

# OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL OF BELIZE



## ***SPECIAL AUDIT - VISA IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY DEPARTMENT***

**FOR THE PERIOD  
2011 - 2013**



***Office of the Auditor General***

*Second Floor*

*Garden City Building*

*Almond Drive*

*Belmopan City*

*Belize, C.A.*

*P.O. Box 7*

*Tel. No. 822-2850/0208/0214 (General Office)*

*828-4362 (Auditor General)*

*Fax No. 501-822-1041*

Email: [AuditorGeneralBelize@audit.gov.bz](mailto:AuditorGeneralBelize@audit.gov.bz)

May 31, 2016

Honourable Dean O. Barrow  
Prime Minister  
Minister of Finance  
Office of the Prime Minister  
Sir Edney Cain Building  
Belmopan

Dear Prime Minister:

In Accordance with Section 120 (4) of the Belize Constitution 1981, and Section 16(3) of the Finance and Audit (Reform) Act No 12 of 2005, I hereby present a Special Visa and Other Findings Report on the Immigration and Nationality Department for period January 1, 2012 – September 30, 2013.

I shall be grateful if you would cause the report to be laid before the House of Representatives and the Senate in due course.

Respectfully submitted,

**DOROTHY A. BRADLEY (MRS)**  
Auditor General



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## VISA

### *SECTION I*

Acronyms.....	page i
Executive Summary.....	page iii
Audit Mandate .....	page 1
Background/Reason for Audit.....	page 1
Audit Objectives.....	page 1
What we examined.....	page 1
What we found.....	page 2
Recommendations.....	page 60

### **Appendices**



## Acronyms

PR- Permanent Residence

INS- Immigration and Nationality Service

BECIP – Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program

BNA – Belize Nationality Application

BMPS – Belmopan Station

BWBS – Belize Western Border Station

BNBS – Belize Northern Border Station

PGIA – Phillip Goldson International Airport

OIC – Officer in Charge

BMRPIS – Belize Machine Readable Passport Issuance System

BPIS – Belize Passport Issuance System

BMRPAIP – Belize Machine Readable Passport Application and Issuance Process

MRPS – Machine Readable Passport System

QA – Quality Assurance

FO – Finance Officer

FO Number – Financial Orders Number

USR\_FNAME – User First Name

USR\_LNAME – User Last Name

USR Step – User Step

App Step Date – Application Step Date

TEP – Temporary Employment Permits

DINS – Director of Immigration and Nationality Service

PRF – Permanent Residence File

S.I – Statutory Instrument

VSU – Vital Statistic Unit  
HQ – Headquarters  
CIDAPS – Central Intelligence Data and Analysis Processing System  
CRO – Criminal Records Office  
JICC – Joint Intelligence Coordinating Center  
CIB – Crimes Investigation Branch  
ACP – Assistant Commissioner of Police  
JP – Justice of the Peace  
HIV – Human Immunodeficiency Virus  
VDRL – Venereal Disease Research Laboratory  
DOA – Date of Arrival  
FIU – Financial Intelligence Unit  
W/Sergeant – Woman Sergeant  
ROC – Republic of China  
ID Cards – Identification Cards  
IT – Information Technology  
CITO – Central Information Technology Office  
SSB – Social Security Board  
UK – United Kingdom  
US – United States  
CITO – Central Information Technology Office  
CSME – Caribbean Single Market Economy



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. On September 30, 2013 the Office of the Auditor General received a copy of a memorandum from the Immigration and Nationality Department regarding some missing visas.
2. The Office of the Auditor General initially decided to undertake a Compliance Audit of the Department's Visa Section. However, during the preliminary phase of the Visa Audit the Immigration Department was faced with a passport scandal and on that basis the audit scope was broaden to encompass both the Passport and Nationality Sections.
3. The audit covers the period 2011 to 2013 and starts with the Visa examination progressing into the Nationality and Passport Examinations. The individual reports are lengthy due to the different findings and the manner in which they were executed. The presentation is done in sections: Visa - Section I, Nationality - Section II, Passport Section - III and Other findings – IV. **Appendices presented, for each section, reflect a small percentage of total findings because of the volume of actual findings.**

### Visa- Section I

4. Upon examination of the Immigration and Nationality Visa application files many inconsistencies were found regarding the issuance of visas. Cases were found whereby persons who were issued visas had acquired Belizean Nationality and Passport within very short periods. Twenty eight such cases were cited. In another instance fifteen individuals were issued visas and subsequently, quickly received permanent residency. Many visa stubs were missing, eight of which prompted the Office to initially conduct an audit investigation.
5. Ministers of Government, CEO, Constituency representatives and a Mayor made recommendations and requests to the Department for the approval of Belize Visas. Even though The Nationality Act makes no such provision for those requests they were facilitated by some of the Department's representatives. Additionally, it was observed that visa applicants from countries that needed DINS and Security clearance checks were granted visas. This was done based on the presentation of US visas and US permanent residency cards without verification of authenticity of said visas and residency cards from the US Department of Immigration. Cases of persons with expired US visas obtaining Belize visas were also observed.

6. The Department of Immigration uses Visa Foils/Stickers supplied from the 3M Company. An order was placed for 25,000.00 of such Visa Foil/Stickers which was not made to specification and the 25,000 stickers had to be destroyed. It is of tremendous concern that such a huge destruction, of Government's property, was carried out without the involvement of the Office of the Auditor General. Furthermore concerning Is the fact that upon reviewing the Department's file it was discovered that conflicting destruction dates were noted and the only witnesses to said destruction were two officers from the Department and a Justice of the Peace. The Ministry of National Security assured the Audit Team that only one payment was made to 3M Company for the replacement of the 25,000 Visas/Foils. However, we could not confirm whether or not the Government of Belize incurred any additional cost.
7. Four hundred sixty (460) Visa Foil/Stickers were returned to the Department for safekeeping by some embassies however, 400 of those stickers were unaccounted. The Visa Ledger reflected that only 60 Stickers, of the 460 returned, were reissued.
8. It is of grave concern to this Office that in all instances of procurement, done by the Immigration Department, there was no evidence to substantiate that the Department conducted any form of verification upon receipt. It is to be noted that even the US Customs inspection Agency carries out random checks to ensure that declared content is as stated. Furthermore disturbing is the fact that even when no verification is done upon receipt the Department has no register in place to reflect actual movement of Visas based on receipt, issuance and balance on hand. Data Information is kept in quite a haphazard manner. It is of deep concern to this Office to find important documents reflecting the sovereignty of our nation being managed in such reckless manner.
9. Another finding was that the poor management of the Revenue Form Issue Note (RFIN) resulted in undetected defected RFIN serial numbers.

The Office of the Auditor General found it necessary to bring to the Chief Executive Officer's attention the resistance encountered at the Immigration Department. We eventually wrote directly to the Minister advising that actions taken by the Department were not acceptable and warranted immediate attention. Subsequent to our memos the Acting Director, Maria Marin, wrote explaining her position. However, this Office's position remained the same and cautioned that any further resistance in denying Audit access would result in further action.

The same can be said for the Director, Central Information Technology Office (CITO). The Financial Secretary's attention was drawn to the fact that an Officer from the CITO's Office was assigned to the Audit Team, in Accordance with the Finance and Audit Reform Act,

Section 13 1(b). During the ongoing examination that Officer was withdrawn and sent away without any notification. The action taken by the Director of CITO contravenes the Audit and Finance Reform Act Section 13 1 (b). That Officer, in essence, abandoned the audit investigation and the Team had no other means of extracting pertinent data that could have further substantiated our findings.

I take this opportunity to acknowledge Officers within the Immigration Department for assistance provided to the Audit Team. To those other agencies that also provided the Team with the necessary assistance it sought. To the Supervisor of Audit, Ms. Carla Faber and Officers assigned to conduct the audit.

It is anticipated that the Report presented will provide the Immigration Department with pertinent information required to effect meaningful reform regarding policy formulation and implementation. It should also lend to the building of necessary controls to better effect policies, changes and procedures.



**AUDIT INVESTIGATION –VISAS ISSUED BY IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY  
DEPARTMENT IN BELMOPAN, BELIZE NORTHERN BORDER, BELIZE WESTERN  
BORDER AND PHILIP GOLDSON INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT DURING THE PERIOD  
1<sup>ST</sup> JANUARY 2012 TO 30<sup>TH</sup> SEPTEMBER 2013**

---

The following comments, suggestions and recommendations arise as a result of an Audit investigation on the issuance of Belize Visas maintained by the Director of Immigration and Nationality at the Belmopan station, Belize Northern Border Station, Belize Western Border Station and Philip Goldson International Airport Station covering the period 1st January 2012 to 30th September 2013.

**Audit Mandate**

2. In accordance with **Section 14** of the Finance and Audit Act 2005 which states “ If at any time it appears to the Auditor General that any fraud, or serious loss or serious irregularity has occurred in the receipt, custody or expenditure of public moneys or in the receipt, custody, issue, sale, transfer or delivery of any stamps, securities, stores or other Government property of any kind whatsoever, or in the accounting for the same, he shall immediately bring the matter to the notice of the Minister of Finance”.

**Background/Reason for Audit**

The Office of the Auditor General decided to conduct an audit investigation after receiving a memorandum reference IMM/GEN/21/01/2013 (8) Vol. II dated September 30, 2013 from the Immigration and Nationality Department on October 09 2013, which reported a case of some missing visas. Based on the memorandum received the Office decided to undertake a Compliance Audit of the Visa Section at the main office Belmopan, the Belize Northern Border, Belize Western Border and the Phillip Goldson International Airport.

**Audit Objective**

3. To determine whether every person entering Belize as a visitor requiring a visa was issued a visa approved by the Director of Immigration and Nationality in accordance with Immigration and Nationality visa policies and procedures and the Immigration Act Chapter 156 section 8(3-a)

**What we examined:**

4. We examined the following:
  - Immigration and Nationality Belize Visa application files



- The Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS) List
- The visa foils/stubs, monthly visa returns and Visa Registers for Belmopan, Belize Northern and Western Borders and Phillip Goldson International Airport Stations.
- All Station Visa files

Additionally, we interviewed the OICs/Port Commanders for the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA to determine whether:

- Visa applications and the issuance of visas were in accordance with the law.
- Ministers of Government were involved in the visa process
- Counterfoils and monthly reports submitted to the Finance Officer, Immigration and Nationality.

### **What we found:**

#### **Twenty eight (28) unqualified individuals were first issued visas and thereafter Belizean Passport.**

Procedure 6 page (6) of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedures Manual July 2011 states:

“Proof of (5) years residence in the country. If applicant has permanent residence in Belize, the date of arrival must be checked to ensure that the five year domicile period is correct. If they have only passports, the passports must reflect the five year domicile period through successive temporary status.....Please note that based on the checklist provided by the Solicitor General’s Office, a person who has permanent residence but does not have a passport must still show proof that they have been residing in Belize. Having a permanent residence card is not enough proof; therefore they must a declaration stating reason why they are not in possession of passport.....”

5. We observed twenty eight instances where individuals were approved visas for entry into the country and thereafter issued Belizean Passport. This was revealed when we compared the visa applications against the Belize Passport Issuance System list. A careful examination of the system showed the application and issued dates for those Applicants. It was evident that they were issued Belizean nationality and passport within a short time frame which is contrary to the Nationality and Passport Regulations. Listed below at **Table A** are applicants who were issued visas as well as Belizean passports although they were not qualify for passports.

**Table A**

The following is the list of individuals who were issued visas, Belizean nationality and passports although they did not qualify for the nationality and passports

<b>Name</b>	<b>DOB</b>	<b>Birth Place</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number issued</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>	<b>Passport Number</b>	<b>Date of Issue</b>
Jin Chen An	15/08/73	China	Roger Tien	25/10/12	V00034694	797288	P0223556	04/12/12
Xi Wang	06/03/84	China	Christopher Zheng	15/01/13	V00036693	841852	P0238890	12/06/13
Ji Wang	05/06/63	China	Jiabi Nunez	11/10/12	V00034666	791761	P0236503	10/05/13
Zi Jian Chen	10/01/81	China	Daxi Huang	12/06/13	V00039578	915470	P0204841	18/06/12
Liming Huang	30/07/75	China	Roger Tien	25/10/12	V00034693	797286	P0239621	20/06/13
Chang Chen	30/12/91	China	Can Huan Wu	06/02/13	V00037528	856112	P0215012	21/08/12
Khaled Assaad	01/01/90	Lebanon	Mouhamad Assad	08/05/12	V00031396	708254	P0187799	20/12/11
Jimin Guan	05/04/70	China	He had no sponsor. Minister Erwin Contreras wrote letter dated 29 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 to Director	05/03/13	V00037753	875314	P0239029	13/06/13
Tian Zhi Wang	15/10/69	China	Wen Bin Chen	07/11/11	V00025636	654330	P0202374	25/05/12
Liudmila Shengeliia	18/01/70	Russia	She had no sponsor	12/11/12	V00034608	704558	P0193776	02/03/12
Wei Hang Chen	02/09/90	China	Kwok Chun Chan	31/05/12	V00031450	720143	P0207661	06/07/12
Chang Yang	04/04/99	China	David Wang	06/12/11	V00026823	622280	P0230780	06/03/13
Xiaobing Yang	22/04/68	China	David Wang	06/12/11	V00026824	622279	P0230769	06/03/13

Name	DOB	Birth Place	Name of Sponsor	Date of Application	Visa Number issued	Receipt Number	Passport Number	Date of Issue
Ruijie Ren	26/09/77	China	David Wang	06/12/11	V00026822	622281	P0228610	11/02/13
Weidong Li	03/12/67	China	He had no sponsor. Minister Erwin Contreras wrote letter dated 29 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 to Director	05/03/13	V00037752	875311	P0239028	13/03/13
Muping Chen	30/06/67	China	He had no sponsor. Minister Erwin Contreras wrote letter dated 29 <sup>th</sup> January 2013 to Director	26/03/13	V00038497	886498	P0236265	07/05/13
Shang Shang Wang	08/12/95	China	Kim Chee	03/04/13	V00038523	890129	P0236272	07/05/13
Jiahao Wu	26/11/95	China	Liang Hao	29/09/11	431/Bmp/11	586613	P0187311	08/12/11
Weihamg Chen	02/09/90	China	Kwok Chun Chan	31/05/12	V00031450	720143	P0207661	06/07/12
Ying Zheng	18/04/72	China	David Wang	06/12/11	566/BMP/11	622782	P0230801	06/03/13
Geetu Chaudhary		India	Avnesh Chaudhary	11/6/12	V00031473	725823	P0240077	26/06/13
Yongbo Ye	12/09/68	China	Wen Bin Chen/ Chen's Mall	19/12/11	V00026842	629420	P0189513	06/01/12
Mohamed Mohamed Khalil Owemer		Saudi Arabia National of Palestine	He claimed Belizean nationality through certificate number 2128 belonging to	15th March 2011; expired on the 15th June 2011. He entered Belize on the 11 <sup>th</sup> June 2011, four	Visa stamp Belize High Commission in London, seen stamped in copy of native passport	Not seen	P0170346	24/06/11

<b>Name</b>	<b>DOB</b>	<b>Birth Place</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number issued</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>	<b>Passport Number</b>	<b>Date of Issue</b>
		Ukraine	Faten Omar El Bashatli who he claimed was his wife.	days before his visa had expired.				
Oleg Kalugin	18-May-68	Russia	None stated	16-Jul-12	V00032180	654330	P0209568	17-Jul-12
Dong Tao Jin	1-Mar-68	China	None stated	2- Jun- 13	V00037038	936333	P0238518	7-Jun-13
Alexey Kharitonenko	14-Mar-80	Ussr		6-Jan-13	V00036275	805802	P0226251	11-Jan-13
Olena Moskalyk	6-Aug-86	Ukraine	None stated	6-Feb-12	V00029132	425745	P0193300	24-Feb-12
Mykola Moskalyk	15-May-08	Ukraine	None stated	6-Feb-12	V00029131	425746	P0193301	24-Feb-12

**Fifteen (15) individuals were issued visas thereafter received permanent residency status in Belize contrary to the Policy and Procedure Manual.**

Procedure 1 (a) of the Nationality and Permanent Residence Section Policy and Procedure Manual July 1 2011 titled “Acceptance of Permanent Residence Application” states:

Applicants’ passports must first be checked to see if applicant qualifies for permanent residency before issuing an application form accompanied by a list of requirements.”

What to look for in passport and what to ask applicant for permanent residence applications

a. Arrival and Departure Immigration Stamps – Visitor’s Permit and Extensions.

Procedure 2 states:

When examining the passport Counter Clerk must check one year backwards from the date of application. Passports must be examined to ensure that applicant has satisfied the one year domicile period in Belize. Counter Clerk must note that the applicant has not left Belize for more than (14) fourteen days cumulative. This can be ascertained by examining for monthly extensions, conditions stamps, student permit stamps, dependent permit stamps, special permit stamps, and temporary employment permit stamps.”

6. Fifteen (15) individuals who were issued visas thereafter received permanent residence (PR) status that they were not entitled. Listed below at Table A.1

**Table A.1**

The following is the list of 15 individuals who received visas and permanent residency status to which they were not entitled

Name	Date of Birth	Birth Place	Name of Sponsor	Who Accepted And Approved Visa Application	Visa Number issued	Permanent Residency Number
1.Tianzhi Wang	15/10/69	China	Wen Bin Chen	Accepted by Miss Ady Pacheco Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa # V00025636 approved 9th November 2011	43608 dated 9th November 2011
2.Yongbo Ye	12/09/68	China	Wen Bin Chen	Accepted by Miss Ady Pacheco Approved by Miss Ruth	Visa #V00026842 approved 19th	43895dated 28th December 2011

<b>Name</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Birth Place</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Who Accepted And Approved Visa Application</b>	<b>Visa Number issued</b>	<b>Permanent Residency Number</b>
				Meighan	December 2011	
3.Lin You	06/10/82	China	Wen Bin Chen	Accepted by Miss Ady Pacheco Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00026864 approved 9th January 2012;	44044 dated 13th March 2012
4.Wen Yuan Chen	12/07/89	Guangdong China	Wen Bin Chen	Accepted by Mr. Martin Guy Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00029387 approved 5th March 2012.	44045 dated 13th March 2012
5.Jin Jie Huang	23/12/86	China	Wenjing Chen	Accepted by Miss A Martinez approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00033814 approved 2nd October 2012	44738 dated 23rd November 2012
6.Xiaoting Su	15/12/89	China	Weitao Liu	Accepted by Mr.M Guy approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00037533 approved 5th February 2013	44770 no date recorded in PR Permit Number Register but the date before that entry was 3 <sup>rd</sup> December 2012
7. Muhua Li		Guangdong China	Copy of visa was not seen	We saw the information on the Belmopan Visa Returns	Visa #V00039580 approved 12th June 2013	44865 dated 11th January 2013
8. Lang Yan Su	01/11/93	Guangdong China	Yu Cheng Xiao	Accepted by Mr. Martin Guy Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00032313 approved 23rd July 2012	44928 dated 30th January 2013
9. Rujian Jian	10/06/86	Guangdong China	Xuefei Cao	Accepted by Miss Adli Martinez	Visa #V00033810	44942B dated 5th February 2013

<b>Name</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Birth Place</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Who Accepted And Approved Visa Application</b>	<b>Visa Number issued</b>	<b>Permanent Residency Number</b>
				Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	approved 2nd October 2012	
10. Jia Yong Ma	29/10/86	Guangdong China	Xuefei Cao	Accepted by Miss Adli Martinez Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00033 811 approved by 2nd October 2012.	44944B dated 5th February 2013
11. Zi Jian Chen	10/01/81	China	Daxi Huang	Accepted by Mr. Martin Guy Approved by Ms Maria Marin	Visa #V00039 578 approved 8th May 2013.	44956B dated 11th February 2013
12. Hailiang Lin (Hai Liang Lin)	09/05/71	Guangdong China	Jie Fu Lin	Accepted by Miss RMejia Approved by Ms Maria Marin	Visa #V00039 581 approved 21st May 2013.	44957B dated 12th February 2013
13. Bi Qi Su (Biqi Su)	08/1/94	Guangdong China	Yu Cheng Xiao	Accepted by Mr. Martin Guy Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00032 314 approved 23rd July 2012.	44960 dated 13th February 2013
14. Jian Zhong Cao	09/12/86	Guangdong China	Xuefei Cao	Accepted by Miss Adli Martinez Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V000 33812 was approved 2nd October 2012	44961 dated 14th February 2013
15. Xiaoxia Zhen	22/09/86	China	Jian Xing Chen	Accepted by Miss Ady Pacheco Approved by Miss Ruth Meighan	Visa #V00026 888 approved 2nd February 2012.	45015 backdated to 27th July 2012 (Her old PR # was stated in the Numbers Book as 3297/86, the same year she was born)

The findings on individuals who were issued visas and Belizean passports will be discussed at paragraphs 12, 34, 35.37, 45, 46, 49, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 65, 79, 80, 81, 86, 122.7 and 170 in the Nationality report, referenced Section III, In respect of those issued permanent residence, further investigation is required to examine their PR files.

### **Ministers of Government recommended and requested the approval of Belize visas for some individuals at BMPS**

7. We found recommendations and requests made by Ministers of Government for individuals to be approved Belize visas. The purpose of the Ministers' requests were to assist specific applicants to obtain visas to visit or visa extensions to stay longer in Belize. Some recommendations and requests were found in 'letters format' attached to applications. In regards to other recommendations and requests that were done verbally the Immigration Officer would write notations on the respective application indicating which minister made the request. We noted that Ministers of Government recommended and requested that a number of Asian individuals be issued Belize visas to enter the country of Belize.

7.2 Since the law does not provide for ministers to intervene in the visa process it was illegal for those ministers to have done so.

7.3 According to the OIC Visa Section, Mr. Edgar Cano, all applications with Ministers requests whether verbal or by letters were treated as normal. Our examination revealed findings contrary to what he told us. We noted applications without financial letters, native passport bio page, passport size photo, financial support documents, proof of funds, finite period of stay, the purpose of visit documents and documents showing relationships between sponsors and applicants. Ministers and applicants who requested visas are listed at **Appendix I**.

### **Chief Executive Officer, Mayor, Caretakers and a citizen made requests for applicants to be facilitated with Belize visas at the BMPS**

8. We noted that the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of Labour ( Ms. Candelara Saldivar Morder, the CEO at the time ), caretakers Frank Mena (Dangriga Constituency), Michael Hutchinson (and Ismael Garcia (Cayo Constituency), John August (former Mayor of San Ignacio and Santa Elena) and Said Perdomo, a private citizen requested that some visa applicants receive Belize visas from the BMPS. Those requests are listed at **Appendix II**.

### **Ministers of Government made 7 requests to Port Commanders at BNBS and PGIA to facilitate individuals with visas**

*We expected to find that all requests made by Ministers would not have been facilitated by Port Commanders since the law does not provide for ministers to make such requests*



9. We found three instances where two Ministers of Government requested assistance in the issuing of seven visas; three (3) at the BNBS and four (4) at PGIA. The Ministers' requested assistance for applicants to get visa to visit or visa extension to stay a little longer in Belize. Those requests were found in the form of a letter format attached to the applications or they were done verbally which was put as a notation on the applications. The Port Commander was asked if the BNBS received ministers' request to approve visas for applicant, Port Commander, Mr. Rejon stated that not as far as he could recall. We however found seven as stated above. **Table B** lists those seven applications as well ministers that requested the facilitation of visas to the individuals.

**Table B**

The following are seven applications that three ministers of government requested visas be issued for  
BNBS

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Minister</b>	<b>Application and issue Date</b>	<b>Visa Number issued</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Katharina Reimer de Schmitt	12-Oct-82	Paraguay	Elvin Penner	05-Sept-12	V00033453	Only Application and a note from the desk of Elvin Penner was presented; No Passport Photo, Passport Bio-Data Page or other supporting documents were presented.
Elvin Roberto Ramirez Licon	14-May-78	Honduras	Hugo Patt	17-Aug-12	V00033433	Only copy of passport was presented along with letter of support from Hon. Hugo Patt.
Jonathan Exequiel Rodriguez Elvir	12-Oct-81	Honduras	Hugo Patt	17-Aug-12	V00033432	Only copy of passport was presented along with letter of support from Hon. Hugo Patt.

**PGIA**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Minister</b>	<b>Application and Issue Date</b>	<b>Visa Number Issued</b>	<b>comments</b>
Gurjeevan Singh Gill	25-Aug-90	India	Edmond Castro	25-Mar-12	V00028529	
Parmjit Singh	30-Apr-73	India	Edmond Castro	25-Mar-12	V00028530	
Milan Thapa	13-Oct-84	Nepal	Edmond Castro	28-Mar-12	V00028533	
Sunil Pokharel	13-Sep-85	Nepal	Edmond Castro	28-Mar-12	V00028534	

**Nine (9) visa stubs for the months of June and December 2012 were neither presented nor found on hand at the BWBS**

*We expected to find that the Immigration and Nationality Department accounted for all visa counterfoils*

10. We found nine visa stubs were not presented to Audit nor were those stubs found on hand. Eight of those stubs were the reason the Office of the Auditor General decided to conduct an audit investigation as aforementioned at paragraph 2.2 above. The nine visa numbers are listed at **Table C** below:

**Table C**

**The following is the list of nine visa stubs that were not presented nor found on hand at the BWBS**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>	<b>Name of Individual</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>
16-Jun-12	V00031648	613474	Rie Murakami	14-Mar-95	Singapore
28-Dec-12	V00035517	846924	Saul Rodriguez	8-Dec-76	Salvador
28-Dec-12	V00035518	846945	Hyeonji Oh	21-Nov-81	South Korea
28-Dec-12	V00035519	846946	Kana Honada	21-Dec-91	Japan
28-Dec-12	V00035520	846946	Naoto Imayo	8-Nov-80	Japan
28-Dec-12	V00035521	846965	Andres Felipe Botero	20-Nov-79	Colombia
28-Dec-12	V00035522	846965	Natalia Machado	22-Dec-82	Colombia
28-Dec-12	V00035523	846994	Juaquin Castro	24-Nov-77	Salvador
28-Dec-12	V00035524	846836	Rita Vanegas	22-May-90	Nicaragua

10.2 We saw on Part I of (Department's internal report) the "REPORT ON LOSS OR SHORTAGE IN GOVERNMENT FUNDS OR OTHER PROPERTY" where Immigration Officer Vernon Leslie stated in part:

*"On 26<sup>th</sup> December, 2012, at the Belizean Western Border Station, I.O. M. Tench discovered that eight (8) Belize visa foils were missing. Officer M. Tench reported the matter to OIC E Cano. We initiated an investigation and discovered that I. O. L Wade had removed the eight visa foils from the officer and given them to one Mr. Middleton for sale. Mr. Middleton is the common-law husband of Officer Inez Casanova (O Walk office). Mr. Middleton took the visas to Belize City Deputy Mayor Eric Chang and Council Financial Controller Patrick Tillett whom purchased the visas.*

*Both Mr Chang and Mr. Tillett wrote statements confirming the transaction. Both men doubted the validity of the visa foils, so they took them to Belmopan Immigration Office where Officer George Reynolds confirmed that the visa foils were legitimate but were illegally issued. All statements by both men along with the reports from three (3) Immigration investigators were then forwarded to the former Director Ms. Ruth Meighan.*

*The decision to issue the Belize visas without the stickers was approved by the OIC E Cano. This was done for two (2) reasons: Primarily to give our investigation team sufficient time to find the perpetrators, Secondly to avoid excessive revenue loss. OIC E Cano was reluctant to issue the visas without stickers, but eventually, he gave the approval. In doing this we were given ample time to find out what occurred and we avoided revenue loss. All visas were sold to genuine applicants whom completed the entire process. Eight genuine Revenue Collectors Receipts were issued in the sum of \$100.00 each.....”*

#### 10.3 We could not ascertain:

- i. Why the matter of the eight (8) missing visa foils were not reported to the police for investigation against I.O. L Wade, Belize City Deputy Mayor, Eric Chang and the Council Financial Controller Patrick Tillett.
- ii. Why Immigration Officer George Reynolds did not take custody of the visas and inform the Director (immediately) since they were housed in the same building. Why the then Director, Miss Ruth Meighan did not make efforts to have the matter investigated by the police and retrieve the stickers from the aforementioned individuals who had the stickers in their possession.
- iii. Why OIC E Cano gave approval for the visa numbers to be sold to applicants knowing that all applicants approved visas should have visa stickers inserted in their passports. He should have been fully aware that it was not legitimate for those visas to be issued in that manner.

That if the eight visa stickers went missing on 26<sup>th</sup> December 2012 why it was not until 29<sup>th</sup> December 2012 that he gave approval for the eight visa numbers to be issued to applicants. This should have been enough time to contact the Director to ask for guidance. It is our belief that this action could have aided in the fraudulent issue of visas V00035517 to V00035524.

- iv. The reason OIC E Cano did not appraise the Director of the situation before he gave his approval for the issuance of those visas without valid stickers.

- v. How such action of issuing the missing visas without stickers to genuine applicants could have helped the investigating team. The Director could have sent out bulletins to all OICs at Ports of Entry listing the eight missing visa stickers. Why visa numbers were not entered in the BWBS cash book as missing. A copy of the Director's bulletin could have also been attached to the cashbook page.

10.4 In its memo IMM/GEN/21/01/2013 (8) Vol. II dated September 30, 2013, from the Ministry of Labour, Local Government, Rural Development, National Emergency Management, and Immigration and Nationality addressed to the Accountant General and copied to the Financial Secretary and Auditor General reported the eight missing visa foils.

10.5 We saw at paragraph 4 of the memo mentioned above that the Ministry supported the recommendation for the demotion and surcharge of Mr. Mark Tench and the demotion of Mr. Vernon Leslie for his action to cover up the disappearance of the visa foils. We however did not see any mention made of Immigration Officer L Wade and OIC E Cano.

10.6 In respect of visa V0003164 issued to Rie Murakami on 16<sup>th</sup> June, 2012 we could not determined if this was the case as with the eight (8) visa stickers that had gone missing.

**One Hundred and Thirty Four (134) Visa Stubs were neither presented nor found on hand at the BNBS and PGIA**

*We expected to find that all Visa Stubs were properly accounted for and kept on hand at BNBS AND PGIA*

11. We found that One Hundred and Thirty Four (134) visa stubs for December 2012, January 2013 and April 2013 respectively were not found in the relevant visa counterfoils. The Port Commander BNBS issued One Hundred and Thirty Three applicants and the Port Commander PGIA had cancelled one. Those visa numbers are listed at **Table D** below

**Table D**

The following are three out of the 134 visa stubs that were not presented nor found on hand at BNBS and PGIA for the period December 2012 and April 2013

<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Country of Birth</b>	<b>Revenue Collectors Receipt</b>	<b>Cost of Visa</b>	<b>Port of Entry</b>
V00035977	31-Dec-12	Ekaterina Drobysheva	20-Nov-73	Russian	835999	\$100.00	BNBS
V00035978	31-Dec-12	Kaori Oka	06-May-77	Japanese	836000	\$100.00	BNBS
V00036974	-Apr- 13	Cancelled	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	PGIA

The other missing 131 visa stubs are listed at **Appendix III**.

