafailan Machuca                                  | Salvador                               | 27595         | 26967/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Yoshiki Kai Velasquez   | USA                                    | 26220/11      | 27772/12                        | No copy seen in file   |
| Mirta Marta Calderon Perez                                    | Guatemala                              | 27649/12      | 27086/12                        | No copy seen in file   |

## Appendix P

The following is the list of nationality files examined that had the same bogus referees, Therese Cabral and Robert Theodore Hulse

| <b>File Number</b> | <b>Certificate Numbers</b> | <b>Date</b> | <b>Name</b>         | <b>Recommenders</b>   |
|--------------------|----------------------------|-------------|---------------------|---|
| 17272/02           | 16607/02                   | May 2002    | Thomas Edward Rubin | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| 16781/01           | 15203/01                   | 29-Nov-01   | Yu-Wei Liang        | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| 16781/01           | 15204/01                   | 29-Nov-01   | Yao-Ming Liang      | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| 16781/01           | 15205/01                   | 29-Nov-01   | Jui-Lan Liang       | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| 16781/01           | 15206/01                   | 29-Nov-01   | Yu-Ting Liang       | Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |

## Appendix Q

The following is the list of nationality certificates dated between 2001-2003 that had certificate, Register or BNA File discrepancies

| <b>Name</b>                         | <b>Certificate #</b> | <b>Date of Certificate</b> | <b>Signature of Minister appeared as</b>  | <b>Register &amp; Other Observations</b>   |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|---|--|
| Jung-Chin Lin                       | 15848/02             | 5-March-2002               | Maxwell Samuels   | All persons were placed in 1 Nationality file #16781/02. Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Yi-Fu Lin                           | 15850/02             | 5-March-2002               | Maxwell Samuels   | All persons were placed in 1 Nationality file #16781/02. Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Sheng-Yi Lin                        | 15851/02             | 5-March-2002               | Maxwell Samuels   | All persons were placed in 1 Nationality file #16781/02. Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Hsiu-Chin Tseng & Cheng Cheng Tseng | 15849/02             | 5-March-2002               | Signature on certificate was Maxwell Samuels  | All persons were placed in 1 Nationality file #16781/02. Unclear photocopy of Voter's ID of Therese Estelle Cabral & Robert Theodore Hulse |
| Anzhella Grishchenko                | 17153/02             | 16-Jul-02                  | Name imprinted on replacement certificate was Hon. Maxwell Samuels and it had no signature of Director to certify the replacement | Register (Section 10) had no information for the applicant   |

## Appendix R

The following is the list of missing nationality files for persons who allegedly acquired Belize nationality mostly under Section 11A (through Economic Investment)

| <b>Name of Nationality Certificate/Passport Holder</b> | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Certificate Number &amp; Date</b> | <b>Date on Certificate</b> | <b>Signature of Minister appeared as</b> | <b>Section under which acquired Nationality</b> | <b>Observations</b>   |
|--|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------------|--|---|---|
| Ola Ali Youssef Youssef El Alamy                       | Kuwait                  | 049/95 dated 15-Dec-95               | 15-Dec-95                  | Dean Barrow                              | unknown   | Did not exist in any Register. Certificate 049 was for Lee Yung Chu-Lin dated 8-Jan-1989 under Section 11A & for Expectacion de Jesus Mendoza dated 20-Aug-1982 under Section 10 No children included on certificate. |
| Anaan Souheil El Musleh                                | Beirut, Lebanon         | 1811/91 dated 18-Mar-1991            | 18-Mar-91                  | Said Musa                                | 11A   | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration but No file # recorded in Register. No children included on certificate.  |
| Daniel Joseph El Hage                                  | Beirut, Lebanon         | 1907/91 dated 20-Aug-1991            | 20-Aug-91                  | Said Musa                                | 11A   | Name seen in the Register of Citizens by Registration but No file # recorded in Register. No children included on certificate   |

## Appendix S

The following is the list of nationality certificates numbers used by persons whose names were not seen in the Registers of Citizens by Registration (Section 10 & Section 11A)

**(There was no name, date of certificate, date of oath of affirmation, # of children included on certificate, file # , Section (under Law) under which certificate was granted etc. in the Registers)**

| Name                          | Certificate Number | Date of Certificate | Minister who signed or Director who Replaced Certificate  |
|-------------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|---|
| Shu Ming Chen aka Sumi Chen   | 25424/11           | 22-September-2011   | Carlos Perdomo  |
| Ni-Yen Lee (aka Annie Lee)    | 25424.1/11         | 22-September-2011   | Carlos Perdomo  |
| Ting-Chun Lee (aka Kevin Lee) | 25424.2/11         | 22-September-2011   | Carlos Perdomo  |
| Bingquan Huang                | 21/02/2000         | 22-June-2000        | The name on the Replacement certificate was Maxwell Samuels but it was replaced by what appeared to be the signature of Gareth Murillo on 25-Jan-2010 |
| Xiaobo Ji                     | 041/3/00           | 24-Aug-00           | Name on Certificate was Hon Maxwell Samuels but there was no signature of any Director who replaced at the back                                       |