**Xing Bao Wang and Yong Bin Wang used the same passport picture on their application for a Belize visa from the BMPS**

12. We noted that two applicants Xing Bao Wang and Yong Bin Wang used the same passport size picture to apply for their visas. Their visa application forms were dated 2<sup>nd</sup> July 2013 and the forms reflected that they were both born in China. Their dates of birth were 29<sup>th</sup> October 1993 and 9<sup>th</sup> September 1979 respectively. Attached to their visa applications were copies of their native Chinese passports G61417722 (Xing Bao Wang) issued 27<sup>th</sup> April 2012 and G39225057 (Yong Bin Wang) issued 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2010. Sponsor, Jin Fan Chen was in possession of a Belizean Passport number P0188337 which was issued on the 16<sup>th</sup> December 2011. Both Xing Bao Wang and Yong Bin Wang were recommended for their visas by Minister John Saldivar

12.2 Immigration Officer A Martinez accepted their applications on 5<sup>th</sup> July 2013. The applications were not recommended by a Senior Immigration Officer before the documents were submitted to the Director for approval. A notation was seen from the Director on the form for Xing BaoWang "Mr. Reynolds FNA" (He was the OIC Nationality Section) and "no picture attached" dated the 9<sup>th</sup> July 2013.

12.3 We could not ascertain how 9<sup>th</sup> July was affixed to the notation on Xing BaoWang's application form when his and Yong Bin Wang's applications were accepted on the 15<sup>th</sup> July 2013.

12.4 A notation was found on the interview questionnaires stating that the "visa recommended 24<sup>th</sup> July 2013 and 15<sup>th</sup> July 2013" respectively. In addition that both visas were "approved 24<sup>th</sup> July 2013".

12.5 Examination of the visa application forms revealed that Visa numbers V00039817 and V00039819 were issued on the 24<sup>th</sup> July 2013 without the Director's approval and signature on the visa forms.

**Cuban Natives who had been incarcerated at the Belize Central Prison were issued visas to remain in Belize**

13. Listed at **Table E** below are particulars noted on five applications forms for Cuban nationals who had been incarcerated at Belize Central Prison from 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2012 to 1<sup>st</sup> January 2013. Upon their release from prison, they were given visas to stay in Belize instead of being deported back to their native country.

It is to be noted that those Cubans presented only copies of their native passports bio pages and passport photos.



**Table E**

The following are the names of the five Cuban nationals who were issued visas after they were released from the Belize prison

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Visa Number Issued</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>	<b>Date of Receipt</b>
Osmedys Alejandro Gonzalez Caballero	24 <sup>th</sup> December 1973	V00037776. Visa approved by Ms Maria Marin on 15 <sup>th</sup> March, 2013. She made notation on his visa application form as follows: See, approved to regularize status upon completion of sentence and release from BCP on the 14/3/13. She then signed the notation.	880738	15 <sup>th</sup> March 2013
Diaz Leon Edel	19 <sup>th</sup> September 1979	V00037775. Visa approved by Ms Maria Marin on 15 <sup>th</sup> March, 2013. She made notation on his visa application form as follows: See, approved to regularize status upon completion of sentence and release from BCP on the 14/3/13. She then signed the notation.	880736	15 <sup>th</sup> March 2013
Marcial Companioni Suarez	9 <sup>th</sup> October 1972	V00037774. Visa approved by Ms Maria Marin on 15 <sup>th</sup> March, 2013. She made notation on his visa application form as follows: See, approved to regularize status upon completion of sentence and release from BCP on the 14/3/13. She then signed the notation.	880743	15 <sup>th</sup> March 2013
Norge Morales Rodriguez	3 <sup>rd</sup> January 1971	V00037773. Visa approved by Ms Maria Marin on 15 <sup>th</sup> March, 2013. She made notation on his visa application form as follows: See, approved to regularize status upon completion of sentence and release from BCP on the 14/3/13. She	880745	15 <sup>th</sup> March 2013

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Visa Number Issued</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>	<b>Date of Receipt</b>
		then signed the notation.		
Raydel Leon Galvez	2 <sup>nd</sup> December 1978	V00037772. Visa approved by Ms Maria Marin on 15 <sup>th</sup> March, 2013. She made notation on his visa application form as follows: See, approved to regularize status upon completion of sentence and release from BCP on the 14/3/13. She then signed the notation.	880735	15 <sup>th</sup> March 2013

iii.) With the exception of one of the Cubans, Raydel Leon Galvez, references were found at the back of each application but the pertinent documents were not attached to the application forms. Those references were as follows:

Name	References
Osmedys Alejandro Gonzalez Caballero	Gen/6/01/13(2) Vol ??/ 15.3.13 Gen/6/01/13 Vol ??/ 28.2.13 FA/BR/27/13(107), 3.1.13 RS/119/2012/ 14.2.12 Copy of letter from Cuba.
Diaz Leon Edel	Gen/6/01/13(2) Vol ??/ 15.3.13 Gen/6/01/13 Vol ??/ 28.2.13 FA/BR/27/13(107), 3.1.13 RS/119/2012/ 14.2.12 Copy of letter from Embassy
Marcial Companioni Suarez	Gen/6/01/13(2) Vol??/ 15.3.13 Gen/6/01/13(1) Vol 4/ 28.2.13 FA/BR/27/13(107)/ 3.1.13 RS/119/2012/ 14.2.12 Embassy of Cuba letter, 18.12.??
Norge Morales Rodriguez	Gen/6/01/13(2) Vol V/ 15.3.13 Gen/6/01/13(1) Vol V/ 28.2.13 FA/BR/13(107) dated 3.1.13 RS/119/2012/ 14.2.12 Embassy of Cuba letter, 18.12.??

We could not ascertain the following:

- i. Where those individuals were during the period 2<sup>nd</sup> January to 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013, since they had been released from the 1<sup>st</sup> January 2013.
- ii. Whether they had requested and granted asylum in Belize, since documents were not presented for inspection.

### **Sponsors with Permanent Residence (PR) status were allowed to sponsor applicants to visit Belize**

We expected to find that only Belizean Nationality would be allowed to sponsor applicants to visit Belize

14. It was observed that several individuals who only had Permanent Residence status in Belize invited and sponsored other individuals to visit Belize. We however did not see where the Nationality Act made provisions for permanent residency status to invite persons for visits to Belize. In addition, the Department did not have any policy in place which allowed permanent residence holders to sponsor applicant/s to visit Belize. Those sponsors with permanent status are listed at **Appendix IV**.

**Eight Hundred and Thirty Three (833) applicants used their US Visas or US Permanent Residence Cards to obtain Belize Visas from the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

We expected that the Immigration and Nationality Department had vetted all visa applicants with US visas to ensure that those individuals had met the department's visa requirements

15. We noted that the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA issued Eight Hundred and Thirty Three visas to applicants who had US Visas and or US Permanent Residence Cards. We saw documents indicating that Thirty (30) individuals were issued visas at the BMPS while Eight Hundred and Three (803) individuals were issued visas at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA. Those persons used their United States (US) Visas (605) and US Permanent Residence Cards (228) to obtain Belize visas.
- 15.2 In respect of the Eight Hundred and Three applicants, their application forms were found among the total of 3,791 applications that was presented to us by the Port Commanders at the BNBS (1246), BWBS (1516) and PGIA (1029). We could not ascertain whether 803 applicants met all the requirements stated on page 3 of the Director of Immigration and Nationality's memo Gen/24/01/10(1) vol.III dated 14<sup>th</sup> December 2010. A copy of this memo is attached at **Appendix V** for ease of reference.
- 15.3 We noted that instead an internal document prepared by the Immigration Department marked "Visa Requirements was used at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA to process and grant approval for those applicants who had presented US Visas or US Permanent Residence Cards. That document listed the countries that needed or did not need a Belize visa to enter Belize. At the back of that document was stated "It should be further noted that due to the recent changes made in SI #32 of 2011, any foreign national holding a valid US multiple entry visa or a valid US Permanent Residency Card may be issued a visa for Belize without referral to the Immigration Department."
- 15.4 We checked SI #32 of 2011 and saw the changes made in respect of any foreign national holding a valid US multiple entry visas or a valid US Permanent Residency Card, However there was no indication that security clearance was 'waived' for foreign nationals.
- 15.5 We found no documented evidence that those US visas and US permanent Residence Cards were verified for authenticity. It was noted that applicants from countries that needed DINS and

Security Clearance checks were automatically granted a Belize visa as a result of having US visas or US Permanent Residency Cards.

15.6 We were informed during an interview held on the 15<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 with the Port Commander BNBS, Mr. Francisco Rejon, that he did verifications with the US Embassy in Belize on those US visas and residence cards. He however did not provide any documented evidence to confirm that he indeed did those verifications with the US Embassy.

15.7 According to the Port Commander, BWBS, Mr. Sheldon Hudson, in our 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 interview, he indicated that they had knowledge of the security features of the US visas and US permanent residence cards and they used an ultra violet light to check the individuals' travel documents. He also stated that verifications were done at the US Embassy in Belize on those US visas and US permanent residence cards. As with the Port Commander, BNBS Mr. Hudson did not provide us with any documented evidence to confirm his statements.

15.8 The Port Commander, PGIA, Mrs. Debra Estrada in our 11<sup>th</sup> August 2014 interview, informed us that they check the applicants' travel patterns and use the UV light to check the security features of the visas. In addition a loop magnifying glass was also used, however, she did not provide us with any documented evidence.

15.9 In an attempt to ascertain that the visas and residency cards were valid, we have conducted further assessments however confirmation is pending.

**Eighteen (18) individuals were issued Belize visas at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA although their US visas had expired**

16. We found eighteen (18) instances where applicants with expired US visas were issued Belize visas at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA. Those individuals are listed at **Table F** below.

**Table F**

The following are the eighteen applicants who were approved Belize visas although their US visas had expired

**Belmopan Station**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Belize Visa Number</b>	<b>Nationality as extracted from visa application</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Sex</b>	<b>Date of Issue</b>	<b>Expiry Date</b>	<b>Place of Issue</b>
Weidong Zhang	Application was dated 20-Jul-12. V00032310 dated 23-Jul-12	Chinese	18-Dec-68	Male	17-Jun-11	15-Jun-12	Beijing
Mohd Zaman	Application was dated 11-Jul-12 and approved by Director Ruth Meighan. V00032291 dated 11-Jul-12	Afgan	1-Jan-64	Male	15-May-09	13-Aug-09	Islamabad

### Belize Northern Border Station

<b>Name</b>	<b>Belize Visa Number</b>	<b>Nationality as extracted from visa application</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Sex</b>	<b>US Visa number</b>	<b>Control Number</b>	<b>Date of issue of US visa</b>	<b>Expiry Date of US visa</b>	<b>Place of issue</b>
Da Lin	V00037162 dated 18/Feb/13	China	2/Nov/80	M	F2926708	20113634010004	30/Dec/11	28/Dec/12	Chengdu
Yuself Roberto Cala de la Hera	V00037130 dated 1/Feb/13	Cuba	28/Oct/79	M	F2623603	20121715560006	20/Jun/12	18/Sep/12	Merida
Zuowen Fan	V0036391 dated 22/Jan/13	China	24/Nov/49	M	H0268508	20123333960008	29/Nov/12	27/Nov/13	Guangzhou
Quan Zhou	V00039633 dated 1/Jul/13	China	18/May/87	M	F6625386	20121947480063	13/Jul/12	11/Jul/13	Shenyang

**Belize Western Border Station**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Belize Visa Number</b>	<b>Nationality as extracted from visa application</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Sex</b>	<b>Visa number</b>	<b>Control Number</b>	<b>Date of issue</b>	<b>Expiry Date</b>	<b>Place of issue</b>
Quan Zhou	V00039319 dated 3/Jul/13	China	18/May/87	M	C8820276	20102323600001	24/Aug/10	19-Aug-11	Shenyang
Youzhu Wang	V00036424 dated 15/Jan/13	China	14/Jun/90	F	F0837645	20112144990004	3/Aug/11	1-Aug-12	Beijing
Yaonan He	V00037371 dated 22/Feb/13	China	1/Jan/76	M	E1455237	20110802110001	21Mar/11	20-Mar-12	Guatemala City
Pei Hsuan Lu	V00028973 dated 16/Feb/12	Taiwan	8-Oct-87	F	E2485267	20111162500001	26-Apr-11	30-Sep-11	Taipei



## Phillip Goldson International Airport

Name	Belize Visa Number	Nationality as extracted from visa application	Date of Birth	Sex	Visa number	Control Number	Date of issue	Expiry Date	Place of issue
Igor Lukashev	V00034052 dated 16/Dec/12	Kazakhstan	10-Mar-52	M	E3620255	20113259230001	23-Nov-11	21-Feb-12	Bishkek
Jiande Cen	V00037045 dated 12/Jun/13	Chinese	25-Apr-63	M	F76359	20121782840001	28-Jun-12	25-Sep-12	Beijing
Larisa Lukasheva	V00034051 dated 16/Dec/12	Latvia	6-May-52	F	E3620256	20113259240001	23-Nov-11	21-Feb-12	Bishkek
Lydia Zira	V00037060 dated 26/Jun/13	Nigeria	23-Nov-64	F	E4183125	20121243550013	14-May-12	10-Jun-12	Abuja
Samuel Kibunywa Mwaura	V00036992 dated 30/Apr/12	Kenya	27-Jul-60	M	E1041882	20113345770001	1-Dec-11	29-Nov-12	Johannesburg
Goran Rodin	V00036948 dated 20/Mar/12	Croatian	7-Jan-75	M	79517831	20061774930001	27-Jun-06	25-Jun-11	Zagreb
Ha Young Jeong	V00031750 dated 16/Jun/12	Korean	23-Oct-92	F	97396672	20083657810003	6-Jan-09	31-Dec-11	Seoul
Zaw Min Latt	V00037026 dated 21/May/13	Myanmar	20-Feb-73	M	F0535834	20113074410002	9-Nov-11	2-Feb-12	Rangoon

16.2 We found an instance, where we could not confirm whether US visa control number 2011314727002 was indeed in the passport of a Russian, Ms. Zhanna Bobraicova. We observed this number written on her application form and it was stated as being a valid visa. Those attachments to her application form were:

- i. The copy of her passport photograph which showed the word VIS at the top.
- ii. A copy of a Russian male person named Sergey Viktorovich Anokhin whose date of birth was stated as 16<sup>th</sup> May, 1964 and his US visa control number was 2011314720001.
- iii. The copy of Sergey Viktorovich Anokhin's Russian passport 71 24.
- iv. A copy of another Russian male person named Igor Vladimirovich Razlutskiy whose date of birth was 20<sup>th</sup> September, 1963 and his US visa control number was 20113508270002.

We noted that Ms. Zhanna Bobraicova was issued Belize visa number V00028697 on the 9<sup>th</sup> January 2012.

### **Seven (7) individuals with US expired Permanent Residence Cards were issued visas at the PGIA**

17. We found that the PGIA had issued seven individuals with visas although their US permanent residence cards had expired. Those individuals are listed at **Table G** below.

**Table G**

The following are the seven individuals whose US permanent residence cards were expired and they were still issued visas at the PGIA

<b>Name</b>	<b>Belize Visa Number</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Sex</b>	<b>PR number</b>	<b>Issued Date</b>	<b>Expired Date</b>
Juri Ogawa	V00034074 dated 31/Dec/12	2/Mar/82	F	USCIS#203-056-946	28/Oct/10	28/Oct/12
Kanami Yamasaki	V00034072 dated 29/Dec/12	30/Jul/67	F	USCIS#203-113-616	12/Feb/10	12/Feb/12
Joel Bernard	V00022464 dated 17/Feb/12	01/Sept/62	M	031-196-167	No date of issue on PR	19/Jul/09
Bertin Ruiz	V000334095 dated 14/Jan/13	02/Aug/83	M	200-420-256	22/Apr/10	22/Apr/12
So Yong Kim	V00033980 dated 3/Nov/12	23/Nov/68	F	036-769-859	No date of issue on PR	06/Aug/12

Name	Belize Visa Number	Date of Birth	Sex	PR number	Issued Date	Expired Date
Merly L Howe	V00031011 dated 30/Apr/12	28/May/69	F	USCIS#200-309-438	15/Oct/09	15/Oct/11
Naomi Hara	V00037039 dated 9/Jun/13	03/Jan/66	F	087-793-729	7/Jun/11	07/Jun/13

**There was no documented evidence of a ‘Visa Manual and a ‘Policy on the Procedures and Issuance’ of a Belize visa**

We expected to find that the Immigration and Nationality Department had a written manual and a policy on the procedures and issuance of visa

18. Although we saw a policy manual for the issuance of passports, we did not see any visa manual and/or written policy on visa application, procedures and issuance of a visa. The internal documentation we saw for the Belize Visa Issuance process was the Director of Immigration and Nationality memo reference GEN/24/01/10(1) Vol. III dated 14th December 2010 which is shown at **Appendix V**.

**Immigration Officers at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA processed some visa application forms without the signatures of the applicants**

We expected that Immigration Officers at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA ensured that all applicants signed their visa application forms

19. We saw application forms which did not have signatures of applicants, yet those application forms showed visa numbers that were issued and applicants were granted entry into the country of Belize. **Table H below** lists applicants who applied at the BMPS while **Appendix VIII** lists those applicants from the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA who did not sign their visa application forms and were issued visas.

**Table H**

The following is the list of applicants who applied at the BMPS that did not sign their visa application forms and were issued visas

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Birth Place</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>
Jatinderjit Singh	15-Jan-90	India	11-Sep-12	V00033759
Mireya Rosmery Lopez De Juarez	30-Jan-12	Nicaragua	19-Dec-12	V00036119
Juan Antonio Salazar	19-Feb-61	El Salvador	20-Nov-12	V00035263
Qiao Ru Zou	12-Jun-96	China	7-Nov-12	V00034730
YiYing Lin	12-Aug-84	China	20-Nov-12	V00035268
Harpreet Singh	19-Jun-92	India	28-Jan-13	V00036743
Kulwinder Singh	13-Jan-90	India	28-Jan-13	V00036744
Sahil Salaria	07-Feb-92	India	28-Jan-13	V00036745
Ajmer Singh Dabh	04-Nov-85	India	8-Feb-13	V00037545
Harjit Singh	03-Jul-91	India	8-Feb-13	V00037547
Kamalpreet Signh	15-Aug-88	India	8-Feb-13	V00037546
Guoke Wu	19-Apr-84	China	16-Nov-12	V00035259

**Numerous application forms did not have the required passport size photos of the applicants who had received visas from the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

We expected to see passport sized photos of all visa applicants who had been granted visas

20. We saw numerous application forms that did not have the required passport size photos of individuals who had applied for Belize visas. That was viewed with concern as passport size picture is one of the requirements for the acquisition of a Belize Visa. Listed at **Appendix IX** are those application forms that that did not have the required passport size photos, yet the applicants were issued visas.

**We noted several instances of photocopied photographs of visa applicants at the BWBS**

*We expected to find that all applicants' photographs retained by the Immigration and Nationality Department would be original*

21. We observed instances where photocopies of applicants' photographs were attached to their visa application forms. Those individuals are listed below at **Table I**.

**Table I**

The following is the list of applicants whose photographs were photocopied and attached to their visa application forms

<b>Name</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Visa Number issued</b>	<b>Date of Issue</b>
Joaquin Eusebio Christie New Bery	01/08/1988	Argentina	V00031633	04/06/2012
Naruhito Hashimoto	18/11/1990	Japan	V00031659	19/06/2012
Walter Aguilar	26/06/1972	Peru	V00032693	13/07/2012
Tomoko Saito	07/06/1983	Japan	V00032683	10/06/2012
Paulo Proite	19/11/1948	Brazil	V00032702	16/07/2012

**Many application forms presented by the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not have the required copies of the applicants' native passports bio pages**

We expected to see copies of the bio pages of applicants' native passports attached to their application forms

22. We could not verify the names and personal information of many applicants who received visas as the Immigration Officers at the BMPS did not obtain copies the applicants' native passports bio pages. Again, this was of concern as Immigration Officers, who had processed those application forms, did not adhere to another important requirement. . **Appendix X** lists those application forms which did not have the required copies of the applicants' native passport bio pages.

22.2 We also saw two application forms at the BWBS which the applicants had filled out in pencil. This is contrary to the financial order number 571(a). Those two applicants are listed below at **Table J**.

**Table J**

The following are the two applicants that filled out their application forms with/using a pencil

Name of Applicant	Visa Number issued	Date of Application and issue
Takunanz Takahashi	V00026613	8 <sup>th</sup> December 2011
Shigera Naoya	V00026614	8 <sup>th</sup> December 2011

**Officers at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not obtain the required letters of financial support from sponsors before visas were approved to applicants**

We expected to find letters of financial support submitted by persons who had sponsored applicants for Belize visas

23. A letter of financial support is a letter that a sponsor fills out which states his/her relationship and that he/she can support the applicant during his/her stay in Belize, and the income of the sponsor. A sponsor's financial stability can also be proven by cash and credit cards. In addition, the sponsors should show proof of their immigration status by submitting a copy of their Belizean passport or nationality.

23.2 We noted that for the period investigated 1<sup>st</sup> January 2012 to 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013, the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not procure letters of financial support from individuals who had sponsored the applicants. **Appendix XI** lists the names of those applicants whose application forms did not have letters of financial support for BMPS only. All 3,791 application forms presented to us at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA no letters of financial supports were attached to those application forms.

23.3 In an interview held on 24<sup>th</sup> July 2014, with the Officer in Charge Visa Section, Port Commander Mr. Edgar Cano, he informed us that the Visa section proof of an applicant not being a financial burden to the Government of Belize was providing a letter of financial support, cash or credit card. Also, that it was the responsibility of the Investigation Unit to verify sponsors' financial stability.

23.4 Financial support letters were found attached to some application forms at the BMPS.

**Four sponsors submitted incomplete letters of financial support**

We expected that all letters of financial support submitted by applicants and or sponsors would have all information required by the Immigration and Nationality Department

24. We noted four letters of Financial Support submitted by sponsors were incomplete and can be considered not valid. **Table K** below lists those four sponsors.

**Table K**

The following is the four sponsors who submitted incomplete letters of financial support

<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Visa Number Issued</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Letter of Financial Support</b>
Uishal Sabnani. Name found on Trade License Certificate dated 29 <sup>th</sup> December 2011 issued by the Belize City Council	Ajmer Singh Dabh	India	4-Nov-85	37545	8-Feb-13	Sponsor's name and signature Missing JP signature
Guo Qin Chen	Jia Li Lin	China	24-May-90	37544	8-Feb-13	Amount of years living with applicant missing
Yu Cheng Xiao	Da Ming Yan	China	8-Dec-85	37543	8-Feb-13	Amount of years living with applicant missing
Yu Cheng Xiao	Yi Wen Zhong	China	6-Nov-72	37542	8-Feb-13	Amount of years living with applicant missing

**Officers at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not obtain from all sponsors the required documents that indicated proof of their source of funds**

We expected to find copies documents received from all sponsors that indicated proof of their source of funds

25. It was observed that the Immigration officers at the BMPS did not obtain from some sponsors the required documents (i.e., bank statements, bank books, credit cards or employment letters) which are used as proof of their source of funds. **Appendix XII** lists those sponsors who did not provide proof of source of their funds.

25.2 We were not presented with bank statements, employment letters or proof of funds, whether cash or credit cards were shown by applicants who had applied for visas at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA.

- 25.3 During our 24<sup>th</sup> July 2015 interview with Port Commander, Mr Edgar Cano, he indicated that no verification was done on debit or credit card. The Immigration Department did not have the technology to check the cards. Therefore, if an applicant's only source of funds was a debit or credit card and he/she could not present it, the application was not denied. He said that Immigration did not send back the applicant because it would be discrimination and it would be bad for tourism.
- 25.4 When we asked him whether the financial stability of applicants were checked before visas were approved, Mr. Rejon (BNBS) told us in our 15<sup>th</sup> September 2014 interview that yes, credit cards and cash of applicants were checked.
- 25.5 We also asked Mr. Hudson (BWBS) the same question and his response was yes the check was done and that they try to substantiate as best as they could.
- 25.6 In our 11<sup>th</sup> August, 2014 interview with the Port Commander PGIA, Mrs Debra Estrada, stated that they would normally check a regular tourist to see how much funds they had by requesting cash, travellers' cheques or credit cards. Diplomats and officials were never requested to show their funds. For students, they usually came in groups and would be sponsored by a legitimate organization for example Belize Medical School. For business people, a business entity would sponsor so they did not need to show funds. In addition, some of those business people who lived abroad had business in Belize.

**Some visa applicants and sponsors provided Business Certificates and licenses as proof of their financial stability**

We expected to find that Immigration Officers had carried out verification of business certificates and licenses submitted by applicants and sponsors as proof of their financial stability

26. We noted that some applicants and sponsors used their business certificates, trade and liquor licenses to prove financial stability. We found no evidence that the Immigration and Nationality Department verified the authenticity of those business certificates and licenses. We did verification of those business certificates and licenses at the Belize Company Registry and we unearthed the following:

**Some sponsors used bogus Business certificates and licenses to obtain visas for some applicants**

27. We found that bogus business certificates and licenses were used by some sponsors to show ownership of a business to prove their financial stability. Those certificates were not registered in their names or the business names stated on the copies of certificates. Sponsors who were not owners of business certificates are listed at **Appendix XIII**.



**As proof of financial stability some sponsors quoted the names of businesses that did not exist/were not registered at the Belize Companies Registry**

28. As part of our examination we prepared a list of businesses which the sponsors quoted on the relevant forms as proof of their financial stability. We then visited the Companies Registry in Belmopan in an effort to determine if those businesses were legitimate companies. Our investigation disclosed that many of those businesses, quoted by the sponsors, did not exist/were not registered at the Belize Companies Registry. Those businesses that did not exist at the Belize Companies Registry are listed at **Appendix XIV**.

28.2 In an interview held on 7<sup>th</sup> August 2014 with Acting Registrar, Ms. Samantha Matute, she informed that a business has to be registered before it can obtain a trade and liquor licenses. Ms. Matute stated that before 2008, registration of companies were not required. Thereafter, the Companies Registry had requested the City Councils and Town Boards to ensure all businesses were registered before they received their Trade and liquor Licenses. Only Belmopan and San Ignacio Town Boards had complied to ensure that the proper procedures were adhered to. The Belize City Council and other Town Boards were still issuing Trade and Liquor Licenses to individuals without the official business certificates. Also, the practice of using Trade and Liquor Licenses instead of the official business certificates from the Belize Companies Registry to show ownership of a business was illegal. She further informed that in some cases those certificates and licenses were never registered at the Belize Companies Registry because those individuals may not have been the owner of a company or business. Ms. Matute said that the proper procedure to obtain a Trade or Liquor License from the City Council or Town Board was for individuals to present a registered business certificate called a Certificate of Registration.

**Many sponsors with bogus business certificates used those certificates to sponsor more than one individual**

29. We noted that many of those sponsors with bogus certificates sponsored more than one applicant. Those individuals who were sponsored by sponsors with bogus certificates are listed at **Appendix XV**.

**The majority of copies of the required documents for finite (fixed, set) period of stay in Belize were not retained by the BMPS for all applicants**

We expected to find all copies of the documents presented by applicants in respect of their finite period of stay would be retained by the BMPS for audit purposes

30. We noted that the officers at the BMPS neglected to retain all the required copies of documents which would have showed the finite (fixed, set) period for the majority of applicants who were given visas to stay in Belize. The documents used were the travel itineraries of those applicants.

**Port Commanders at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not retain copies of the required documents for finite (fixed, set) period of stay in Belize**

*We expected to find that Port Commanders had maintained copies of the required documents for finite (fixed, set) period of stay in Belize*

31. We noted that the officers at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA neglected to retain the required copies of documents which would have showed the finite (fixed, set) period applicants would have stayed in Belize. According to Port Commander, Mr. Francisco Rejon, the document used was the applicant's travel itinerary. He indicated that in most cases, the applicants were asked to get a print out from the Belize Tourist Board (BTB) booth that was located in the same building with BNBS. We however did not find any evidence that this was done as copies of those itineraries were not presented to us nor did we find said itineraries in the station files.

31.2 Mr. Sheldon Hudson, the Port Commander BWBS stated that they would interview the sponsors to establish the accommodation, relationship and proof of relationship.

31.3 Port Commander, Mrs Debra Estrada also told us that the applicants' travel itinerary or any other documents was used to verify their stay in Belize. In most cases, they asked the applicants to get a print out from the BTB booth at the station. Despite this information about verification carried out there was no evidence found that this was indeed done by the officers at the PGIA.

**The BMPS did not maintain the majority of copies of applicants' supporting documents for the purposes of their visits to Belize**

We expected to find that the Immigration and Nationality Department had maintained all copies of applicants' supporting documents in respect of the purposes of their visits

32. We requested copies of supporting documentations which would have enabled us to ascertain applicants' legitimate purpose of visit to Belize; however we were not provided with any such documentation. Those documents would have enabled us to know whether the applicants had visited Belize for tourism, business, official, or student purposes. Those applicants whose application forms did not have the supporting documents attached are listed at **Appendix XVI**.

**Most sponsors failed to submit documents to prove their relationship with their visa applicants.** Those sponsors are listed at Appendix XVII

**Port Commanders at BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not present to us copies of documents showing applicants' relations to the various sponsors**

33. The Port Commanders at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA failed to give us copies of documents showing relation of visa applicants to the respective sponsors.

33.2 Mrs. Estrada informed us that PGIA do place emphasis on missing requirements and they would assist the applicant in obtaining the missing requirements if the need arise. This was contrary to what we found as the above requirement was missing from almost all of the application forms.

33.3 Mrs Estrada explained that the procedure entailed the applicants presenting their native passports, and then those applicants would be referred to the Port Commander or second in command. Also, verbal interviews would be conducted on the applicants' nature of visit to Belize. The applicants' documentations would be looked at to verify the applicants' identities, accommodations, funds and return tickets. Mrs. Estrada said that each individual got treated differently depending on the case they presented.

**Instances were found where Immigration Officers at the BMPS failed to sign and date visa application forms accepted from applicants**

34. Those applications which did not have the signatures of the Immigration Officers are listed at **Appendix XVIII**.

**Immigration Officers at the BNBS, BWBS, BMPS and PGIA failed to sign and date visa application forms accepted from applicants**

*We expected to find all visa application forms to have been signed and dated by the Immigration Officers who had accepted those application forms*

35. We found no evidence by way of signature and date on the application forms of the Immigration officers who had accepted the visa applications forms for processing. The practice of accepting officers signing and dating the top of application forms was seen on those visa application forms processed at the main office Belmopan. This was the procedure carried out even with the Director when approving visas to individuals.

35.2 In our 15<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 interview, Port Commander, Francisco Rejon admitted that applications were not signed and dated by accepting Immigration Officers. Instead the applicants would be referred to the Port Commander or Shift Supervisor who would approve, sign and date the applications.

35.3 In our 29<sup>th</sup> September 2014 interview with BWBS Port Commander, Mr. Sheldon Hudson his response was the same as Mr. Francisco Rejon's answer. He also told us that applicants were referred to either him or Shift supervisors who are responsible to officially accept visa application forms.

35.4 In our 11<sup>th</sup> August 2014 interview, Mrs. Estrada informed us that indeed the applications were signed and dated by an Immigration officer. We did not find any evidence of this to substantiate her statement.

**Immigration Officers at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not stamp photocopies of documents as being true copies of the original**

We expected to find that *the accepting Immigration officer had stamped and certified the photocopies of documents presented by applicants as being true copies of the originals seen.*

36. We noted that Immigration officers failed to stamp and certify the supporting documents found attached to the applications at Port of entries BNBS, BWBS and PGIA. Those documents should have been stamped and certified as being true copies of the originals that were seen.

36.2 The Port Commander of BNBS, Mr. Rejon, admitted that BNBS does not stamp and certifies the photocopies of original documents as being true copies of the original supporting documents.

36.3 Mr. Hudson, the Port Commander at BWBS, told us that since he had taken over as Port Commander 1<sup>st</sup> August 2013, he noticed that stamping and certifying of documents was not practised at the station. He added that the officer approving the visa is responsible for the copies of the documents.

36.4 Port Commander, Mrs. Debra Estrada, indicated to us that they did stamp and certified the photocopies as being true copies of the original supporting documents. We did not see such evidence on the application forms presented to us.

**No Acceptance Register was maintained prior to 15<sup>th</sup> July, 2013, for visa applications forms received and accepted by the BMPS**

*We expected to find where an Acceptance Register was maintained to record all visa applications received from applicants who desired to enter Belize*

The Acceptance Register is a register used to record all visa applications received at the Immigration and Nationality Services. In addition to recording the approval of visas, this register should also have information regarding the denial of visas to applicants who do not meet the mandatory requirements.

37. We observed that prior to 15<sup>th</sup> July 2013; the Visa section did not maintain an Acceptance Register. We were told by Mr. Cano during the interview held on 24<sup>th</sup> July 2014 that the Visa section had opened an acceptance register on 15<sup>th</sup> July 2013 and that before that period none had been maintained.

39. The BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not maintain an acceptance register. Mr. Francisco Rejon Mr. Sheldon Hudson and Mrs. Estrada informed us during our 15<sup>th</sup>, 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 and 11<sup>th</sup> August 2014 interviews with them, that the stations did not maintain an acceptance register to record visa applications received at the Port of entries. They also indicated that a register would be opened.

39.2 The maintenance of this register would keep track of / record all applications received whether they were approved or denied.

**No Interview Questionnaires were utilized by Immigration Officers at BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

*We expected to see interview questionnaires being utilized by the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA as the documented proof that the Port Commanders or the Shift Supervisors conducted interviews with applicants before issuing visas*

40. We saw no interview questionnaires attached to the application forms presented to us. The Port Commanders all indicated that the station did not utilize the interview questionnaires used by the main office in Belmopan. They would normally ask their own basic questions (address of stay, purpose, length of stay, relationship with the person and contact numbers). If there was a doubt, then further in depth questions would be asked. All answers were logged into their Personal Identification Registration System (PIRS).

**There were instances where the interview questionnaires were not attached to application forms at the BMPS**

We expected to find the the Immigration and Nationality Department had attached all interview questionnaires to applicants application forms

41. We found a few instances where interview questionnaires were not found attached to application forms. The interview questionnaire is vital as it is documentary proof that the Officer in Charge/ Port Commander BMPS conducted an interview with applicants before issuing a Belize Visa. Those instances where interview questionnaires were not attached to application forms are listed at **Appendix XIX**.

**Officers at the BMPS did not fill out the supporting documents sections of a few visa application forms and recommendation section of numerous application forms although visas were approved by the Director**

We expected to see where officers at the BMPS filled out the supporting documents sections of the visa application forms

42. At the back of the application form is a section where all the supporting documents an applicant presented is to be written/ listed. We noted that a few applications did not have the supporting documents sections filled out. This simply meant that in instances the officers at BMPS did not fill out the supporting documents section of the application form. In some cases it was therefore difficult to verify the information on the visa application forms. Applicants who did not submit supporting documents as well as application forms where the supporting documents sections were not properly filled out are listed at **Appendix XX and Appendix XXI**

We noted that numerous visa application forms at the BMPS did not contain the recommendations of the relevant Immigration Officer although those forms reflected that the Director had approved visas for those applicants.

**Some applicants from countries that required security clearance were not subjected to such clearance by Immigration Officers at BMPS**

We expected to find that Security Clearance was done for all visa applicants coming/originating from countries listed in the Belize Visa Requirements effective 1<sup>st</sup> December, 2011, 2012 and 2013

43. The Immigration and Nationality Services has a formal process to vet applicants for security purposes before they can be granted visa approval. The Visa Section submits the visa request of applicants from listed countries to the Director for a back ground check. In addition to looking at the trustworthiness of the applicant, it is imperative that a review is done on the applicant's police record from his/ her native country. The Director subsequently submits the request to the Special Branch of the Belize Police Force that then liaises with its counterpart.

43.2. We noted that according to the Belize Visa Requirements effective 1<sup>st</sup> December, 2011, 2012 and 2013 prepared by the Immigration and Nationality Department applicants from the countries listed at **Table L** below required DINS and security clearance before visas were approved and issued to them.

**Table L**

The following is the list of countries that required DINS and Security Clearance

Countries	Countries
Afghanistan	Kenya
Algeria	Korea (North)
Bangladesh	Libya
Bolivia	Pakistan
Colombia	Palestine
Eriterea	Somalia
Iran	Sudan
Iraq	

43.3 We found that Belize Visas were approved at the BMPS to a number of applicants coming from those countries list at **Table L** above. Further examination disclosed that the required security clearance was not performed for many of the applicants. Those applicants are listed at **Appendix XXII**.

**Port Commanders at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not provide documented evidence indicating that they had carried out security clearance on individuals who required such clearance**

44. We examined the records presented to us for BNBS, BWBS and PGIA and found no documented evidence to substantiate that security clearance was conducted for all applicants that required such clearance before they were issued visas.

44.2 In the 11<sup>th</sup> August 2014 interview at the PGIA, Port Commander informed us that the Investigation Unit Section did not vet visa applications. A visa was granted automatically once the applicants were in possession of US Visas and US PRCs. Those applicants were exempted from DINS and Security clearance. The reason for this was that the Port Commander relied heavily on the US Visas and US PR because the US did their own vetting before issuing a Visa or PRC. Based on this reliance the Port Commander would process the Belize visa without any verification and vetting. This was as a result of the Belize Immigration Visa requirements.

44.3 Mrs. Estrada also informed us that the Airlines have the responsibility and obligation not to allow passengers to fly without a US Visa or PRC. If the applicant does not have a US Visa or PRC they would be denied a visa.

**Appendix XXIII** also includes those applicants that were approved visas without security clearance at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA.

45. We asked the BNBS Commander, Francisco Rejon, if visa verifications of Belize visas issued outside the country of Belize was done by his station and he responded no.

45.2 The Port Commander BWBS informed us that his station does verifications only in cases when there is a doubt about the genuineness of the visas. We however did not see any evidence of such cases on the application forms or any other records presented to us during the investigation.

**Instances existed where the Director did not sign, did not write ‘approve’ and only inserted the words ‘for necessary action’ on visa application forms at the BMPS**

We expected to find that the Immigration and Nationality Department ensured that all applications are approved and signed before a visa is issued

46. We observed that the approvals for Belize Visa Application were done by the Ag Director, Ms. Maria Marin, OIC Visa BMPS, Mr. Edgar Cano and Immigration Assistant Officer II Mr. Martin Guy. We found that several visa applications were not signed by any of the aforementioned approvers and as a result those applications were incomplete and the visas were not legitimately issued. The names of those applicants who received visas without their applications been approved are listed at **Appendix XXIV**.

**Some visa application forms approved at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not have the Port Commanders' signatures**

*The Immigration officers should ensure that all approved applications are signed and dated by the Director before a visa is issued (Page 2 of the Belize Visa Application Form under "FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY")*

**Appendix XXV** lists the applications that were not signed by the Port Commander and or Shift Supervisors.

47. We also observed the following during the examination of the visa application forms:

- a.) Instances where there was a signature of the approver on the various visa applications, however; the approver did not print his/her name under the signature. As a result, we were unable to determine the identity of the approver.
- b.) The approver did not imprint the official stamp of the Department on the visa application forms. The stamp would have aided in establishing the validity of pproved application.

**Some Justices of the Peace did the English translations and certified some applicants' native documents**

We expected to find that the Language Centre at the University of Belize being the only authorized institution to perform English translation of foreign languages for the Immigration and Nationality Department

48. We noted whereby some Justices of the Peace did the English translation and certified some applicants' native documents such as Birth and Marriage certificates. We found evidence of this infraction when we examined the native and translated documents attached to application forms. It is a requirement for those documents to be submitted along with the English translation of exactly what is on the original documents. Further investigation is required to ascertain whether any of those translations were incorrect.

48.2 We were informed by OIC, Visa section, Mr. Edgar Cano that the only authorized institution to perform the English translation of foreign languages was the Language Exchange Centre at the University of Belize. We noted that the majority of the translations were performed by some Justices of Peace in Belize. This of course was contrary to what Mr. Cano had told us. **Appendix XXVI** lists those applicants whose native documents were translated and certified by some Justices of the Peace.

48.3 We also found a few English translations that were not signed and certified. Those uncertified translated documents were considered incomplete and should not have been accepted. Only one case was found for Brunet Charleron where no translation was done.



In addition, we noted a few uncertified notarial certificates. The seal on those notarial certificates were not visible to show the authenticity of the native documents. **Appendix XXVI** also lists uncertified translated documents.

**Two (2) Visa application forms were not presented. The receipt numbers recorded as issued were not from the series utilized by the BNBS**

*We expected to find that all Port Commanders had maintained and retained all visa application forms*

49. We found through verification of application forms to the Visa register that two application forms were not presented to Audit or found on hand. Our verification of the visa register for the period 1<sup>st</sup> January 2012 to 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013 revealed that the Belize Northern Border Station received one thousand two hundred forty eight (1,248) application forms. Of this amount only one thousand two hundred forty six (1246) were presented to us for auditing. Listed at **Table M** are the two individuals whose application forms were not presented to Audit or found on hand.

**Table M**

The following are the two individuals whose visa application forms were not presented or found on hand at the BNBS

Name	Date of Birth	Country of Birth	Visa Number	Date	Receipt Number
Mourad Sawson	10/Nov/88	Lebanon	V00032173	13/Jul/12	696564 for \$100.00
Yasmine Houeida	6/Jul/63	Lebanon	V00032174	13/Jul/12	696565 for \$100.00

49.2 We verified the two receipt numbers 696564 and 696965 and found that those receipt numbers were not from any series recorded in the BNBS cashbook. Our check of the RFIN files also revealed that no such series were issued to BNBS.

49.3 We also scrutinized the RFIN to ascertain the amount of Visa foils that were issued by the main office, Belmopan and received by BNBS and found that one thousand two hundred forty eight (1,248) visa foils were received by BNBS for period January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2012 to 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013. This proved that indeed two visas V00032173 and V00032174 were issued for which the application forms were not presented to Audit.

**The BWBS did not present 6 Visa application forms for Audit examination**

50. We did not receive six visa application forms from the Port Commander at the BWBS. We observed from the RFIN Register that a total of One Thousand Five Hundred and Twenty Two (1,522) visas were issued by the BWBS during the period 1<sup>st</sup> January 2012 to 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2013.

When we compared the information on the application forms against the relevant information in the visa register, we found that six of those visas were issued for which no application forms were presented. Of the six, three were marked cancelled after those individuals' personal details, visa and receipt numbers were already entered in the register. Those six application forms are listed at **Tables N and O** below:

**Table N**

The following is the list of individuals whose application forms were not presented by BWBS for auditing

Name in Visa register	Date of Birth	Country of Birth	Visa Number issued	Date Issued	Receipt number
Tatiana Snova	23/Jan/88	El Salvador	V00028730	13/Jan/12	556752
Moreno Argelo	28/Sep/96	El Salvador	V00028735	15/Jan/12	556764
Jiong Cheon	16/Jan/76	Korea	V00030091	6/Apr	44118

**Table O**

The following is the list of application forms not presented by the BWBS and entries that were cancelled in the visa register

Name in Visa Register	Date of Birth	Country of Birth	Visa Number issued	Date Issued	Receipt number
Liceth Choperna	14/Feb/86	Columbia	V00028928	29/Jan/12	557826
Yersson Ortiz	1/Oct/95	Columbia	V00028929	29/Jan/12	557826
Alejandro Pedrino	3/May/86	Argentina	V00032756	2/Aug/12	6464

**Particulars relating to Twenty One (21) applicants who were approved visas were not recorded in the Visa Register maintained at BWBS**

*We expected to find that all visas issued and or cancelled would be accounted for in the Visa register*

51. We found a total of twenty one application forms for individuals who had been issued visas that had not been accounted for in the visa register by Immigration officers at the BWBS. We noted that nineteen visas were not accounted for during our comparison of application forms to the Visa register. Those applicants are listed at **Appendix XXVII**.

51.2 As a result of our finding, we checked the monthly returns submitted by the BWBS to main office Belmopan and found, that two of those visa numbers V00028736 dated 15<sup>th</sup> January 2012 and V0031624 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> June, 2012 were quoted as issued to two individuals on their application forms, however the monthly returns indicated different names. **Table P** lists those individuals.

**Table P**

The following are two application forms that had visa numbers. Also, the other two names were recorded on the monthly returns as being issued the same visa numbers

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Visa number on application form</b>	<b>Name recorded in Visa Register</b>	<b>Name recorded on monthly return</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
Pomario Aragon	V00028736	Sabrina Abran	Sabrina Abran	Pomario Aragon's name does not appear on the January 2012 monthly return
Jose Hernandez	V00031624	Salvador Guillen	Jose Hernandez (check returns for his name)	Salvador Guillen name was recorded as been issued V00031625 on monthly return.

**The receipt number issued to one individual was fraudulently quoted in the BWBS Visa Register as been issued to another individual**

52. During our verification process we saw that Moreno Argelo was issued visa number V00028735 for which he paid for vide receipt number 556764 dated 15<sup>th</sup> January, 2012. As reported at **Table I** above we did not receive any visa application for this individual. Verification of the receipt number to the receipt book disclosed that receipt number 556764 dated 15<sup>th</sup> January, 2012 was issued to David Aldana in respect of a Temporary Border Permit for the sum of Twenty Dollars (\$20.00).

**No Letters of approval were found attached to the applications of those individuals who were issued courtesy visas at BNBS and BWBS**

*We expected to find that Ports of entry had maintained all letters of approval for courtesy visas issued to individuals*

53. Courtesy Visas are visas issued to an applicant free of cost on the request of the Government of Belize (GOB). Persons entitled to courtesy visas are Officials, Diplomats and those individuals who are invited to the country by the GOB for an official visit. Courtesy Visa requests are submitted to and approved only by the Director of Immigration and Nationality. The Director's approval is sent in the form of a letter and is faxed to all Port of entries in order to sensitize all Port Commanders of approval.

The letter would have a reference number, the applicants' names, native passport numbers, approved courtesy visa and arrival schedule. Courtesy visas are issued upon arrival of applicants into Belize. Upon arrival, the applicants present their native passports and application forms are filled out in an effort to account for the visa numbers issued. The reference number of the Director's approval letter is quoted at the back of the application forms.

53.2 We saw no letters of the Director's approval for courtesy visas attached to application forms for those individuals that received such courtesies at the BNBS and BWBS. In addition, there were no references written on those application forms to indicate that the Director approved courtesy visas. We saw only the notation "Courtesy Visa" was written on the application forms.

53.3 We asked the Port Commanders, Mr. Francisco Rejon and Mr. Sheldon Hudson, if an applicant with a GOB invitation needed to meet all visa requirements and they indicated yes. They were also asked if courtesy visas were issued to any applicants that were not entitled to such visas and Mr. Rejon responded 'not to his knowledge' while Mr. Hudson said 'no'.

**Not all letters of approval for courtesy visas issued to individuals at the PGIA were found attached to application forms**

54. We noted that courtesy visas were frequently issued at the PGIA station. We found that only a few of those courtesy visa approval letters were attached to individuals' application forms. In most cases only the notation "Courtesy Visa" was found on those application forms and the reference number was written on the application forms. We also noted some application forms that had the notation "approved by the Director via Telephone".

54.2 We did not see any letters of approval from the Director at the BWBS and we were unable to go through the file at BNBS, Also, we were unable to ascertain that:

- i. Individuals who were issued courtesy visas had received the Director's approval
- ii. Individuals who were not entitled to courtesy visas had been issued such visas
- iii. Individuals who had been issued courtesy visas had met all the requirements for a visa

Listed at **Appendix X** are those application forms which did not have the Director's letters of approval.

**The Director neglected to remit photographs for a family of four who had been approved courtesy visas at the PGIA**

*We expected to see passport sized photos of all visa applicants who had been granted visas*

55. We found courtesy visas approval for a family of four who had travelled to Belize on 15<sup>th</sup> September 2013. A copy of the Director's courtesy approval was found attached to an application form which had the name of Eman Mohamad. The Director's approval had the reference 111/2B/13(17) Vol XXXII and was dated 9<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

55.2 The Director however neglected to send the photos of the family of four along with her approval letter to the PGIA for identification.

Only the application forms were found at the station along with the photos that they had presented on their arrival to Belize. We also did not see the family's bio page attached to their application forms. As a result, we were unable to verify if indeed the courtesy visas were issued to the right family.

55.3 We also found that this occurred at the Belize Northern Border Station and Belize Western Border Station. That was of major concern as we could not verify applicants for courtesy visas as their identification documents/photos were never sent to the land border and Airport stations by the Director. **Table Q** below lists the four members of the family who received courtesy visas although the Director did not submit their photos and copies of their bio pages to the relevant Port Commander.

**Table Q**

The following is the list of four family members who received courtesy visas without photos and bio pages been submitted at the PGIA

<b>Applicant Names</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Visa Date</b>	<b>Country of Birth</b>	<b>Native Passport Number</b>
Eman Abu Abdullah Elbu Khari Ibra Hi Mohamad	V00040105	15 <sup>th</sup> September 2013	Sudan	SDN-B0596118
Amani Abubaker Mohamed Omer	V00040102	15 <sup>th</sup> September 2013	Sudan	O00931290
Maisoon Abu Abdalla Elbukhari Ibrahim	V00040103	15 <sup>th</sup> September 2013	Sudan	P00904069
Mohamed Amir Mohamed Saleim	V00040104	15 <sup>th</sup> September 2013	Sudan	P00876071

**A visa was issued to an individual who had an outdated Belize permit card which enabled the individual to reside in Belize**

56. We found an application form for an Indonesian, who had travelled with her native passport number T200039. We noted that she was issued visa number V00040098 on 11<sup>th</sup> September 2013. We were unable to read the signature of the person who issued the visa. The approval was given based on an outdated Ministry of Home Affairs Belize Permit Card which permitted her to reside in Belize. The card had only a photograph of a female on it.

There was no name, date and place of birth, nor was the date of issue shown on the permit card which would have assisted in verifying that the person, who presented herself on the 11<sup>th</sup> September, 2013 was indeed Rita Kishore Kumar Pridhnani.

56.2 It is to be noted that it was the first time that we have seen such a card as we did not find any at the main office, Belmopan and the Ports at BNBS and BWBS.

- i. Why a visa was approved to Ms. Pridhnani when the card gave her the right to reside in Belize.
- ii. How Ms. Pridhnani was still travelling with an outdated card when she should have already had nationality and a Belizean Passport.
- iii. That the person issued visa V00040098 was indeed the same individual whose picture was on the Belize permit card.

#### **Copies of previous visas issued were not attached to applicants' visa application forms**

We expected to see where the Immigration and Nationality Department ensured that all applicants' previous visas were attached to applications.

57. We observed that applicants who had indicated that they had been issued a visa before, only few instances were seen where the previous visas were attached to applicants' application forms. We were therefore unable to verify whether those applicants had indeed been issued visas before.

#### **Exhausted visa stickers series were not recorded in the letters of request made by the Port Commander BNBS to main office Belmopan for the replenishment of visa stock**

*We expected to find that the serial numbers of exhausted visa stickers would be recorded in letters of request made by all Port Commanders*

58. We noted that the Port Commander for BNBS submitted visa request letters to main office Belmopan without recording the issued/exhausted visa stubs series. **Table R**

The following is the list of dates on which letters of request were made for visa stock and the BNBS Port Commander did not include the exhausted visa series

<b>Date of request</b>	<b>Amount of visas requested</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
22 November 2012. No reference number used	100	Series of previous visas received not quoted
27 September 2012. No reference number used.	100	Series of previous visas received not quoted
31 December 2012. No reference number used.	100	Series of previous visas received not quoted
24 October 2013. No reference number used.	100	Series of previous visas received not quoted
28 August 2013. No reference number used.	100	Series of previous visas received not quoted
8 March 2013. No reference number used.	100	Series of previous visas received not quoted

58.2 We scrutinized those issued/exhausted visa stubs and noted that whenever requests were made for new visa stock, there was still unused stock on hand. We saw the practise where instead of using the balance of stock that was on hand, officers would issue visas from the new stock received. This practise was not detected by the FO issuing the visa stock. As there were no indications that reconcillations were done.

58.3 We noted that despite the Director's new visa requirement memo reference FIN/4/03/13Vol I (34) dated 1<sup>st</sup> March 2013 which was to take effect 1<sup>st</sup> March 2013, the FO was not reconciling the exhausted visa stubs. If those visas were reconciled, the errors and/or the short fall of those exhausted visas could have been detected.

#### **BNBS and BWBS Immigration officers who had issued visas did not fill out some Visa Stubs**

59. We found some blank visa foils/stubs which the Immigration officers at BNBS did not record the pertinent information for visas that had already been issued to applicants. **Appendix XXVIII** lists those visa foils/stubs that were found blank although the visas had been issued.

#### **Four (4) visa stubs did not have the name of the individuals who had been issued visas by the BWBS**

*We expected to find all visa stubs to have the names of the individuals who had been issued those visa sticker numbers*

60. We found four visa stubs at the BWBS that did not have the names of the individuals to whom the visas were issued to. **Table S** below list said visa stub numbers.

**Table S**

The following is the four BWBS visa stubs that did not have the names of the individuals to whom those visas were issued

Visa stub number	Date	Name on return	Nationality
V00033587	26 <sup>th</sup> September 2012	Salvador Landaverde	“Salvador”
V00028958	13 <sup>th</sup> February 2012	Walther Suazo	Honduran
V00030151	3 <sup>rd</sup> May 2012	Leticia Padilla	Bolivian
V00033513	16 <sup>th</sup> August 2012	Jennifer Bilangel	Philippino

60.2 In addition, we found two visas that were issued to the same individual on the 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2012. The two visa stubs recorded that visa number V00053475 was issued to Jaime Rivera and V00035476 was issued to Jaime Rivera Aguilar with nationality being “Salvador”.

**Some Visa Stubs had missing information for visas issued by the BNBS**

*We expected to find that all visa stubs would be filled in with the relevant information of those individuals who had been issued the corresponding visa sticker numbers*

61. We saw visa stubs that did not have the relevant information. The information that was not seen was the names of the individuals, passport numbers, nationalities, receipt numbers and the Director’s approval reference number. **Table T** below list those visa numbers that did not have the relevant information needed.



**Table T**

The following is the list of visa stubs that we found without the relevant information recorded thereon

<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Missing information</b>
V00028075	Name, passport number, nationality and receipt number
V00029161	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00029188	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00030204	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00030268	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00032139	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00032164	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00033400	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00033471	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00034543	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00034584	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number
V00035942	Name, nationality, receipt and reference number

**There were instances where passport numbers were not recorded on Visa stubs at the BMPS and BWBS**

We expected to find that passport numbers of all applicants were recorded on the relevant visa stubs

62. Our examination of the BMPS and BWBS visa stubs revealed some instances where passport numbers were not recorded on some of those stubs. Listed at **Appendix XXIX** are the names of those individuals whose passport numbers were not recorded on visa stubs.

**Prior to March 2013 no system was in place to ensure that all exhausted visa stubs were accounted for by the OIC/Port Commanders at BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

We expected to find where the Director of Immigration and Nationality ensured that Officers in Charge/ Port Commanders of the various district stations submits monthly return in which they account for all exhausted visa stubs/ counterfoils.

63. We noted that prior to March 2013, there no system was in place at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA which ensured that all exhausted visa stubs were accounted for. Examination of the Immigration and Nationality “All Station files” revealed that counterfoils/visa stubs were not submitted to the Finance Officer, Immigration and Nationality. We saw that only request letters along with exhausted visa numbers and monthly reports were submitted to replenish stock.
- 63.2 We found that it was not until after eight visas had gone missing from the Benque Viejo Port of entry that the Director sent out a memo reference FIN/4/03/13 VOL I (34) dated 1<sup>st</sup> March 2013 to all Stations. The memo stated that with immediate effect, whenever there was a request to replendish their stock, it was mandatory for Port Commanders to submit exhausted visa stubs along with their monthly reports.

**The BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not maintain Visa Denial Registers**

We expected to see that the Immigration and Nationality maintained a register to record all approvals as well as the denial of visas.

64. We noted that the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA did not maintain Visa Denial Registers for those applications that had been denied.
- 64.2 During our 24<sup>th</sup> July, 2014 interview with OIC, Mr. Edgar Cano, we found out that the Visa section kept an electronic spread sheet of all applications that had been denied. We were given a copy of the spread sheet and when it was examined we found that the spread sheet did not indicate the reason/s for the denial/s.

**The BWBS did not present Three (3) Monthly Returns to Audit for examination**

*We expected that all monthly returns would be retained and presented for audit purposes*

65. When we requested the BWBS’s monthly returns and were presented with electronic copies. Scrutiny of those electronic monthly returns disclosed that three months, *May 2012, March and June 2013* were not prepared by the BWBS. The OIC, Mr. Sheldon Hudson, had checks carried to locate the three monthly returns, however those checks proved futile. A check of the **All** station file maintained by main office, Belmopan disclosed that the three aforementioned months had been submitted.

**There were instances where the particulars of the Visa Stubs did not match the pertinent information on the monthly returns.**

We expected to find that all applicants' relevant information would be recorded on the visa stubs of those visas issued to them

66. The visa foils should be properly filled out with the applicant's name, nationality, native passport number, receipt number and date. Also, included should be the BMPS internal control (reference) number assigned to each applicant that had been issued visa as recorded in the visa register.

66.2 We observed that some Visa Foils/Stubs were not properly filled out with the relevant information of the applicants who had been issued those visa stickers.

**Instances whereby one person's visa sticker number being recorded as another person's visa sticker number were noted on seven Monthly Returns prepared by the BWBS**

*We expected to find the names of individuals recorded on visa stubs to be the same names accounted for on monthly returns*

67. We observed seven monthly returns prepared by the BWBS where visa numbers issued to individuals were recorded as issued to other individuals. Instances are listed at **Appendix XXX**.

**There were instances where the names recorded on the visa stubs did not agree with the corresponding names on the monthly returns submitted to the Finance Officer by the BMPS and BWBS**

We expected to see names recorded on the the visa stubs also recorded on the monthly returns prepared and submitted by the OICs /Port Commanders

68. We found that the names on some visa stubs were not the same names that were recorded on the monthly returns. It is vital that accurate records are maintained for all individuals issued visas since such records could be used for verification purposes by the Department, Audit and the Police. **Appendix XXXI** lists those visa stubs for which wrong names were recorded on the monthly returns.

**Numerous instances of wrong Passport Numbers were written on monthly visa reports/returns submitted by the OICs/Port Commanders BMPS, BNBS and BWBS**

We expected to see passport numbers recorded on monthly returns to match those written on the visa stubs

69. We noted a number of instances where passport numbers recorded on BMPS, BNBS and BWBS monthly returns were not identical to passport numbers reflected on relevant visa stubs. **Appendix XXXII** list instances whereby wrong passport numbers were recorded on monthly returns.

**There were instances of incorrect receipt numbers written on Monthly Returns prepared by the BMPS and BNBS**

We expected to find that receipt numbers written on the visa stubs were what were recorded on the monthly returns prepared by the OICs/Port Commanders at BMPS and BNBS

70. A few of those instances are listed at **Appendix XXXIII**.

**Wrong fees were frequently recorded on monthly returns**

We expected that fees recorded on monthly returns would be the same as those recorded on visa stubs

71. We saw a few instances where fees found written on some applications forms were different from fees recorded in the monthly returns. Those instances are listed at **Appendix XXXIV**.

**Three (3) visa sticker numbers issued by the BWBS were not accounted for on the relevant monthly returns**

*We expected to find all visa sticker numbers issued and cancelled recorded on monthly returns submitted to the Finance Officer*

72. During our scrutiny of the BWBS visa stubs to the pertinent monthly returns we discovered that three visas were not accounted for on the monthly returns as shown at the below **Table** labelled U.

**Table U**

The following are three visas that were not accounted for on the BWBS monthly returns

Visa Number	Date on visa stubs	To whom issued	Nationality
V00026596	November, 2011	Amel Lazo	Cuban
V00026597	November, 2011	Melly Lara	Honduran
V00026654	December, 2011	Daniel Silva	Argentina

**Four (4) visa sticker numbers were recorded on the BWBS monthly return for November 2012 instead of the monthly return for December 2012**

*We expected to find that visa sticker numbers would be accounted for on the monthly return in the month that those stickers were issued*

73. Further scrutiny of the BWBS visa stubs to the monthly returns disclosed that four visas, which were issued in December 2012, were recorded on the November 2012 return. Those visas are listed at **Table W** below.

**Table W**

The following are the four visas that were issued in December 2012 but accounted for on the November 2012 monthly return

<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Date on visa stub</b>	<b>Date on monthly return and Visa Register</b>	<b>To whom issued on visa stub</b>	<b>To whom issued in Visa register and on monthly return</b>	<b>Passport number on visa stub</b>	<b>Passport number on monthly return</b>	<b>Nationality</b>
V00035460	1-Dec-2012	29-Nov-2012	Yui Ito	Yui Ito	Not stated	TG6327427	Stated as Japan
V00035461	1-Dec-2012	29-Nov-2012	Daisuke Hiro	Daisuke Hori	Not stated	TH7530254	Stated as Japan
V00035462	1-Dec-2012	29-Nov-2012	Roberto Canus	Roberto Canas	Not stated	5079433	Stated as Salvador
V00035463	1-Dec-2012	29-Nov-2012	Veronica Alvarewgs	Veronica Alvarenga	Not stated	C801081	Stated as Honduras

**The BMPS Visa section did not maintain any Visa ledger for visas stickers requested and received from the Finance Officer**

We expected to find that the BMPS Visa section maintained a visa ledger for those visa stickers requested and received from the Finance Officer

74. We observed that the Visa section of the BMPS did not maintain a visa ledger to sequentially record unused visa stickers received from the Finance Officer of the Immigration and Nationality Department. We were informed by OIC, Visa section, Mr. Edgar Cano, that they maintained a Visa register. We noted that the register maintained was to record information on the individuals who had been approved and issued visas.