## Appendix T

The following is the list of nationality applicants who had Police Record Violations

| <b>Name of Applicant for Nationality</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate#</b> | <b>Current Address as per Certificate</b>       | <b>Country of Birth</b> | <b>Police Record (6 months validity)</b>                                  |
|--|---------------------------------|---|-------------------------|---|
| Shu-Tang Chang (applicant)               | 12504/00<br>dated 4-July-2000   | 29 Albert Street,<br>Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/<br>application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired) |
| Chung Pao-Chu Chang (wife)               | 12503/00<br>dated 4-July-2000   | 29 Albert Street,<br>Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/<br>application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired) |
| Wen-Cheng Chang (aka Eric Chang)         | 12505/00<br>dated 4-July-2000   | 29 Albert Street,<br>Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/<br>application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired) |
| Kang-Chih Chang (aka Andy Chang)         | 12506/00<br>dated 4-July-2000   | 29 Albert Street,<br>Apartment #10, Belize City | Taiwan ROC              | dated 15-Oct-1999/<br>application dated 5 or 8 June-2000 (It had expired) |

| Name of Applicant for Nationality | Nationality Certificate#  | Current Address as per Certificate | Country of Birth   | Police Record (6 months validity)  |
|-----------------------------------|---|------------------------------------|--------------------|--|
| Ziad Omais                        | 28151/13 dated 23-May-2013  | Santa Rita Road, Corozal           | Dakar, Senegal     | No   |
| Wael Harmouche                    | 26324/12 dated 11-Jan-2012  | Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town     | El Sfireh, Lebanon | picture in applicant's Lebanese passport was printed and copied on to photo paper for Criminal Record    |
| Tian Zhi Wang                     | 25698/11 dated 24-Nov-2011  | Mountain View Boulevard, Belmopan  | Hubei, China       | Photo used for Police Report was picture of a picture  |
| Saad Mohamad Harmouch             | 26328/12 dated 11-Jan-2012  | Pescador Drive, San Pedro Town     | El Sfireh, Lebanon | Picture of a picture used on Police Report for Criminal Records Office                                   |
| Ahmad Harmouche                   | 26363/12 dated 11-Jan-2012 (applicant did not qualify until 30-Sept-2012 or 1-October-2013) | Hurricane Street, San Pedro Town   | El Sfireh, Lebanon | Photo used for Police Report was picture of a picture taken from his passport picture (very young photo) |
| Yih Wei Ku                        | 25202/11  | Succotz Village                    | China              | No   |
| Ali Zaouali                       | 25506/11  | #9 Barrack Rd, Bze City            | France             | No   |



| Name of Applicant for Nationality | Nationality Certificate# | Current Address as per Certificate | Country of Birth     | Police Record (6 months validity)         |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------|---|
| Hui Juan Liu                      | 27686/12                 | 40 Mahogany St, Bze City           | China                | Police Record was not signed by applicant |
| Sidia Elizabeth Cabrera           | 27254/12                 | Spanish Lookout                    | Honduras             | No  |
| Thomas Edward Rubin               | 16607/02                 | #97 Vista Del Mar, Bze City        | San Diego California | No  |
| WenYing Huang                     | 5903/02                  | 4th Ave, Czl Town                  | China                | No  |
| Feng Jiao Huang                   | 15904/02                 | 4th Ave, Czl Town                  | China                | No  |
| Jung-Chin Lin                     | 15848/02                 | #49 Vista Del Mar                  | China                | No  |
| Sheng-Yi Lin                      | 15851/02                 | #49 Vista Del Mar                  | China                | No  |
| Yi-Fu Lin                         | 15850/02                 | #49 Vista Del Mar                  | China                | No  |
| Hsiu-Chin                         | 15849/02                 | #49 Vista Del Mar                  | China                | No  |
| Meng Cheng Li                     | 16768/02                 | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City          | China                | No  |
| Caiqiong Li                       | 16767/02                 | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City          | China                | No  |
| Mengtang Li                       | 16766/02                 | #42 Freetown Rd, Bze City          | China                | No  |