**Fifty six (56) Visa stubs along with the monthly return for February 2013 were not found in the BMPS and All Stations Visa monthly reports/returns files**

We expected to see where the BMPS Visa section and the Finance Officer maintained all visa stubs and monthly return for audit purposes

75. We noted that fifty six (56) visa numbers V00037689 to V00037744 from the Visa section of the BMPS, along with the monthly visa return for the month of February 2013, were not in the Visa section and on the All Stations Visa monthly reports/returns files.

75.2 Visa section had both electronic and manual copies of monthly reports/returns.

**Two (2) instances were noted where the January 2013 Monthly Return did not match the Monthly Return seen in the file maintained by the OIC/Port Commander BMPS**

We expected to see those Monthly Returns kept in the All Stations Visa File and Visa Foils matched entries in files kept at the Belmopan Station

76. We found discrepancies between the two sets of documents as listed at **Table X** below:

**Table X**

All Station Visa File for January 2013

Date	Visa Foil Number as per BMPS monthly report	Visa Foil Number as per monthly returns in All Station file	Name as per BMPS monthly report	Name as per monthly returns in All Station file	Passport Number BMPS monthly report	Passport Number Monthly Returns in All Station file	Nationality	RCR #	Amount
8/1/13	V00036153	V00036653	Yudel Arbella	Yudel Arbella Perez	HZ91410	H291410	Cuban	837738	\$200.00
8/1/13	V00036154	V00036654	Yasmin Chopin	Yasmin Chopin	003243859	O03243859	Salvadoran	837882	\$100.00

76.2 We checked the Belmopan Visa Register which revealed the correct visa number issuance as follows:

Date	Visa Foil/Sticker Number	Name	Passport Number	Nationality	Receipt Number	Amount
8/1/13	V00036153	Yudel Arbella	HZ91410	Cuba	837738	\$200.00
8/1/13	V00036154	Yasmin Chopin	003243859	Salvador	837882	\$100.00

**Visa V00040259 marked cancelled on the BMPS August 2013 Monthly Return was not marked cancelled on the visa stub**

77. We found that Visa number V00040259 dated 15/8/13 issued in the name of Jin Pin Chen was cancelled on the August 2013 monthly return prepared by the Visa section BMPS. A check was made in the All Station file to ascertain whether said visa was cancelled and we found that the visa stub which was attached to the return was not cancelled and the amount collected was not indicated. In addition, the visa sticker was not attached to the stub or seen on the file.

77.2 We saw on the August 2013 returns in the All Station file, that Jin Pin Chen was also issued visa #V00040266 dated 15/8/13 for the sum of Two Thousand Dollars (\$2,000.00). That was the same date Visa stub #V00040259 was noted as been written and issued to said Jin Pin Chen.

We could not ascertain:

- i. Whether visa V00040259 had been cancelled since its visa stub was not marked cancelled and the sticker was not attached to the stub.
- ii. Whether the amount collected for V00040259 was Two Thousand Dollars.
- iii. What happened to visa sticker V00040259
- iv. How the FO did not observed that V00040259 was not cancelled and was accounted for as cancelled on the August 2013 Monthly Return.

**There was no safe to store and safeguard unused and used visa foils held by the OICs/Port Commanders at the BMPS, BNBS and BWBS**

We expected to find that OICs/Port Commanders kept their stock of visas in a safe/vault for safe keeping

78. We noted that the unused and used visas were safeguarded in a cabinet in the OIC/Port Commander's BMPS Office. When we asked him if he was satisfied with the safekeeping of visas, Mr. Cano indicated that he was not satisfied with the safe keeping of the unused visas in the cabinet and would prefer a safe.

78.2 In respect of the OIC/Port Commander BNBS, his stock of unused and used visa foils were kept in a small cabinet in his office. The BWBS stocks of visas were kept in a padlocked drawer of the OIC's desk. Both Officers stated that they would prefer a metal safe for safety and security. When Mr. Hudson (BWBS) was asked in our 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2014 interview if he was satisfied with the safekeeping of the unused visas his response was he would prefer a metal safe.

78.3 It is to be noted that the Port Commander PGIA, had an iron safe which stored unused and used visas foils.

**No documented evidence was found to indicate that internal checks had been carried out at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

*We expected to find that the Immigration and Nationality Department maintained efficient checks, including surprise inspections against the occurrence of fraud, embezzlement or carelessness in accordance with Financial Orders 7d (II)*

79. We did not see any evidence by way of signature that the OICs/Port Commanders BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA or other officers carried out checks on the visa foils, visa registers and cashbooks. We asked Mr. Rejon (BNBS) if internal checks were done on a daily basis on visas and he responded yes, he personally checked the visas, but did not document checks done. The only documented check he did was the signing of the triplicate copies of receipts issued for visas. Mr. Hudson (BWBS) and Mrs. Estrada (PGIA) responses were: yes, daily checks were carried out at the BWBS and PGIA. The Port Commander, PGIA continued by saying that she conducted internal checks at the PGIA. When she is not at work her second, Mr. Romero did the checks and she would review what was checked on her return to work.

79.2 We did not see any evidence that the FOs from the Ministry of Labour, Immigration and Nationality and the main office Belmopan, conducted routine or surprise checks on the stocks of visas held by the Port Commanders BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA. According to Mr. Hudson (BWBS) the Finance Officer from the main office Belmopan, checked his station once. He did not present proof to us that indeed his station was checked by the Finance Officer.

**There was no evidence to substantiate that the Director of Immigration and Nationality monitored his/ her staff at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

We expected to find that the Director of Immigration and Nationality exercise supervision over staff activities as it relates to visa issuance in accordance with Financial Orders 7d (ii)

80. We found no evidence to confirm that the Director of Immigration and Nationality was supervising staff activities as it pertained to the issuance of visas for the period investigated. We did not see, by way of signature, that any checks were made on the OIC Port Commanders to ensure that all staff complied with the laws and regulations.

80.2 Monitoring is of great importance as it assesses the quality of performance over a period of time. This can only be accomplished by the ongoing vigilant monitoring by management and supervisors. There were no written internal procedures and policies with regards to monitoring of visa issuance. This was obvious in the non existence of monthly reconciliations and the safeguarding of used and unused visas. Those inefficiencies exposed the Department to risks such as fraud, embezzlement and or carelessness.



## **Internal controls were very weak at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA**

We expected to find that the Immigration and Nationality Services had maintained an efficient system of internal control

81. The internal control at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA was very weak. We found that there was no manual on the policy and procedures on the issuance of visas. In addition we did not see evidence by way of the signatures of the Port Commanders or other senior officers that the staffs at the BMPS, BNBS, BWBS and PGIA were monitored and work checked on a daily or weekly basis. Monthly reconciliations were also not prepared and submitted to the FO, Belmopan. There is no supervision of staff, reconciliation, internal and security checks.

81.2 The importance of internal control cannot be over emphasized as this helps an entity to achieve its goals/objectives and prevent loss of resources.

## **OTHER FINDINGS**

### **All Station Files**

82. Examination of the All Station Files found at the Belmopan Headquarters revealed a few discrepancies listed below:

### **Three receipt numbers were not recorded on visa stubs submitted by the Big Creek Immigration Office**

82.2 Three visa stubs did not have the receipt numbers recorded on them and as a result we were unable to confirm payments for those visas. Those receipt numbers were from three stubs that were issued at the Big Creek office in August 2013. Listed at **Table Y** is the list of the three visa stubs that no receipt numbers were recorded on.

**Table Y**

The following is the three visa stubs that did not have receipt numbers recorded on them

<b>Visa stub numbers</b>
V00040333
V00040334
V00040335

**The sum of One Hundred (\$100.00) and Two Hundred Dollars (\$200.00) were recorded on visa sticker stub number V00039560 as been collected by the Immigration Department Belize City**

82.3 We noted that \$100.00 and \$200.00 was recorded on Visa sticker stub number V00039260 issued to Francisco Guianan Jr on 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2013 in Belize City. A check of the monthly returns revealed that \$200.00 was the amount that was recorded for visa V00039260.

**Two (2) Visa stubs numbers V00039902 and V00039903 were recorded as issued to one person while the monthly returns had it as issued to another** 88.4 We noted that visa stub number V00039902 recorded that the visa sticker had been issued to Ines Rodriquez, (no nationality stated) vide receipt number 964308 dated 1<sup>st</sup> August 2013 for \$100.00 (returns had Honduran). When we compared the visa stubs against the monthly returns for August 2013 we saw that V00039902 was accounted as issued to Paulino Castillo, a Honduran on receipt number 964282 dated 1<sup>st</sup> August 2013 for \$100.00 instead of Ines Rodriquez. We saw V00039903 had the name Paulino Suou as been issued visa sticker V00039903 vide receipt number 964279 dated 1<sup>st</sup> August 2013 for \$100.00.

83. The Director kept and maintained majority of the visa files in her office. We did not get to examine those files in detail, however, a quick browse revealed that some of the contents were Courtesy Visas approval, Visa Denials, Ministers' request and letters, Chief Executive Officers request and letters, visas authentication for missions, the request and verification of genuine visas, Missions refusal to grant visa despite the Directors approval, Nationality Certificates, revenue collector's receipts copies, Missions whistle blowing information, questionnaires, verifications, security request and clearance, visa applications, specimen request, visa approvals, Treasury Bills and Travel Agent letters.

83.2 Further investigation is needed to examine the content of all files. This is considered vital regarding the many visa discrepancies found during the audit. For example, in the case of Xi Wang aka James Louis Wang, whom we found had his visa verified as genuine by the former Director Ruth Meighan. Shortly after he entered the country he was issued Belizean nationality and passport. (See paragraph 45 of our Nationality report referenced Section II).

84. We found an application form for Bhupinder Singh which was accepted by R Mejia, Immigration Officer, on 13<sup>th</sup> June 2013. The application indicated the Bhupinder Singh was born in India on 20<sup>th</sup> July 1992 and was the holder of a passport from Republic of India with serial number G5416182 which was issued on 18<sup>th</sup> October 2007. On the issuance of the native passport, Singh was 15 years old and the person in the passport picture of the bio page appeared to be a mature man and not a 15 year old teenager.

84.2 We noted that Tolani Saurabh was the reference/sponsor for Bhupinder Singh. He presented the application for the visa at BMPS to apply for the Belize visa in respect of Singh as a family friend. Saurabh paid the sum of \$ 500.00 for the visa vide receipt # 947584 dated 5<sup>th</sup> July 2013. The Director of Immigration approved the visa on 5<sup>th</sup> July, 2013 on the request of Minister Elvin Penner, (a notation was made on the application to that effect). Bhupinder Singh was issued his Belize Visa number V00040672 dated 27<sup>th</sup> August 2013.

84.3 We saw that Tolani Saurabh was born on 19<sup>th</sup> May 1976 in Jaipur India and was the holder of a Belizean Passport with serial number P0222253 issued 29<sup>th</sup> December 2012 with expiry date of 29<sup>th</sup> December 2022. According to the bio page, Tolani Saurabh was 36 years old when he received that passport; however Saurabh appeared as a teenager in the picture. The copy of his Belizean passport was certified to be a copy of the original by Allan Vargas on 21<sup>st</sup> June 2013 at the BMPS.

84.4 We did a check of the Belizean Passport Issuance System (B.P.I.S) and found that passport P0222253 was issued to Mili Vanessa Bul and not Tolani Saurabh. The finding is discussed at paragraph 23 of our Passport report referenced Section III.

### **Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

1. The intervention of Ministers into the visa process either through recommendation letters or requests to expedite the process is stopped since a Minister's intervention is not provided for under the law.
2. The intervention of Ministers, the CEO, Mayor, Caretakers and private individuals in the visa process is investigated to ascertain whether bribery was involved in the issuance of Belize visas to those individuals for whom requests and or recommendations were made.
3. The Minister is notified of such persons who received Permanent Residence in order to review their status since they did not qualify for Belize residency.
4. Expired US visas and Permanent Cards are not accepted by Immigration Officers.
5. All applicants' information is recorded on their application forms and copies of their documents are attached to such application forms.
6. A written documented policy manual on the requirements and issuance of a Belize Visa is implemented.
7. An immediate investigation is conducted into the One Hundred and Thirty Four missing visas stubs at the BWBS, BNBS and PGIA.
8. The missing visa stubs were not as a result of wrongdoing and if so recommend an investigation by the Police.
9. A thorough check is carried out at the BWBS on its visa stubs, visa register and cash book.
10. There is a policy on the acceptance of sponsors with Belizean permanent status
11. Staffs do not issue visas to applicants with expired US visas and Permanent Resident Cards.
12. A documented manual and policy be implemented on the issuance of visa by the INS
13. Immigration officers scrutinize all application forms to make certain that applicants have signed said forms.
14. All applicants present his or her passport size photo for identification purposes.
15. Applicants present his or her native bio page for verification purposes.
16. All applicants or sponsors present proof of financial support.
17. All applicants present documented proof of funds.
18. All applicants present documents for finite period of stay in Belize.

19. All applicants present supporting documents for purpose of visit to Belize.
20. All sponsors present documents showing their relationships with the applicants.
21. Incomplete application forms are not accepted by Immigration Officers.
22. An immediate investigation is made into the fraudulent business certificates and licenses that were presented by sponsors
23. All fraudulent business certificates and licenses found are reported to the Commissioner of Police for immediate action to be taken against the sponsors.
24. A system is put in place to verify the authenticity of business certificates before the issuance of visas.
25. Only those official Business Certificates from the Belize Companies Registry are accepted for the processing of visas.
26. Business certificates are verified at the Belize Companies Registry for authenticity purposes.
27. All applications accepted at the Immigration stations are signed and dated by Immigration officers indicating which officers accepted the applications and on what date.
28. The Acceptance Register maintained by the Visa section records all applications received.
29. An acceptance register is open and maintained by BNBS, BWBS and PGIA to record all applications received.
30. The supporting document section is filled in with information from the supporting documents presented.
31. The interview questionnaires are used when applicants are interviewed for visas.
32. Applicants present all their necessary supporting documentations.
33. The supporting document section is completed by inserting the necessary information from the supporting documents presented.
34. Immigration Officers insert/place/include their recommendation on the application forms before the Director gives his/ her approval for applicants to receive visas.
35. Approvers sign all application forms before the issuance of visas to applicants.
36. All applications approved at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA are signed by the Port Commander or Shift Supervisors before a visa is issued to an applicant.
37. All Port Commanders and Shift Supervisors print their names below their signatures for verification purposes.
38. The official stamp is imprinted on applications to show validity of approvals.
39. All visa applications are recommended by a senior Immigration Officer before a visa is approved for an applicant the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA stations.
40. Those applicants from countries that require security clearance are vetted and documented evidence of such security clearance activities are retained for audit purposes.
41. It is mandatory that applicants present their legitimate purpose of visit before the authorised person(s) approves visa(s) to them.
42. Verifications are carried out on Belize Visas issued at the Missions, Embassies or Consuls for Belize.

43. Copies of previous visas are attached to application forms for those applicants who had previously been issued visas.
44. The Personal Identification Registration System (PIRS) now in place at the INS Port of entries is utilized to assist officers to verify that applicants had been issued visas before.
45. Only the University of Belize, the authorized organization, translates and certifies foreign language documents.
46. Officers do not accept notarial certificates that do not have the seals from the applicants' native countries.
47. An investigation is conducted at the BNBS and BWBS to ascertain who fraudulently inserted those aforementioned receipt numbers in the visa register and returns at BNBS and the visa register at BWBS with a view to have those officers investigated.
48. A system is in place whereby Port Commanders account for all Belize visa stickers/ exhausted visa stubs.
49. A ledger is maintained by OICs/Port Commanders to record all visa stickers received from the Finance Officer for accountability purposes.
50. A Visa Denial Register is maintained by Port Commanders for accountability purposes.
51. OICs/Port Commanders monthly returns in a more efficient and effective manner.
52. An investigation is carried out to determine who received Visa sticker V00040259 and the amount collected.
53. Investigate the Immigration Officer who issued visa sticker V00040259. .
54. The Finance Officer monitors and reconciles all visa stubs to monthly returns when they are submitted.
55. Unused and used visa stickers are kept under lock and key at all times for accountability and security purposes.
56. All OICs/Port Commanders are issued an iron safe for safe keeping of unused and used visas.
57. Proper documentations by the OICs and the Finance Officer of all checks done on a daily or weekly basis.
58. Conducts regular and surprise checks on the Finance Officer's stock of visa stickers for accountability purposes.
59. The Finance Officer does regular and surprise checks on those visas issued to the various Immigration Port Commanders
60. Supervises and monitors staff activities as it relates to the daily activities of the Department.

# Appendices

(For Visa Section 1)



## Appendix I

The following is the list of applicants whose visas were requested by Ministers

### Minister Elvin Penner

Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number	Sponsor
1. Lan Xin Liu	25-Nov-94	China	10-Jun-13	V00039565	None seen. Only vetting Officer Allan Vargas' comments he recorded during interview and that her visa application was supports by Minister Penner
2. Qing Weng	22-Oct-91	China	10-Jun-13	V00039560	Only commence made by vetting officer Allan Vargas seen with notation made by Ms Maia Marin that "Visa recommended Min Penner request" initialed by her and date 7/6/13 and "approved" with her initial and dated 7/6/13
3. Peng Lin	27-Dec-88	China	10-Jun-13	V00039561	Only commence made by vetting officer Allan Vargas seen with notation made by Ms Maia Marin that "Visa recommended Min Penner request" initialed by her and date 7/6/13 and "approved" with her initial and dated 7/6/13
4. Li Juan Liu	20-Jul-95	China	10-Jun-13	V00039562	Only commence made by vetting officer Allan Vargas seen with notation made by Ms Maia Marin that "Visa recommended Min Penner request" initialed by her and date 7/6/13 and "approved" with her initial and dated 7/6/13



## Appendix II

The following is the list of individuals that the Chief Executive Officer, Caretakers, the Mayor and a citizen requested visas for

### Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Labour, Candelaria Saldivar-Morter

Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number	Sponsor
1. Dadian Ye	1-Mar-85	China	22-Jan-13	V00036709	Zhen Yi Luo
2. Jie Jiang	25-Jul-89	China	17-Jan-13	V00036708	Zhen Yi Luo
3. Jiamin Chen	30-Sep-95	China	receipt date 19-Jun-13	V00039612	Only memo from Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Labour, Local Government, Rural Development, National Emergency Management, Immigration and Nationality ref IMM/GEN/3/04/13 VOL. VII (21) dated 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 seen
4. Yaping Chen	11-Feb-93	China	receipt date 19-Jun-13	V00039613	Only memo from Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Labour, Local Government, Rural Development, National Emergency Management, Immigration and Nationality ref IMM/GEN/3/04/13 VOL. VII (21) dated 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 seen
5. Jiaxin Chen	8-Feb-94	China	receipt date 19-Jun-13	V00039614	Only memo from Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Labour, Local Government, Rural Development, National Emergency Management, Immigration and Nationality ref IMM/GEN/3/04/13 VOL. VII (21) dated 12 <sup>th</sup> June 2013 seen

### APPENDIX III

The following is the list of One Hundred and Thirty One Visa Stubs that were presented nor found on hand at the time of investigation at the BNBS

Visa Number	Date	Name	Date of Birth	Country of Birth	Revenue Collectors Receipt	Cost of Visa
V00037113	26.01.13	Hiroyuki Okubo	21.01.85	Japan	807643	\$100.00
V00037114	27.01.13	Ibet Morales	15.04.78	Columbia	807645	\$100.00
V00037115	28.01.13	Nery Villacorta	26.06.71	Peru	807646	\$100.00
V00037116	28.01.13	Audrey Filinkov	30.03.67	Russia	807419	\$100.00
V00037117	29.01.13	Nelda Sotelo	24.03.64	Peru	807420	\$100.00
V00037118	29.01.13	Marlene Tuesta	12.11.69	Peru	807420	\$100.00
V00037119	29.01.13	Yoshida Kazuyo	15.11.89	Japan	807426	\$100.00
V00037120	29.01.13	Motoi Nakanishi	13.09.91	Japan	807426	\$100.00
V00037121	29.01.13	Minori Horikoshi	11.06.80	Japan	807426	\$100.00
V00037122	29.01.13	Alexey Lobada	06.06.78	Russia	807438	\$100.00
V00037123	29.01.13	Sergey Denisov	18.10.79	Russia	807438	\$100.00
V00037124	29.01.13	Maxim Lipovskikh	25.08.87	Russia	807438	\$100.00
V00037125	29.01.13	Viktorita Doina	31.07.72	Russia	807440	\$100.00
V00037126	29.01.13	Liana Shengeliya	26.06.93	Russia	807440	\$100.00
V00037127	29.01.13	Erika Asano	31.05.85	Japan	807444	\$100.00
V00037128	30.01.13	Diony Gomez	30.07.87	Honduras	807652	\$100.00
V00037129	30.01.13	Oscar Barahona	21.09.78	Honduras	807652	\$100.00

V00036253	02.01.13	Oleg Suraev	04.08.59	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00036254	02.01.13	Svetlana Savtcova	23.12.75	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00036255	02.01.13	Ekaterina Gubareva	19.06.86	Russia	804985	\$100.00
V00036256	02.01.13	Denis Dubrovin	28.11.69	Russia	804985	\$100.00
V00036257	02.01.13	Ekaterina Petrova	12.11.71	Russia	804985	\$100.00
V00036258	03.01.13	Supranee Kampongsun	16.07.79	Thailand	804987	\$100.00
V00036259	03.01.13	Masato Fujita	02.02.84	Japan	804987	\$100.00
V00036260	03.01.13	Ghassan Alsayyed	20.01.80	Jordan	804988	\$100.00
V00036261	03.01.13	Dmitry Kharitonov	04.05.72	Russia	804993	\$100.00
V00036262	03.01.13	Danil Kharitonov	30.11.96	Russia	804993	\$100.00

No receipt number in visa register for V00036256 and V00036257

V00036263	03.01.13	Nil Kharitonov	15.06.01	Russia	804993	\$100.00
V00036264	03.01.13	Sergey Ermolaev	08.03.65	Russia	804994	\$100.00
V00036265	03.01.13	Tatiana Ermolaeva	19.01.67	Russia	804994	\$100.00
V00036266	03.01.13	Roman Ermolaev	22.07.91	Russia	804994	\$100.00
V00036267	03.01.13	Svetlana Surina	28.12.73	Russia	804995	\$100.00
V00036268	03.01.13	Aleksandr Chmutov	24.05.51	Russia	804995	\$100.00
V00036269	04.01.13	Elena Pobozhaya	13.02.83	Russia	804989	\$100.00
V00036270	04.01.13	Pete Voronov	03.03.78	Russia	804989	\$100.00
V00036271	05.01.13	Hiroka Maruyama	05.02.76	Japan	804996	\$100.00
V00036272	05.01.13	Yoshinori Maruyama	03.04.76	Japan	804996	\$100.00
V00036273	05.01.13	Gloria Cerna	19.12.97	Salvador	804997	\$100.00
V00036274	05.01.13	Hanburg Kim	29.01.85	South Kore	805000	\$100.00
V00036275	06.01.13	Alexey Kharitonenko	14.03.80	Russian	805802	\$100.00
V00036276	06.01.13	Ingrid Rossell	24.05.93	Peru	805803	\$100.00
V00036277	07.01.13	Zoran Mihaljevic	26.08.79	Croatia	806201	\$100.00
V00036278	07.01.13	Artur Aparenkov	09.08.70	Russia	806202	\$100.00
V00036279	07.01.13	Alexander Kazantsev	23.03.78	Russia	806202	\$100.00
V00036280	07.01.13	Elena Gudenko	06.06.60	Russia	806202	\$100.00
V00036281	07.01.13	Olga Efimova	25.05.74	Russia	806203	\$100.00
V00036282	07.01.13	Mikhail Berezka	06.07.63	Russia	806203	\$100.00
V00036283	07.01.13	Yu - Hang Chung	28.03.89	Tawian	806204	\$100.00
V00036284	08.01.13	Kentaro Kumazawa	10.02.78	Japan	806205	\$100.00
V00036285	08.01.13	Angely Trochez	24.09.99	Honduras	806206	\$100.00
V00036286	08/01.13	Yevgeniya Rudenko	14.09.54	Ukraine	806207	\$100.00
V00036287	08.01.13	Igor Kadochin	23.07.69	Russia	806207	\$100.00
V00036288	08.01.13	Nadir Chiglikov	02.06.74	Russia	806207	\$100.00
V00036289	08.01.13	Irina Chiglikova	09.05.84	Russia	806208	\$100.00
V00036290	08.01.13	Yuliana Lyakhova	03.02.79	Russia	806208	\$100.00
V00036291	08.01.13	Ilya Mitasov	04.05.80	Russia	806208	\$100.00
V00036292	08.01.13	Irina Bushina	07.05.71	Russia	806208	\$100.00
V00036293	08.01.13	Igor Bushin	30.08.69	Russia	806209	\$100.00
V00036294	08.01.13	Liubov Kelbakh	26.04.81	Russia	806209	\$100.00
V00036295	08.01.13	Denis Abuev	26.03.81	Russia	806209	\$100.00
V00036296	08.01.13	Yulia Brodskaya	10.07.62	Russia	806210	\$100.00

V00036297	08.01.13	Svetlana Berdnikova	18.04.57	Russia	806210	\$100.00
V00036298	09.01.13	Maria Amaya	25.03.68	Honduras	805807	\$100.00
V00036299	09.01.13	Lesly Casanova	04.02.96	Honduras	805809	\$100.00
V00036300	09.01.13	Ancelmo Isaias	15.11.78	El Salvador	805810	\$100.00
V00036301	09.01.13	Keiko Miyagaki	13.06.86	Japan	805813	\$100.00
V00036302	09.01.13	Ryota Saito	20.07.91	Japan	805813	\$100.00
V00036303	10.01.13	Seokhwan Moon	14.12.55	Korea	805834	\$100.00
V00036304	11.01.13	Sara Krnic	18.07.96	Montenegro	805836	\$100.00
V00030305	11.01.13	Edin Krnic	07.01.68	Montenegro	805836	\$100.00
V00036306	11.01.13	Ivana Kozarac	23.10.82	Serbia	805837	\$100.00
V00036307	11.01.13	Vladimir Stojkovic	11.07.73	Serbia	805837	\$100.00
V00036308	11.01.13	Manami Toda	19.09.81	Japan	805843	\$100.00
V00036309	11.01.13	Yuko Saruwatari	17.11.79	Japan	805843	\$100.00
V00036310	12.01.13	Kosuke Fujioka	27.12.77	Japan	805848	\$100.00
V00036311	12.01.13	Ryuji Takemoto	13.10.88	Japan	805849	\$100.00
V00036312	14.01.13	Reina Aleman	28.04.66	Honduras	806228	\$100.00
V00036313	15.01.13	Alexey Afanasyev	12.01.82	Russian	806251	\$100.00
V00036314	15.01.13	Walter Perez	18.04.96	Nicaraguan	806254	\$100.00
V00036315	15.01.13	Mika Menjo	25.11.86	Japanese	806256	\$100.00
V00036316	16.01.13	Liidia Papina	09.05.45	Russian	805853	\$100.00
V00036317	16.01.13	Natalia Uspenskaya	24.11.61	Russian	805853	\$100.00
V00036319	16.01.13	Mikhail Seryakov	30.07.80	Russian	805853	\$100.00
V00036318	16.01.13	Alexey Bychkov	26.09.68	Russian	805853	\$100.00
V00036320	16.01.13	Svetlana Smirnova	01.06.83	Russian	805854	\$100.00
V00036321	16.01.13	Aleksandr Uspenskii	04.11.57	Russian	805854	\$100.00
V00036322	16.01.13	Iuliia Leoshina	18.01.68	Russian	805854	\$100.00
V00036323	16.01.13	Elena Egorova	07.11.66	Russian	805854	\$100.00
V00036324	16.01.13	Mikhail Gusmanov	05.07.79	Russian	805854	\$100.00
V00036325	16.01.13	Nery Miranda	24.03.83	Honduran	805859	\$100.00
V00036326	16.01.13	Yuda Naridomi	08.07.79	Japanese	805861	\$100.00
V00036327	16.01.13	Akifumi Kajiwara	18.12.86	Japanese	805864	\$100.00
V00036328	16.01.13	Nobuaki Suyama	22.12.57	Japanese	805865	\$100.00
V00036329	16.01.13	Pavel Fedorov	22.02.75	Russian	805869	\$100.00
V00036330	17.01.13	Isao Nago	22.07.58	Japanese	805870	\$100.00

Visa regsiter had 805844  
visa regsiter had 805845

V00036331	18.01.13	Ecsibia Pineda	08.10.63	Honduran	805891	\$100.00
V00036332	18.01.13	Delma Castelblanco	19.09.75	Colombian	805893	\$100.00
V00036333	18.01.13	Kanako Copeland	11.07.68	Japanese	805894	\$100.00
V00036334	20.01.13	Darlin Turcios	17.05.90	Honduran	805898	\$100.00
V00036335	21.01.13	Sekyn Park	16.01.80	Korean	806266	\$100.00
V00363336	21.01.13	In Sook Sung	20.01.82	Korean	806266	\$100.00
V00036337	21.01.13	Ingry Torres	07.08.80	Columbia	806271	\$100.00
V00036338	21.01.13	Maria Quiceno	01.11.86	Columbia	806276	\$100.00
V00036339	22.01.13	Branko Fiorilo	10.03.79	Bolivia	806297	\$100.00
V00036340	22.01.13	Qiangfang Gui	23.12.57	China	806298	\$100.00
V00036341	22.01.13	Zuowen Fan	24.11.49	China	806298	\$100.00
V00036342	22.01.13	Shoupeng Tang	15.06.55	China	806298	\$100.00
V00036343	22.01.13	Jufang Wang	08.08.55	China	806299	\$100.00
V00036344	22.01.13	Jinsheng Han	10.06.62	China	806299	\$100.00
V00036345	22.01.13	Changlin Zhang	17.03.53	China	806299	\$100.00
V00036346	22.01.13	Tielang Ren	22.07.46	China	806299	\$100.00
V00036347	23.01.13	Guillermo Jimenez	24.01.71	Panama	807605	\$100.00
V00036348	23.01.13	Mirelle Navarro	12.04.72	Panama	807605	\$100.00
V00036349	25.01.13	Victor Britez	27.03.85	Paraguay	807634	\$100.00
V00036350	25.01.13	Akira Masago	26.04.48	Japan	807635	\$100.00
V00036351	25.01.13	Yuka McKenna	08.02.67	Japan	807635	\$100.00
V00036352	25.01.13	Karen Tamaris	07.08.83	Columbia	807641	\$100.00

V00035979	01.01.13	Natsuni Saito	19.10.91	Japan	804982	\$100.00
V00035980	01.01.13	Yuki Nakayama	11.08.86	Japan	804983	\$100.00
V00035981	02.01.13	Elena Rekshnya	26.10.70	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035982	02.01.13	Viktor Efremov	30.03.58	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035983	02.01.13	Alexandr Latyshev	04.09.48	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035984	02.01.13	Alexander Rekshnya	19.05.70	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035985	02.01.13	Gelena Kugavskaya	20.04.61	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035986	02.01.13	Elena Vidershpan	25.09.74	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035987	02.01.13	Alexander Sharmanov	04.12.56	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035988	02.01.13	Natalia Piskareva	20.05.83	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035989	02.01.13	Galina Vasilets	29.03.60	Russia	804984	\$100.00

V00035990	02.01.13	Natalia Vasilets	21.11.86	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035991	02.01.13	Sergey Vasilets	01.01.59	Russia	804984	\$100.00
V00035992	02.01.13	Dmitry Muromets	15.08.69	Russia	804984	\$100.00

## APPENDIX IV

The following is the list of individuals with Permanent Residence Status that invited and sponsored applicants to visit Belize

NAME OF APPLICANT	NAME OF SPONSOR	DATE OF BIRTH	BIRTH PLACE	VISA #	RECIPT NUMBER	DATE OF APPLICATION	MINISTER'S REQUEST	MINSTER'S LETTER
Zi Jian Chen	Daxi Huang	10-Jan-81	China	V00039678	915470	12-Jun-13		
Zhong Li	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	13-Jun-90	China	V00040851	983703	3-Sep-13		
Chuande Tang	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	21-Sep-93	China	V00040852	983704	3-Sep-13		
Xia Ping Sun	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	9-Feb-96	China	V00040857	983710	4-Sep-13		
Jia Hang Shi	Jia Cheng Zhao	15-Nov-82	China	V00039589	934169	14-Jun-13	Charles Gibson	MISSING
Jian Xue Li	Rongman Li	28-Feb-69	China	V00040250	969212	9-Aug-13	Elvin Penner	
Bingzhu Liu	Ruibin Chen	5-Jan-71	China	V00036705	842879	16-Jan-13		
Renli Wang	Ruibin Chen	11-Jul-01	China	V00036706	842864	16-Jan-13		
Yong Jian Wang	Ruibin Chen	28-Nov-73	China	V00036707	842863	16-Jan-13		
Xiu Hui Wang	Wei Biao Zhao	23-Dec-91	China	V00040264	972209	15-Aug-13	Edmund Castro	NO
Jin Pin Chen	Wei Biao Zhao	4-Nov-86	China	V00040266	972180	15-Aug-13	Edmund Castro	NO
Anning Li	Wei Shi Liu	26-Aug-91	China	V00036143	836831	7-Jan-13	Mayor John August	Elvin Penner
Hong Li	Wei Shi Liu	12-Jul-88	China	V00036144	836833	7-Jan-13	Mayor John August	Elvin Penner
Xiu Yu Huang	Wei Shi Liu	2-Jul-88	China	V00036145	836832	7-Jan-13	Mayor John August	Elvin Penner
Zen Feng Lin	Wei Shi Liu	11-Nov-95	China	V00036149	837502	8-Jan-13	Mayor John August	Elvin Penner
Qian Wang	Wei Shi Liu	13-Apr-90	China	V00036150	837503	8-Jan-13	Mayor John August	Elvin Penner
Yang Yang Zheng	Wei Shi Liu	24-Jul-93	China	V00036151	837510	8-Jan-13	Mayor John August	Elvin Penner
Fang Lin	Wen Yuan Zhen	23-Aug-83	China	V00039591	934176	14-Jun-13	Charles Gibson	MISSING
Wen Zan Yu	Zian Li	29-Jan-77	China	V00037500	853800	1-Feb-13	Anthony Martinez	YES
Wei Xun Lin	Zian Li	10-Mar-96	China	V00037509	854592	4-Feb-13		
Ling Lin	Zian Li	14-Apr-91	China	V00037510	854593	4-Feb-13		

APPENDIX V



## MEMORANDUM

**MY REF:** GEN/24/01/10(1) Vol. III  
**FROM:** Director, Immigration and Nationality Services  
**TO:** Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Foreign Trade

**SUBJECT:** PROCESS FOR BELIZE VISA ISSUANCE

**DATE:** December 14, 2010

Please note that through our Honorary Consul in Houston Texas, Mr. Hugh McCain, visa number TX1941 dated November 16, 2010 was issued to Cuban national, Nelson Andres Velazquez Liriano holder of passport number B323384, without obtaining prior approval from the Director. This practice is not an isolated case and our Foreign Service Officers must be advised to discontinue this visa issuance procedure.