## Appendix U

The following is the list of nationality and permanent residency files requested for examination from the Nationality Section/ Registry by Audit and were not presented

| <b>Name</b>                       | <b>File #</b> | <b>Nationality Certificate</b> | <b>Date on Certificate or Date seen in Certificate Numbers Book</b> | <b>Date File Requested</b>   |
|-----------------------------------|---------------|--------------------------------|---|--|
| Yanira Valle                      | 26539         | 28268/13                       | 22-Apr-13   | File requested February 25, 2014<br>(File could not be found in Registry as per Internal Report for BNA) |
| Dongtao Jin aka Dong Tao Jin      | 29948         | # 28382/13                     | 19-May-13   | Requested February 2014  |
| Yiu-Pang Chen aka Peter Pang      | 31922         | 28456/13)                      | 18-May-13   | Requested February 2014  |
| Jac Jie Qin aka Marc Chin         | 31924         | 28457/13                       | 18-May-13   | February 2014  |
| Quoc Vinh Truong aka Simon Truong | 31923         | 28458/13                       | 18-May-13   | February 2014  |
| Jia-Jing Lai                      | 31926         | 28462/13                       | 22-May-13   | February 2014 & 19 <sup>th</sup> June 2014   |
| Obel Corcho Melgarejo             | 31937         | 28491/13                       | 19-Jul-13   | February 2014  |
| Maxim Poon Wong                   | no file #     | 28417/13                       | 30-May-13   | 14-July-2014 (File was not at Registry, Special Branch/ with Minister/ Upstairs etc).                    |
| Willian Eduardo Garcia Lemus      |               | 28523/13                       | 23-Aug-13   | Requested on March 13, 2014  |
| Yakup Sut                         | 31973         | 28570/13                       | 03-Jun-13   | February 2014  |
| Wonhong Kim                       | 31986         | 28577/13                       | 22-Apr-13   | 21-November 2013 and again on 25-2-2014  |

## Appendix V

The following is the list of persons who were issued Belizean nationality by Descent through parents who received through Citizenship by Registration including Citizens through Economic Investment

**Their parent(s) claim to Belizean nationality could not be verified as genuine for various reasons as outlined below**

| Name  | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Descent<br>Nationality<br>Certificate<br>Details   | Name of<br>Parent  | Place/<br>Country of<br>Birth | Nationality by<br>Registration Certificate<br>& Register Information<br>Details   | Other<br>Observations   |
|---|-------------------------------|--|--|-------------------------------|---|---|
| Danny<br>Williams<br>(previously<br>Danil<br>Bessmertny<br>y) | St. Petersburg,<br>Russia     | 1684/1/11Vol.II(54<br>) dated 15 <sup>th</sup> March<br>2011<br><br>(Copy of certificate<br>was not seen)<br><br><b>Descent<br/>Certificate<br/>#1684/1/11 Vol XI<br/>(54) dated 28<sup>th</sup><br/>December 2011</b> | Father: Boris<br>Sokholov who<br>changed his<br>name to Boris<br>Bessmertnyy<br>on the 25 <sup>th</sup><br>January 2008<br>and who<br>changed his<br>name to Barry<br>Williams on<br>the 16 <sup>th</sup><br>February 2012 | Angarsk,<br>Russia            | 10/1/98 dated 20 <sup>th</sup> January<br>1998;<br><br>(P0078107 issued 30 <sup>th</sup><br>January 2008 & P0156575<br>issued 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2011 in<br>the name Boris<br>Bessmertnyy). | P0181927 issued 7 <sup>th</sup><br>October 2011 in the<br>name Danil<br>Bessmertnyy and<br><br>P0196239 issued<br>28 <sup>th</sup> March 2012 in<br>the name Danny<br>Williams (name<br>changed on the 22 <sup>nd</sup><br>February 2012)<br><br>Nationality file for<br>Boris Sokholov did |

|             |                                      |  |  |                                    |  |   |
|-------------|--------------------------------------|--|--|------------------------------------|--|---|
|             |                                      | <b>was seen as issued to Rei-Ya Gilharry</b>   | Mother:<br>Unknown   |                                    |  | not contain a birth certificate for him nor the descent application with birth certificate of Danil Bessmertnyy to ascertain that Danil was indeed the son of Boris   |
| Lamar Awwad | Ras Al-Khaimah, United Arab Emirates | 1684/1/12 Vol. VIII (40) dated 25 <sup>th</sup> September 2012; signed by what appeared as the signature of Maria Mendez (Marin) but it was not clear since department's stamp was placed over the signature | Father: Nader Ibrahim Mohamed Hassan Awwad<br><br>Mother: Rasha Ahmed El Hourani | Kuwait City, Kuwait<br><br>Unknown | Father Nader Ibrahim Mohamed Hassan Awwad had Belizean Nationality by Registration Certificate #2485/92 dated 22-October-1992.<br><br><b>There was no entry for this certificate 2485/92 under Section 11A; No file #; no file presented when requested on 19<sup>th</sup> June 2014. Under Section 10, certificate # was for Julio Cesar Martinez</b> | Father had already received passport #P0156077 issued 27-January-2011 and was already renewing it on 5 <sup>th</sup> December 2012 and received P0223751 issued 5 <sup>th</sup> December 2012.<br><br>Temporary passport #T0000523 for Lamar Awwad was signed by Ruth Meighan on 26-September- 2012 |