Allow me to refer to section 9(1) Chapter 156 of the laws of Belize Revised Edition 2000 and Statutory Instrument number 42 of 2005 section 3, I quote:

"The principal Immigration Officer (Director) may issue to any prospective immigrant a permit to enter or remain in Belize subject to such conditions as to occupation, security to be furnished, or any other matter or thing as the principal Immigration Officer (Director) may think expedient."

"Every person who intends to obtain an Entry Permit (Visa) to enter Belize shall ordinarily apply to the diplomatic or consular office of Belize in the country where the applicant resides, or where Belize is not so represented, to the diplomatic or consular office of the country that acts on behalf of Belize in that country by mutual agreement. In exceptional circumstances where it would be impracticable or inexpedient to issue visas abroad, such an application may be made in Belize, but in every such case the conditions for the grant of the Entry Permit and the fees payable shall apply in like manner as if the application had been made abroad."



Please be informed that in an effort to streamline the visa issuance process, this office has adopted the below listed changes and improvements to security and internal controls.

The Immigration and Nationality Department has committed to complete requests made for approval or otherwise of visas within (5) five working days of having received such request.

I hereby reiterate our commitment to improve our services to the public and to recognize the support your Foreign Service Offices have contributed to this cause.

Submitted for your information.

**RUTH MEIGHAN (Ms.)**  
**DIRECTOR**  
**Immigration and Nationality Department**

cc: CEO, Ministry of Defense and Immigration

### Process for Belize Visa Issuance

For visas issued in Belize:

1. Presentation of application form by sponsor/family member of applicant if already in Belize. Family member refers to mother/father, daughter/son, wife/husband, or sister/brother.
2. Application form is to be accompanied by supporting documents that include bank statements, passports, proof of ability to maintain self, and any other document that may support the application.
3. Application form is vetted and documents inspected as to their authenticity.
4. Sponsor/family member or applicant is interviewed as to purpose of visit, intended length of stay, intended address, and relationship; this is done with a view to determine that the application is genuine.
5. Denial or approval is granted.
6. If approved, payments are effected and visa is issued.
7. As per the Belize Visa Requirement List (prepared in collaboration with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs), certain nationalities require clearance from the Director, Immigration and Nationality and some require both such clearance and an additional security clearance (conducted by the Special Branch of the Police Department) prior to approval.
8. Typical visa fees are as follows:
  - a. Single entry up to six months – BZ \$100.00
  - b. Multiple entry up to a year – BZ \$200.00 except for
  - c. For citizens of India, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh, and Pakistan – BZ \$500.00
  - d. For citizens of the Peoples Republic of China – BZ \$4,000.00 plus a BZ \$8,000.00 repatriation deposit.

For visas issued at our Foreign Service offices.

1. Presentation of application by applicant along with supporting documents and copy of bio-data page of passport.
2. Application form is vetted as to their authenticity and interview is conducted.
3. Copies of all documents accepted and results of interview should be forwarded to the Director Immigration and Nationality Department, Belize.
4. After due diligence is conducted, the Director Immigration and Nationality Department will forward letter of approval/denial to Foreign Service office.



5. Fees should be levied in accordance with Statutory Instrument #42 of 2005.
6. Monthly reports should be submitted to Director Immigration and Nationality as per S.I. #42 of 2005.

#### **Recommendations to improve Security and Internal Controls**

1. Update the current application form for more relevant data and include a separate sheet for an interview of the applicant and for a recommendation for or against visa approval.
2. The updated form is to also include an area that clearly delineates the internal processes:
  - a. Front desk Immigration Officer to inspect form and supporting documents and interview applicant. He/she will initial and date form. Then,
  - b. Forward to Senior Immigration Officer (Supervisor) for secondary inspection and a further interview if so required. He/she will initial or date form. Then,
  - c. If applicant is a citizen of a country that requires no Director clearance, the Senior Immigration Officer may approve or deny the application. He/she will initial and date form. Or,
  - d. If applicant requires Director's clearance, the form and supporting documents are forwarded to Director/Deputy for further vetting and subsequent approval or denial. He/she will initial and date form.
3. In doing the due diligence, the Immigration and Nationality Department has to improve on its being current with regional and global migration trends. The intra-governmental communication channels are to be re-established and every effort is to be made to become components of regional data sharing networks. This will be done through the Regional Conference on Migration (RCM), the Organization of Central American Migration Directorates (OCAM), and CARICOM and the Implementation Agency for Crime and Security (IMPACS).
4. That the practice of receiving and processing visa applications in country be limited to: (1) applicants who are here having already entered; and (2) persons inviting their immediate family (parents, children, husband/wife, brother/sister) to visit.
5. That the practice of using a wet stamp (rubber) for visa issuance is to be discontinued upon receipt of the Visa foils. Visa foils, applied to a passport with adhesive are to be implemented. These will provide for enhanced security containing modern features, particularly when compared with the wet stamp. Because they bear serial numbers, they also allow for better record's management and facilitate auditing inspections.
6. Given the current prevalence of the topic, not just visas but also the proposed Amnesty Program, there is the need for the development of a comprehensive migration policy which should include national dialogue on the subject.

## Appendix VI

The following is the list of application forms did not have the required passport size photos of the applicants who had been issued visas at the BNBS, BWBS and PGIA

### BNBS

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number
Tokuko Hyodo	18-Jul-74	Japan	26-Aug-12	V00033444
Igor Petros	11-Feb-67	Russia	7-Mar-12	V00029171
Hayashi Daichi	13-Oct-91	Japan	4-Mar-12	V00029170
Yamamoto Yuko	11-Nov-91	Japan	4-Mar-12	V00029169
Sol Ines Giannini	4-Mar-85	Argentina	2-Mar-12	V00029168
Maria Agustina Ginaca	18-Jan-83	Argentina	2-Mar-12	V00029167
Dmitry Nazarenkov	4-Jan-65	Russia	7-Mar-12	V00029172
Yuri Ota	1-Jul-87	Japan	28-Sep-12	V00033445
Mercy Abisola Erinle	10-Mar-87	Nigeria	9-Mar-12	V00029176
Arsenio Chicas	14-Dec-68	El Salvador	27-Aug-12	V00033443
Ana Gabriela Mejia Perez	2-Nov-87	Honduras	25-Aug-12	V00033442
Maria Juila Melgar Ramirez	12-Sep-12	El Salvador	21-Aug-12	V00033437
Amaury German Liriano Rosa	30-Jan-77	Rep. Dominica	20-Aug-12	V00033435
Marlene Rafalina Matos Rosa	12-May-85	Rep. Dominica	20-Aug-12	V00033434
Peralta Carlos Acberto	6-Sep-99	Argentina	1-Mar-12	V00029166
Felipe Luis da Costa	20-Nov-87	Brazil	13-Mar-12	V00029179
Marlene Rafelina Matos Rosa	12-May-85	Rep. Dominica	15-Aug-12	V00033425
Adrian Fernando Martins Capitas	7-Feb-79	Argentina	15-Mar-12	V00029187
Mauricio Paulo Chueiri	29-Jun-74	Brazil	14-Mar-12	V00029183
Matsuda Takahiko	10-Apr-77	Japan	30-Oct-12	V00034576
Jonas Kazmirczak	6-Oct-87	Brazil	14-Mar-12	V00029182
Masatoki Utsai	3-Sep-89	Japan	9-Mar-12	V00029174
Dorado Marta Adriana	28-Jul-56	Argentina		V00029180
Horesteres Zavila Cruz	9-Oct-90	Honduras		V00029173
Jose Moises Canales Avila	7-Feb-64	Honduras	15-Mar-12	V00029186
Emilio Fernando Amaral	24-Jun-76	Brazil	13-Mar-12	V00029178

Rodriuez				
Diego Antonio Cornejo	18-Apr-77	Argentina	15-Mar-12	V00029185
Alla Zhidkova	30-Aug-72	Ussr	11-Mar-12	V00029177
Kotaro Hayashida	13-Sep-89	Japan	9-Mar-12	V00029175
Hugo Sebastian Agnetti	4-Sep-80	Argentina	14-Mar-12	V00029184
Katsiaryna Petrashkevich	9-Apr-87	Belarus	14-Mar-12	V00029181
Cecilia Mercedes Vinzia	2-Jul-80	Argentina	1-Aug-12	V00033392
Ro Hyein	18-Jan-91	Republic of Korea	1-Aug-12	V00033390
Vladimir Sharlaev	25-Dec-73	Ussr	2-Aug-12	V00033398
Reginaldo Marcio Pereida	8-Nov-64	Brazil	2-Aug-12	V00033397

## Appendix VII

The following is the list of application forms that were found without any passport size photos of the applicants

### BMPS

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number
Bi Ying Liu	17-May-84	China	29-Jan-13	V00036747
Ming Yi Gao	8-Sep-85	China	29-Jan-13	V00036746
Xiu Yun Xiao	4-Sep-68	China	10-Jul-12	V00032286
Chen Wen Yuan	12-Jul-89	China	5-Mar-12	V00029387
Tian bi Lai	8-Oct-78	China	31-Jul-12	V00032940
Clementina Guzman	17-Apr-52	Honduras	31-Jul-12	V00032934
Alberto Lopez Lopez	25-Aug-71	El Salvador	30-Jul-12	V00032938
Zhen Yong Weng	22-Jun-78	China	30-Jul-12	V00032937
Evelyn Karina Solis Morazan	8-Nov-85	Honduras	27-Jul-12	V00032929
Chun Yan Zhu	5-Mar-79	China	26-Jul-12	V00032320
Soaya Shaina Witney Dumay	25-Jan-04	Haiti	25-Jul-12	V00032316
Yester Jouse Dominguez	24-Dec-96	Honduras	23-Jul-12	V00032309
Doris Arggentina Dominguez	27-Aug-67	Honduras	23-Jul-12	V00032308
Amandeep Singh	25-Jan-96	India	31-May-12	V00031453
Dan Dan Lei	27-Sep-92	China	10-Jul-12	V00032287
Wen Jing Lei	9-Dec-93	China	10-Jul-12	V00032285
Xue Ling He	6-Jul-84	China	10-Jul-12	V00032284
Yovanni Fortin	20-Sep-70	Honduras	27-Apr-12	V00029462
Azalia del Carmen Quezada	6-May-76	El Salvador	10-Apr-12	V00029412
Yasmine Spencer	23-Jun-01	Honduras	4-Apr-12	V00029411
Kevin Spencer	24-Nov-97	Honduras	4-Apr-12	V00029410
Mari Luz Lopez Barrera	4-Aug-87	Nicaragua	2-Apr-12	V00029402
Alexa Nicole Lopez Barrera	19-Sep-12	Matagalpa Nicaragua	2-Apr-12	V00029403
Leonardo Jesus Misanda Lopez	23-Nov-05	Matagalpa Nicaragua	2-Apr-12	V00029404
Carlos Enrique Lopez	31-May-09	Matagalpa	2-Apr-12	V00029405

Barrera		Nicaragua		
Qing Liu	5-Mar-90	China	5-Oct-12	V00034652
Roxana Yanette Ramos	31-Aug-78	El Salvador	18-Jul-12	V00032301
Juan Lin	25-Mar-74	China	9-Nov-12	V00035272
Hui Juan Zou	20-Sep-96	China	5-Oct-12	V00034646
Jian Chao Huang	11-Mar-90	China	5-Oct-12	V00034695
Yu Lin Huang	4-Jun-92	China	5-Oct-12	V00034643
Digna Abigail Sanchez	7-Feb-93	Honduras	3-Oct-12	V00033825
Kenia Yaleni Antunez	2-Sep-89	Honduras	2-Oct-12	V00033824
Su Xian Liu	20-Aug-90	China	2-Oct-12	V00033816

## Appendix VIII

The following is the list of applications that did not have the applicants' Passports Bio Pages

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number
Katsumi Nagamori	16-Nov-46	Japan	14-Mar-12	V00029393
Jixin Cen	14-Feb-92	China	9-Jul-13	V00039761
Qin Xu	17-Jul-93	China	9-Jul-13	V00039762
Shuxian Cen	14-May-89	China	9-Jul-13	V00039763
Digna Abigail Sanchez	7-Feb-93	Honduras	3-Oct-12	V00033825
Pierre Charbel	4-Jan-63	Halat, Lebanon	27-Jul-12	V00032933
Jiesthan Glenda Moron Arroyo	13-May-74	Santa Cruz, Bolivia	27-Jul-12	V00032932
Verlande Adelin	20-Sep-80	Haiti	9-Jul-12	V00032282
Nahoko Yaguchi	30-May-73	Japan	5-Jul-12	V00032275
Aicha Mohamad Hijazi	1-Oct-12	Brazil	16-Apr-12	V00029431
Aki Tanaka	3-Jul-88	Japan	25-May-12	V00031442
Kumiko Hoshi	13-Jan-89	Japan	25-May-12	V00031441
Nian - Tsy Tsai	13-Aug-55	Taiwan	26-Jun-12	V00032244
Xia Ping Sun	9-Feb-96	China	4-Sep-13	V00040857
Pin Yen Chen	21-Nov-11	Taiwan	23-May-12	V00031437
Wen Long Hua	6-Aug-88	China	9-Jul-13	V00039764
Francois Fritzlor	22-Dec-61	Haiti	26-Jun-12	V00032243
Hsiu Chuan Lin	2-Jan-80	Republic of China	3-May-12	V00031393
Mai Liang Zhu	12-May-85	China	16-May-12	V00031425
Qi Wen Zheng	10-Feb-82	China	16-May-12	V00031426
Chuanyin Chen	15-Aug-89	China	16-May-12	V00031427
Shuqin Huang	12-Sep-83	China	16-May-12	V00031428
Yu Zhang	1-Jun-87	China	30-Dec-11	V00026850
Hong Ning Yan	4-Jun-71	China	25-Nov-11	V00025663
Lin Lin Ye	14-Aug-93	China	14-Nov-11	V00025647
Tranzhi Wang	15-Oct-69	Hubei/China	7-Nov-11	V00025636



## Appendix IX

The following is the list of applications that did not have Financial Support Letters

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number
Clementina Guzman	17-Apr-52	Honduras	31-Jul-12	V00032934
Margarita Cuadra Fedrick	10-Feb-91	Nicaragua	23-Jul-12	V00032312
Soaya Shaina Witney Dumay	25-Jan-04	Haiti	25-Jul-12	V00032316
Julia Yanira Portillo de Bonilla	20-Aug-79	El Salvador	26-Jul-12	V00032317
Evelyn Karina Solis Morazan	8-Nov-85	Honduras	27-Jul-12	V00032929
Julio Cesar Lopez Arias	24-Jan-93	San Salvador	27-Jul-12	V00032930
Liyu Zhuang	11-Jun-82	China	16-Mar-12	V00029394
Alberto Lopez Lopez	25-Aug-71	El Salvador	30-Jul-12	V00032938
Doris Arggentina Dominguez	27-Aug-67	Honduras	23-Jul-12	V00032308
Tian bi Lai	8-Oct-78	China	31-Jul-12	V00032940
Hirata Kazunobu	5-Jan-39	Japan	8-Feb-12	V00029392
Katsumi Nagamori	16-Nov-46	Japan	14-Mar-12	V00029393
Do Sung Na	20-Nov-71	Korea	25-Sep-13	V00041381
Alex Armando de la Cruz Garcia	2-Jun-92	San Salvador	27-Jul-12	V00032931
Maria Graciela Zeledon	1-Jul-48	El Salvador	13-Jul-12	V00032295
Nahoko Yaguchi	30-May-73	Japan	5-Jul-12	V00032275
Leonor Martinez Barcelo	1-Jul-46	Cuba	6-Jul-12	V00032278
Rony Javier Aguirre Ortiz	5-Jun-90	Honduras	10-Jul-12	V00032283
Fermin Gamez	5-Jan-80	El Salvador	11-Jul-12	V00032288
Mohd Zaman	11-Jul-12	Afghanistan	11-Jul-12	V00032291

## Appendix X

The following is the list of sponsors that did not submit proof of their source of funds such as Bank Statements or Job Letters

Name of Sponsor	Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Visa Number
Angela Hernandez	Gloria Edelmira Lopez Diaz	02-Jan-68	Nicaragua	137/BMP/12
Fredrick Antonio Sho	Fatima Elietl Ramirez Zuniga	24-Oct-00	Honduras	140/BMP/12
Wen Bin Chen	Chen Wen Yuan	12-Jul-89	China	V00029387
Hassan Hijaei	Mhd Nabil Tabbab	01-Jan-82	Syria	V00029429
Hassan Hijaei	Ahmad Yaser Tabab	01-Nov-87	Syria	V00029430
Hassan Hijaei	Aicha Mohamad Hijazi	01-Oct-12	Brazil	V00029431
Lee Mark Cheng	Xue Ling He	06-Jul-84	China	V00032284
Bing Tang Li	Ying Jiang	01-Aug-92	China	V00032936
Bing Tang Li	Zhen Yong Weng	22-Jun-78	China	V00032937
Depei Zhang	Dong Lidan	25-Jan-91	China	V00036115
Depei Zhang	Ting Xing Li	02-Oct-84	China	V00036116
Wei Shi Liu	Anning Li	26-Aug-91	China	V00036143
Zong Rong Chen	Zu Fa Zhu	10-Oct-73	China	V00036660
Christopher Zheng	Xi Wang	06-Mar-84	China	V00036693
Xi Shi Chen	Fei Dong	27-Mar-89	China	V00036696
Wei Tao Liu	Yan Hua Zhang	14-Sep-88	China	V00036697
Xing Juan Zhu	Lei Ping Zheng	26-May-95	China	V00036698
Xing Juan Zhu	Qiao Zheng	15-Sep-88	China	V00036699
Wei Tao Liu	Li Zhang Lin	13-May-85	China	V00036700

Name of Sponsor	Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Visa Number
Xishi Chen	Xiang Lin	14-Aug-90	China	V00036701
Zong Rong Chen	Xue Yan Ou Yang	02-Jan-91	China	V00037530
Wei Tao Liu	Xiao Ting Su	15-Dec-89	China	V00037533
Xing Juan Zhu	Yan Fei Guo	21-Mar-80	China	V00037534
Wei Tao Liu	Gen Mei Zhang	16-Dec-86	China	V00037535
Wei Tao Liu	Xue Mei Xu	04-Apr-66	China	V00037536
Meng Tang Li	De Rong Lin	16-Apr-77	China	V00037557
Meng Tang Li	Yu Zheng	30-Sep-85	China	V00037558
Shao Li Chen	Xiao Ting Fan	21-Jun-84	China	V00037564
Guanning Wu	Wei Wu	17-Jan-89	China	V00037691
Guanning Wu	Jin Fa Hu	01-Feb-69	China	V00037704
Guanning Wu	Chen Jin Hui	04-Nov-86	China	V00037705
Jian Fu Li	Li Chen Yu	26-Aug-82	China	V00037710
Guo Hua Ruan	Lan Feng Huang	08-Jun-89	China	V00039105
Guo Hua Ruan	Juan Ying Zhang	23-Sep-90	China	V00039106
Guo Hua Ruan	Qi Hong Weng	25-Nov-91	China	V00039107
Jian Hong Wu	Shi Yong Dong	15-May-85	China	V00039110
Ming Zhao Wu	Jun Li	24-Sep-91	China	V00039113
Ming Zhao Wu	Chun Chao	15-Mar-90	China	V00039114
Ming Zhao Wu	Cong Ying Zheng	05-Mar-86	China	V00039115
Young Gu Hwang	Do Sung Na	20-Nov-71	South Korea	V00037157

## Appendix XI

The following is the list of sponsors that used bogus businesses to sponsor applicants for their Belize Visas

Name of Applicant	Visa Number Issued	Date	Name of Sponsor	Sponsor's Address	Business name of Sponsor	Document Used	Comments
Wen Xia Liu Yong Chang Liu Tian Xing Su Hui Juan Zhang Yong Jiang Yong Jiang Rong Wang Lu Wen Wei Ke	V00033804 V00033803 V00033802 V00033801 V00040243 V00037503 V00037502 V00040242	01/10/12 01/10/12 01/10/12 01/10/12 08/08/13 04/02/13 04/02/13 BLANK	Anna Zhu	Anna's Store	Fadden Ave, Independence Village, S/C	Fraudulent Certificate # 18582 with the name Anna Zhu dated 6- Nov-2010 (18582 was also used fraudulently by 818 Super Store)	Anna's Store did not exist in the Registry. Certificate # 18582 was seen for Corozal Basketball Action owned by Curtis Calbert Arnold dated 16-October- 2012
Ahmad Mhanna Bassam El Madri Bassem Ayyad Alsayed Ragheb	V00031415 V00031417 V00031460 V00035281	11/05/12 11/05/12 01/06/13 26/11/12	Bilal Abdallah Omar	1634 Spain Avenue, Belize City Belize Dist	Houston Auto Sale	Certificate of Registration #14497	Registration #14497 owned by Bilal Abdallah Omar 5-Nov-2009
ZhenHan Weng Jian Feng Weng Xun Chen Zhi Wei Lin Xiao Gou Fu En Chen	V00034649 V00034648 V00034647 V00033808 V00033807 V00033806	05/10/12 08/10/12 05/10/12 02/10/12 02/10/12 02/10/12	Bing Tang Li	Bing Tang Li 'Chang Fa" Restaurant Bar	Park St, North Corozal Town	Trade License	Bing Tang Li 'Chang Fa" Restaurant Bar was not seen in the Registry.

## Appendix XII

The following is the list of Business Certificates that were presented by sponsors as proof of their financial stability and that did not exist at the Belize Companies Registry

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Sponsor Address</b>	<b>Name of Business</b>	<b>Document Used</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Wen Xia Li Yong Chang Liu Tian Xing Su Hui Juan Zhang Liangui Zeng Rong Wang Lu Yong Jiang Wen Wei Ke	Anna Zhu	Anna's Store	Fadden Ave, Independence Village, S/C	Certificate of Registration. Fraudulent Certificate # 18582 with the name Anna Zhu dated 6-Nov-2010 (18582 was also used fraudulently by 818 Super Store)	Does not exist in Registry.
Ashaben Manoj Kuma Patel	Ashaben Manoj Kuma Patel	Perez Street Santa Elena Town	Maya Gift Shop	San Ignacio/ Santa Elena Trade License #240	Does not exist in Registry.
Feng Zhang You Meng Lan Ruan Yan Wu	Bing Tang Li	Slot Machines Park St. North Corozal Town	Slot Machines Park St. North Corozal Town	Trade Licence Corozal	Does not exist in Registry.
ZhenHan Weng Jian Feng Weng Xun Chen Zhi Wei Lin Xiao Gou Fu En Chen	Bing Tang Li	Bing Tang Li ' Chang Fa" Restaurant Bar	Park St, North Corozal Town	Trade License	Does not exist in Registry.

## Appendix XIII

The following is the list of applicants who were sponsored by sponsors with bogus certificates

Name of Applicant	Name of Sponsor	Sponsor Address	Name of Business	Document Used	Comments
Wen Xia Li Yong Chang Liu Tian Xing Su Hui Juan Zhang Liangui Zeng Rong Wang Lu Yong Jiang	Anna Zhu	Anna's Store	Fadden Ave, Independence Village, S/C	Fraudulent Certificate # 18582 with the name Anna Zhu dated 6-Nov- 2010 <b>(18582 was also used fraudulently by 818 Super Store)</b>	Certificate # 18582 was seen for Corozal Basketball Action owned by Curtis Calbert Arnold dated 16-October-2012
Sahil Salaria Kulwinder Singh Harpreet Singh Ratna Bhagwandas Mahtani	Bhagwan Kewalrama aka Bob Hotchandani		Mayfair Group of Companies Limited	Certificate of Incorporation 12592	Registration #12592 dated 11- Nov-2012 of #132 Barrack Road Directors are: Bob Hotchandi, Sunjay Hotchandi & Mohini Hotchandi
Zeng Hui Liu Wei Ping Lin Qing Peng Li Liang Liang Zheng Minen Yang Fa Deng Lu Bin Huang Xiu Bing Weng Wen Zhang Wang Shao Shu Kai Lin Qiu Shan Chen	Cai Juan Chen	Cai Juan Chen	Marlboro Shop	Liquor License 0	“Marlboro Shop” Registration #4489 owned by Wo Zhi Zhao 15- Dec-1999 and transferred to Zhu Juan Chen on 5-Sept-2005 then to Shuming Chen on 3-May-2006. It was not owned by Cai Juan Chen.

## Appendix XIV

The following is the list of applicants whose application forms did not have supporting documents attached

<b>Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Application Date</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>
Franklin Fernando Juarez Mayorga	15-Aug-81	Nicaragua	None	19-Dec-12	V00036120	828315
Mireya Rosmery Lopez De Juarez	30-Jan-12	Nicaragua	None	19-Dec-12	V00036119	828319
Teresa Cubias Cruz	15-Oct-25	Salvador	Julio Cubias	22-Oct-12	V00034683	795617
Nilda Saavedra	30-Jun-30	Cuba	None	9-Oct-12	V00034665	
Digna Abigail Sanchez	7-Feb-93	Honduras	None	3-Oct-12	V00033825	787738
Kenia Yaleni Antunez	2-Sep-89	Honduras	None	2-Oct-12	V00033824	787304
Milton Javier Herrera	26-Jun-78	El Salvador	Roman Catholic Chancery Office	30-Mar-12	V00029398	687484
Liyu Zhuang	11-Jun-82	China	No	16-Mar-12	V00029394	680066
Kongbo Wang	17-Apr-12	China	No	16-Mar-12	V00029395	680065
Martha Gladys Brown Fernandez	21-Oct-85	Honduras	Young Gu Hwang	8-Mar-12		
Hirata Kazunobu	5-Jan-39	Japan	No	8-Feb-12	V00029392	
Chen Wen Yuan	12-Jul-89	China	Wen Bin Chen	5-Mar-12	V00029387	674048
Tian bi Lai	8-Oct-78	China	No	31-Jul-12	V00032940	755306
Clementina Guzman	17-Apr-52	Honduras	No	31-Jul-12	V00032934	754937
Alberto Lopez Lopez	25-Aug-71	El Salvador	No	30-Jul-12	V00032938	754044
Zhen Yong Weng	22-Jun-78	China	Bing Tang Li	30-Jul-12	V00032937	753816

Ying Jiang	1-Aug-92	China	Bing Tang Li	30-Jul-12	V00032936	753812
Pierre Charbel	4-Jan-63	Halat, Lebanon	Naji Boutros El Ters	27-Jul-12	V00032933	753052
Jiesthan Glenda Moron Arroyo	13-May-74	Santa Cruz, Bolivia	Naji Boutros El Ters	27-Jul-12	V00032932	753051
Alex Armando de la Cruz Garcia	2-Jun-92	San Salvador	No	27-Jul-12	V00032931	752964



## Appendix XV

The following is the list of application forms found that did not have the documents from sponsors which showed relationship to applicants

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Name of Sponsor</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>
Jeong Woo Kim	13-Nov-96	Korea	Sheng Hui Lin	2-Nov-12	V00034710
Mei Ling Weng	3-Mar-91	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041325
Jia Fu Yu	16-Dec-91	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034721
Shen Xiang Lian	14-Dec-95	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034720
Lin Zheng	4-Dec-91	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034719
Jin Lin	16-Nov-88	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034718
Xing Xiang	28-Feb-90	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034717
Jing Qian Liang	6-Jan-82	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034716
Chang Shun Liu	17-Nov-89	China	Meng Tang Li	5-Nov-12	V00034715
Jishi Qiu	6-Jun-84	China	Christopher Zheng	5-Nov-12	V00034714
Jian Lai Cai	10-Dec-87	China	Cheng Run Zhen	5-Nov-12	V00034723
Reddy Naveen Palupunuri	10-Oct-84	India	Walley Joe Walkley	5-Nov-12	V00034712
Yong Huang	5-Nov-12	China	Cheng Run Zhen	5-Nov-12	V00034724

## Appendix XVI

The following is the list of application forms found that Immigration Officers did not sign and date

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Name of Sponsor	Date of Application	Visa Number
Igor Lukasheva	10-Mar-52	Kazakstan	None	20-Dec-12	V00036123
Mei Ling Weng	3-Mar-91	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041325
Katsumi Nagamori	16-Nov-46	Japan	Letter from Min of Foreign Affairs	14-Mar-12	V00029393
Kongbo Wang	17-Apr-12	China	None	16-Mar-12	V00029395
Liyu Zhuang	11-Jun-82	China	None	16-Mar-12	V00029394
Qiao Jian Zou	10-Jul-91	China	Cheng Run Zhen	7-Nov-12	V00034729
Juan Antonio Salazar	19-Feb-61	El Salvador	None	20-Nov-12	V00035263
Shu Feng Chen	30-Dec-64	China	None	29-Nov-12	V00035288
Yong Xiong Zheng	21-Nov-66	China	None	29-Nov-12	V00035289
Kota Murakami	14-Jun-82	Japan	None	29-Nov-12	V00035291
Kenia Yaleni Antunez	2-Sep-89	Honduras	None	2-Oct-12	V00033824
Jin Chen An	15-Aug-73	China	None	25-Oct-12	V00034694
Larisa Lukasheva	6-May-52	Latvia	None	20-Dec-12	V00036124
Zhong Li	13-Jun-90	China	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	3-Sep-13	V00040851
Chuande Tang	21-Sep-93	China	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	3-Sep-13	V00040852

## Appendix XVII

The following is the list of applications found that did not have Interview Questionnaires attached to them

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Name of Sponsor	Date of Application	Visa Number
Maria Victoria Quintalla Sanchez	17-Sep-87	El Salvador		11-Sep-13	V00041338
Mei Lan Jiang	6-Oct-89	China	Jian Fu Li	14-Feb-13	V00037702
Mei Ju Xiao	27-Mar-93	China	Fen Xian Guan	1-Feb-13	V00037494
Mei Hua Lin	14-Oct-90	China		7-Jun-13	V00039550
Maura Ramen Reyes	25-Nov-76	Honduras	None	15-Aug-12	V00032972
Marleny Michell Portilo Ortiz	15-Sep-00	Honduras	None	13-Jul-12	V00032294
Marlene Carollo	2-Jul-57	Cuba	Maria C. Brigido	10-May-12	V00031409
Mark Lozano Bautista	18-Nov-84	Philippines	Arturo Lizarraga	10-Apr-12	V00029417
Marina Isabel Lainez Ramos	17-Sep-87	El Salvador	None	2-Oct-12	V00033805
Marie Michesterna Desire	26-Oct-01	Haiti	Jean Michelet Desire	9-Oct-12	V00034664
Maddiely Reyna Escalona	24-Feb-82	Cuba	Danilo Orlando Chuc	19-Dec-12	V00036118
Marie Benita Senatil/ Ilerin	15-Dec-68	Haiti	Wally Phanord	18-Dec-12	V00036110
Menaka Manohar Bhagchandani	11-Dec-89	India	Hi Tesh Punjabi	14-Aug-13	V00040258
Maria Victoria Guerrero Smith	31-Oct-48	Philippines	None	2-May-12	V00031390
Maria Juana Cornejo vda de Flores	17-Feb-42	El Salvador	None	15-Aug-12	V00032971

Maria Graciela Zeledon	1-Jul-48	El Salvador	None	13-Jul-12	V00032295
Maria Bello	18-Nov-83	Bolivia		19-Apr-13	V00040208
Mari Luz Lopez Barrera	4-Aug-87	Nicaragua	Joe Silvestre Haris	2-Apr-12	V00029402
Margarita Cuadra Fedrick	10-Feb-91	Nicaragua	None	23-Jul-12	V00032312
Marco Felix	29-May-76	Haiti	Darlyne Alexander Valeus	9-Aug-12	V00032959
Marcial Companioni Suarez	9-Oct-72	Cuba		15-Mar-13	V00037774

## Appendix XVIII

The following is the list of applications for which the supporting document section was not filled in

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Name of Sponsor	Date of Application	Visa Number
Franklin Fernando Juarez Mayorga	15-Aug-81	Nicaragua	None	19-Dec-12	V00036120
Mireya Rosmery Lopez De Juarez	30-Jan-12	Nicaragua	None	19-Dec-12	V00036119
Teresa Cubias Cruz	15-Oct-25	Salvador	Julio Cubias	22-Oct-12	V00034683
Nilda Saavedra	30-Jun-30	Cuba	None	9-Oct-12	V00034665
Digna Abigail Sanchez	7-Feb-93	Honduras	None	3-Oct-12	V00033825
Kenia Yaleni Antunez	2-Sep-89	Honduras	None	2-Oct-12	V00033824
Milton Javier Herrera	26-Jun-78	El Salvador	Roman Catholic Chancery Office	30-Mar-12	V00029398
Liyu Zhuang	11-Jun-82	China	None	16-Mar-12	V00029394
Kongbo Wang	17-Apr-12	China	None	16-Mar-12	V00029395
Hirata Kazunobu	5-Jan-39	Japan	None	8-Feb-12	V00029392
Chen Wen Yuan	12-Jul-89	China	Wen Bin Chen	5-Mar-12	V00029387
Tian bi Lai	8-Oct-78	China	None	31-Jul-12	V00032940
Clementina Guzman	17-Apr-52	Honduras	None	31-Jul-12	V00032934
Alberto Lopez Lopez	25-Aug-71	El Salvador	None	30-Jul-12	V00032938

## Appendix XIX

The following is the list of applications found without supporting documents sections been completed by Immigration Officers

### BNBS

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Date of Application	Visa Number
Amauri German Liriano Rosa	30-Jan-77	Santo Domingo	26-Jun-12	V00032141
Marlene Matos Rosa	12-May-85	Santo Domingo	26-Jun-12	V00032140
Dora Orbelina Cunza Morales	10-Nov-87	La Libertad	25-Jun-12	V00032139
Loraida Perez	24-Mar-60	Cuba	24-Jun-12	V00032138
Calderon Ognis Lilian	13-Jul-62	Argentina	21-Jun-12	V00032137
Yui Chi Oda	12-May-83	Japan	21-Jun-12	V00032136
Mami Oda	10-Aug-83	Japan	21-Jun-12	V00032135
Shuich Ezawa	7-Oct-78	Japan	21-Jun-12	V00032134
Danna Sharipova	19-Jan-79	Turkmenistan	20-Jun-12	V00032133
Maria Fernanda Mulet	11-Aug-83	Argentina	18-Jun-12	V00032132
Lambert Mendez	13-Sep-86	Argentina	18-Jun-12	V00032131
Lucia Govia	22-Jan-85	Argentina	17-Jun-12	V00032130
Ahmad Hamze	1-Feb-82	Lebanon	17-Jun-12	V00032129
Santiago Ivan Semensi	8-Jun-91	Argentina	14-Jun-12	V00032127
Mauricio Javier Bertola	7-May-88	Argentina	14-Jun-12	V00032126
Yamila Estray	22-Aug-88	Argentina	14-Jun-12	V00032125
Otsuka Naomi	20-Jan-79	Japan	20-Jan-79	V00032124
Julia Romenskaya	10-Jun-80	Russia	10-Jun-12	V00032123
Roman Romenskiy	16-Jan-80	Russia	10-Jun-12	V00032122
Renato Mauricio Arana Perez	22-May-80	Argentina	8-Jun-12	V00032121
Martin Olivieri	11-May-86	Argentina	4-Jun-12	V00030282
Gabriel Andres Olivieri	18-Feb-85	Argentina	4-Jun-12	V00030281
Byoung OK Ko		Korea	2-Jun-12	V00030280
Colyn Yajaira Antunez	12-Mar-90	Honduras	1-Jun-12	V00030279
Liu Fuganti	25-Jan-88	Argentina	1-Jun-12	V00030278
Americo Luis Lamelza	21-Jun-41	Argentina	2-Jul-12	V00032145
Zulema Marta Cardosa	8-Dec-12	Argentina	2-Jul-12	V00032146
Gustavo Roberto Pagliano	27-Apr-65	Argentina	3-Jul-12	V00032147
Sergio Delmar Simeoni	29-Aug-52	Argentina	3-Jul-12	V00032148

## Appendix XX

The following is the list of applicants who were issued visas without the required security clearance

NAME OF APPLICANT	Date of Birth	PLACE OF BIRTH	DATE OF APPLICATION	VISA Number	RECEIPT NUMBER
Maria Bello	18-Nov-83	Bolivia	19-Apr-13	V00040208	920867
Sang Chan Lee	23-Jul-00	Korea	28-Mar-13	V00038518	888361
Ki Cheol Noh	27-Sep-94	Korea	16-May-13	V00039097	916927
Do Sung Na	20-Nov-71	Korea	25-Sep-13	V00041381	996213
Branko Danillo Stefano Fiorilo Drakic	10-Mar-79	Bolivia	19-Sep-13	V00041372	993112
Eduard Andres Cano	3-Nov-79	Colombia	26-Nov-12	V00035283	814196
Johanna Patricia Luna	6-Sep-78	Colombia	26-Nov-12	V00035282	814199
Jeong Woo Kim	13-Nov-96	Korea	2-Nov-12	V00034710	802617
Farzad Modiri	21-Mar-58	Iran	12-Jul-12	V00032292	744130
Mercedes Martinez de Veira	6-Nov-46	Colombia	6-Jul-12	V00032279	740983
Diego Alejandro Espinosa	9-Oct-84	Colombia	19-Apr-12	V00029437	698276
Vicky Eunice Njeri Maina	9-Feb-12	Kenya	23-May-12	V00031434	715511
Hyun Tae Shin	5-Jan-53	Korea	17-Aug-12	V00032975	764090
Paola Mercedes Escamilla Caro	7-Oct-79	Colombia	9-Aug-12	V00032954	759130
Brawko Fiorilo	1-Nov-11	Bolivia	22-Jun-12	V00032238	732623
Ki Cheol Noh	27-Sep-94	Korea	18-Jun-12	V00032227	729342
Sang Chan Lee	22-Jul-00	Korea	18-Jun-12	V00032226	729385
Maria Isabel Franco Pulido	8-Jul-64	Colombia	22-Nov-11	V00025656	613848
Sang Chan lee	23-Jul-00	Korea	12-Dec-11	V00026833	624770
Ki Jun Jeun	10-May-85	Korea	12-Dec-11	V00026832	624776

## Appendix XXI

The following is the list of applicants that were approved visas without security clearance

### BNBS

NAME OF APPLICANT	DOB	BIRTH PLACE	DATE OF APPLICATION	VISA Number	RECIPT NUMBER
Branko Danilo Fiorilo Drakic	10-Mar-79	Bolivia	15-Jun-12	V00032128	651753
Byoung OK Ko		Korea	2-Jun-12	V00030280	514383
Gilberto Fonseca	19-Jan-51	Colombia	6-Jul-12	V00032156	653392
Misaelina Fonseca	25-Aug-51	Colombia	6-Jul-12	V00032157	653392
Guchul Jung	15-Jan-80	Korea	8-Jul-12	V00032158	651191
Joung Sun Joo	27-Jul-79	Korea	8-Jul-12	V00032159	651192
Jung Tae Park	12-Oct-75	Korea	9-Jul-12	V00032160	651200
Hyun Tae Shin	5-Jan-53	Korea	13-Jul-12	V00032175	654310
Yong Kang Lee	22-Mar-74	Korea	13-Jul-12	V00032176	654311
Do Sung Na	20-Nov-71	Korea	13-Jul-12	V00032177	654312
Luis Guillermo Romero	5-Aug-85	Colombia	23-Jul-12	V00032201	699315
Han Sungil	8-Aug-88	Korea	28-Sep-12	V00033479	707275
Ju Young Kim	25-Feb-80	Korea	3-Dec-12	V00035901	834696
Hak Baz Kim	29-Apr-80	Korea	3-Dec-12	V00035902	834696
Yoon Ki Kim	11-May-10	Korea	3-Dec-12	V00035903	834696
Kun Kyu Park	2-Nov-64	Korea	4-Dec-12	V00035904	835920
Maria Margarita Quiceno	1-Nov-86	Colombia	6-Dec-12	V00035906	777740
Catalina Castro	13-Jun-85	Colombia	7-Dec-12	V00035908	777757
Choom Park	28-Feb-70	Korea	11-Dec-12	V00035914	835954
Do Sung Na	20-Nov-71	Korea	11-Dec-12	V00035915	835954
Maria Elena Mazo Loaiza	6-Nov-66	Colombia	16-Dec-12	V00035925	835987
Sergio Ivan Rivera Gonzalez	21-Oct-60	Colombia	16-Dec-12	V00035926	835987
Jieon Kim	11-Mar-89	Korea	18-Dec-12	V00035940	804952
Delma Nataly Castelblanco	19-Sep-75	Colombia	20-Dec-12	V00035942	835991
Jorge Eustacio Leiva Sanchez	9-Jun-63	Colombia	23-Dec-12	V00035948	835997



## Appendix XXII

The following is the list of applicants whose applications were not approved by the Director

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Place of Birth	Name of Sponsor	Date of Application	Visa Number
Yang Min Zhang	22-May-90	China	Jing Xiao Tan	3-Sep-13	V00040855
Guang Cheng Ye	23-Nov-91	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041326
Mireya Rosmery Lopez De Juarez	30-Jan-12	Nicaragua	None	19-Dec-12	V00036119
Franklin Fernando Juarez Mayorga	15-Aug-81	Nicaragua	None	19-Dec-12	V00036120
Sarai Gonzalez Noa	23-Aug-89	Cuba	Jerry Lanza	19-Dec-12	V00036121
Igor Lukasheva	10-Mar-52	Kazakstan	None	20-Dec-12	V00036123
Larisa Lukasheva	6-May-52	Latvia	None	20-Dec-12	V00036124
Zhong Li	13-Jun-90	China	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	3-Sep-13	V00040851
Chuande Tang	21-Sep-93	China	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	3-Sep-13	V00040852
Ro-Tin Yu	13-Apr-84	Taiwan	None	23-Oct-12	V00034689
Pei Ting Wu	24-May-94	China	Jing Xiao Tan	4-Sep-13	V00040856
Xia Ping Sun	9-Feb-96	China	Ivan David Zhou Zhu	4-Sep-13	V00040857
Yi Cong Zhen	17-Mar-93	China	Jian Qiao Zhen	4-Sep-13	V00040858
Wen Hui Li	28-Aug-84	China	Jin Lan Zhen	4-Sep-13	V00040860
Chong Mao Zhao	4-May-94	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041321
Xin Gui Zheng	10-Nov-90	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041322
Qing Feng Xu	16-Dec-89	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041323
An Ling Chen	2-May-95	China	Dong Sheng Zheng	4-Sep-13	V00041324
Qin Dai Zheng	16-Sep-76	China	Jing Xiao Tan	3-Sep-13	V00040853
Juan Antonio Salazar	19-Feb-61	El Salvador	None	20-Nov-12	V00035263

### Appedix XXIII

The following is the list of applications that were not signed by the Port Commander or Shift Supervisors

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>
Julia Romenskaya	10-Jun-80	Russia	10-Jun-12	V00032123
Anna Gibadulina	8-Aug-88	Ussr	14-May-13	V00039003
Maria Fernanda Mulet	11-Aug-83	Argentina	18-Jun-12	V00032132
Yesica Yamileth Guillen	25-Feb-91	Honduras	8-Jul-13	V00039637
Olga Robles	15-Jun-73	Dominican	8-Jul-13	V00039636
Quan Zhou	18-May-87	China	1-Jul-13	V00039633
Yao Luo	24-Aug-89	China	1-Jul-13	V00039632
Zhiqi Wu	1-Mar-91	China	1-Jul-13	V00039631
Miyuki Inamochi	5-Jan-75	Japan	23-May-13	V00039020
Dover Victor Portillo	9-Jan-76	Peru	23-May-13	V00039019
Milagros Salas	25-Feb-80	Peru	23-May-13	V00039018
Natalia Orlova	30-Aug-76	Russia	21-May-13	V00039014
Carmen Patricia Antunez Gross	16-Aug-78	Honduras	19-May-13	V00039012
Takeshi Mikami	25-Aug-80	Japan	9-Jul-13	V00039639
Ayako Oka	5-Feb-82	Japan	14-May-13	V00039004
Sayam Watwani	29-Sep-64	India	11-Jul-13	V00039644
Bastant Arjundas Budhrani	18-Jul-78	India	12-May-13	V00039002

## Appendix XXIV

The following is the list of applicants whose native documents were translated and certified by some Justices of the Peace as well as those that were found translated and was uncertified

Name of Applicant	Date of Birth	Birth Place	Name of Sponsor	Date of Application	Visa Number	Justice of the Peace
Schiler Paul	15.04.86	Haiti	Jean Smith Choune	06.09.11	420/BMP/11	Juliana Arana
Wadson Louis	07.04.87	Haiti	none	18.11.11	V00025653	Juliana Arana
Plaisir Manrckently	17.08.91	Haiti	Odner Estiverine	08.11.11	V00025637	Martin Cal
Estiverne Magalie	08.11.11	Haiti	Odner Estiverine	08.11.11	V00025638	Martin Cal
Roberson Orelie	02.01.85	Haiti	Renel Fenelon	24.01.12	V00026879	Juliana Arana
Franky Lubin	30.11.81	Haiti	Frantz Guito Lubin	11.01.12	V00026872	Juliana Arana
Fritzson Lincy	15.12.89	Haiti	Obonel Louis	03.01.12	none	Juliana Arana
Sendro Exume	02.06.92	Haiti	Obonel Louis	03.01.12	V00026852	Juliana Arana
Paul Amazan	12.03.86	Haiti	Carleb Raphael Mesariecc	16.02.12	V00029373	Gecko Graphics

## Appendix XXV

The following is the list of twenty one applicants who were issued visas and their application forms were not accounted for in the BWBS visa register

<b>Name as on Visa Returns</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Country of Birth</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>
Amaya Hernandez	11/Sep/92	HONDURAS	V00032684	10/Jul/12	518317
Azucena Castillo	5/Nov/83	HONDURAS	V00032685	10/Jul/12	518318
Mercedes Martinez	26/Oct/55	HONDURAS	V00032686	10/Jul/12	518319
Sho Kubota	21/Dec/83	JAPAN	V00032687	11/Jul/12	518334
Juan Cerritos	20/Jun/81	SALVADOR	V00032689	12/Jul/12	518348
Aristides Gutierrez	18/Aug/71	SALVADOR	V00032690	12/Jul/12	518363
Salvador Guillen. Visa Register has his name for visa V00031624	10/May/59	EL SALVADOR	V00031625	2/Jun/12	612068
Joaquin Eusebio Christie Newberry	1/Aug/88	ARGENTINA	V00031633	4/Jun/12	612088
Ana Carolina Iden Medina	7/Jun/59	NICARAGUA	V00031644	11/Jun/12	613446
Magdalena Morelo Lanza	4/Apr/84	ARGENTINA	V00031651	14/Jun/12	515754
Rodrigo Ariel Alzuarena	14/Jun/12	ARGENTINA	V00031650	14/Jun/12	515753
Jose Ricardo Lemus Godoy	19/May/56	EL SALVADOR	V00031652	15/Jun/12	515758
Amanda	6/Jun/84	EL SALVADOR	V00031676	25/Jun/12	516156
Leonardo Garcia Castro	14/Mar/60	EL SALVADOR	V00039301	17/Jun/13	921755
Luis Factor Munoz Mora	4/Jul/82	NICARAGUA	V00039302	19/Jun/13	922316
Miguel Angel Melendez Artiga	23/May/78	EL SALVADOR	V00039311	28/Jun/13	922740
Maritza Amaya	11/Sep/92	HONDURAS	V00039956	23/Jul/13	945124
Neil Salvador Rodriguez	6/Apr/99	NICARAGUA	V00039967	28/Jul/13	944976

<b>Name as on Visa Returns</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Country of Birth</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Receipt Number</b>
Sindy Donila Camargo Castro	19/Jul/93	HONDURAS	V00039970	30/Jul/13	945179
Valerie Alexandra Montano	7/Mar/11	EL SALVADOR	V00041302	26/Sep/13	1009861
Sandra Lissette Mata	26/Sep/13	EL SALVADOR	V00041301	26/Sep/13	1009860

## Appendix XXVI

The following is the list of application forms found at the PGIA which did not have the Director's letters of approval for courtesy visas issued to the individuals

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>
Mauricio Ernesto Zaballa Romero	22-Jan-73	Venezuela	24-Jun-12	V00031764
Lorena Solorzano Salazar	15-May-75	Ecuador	01-Mar-13	V00034140
Mauricio Ernesto Zaballo romero	22-Jan-73	Venezuela	06-Mar-13	V00036919
Kotaro Kawashima	20-Dec-81	Japan	10-Mar-13	V00036924
Susana Patricia Ponce Galarza	06-Nov-81	Ecuador	12-Mar-13	V00036929
Ruth Liliana Alarcon Alzate	11-Jan-71	Colombia	12-Mar-13	V00036930
Francisco Vinicio Ayala Salas	25-Aug-59	Ecuador	12-Mar-13	V00036931
Frances Aluoma Odogwu	09-Mar-86	Nigeria	12-Mar-13	V00036933
Claudia Patricia	17-Aug-69	Colombia	19-Mar-13	V00036940
Sergio David Zuluaga Martinez	07-Jan-83	Colombia	19-Mar-13	V00036941
Maria Claudia Valdivieso Beltran	03-Dec-73	Colombia	19-Mar-13	V00036942
Marcela Yepes Rendon	21-Nov-81	Colombia	20-Mar-13	V00036943
Andres Felipe Vengoechea Ricardo	09-Jul-83	Colombia	20-Mar-13	V00036944
William Perez Cotrino	16-May-83	Colombia	20-Mar-13	V00036945
Juan Sebastian Gomez Velez	15-Dec-79	Colombia	20-Mar-13	V00036946
Vania Andrea Garcia Hinojosa	05-Feb-87	Bolivia	03-May-13	V00036997
Ivan javier Balbuena paez	28-Apr-85	Colombia	06-May-13	V00037000
Sergio David Zuluaga	07-Jan-83	Colombia	12-May-13	V00037006
William Perez Cotrino	16-May-83	Colombia	12-May-13	V00037007
Cabezas Jose Gerardo	05-Oct-67	Salvador	21-May-13	V00037025

Antoniio Jose Garcia Capote	31-Mar-62	Cuba	27-May-13	V00037034
Norbert Schneider Goldszmidt	10-Dec-69	Peru	03-Jul-13	V00037069
Thi Thoai nghi Nguyen	21-Oct-84	Vietnam	04-Jul-13	V00037072
Ayaka Minoura	22-Jun-87	Japan	17-Jul-13	V00037075
Claire Amayo Bassey	02-Mar-93	Ukraine	07-Jul-13	V00037079
Rainier Palino Escalada	04-Jan-75	Phillippines	08-Jul-13	V00037080
Israel Olusola Ojo	28-Feb-58	Nigeria	14-Jul-13	V00037090
Benoit Sarr	23-Apr-60	Senegal	14-Jul-13	V00037097
Zineb Benchakroun	14-Mar-90	Morocco	14-Jul-13	V00037098
Meenal Nalwaya	11-May-85	India	14-Jul-13	V00037099
Any Babayan Aghan	24-May-83	Iran	14-Jul-13	V00037100
Yun Chen	08-Apr-91	China	14-Jul-13	V00037101

<b>Name of Applicant</b>	<b>Date of Birth</b>	<b>Place of Birth</b>	<b>Date of Application</b>	<b>Visa Number</b>
Kasaka Joseph Kamwenyi	14-Sep-76	Congo	15-Jul-13	V00037102
Hazin Edwige Botoni	14-Nov-65	Coted'ivoire	15-Jul-13	V00037104
Phan Nguen Huong Thuy	03-Aug-62	Vietnam	15-Jul-13	V00037108
Seleshi Berele Awalachew	08-Feb-65	Ethiopia	15-Jul-13	V00037110
Gabriel Andres Bernal	14-Dec-83	Colombia	23-Jul-13	V00040010
Carlos Fernando Pomareda Benel	23-Apr-47	Peru	24-Jul-13	V00040012
Ruth Gullermina Sviercovich Dobronski	25-Jun-66	Ecuador	01-Aug-13	V00040024
Ivan Patricio Yerovi Herbozo	02-May-63	Ecuador	01-Aug-13	V00040025
Camilia Nicole Yerovi Sviercovich	28-Sep-95	Ecuador	01-Aug-13	V00040026
Sergio Antonio Selaya Elio	07-Feb-76	Bolivia	06-Aug-13	V00040038
Pierre Somse	23-Jun-57	Geneva	04-Sep-13	V00040087
Winifred Ogochukwu kwentua Aboderin	18-Apr-80	Nigeria	15-Sep-13	V00040099
Amani Omer	14-Dec-86	Sudan	15-Sep-13	V00040102
Maisoon Elbukhari Ibrahim	07-Aug-77	Sudan	15-Sep-13	V00040103
Mohamed Mohamed Salim	24-Jul-08	Sudan	15-Sep-13	V00040104
Eman Abu Abdullah Elbukhari Ibra Him Hohamed	02-Jan-91	Sudan	15-Sep-13	V00040105
Segundo Rafael Andrango Bonilla	07-Aug-50	Ecuador	16-Sep-13	V00040106



## Appendix XXVII

The following is the list of visa stubs that were not filled out by Immigration officers who had issued those visas

### BNBS

Visa #	Name	Passport#	Nationality	Date	RCR#	Reference#
V00028059	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00028101	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00028102	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00030235	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00030260	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00030265	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00030266	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00034569	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
V00034620	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

## Appendix XXVIII

The following is the list of individuals whose passport numbers were missing on the visa stubs found at the BMPS and BWBS

Name	Passport Number	Nationality	Visa Foil Number	Date Issued
Cindi Arely Pena	A02447688	Salvadoran	V00033827	3/10/12
Humberto Maldonado	C967268	Honduran	V00036096	17/12/12
Lilia Yigit	5025636 51N5025636	Russian	V00036107	17/12/12
Francisco Sobalvaro	C1070734	Nicaraguan	V00031412	11/5/12
Zhen Peng Wu	E01162908	Chinese	V00040291	20/8/13
Rita Fiallos	E214447	Honduran	V00040294	20/8/13

## Appendix XXIX

The following is the list of visa sticker numbers issued to individuals that were recorded as issued to other individuals.