## Appendix W

The following is the list of persons whose passport applications stated that they stayed at Belize Hotels for first issue or renewal of Belize passports (Section 10 Registration)

**(Several of the individuals listed below were issued fraudulent Nationality certificates)**

| <b>Name</b>   | <b>Place of Birth</b> | <b>Date entered Belize</b> | <b>Visa # issued/date</b>   | <b>Nationality certificate #</b>  | <b>Minister who signed or Director who replaced</b> | <b>Belize Passport Number issued/date</b>  | <b>Other Observations</b>  |
|---------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|
| Johnson Chien | China                 | Unknown                    | He renewed Belize passport number P0088759 issued 1 <sup>st</sup> July 2008 | 9355/99 dated 18 <sup>th</sup> March 1989. In the Register (Section 10) this certificate number was seen as issued to Sheng Chien but no deed | Copy was not seen                                   | P0172786 issued 18 <sup>th</sup> July 2011 | Biltmore Hotel was stated as Belize address on passport application form.<br><br>Passport Recommender was Andy Lee, JP of Benque Viejo |

|                |        |         |         |  |   |  |  |
|----------------|--------|---------|---------|--|---|--|--|
|                |        |         |         | poll was attached to passport application to verify name change  |   |  |  |
| Chun-Lang Chen | Taiwan | Unknown | Unknown | Fraudulent Replacement certificate #17367/03 dated 7 <sup>th</sup> February 2003. No entry seen in the Register Section 10 | Name on certificate was Hon. Ralph Fonseca replaced by what appeared to be the signature of Gareth Murillo on 9-Sept-2009 | P0188724 issued 29 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 | <p>Belize address was Bull Frog Inn. Passport recommender was Florentino Baiza.</p> <p>Copy of Taiwanese passport #303161764 issued 10<sup>th</sup> June 2011 was used with passport application</p> |

## Appendix X

The following is the email response received from IPC Belize

Dear Customer

Thank you for your interest in the Belize Passport & Citizenship Program. Full Belize citizenship via naturalization including passport can be arranged within 30 days and there are several steps which must be taken (legal residency, issue of the naturalization certificate, document issue). The total cost for the main applicant is \$9,900.

Family members have a 50% discount if their orders are processed at the same time and children under the age of 18 are processed free of charge as part of the family package. We only deal with real government issued documents which are valid for life and fully renewable. They can be delivered in person if you decide to travel to Belize directly at the Ministry.

In case you prefer processing from your current location delivery will be arranged via the nearest Belize Consulate or courier (DHL). A \$3,900 advance is required to proceed with the remaining \$6000 balance due upon order completion (30 days).

We are the only company in the world that accepts payment of the remaining balance within 3 business days after delivery of the order has been completed and the client has received the documents through the Belize Embassy/Consulate or via DHL.

There is an additional 10% discount on order paid fully in advance (optional). Using this option the total order cost would be \$8,900 for a single applicant.

Please follow the link below for a list of visa free countries that citizens of Belize can travel to:

[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Visa\\_requirements\\_for\\_Belizean\\_citizens](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Visa_requirements_for_Belizean_citizens)

and let us know if we can be of any further assistance.

Sincerely

Richard Hoffmann

IPC Belize  
3722 Regent Street West  
Belize City, Belize

fax: +501 (0)262 885

[ipcbelize@mail.be](mailto:ipcbelize@mail.be)

<http://www.ipcbelize.com>

Ce message et ses pieces jointes peuvent contenir des informations confidentielles ou privilegiees et ne doivent donc pas etre diffuses, exploites ou copies sans autorisation. Si vous avez recu ce message par erreur, veuillez le signaler a l'expediteur et le detruire ainsi que les pieces jointes.

This message and its attachments may contain confidential or privileged information that may be protected by law; they should not be distributed, used or copied without authorization. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender and delete this message and its attachments.