Name	Visa number on Return	Visa number on Stub	Date
Azucena Castillo	V00025524	V00025525	11-Oct-11
Maria Rivera	V00025525	V00025524	11-Oct-11
Luis Enamorado Sorrano	V00026637	V00026636	14-Dec-11
Young Yoo	V00026636	V00026637	14-Dec-11
Rosa Halford	V00026660	V00026661	19-Dec-11
Mchael Ironi	V00026661	V00026662	19-Dec-11
Barbell West	V00026662	V00026663	19-Dec-11
Rachel Sanchez	V00026663	V00026660	19-Dec-11
Oren Moshe Canetti	V00025445	V00025446	3-Oct-11
Rahmani Eyal	V00025446	V00025445	2-Oct-11
Angela Moreno	V00028735		15-Jan-12
Sabrina Abran	V00028736	V00028735	15-Jan-12
Cassius Rebelah	V00028737	V00028736	15-Jan-12
Suzitte Aragon	V00028738	V00028737	15-Jan-12
Javier Iglesias	V00028954	V00028955	11-Feb-12

## Appendix XXX

The following is the list of names recorded on monthly returns that did not agree with what was recorded on the visa stubs

<b>Name on Visa Section List /Application Form</b>	<b>Name on Visa Foil Returns (File)</b>	<b>Nationality</b>	<b>Passport number</b>	<b>Visa Foil Number</b>	<b>Issue Date</b>
Wen Cheng Lin	Wen Chang Lin	Chinese	G1515746 G51574623	V00033775	18/9/12
Rafael Antonio Suria Menjivar	Rafael Antonio Surion	Salvadoran	A03933065 A0393065	V00033792	24/9/12
Emilio Abraham Pleitez	Emilio Pleitez	Salvadoran	M00823871	V00033733	4/9/12
Shu Jun Ruan	Sho Jun Ruan	Chinese	G30505418	V00035244	9/11/12
Anagaragtuya Erdenebayar	Anganagfuya Esdenebeyar	Mongolian	E0727042	V00035247	13/11/12
Celia Sarahi Quezada Rapalo	Celia Quezada	Honduran	C713312	V00035249	13/11/12
Malarvichi Viswanathan	Malarvizhi Viswanathan	Indian	H5796649	V00035264	20/11/12
Mukaila A Owonde.	Mukaila Adeyinka Owoade	Nigerian	A01958730	V00033828	4/10/12
Hui Juan Zou	Hui Xin Zou	Chinese	G30391737	V00034646	5/10/12
Qiaoer Li	Qiao Li	Chinese	G61648936	V00034651	5/10/12
Yonese Desiree	Malbranche Desire	Haitian	PP2742995 PP2742992	V00034662	9/10/12
Lrvi Anaim Mejia	Leiva Amin Mejia	Honduran	E026846	V00034682	19/10/12

## Appendix XXXI

The following is the list of wrong passport numbers recorded on monthly visa reports/returns

### BMPS

Name	Passport Number on Visa Stubs	Passport Number on Visa Foil Returns	Visa Foil Number	Issue Date
Wen Chang Lin	G51574623	G1515746	V00033775	18/9/12
Rafael Antonio Surion	A03981065	A0393065	V00033792	24/9/12
Wilber Montano	A04774616	A047616	V00033795	25/9/12
Bin Bin Liu	E01482785	F01482785	V00033024	3/9/12
Jean Emmanuel	CY2781312	CY2781313	V00033028	4/9/12
Zhi Zhou	G31833998	G31833998	V00033748	5/9/12
Maria.E Martinez	004174303	004174303	V00033764	13/9/12
Edwin Leon	C931418	C951418	V00033766	14/9/12
Solomon Jean	PP2752016	PP2752016	V00033730	4/9/12
Abraham Pleitez	A50029012	A50029012	V00033731	4/9/12
Da Rong Huang	G4351483	G4355148	V00035258	16/11/12
Jie Lin	G28770022	G28770022	V00033809	2/10/11
SuXian Liu	G368350	G36868350	V00033816	2/10/12
Zhong Lin	G50573448	G5057348	V00034655	5/10/12

## Appendix XXXII

The following is the list of incorrect receipt numbers written on the Monthly Returns

			<b>APPLICATION FORM</b>	<b>VISA SECTION LIST</b>	<b>VISA FOIL RETURNS</b>
<b>Issue Date</b>	<b>Visa Foil Number</b>	<b>Names</b>	<b>Receipt Number on Application Form</b>	<b>Receipt Number on Visa Section list</b>	<b>Receipt Number on Visa Foil Returns</b>
5/9/12	V00033739	Xin Hua Lin	773815	773818	773815
5/9/12	V00033741	Xing Zhen Lin	773821	773821	773818
16/11/12	V00035260	Fuye Xiao	810228	810226	810228
20/1/12	V00035261	Jose Alvarado	810545	810542	810545
3/10/12	V00033825	Digna Abigail Sanchez	787738	787738	787739
3/10/12	V00033826	Ariana Rosibel Romero	787775	787775	787738
21/9/80	V00034649	Zhen Han Weng	788858	788858	788950
5/10/12	V00034650	Heinar Maravilla	788950	788950	788858
11/10/12	V00034666	Ji Wang	791761	791761	790371
11/10/12	V00034667	Run Ye Li	791772	791767	791772
16/10/12	V00034673	Maria E. Garcia	792791	792791	795791
17/10/12	V00034678	Maria J.C Orellano	793721	793723	793355
18/10/12	V00034680	Pierre Antoine Moise	794051	794051	794050
23/10/12	V00034689	Ro Tin Yu	796606	796600	796606
5/11/12	V00034714	Jishi Qiu	803223	803223	803224
7/12/12	V00035338	Jing Jing Zheng	821430	821430	821480
7/12/12	V00035340	Meng Lu	821428	821428	821482
11/12/12	V00036073	Chao Gin Lin	823202	823205	823202
11/12/12	V00036076	Candida Yasmin Chacon	82370	823270	822370
28/12/12	V00036134	Alberto Rosales	832168	832991	832168
4/5/12	V00031394	Rodolfo Orteiz Salazar	706396	706396	705396

### Appendix XXXIII

The following is the list of wrong fees found recorded on the monthly returns from that on the Visa stubs

Name	Nationality	Passport Number	Visa Foil Number	Issue Date	Receipt Number on Visa Section application Form	Amount	Receipt Number on Visa Foil Returns (File)	Amount
Malarvichi Viswanathan	Indian	H5796649	V00035264	20/11/12	810944	\$200.00	810944	\$500.00
Shu Feng Chen	Chinese	G51513269	V00035288	29/11/12	816142	\$100.00	816142	\$2000.00
Xiao Dong Li	Chinese	G47390434	V00036061	10/12/12	None	\$0.00	822043	\$2000.00
Ying Li	Chinese	G2674499	V00036062	10/12/12	None	\$0.00	822051	\$2000.00
Cesar Euceda Moreno	Honduran	E079183	V00036075	11/12/12	823236	\$200.00	823236	\$100.00
Gerardo Sosa Lopez	Honduran	C680475	V00036085	13/12/12	824214	\$200.00	824214	\$100.00
Maldonado Humberto	Honduran	C967268	V00036095	17/12/12	826280	\$200.00	826280	\$100.00
Sarai Gonzalez Noa	Cuban	B637027	V00036121	19/12/12	828383	\$200.00	828383	\$100.00
Marlene Carollo	Cuban	H103127	V00031409	9/5/12	709466	\$200.00	709466	\$100.00
Radhakrishna Surapaneni	Indian	J5486571	V00031433	22/5/12	715094	\$500.00	715094	\$100.00
Ming Qiang Guan	Chinese	G25667442	V00031443	28/5/12	717988	\$2000.00	717988	\$100.00
Jia Rong Zhu	Chinese	G54091081	V00031444	28/5/12	717985	\$2000.00	717985	\$100.00
Jin Ping Zhang	Chinese	G47595762	V00031445	28/5/12	717983	\$2000.00	717983	\$100.00

Name	Nationality	Passport Number	Visa Foil Number	Issue Date	Receipt Number on Visa Section application Form	Amount	Receipt Number on Visa Foil Returns (File)	Amount
Hasu Kishandas Wadhwani	Indian	G1865226	V00031482	12/6/12	726589	\$500.00	726589	\$100.00
Jian Ping Rong Note of Validity of Visa (6mths & 1yr)	Chinese	PE0016280	V00036667	10/1/13	839022	\$2000.00	839022	\$2000.00
Ziguang Liu	Chinese	G55788308	V00037554	11/2/13	856634	\$2000.00	856654	\$500.00
Wei Pan	Chinese	G22029077	V00040271	16/8/13	973288	\$100.00	973288	\$2000.00
You Cheng Wang (Visa Stub- RCR# 973281; amount \$100.00)	Chinese	E00321138	V00040273	16/8/13	973281	\$2000.00	973281	\$2000.00
Jyoti ( Visa Stub has both RCR#; \$500.00)	Indian	L1684228	V00040288	19/8/13	974440975189	\$500.00	974440	\$200.00
Nanak Chand Visa Stub Has both RCR#, \$500.00)	Indian	L1682701	V00040289	19/8/13	974442/975187	\$500.00	975187	\$200.00





**VISA REQUEST MADE BY THE DIRECTOR OF  
IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY  
(Visa Section 1.1)**



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## VISA

### *SECTION I (1)*

Acronyms.....	page i
Executive Summary.....	page iii
Audit Mandate .....	page 1
Background/Reason for Audit.....	page 1
Audit Objectives.....	page 1
What we examined.....	page 1
What we found.....	page 2

### **Appendices**



## VISA REQUEST MADE BY THE DIRECTOR OF IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY

---

The following comments, suggestions and recommendations arise as a result of an Audit investigation in the request and issuance of Belize Visas by the Director of Immigration and Nationality covering the period 1st January 2012 to 30th September 2013.

### **Audit Mandate**

2. In accordance with *Section 14* of the Finance and Audit Act 2005 which states “ If at any time it appears to the Auditor General that any fraud, or serious loss or serious irregularity has occurred in the receipt, custody or expenditure of public moneys or in the receipt, custody, issue, sale, transfer or delivery of any stamps, securities, stores or other Government property of any kind whatsoever, or in the accounting for the same, he shall immediately bring the matter to the notice of the Minister of Finance”.

### **Background/Reason for audit**

The Office of the Auditor General decided to conduct an audit investigation after receiving a memorandum from the Immigration and Nationality Department on October 09 2013, which reported a case of some missing visas. Based on the memorandum received the Office decided to undertake a Compliance Audit of the request and issuance of visa stickers by the Director of Immigration and Nationality.

### **Audit Objectives**

3. To determine whether:

Request for Belize Visa Foils were in accordance with applicable laws as well as policies and procedures of the Immigration and Nationality Department.

### **What we examined:**

4. In order to reach our objective we examined files for:

- Visas ordered and received from 3M Company
- Request and Issue of Blank Passports and Meryl Sheets
- Files maintained by the Accounts section

- 3M Company's Security Market Centre manual
- Visa Ledgers
- Mission files
- We also interviewed the Finance Officer, Miss Teresita Castellanos
- Unused and used visas

## **What we found:**

### **The Director of Immigration and Nationality ordered and purchased all Belize Visa Foils/Stickers from 3M Company**

#### *Criteria*

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should order all visa stickers from 3M*

5. We saw that the Director of Immigration and Nationality Services (INS) purchased visas from 3M Company.

### **25,000 Visas were destroyed by the Director**

#### **Visa Order**

6. We saw a Ministry of Defence and Immigration email dated 7<sup>th</sup> January 2011 addressed to Mr. Steven Grant of 3M Company, Ms. Diane Locke of Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Director, Immigration. The email was for a 3M Quotation # 3MCAR-10012 (attached) which was signed by the Chief Executive Officer Mr. Allen Whyllie in the Ministry of Defence and Immigration. That quotation was for 25,000 Belize Visa Foils costing US \$ 25,000.00 which was to be paid by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

The only documented evidence found to show confirmation of visa order was the 3M Quotation which was used as the Customer Purchase Order and which was also used as invoice for payment.

## Visa Payment

7. We saw a 3M Invoice # NE15770 dated 24<sup>th</sup> May 2011 for US \$ 26,852.65 which included shipping for US \$1,852.65 for the payment of the 25,000 Belize Visa Stickers.

## Received Visas

8. We noted that on 10<sup>th</sup> June 2011, 25,000 visa stickers were received, by the Finance Officer of the Immigration and Nationality, from the Belize Customs PGIA.

From the email we saw, Director Miss Ruth Meighan, knew that those 25,000 visas stickers were spoilt before it arrived in Belize. Those stickers did not meet the quality assurance requirements by the Director due to the fact that some features were not correct. No evidence was found that the Director had requested 3M Company to replace those spoilt visa stickers with the quality and standards required.

Spoilt visa stickers with serial numbers that were received and destroyed by the Director are listed at **Table A** below.

## Table A

The following is the list of visa sticker series that were received spoilt and destroyed by the Director

Stock Number: GR200137499

Visas serial numbers	Total
V00000001 TO V00003000	3,000
V00003001 TO V00006000	3,000
V00006001 TO V00009000	3,000
V00009001 TO V00012000	3,000
V00012001 TO V00015000	3,000
V00015001 TO V00018000	3,000



V00018001 TO V00021000	3,000
V00021001 TO V00024000	3,000
V00024001 TO V00025000	1,000
<b>Total</b>	<b>25,000</b>

We saw a 3M Destruction or Disposal of Product(S) Confirmation letter dated 23 June 2011 addressed to the Immigration and Nationality Services. It stated 3M Invoice Number NE 15770 and Customer Purchase Order Number 3MCAR-10012.

The letter was to: "Confirm the product (Belize Visa Foils) has been properly disposed of or destroyed on behalf of 3M Company. Disposal/destruction was completed in compliance with all applicable laws within our country".

That letter was signed and stamped on 5 July 2011 by the Director of Immigration and Nationality, Miss Ruth Meighan. The Director made a notation on the destruction memo to the Finance Officer to: "Please make arrangement for the 25,000 visa foils to be destroyed on Friday 8 July 2011." The Finance Officer on 6 July 2011 acknowledged the Director's notation and signed it.

The destruction of those 25,000 visa stickers was conducted on the 15<sup>th</sup> July 2011 as seen on the Director's Destruction Certificate dated 10<sup>th</sup> June 2011. It was conducted and witnessed by Finance Officer, Miss Teresita Castellanos, Immigration Officer III, Mr. Leandro Quischan and Justice of the Peace, Mr. Florentino Bazia.

We could not ascertain the following:

- i. Why 25,000 spoilt visas were not recorded in the Visa Ledger since the Finance Officer had received and was accountable regardless of the eventual destruction.
- ii. Why the Director sent on 5<sup>th</sup> July 2011, the confirmation that the 25,000 visa stickers had been destroyed when in fact it was not until the 15<sup>th</sup> July that those stickers were supposedly destroyed.
- iii. Why no request was made to the Auditor General to witness the destruction of those spoilt visa stickers.

9. We observed that the Director of Immigration and Nationality Services received another 25,000 Belize Visa Stickers from 3M Company during the period investigated. Those 25,000 visas stickers were accounted for in the Finance Officer's Visa Register and had serial numbering V00025001 to V00050000.

We noted that the implementation of the new visa stickers took over six months due to the spoilt stickers.

**Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

- i. An investigation is carried out to ascertain whether the Government of Belize suffered a lost by paying for those visas that were spoilt by 3M Company.
- ii. The Auditor is informed of all future destructions of documents done by the INS.

**No evidence that the Finance Officer checked visa stickers ordered and received from the supplier**

***Criteria***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should check the visas received from the supplier to ensure that quantities ordered was received*

10. We found no evidence that the Finance Officer checked the visas stickers received from 3M Company. We expected to see evidence that the Finance Officer verified visas received.

**Recommendation:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that the Finance Officer checks all visa stickers ordered and received and that she makes such indication on the invoice submitted by the supplier.

**The Director of Immigration and Nationality Services did not keep and maintained a Visa Stock Register of all visa foils ordered and received from 3M Company**

***Criteria***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should maintain a stock register of all visas received from supplier and those issued to supervisor of visa section, officers in charge at port of entry, foreign embassies and consuls*

11. The Finance Officer did not maintain a Visa stock register for visa stickers ordered and received from 3M Company.

We saw a Visa Ledger which showed all the visa stickers that were issued to the Supervisor of Visa Section in Belmopan, Port Commanders at all Port of entries, Missions and Consuls of Belize.

**3355 unused visa stickers were found on hand as at 9<sup>th</sup> May 2014**

12. We carried out a survey of those visa stickers on hand at 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2014 and found a total of 3355 unused visa stickers that were stored in a vault for safe keeping until the embassies, missions and the different stations requested visa stickers for issuance.

FO, Ms. Castellanos refused to grant the Team access to the vault where the visa stickers were stored. Instead, she brought out the stock on hand and placed it on her desk and on the floor around her desk. It was not until we demanded access that she picked up the phone and called the Acting Director, Ms. Marin and was given permission for us to check the vault.

We want to caution the Immigration and Nationality Department including the Director, FO, Miss Castellanos, and any other subsequent FO, to the powers of the Auditor General which is outlined at section 13(1c) and 13(3) of the Finance and Audit (Reform) Act 2005 revised Edition, Number 12 of 2005

Section 13. (1) In the exercise of his duties under this Act, the Auditor General may-

(c) Without payment of any fee, cause a search to be made in and extracts to be taken from any book, document, or record in any public office.

Section 3. In the exercise of his duties under this Act, the Auditor General shall not be subject to the direction or control of any other person or authority.

#### **400 Visa stickers returned for safekeeping were not accounted for during our stock count**

13. A total of Four Hundred (400) visa stickers that had been returned to INS for safekeeping were not found on hand during our visa stock count on 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2014. Those visa stickers' serial numbers are listed at **Table B** below.

#### **Table B**

The following is the list of 400 visa stickers that were returned to INS for safekeeping and which were not found on hand as at the time of our visa stock count

<b>Visa Sticker Numbers</b>	<b>Amount Issued</b>	<b>Date Issued</b>	<b>Issued to</b>
V00026965 – V00027224	260	23/11/11	United Kingdom, MFA (Ministry of Foreign Affairs)
V00027225 – V00027284	60	2/12/11	Atlanta Georgia, MFA
V00027285 – V00027344	60	2/12/11	Germany
V00027345 – V00027404	60	2/12/11	MFA Later reissued
V00027405 – V00027424	20	2/12/11	Israel

#### **460 Visa stickers returned for safekeeping were not added back to stock and adjustment made in the Visa Ledger by the Finance Officer (FO) INS**

14. We noted no emphasis was placed by the FO on documenting visa stickers that had been returned for safekeeping. We saw only the notation “returned for safekeeping” with no date inserted to indicate when the stickers had been returned to the INS. No reason/s was stated as to why those visas had been returned for safekeeping.

We observed that the FO did not make any adjustment in the Visa Ledger for the 460 visa stickers returned. Four Hundred (400) of those visa stickers were not accounted for in the stock count done by us on 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2014.

We found a notation in the Visa Ledger which stated “reissued to OIC, Belize city on 3/3/14”. The notation was in respect of 60 visas (series V00027345 – V00027404) that had been returned and was reissued on 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2014 to OIC, Belize City. At **Table C** below is a list of visa stickers that had returned to the Finance Officer, INS for safe keeping.

**Table C**

The following is the list of visas that were returned for safekeeping to the Finance Officer INS

Date	Visa Sticker Numbers	Embassy of Belize	Amount of Visa stickers Issued	Reissued
23/11/11	V00026965 – V00027224	United Kingdom, MFA (Ministry of Foreign Affairs)	260	N/A
2/12/11	V00027225 – V00027284	Atlanta Georgia, MFA	60	N/A
2/12/11	V00027285 – V00027344	Germany	60	N/A
2/12/11	V00027345 – V00027404	MFA	60	OC Belize City
2/12/11	V00027405 – V00027424	Israel	20	N/A

We could not ascertain why those embassies listed in Table X returned visa stickers for safekeeping .

### **Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

- i. The Finance Officer maintains a Visa Stock Control Register give accountability of all visas ordered and received from 3M.
- ii. The Finance Officer is aware of section 13 (1c) and (3) of the Finance and Audit (Reform) Act 2005
- iii. An investigation is conducted as to the whereabouts of the 400 visa stickers which had been returned for safekeeping and were not accounted for during our stock count.

- iv. When stocks are returned for safekeeping those stocks are added back to Finance Officer's main stock and adjustment made in the Visa Ledger to show such addition.

**The Finance Officer stored the main stock of Visas in a cabinet**

***Criteria***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should keep her stock of visas in a safe/vault for safe keeping*

16. We found that the main stock of visas was kept in a cabinet which was stored in a vault adjacent to the Finance Officer's office in Belmopan.

**No documented evidence that the Director carried out regular checks on the main stock of visa stickers held by the Finance Officer**

***Criteria***

*Regular checks should be carried out on the main stock of visas and those issued to the Supervisor of Visa section, Officers in Charge/ Port Commanders at Port of Entry, Foreign Embassies and Consuls of Belize.*

17. We saw no documented evidence of regular checks made by the Director on the main stock of visa stickers held by the Finance Officer. Those checks are necessary as it prevents and minimizes errors and fraud.

**No documented evidence that the Finance Officer carried out regular checks on the stock of visa stickers held by the Visa section and Port Commanders at Port of Entries Foreign Embassies and Consuls of Belize**

18. We saw no documented evidence where the Finance Officer carried out regular checks on the Port Commanders at Ports of entry and at the Foreign Embassies and Consuls of Belize.

**Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration should ensure that:

- i. Regular checks are carried out on the main stock held by the Finance Office.
- ii. The Finance Officer carry out regular checks on the stock of visa stickers issued to Port Commanders and Foreign Embassies and Consuls

**2 instances of the same visa sticker numbers recorded on two Revenue Form Issue Note (RFIN) Forms**

19. We found two instances where the same visa sticker numbers were recorded on two RFIN as detailed below:

- I. Sixty (60) visa stickers with serial numbers V00026745 to V00026804 were issued to OIC Immigration Department, Stann Creek District via RFIN numbers 100446 and 100447 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2011. We noted that an error was made on RFIN # 100446 on which visa stickers' numbers V00026745 to V00026824 were recorded as 60 visas instead of 80 visas. Although The Finance Officer issued the aforementioned visa stickers on RFIN number 100447 she failed to cancel the previous RFIN # 100446 to ensure proper accountability of the visas.
- II. Fifty two (52) visa stickers with serial numbers V00040737 to V00040788 were issued to OIC Immigration Dept, San Pedro via RFIN numbers 678088 and 678222 dated 23<sup>rd</sup> August 2013 and 25<sup>th</sup> November 2013 respectively. We noted that there was no signature of the individual who had received those visa stickers on RFIN 678088. As with the case above, the FO failed to cancel RFIN number 678088.

**6 defected RFIN forms 100421 to 100426 were used to issue visa stickers**

20. We saw six defected forms in an RFIN book with serial numbers 100400 to 100450. Those six forms-serial numbers 100421 to 100426 were not in sequential order and were used for the issuance of visa stickers instead of been cancelled. The **Table D** below shows the defect noted.

**Table D**

The following is the six RFIN serial numbers that were defected and were still used to issue visa stickers to OIC Ports of Entry

Serial number on pink copy of RFIN form	Serial number on blue copy of RFIN form
100421	100426
100422	100421

100423	100422
100424	100423
100425	100424
100426	100425

It is the opinion of the Office of the Auditor General that the FO was not vigilant as those defected forms should have been detected by her.

We also noted that the FO failed to record the RFIN numbers, on which she issued visa stickers, to Port Commanders and the missions and embassies abroad.

### **Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality Services should ensure that:

- i. The FO is more vigilant in the checking of RFIN books to ensure that the white, pink and blue copies are correct.
- ii. The FO cancels a RFIN when a mistake is made before writing and a new RFIN.
- iii. A proper visa ledger is maintained with all Revenue Form Issue Note (RFIN) for accountability of all visas issued to the Port Commanders in Belize and the embassies and missions of Belize.

### **8. Visa Issuance Control Ledger**

21. We noted that only a Port Commander/Officer in Charge could have signed a visa request for visa stickers from the Finance Officer. Visa stickers were issued without implementing the necessary procedures to ensure caution was taken in the visa issuance. No emphasis was placed on the issuance of visas as we unearthed several discrepancies as listed below:

- a.) The implementation of the new visa stickers were done across the board for all Embassies, Consuls, Belize Port of entry, Visa Section and PGIA. No documented evidence was submitted as to the official date for the implementation of visa stickers. We noted that the first set of visa stickers were issued on the 15<sup>th</sup> September 2011. No RFIN serial numbers were recorded to visa stickers issued from 15<sup>th</sup> September 2011 to 4<sup>th</sup> November 2011.
- c.) The first part of the register starting from the 15<sup>th</sup> September 2011 to the 4<sup>th</sup> November 2011 did not indicate which station the visas stickers were issued to.



d.) No RFIN was found for 100 visa stickers bearing serial numbers V00025001 – V00025100 issued to Brazil on 15<sup>th</sup> September 2011. We brought that finding to the attention of the Finance Officer, who made attempts to locate the RFIN but it proved futile. As a result we considered those visa stickers missing.

e.) Three visa stickers bearing serial numbers V00028014 – V00028016 were not accounted for in the Visa Ledger. Those visa stickers were found on the 9<sup>th</sup> May 2014 when we did a visa count of visa stickers on hand. We were informed by the Finance Officer, Miss Teresita Castellanos, that those visa stickers were kept in the safe as specimen.

f.) Minister Manuel Heredia received 52 visa stickers bearing serial numbers V00033829 to V00033880 (No RFIN number indicated) dated 7 September 2012. Those visas were for the OIC, San Pedro. No authorization was found for Minister Heredia to have signed and received those 52 visas on behalf of Officer in Charge (OIC), San Pedro.

g.) The System Administrator, Mr. Rodolfo Bol Jr. received on 19<sup>th</sup> March 2012, 100 visa stickers bearing serial numbers V00030185 to V00030284 (No RFIN number stated). Those visas were issued to OIC, Belize Northern Border Station (BNBS). No authorization was found for Mr. Bol to have signed for and received those visas on behalf of OIC BNBS.

h.) Immigration Officer, Mr. Mark Michael Tench was issued 100 visa stickers on 17<sup>th</sup> February 2012 bearing serial numbers V00029473 – V00029572 (No RFIN stated). He received those visa stickers on behalf of OIC, Belize Western Border. We found no authorization for Mr. Tench to have signed and received those 100 visa stickers.

i.) No signature was seen for the individual who on 17<sup>th</sup> February 2014 received 84 visa stickers bearing serial numbers V00045173 – V00045256 on behalf of OIC, Dangriga/Independence office.

j.) The balances of visa stickers that should be on hand were recorded in pencil. We checked those balances and found many errors and made the necessary corrections with audit green pen ink and placing question marks. On the 30<sup>th</sup> May 2014, Finance Officer, Miss Teresita Castellanos, borrowed the register and when it was returned on the 12<sup>th</sup> June, 2014, all the balances in pencil had been erased and the corrected figures were recorded in pen for each sets of visas issued despite audit warnings that the register was being inspected.

k.) A total of 60 visa stickers V00025545 – V00025604 were issued (No RFIN number stated) on the 4<sup>th</sup> October 2011 without the receiving officer signing.

L.) 100 visas from V00025201 – V00025300 were found issued to an unknown station in the ledger. In the balance column, a notation in pencil was seen “El Salvador dated 20.03.12”. A check of the RFIN register revealed that those visas were issued to Dominican Republic.

m.) The RFIN numbers for all visa stickers issued were not recorded in the Visa Issuance Control Ledger. RFIN numbers are important as it shows accountability and reference for each visa issuance.

### **Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

- a.) RFIN numbers are recorded in the Visa Issuance Control Ledger for verification purposes.
- b.) The register is properly ruled to show exactly whom and which station receives new visa stickers.
- c.) An investigation is carried out to ascertain whether or not those 100 visa stickers bearing serial numbers V00025001 – V00025100 had been issued on an RFIN to Brazil and also if those stickers had been received by Brazil.
- d.) Internal checks are made to account for every visa issued to the Visa Section in the Visa Ledger.
- e.) Only Officer in Charge and Port Commanders receive new visa stickers from the Finance Officer.
- f.) Original visa stickers are not used for specimen in the future.
- g.) An investigation is carried out to account for all original visas used for specimen.
- h.) All Officers in Charge and Port Commanders signed the ledger upon receiving new visa stickers for accountability purposes.
- i.) The Finance Officer records the balance of visas that should be on hand in the ledger upon the issuance of visas.

### **8.) Specimen**

22. We found a few discrepancies outside our scope. Four visas with serial number V00044589 – V00044592 were issued to Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Labour and Local Government on 29<sup>th</sup> January 2014 for specimen.

No signature was found in the ledger to state who received those visas on behalf of the Ministry. In discussion with the Finance Officer (FO), it was revealed that she received instructions to issue those original unused visa stickers to the Ministry for an investigation. A check of the visa ledger revealed that those visas were not returned as at 30<sup>th</sup> May 2014.

We could not ascertain why those four unused visa stickers were sent to the Ministry to be used as specimen and also why the proper procedure was not followed in the receipt of those visas.

#### 8. Visa Request

23. A visa request is when Visa Section request for new visa stickers to replenish their stock. This is done by submitting a letter stating the amount of visa stickers needed to replenish stock and the exhausted visa stub series.

Despite the Director's new visa requirement memo that went into effect 1st March 2013, the Finance Officer was not reconciling the exhausted visa stubs. If these visas were reconciled, the errors or the short fall of these exhausted visas could have been detected. This shows negligence on the Finance Officer.

#### **Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

1. There is compliance with the visa requirement that went into effect on 1st March 2013.
2. The Finance Officer does reconciliation of exhausted visa stubs to give accountability of those visa stickers issued from the Immigration's Finance Office in Belmopan.

#### **Safeguarding of Unused and used Visas**

##### **Main Stock**

24. The unused visas were safeguarded in iron safe. The used visas were filed away in their respective station files. The files were kept by the Administrative Section. No emphasis was placed on the safekeeping of used visa stubs as some were considered missing.

#### **MISSIONS, EMBASSIES AND CONSULATES**

##### **1.) Visa Register:**

25. Examination of the Visa Register revealed many discrepancies as follows:

## Specimen Visa

It was noted that the Embassy of Belize in Cuba received a visa sticker to be used as specimen. The visa sticker V00028013 was issued on 14 December 2011. No evidence was found to substantiate that the Embassy of Belize in Cuba had requested and received visa sticker V00028013.

## Cancelled Visas

### **Two visa stubs for visa stickers cancelled in Cuba were not attached to the returns submitted**

Two visa stickers' serial numbers V00037901 and V00037902 were found cancelled in the Cuba File. No visa stubs were found attached to the returns to show that the visas were cancelled. No substantive evidence was found to show that those visas were cancelled. We saw no evidence that the INS Finance Officer and Ministry of Foreign Affairs had questioned the cancelled visas.

### **There were files that were not examined by Audit**

26. Further investigation is required for the files listed at **Table E** below since they were not examined by us.

#### **Table E**

The following is the list of files that were not examined by Audit

<b>File Reference Numbers</b>	<b>Name of Files</b>	<b>Missions</b>
Ret/10/02 – 2010	Visa and Passport Returns	Honduras
Ret/10/11	Visa and Passport Returns	Japan
Ret/10/10	Visa and Passport Returns	Hong Kong
Ret/10/16 IV, V – 2010	Visa and Passport Returns	Singapore
Ret/10/09	Visa and Passport Returns	USA
Ret/10/17	Visa and Passport Returns	India
Ret/10/26 II, I – 2005	Visa and Passport Returns	Consulates/Other
Ret/10/16 V, IV – 2009	Visa and Passport Returns	Singapore
Ret/10/25 III, II – 2008	Visa and Passport Returns	Santa Domingo

## Stamps

27. We noted in the Minutes of Meeting of 3<sup>rd</sup> May 2013 that a few Foreign missions/Consulates were still using stamps in 2013 even though the new visa stickers were issued from 2011. The countries identified were Honduras, Britain, Panama and Merida. It was mentioned at the

meeting that request would have been made to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs requesting that those countries desist from using those stamps.

In an interview held on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2014 with Ms. Diane Locke from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, she informed us that the Ministry was aware that only Japan and Honduras were still using the stamps instead of the visa stickers. She went on to say that in November 2011, the Missions were notified of the new implementation of the new visa stickers and that it was not until January 2012 that all missions began using the new visa stickers. In addition, Ms. Locke stated that people were being affected by use of the stamps because they were refused entry into Belize. No evidence was submitted to verify if those above mentioned countries have desisted from using the stamps instead of the visa stickers.

### **Recommendations:**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

- i. An investigation is made into the RFIN missing series.
- ii. Proper accounting is made in the register for all returned and reissued visas by making the necessary adjustments.
- iii. All missions and consulate should send a copy of all void/cancel visas to director as proof of cancel visas.
- iv. All missions are utilizing the new visa stickers instead of the stamp.
- v. The missing missions' files are located and kept for future inspection.

### **Revenue Form Issue Notes**

28. An examination of the Revenue Form Issue Notes on which Belize Visas were issued to Port Commanders by the Finance Officer revealed the following:

#### **A number of original Revenue Form Issue Notes (RFIN) were not issued to the Officers in Charge/ Port Commanders who had been issued visa stickers**

We saw a number of original Revenue Form Issue Notes that had been used by the Finance Officer Miss Teresita Castellanos, to issue visas to Port in the RFIN books. Those original forms should have been issued to the Port Commanders/Officer in Charge who had requested and received visa stickers. Those RFINs should have been used by OIC/Port Commanders to record and account for the visa sticker numbers that they had received.

**An RFIN was altered without having been cancelled and thereafter another RFIN was prepared by the Finance Officer**

We noted that the Finance Officer had prepared an RFIN # 137874 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2013 to OIC Visa Section Belmopan for one hundred (100) visa stickers V00038497 to V00038596. Thereafter, the Finance Officer crossed out the OIC Visa Section Belmopan and inserted Honorary Consul for Belize, Chicago. She also changed the visa stickers' numbers to serial numbers V00038597 to V00038636 a total of forty (40) visas without altering the amount of 100 to the forty visas without any explanation. An individual signed as Debbie M (her surname was not legible). The Finance Officer thereafter prepared another RFIN 137876 dated 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2013, to the same Honorary Consul for Belize Chicago for the forty visas as aforementioned. No one signed as having received those 40 Visas stickers.



**IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY DEPARTMENT  
APRIL 2011 TO SEPTEMBER 2013  
AUDIT INVESTIGATION**

**Other Findings**

**Section IV**





# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

## **OTHER FINDINGS**

### **SECTION IV**

Acronyms.....	page i
Executive Summary.....	page ii
Audit Mandate .....	page 1
Background/Reason for Audit.....	page 1
Audit Objectives.....	page 2
What we examined.....	page 2
What we observed/found and recommendation.....	page 2

## Acronyms

PR- Permanent Residence

INS- Immigration and Nationality Service

BECIP – Belize Economic Citizenship Investment Program

BNA – Belize Nationality Application

BMPS – Belmopan Station

BWBS – Belize Western Border Station

BNBS – Belize Northern Border Station

PGIA – Phillip Goldson International Airport

OIC – Officer in Charge

BMRPIS – Belize Machine Readable Passport Issuance System

BPIS – Belize Passport Issuance System

BMRPAIP – Belize Machine Readable Passport Application and Issuance Process

MRPS – Machine Readable Passport System

QA – Quality Assurance

FO – Finance Officer

FO Number – Financial Orders Number

USR\_FNAME – User First Name

USR\_LNAME – User Last Name

USR Step – User Step

App Step Date – Application Step Date

TEP – Temporary Employment Permits

DINS – Director of Immigration and Nationality Service

PRF – Permanent Residence File

S.I – Statutory Instrument

VSU – Vital Statistic Unit  
HQ – Headquarters  
CIDAPS – Central Intelligence Data and Analysis Processing System  
CRO – Criminal Records Office  
JICC – Joint Intelligence Coordinating Center  
CIB – Crimes Investigation Branch  
ACP – Assistant Commissioner of Police  
JP – Justice of the Peace  
HIV – Human Immunodeficiency Virus  
VDRL – Venereal Disease Research Laboratory  
DOA – Date of Arrival  
FIU – Financial Intelligence Unit  
W/Sergeant – Woman Sergeant  
ROC – Republic of China  
ID Cards – Identification Cards  
IT – Information Technology  
CITO – Central Information Technology Office  
SSB – Social Security Board  
UK – United Kingdom  
US – United States  
CITO – Central Information Technology Office  
CSME – Caribbean Single Market Economy



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. On September 30, 2013 the Office of the Auditor General received a copy of a memorandum from the Immigration and Nationality Department regarding some missing visas.
2. The Office of the Auditor General initially decided to undertake a Compliance Audit of the Department's Visa Section. However, during the preliminary phase of the Visa Audit the Immigration Department was faced with a passport scandal and on that basis the audit scope was broaden to encompass both the Passport and Nationality Sections.
3. The audit covers the period 2011 to 2013 and starts with the Visa examination progressing into the Nationality and Passport Examinations. The individual reports are lengthy due to the different findings and the manner in which they were executed. The presentation is done in sections: Visa - Section I, Nationality - Section II, Passport Section - III and Other findings – IV. **Appendices presented, for each section, reflect a small percentage of total findings because of the volume of actual findings.**

### Other Findings-Section IV

4. Blank passports ordered from 3M Company were not verified upon receipt from the supplier. Blank Passports were stored in the Central Bank of Belize's vault for safe keepings. The Immigration Department does not maintain a stock register. Therefore, Audit could not ascertain that the receipt, issuance based on request and actual balances on hand as correct since information were not properly recorded to reflect the movement of passports.
5. Regular stock verifications were not conducted. The Department has a Revenue Form Issue Note (RFIN) Register however, the Finance Officer failed to make adjustments for passports returned from Officers in charge of the Passport Section. Therefore, it was not possible to obtain a true picture of actual stock on hand.
6. Meryl Sheets were not accounted for and safeguarded. Meryl Sheet is a unique, thin, frangible security laminate designed for the highest security document application. We found Meryl Sheets in a cabinet and on the floor of the Finance Officer's Office.
7. The Department could not account for 7 Temporary (Emergency) Passports which were submitted as specimen to 3M Company.

8. The BPIS maintenance cost US\$90,000.00. We found that the System was not optimized. Audit trails were not activated, System manipulation was excessive. During our examination, we encountered many instances of breach of the BPIS. As a result, we question whether the Director of Immigration and Nationality got value for the amount of money spent on the system.

It is anticipated that the Report presented will provide the Immigration Department with pertinent information required to effect meaningful reform regarding policy formulation and implementation. It should also lend to the building of necessary controls to better effect policies, changes and procedures.

**IMMIGRATION AND NATIONALITY DEPARTMENT  
APRIL 2011 TO SEPTEMBER 2013  
AUDIT INVESTIGATION**

**Other Findings**

- BLANK PASSPORTS
- UNACCOUNTED PASSPORTS
- MERYL SHEETS

---

The following comments, suggestions and recommendations arise as a result of an Audit investigation on the acquisition of blank passports from 3M Company and distribution to Officers in Charge of Passport Section and other related documents maintained by the Immigration and Nationality Services for the period April 2011 to 30<sup>th</sup> September 2013.

**Audit Mandate**

2. In accordance with *Section 14* of the Finance and Audit Act 2005 which states “ If at any time it appears to the Auditor General that any fraud, or serious loss or serious irregularity has occurred in the receipt, custody or expenditure of public moneys or in the receipt, custody, issue, sale, transfer or delivery of any stamps, securities, stores or other Government property of any kind whatsoever, or in the accounting for the same, he shall immediately bring the matter to the notice of the Minister of Finance”.

**Background/Reason for audit**

3. The Office of the Auditor General initially decided to conduct an audit investigation after receiving a memorandum from the Immigration and Nationality Department on October 09 2013, which reported a case of some missing visas. Based on the memorandum received the Office decided to undertake a Compliance Audit of the Visa Section. The objective and scope of the audit was further developed to include Passport and Nationality Sections of the Immigration and Nationality Department.



#### 4. Audit objectives:

- 1) To determine the process the Department has in place to acquire, safe guard and distribute Passports from supplier/s.
- 2) To determine whether Passports were issued in accordance with the policies and procedures of the Immigration Act.
- 3) To determine whether there was a breach of the Passport Readable machine regarding unauthorized access and imputing of data.

#### **What we examined:**

5.

- 3M Company files maintained by the Immigration and Nationality,
- 3M Security Market Center Manual
- Meryl Sheets files
- Foreign Purchase Approval File
- Revenue Form Issue Note (RFIN) file with original RFIN and memos from former and current Officers in Charge (OIC) Passport sections, Belize and Belmopan Cities requesting blank passports
- Stock Register/ledger of blank passports (Diplomatic, Official, Ordinary and Temporary) received from Central Bank (CB) and issues made to OICs
- Misprinted, cancelled and spoilt passports and
- The Belize Passport Issuance System

#### **What we observed/found**

**There was no evidence that the Director of Immigration and Nationality checked blank passports, received from the supplier, at the Port of Entry for the period April 2011 to September 2013**

### ***Criteria***

6. *The Director of Immigration and Nationality should check blank passports received at port of entry (onsite or offsite) before lodging at the central bank for safekeeping.*

6.2 We found no evidence on file to prove that blank passports purchased from 3M Company were checked at the Port of Entry for the period April 2011 to September 2013.

**The former Director of Immigration and Nationality Ruth Meighan instructed that serial numbers of passports (stored in the Central Bank's vault) be forwarded under separate cover to the Central Bank of Belize for good accounting practice**

### ***Criteria***

7. We expected to see serial numbers recorded for all passports received and issued by the Central Bank for accountability purposes.

7.2 We searched for evidence, by way of permission granted by the Director of Immigration and Nationality, as to why passports were recorded by boxes and not by box and serial numbers. We scrutinized the Department's file PPI/13/01/2008 and saw on a minute sheet, two minutes between the Director at the time, Ruth Meighan and the then Finance Officer, Sheryl Solis. In reading the minute of 21<sup>st</sup> March 2011 from Sheryl Solis, informed the Director that the first time she was sent to pick up passport from AMERIJET at the PGIA, the first thing she had asked the director at the time was, if there were documents sent that stated the serial numbers of the passports. Also, if there was a need to check all the passports (at the time fifty thousand were expected).

7.3 She stated that only box numbers were sent for security purposes because the sending of serial numbers would breach the security of the passports. Ms. Solis stated that this had been the practice "by all previous directors."

7.4 Ms. Solis stated that when the passports arrived she ensured that all the boxes came. The passports came in wooden boxes and were sealed with metal strip all around them and the lid of the boxes were taped with the manufacture's name labeled on the tape. In addition, that the outside of the boxes were numbered e.g. 1/93 and so forth. She went on to state that the only time she had checked the contents in a box, was when it had arrived with the metal seal broken. This was due to Customs official in Miami, who needed to verify that the contents were indeed passports. That was the first time serial numbers and the amount of passports in boxes was checked.

7.5 In a 25<sup>th</sup> March 2011 minute to the FO, former Director, Ruth Meighan, stated that "the FO minute was noted. The listing of serial numbers was expected to be forwarded under secured covering and that was a form of good accounting practices. That is what she would demand. She believed that whenever a box is opened that the FO would have a listing by which she could verify what was received".

7.6 We also saw a memorandum PP1/2/01/09 (4) Vol II dated 2<sup>nd</sup> June 2009 from Sheryl Solis to Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of National Security, informing that box 79 of 94 (of the 50,000 CARICOM blank passports received) was marked with US Customs green tape. The explanation given by the Belize Customs officer was that the box arrived in that condition as apparently the US Customs needed to verify its content. Upon examination of the box by the Finance officer and the Belize Customs officer it was noted that one pack of passports were opened, which they immediately checked and found that the quantity was correct.

The practice of checking blank passports by boxes still continues up to present.

***Recommendations:***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:*

- 1. Serial numbers are recorded for verification purposes in a secure and confidential manner.*
- 2. Serial numbers are stored in the Central Bank's vault under confidential cover.*

3. *At the very least sealed boxes should be randomly checked upon receipt from supplier. (US Customs Officials conducted an examination to satisfy themselves of the declared item).*

## **Main stock register/ledger of Blank Passports**

**No register was maintained for the stock of blank passports purchased and received from 3M**

### ***Criteria***

8. *The Director of Immigration and Nationality should maintain a stock register of all blank passports ordered and received from 3M Company and kept at Central Bank*

8.2 We examined the Department's records and found that the Director of Immigration and Nationality did not maintain a main stock register to record all passports purchased and received from 3M Company and kept at the Central Bank. This Audit views with great concern as it appeared that the basic controls for the recording of receipt and issuance of passports were not fully utilized once the items were lodged in the Central Bank's vault.

8.3 As a result of the Director not maintaining a register, we were unable to ascertain the book balance for the stock of blank passports as at February 2014

8.4 We did not check the stock of passports held in the Central Bank's vault due to time constraints. According to the Finance Officer (FO), Teresita Castellanos, the total amount of blank passports as at February 2014, recorded on an electronic spreadsheet, was 68,000.

**The Director of Immigration and Nationality did not carry out regular stock verifications of the main stock of passports lodged at the Central Bank**

### ***Criteria***

9. *Monthly reconciliations should be conducted on the main stock of blank passports held at the Central Bank, those held by the Director of Immigration and the supervisor of passports.*

9.2 We found no trace during the period April 2011 to September 2013, where the Director of Immigration and Nationality carried out regular checks on the stock of blank passports, held by the Central Bank.

9.3 During the period investigated, one handing and taking over of passports was noted carried out on 6 June 2011 on the main stock at the Central Bank. This handing over was between Finance officers Ms. Sheryl Solis and Ms. Teresita Castellanos. The then Deputy Director, Maria Marin was present at the handing over. Information concerning the amount of passports on hand at the time was handwritten on a legal pad, which was signed by both Finance Officers and Ms. Marin.

9.4 Scrutiny of the hand written handing and taking over document revealed that the main stock at the Central Bank was as follows:

1. 54 boxes of Caricom (ordinary) passports, boxes #41 to 94 of 94 boxes. All boxes were found to be sealed except for box 79 (opened by the US Customs official in Miami as stated at paragraph 7.3 above) which was sealed by Central Bank and verified by Mrs. Solis.
2. 19 boxes of Emergency (Temporary) passports that is, boxes 2 to 20 of 20 boxes. Boxes 3, 13 and 19 seals were broken and the counting was done by Mrs. Solis and personnel from Central Bank.

No evidence was shown that the exercise was done using passport serial numbers for verification.

Miss Castellanos took a high risk when she did not take a stock of the quantity of passports and serial numbers especially for the boxes where the seals were broken and resealed.

### ***Recommendations***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:*

1. *The FO maintains a main stock register that records actual receipts and issues of blank passports. An immediate check is carried out to ascertain the actual amount of blank passports on hand and in the Central Bank's vault.*

***Subsidiary stock register was maintained by the Immigration and Nationality Department***

***Criteria***

*10. The Director of Immigration and Nationality maintain a subsidiary stock register in which all stock of blank passports requested and received from Central Bank and issued to the Supervisor of Passport Section are recorded*

10.2 We found that the Director of Immigration and Nationality maintained a stock register in which blank passports received from the Central Bank were recorded. However, only the amount received, for example 500 were inserted. The practice of not entering the serial numbers of blank passports received from the Central Bank was evident throughout the period investigated. It was not until blank passports were issued to the Officer in Charge Passport Section that serial numbers of passports issued were recorded.

**The Director of Immigration and Nationality failed to carry out checks on the stock of blank passports held by the Finance Officer and the Supervisor Passport Section**

***Criteria***

*11. Regular checks should be carried out on blank passports held by the Director of Immigration and those issued to the supervisor of passports*

***No checks were carried out on the Stock of Blank Passports held by the Finance Officer at Immigration and Nationality***

11.2 We found that the Director of Immigration and Nationality failed to carry out internal checks on the stock of blank passports held by the Finance Officer. This was the case since 19<sup>th</sup> April 2007.

***There was no documented evidence of checks carried out on the Stock of Blank Passports held by the Supervisor of Passport Section***

11.3 We found no documented evidence that checks were made on the stocks issued to the Supervisor of Passports Section.

### ***Recommendations:***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:*

- 1. The serial numbers of blank passports received from the Central Bank and issued to the Supervisor of Passport Section must be recorded in a subsidiary register maintained by the Finance Officer.*
- 2. Regular checks are carried out on the subsidiary stock held by the Finance Officer and evidenced by signatures and dates.*
- 3. Spot checks are carried out on the stock issued to the Supervisor of Passport Section indicating verifier by signatures and dates.*

### **Temporary (Emergency) Passports were not accounted for in the BPIS**

#### ***Criteria***

- 12. We expected to see all passports issued by the Immigration and Nationality Department accounted for in the BPIS*

We noted that Temporary passports were manual and not machine readable. Hence, Temporary passports were not accounted for in the BPIS.

### **The Finance Officer failed to make adjustments for passports returned from Officers in Charge of Passport Section Belmopan and Belize City**

#### ***Criteria this was the first mention of RFIN stock register!!***

- 13. We expected to see where applicable that the FO would adjust the RFIN stock register of passports to reflect passports returned by the OICs.*

13.2 500 blank passports were issued to OIC Sharon Neal Flowers vide RFIN number 100427 dated 18/10/11. 25 Passports P0182701 to P0182725 were voided and received by Audit as cancelled passports. F O, Ms Teresita Castellanos, did not record the returned, void passports by OIC, Ms. Sharon Neal Flowers in the RFIN stock register.

13.3 On the memorandum received from Sharon Neal Flowers, she wrote:

“Issued vide RFIN number 100427 dated 18/10/11. Reissued RFIN number 100433 dated 31/10/11, 475 passports P0182501-P0182700, P0182726 to P0183000 due to missing series P0182701 to P0182725.”

13.4 Additionally she wrote:

“Pl refer to RFIN number 100427 that was cancelled due to missing series P0182701- P0182725”. She initialed and dated the notation 31/10/11.

13.5 We verified RFIN number 100427 dated 18/10/11 on which 500 blank passports bearing serial number P0182501 to P0183000 were issued. The balance on hand was 3000 after the 500 passports were issued.

13.6 We also noted that in the RFIN stock register a notation was made:

“25 passports were not issued due to wrong series P0286501 to P0186525”. This was initialed and dated 31/10/11 by the FO Teresita Castellanos.

13.7 We noted the balance in the RFIN register was not adjusted to reflect that only 475 passports were issued to Sharon Neal Flowers while the other 25 passports had been returned to the FO. The issuing and receipt of passports would be better managed if the register reflected serial numbers.

### ***Recommendation***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that the FO make adjustments in the RFIN register for all passports that are returned. This should be done immediately the passports are returned.*

### **3800 blank passports were found during verification of Book balance of Passports on hand at the time of the investigation**

#### ***Criteria***

*14. The stock of blank passports on hand should match the book balance at any given time*

14.2 We checked the FO stock of passports on hand against the book balance of 3,800 blank passports as at 4<sup>th</sup> February 2014 and found a total of **3800**



passports as shown in the **Table** below labeled **A**. The FO's Book balance only shows the actual amount received from the Central Bank. The blank passports issued to the OICs are taken from the FO's balance on hand. The breakdown of the 3800 blank passports found on hand is listed at table A below.

**Table A**

The following is the list of passports found on hand as at 4<sup>th</sup> February 2014

<b>Type of Passports</b>	<b>Amount found on hand</b>
Diplomatic	600
Official	1675
Regular	1200
Temporary (emergency)	325
<b>Total passports found on hand</b>	<b>3,800</b>

**Thirty-Three (33) Passports received by Officers in Charge were not accounted for in the Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS) for the period April 2011 to September 2013**

***Criteria***

*15. We expected that all passports received by Officers in charge would be accounted for in the BPIS.*

We found a total of **33** passports were not accounted for in the system. **Table B** below shows the type of passports that were not accounted for.

## Table B

The following is the diplomatic, official and ordinary passports which were not accounted for in the BPIS by Officers in charge of the Passport section

Type of passport	Amount of passports not accounted for
Diplomatic	1
Official	4
Ordinary	28
<b>Total unaccounted passports</b>	<b>33</b>

15.2 We found that of the twenty eight ordinary passports not accounted for on the BPIS, twenty three were found among the cancelled passports presented to us.

15.3 We could not ascertain how those twenty-three passports were not seen in the BPIS, yet they were cancelled and presented for Audit scrutiny. It is to be noted that those 23 passports should have been on the BPIS because for those to be cancelled it meant they had to be used. Therefore if a mistake was made it still should have been recorded in the system.

15.4 The thirty three (33) unaccounted passports serial numbers are listed at **Appendix A**

Although it did not fall under our scope, we were presented with cancelled passports that were before April 2011 and we noted that one passport C0002019 which was issued on 2.8.09 was not accounted for in the BPIS.

**Twenty (22) passports accounted for on the spoilt list were also seen on the misprinted list**

### *Criteria*

*We expected to see separate listings for misprinted and spoilt passports.*

16. We noted that twenty two (22) passports on the spoilt list were also seen on the misprinted list as shown at **Appendix B**.

**Two (2) cancelled passports presented were not found on the cancelled, spoilt or misprinted lists**

17. We found two cancelled passports which were not found on the cancelled, spoilt or misprinted lists. The two passports were diplomatic passport B000401 and official passport C000258. There was no name, date of birth and date of issue in those two passports.

**Two (2) passports were presented which were not on the list prepared and given to us by Finance Officer**

18. We found two passports among the cancelled passports which were not on the list presented by the Finance Officer. Those two passports are shown at **Table C** below:

**Table C**

The following are the two passports that were found among the cancelled passports but not on the list prepared and presented by the Finance Officer

<b>Name</b>	<b>Passport number</b>	<b>Status</b>
Robert Hernandez	A003925	Cancelled
Bobby Vasquez	P0088906	Revoked

***Recommendations:***

*The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:*

- i. All spoilt, misprinted and cancelled passports are retained for audit purposes.*
- ii. The Finance Officer makes adjustments to her stock register for passports which are returned from the OIC Passport section.*
- iii. All stocks of passports are accounted for in the stock register as soon as those passports have been received from the supplier.*

- iv. *An investigation is made as to why the forty two (42) passports received by Officers in Charge were not accounted for in the Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS) during the period April 2011 to September 2013.*
- v. *Regular checks are carried out to ascertain that all passports issued by the Finance Officer are accounted for on the BPIS.*

**Meryl Sheets were not accounted for and safeguarded under lock and key**

19.A Meryl Sheet is a unique, thin and frangible security laminate designed specifically for the highest security document application. According to the 3M Company Security Market Center manual section 10 of page 45, 3M Company has the technology to produce the beads and turn the beads into a transparent laminate which is impossible to counterfeit or simulate. The laminate can be viewed using a simple focused light source. Any attempt to tamper with the laminate will cause it to be destroyed.

19.2 We found that the Finance Officer, Ms. Teresita Castellanos did not maintain a register for Meryl Sheets. The stocks of Meryl Sheets were kept in a cabinet and on the floor of the Finance officer's office.

19.3 As at 21<sup>st</sup> May 2014 a total of 63 boxes or 126,000 Meryl sheets were purchased from 3M Company. A stock count was done to verify what was on hand and the result is listed at the below **Table labeled D**.

**Table D**

The following is the Meryl Sheets that were found on hand as at 21<sup>st</sup> May 2014

<b>Particulars</b>	<b>Amount</b>
32 seal boxes	64,000
One loose box (2*250)	500
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>64,500</b>

**No checks were made on the stock of Meryl sheets by the Immigration and Nationality Department**

20. In a discussion on 21st May 2014 with the Finance Officer II, Ms. Teresita Castellanos, she revealed that no importance was placed on the Meryl Sheets as the Meryl Sheets are kept in a cabinet and on the floor of her office. Also, no checks were made on the stocks of Meryl Sheets because they do not have serial numbers and are kept safely in her office.

**No Agreement/Contract was presented or seen for the maintenance of the BPIS system**

21. It was noted that the Director of Immigration and Nationality paid a yearly maintenance for the Belize Passport Issuance System (BPIS). The BPIS is maintained by 3M Company for a cost of US \$ 90,000.00 per annum.

We did not see a service agreement between the Director and 3M Company to carry out such service; therefore we could not verify the cost (\$90,000.00) and terms of the agreement. A list of the invoices from 3M Company for the maintenance of the system is shown at the below **Table** labeled **E**.

**Table E**

The following is the invoices for system maintenance by 3M for the cost of US \$90,000.00 or Belize \$180,567.00 per annum

<b>Invoice number</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Cost in US Dollars</b>	<b>Cost in Belize Dollars</b>
NE 20996	01.02.13	\$ 90,000.00	\$180,567.00
NE	2012	\$ 90,000.00	\$180,567.00
NE16736	02.07.11	\$ 90,000.00	\$180,567.00
NE 43330	24.02.10	\$ 90,000.00	\$180,567.00

**The Department of Immigration spent \$180,567.00 (Belize Dollars) per annum for the maintenance of the BPIS which was not functioning efficiently**

22. We found a memo referenced MNS/ACC/2/02/10 (59) dated June 22, 2010 from the Ministry of National Security addressed to the Director of Immigration and Nationality. This memo gave the approval for advance de-reservation of funds and detailed the particulars of departmental warrant number 15 of 2010/11 for \$180,567 in order for the Department of

Immigration to make payment for the maintenance and upgrade of the Biometric Passport System.

22.2 During our examination, we encountered many instances where the BPIS were breached. As a result, we question whether the Director of Immigration and Nationality got value for the amount of money spent on the system.

**Internetworks Limited was paid \$2,997.05 more than the agreed amount**

23. The Agreement dated 31st May 2012, reflected that a local company in Belize by the name of Internetworks Ltd was contracted for \$107,930.54 to upgrade the network infrastructure for the machine readable passport system and the installation of network infrastructure to support the Border Management System.

24. At the end of the project Internetworks Limited sent a Tax Invoice INT-AR-1096 dated 9 November 2012 that indicated the cost of the services provided had increased to \$ 110,927.59. No explanation was given for this increase. At the bottom of the last page of said invoice there was a notation which stated:

“Invoice has been revised to replace previous invoice No. INT-AR – 1014 dd July, 4<sup>th</sup> 2012”.

A notation in pen ink was made as follows.

“All equipment has been delivered to Belmopan Headquarters”.

Mr. Rodolfo Bol, who is the System’s Manager for the Immigration and Nationality Department, acknowledged this notation by signing alongside it on 7/12/12.

**The Department of Immigration could not account for 7 Temporary (Emergency) Passports which were submitted as specimen to 3M Company**

25. **Table F** below list seven (7) emergency passports which the Department claimed it had issued to 3M Company but was unable to account for at the time of our investigation.

## Table F

The following is the list of seven Emergency passports that the Department was unable to account for

<b>Passport number</b>
T0000001
T0000004
T0000009
-T0000021
T0000023
T0000024
T0000025

25.2A memo reference PPI/13/01/11 (22) dated 2<sup>nd</sup> March, 2011 from the then Finance Officer, Sheryl Solis, to former Director, Ruth Meighan, informed that emergency passports were received on 2<sup>nd</sup> March, 2011. This was a shipment of twenty (20) boxes which contained 10,000 emergency passports. We examined the Central Bank's "Items Received For Safekeeping Form" to confirm the amount and found that the amount was correct.

25.3Also, stated in Finance Officer Solis' memo was

"In regards to the specimen for 3M Co., we had to open box 1 of 20 and took out series T0000001-T0000025, and the same box was closed and sealed with the sealing machine".

25.4We saw an email dated 24 February, 2011 from 3M Business Development Manager, Mr. Steven Grant stating that the shipment of the 20 boxes of emergency passports had arrived in Belize and that he was requesting again that the Director forward back to 3M Company 20 blank emergency passports for use to calibrate the laminators. Also, that the passports should be stamped "specimen" or marked so that they could not be used again. According to the email request it was a follow up from the first request which was done verbally in a discussion with the then Director, Ruth Meighan, during Mr. Grant's visit to Belize. According to the copy of a covering letter PPI/13/01/11 (23) Vol. 1 dated 4<sup>th</sup> March 2011 which was in response to the request made by 3M Company on 24 February 2011, the former Director,

Ruth Meighan, forwarded twenty Emergency Passports with serial numbers T0000001 - T0000020 to 3M Company.

25.5 We saw a memo PPI/10/01(18) VOL IV dated 30<sup>th</sup> September 2011, from the Director of Immigration and Nationality to Secretary, Louise Gillett on behalf of Cecile Van Oosterwijk.

The memo's subject matter was for the handing over of specimen sample of Belize Temporary Passport. It showed that passport T0000011 (which was supposedly issued to 3M Company vide letter PPI/13/01/11 (23) Vol. 1 dated 4<sup>th</sup> March 2011) was then issued and signed by Teresita Castellanos (FO) and received and by Louise Gillett (Secretary Immigration and Nationality) on behalf of Ms. Cecile Van Oosterwijk, Amsterdam, Netherlands. No evidence was found to show that Ms. Cecile Van Oosterwijk received the specimen passport from Ms. Louise Gillett.

25.6 Nine (9) of the twenty (20) Temporary Passports issued to 3M Company were found in the Immigration vault during our check of Visa stock on 12<sup>th</sup> May 2014. The nine Temporary passports were in a box in the vault held by the FO, Teresita Castellanos.

25.7 We were concerned about the finding, since it was on record that Emergency passports T0000001 – T0000020 were forwarded to 3M Company as was requested. We saw no evidence on file from 3M Company that those 20 passports had been received by the company.

25.8 We questioned the Finance Officer, Miss Teresita Castellanos, about the nine (9) emergency passports found. She stated that the passports had been returned but could not remember by whom. The only thing Ms. Castellanos remembered was that she had received the passports and left those passports in a box in the vault. We again noted that no records were kept to account for returned passports.

25.9 It would appear that the department placed no importance on returned Ordinary and Temporary passports. We asked about the whereabouts of Temporary Passports T0000001, T0000004, T0000009, T0000021,



T0000023, T0000024 and T0000025 for audit examination but the department was unable to provide information on the location of those passports.

**26. Table G** show the serial numbers of the nine (9) emergency passports found in a safe which was said to have been forwarded to 3M Company as specimen.

**Table G**

The following is the list of nine emergency passports which were found in a box which was held in the safe by the Finance Officer

Passport number	Passport number	Passport number
T0000012	T0000015	T0000018
T0000013	T0000016	T0000019
T0000014	T0000017	T0000020

We found another eight (8) of the emergency passports (purportedly issued to 3M Company) among the cancelled passports **Table H** shows those passports.

**Table H**

The following is the list of eight emergency passports found

Passport number	Remarks	Passport number	Remarks
T0000002	Found among the cancelled passports	T0000007	Found among the cancelled passports
T0000003	Found among the cancelled passports	T0000008	Found among the cancelled passports
T0000005	Found among the cancelled passports	T0000009	Found among the cancelled passports
T0000006	Found among the cancelled passports	T0000010	Found among the cancelled passports

## **Recommendations**

The Director of Immigration and Nationality should ensure that:

- 1.) An immediate investigation is done into the seven missing emergency passports bearing serial numbers T0000001, T0000004, T0000009, T0000021, T0000023, T0000024 and T0000025.
- 2.) An investigation is carried out to ascertain whether or not the 20 emergency passports were submitted to 3M Company. In the event that they were forwarded and returned, why no record existed or a notation was made to indicate that the passports had been returned and received by the department.
- 3.) That an investigation is done to establish whether Ms. Cecile Van Oosterwijk received the specimen passport T0000011 from Ms. Louise Gillett.
- 4.) All unused blank passports returned to the department are accounted for and recorded in the Passport Register.

**The Department of Immigration gave excellent reviews about the BPIS although they were experiencing a number of problems.**

27. Despite the many problems the department encountered with the Belize Passport Issuance, no evidence was found that any of the Directors addressed the problem to improve the performance of the system. The system was installed in 2005 at an initial cost of \$ 1,000,000.00 United States Dollars.

27.2 We found on file PPI/13/01/13 Vol I emails in which 3M Company asked the Directors of Immigration for a reference letter.

In each email, a draft was sent to the Director indicating the exact format as to how the letter should be written and to whom it should be addressed. The notation found at the end of every letter is "3M is very professional and responsive in all of their dealing with the department. The service we receive is excellent".

27.3 The emails also reflected that the reference letter should reach a specific person that was mentioned in the email by a specific date.

27.4 We saw three letters of reference in favor of 3M Company. Two was submitted by former Director, Ruth Meighan and one by the acting Director, Maria Marin. All letters indicated that the service provided by the 3M Company was excellent although the system was not operating as it should.

**Conclusion:**

We noted that internal control was very weak when it came to the control and issuance of Blank Passports and the management of Meryl Sheets. The Department needs to develop an effective internal control policy regarding the receipt, issuance and final disposal of those mentioned documents. It is evident that the Department lacks management in planning, control and organization of vital documents. Training in document security along with storage and preservation is strongly recommended.

